

PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION
COMMITTEE ON CERTIFICATION
MINUTES

14 JULY 1980

Present: Edward Pinkowski, Chairman of the Committee on Certification and Member,
Philadelphia Historical Commission
Janet Klein, Vice-Chairman of the Philadelphia Historical Commission
John O. Higgins, Chief, Area Planning Division, City Planning Commission
James E. Mooney, Director, Historical Society of Pennsylvania
Hyman Myers, A.I.A.

Richard Tyler, Historian
Jefferson M. Moak, Historical Research Technician
Patricia A. Siemiontkowski, Executive Assistant to the Chairman

Also: Bud Ross, Bud Ross & Associates, architect of renovations to 729 S.
2nd Street to request certification of this building.
James Kise, Drum Moir Corporation, to present plans for the
rehabilitation of the Drum Moir Heating House as requested by
the Committee on Certification.

The fifth meeting of the Committee on Certification met at 2:30 p.m. on Monday,
14 July 1980, in Room 1313, City Hall Annex.

NEW SUBMISSIONS FOR CERTIFICATION

✓ 8000 St. Martins Lane, a.k.a. 401 W. Willow Grove Avenue, St. Martin in the Fields
Episcopal Church. (Owner: Church of St. Martin in the Fields).
Erected 1888-1889 from the designs of George W. & William D. Hewitt, this
one-story, stone church is built along a cruciform plan. The openings
along the side made the building appear two stories in height. At the ends
of the transept are located large rose windows. A five-sided baptistry,
designed by Theophilus P. Chandler in 1899, is attached to the southeast
end of the transept. Two ante-rooms appear on the northwest side. In 1902,
a gable roofed sanctuary was added to the northeast (or St. Martins Lane)
side of the church, also of a design by Chandler. The dominant feature of
this church is the bell tower, part of the original design, standing
approximately four stories high on the southeast side of the building.
The church forms part of Henry H. Houston's development for this portion of
Chestnut Hill and is contemporary with the Wissahickon Inn and Drum Moir.

The Committee unanimously recommended certification of the Church of St.
Martin in the Fields, 8000 St. Martins Lane, a.k.a. 401 W. Willow Grove Avenue.

107 West School House Lane, the James Matthews House. (Owner: Elizabeth Shelenberger).
This unusually fine house is a typical 2½ story building with a full cellar
characteristic of Germantown's Federal architecture. Constructed ca. 1800
by Jacob Groot, it was sold first to James Matthews in 1807 and then to the
Germantown Academy in 1810 for use as housing for their students. The
exterior walls are of stone covered with stucco. The house measures 35 feet
wide and 31 feet deep with a kitchen wing 22 x 16.

The Committee unanimously recommended certification of the James Matthews
House, 107 West School House Lane.

36-42 East Price Street, First Baptist Church of Germantown. (Owner: Polite Temple Baptist Church).

A fine late example of the Greek revival in Philadelphia, this one story church stands on a raised basement with a Corinthian portico and gable roof. The facade of the church is distinguished by its Greek Temple appearance. It was constructed in 1852-1853 from the designs of Samuel Sloan to house the first Baptist congregation to take root in Germantown. A one-story addition exists on the west side of the ground floor. This building has been recorded by the Historic American Buildings Survey.

The Committee unanimously recommended the certification of 36-42 East Price Street, First Baptist Church of Germantown.

5140 Morris Street, Manheim. (Owner: Germantown Cricket Club).

Manheim is an excellent example of the Georgian revival. The center building is a 2½ story brick building with 3 pavilions on the front side and a two-story porch on the side facing the playing fields. It was constructed in 1890-1891 from the designs of Charles F. McKim of McKim, Mead and White, who also designed the addition of the wings in 1902 and 1907. The Germantown Cricket Club holds the distinction of being the second oldest cricket club in the United States, after the Philadelphia. This building has been recorded by the Historic American Buildings Survey.

The Committee unanimously recommended the certification of 5140 Morris Street, Manheim, home of the Germantown Cricket Club.

3822 Ridge Avenue, Laurel Hill Cemetery Gatehouse. (Owner: Laurel Hill Cemetery).

Laurel Hill Cemetery was laid out in 1836 by John Notman. The entrance was completed in 1837 although the other buildings on the grounds were not completed until 1839. In designing more than a burial ground, Notman designed a picturesque arboretum and a prototype for public parks in America. The gatehouse is a two-story stone building with stuccoed-brick lateral wings, flat roof and a flat Doric octastyle portico with barrel-vault entrance, measuring approximately 65' by 30'. This building appears on the Historic American Building Survey.

The Committee unanimously recommended the certification of 3822 Ridge Avenue, the Laurel Hill Cemetery Gatehouse.

1801-1819 Diamond Street, The George W. Smith Memorial Protestant Church of the Advocate. (Owners: Trustees of the Church of the Advocate).

