

**THE MINUTES OF THE 432nd STATED MEETING OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION
12 August 1998**

**City Council Caucus, Room 401, City Hall
Wayne S. Spilove, Chair**

Present

Wayne S. Spilove, Chair
Joseph James, Deputy Commissioner, Department of Licenses and Inspections
Barbara Kaplan, Executive Director, City Planning Commission
Carol Lawrence
Shelly Merhige, Office of the City Council President
Stephen Mullin, Director and City Representative, Department of Commerce
David Perri, Deputy Commissioner, Department of Licenses and Inspections
Michael Sklaroff, Esq.
Robert Thomas
Scott Wilds, Assistant Director for Housing, Office of Housing and Urban Development
Caroline Wischmann
Stephanie Wolf, Ph.D.

Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Randal Baron, Assistant Historic Preservation Officer
R. Scott Jacob, Executive Secretary
Laura Spina, Historic Preservation Planner
Elizabeth Harvey, Historic Preservation Planner

Mark Zecca, Esq., Deputy City Solicitor

Also

Lenore Millhollen, Center City Residents Association (CCRA)
James Verzella
Robert McCauley, Ueland Junker McCauley Neilson
Arthur Jones, Bower Lewis Thrower Architects
James Quesenberry
Judith Eden, Center City Residents Association
Gregory Harvey
Andrew Kinzler
Thomas Eshelman

Wayne S. Spilove, Chair, recognized the presence of a quorum and called the 432nd Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission to order at 10:30 A.M.

Mr. Zecca notified the members of the public present at the meeting that the Historical Commission held an Executive Session immediately preceding the public meeting to discuss issues of litigation, and appeals to decisions made from the Historical Commission to the Board of Licenses and Inspections review.

Mr. Spilove thanked Diane Dalto, Michael Sklaroff and Mark Zecca for their recent efforts to retain the Maxfield Parrish and Louis C. Tiffany mosaic mural *Dream Garden* in the City of Philadelphia. Mr. Wilds led the Commission in a round of applause thanking Mr. Spilove for his role in the protection of the mural.

MINUTES of the 431st Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission. Upon a

motion made by Mr. Wilds and duly seconded, the Commission unanimously approved the minutes of the 431st Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission held on 15 July 1998, Wayne S. Spilove, Chair.

REPORT of the Architectural Committee, 28 July, 1998, Robert Thomas, Chair.

23-29 North Juniper Street, City Hall Annex

Annex Center Limited Partnership, Owner

James Platt, Architect/Applicant

DATE: 1927

PROPOSAL: Loading dock gate, mechanical floor, HVAC, signs, window glazing

Architectural Committee Recommendation: approval of the proposal, with the suggestion that the applicant modify the proposed Commerce Street doors to center them in the window openings, with flush panels completing the in-fill of any window section.

Mr. Thomas explained that this proposal provides details of modifications to convert the former City Hall Annex building into a Marriott Hotel. The architects propose the creation of a mechanical room floor within the u-shaped light court. Existing penthouses on the roof will largely hide new condensing units at that level. A signage package shows halo-lit metal signs installed in the recessed stone plaques on each side of the building, and a kiosk sign in the new front traffic island. The applicant wishes to glaze several registers of windows with black spandrel glass. The roll-down gates on the loading dock will have a projecting housing because of height requirements for trucks using the dock. Mr. Thomas stated that the applicant agreed to paint the security grate housing and the proposed new door the color of the existing stone at that location.

Mr. Thomas explained that Committee members observed that the new door cuts on Commerce Street, previously approved by the Commission, impinge upon the windows above them in the current proposed elevation, and that they asked that the applicant modify the doors to center them in the window openings, with flush panels completing the in-fill of any window section.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Ms. Wolf seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

127 North Van Pelt Street

Paul Goddard, Owner/Applicant

DATE: c. 1860

PROPOSAL: Rear addition visible from street

Architectural Committee Recommendation: approval, conditioned upon the submission of clearer and more detailed plans, with staff to review and approve details.

Mr. Thomas explained that the owner proposes building a second- and third-floor addition on top of a rear one-story piece of his house. The building will cover a portion visible to the public with stucco at the second floor. A glass and metal greenhouse will form the top floor.

Mr. Baron circulated a new set of drawings that the applicant submitted after the Committee meeting that shows another window on the addition. Mr. Thomas, representing the Architectural Committee, and Mr. Baron both recommended the Commission approve the new plans for the proposal.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation as well as approve the newly proposed window. Mr. Mullen seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

123 South Broad Street

First Union Bank, Owner

Allen Roth, Applicant

DATE: 1930

PROPOSAL: Cut out old stone plaque, install a new one

Architectural Committee Recommendation: approval of the proposal, using the font that most resembles the existing and staff to review and approve details.

