

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

16 July 1980

Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman

Present: Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A., Chairman, Architectural Advisor to the Commission
Theodore T. Bartley, Jr., A.I.A., Preservation Committee, American
Institute of Architects, Philadelphia Chapter
Henry J. Magaziner, F.A.I.A., Architect, National Park Service
Penelope H. Batcheler, Architect, National Park Service
Janet Klein, Vice Chairman of the Commission
Richard Tyler, Historian
Patricia Siemiontkowski, Executive Assistant to the Chairman

Also: Lester Pitman, Contractor, and his clients, Mr. and Mrs. Richard Freunlich,
to present plans for alterations to the side and rear elevations of
1835 Delancey Street.
Samuel Farrington, Engineer, John McIlhenny, Historian, and Dennis Feldsher,
Architect, to present plans and specifications for alterations to Lemon
Hill Mansion.
Gray Smith, Architect, to present plans for renovations to 273 South 4th
Street.
Charles Newman, Architect, to present his proposal for the rehabilitation
of 1825 Delancey Street.
Jack Austin, Architect with Roland C. Davies and Associates, to present,
for the Committee's review, his preliminary proposal for the restoration
of the front facade of 208 South 4th Street.
David Beck, Architect, and Stewart Harting and Lance Silver, Developers,
to present plans for the complete rehabilitation of 219-21 Market Street.
Owen Fox, President of the Orianna Development Corporation and P. Richard
Frantz, Architect, to request a reconsideration of the Corporation's
request for plaques for 129 to 139 North 4th Street.

SUBMISSIONS FOR ALTERATIONS

✓ 1835 Delancey Street. Lester Pitman, Contractor. Mr. Pitman appeared
before the Architectural Committee with his clients, Mr. and Mrs.
Richard Freunlich, to present plans for alterations to the side and
rear elevations of 1835 Delancey Street.

Mr. Pitman's proposal called for the extension of a rear masonry addition,
the introduction of a new window on the face of that addition, and the
construction of a new deck along the side of the house to connect with an
existing one on the rear. After considerable discussion concerning the
construction of the new deck, the Committee asked that it be executed
in wood on a steel frame. The owner's request to install an iron decora-
tive railing along this deck met with Committee's approval as did the
design of the proposed new window. It was suggested, however, that a
smaller window be used in order to provide at least a 16" reveal at the
north corner of the masonry extension.

Subject to the above changes, the Committee voted to recommend the
approval of Mr. Pitman's plans. Since the proposed alterations do not
constitute a restoration, the building will not be eligible for receipt
of a Commission plaque.

✓ Lemon Hill Mansion, Fairmount Park Commission. Samuel Farrington, Engineer, John McIlhenny, Historian and Dennis Feldsher, Architect, presented to the Committee members plans and specifications for proposed alterations to Lemon Hill Mansion.

The alterations to be undertaken at Lemon Hill include some general construction work, improvements to the heating and ventilating systems, the introduction of air conditioning and some supplementary plumbing and electrical work.

Mrs. Batcheler conducted an on-site inspection of the building prior to the Committee meeting. Her comments provided the basis for the Committee to examine in detail the proposed alterations to the interior of Lemon Hill Mansion. Several changes to the architect's plan were suggested as a result.

On the second floor of the mansion, the Committee asked that the proposed fan coil unit be relocated away from the Palladian window and away from the existing access to the attic. As suggested by Mrs. Batcheler, the new unit and grills should be placed in a less noticeable position on the opposite end of the wall within a presently unused space. Access to the unit could be achieved by either hinging the adjoining stair or introducing a removable tread and riser section into it.

On the ground floor, Mrs. Batcheler expressed concern for the treatment of some existing original fabric within the proposed new bathroom. Mr. Farrington assured the Committee that the new shelves to be positioned within the existing doorways (as shown on the drawing) will not be nailed but shimmed into the recesses, thereby preserving the original fabric. Concerning the security system on the first floor, Mr. McIlhenny reported that, if possible, a second defense system would be introduced to supplement the proposed window and door detectors. As an alternative, he suggested the use of an electric eye system. To improve security further, the Committee suggested that Fairmount Park maintenance be advised of the deteriorated condition of the existing garage door and the need for its repair.

In general, the members questioned the Park's priorities and noted the lack of insulation in the attic and the badly deteriorated condition of the building's exterior. A suggestion to secure the building from further weather damage and adequately and correctly insulate the attic did not appear feasible to the Park Commission representatives. These items according to Mr. McIlhenny have been listed as future alternates and will be given consideration if and when additional moneys become available.