Erected 1891-1897 from the designs of Charles M. Burns, this building was generally described in contemporary newspaper accounts as being modelled on Amiens cathedral. It sits slightly askew on its lot to line up true east-west, orienting the building according to ancient medieval practices. In plan, it takes the medieval French articulated cruciform shape of long nave by broad transept, and terminated by the developed chevet. The Church provides Philadelphia with a rare example of the monumental masonry space that characterizes the grand public and ecclesiastical architecture of Europe. This building is registered with the Pennsylvania Inventory and recorded by the Historic American Buildings Survey.

The Committee unanimously recommended the certification of 1801-1819 Diamond Street, The George W. Smith Memorial Protestant Church of the Advocate.

2-6 West Girard Avenue, a.k.a. 1148-1162 Frankford Avenue, Kensington National Bank. (Owner: The First Pennsylvania Company).

Designed by Frank Furness in 1877, the Kensington National Bank remains the only one of three surviving banking structures by Furness and the only one used as a bank today. It is one of the purest Neo-Grec works Furness ever designed. The corner is cut off at an angle for the entrance and principle

facade decorative emphasis, rising to a large clock at the top with Kensington National Bank inscribed in the stonework in a rustic style lettering. The surfaces are enriched with incised linear and floral ornament, ironwork grills of abstract patterns at the windows and roundels and other Neo-Grec details. The building is recorded with the Historic American Building Survey.

The Committee unanimously recommended the certification of 2-8 West Girard Avenue, a.k.a. 1148-1162 Frankford Avenue, The Kensington National Bank.

729 South 2nd Street. (Owner: Irvin Udell)

This $3\frac{1}{2}$ story, brick building was erected 1843 by Samuel Fortin in the Southwark section of the city as a dwelling and store. Alterations c. 1900 changed the appearance of the ground floor giving it a turn-of-the-century shopfront.

Mr. Bud Ross of Bud Ross & Associates appeared before the Committee to request certification. He was responsible for recent alterations to the building which had been vacant for approximately 10 years. It was pointed out by the Committee that, although the interior of the building demonstrated its historical qualities, there remained little on the outside to show this. Referring back to the problem with 2129 Cypress Street in which Louis Kahn did interior alterations with little sympathetic exterior alterations, the Committee felt that it could not recommend for certification a private building in which only the interior space qualified it as a historical structure.

The Committee unanimously recommended that 729 South 2nd Street not be certified.

Drum Moir. The Heating House, 777 W. Valley Green Road. (The present Carriage House, Owner: James Kise).

The Heating House is a two-story Wissahickon schist building with a stuccoed rear (southwest side) and a brick and stucco southeast side, both of which were initially attached to greenhouses. The building measures 28 feet 4 inches by 20.5 feet and has an overhanging slate gable roof. The front, or northeast facade, reflects the building's function since 1907, when the Heating House was altered to a ground story garage with a second-story apartment. Duhring, Okie & Ziegler were responsible for this alteration.

Mr. James Kise, owner and developer of this property, appeared before the Committee to request certification and explain his proposal for incorporating the structure in the overall development of the Drum Moir Estate. He plans to restore it to its 1907 appearance and add a new structure compatible with the original design to the northwest facade.

The Committee unanimously recommended the certification of the Drum Moir Heating House, 777 W. Valley Green Road.

1217 N. 4th Street. (Owner: W. E. Itzstein).

Erected c. 1823, 1217 N. 4th Street stands two-and-one-half stories in height with a two-bay front measuring approximately sixteen feet. Of frame construction, the house itself is only fifteen feet deep with an ell eighteen feet in depth and fourteen feet in width. Two ante-bellum brick additions extend from the ell: the first is two stories high and measures 11 by 12 feet, the second rises but one story, 13 x 12. A one-story, 6 x 12 wooded shed completes the structure.

4
This modest frame house, as a representation of the early development of the Liberties above Girard Avenue. It's construction and scale accompanied the vernacular architecture and urban pattern of the expansion of Philadelphia well north of the pre-60's.

After some discussion, the Committee unanimously recommended the certification of 1217 N. 4th Street as an integral part of the streetscape of

OLD CITY NATIONAL HISTORICAL DISTRICT

In its continuing effort to certify buildings in the Old City National Historical District legally, the staff presented several structures for the Committee's review. Certification of these buildings, added to the list in 1971 as part of a district designation, did not occur as prescribed by the Commission's ordinance. As a result, the staff continues to review those buildings entered on the list in 1972 and prepare individual nominations for the Committee's consideration.

BUILDINGS RECOMMENDED FOR INCLUSION TO THE PHILADELPHIA REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES

319-321 Race Street. (Owner: City of Philadelphia).
A two-story, three-bay, brick building erected 1910 as a fire station. This building was built as a mate for the police station at 323-325 Race Street. The ground floor consists of a large arched garage entrance with a keystone and its original doors. The 3 bays on the 2nd floor have stone sills and lintels with projecting keystones. A heavy dentil cornice sits above these openings.

Although this building fails to qualify as part of the Old City District, the Committee believed that it contained enough architectural significance to merit its certification.

The Committee voted 4-1 to recommend certification of 319-321 Race Street. Mr. Pinkowski voted in opposition.

