

**REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION
OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

**WEDNESDAY, 19 FEBRUARY 2025
REMOTE MEETING ON ZOOM
EMILY COOPERMAN, CHAIR**

CALL TO ORDER

START TIME IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:00:00

The Chair called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The following Committee members joined her:

Committee Member	Present	Absent	Comment
Emily Cooperman, Ph.D., Chair	X		
Suzanna Barucco	X		
Jeff Cohen, Ph.D.		X	
Bruce Lavery	X		
Debbie Miller		X	
Elizabeth Milroy, Ph.D.	X		

The meeting was held remotely via Zoom video and audio-conferencing software.

The following staff members were present:

Jonathan Farnham, Executive Director
Kim Chantry, Historic Preservation Planner III
Shannon Garrison, Historic Preservation Planner III
Heather Hendrickson, Historic Preservation Planner II
Ted Maust, Historic Preservation Planner II
Allyson Mehley, Historic Preservation Planner III
Dan Shachar-Krasnoff, Historic Preservation Planner II
Alex Till, Historic Preservation Planner II

The following persons attended the online meeting:

Allison Weiss, SoLo Germantown Civic Association
Aaron Moselle, WHY
Abbey Lewis
Amy Lambert, University City Historical Society
Bishop Linda Joy Calhoun
Chrissy Clawson
Damariz Winborne
David Traub, Save Our Sites
Hanna Stark, Preservation Alliance for Greater Philadelphia
Julia Hayman
Kimberly Haas, Hidden City Philadelphia
Lorraine Appelbaum
Massoud Mohadjeri
Matthew McClure, Esq., Ballard Spahr
Meredith Trego, Esq., Ballard Spahr

Oscar Beisert, Keeping Society
Patrick Bayer, UCD
Richard Thom
Roya Taheri
Sarina Rose, Post Brothers
Sherman Aronson
Tim Kerner, Center City Residents' Association
Nolbert Brown, Jr.

AGENDA

ADDRESS: 549-51 N 10TH ST

Name of Resource: Edward S. Earley, Undertaker, House and Business

Review: Designation

Property Owner: Shui Guan Li & Zhen Yue Huang

Nominator: Staff of the Historical Commission

Staff Contact: Jon Farnham, jon.farnham@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 549-51 N. 10th Street, the site of the residence and business of Edward S. Earley, Undertaker, as historic and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the property satisfies Criterion for Designation B as delineated in Section 14-1004(1)(b) of the Philadelphia Code; the property "is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation," the funeral of Abraham Lincoln. Earley was the undertaker for the Philadelphia segment of Lincoln's funeral, providing a custom hearse to carry the president's body and overseeing the logistics of the ceremonies. Lincoln's funeral lasted nearly two weeks in April and May 1865. Lincoln's body was carried by train from Washington, DC to Springfield, Illinois, where he was interred. The funeral train with Lincoln's portrait on the engine and remains in a special rail car covered 1,654 miles, passed through 200 cities and towns, and employed nearly 50 locomotives. Millions of Americans viewed and mourned Lincoln along the rail lines, during the many short stops along the way, and during the 12 extended ceremonies in the state capitals and large cities including Philadelphia. The nomination claims that the funeral is not only historically significant as a shared outpouring of the grief over the first assassination of a US president and more broadly over the devastating Civil War that was ending at the time of the assassination but is also important for its impact on funerary practices in the United States. Noted funeral director and historian of the American funeral industry Todd Van Beck has contended that "the funeral of President Lincoln was so consequential, so massive, so involved, that it changed funeral service in the United States for the next 100 years." The nomination seeks to demonstrate that the property at 549-51 N. 10th Street, the site of the residence and business of Edward S. Earley, Undertaker, played a fundamental role in the funeral and therefore merits historic designation.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination for 549-51 N. 10th Street demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion for Designation B; the property "is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation," the funeral of Abraham Lincoln.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:07:43

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Farnham presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- No one represented the property owner.

