

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

21 March 1984

Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman

Present: Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman, Architectural Advisor to the Commission
Theodore T. Bartley, Jr., F.A.I.A., Preservation Committee, American Institute
of Architects, Philadelphia Chapter
Penelope H. Batcheler, Historical Architect for Independence National Historical
Park
John Dickey, F.A.I.A.
William Blades, Philadelphia Historic Preservation Corporation
Richard Tyler, Historian
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Architectural Historian
Sara Reiter, City Planner Trainee

Also: David Beck and Cecil Hetrick, Architects to request permission to demolish
111 South 2nd Street and to present plans and a model for the rehabilita-
tion of 107-109 South 2nd Street and the construction of a new addition
on the site of 111-113 South 2nd Street.
Andrew Moroz and Judy Hendrickson, Architects, to present a proposal for
the rehabilitation of 111-113 Beck Street.
Charles Burnette, Architect, to present plans for the restoration of the
facade of 240 South 3rd Street.
William Ciolko, of the Philadelphia Housing Development Corporation to discuss
with the Committee the proposed rehabilitation of 5132 Tabor Road and
5120, 5122 and 5124 Tabor Road.
Michael Closeme of the Office of Housing and Community Development to
review with the Committee a set of rehabilitation specifications for
125 Christian Street.
Frank Lyburn of the Office of Housing and Community Development to present
a proposal for the rehabilitation of 1609 St. Paul Street.
John Rauch, Architect, to present plans for the rehabilitation and reuse
of the carriage house at 213-219 Fitzwater Street.
Larry Gilbert, Architect, and Jack Dichter, Owner, to present a proposal
for the construction of an addition to the rear of 1021 Waverly Street.
Bob Buyer of Capstone Construction to present plans for the construction
of a rear addition to 2107 Delancey Street and the restoration of its
facade.
Harry J.J. O'Neil, Esq., representing the College of Physicians, to present
for the Committee's consideration a master development plan for the College.

SUBMISSIONS FOR ALTERATIONS

- ✓ 107-109 and 111 South 2nd Street, David Beck and Cecil Hetrick, Architects.
Messrs. Beck and Hetrick appeared before the Architectural Committee to
present their proposal for the rehabilitation of 107-109 South 2nd Street,
a 1930's commercial building, the demolition of 111 South 2nd Street and
the construction of a new, contemporary addition on the 111-113 site.

In October of 1983, the Architectural Committee met with the owner of the buildings, Gus Falcione, to discuss his proposal to significantly alter the facades of the two buildings or demolish them and build a "colonial" reproduction. At that meeting, the Committee suggested to Mr. Falcione the preservation and restoration of 107-109 South 2nd Street. The Committee further recommended that Mr. Falcione either add additional floors atop the building at 111 or demolish it and construct a new, larger, contemporary addition to the remaining building.

Mr. Falcione, in consultation with his architect, evaluated his needs and decided to opt for the demolition of the small building at 111 and the construction of a new addition on the 111-113 site. In response to this decision, Mr. Beck prepared plans for the new addition and submitted them to the Architectural Committee with a request for permission to demolish the building at 111.

The members of the Architectural Committee found the design of the proposed new addition to be sympathetic and in keeping with the character and scale of the historic structure at 107-109 and voted to recommend an approval, in concept, of the proposed project. The Committee also voted to recommend that the Commission allow the demolition of the building at 111 South 2nd Street. A more complete and detailed set of plans will be forthcoming.

Mrs. Batcheler expressed her desire to examine the party wall of the building at 111 before demolition and construction begins. The architect agreed to make the necessary arrangements for Mrs. Batcheler to see the structure.

- ✓ 111-113 Beck Street, Andrew Moroz and Judy Hendrickson, Architects. Mr. Moroz and Ms. Hendrickson presented to the members of the Architectural Committee their proposal for the rehabilitation of the buildings at 111-113 Beck Street, two, small eighteenth century houses.