After some further discussion, the Committee voted to recommend an approval of the proposed project subject to the relocation of the fan coil unit on the second floor and the accompanying stair alteration. The architect was asked to submit an addendum and a sketch of this required change. Moreover, the Committee recommended that the Commission direct a letter to the Fairmount Park Commission encouraging adequate maintenance of Lemon Hill. Those items of particular note requiring immediate repair or replacement include the deteriorated garage door and the damaged downspouts.

16 July 1980

- ✓ 273 South 4th Street, Gray Smith, Architect.
The Committee reviewed Mr. Smith's plans for renovations to the rear of 273 South 4th Street and for the repair of the building's front cornice and dormer.

Following a brief discussion of the work with the architect, the Committee voted to recommend the approval of this submission.

- ✓ 1825 Delancey Street, Appelquist/Newman, Architects. Charles Newman presented to the Committee members his plans for renovations to the front facade of 1825 Delancey Street, a mid-nineteenth century residence.

The building, currently four apartments, will be converted into fewer units and the front facade renovated. Mr. Newman's plan called for the retention of an existing pseudo-Georgian door frame and transom and the installation of a new door and shutters.

The Committee members found the new door inappropriate and asked that the architect redesign the panel arrangement. Photographs of correct doors along the street were shown to Mr. Newman as examples to follow in his redesign.

As an alternative to hanging shutters on the facade, the Committee suggested that the architect consider the restoration of the door frame and transom to its original appearance.

The Committee recommended tabling this matter and asked that the architect review his proposal in light of the above comments.

- ✓ 208 South 4th Street, Roland C. Davies and Associates. Jack Austin presented to the Committee for its review his proposal for the restoration of the front facade of this early nineteenth century residence. The plans, as reviewed, call for the complete restoration of the building to conform with an 1812 fire insurance survey on file in the Commission office.

The Committee found Mr. Austin's proposal to be acceptable and recommended its approval in concept. A complete set of working drawings and details will be required before a final approval of the project can be granted.

- ✓ 1412-14 Pine Street, Theodore T. Bartley, Jr. The Committee reviewed Mr. Bartley's plans for renovations to the buildings, 1412 and 1414 Pine Street, and found them to be acceptable. Although extensive rehabilitation will be undertaken, the proposed work will not constitute a complete restoration of the buildings and will not make them eligible for plaques.

The Committee recommended that an approval of Mr. Bartley's submission be granted.

16 July 1980

- ✓ 219-21 Market Street, David Beck, Architect. Messrs. Silver and Harting and their architect, David Beck, presented for the Committee's consideration plans for the rehabilitation of the buildings located at 219-21 Market Street.

Following some discussion of the project, the Committee agreed to recommend its approval.

DEMOLITIONS

- ✓ 232-234 Arch Street. The Committee once again considered the request of the First Federal Savings and Loan Association for permission to demolish 232 and 234 Arch Street. The Committee had tabled action on this matter at its 18 June 1980 meeting pending further discussion of the issue of demolition and the proposed relocation of the Comly Rich house on the cleared site in Old City.

After a brief discussion, the Committee recommended that the Commission impose its six month statutory delay on the demolition of the two Arch Street buildings.

PLAQUES

- 129 to 139 North 4th Street. Owen Fox, President of the Orianna Development Corporation, and P. Richard Frantz, Architect, appeared before the Committee to request the Committee's reconsideration of their recommendation against granting plaques to the Corporation's N. 4th Street buildings.

As stated in Mr. Frantz's letter to the Chairman, the Corporation's board believes that at the time construction was in progress all work proceeded as directed by the Historical Commission, the Redevelopment Authority and staff representatives of these two offices. In view of this, Mr. Fox and Mr. Frantz requested that the restorations be judged by the standards which were in effect at that time.

While the Committee sympathized with Mr. Fox and Mr. Frantz, they could not recommend that plaques be issued to buildings which do not represent a complete and accurate restoration. The Committee did suggest, however, that an appeal could be made to the Historical Commission members who make the final determination in such matters.

The Committee voted to stand by its original decision of 21 November 1979 recommending that plaques not be issued to 129 through 139 North Fourth Street.

- ✓ 913 Spruce Street. Mr. Bartley reported to the Committee on his inspection of the Greenberg's building, 913 Spruce Street, and recommended that the Committee endorse the owner's request for a plaque. The door, shutters and trim have been painted an appropriate color in accordance with the Committee's previous recommendation.

16 July 1980

The Committee recommended the approval of a Certified Restored plaque for 913 Spruce Street with the requirement that a current photograph of the present condition of the building be submitted for file.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:20 P. M.

Respectfully submitted,

Patricia Siemiontkowski
Executive Assistant to the Chairman