DISCUSSION:

- Mr. Farnham asked several times if anyone attending the meeting represented the property owner. No one responded.
- Mr. Farnham noted that historian Paul Kahan suggested the site for designation and the Historical Commission's staff authored the nomination.
- Ms. Cooperman stated that it was a fantastic nomination with amazing research that was wonderfully written.
- Mses. Barucco and Milroy commented that it was a fascinating story.
- Mr. Laverty stated that he was surprised to learn that the undertaking industry grew out of the carpentry industry. He noted that the shuttered Civil War Museum in Philadelphia had some of the fabric from the hearse in its collection. He noted that Jim Mundy, the retired curator at the Union League, might know about any surviving pieces of the hearse.
- Ms. Cooperman asked Mr. Farnham if he considered arguing that the site also satisfied Criteria A and J.
 - Mr. Farnham stated that he believes that cogent arguments could be made for the satisfaction of Criteria A and J but noted that he limited the nomination to Criterion B to simplify and streamline the nomination.
 - Mr. Laverty stated that he preferred the clean, simple nomination and contended that adding Criteria was not necessary.
 - Ms. Milroy stated that she would support the addition of Criteria.
 - Ms. Barucco suggested adding Criterion A, owing to the site's significance to the funerary industry.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- None.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The building at 549-51 N. 10th Street was constructed by undertaker Edward S. Earley about 1863 as his residence and business.
- Edward S. Earley was the undertaker for the Philadelphia segment of President Abraham Lincoln's funeral, providing a custom hearse to carry the president's body and overseeing the logistics of the ceremonies.
- Lincoln's funeral is not only historically significant owing to the nation's collective mourning of the first assassination of a US president but is also important for its impact on funerary practices in the United States. The funeral changed funeral service in the United States for the next 100 years.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion A, owing to the national significance of undertaker Edward S. Earley and his role in changing funerary practices in the United States.
- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion B, owing to its

involvement in the funeral of President Abraham Lincoln, an event of national significance.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 549-51 N. 10th Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A and B.

ITEM: 549-51 N 10th St					
MOTION: Satisfies Criteria A and B					
MOVED BY: Barucco					
SECONDED BY: Milroy					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, Chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Laverty	X				
Debbie Miller					X
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Total	4				2

ADDRESS: 1520-22 CHESTNUT ST

Name of Resource: S.S. Kresge Store

Proposed Action: Designate

Property Owner: PR Chestnut Associates LP

Nominator: Center City Residents Association

Staff Contact: Ted Maust, theodore.maust@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 1520-22 Chestnut Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. A two-story commercial building, known as the S.S. Kresge Store, stands on the property. The nomination contends that the S.S. Kresge Store, built in 1934, satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E. The nomination argues that the property reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style and embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style, specifically the Art Deco style, satisfying Criteria C and D. The nomination also argues that Silverman & Levy, the architects of the structure, was a firm that significantly influenced the development of the City of Philadelphia, satisfying Criterion E.

The Committee on Historic Designation reviewed this nomination for the property at 1520-22 Chestnut Street at its meeting on 17 April 2024. After that review, the Historical Commission discovered that it had failed to inform the property owner of the restarted review, which had been continued for many months. Therefore, the Historical Commission decided to abandon the ongoing review and start the process over from the beginning with proper notice to the owner. The Committee on Historic Designation will review the nomination today as though the first Committee review had not happened. The Historical Commission is scheduled to review the nomination on 14 March 2025.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the property at 1520-22 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION, 19 FEBRUARY 2025

PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION, PRESERVATION@PHILA.GOV

PHILADELPHIA'S PRINCIPAL PUBLIC STEWARD OF HISTORIC RESOURCES

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:20:40

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Maust presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Oscar Beisert of the Keeping Society of Philadelphia and Tim Kerner of the Center City Residents' Association represented the nomination.
- Attorney Matthew McClure and owner's representative Sarina Rose represented the property owner.

DISCUSSION:

- Mr. McClure noted that the building is taxed based on an appraisal by the City that takes the site's zoning and development potential into account. He repeated the request made in his letter to limit the designation to the street-facing facades or include a proviso allowing for a future overbuild even if the Commission finds the massing does not meet the standards.
 - o Ms. Cooperman clarified that the Committee could only evaluate the merits of the nomination based on the Criteria for Designation.
- Ms. Rose spoke about the property owner's stewardship of the building, including stabilization and restoration of the Chestnut Street facade. She explained that that work had been financed by leveraging the development potential with lenders. She said she has heard from lenders that a historic designation would cut into the property owners' ability to do the same in the future to continue to maintain the property.
- Ms. Rose also noted that she had presented the proposed compromise to the Center City Residents' Association. She expressed openness to input from the Committee members concerning the language of the proposed proviso.
- Mr. Beisert thanked Ms. Rose for her company's care of the building. He suggested that both the Keeping Society and Center City Resident's Association have supported applications for overbuilds in the past.
- Ms. Barucco complimented the nomination and noted the striking entrance at the west end of the Chestnut Street facade, commending Ms. Rose and her company for the work they did to reveal and restore the details there.
 - o Ms. Barucco reiterated Ms. Cooperman's statement that the Committee is not tasked with evaluating appraisals or the zoning of property. She also suggested that there are numerous examples of overbuilds of historic properties in Philadelphia and that those are examples of managed change. Ms. Barucco acknowledged the Committee's responsibility to consider not just the fate of the property under its current ownership, but also its fate decades in the future. Finally, Ms. Barucco noted the importance of the Sansom Street facade, which was also carefully designed.
- Ms. Milroy echoed Ms. Barucco's comments and observed that the nomination convincingly demonstrates that the property meets the cited Criteria for Designation.
- Mr. Laverty identified the building as a transitional example in the field of commercial architecture and called it a "survivor" of everyday stores.
- Mr. McClure described the 1500 block of Chestnut Street as one of the blocks hit hardest by the downturn in Center City's retail environment. He urged the City to look holistically at the value of the property to balance the burden of preservation with the potential for development.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- David Traub commented in support of the nomination.
- Julia Hayman commented in support of the nomination.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The S.S. Kresge Store at 1520-22 Chestnut Street was designed by architects Silverman & Levy, is Art Deco in style, and was built in 1934.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criteria C and D because characteristics of the Art Deco style are evident on both of its street facades.
- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion E, owing to its attribution to Silverman and Levy, an architecture firm that significantly influenced Philadelphia's built environment.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1520-22 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E.

ITEM: 1520-22 Chestnut St					
MOTION: Satisfies Criteria C, D, and E					
MOVED BY: Barucco					
SECONDED BY: Lavery					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, Chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Lavery	X				
Debbie Miller					X
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Total	4				2

ADDRESS: 4732-42 N BROAD ST

Name of Resource: Logan Theatre

Review: Designation

Property Owner: Owen Williamson

Nominator: Staff of the Historical Commission

Staff Contact: Ted Maust, theodore.maust@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 4732-42 N. Broad Street, known as the Logan Theatre, and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The two-story structure was built in 1923 for the Stanley Company of America and operated as a movie theater from its opening in 1924 until the property was sold to a church in 1973. The nomination contends that the property meets Criterion for Designation C as a reflection of the neighborhood movie theaters built between 1913 and 1930, many of which employed broadly Neoclassical styles and were intended to stand out from the surrounding environments. The nominator further argues that the theater's architects, Hoffman & Henon, make it worthy of Criterion for

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION, 19 FEBRUARY 2025

PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION, PRESERVATION@PHILA.GOV

PHILADELPHIA'S PRINCIPAL PUBLIC STEWARD OF HISTORIC RESOURCES

Designation E, as the firm gained national recognition for their work and significantly shaped Philadelphia's built environment through their theaters and commissions for Catholic institutions. Finally, the nomination explores the Logan Theatre's role as a fixture in the Logan neighborhood of Philadelphia, asserting that it exemplifies the cultural and social heritage of the community and merits designation under Criterion J.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the property at 4732-42 N. Broad Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, E, and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:55:45

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Maust presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Damariz Winborne and Nolbert Brown Jr. represented the property owner.

DISCUSSION:

- Ms. Milroy spoke favorably about the nomination and commended Mr. Brown and his collaborators for their vision for the site as the Cicely Tyson Performing Arts Center.
- Ms. Barucco echoed Ms. Milroy's comments and praised the nomination for its information about the architectural firm of Hoffman & Henon.
- Mr. Lavery shared that there were 432 theater buildings constructed in Philadelphia between 1900 and 1932. Of those, about 20 were classified by scholar Irvin Glazer as "movie palaces" having a capacity of over 1,000 seats. While all of the central movie palaces have been demolished, this theater, constructed in a residential neighborhood, is one of only a few movie palaces that might be saved and brought back to use intact, albeit as a performance venue rather than as a movie theater.
 - o Mr. Lavery further shared that he had one of his first movie-going experiences at this theater when his grandmother took him to see *Godzilla Versus Mothra* in 1965.
 - o Mr. Lavery also reiterated the acknowledgement from the nomination that this research would not have been possible without the materials in the Irvin R. Glazer Theater Collection at the Athenaeum and described how Mr. Glazer had entered the Stanley Theatre at 19th and Market Streets while it was being demolished to save the filing cabinets of photographs and records.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Oscar Beisert of the Keeping Society commented in support of the nomination.
- David Traub of Save Our Sites commented in support of the nomination.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- Adapting the Logan Theatre into a performing arts venue would be a beneficial development for preservation and for the arts.
- The Hoffman & Henon architectural firm is notable, especially for its work in theater design.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion C as a neighborhood movie palace in an era where many of those structures were built in distinctive architectural styles.

- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion E for its association with the architecture firm of Hoffman & Henon.
- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion J as a staple of the community during its nearly half-century run as a movie house.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 4732-42 N. Broad Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, E, and J.

ITEM: 4732-42 N Broad St MOTION: Satisfies Criteria C, E, and J MOVED BY: Milroy SECONDED BY: Barucco					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, Chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Lavery	X				
Debbie Miller					X
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Total	4				2

ADDRESS: 3708-12 CHESTNUT ST

Name of Resource: Reed-Hubley Residence, Greenfield Intercultural Center

Proposed Action: Designate

Property Owner: Trustees of the University of Pennsylvania

Nominator: Ke-An Chiang, University City Historical Society

Staff Contact: Heather Hendrickson, heather.hendrickson@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 3708-12 Chestnut Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the former Reed-Hubley residence, built circa 1845, satisfies Criteria for Designation C and J. Under Criterion C, the nomination maintains that the subject property stands as one of the last examples of the small suburban villas once found on Chestnut Street. It exhibits a mixture of romantic architectural styles which were prevalent in the era prior to the 1854 Consolidation Act when the area was known as Blockley Township. Under Criterion J, the nomination argues that the property reflects the evolving history of transportation into the suburban areas outside of central Philadelphia. Also under Criterion J, the nomination argues that as home of the Greenfield Intercultural Center since 1982, the building symbolizes the University of Pennsylvania's evolving approach to fostering diverse student communities on campus.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 3708-12 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:21:02

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Hendrickson presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Amy Lambert of the University City Historical Society represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner.

DISCUSSION:

- Ms. Barucco opined that the building is worthy of designation. She noted that the nomination was well written and researched yet could have been clearer if the property was identified on the historic map images.
- Ms. Milroy commented that the addition of north arrows can also make it easier for those reading nominations.
- Ms. Barucco noted that she thought it was wonderful that the nomination was coming from a student in the preservation field.
- Ms. Milroy commented that she was fascinated by the connection the property had to the Peale family and the fact that the Hubley family started an art supply store in West Philadelphia.
- Mr. Laverty commented on the architecture of the residence and noted that it was a wonderful example of a transitional work between Federal and Italianate styles.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- None.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The property at 3708-12 Chestnut Street is a rare surviving example of an early West Philadelphia suburban residence.
- The property at 3708-12 Chestnut Street is also a rare example of an architecturally transitional piece, built with both Federal and Italianate influences.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The property satisfies Criterion C as one of the last examples of the small suburban villas once found on Chestnut Street, with a mixture of romantic architectural styles which were prevalent in the era.
- The property satisfies Criterion J, as it reflects the evolving history of transportation into the suburban areas outside of central Philadelphia.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 3708-12 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C and J.

ITEM: 3708-12 Chestnut St MOTION: Satisfies Criteria C and J MOVED BY: Barucco SECONDED BY: Lavery					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, Chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Lavery	X				
Debbie Miller					X
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Total	4				2

ADDRESS: 1429 W MAYFIELD ST

Name of Resource: Revell House

Review: Designation

Property Owner: Spiritual Assembly of the Baha'is of Philadelphia

Nominator: Roya Taheri, Spiritual Assembly of the Baha'is of Philadelphia

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 1429 W. Mayfield Street as historic and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the property satisfies Criterion for Designation A. Under Criterion A, the nomination asserts that the house holds significant religious, historical and cultural value, owing to its association with a key moment in the early history of the Bahá'í Faith in the United States. The house is notable for its connection with the Revell family, particularly Mary J. Revell and her daughters, Jessie and Ethel Revell, all influential members of the early Bahá'í community in Philadelphia. It is also historically significant for being one of the locations visited by 'Abdu'l-Bahá during his visit in North America in 1912. The proposed period of significance is 1910-1916, when the Revell family occupied the property.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that 1429 W. Mayfield Street satisfies Criterion for Designation A.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:30:52

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Mehley presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Lorraine Appelbaum and Roya Taheri represented the nomination and property owner.