The proposal, as described by Ms. Hendrickson, calls for the cleaning and repointing of brickwork, the reproduction of the original wood cornice, the installation of a new pole gutter and new front doors. Other existing fabric on the building will be cleaned and repaired. On the facade of 111 Beck, the Committee approved lengthening the basement window, below grade, to allow for additional light into the cellar. The Committee suggested the installation of a safety grate over the well in the sidewalk to prevent someone from accidentally walking into the well.

After some discussion, the Committee voted to recommend an approval of this project. The house, however, will not be eligible for a plaque, at this time, since the work proposed will not constitute a complete restoration.

- ✓ 240 South 3rd Street, Charles Burnette, Architect. Mr. Burnette presented for the Committee's review his proposal for the restoration of the facade of 240 South 3rd Street, an 1820's Federal townhouse.

The Committee found the architect's proposed treatment of the elevation to be acceptable and voted to recommend its approval. The Committee requested, also, that a complete set of drawings, including plans, be submitted for file.

/ 5120, 5122 and 5124 Tabor Road and 5132 Tabor Road, Bill Ciolko, Philadelphia Housing development Corporation. Mr. Ciolko discussed with the Committee members a list of rehabilitation specifications which described briefly the scope of work proposed for the buildings at 5120, 5122, 5124 and 5132 Tabor Road. These buildings, three workers' houses and a mansion, comprise the remains of Whitker Mills, a nineteenth century industrial complex.

The Committee found the specifications to be inadequate and asked Mr. Ciolko for additional information. They suggested that each feature of the building scheduled for rehabilitation be photographed and a detailed description of the proposed work prepared. All original fabric including cornices, windows, doors, etc. should be preserved and repaired wherever possible. Mr. Ciolko agreed to comply with the Committee's recommendations and prepare the additional documentation.

The Committee directed Mr. Ciolko to make his resubmission to the Commission staff for review and approval. If the staff finds the proposed work to be acceptable and in conformance with the Committee's directions to Mr. Ciolko, a final approval may be granted. If some problem or difficulty arises, another appearance before the Committee will be required.

125 Christian Street, Michael Closeme, Office of Housing and Community Development. Mr. Closeme discussed with the Committee members proposed renovations to the house at 125 Christian Street, a two-and-a-half story, nineteenth century structure.

The proposed work, as described by Mr. Closeme, includes the replacement of the wood framing in the ground floor storefront area, the reconstruction, in kind, of the wood cornice, the installation of a new asphalt shingle roof and the stabilization and repair of the brickwork along the roofline on the building's gable wall. Concerning this last item, the Committee recommended that the existing brickwork remain undisturbed and that it be covered and secured with a metal capping. The Committee also agreed to allow the installation of plywood, painted black, behind the large plate glass store windows on the ground floor to provide the owner with some additional security.

The Committee further reviewed the scope of the proposed work on this project and, following some discussion, voted to recommend a final approval.

1609 St. Paul Street, Frank Lyburn, Office of Housing and Community Development. Mr. Lyburn discussed with the members of the Architectural Committee his office's proposed rehabilitation of the house situate at 1609 St. Paul Street, an 1890's rowhouse.

The work described by Mr. Lyburn includes the replacement of asphalt shingles on the front bay with soft siding, the repair of all deteriorated brownstone, the replacement, in wood, of deteriorated porch columns and rails.

It was the opinion of the Architectural Committee that the treatment of the front bay at 1609 St. Paul should match that next door at 1611 to achieve a uniform appearance. In addition, the Committee asked that the components of the front porch be salvaged and repaired, if possible. To preserve the wood posts, the Committee suggested that they be set on plinths and not placed directly on the porch floor.

The Committee, after discussing the proposed work and providing Mr. Lyburn with some direction, recommended that the staff meet on site to examine the building, assess its condition, and offer any additional advice necessary for a final approval of this project.

✓ 213-219 Fitzwater Street, John Rauch, Architect. Mr. Rauch presented to the Committee members for review his plans for the conversion of an 1899 carriage house into nine apartments and a garage.