Mr. Thomas explained that First Union, the new occupant of the bank building, proposes to change the large stone plaque over the main entrance, which now bears the words "Fidelity Bank," to "First Union." A former owner replaced the plaque at one time as evidenced by the original plans and the lighter color of the stone. The applicant submitted three different font options for the lettering. Mr. Thomas stated that Committee members chose to recommend approval of the "Times Roman" font, which most resembles the existing, pointed so as to minimize the number of visible joints. Mr. Sklaroff expressed concern that using the same font, but for a new owner, would create an impression of false history, and suggested allowing First Union to use their own, more modern font, if that suits the bank's needs. Mr. Baron stated that First Union actually prefers the same font option as the Committee.

Mr. Mullen made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Ms. Wolf seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

Mr. Spilove turned the Chair over to Mr. Wilds.

320 South Broad Street, University of the Arts

University of the Arts, Owner

Nick Gianopoulos, Applicant

DATE: 1875 - fence

PROPOSAL: Rebuild north perimeter wall

Architectural Committee Recommendation: approval of the proposal, but specified that the applicant should complete all aspects of the reconstruction at the same time, and install temporary bollards or a protective wood fence to protect the wall until completion of the other construction on the site.

Ms. Wolf and Ms. Kaplan recused themselves owing to their involvement with the University of the Arts.

Mr. Thomas explained the builders of the new performing arts center propose to rebuild

the University of the Arts' north perimeter wall in preparation for the construction of the center. This brick wall contains a pattern of sawtooth designs and panels. The applicant proposes to rebuild it in cinder block, with a face of salvaged brick that matches the remaining historic portions of the wall; however, they would like to wait to complete the brick facing of the wall until completion of construction planned on the north side of the site. The wall requires reconstruction owing to its poor condition. Mr. Thomas stated that Committee members requested the applicant complete all aspects of the reconstruction at the same time, and install temporary bollards or a protective wood fence to protect the wall until completion of the other construction on the site, and that the Committee did not want the University to leave the new fence standing without the brick face in case of delays in the construction of the new center.

James Verzella, contractor for the project, asked the Commission for approval to proceed with the project in the originally proposed two phases of construction, and offered to secure a performance bond to ensure the realization of the project once the Performing Arts Center construction reaches completion. Mr. Wilds asked counsel to comment on the Commission's position regarding the recognition of performance bonds in such matters. Mr. Zecca stated that he would have to look into the matter. Mr. Baron also asked for an estimation of the time frame for the performance bond. Mr. Verzella explained that the city has established guidelines for the length of time, but could not give specifics.

Mr. Mullen made a motion to approve the proposal conditioned upon the securing of performance bond ensuring the realization of the project once the Performing Arts Center reaches completion, with staff to review and approve details, and Commission Counsel to review and approve the performance bond. Mr. Thomas seconded the motion which carried with seven votes. Mr. James abstained, and Ms. Wolf and Ms. Kaplan recused themselves.

Mr. Spilove resumed the Chair.

12 South 12th Street, PSFS Building

12th Street Hotel Association, L.P., Owner

Arthur Jones, Architect/Applicant

DATE: 1930

PROPOSAL: Addition, alterations

Architectural Committee Recommendation: approval of the proposal, with staff to review and approve details.

Mr. Sklaroff recused himself from the discussion and the vote owing to his law firm's association with the proposal.

Mr. Thomas explained that this proposal shows a more detailed, revised design for the addition to the PSFS building to create the new Loews Hotel. The design differs slightly from that approved in concept before in that glass has replaced many masonry panels and stainless steel panels will now cover the south wall of the addition. The return between the addition and the existing building will remain black brick as in the conceptual proposal. Mr. Thomas stated that Committee members did not object to the proposed new addition.

Mr. Thomas described changes to the historic structure, which include altering a door

configuration on the Market Street facade. Changes to the old Lerner's storefront include removing the old "Lerner's" sign, reinstalling curved glass at the corner, cutting a new door on 12th Street and narrowing a door on Market Street. The new application also includes new windows at the 24th floor to match existing sight lines and dimensions, and switching glazed and louvered windows on a mechanical floor. The new proposal supercedes the old, conceptual proposal, which entailed replacing all the windows.

