

283
SEPT 1984

MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

15 August 1984

Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman

- Present: Theodore T. Bartley, Jr., F.A.I.A., Acting Chairman in Mr. Levy's absence,
Preservation Committee, American Institute of Architects, Philadelphia
Chapter
Penelope H. Batcheler, Historical Architect, Independence National Historical
Park
John Dickey, F.A.I.A.
Janet S. Klein, Vice Chairman of the Commission
Bill Blades, Philadelphia Historic Preservation Corporation
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Architectural Historian
- Also: Martin J. Rosenblum, Architect, to present plans for renovations to the
Robert Morris Hotel at 1701 Arch Street.
Ivan Blitz, Architect, The Blitz Group, to present revised plans for the
rehabilitation of 222-226 Race Street and 223-227 Arch Street.
Henry Brinn to submit a sketch for the reconstruction of the front facade
of 11 Queen Street.
Joel Levinson, Architect and Robert Bayers to present plans for the
rehabilitation of 30-32 North 3rd Street.
Frank Gatlin, Architect of David Beck Architects and Tom Wagner of
Historic Landmarks for Living to present plans for the rehabilitation
and adaptive reuse of the Wills Eye Hospital at 16th and Spring Garden
Streets.
Dr. Meltzer, Owner of 2010 Spring Garden Street, to discuss with the
Committee his proposal for repairs to the brownstone front of his
house.
Mark Mendel, Attorney, to discuss with the Committee his proposal to
install Garden State brickface on the rear of his building at 1620
Locust Street.
David Hollenberg, Architect with John Milnor Associates, and Tom Wagner
of Historic Landmarks for Living to present plans for the rehabilitation
and reuse of the Packard Motor Building at 317 North Broad Street.
Tom McCann of Hans Stein Associates to present a resubmission for the
proposed rehabilitation of 136-138 North 2nd Street.
Paul Calvert, Architect, to discuss proposed renovations to the rear
garden wall of 328 Spruce Street.
Charles E. Peterson, Irene Schrank, Ellen Miller and Kathleen Stephenson
to testify regarding alterations to the rear of 328 Spruce Street.
Fritz Wieblehouse of Bower Lewis Thrower/Architects, and Tom Wagner of
Historic Landmarks for Living to present plans for the rehabilitation
and reuse of Thomas Scientific at 250 North 3rd Street.
Susan Maxman, Architect and David Hollenberg, Architect to present their
proposal for alterations to 123 South 22nd Street.
Stan Cairns to present plans for renovations to 116 Fitzwater Street.

SUBMISSIONS FOR ALTERATIONS

1701-1705 Arch Street, Martin J. Rosenblum, Architect. Mr. Rosenblum presented to the members of the Architectural Committee his proposal for renovations to the lobby and ground floor storefront area. Constructed between 1914 and 1921, the Robert Morris Hotel (originally known as the Wesley Building), stands fourteen stories tall and has terra cotta clad, Gothic design facades.

Mr. Rosenblum's plans call for the introduction of a revolving door along 17th Street, as shown on the original Balinger construction drawings. To comply with code requirements, the architect explained his need to introduce a new pair of front doors into the adjoining shopfront to the south since revolving doors do not meet exit requirements. Finally, the owner intends to remove a pair of original interior doors from the lobby and install them on the main entrance on Arch Street.

The Committee, following some discussion, voted to recommend an approval of Mr. Rosenblum's proposal in concept. They asked, however, that he study carefully the proportions of the design of the proposed storefront alteration and that he chose materials consistent with the existing fabric. The Committee further recommended that the architect conduct a paint analysis to determine the original color scheme for the building including the storefronts. As requested by the Committee, the architect agreed to submit for review, at a later date, details of the 17th Street storefront alterations and photographs of the interior doors to be removed to the Arch Street facade.

222-226 Race Street, The Blitz Group, Ivan Blitz, Architect. Mr. Blitz submitted to the Architectural Committee his revised plans for the rehabilitation of 222-226 Race Street, a four story commercial loft structure constructed in 1885.

As requested by the Architectural Committee, Mr. Blitz corrected his original submission to conform with the Committee's recommendations made at its meeting of 18 July 1984. The members found the revised submission to be acceptable and voted to recommend its approval.

223-227 Arch Street, The Blitz Group, Ivan Blitz, Architect. Mr. Blitz presented for the Committee's consideration revised plans for the rehabilitation and reuse of 223-227 Arch Street, a five story, turn-of-the century, brick building in Old City.

The Committee found the revised plans, submitted by the architect, to conform with the recommendations offered by the Architectural Committee at its meeting of 18 July 1984. A final approval of this project is recommended subject to the review and approval of an entrance door design. The architect agreed to continue his research on the original design of the entrance doors and to submit a detailed drawing of his proposal at a later date.

