

D R A F T

SMA 2/23/64

MINUTES OF THE SEVENTY-EIGHTH STATED MEETING OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

28 January, 1964

Present were: Mr. Harry A. Batten
Dr. Roy Franklin Nichols
Mr. Charles E. Peterson
Mr. George K. Trautwein
Mr. R. Norris Williams, II.

Mr. Grant M. Simon, Chairman

Also present: Mr. Clarence G. Alhart
Mr. G. Edwin Brumbaugh
Mr. Walter D'Alessio
Mr. Irling H. Pedersen

Mr. J. Edgar Durham
Dr. Margaret B. Tinkcom
Mrs. Charles J. Maurer
Miss Constance F. Smith

Unless otherwise noted, all actions taken herein were the result of motions properly proposed, seconded and carried.

THE MINUTES of the November 1963 Meeting were approved as circulated.

REPORTS

The Committee on Historical Values - Dr. Roy Franklin Nichols, Chairman
Dr. Nichols's Report was approved and ordered to be filed with the official Minutes of this Meeting.

Architectural Committee - Mr. George K. Trautwein, Chairman
The Minutes of the December Meeting were presented by Mr. Williams, Chairman pro tem. These were approved and ordered to be filed.
Mr. Trautwein read the Minutes of the January 23 Meeting, which were also approved and ordered to be filed. Two actions were recorded: Approval of plans as submitted for 206 South Fourth Street, which had been referred to the Chairman; and approval of a plaque for 123 West Highland Avenue. Both matters had been referred from the Committee Meeting to the General Meeting.

The Commission's Activities - Dr. Margaret B. Tinkcom, Historian
Dr. Tinkcom's Report was approved and her article in the current issue of THE PENNSYLVANIA MAGAZINE OF HISTORY AND BIOGRAPHY was commended. It was ordered that copies of the issue be sent to the Mayor and other officials.

OLD BUSINESS

The Chairman welcomed Messrs. Alhart, D'Alessio, Brumbaugh and Pedersen and asked for the presentation of plans for the 400 Block of Lombard Street.

Mr. Alhart produced a map showing areas where demolition approval is requested of the Historical Commission as follows: The 600 Block of Delancey and Cypress

OLD BUSINESS continued

for the expansion of facilities for the McCall Public School; the 300 and 400 Blocks of South Fifth Street for proposed shopping facilities; and the 400 Block of Lombard Street for a proposed museum, library, old peoples' home and education facilities and parking for Old Pine Presbyterian Church.

Mr. Alhart referred the latter to Mr. Brumbaugh who stated that the proposals for which he presented preliminary drawings, calls for the demolition of five certified buildings on Lombard Street and four on Addison Street, saying that none of these is adaptable to the proposed use; and that only one is of the 1780 period. Mr. Brumbaugh also noted that building is scheduled for the fall of 1964.

Mr. Pedersen also read his report, prepared for the Old Philadelphia Development Corporation.

Mr. Brumbaugh added that the value of the present structures is not equal to the proposal to house collections of national interest.

The 300 Block of Lombard Street was discussed next. Mr. Alhart stated that demolition had been delayed based on a report from the Historical Commission.

Mr. Pederson read part of his report prepared for the OPDC, concurring with the Historical Commission that 325 Lombard Street is a fine example of the Federal period, a gem and worthy of preservation. He further said that 327 and 329 are not comparable to it and that their restoration could not be justified. In the case of 331, Mr. Pedersen said he found very little of architectural value, in spite of the coral rock in the foundations and rear wall, and in his opinion, the general condition of the structure is very poor.

Mr. Alhart recapitulated the Redevelopment Authority's plans for St. Peter's and stated that the church officials are on record as saying that if the Authority determines that the present buildings must remain, they will abide by that decision, but they cannot use them effectively.

The Chairman asked Mr. Alhart to provide the Commission with a letter reiterating this point.

Mr. Alhart reported that the Redevelopment Authority has altered plans for South Lawrence Street and now believes 325 should be preserved, not demolished. This change also applies to the status of 340 South Sixth Street; and to two houses at the SW corner of 5th and Pine Streets, namely 400 and 402 S. Fifth.

Head House Square Corporation's model was discussed, attention being drawn to new buildings proposed. Area included goes from Front to Third Streets, Pine to Lombard. The model approximates the ultimate appearance of the finished work. Plans for the restoration of certified buildings will be submitted to the Historical Commission in the usual way.

Fourth and Arch Streets. The model indicates a preliminary design. Shoyer's Restaurant proposes to develop a motor inn and restaurant and to restore the Merchants' Hotel.

The Chairman thanked the visitors for appearing with information, drawings, maps, models and reports and excused Messrs. Alhart, Brumbaugh, D'Alessio and Pedersen. The Historical Commission then went into executive session on the

OLD BUSINESS continued

points raised by the Redevelopment Authority, taking the following action:

1. After a motion duly made, seconded and voted on, the Brumbaugh plans were approved and demolition permits promised for the 400 Block of Lombard Street.
2. 300 Block of Lombard Street. It was approved that the Commission see proposed plans before it votes to release these houses.

The Chairman explained that the Commission is on record approving (at the September 1963 Stated Meeting) and that this present action reverses that one. He directed that a letter be prepared for the Redevelopment Authority stating that the Commission has reconsidered its earlier decision in the light of information which was subsequently uncovered. The Redevelopment Authority is to be asked to board up the houses until the problem is resolved.

3. Fifth Street Shopping Center. It was stated that in 1960 the Commission asked to have a study made of the possibility of using the present structures for this purpose. No reply has been received. It was resolved that another such letter be written, asking for a study similar to the one presented for the Second and Pine Streets project.
4. The 600 Block of Delancey and Cypress Streets. It was moved, seconded and carried that these buildings be freed for demolition.
5. Head House Square and Arch Street at Fourth. It was the consensus that no action is required until individual drawings are submitted, but that, meanwhile the Redevelopment Authority is to be formally thanked for bringing the models to the office for the Commission's review.

NEW BUSINESS

700 Block on Pine Street. Mr. Batten explained that the Pennsylvania Hospital had approached the Old Philadelphia Development Corporation with the proposal to use land now occupied by eight certified buildings in its program to expand the Hospital's facilities. A letter to the Historical Commission has been recommended. This has not yet been received. No action, therefore, is required at this time.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

A list of items on former agenda was deferred to another meeting.

There being no further business, the Meeting was adjourned at 5:30 P.M.

Respectfully submitted &c....