The Commission found the architect's proposal to be acceptable and recommended its approval.

1021 Waverly Street, Larry Gilbert, Architect and Jack Dichter, Owner. Messrs. Gilbert and Dichter presented to the members of the Architectural Committee plans for the construction of an addition on the rear of the building at 1021 Waverly Street, a small, nineteenth century house.

The Committee examined the architect's proposal to continue the slope of the A frame roof on the front of the house to a higher peak and, at the same time, raise the rear portion of the roof thereby increasing the headroom in the presently unusable third floor. It was the opinion of the Committee that the proposed treatment significantly altered the original configuration of the roofline of the building and was unacceptable. They suggested instead that the architect retain the original pitch of the roof on the facade and erect the new wall of the addition vertically behind the ridge pole. This treatment would retain the original form of the old building and still provide the owner with additional usable floor area.

The architect was directed to further study the design of the new addition taking into consideration the Committee's recommendations and to resubmit his revised drawing at the next meeting.

21 March 1984

✓ 2107 Delancey Street, Bob Buyer of Capstone Construction Company. Mr. Buyer presented to the Architectural Committee plans for the construction of a new addition at the rear of 2107 Delancey Street and for the restoration of the building's front facade. Built c. 1862, 2107 Delancey Street stands three stories tall and two bays wide.

On the rear elevation, the Committee suggested the use of larger panes of glass, than proposed, and the introduction of control joints to give the building addition proportions which better conform to the character of the original design. On the front facade, the Committee asked for panelled shutters on the ground floor only and louvered shutters above as per the 1862 insurance survey for the property. Mr. Levy agreed to walk the street and report back on what shutters and doors could be used as models for 2107.

Subject to a revision of the rear elevation and some direction from Mr. Levy regarding an appropriate door and shutters for the front facade, a final approval of this project is recommended.

DEMOLITIONS

✓ 20, 22 and 24 South 21st Street, Harry J.J. O'Neill, Attorney for the Philadelphia College of Physicians.

On 18 February 1984, the Architectural Committee reviewed the request of the College of Physicians for permission to demolish the buildings situate at 20, 22 and 24 South 21st Street and recommended to the Historical Commission that its six-month statutory delay be imposed. The Historical Commission at its meeting of 1 March 1984 determined, however, that it could not act upon the Committee's recommendation since the College did not submit a demolition permit application with its request. The Commission refused to accept the College's letter of intent as a proper application. As a result, the Architectural Committee was asked to consider again the College's request and any additional information submitted.

Mr. O'Neill once again appeared before the Committee to request permission, for the College of Physicians, to demolish the buildings at 20, 22 and 24 South 21st Street to provide surface parking for the College. Mr. O'Neill submitted for review, as requested by the Architectural Committee, the College's 1969 Master Plan for development of the 21st Street site and some adjoining property. He explained to the Committee that the 1969 plan was out-dated and that the College had not yet developed a new plan to replace it. The College plans to use the 21st Street site, temporarily, for parking and will, at some future time, develop the parcel.

Following some discussion, the Committee reiterated its recommendation of 18 February 1984 to the Historical Commission to delay the demolition of the buildings at 20, 22 and 24 South 21st Street for the statutory six month

period. They further suggested that the College be encouraged to market the buildings or to develop them for income-producing purposes,

PLAQUES

- ✓ 309 Fitzwater Street. The Committee reviewed the owner's application for a plaque and the accompanying photograph and found a discrepancy between the address on the application and that on the photograph. Mr. Levy asked that the application form be corrected to read 309 Fitzwater Street, instead of 311, to agree with the building shown in the photograph.

Following some discussion, the Committee voted to recommend the issuance of a Certified Restored plaque to 309 Fitzwater Street subject to the painting of the downspout. The color should match that of the other trim on the front facade.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:35 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Patricia Siemiontkowski
Architectural Historian