328 Spruce Street (rear elevation along Cypress Street), Paul Calvert, Architect. At the request of the Historical Commission staff, Mr. Calvert appeared before the Architectural Committee to discuss his client's recent removal of the garden wall along Cypress Street and intent to construct new wood gates to provide access to the rear of the property for parking. The staff informed the members of the Committee that a building permit application had been submitted calling for the replacement of the garden wall. The staff assumed that replacement would be in kind. The matter came to the attention of the staff, again, when neighbors expressed concern over the demolition of the wall and the proposed construction of gates for proposed parking. Several neighbors testified in opposition to the demolition of the wall and use of the rear yard for parking particularly in view of its facing Delancey Park and being highly visible. Since the staff was unaware of the owner's true intention, Mr. Calvert was asked to appear before the Committee to explain his client's proposal.

Following some discussion, the Committee agreed that before any review of the proposed alterations could take place, the owner would need to secure zoning approval for use of the rear yard for parking and Streets Department approval for a curb cut on Cypress Street. Until these approvals have been obtained, the Architectural Committee agreed that it should not review any proposal for the construction of gates. In the meanwhile, the Committee directed the staff to request that the Department of Licenses and Inspections revoke the outstanding permit for exterior alterations until the owner has secured from Zoning and Streets all the required approvals. When these approvals have been granted, the Historical Commission and its Architectural Committee will review Mr. Calvert's plans for design compatibility with the streetscape and the neighborhood.

30-32 North 3rd Street, Joel Levinson and Robert Bayers, Architects. Mr. Levinson presented to the members of the Architectural Committee plans for the rehabilitation and reuse of 30-32 North 3rd Street, two nineteenth century commercial loft buildings.

The Committee examined the plans and raised some concern over the proposed treatment of the north elevation along Wister Alley. As described, the architect intends to infill and/or enlarge all the openings on the north elevation creating an entirely new fenestration. The Committee expressed its opinion that such a treatment may not meet with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines since it completely alters the original scale and rhythm of that elevation.

The Committee suggested that the architect file his Part II Certification form with the Bureau for Historic Preservation in Harrisburg to obtain a preliminary reading on the proposed treatment of the north elevation. The Committee agreed that if the State Preservation office were willing to accept the change in fenestration for ERTA certification, the Committee would, as well. The architect agreed to follow this course of action

and to resubmit to the Architectural Committee following State review and comment.

No action is required at this time.

- 11 Queen Street, Henry Brinn, Owner. Mr. Brinn presented to the members of the Architectural Committee a sketch showing the proposed replacement of the front facade of 11 Queen Street, a two-and-a-half story, mid-eighteenth century house.

Mr. Brinn explained to the Committee his intention to replace the front facade of 11 Queen Street which over the years was covered with permastone and with aluminum siding. The Committee members suggested to Mr. Brinn that the facade, if structurally sound, could be restored to its original appearance based on documentation in the Commission files and an examination of the building fabric. Mrs. Batcheler and Ms. Siemiontkowski agreed to meet with Mr. Brinn on site to determine the condition of the facade and to recommend a course of action.

Subsequent to the 18 July meeting, an on-site meeting was held. The facade was found to be structurally sound and agreement concerning its preservation was reached. Mrs. Batcheler offered to prepare a sketch of the facade which was given to Mr. Brinn so that he might obtain a cost estimate of the proposed work. Window, door, shutter and pent eave details were provided by the staff.

No action is required at this time.

- 2010 Spring Garden Street, Dr. Meltzer, Owner. Dr. Meltzer appeared before the members of the Architectural Committee to discuss his proposed repair of the brownstone front at 2010 Spring Garden Street, a three-and-a-half story, nineteenth century townhouse.

Dr. Meltzer reported on the extremely deteriorated condition of the brownstone facade and his desire to reduce or eliminate the ornamental brownstone features, stucco over the remaining fabric and paint the whole a brownstone color. He expressed his intention to keep the form of the lintels, sills, etc. but not the fine details.

The Committee offered several suggestions. They recommended that he contact Howard Serlik concerning the restoration of the brownstone facade. Mr. Serlik has had considerable experience in this area. They further suggested that, if stucco were to be used, a colored stucco should be considered. The brownstone should not be painted.

Dr. Meltzer agreed to contact Mr. Serlik to obtain his advice. The Committee further asked for the submission of a drawing showing the front elevation of the building and specifying, in detail, the proposed repairs. The Committee warned Dr. Meltzer that the house would not be

eligible for receipt of a plaque if the building were stripped of its ornament instead of being restored.