DISCUSSION:

- Ms. Appelbaum stated that she serves as recording secretary for the Spiritual Assembly of the Baha'is of Philadelphia, the owner of the property. She stated that they intend to apply for a Pennsylvania State Historic Marker and for listing on the National Register of Historic Places.
- Ms. Barucco commented that she was fascinated by the nomination and was very interested in learning about the history of the religion and how this modest rowhouse

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION, 19 FEBRUARY 2025

PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION, PRESERVATION@PHILA.GOV

PHILADELPHIA'S PRINCIPAL PUBLIC STEWARD OF HISTORIC RESOURCES

- was a part of that story.
- Mr. Lavery commented in support of the nomination and thanked the nominators for a well-prepared nomination. He stated that he located a mention of the building permit for the row from 9 April 1888, and a sale of the property from 31 December 1891, meaning that the row was completed by 1891.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Oscar Beisert of the Keeping Society commented in support of the nomination.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The building along with the rest of the row was constructed between 1888 and 1891.
- The house is notable for its connection with the Revell family, particularly Mary J. Revell and her daughters, Jessie and Ethel Revell, all influential members of the early Bahá'í community in Philadelphia.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The building holds significant religious, historical and cultural value, owing to its association with a key moment in the early history of the Bahá'í Faith in the United States, as one of the locations visited by 'Abdu'l-Bahá during his visit in North America in 1912.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1429 W. Mayfield Street satisfies Criterion for Designation A.

ITEM: 1429 W Mayfield St MOTION: Satisfies Criterion A MOVED BY: Lavery SECONDED BY: Barucco					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, Chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Lavery	X				
Debbie Miller					X
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Total	4				2

ADDRESS: 376 MARTIN ST

Name of Resource: German Evangelical Lutheran Bethanien Burial Ground of Manayunk & Roxborough

Review: Designation

Property Owner: Southeastern Pennsylvania Synod of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in America

Nominator: John Manton and Joseph Menkevich

Staff Contact: Kim Chantry, kim.chantry@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the burial ground site at 376 Martin Street as historic and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the property satisfies Criteria for Designation A, I, and J. Under Criterion A, the nomination argues that the burial ground is associated with the lives of persons significant in the past, including Civil War soldiers and German-speaking Lutheran immigrants. Under Criterion I, the nomination contends that the site may be likely to yield information in history. In addition to the burial ground, an 1850 German Lutheran Church stood on the site; it was demolished after Bethany Lutheran Church constructed a new church across the street in 1873. According to the nomination, nearly 1,000 burials were recorded by the turn of the twentieth century. Under Criterion J, the nomination contends that the burial ground exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social, or historical heritage of the community by its connections through its ministers, trustees and its German-speaking immigrant congregants, who were mill workers and mill owners that contributed to the development of Manayunk and Roxborough, and by the German-American Lutheran veterans interred at the site.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the burial ground at 376 Martin Street satisfies Criteria for Designation I and J, but that the arguments for Criterion A are covered under Criterion J and therefore Criterion A can be omitted.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:43:30

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Chantry presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- No one represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner.

DISCUSSION:

- Ms. Milroy commented in support of the nomination and agreed with the staff's recommendation regarding Criterion A.
- Mr. Reuter asked about the ownership of the property.
 - o Mr. Farnham indicated that notice was sent to the Southeastern Pennsylvania Synod of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in America, owing to the closure of Bethany Lutheran Church.
- Ms. Cooperman and Ms. Barucco commented on the presentation of the material in the nomination, stating that the argument is somewhat buried in the way the research and images are provided in the nomination. They suggested that nominators should better synthesize the findings of their research rather than simply providing all of their research.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- None.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- Nearly 1,000 burials were recorded by the turn of the twentieth century at this site, including Civil War veterans and German-speaking Lutheran immigrants.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The site may be likely to yield information in history, as a burial ground and the location of an 1850 German Lutheran Church that was demolished after Bethany Lutheran Church constructed a new church across the street in 1873, satisfying Criterion I.
- The burial ground exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social, or historical heritage of the community by its connections through its ministers, trustees and its German-speaking immigrant congregants, who were mill workers and mill owners that contributed to the development of Manayunk and Roxborough, and by the German-American Lutheran veterans interred at the site, satisfying Criterion J.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the burial ground at 376 Martin Street satisfies Criteria for Designation I and J.

