

MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL MEETING
OF THE
ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE
OF THE
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

21 May 1987

David Hollenberg, Chairman

Present: David Hollenberg, Chairman
Penelope H. Batcheler, Historical Architect, Independence
National Historic Park
John Dickey, F.A.I.A.
Herbert W. Levy, A.I.A.
Mark MacQueen, Esq., Chief Assistant City Solicitor,
Law Department
Richard Tyler, Historic Preservation Officer
Patricia A. Siemiontkowski, Assistant Historic Preservation
Officer
Randal Baron, Preservation Planner
Sally Elk, Historic Research Technician
Carmen Weber, Archaeologist
Terri Koob, Executive Secretary
Maureen Heaney, Clerk Stenographer I

Also: Zvi Barzilay and Douglass Gamble of Toll Brothers, Lenard
L. Wolffe,, Attorney for Toll Brothers and Richard
Hoffman of Wallace, Roberts and Todd
John Hnedak, Charles E. Fisher and Kate Stevenson from
the National Park Service
Sandra Garz and David Knapton, City Planning Commission
And others.

ALTERATIONS

U.S. Naval Home, Zvi Barzilay and Douglass Gamble of Toll Brothers, Lenard L. Wolffe, Attorney for Toll Brothers, and Richard Hoffman of Wallace, Roberts and Todd. Richard Tyler gave a brief summary of Toll Brothers involvement with the U.S. Naval Home and their plans to rehabilitate the property. At its meeting of 8 January 1987, the Committee reviewed a partial submission for the Naval Home and requested plans for the stabilization of the Governor's House and Surgeon's House, details on the treatment of the gatehouses and fence, a restudy of the site plan and landscaping plan, and plans and specifications for the new construction. The Committee also expressed particular concern for Laning Hall. The Commission concurred at its meeting of 28 January 1987. At the request of Toll Brothers, a special meeting of the Architectural Committee was called to allow the developer an opportunity to address the concerns of the Historical Commission. Toll Brothers provided letters to the Committee addressing the preservation of Laning Hall and its potential for reuse. A site plan and drawings were also made available for the Committee's review. Mr. Tyler noted that the only issue addressed by Toll Brothers in its submission of letters involved the demolition of Laning Hall.

Zvi Barzilay, Senior Vice President of Toll Brothers, Inc. addressed the Committee and presented the history of the project from 1979 to the present. Mr. Barzilay focused the Committee's attention on the proposed demolition of Laning Hall.

Richard Hoffman, of Wallace, Roberts and Todd, addressed the Committee and discussed briefly the economics of the project. Mr. Hoffman stated that he was a member of the Center City Residents Association and that he has an intense interest in the development and preservation side of this project. Mr. Hoffman commented upon the competing elements in this complex project which include the economics of the current design, the parking ratio, the desire to preserve large trees on the site and various other issues. Mr. Hoffman stated that the reuse feasibility study that was conducted in 1980 makes it clear that Laning Hall should be demolished and replaced with new construction.

Mr. Tyler stated that all the proposed plans submitted to date for the Naval Home have been "piecemeal" and that the Commission has not yet received a complete submission for the entire development of the Naval Home.

David Hollenberg stated that the Historical Commission must review all applications for demolition under the new ordinance. Mr. Hollenberg stated that in order to evaluate an application for demolition certain information specified under Section 7(F).1 through .7 must be submitted to and reviewed by the Architectural Committee and the Historical Commission.

Mr. Hoffman asked if this process will have to be undertaken for every building on the site.

Mr. Tyler stated that an on-site inspection will be conducted by the Architectural Committee to determine what other buildings on the site, if any, are significant. Based upon this inspection, the Committee will recommend to the Historical Commission a course of action with regard to each building or structure on the site.

After considerable discussion, the Committee voted to defer a decision on this issue until the Architectural Committee can review the documentation presented to them at today's meeting and the 1980 reuse feasibility study for the Naval Home complex.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Maureen Heaney
Clerk Steno I

/mah