No action is required at this time.

Wills Eye Hospital, 16th and Spring Garden Streets, Frank Gatlin of David Beck Architects and Tom Wagner of Historic Landmarks for Living. Messrs. Gatlin and Wagner presented to the members of the Architectural Committee plans for the rehabilitation and reuse of the Wills Eye Hospital as a residential complex. Wills Hospital was built in 1930 from the designs of John T. Windrim, Architect.

The Committee reviewed the plans submitted and found them to be acceptable. A final approval of this project is recommended

1620 Locust Street rear (1621-23 Latimer Street), Mark Mendel, Esq., Owner. Mr. Mandel appeared before the members of the Architectural Committee to request permission to cover the entire rear masonry wall of his building with Garden State brickface. Mr. Mandel explained that approximately six years ago the Latimer Street elevation was painted and treated with silicone. Owing to dampness and seepage of moisture into the building, the entire rear had been repointed before the brick was painted and treated. Since then, the paint has eroded and moisture continues to be a problem particularly at the window sills. Aesthetically, Mr. Mandel finds his rear elevation to be unacceptable. To correct these conditions, Mr. Mandel expressed his desire to cover the existing conditions with Garden State brickface - a colored stucco treatment which can be scored to resemble brick.

The Committee considered Mr. Mandel's request and examined a sample panel submitted by Garden State brickface Company. Following some discussion, Mr. Bartley agreed to inspect two other buildings in the area treated in the proposed fashion and to report his findings to the staff.

Subsequent to the meeting, Mr. Bartley and Mr. Levy visited the buildings at 15th and Pine Streets and 17th and Pine Streets and agreed to approve the proposed treatment provided the texture of the brickface is smooth and a uniform color and that the joint is identical in size to that of the original brickwork. Mr. Levy asked that a sample area of the building be prepared for inspection before the entire project is undertaken. Mr. Mandel agreed to have the sample area prepared and to notify the Commission staff when it may be inspected.

The Committee recommends an approval of this project subject to the above outlined requirements.

123 South 22nd Street, Susan Maxman and David Hollenberg, Architects. Ms. Maxman presented plans and discussed with the Committee her proposal for alterations to the building at 123 South 22nd Street, a three-story, brick and stone dwelling built in 1886 and attributed to the firm of Furness, Evans & Company.

Ms. Maxman explained her intention to restore and rehabilitate the existing terra cotta tile roof, to clean and repoint exterior masonry walls, to remove and replace brick infill on the north elevation where a bay had been removed (new brickwork to match original), to remove a wood shed covering existing exterior stairs to the basement and to install a new wrought iron railing and to construct a new wood fence at the rear of the property to screen four condensing units at grade.

Following some discussion of the proposed work, the Committee voted to recommend an approval of Ms. Maxman's plans. If budget permits, the Committee recommends strongly that the architect consider the reconstruction of the missing bay window on the north elevation of the house.

Packard Motor Company Building, 317 N. Broad Street, David Hollenberg, Architect and Tom Wagner, Historic Landmarks for Living. Messrs. Hollenberg and Wagner presented to the Committee for review plans for the renovation and reuse of the Packard Motor Company Building, a seven-story, terra cotta clad structure built in 1910-11.

The Committee members reviewed the plans and voted to recommend their approval. If changes are required by the Bureau for Historic Preservation in Harrisburg in order to obtain tax act certification, a resubmission of the revised drawings must be made.

Thomas Scientific, 250 North 3rd Street, Fritz Wieblehouse of Bower Lewis Thrower/Architects and Tom Wagner of Historic Landmarks for Living. Messrs. Wieblehouse and Wagner presented to the Committee plans for the rehabilitation and reuse of the Thomas Scientific buildings in Old City.

The Committee reviewed the plans and recommended two changes. They suggested that the new infill to the north of the Diehl Building be set back slightly from the building line. They recommended also, on the Vine Street elevation, that the rolling doors be replaced with full height doors eliminating the infill transom directly above them.

Subject to these changes, a final approval of this project is recommended.

136-138 North 2nd Street, Mike McCann of Hans Stein Associates. Mr. McCann presented to the Committee his revised elevation drawing for 136-138 North 2nd Street, a turn-of-the-century commercial loft building.

The Committee members found the revised submission to be acceptable and voted to recommend its approval.

18 August 1984

116 Fitzwater Street, Stan Cairns, Applicant. Mr. Cairns presented to the Committee plans for renovations to 116 Fitzwater Street. Since the proposed renovations will not affect the exterior appearance of the house, the Committee recommended a final approval.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted

Patricia Siemiontkowski
Architectural Historian