ITEM: 376 Martin St					
MOTION: Satisfies Criteria I and J					
MOVED BY: Barucco					
SECONDED BY: Lavery					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, Chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Lavery	X				
Debbie Miller					X
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Total	4				2

ADDRESS: 820-26 E ALLEGHENY AVE

Name of Resource: Beneficial Savings Fund Society, Kensington Branch

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Majestic Property Management, LLC

Nominator: Historical Commission staff

Staff Contact: Dan Shachar-Krasnoff, daniel.shachar-krasnoff@phila.gov

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the Beneficial Savings Fund Society (BSFS), Kensington Branch, 820-26 E. Allegheny Avenue, and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the BSFS, Kensington Branch, constructed in 1924 and enlarged in 1934 and 1952, satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E.

Under Criteria C and D, the nomination argues that the building's first two construction campaigns are in the Classical Revival Style and the third campaign is in the Modernist Style. Under Criterion E, the nomination maintains that the firm of Horace Trumbauer, designer of the first two campaigns, was a major force in American architecture from the late 1890's through the early 1950's and promoted the Classical Revival style. Paul Monaghan, designer of the third campaign, created eclectic buildings for Roman Catholic and Roman Catholic-related institutions. The period of significance spans from 1923, when construction began, through 1965 shortly after the last documentary photograph with Mid-Century Modern style signs.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the property at 820-26 E. Allegheny Avenue, the BSFS, Kensington Branch, satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 1:58:00

PRESENTERS:

- Mr. Shachar-Krasnoff presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- No one represented the property owner.

DISCUSSION:

- Ms. Barucco complimented the nomination and expressed support for listing the building on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. She noted that the design of the 1953 addition was skillful, harmonizing with the original building while being appropriately differentiated.
- Ms. Barucco disagreed with the nomination's author regarding Figure 18. She thought the elevation drawing for the 1952-53 addition that showed the removal of the original balustrade was a drafting convention and was not meant for its removal when constructed.
- Ms. Cooperman stated that she supports the nomination and found the building interesting in comparison with another wedge-shaped building, the recently designated property at 6701 N. Broad Street, the former Oak Lane Trust Company Bank, designed by Ralph Bencker.
- Mr. Lavery opined that the BSFS Kensington Branch building relates nicely with the rooflines of neighboring rowhouses, being monumental but still in scale with its surroundings. Mr. Lavery continued that the 1952-53 addition is similar in appearance to the Howe and Lescaze branch banks for the Philadelphia Savings Fund Society and the postwar bank building in Mayfair that featured large plate glass windows.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- None.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The first two construction campaigns for the Beneficial Savings Fund Society, Kensington Branch are in the Classical Revival Style and the third campaign is in the Modernist Style.
- The firm of Horace Trumbauer was a major force in American architecture from the late 1890's through the early 1950's and promoted the Classical Revival style. Paul Monaghan created eclectic buildings for Roman Catholic and Roman Catholic-

related institutions.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criteria C and D, with characteristics of the Classical Revival style in the 1923-24 and 1934 campaigns; and the Modernist style in the 1952-53 campaign.
- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion E because the firm of Horace Trumbauer was a major force in American architecture from the late 1890's through the early 1950's. Paul Monaghan created eclectic buildings for Roman Catholic and Roman Catholic-related institutions.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 820-26 E. Allegheny Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E.

ITEM: 820-26 E Allegheny Ave					
MOTION: Satisfies Criteria C, D, and E					
MOVED BY: Lavery					
SECONDED BY: Barucco					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, Chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Lavery	X				
Debbie Miller					X
Elizabeth Milroy					X
Total	3				3

ADJOURNMENT

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 02:07:09

ACTION: The Committee on Historic Designation adjourned at 11:47 a.m.

PLEASE NOTE:

- Minutes of the Philadelphia Historical Commission and its advisory Committees are presented in action format. Additional information is available in the video recording for this meeting. The start time for each agenda item in the recording is noted.
- Application materials and staff overviews are available on the Historical Commission's website, www.phila.gov/historical.

CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION

§14-1004. Designation.

(1) Criteria for Designation.

A building, complex of buildings, structure, site, object, or district may be designated for preservation if it:

- (a) Has significant character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth, or nation or is associated with the life of a person significant in the past;
- (b) Is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation;
- (c) Reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style;
- (d) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or engineering specimen;
- (e) Is the work of a designer, architect, landscape architect or designer, or professional engineer whose work has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural development of the City, Commonwealth, or nation;
- (f) Contains elements of design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant innovation;
- (g) Is part of or related to a square, park, or other distinctive area that should be preserved according to a historic, cultural, or architectural motif;
- (h) Owing to its unique location or singular physical characteristic, represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, community, or City;
- (i) Has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in pre-history or history; or
- (j) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social, or historical heritage of the community.