323-325 Race Street. (Owner: City of Philadelphia).
Erected 1910 as a police station, this three-story, three-bay, brick building is a good example of early 20th Century architecture. The ground floor contains rounded arch openings in all bays. The remainder of the facade is highlighted by the relief panels between the first and second stories, the stone lintels on the second floor with projecting keystones, and the very heavy cornice immediately above the third floor openings.

Although this building fails to qualify as part of the nineteenth century commercial Old City District, the Committee believed that the building contained enough architectural significance to merit its certification.

The Committee unanimously recommended the certification of 323-325 Race Street.

Chestnut Street. (Owner: Sandra L. Ball, Leigh M. Cohen and Samuel Lander).
A four-story, three-bay, brick, commercial building erected c. 1885 in a late Victorian style. The ground floor has the granite piers and entablature openings of the earlier Classical Utilitarian structures. The second floor contains rounded arch windows. The 3rd and 4th floors have sills and lintels. Belt courses may be found through the 4th floor.

and 4th floors. A large brick cornice is supported by 7 large and 10⁵ small corbels. This building clearly reflects the nineteenth century character of the District.

The Committee unanimously recommended the certification of 123 Chestnut Street.

149-151 N. 2nd Street, Fireman's Hall. (Owner: City of Philadelphia).

A two-and-a-half story, three-bay, brick fire station erected 1898 from the plans of Thomas M. Seeds, Jr. to house Engine Company No. 8, the direct descendent of Benjamin Franklin's Union Fire Company, the first fire company in Philadelphia. The Fire Department established its museum in this building in 1967 and christened it Fireman's Hall in 1975. Alterations in 1976 restored the building to its present appearance.

The two bays on the ground floor are filled with large double leaf doors with fanlights above the lower cornice. The building sits on a stone base. The fanlight openings have brick arches with keystones above. The second floor has three openings adorned with fanlights and brick arches. Keystones center each arch. A metal balcony hangs at the second floor level. A stepped gable roof with a tri-part dormer completes the face of this building.

This building is recorded with the Historic American Building Survey. As a representative fire house of the last decade of the 19th Century, this building conforms to the character of the Old City National Historical District.

The Committee unanimously recommended certification of 149-151 N. 2nd Street, Fireman's Hall.

54-58 N. 3rd Street. (Owner: Third and Arch Streets Associates).

A five-story, nine-bay, brick, commercial building erected 1851. The first two stories are cast-iron. The ground floor contains the characteristic iron pilasters and brackets supporting a 2nd floor balcony instead of an entablature. The 2nd floor has clustered piers separating the openings with their slightly pointed segmental arches. The 3rd to 5th floors have 6 bays each, containing within each bay 2 narrow windows with stone sills and decorative cast-iron lintels. A molded wood cornice sits atop this building. In its design, use and date, this building reflects the commercial character of the Old City National Historical District.

The Committee unanimously recommended certification of 54-58 N. 3rd Street.

60-66 N. 3rd Street, St. Charles Hotel. (Owner: Trust of Philadelphia Yearly Meeting of Friends).

A five-story, eight-bay, brick, commercial building erected 1851 by Charles Rubican, builder, as the St. Charles Hotel. Its full cast iron front has the characteristic ground floor piers and entablature of its period. The upper floors are made into a simulated ashlar design. The windows are of the same design as 54-58 N. 3rd Street and have a similar decorative cast-iron lintel. A heavy dentil cornice completes the facade of this building. Recorded by the Historic American Buildings Survey, this building reflects the nineteenth century commercial character of the District.

The Committee unanimously recommended certification of 60-66 N. 3rd Street, the St. Charles Hotel.

BUILDINGS PROPOSED TO BE STRICKEN FROM THE PHILADELPHIA REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES

208-210 Race Street

Constructed 1933, this building stands one story high and three bays wide. The building does not reflect the predominant nineteenth century character of the district. It was proposed for ratification on May 1, 1980. The motion died for want of a second. However, no motion was made to strike it from the Commission's list. It was brought before the Committee with the request to strike it from the list.

The Committee stood by its original recommendation that the building be certified and recommended &-l not to strike this building from the Register. Janet Klein opposed.

111 Chestnut Street

The two-story, two-bay, brick structure was erected 1951. This building has no relationship or significance to the nineteenth century character of the Old City National Historical District.

The Committee unanimously recommended striking 111 Chestnut Street from the Register.

303 Chestnut Street

The two-story, three bay, brick building was erected 1948. This building has no relationship or significance to the nineteenth century character of the Old City National Historical District.

The Committee unanimously recommended striking 303 Chestnut Street from the Register.

313 Chestnut Street

The seven-story, one-bay, steel frame building with brick curtain walls, was erected 1953 by the First Pennsylvania Company on the site of the Furness-designed National Bank of the Republic. This building has no relationship or significance to the nineteenth century character of the Old City National Historical District.

The Committee unanimously recommended striking 313 Chestnut Street from the Register.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Jefferson M. Moak
Historical Research Technician