The Commission already approved the installation of a large canopy with "Loews" signage over the main entrance on Market Street. The historic arrangement of the doors at this entrance featured a symmetrical configuration consisting of a central pair of swinging doors, flanked by two revolving doors. The new proposal creates an asymmetrical configuration in which a central revolving door is flanked by a single-leaf, handicap-accessible entrance to its left, and a pair of swinging doors to the right. Mr. Thomas explained that Committee members asked the applicant to consider a design that would maintain the historic symmetry, and that Arthur Jones, architect for the project, explained why they could not achieve that given the new use and owing to new building code regulations. Mr. Thomas stated that he advised the architect on how to achieve symmetry by using a pair of doors operated by a button to create wheelchair accessibility. The architect did not favor the that proposal.

Ms. Wolf made a motion accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. James seconded the motion which carried with ten votes. Mr. Sklaroff recused himself.

5520 Arch Street, Samuel Yellin Studio

Clare Yellin, Owner

F.W. Slifer/Salvation Army, applicant

DATE: 1915

PROPOSAL: Demolition of building

Architectural Committee Recommendation: send the issue to the Financial Hardship Committee.

Mr. Thomas explained that this proposal calls for the demolition of the Yellin iron works building. He stated that Clare Yellin, owner of the building, finds that since relocating her shop to West Chester she has had trouble even giving the building away. Estimates for rehabilitation run approximately a million dollars without including the cost of toxic waste removal. Ms. Yellin intends to give the building and property to the Salvation Army for use as a children's playground.

Mr. Thomas explained that Ms. Yellin can no longer continue the family business while paying for the maintenance of the Arch Street studio. The Commission agreed with the Committee's recommendation to send the matter to the Financial Hardship Committee of the Historical Commission.

Ms. Wolf made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Mullen seconded the motion which carried with ten votes. Mr. James dissented.

329 South Street

331 South Street Association, L.P., Prospective Owner

Elan Zaken, Applicant

DATE: c. 1860; c.1910 - storefront

PROPOSAL: Remove historic storefront; build modern storefront and rear addition

Architectural Committee Recommendation: approval of the proposed rear addition, but recommended denial of the proposed storefront alterations.

Mr. Thomas explained that this proposal calls for demolishing the first two floors of the front facade including a highly unusual double-recessed storefront. The potential new owner proposes a large glass, two-story storefront flush with the building line. On the rear he hopes to build a three-story addition and parking spaces for two cars. Mr. Thomas explained that Committee members did not oppose the proposed rear addition, but strongly objected to the proposed alterations to the storefront, which would remove significant historic features.

Ms. Wolf made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

401 North Broad Street

Nathan Jacobs, Owner

Robert McCauley, Architect/Applicant

DATE: 1928

PROPOSAL: Transformer and fence

Architectural Committee Recommendation: approval of the proposal, conditioned upon its fitting within a building-wide standard for all future proposals on this building, which the owner should have designed and submitted for Committee and Commission approval, with staff to review and approve details for this project.

Mr. Thomas explained that this proposal involves the installation of a generator and a fence in the areaway at the base of the building along Noble Street. He stated that Committee members expressed concern that with the growing number of tenants in this building seeking approval of exterior alterations, the different proposals should follow a building-wide standard. Robert McCauley, architect for the project, stated that his firm asked their client to consider having the fence coated in black vinyl to match another, earlier proposal on this facade of the building. Mr. McCauley distributed a revised drawing to the Commission reflecting these changes.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to approve the newly submitted proposal. Mr. Mullen seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

710 Pine Street

James Quesenberry, Owner/Applicant

DATE: c. 1820

PROPOSAL: Rear addition

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval.

Mr. Thomas explained that this proposal calls for the demolition of the rear one-story portion of the house and construction of a rear stuccoed addition. The public has little view of the rear from a public right-of-way.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Mullen seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

249 South Van Pelt Street

Jon Merz, Owner/Applicant

DATE: c. 1860

PROPOSAL: Loft door

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval of design alternative one, modified to include one more muntin into the rounded top panes, with staff to review and approve details.

Mr. Thomas explained that this proposal entails an alternate design of the hayloft door on the front of this former carriage house which the applicant seeks to glaze. The applicant submitted several design alternatives that differ from that approved previously by the Committee and Commission. Mr. Thomas explained that Committee members asked the applicant to alter slightly the design alternative which incorporates the fanlight portion into the doors themselves, to include one more muntin into the rounded top panes, because they thought the design had a distinctly "deco" appearance without the extra muntin. Mr. Thomas stated that the applicant agreed to redesign "alternative one" to the Committee's specifications.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Ms. Kaplan seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

City Hall

City of Philadelphia, Department of Public Property, Owner

Harold Aponte/Capital Programs Office, Applicant

DATE: 1872-1901

PROPOSAL: Railings

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Approval of placing railings along the sides of the recessed entrances, angling the railing at the corners, and rounding off the ends.

Mr. James recused himself from the discussion and the vote owing to the Department of Public Property's interest in City Hall.

Mr. Thomas explained that this proposal calls for installing handrails at the west side entrance of the northwest corner and the east side entrance of the of northeast corner of City Hall. The applicant submitted two schemes for Committee review. The first places railings along the sides of the recessed entrances, and the second scheme places the railing down the center. Mr. Thomas stated that Committee members preferred the first option, and recommended the applicant angle the railing at the corners of the recessed entrances, and round off the ends.

Ms. Wolf made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which carried with ten votes. Mr. James recused himself.

330 South 19th Street, a.k.a. 1900 Panama Street

Joseph and Marcie Coppola, Owners

Robert Boothroyd, Jr., Applicant

DATE: c. 1860; stuccoed - c. 1930

PROPOSAL: Overhanging deck

Architectural Committee Recommendation: Denial of the proposal.

Mr. Thomas explained that this proposal calls for approval to build a cantilevered deck and catwalk on the two-story ell of the house, which fronts on Panama Street. The owner wishes to cantilever the catwalk and deck three feet over the sidewalk to accommodate the use of a side window as a means of access to the deck. Mr. Thomas stated that Committee members strongly objected to the proposal, as it would significantly alter the historic appearance of the facade.

Gregory Harvey, a neighbor of 330 South 19th Street, spoke on behalf of several concerned members of the community. He stated that the owner of this property discarded the historic shutters, and executed other facade alterations without approval from the Historical Commission. Mr. Harvey also presented a letter from Andrew and Abbie Kinzler delineating the grievances shared by several members of the neighborhood over this proposal. Mr. Spilove thanked the community members for their concern.

Ms. Wolf made a motion to accept the Committee's recommendation. Mr. Wilds seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

The Report of the Historical Commission Staff

July 1998, Richard Tyler

Mr. Tyler commented on the monthly staff report. Mr. Spilove thanked Laura Spina and Liz Harvey for their tremendous efforts in writing the nomination for the Maxfield Parrish and Louis C. Tiffany mosaic mural *Dream Garden*.

Certified Local Government: National Register Comment, Richard Tyler

- S. S. United States
- Cobbs Creek

Mr. Tyler described the nomination of the Steam Ship (S.S.) United States for inclusion on the National Register. He explained the ship's significance as a trans-Atlantic passenger liner and its meeting criteria A and C of the National Register. He asked the Commission to recommend the nomination. Several Commission members expressed concern that the nomination, though well written, contained no photographs or drawings. Mr. Wilds suggested scheduling a field trip to visit the ship, which remains docked in Philadelphia.

Mr. Wilds made a motion not to comment on the nomination until Commission members can review more material or take a field trip to visit the ship. Mr. Sklaroff seconded the motion which

carried unanimously.

Mr. Tyler described the nomination of the Cobbs Creek neighborhood for a National Register district. He explained the neighborhood's social and historical significance as an "automobile suburb," and asked the Commission to recommend the nomination. Commission members objected to the lack of adequate maps detailing the boundaries of the proposed district. Mr. Tyler stated that Tax Act incentives constitute a strong motivation behind this nomination. Commission members expressed concern that the residents of this community, as well as their member of City Council and local civic associations, should be notified and informed what this designation will mean to them. Mr. Sklaroff asserted that the Commission should devote more time to review this proposal before recommending approval.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to recommend the nomination, with the stipulation that the state give the Philadelphia Historical Commission at least ninety days to review such nominations. Ms. Merhige seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to notify all branches of the City of Philadelphia Government of impending National Register districts, delineating what that designation means for the district. The motion was not seconded.

Mr. Sklaroff recommended checking the Commission's Ordinance to see what, if any, obligations the Historical Commission has toward the community effected by the district.

Mr. Wilds made a motion to ask the Chair of the Historical Commission to consult with Commission counsel regarding the Commission's legal obligations regarding the creation of National Register districts. Ms. Wolf seconded the motion which carried with six votes. Mr. Sklaroff abstained.

Mr. Sklaroff made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Ms. Merhige seconded the motion which carried unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at 12:15 P.M.

Respectfully Submitted,

R. Scott Jacob
Executive Secretary