

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
COMMITTEE ON RULES

Room 400, City Hall
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania
Tuesday, December 6, 2011
10:15 a.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCILMAN JAMES KENNEY, CHAIR
COUNCILMAN DARRELL CLARKE
COUNCILMAN FRANK DiCICCO
COUNCILMAN W. WILSON GOODE, JR.
COUNCILMAN WILLIAM K. GREENLEE
COUNCILWOMAN DONNA REED MILLER
COUNCILMAN BRIAN J. O'NEILL
COUNCILWOMAN BLONDELL REYNOLDS BROWN

BILLS 110793, 110798, 110842, 110846, 110847
and 110826

- - -

1
2 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Good
3 morning, ladies and gentlemen. The
4 Council Committee on Rules is now in
5 session. We have a quorum with members
6 DiCicco, Goode, Greenlee, Miller, Clarke,
7 Reynolds Brown and also have the presence
8 of Councilman O'Neill.

9 The first bill for
10 consideration is Bill No. 110793, which
11 is an ordinance approving the tenth
12 amendment to the redevelopment proposal
13 for the Haddington Urban Renewal Area,
14 Unit No. 2 and Unit No. 3, being the area
15 beginning at the northwest corner of
16 Parrish and Fifty-Second Street,
17 including sixth amendment to the urban
18 renewal plan and the third amendment to
19 the relocation plan, which provides,
20 inter alia, for the additional land
21 acquisition of one property for
22 commercial and residential uses; the
23 provision of certain relocation services,
24 as required by law; and declaring that
25 condemnation is not imminent with respect

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 to the Project.

3 (Witnesses approached witness
4 table.)

5 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Whoever is
6 ready to go, please identify yourself for
7 the record.

8 MR. REDDING: Good morning,
9 Mr. President and members of the
10 Committee. My name is Richard Redding.
11 I'm Director of Community Planning at the
12 Philadelphia City Planning Commission,
13 testifying today in support of Bill No.
14 110793, approving the tenth amendment of
15 the redevelopment proposal for the
16 Haddington Urban Renewal Area. It will
17 authorize acquisition of one property at
18 20 North 59th Street in West
19 Philadelphia. The property will be
20 combined with other properties previously
21 acquired for development of a
22 transit-oriented development near 60th
23 and Market.

24 This is in accord with the
25 Haddington Redevelopment Area Plan and

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 the Philadelphia 2035 Citywide Vision,
3 the comprehensive plan approved in June
4 of this year.

5 The Planning Commission staff
6 approved this amended redevelopment
7 proposal on October 20th, 2011, and I'll
8 be happy to answer any questions of the
9 Committee.

10 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you
11 very much.

12 Please identify yourself for
13 the record and proceed.

14 MR. COVINGTON: Good morning.
15 My name is Ed Covington. I'm the
16 Executive Director of the Philadelphia
17 Redevelopment Authority. Good morning,
18 Chair and members of the Committee. I am
19 here to speak in support of Bill No.
20 110793, the tenth amendment to the West
21 Philadelphia Redevelopment Proposal and
22 the sixth amendment to the Haddington
23 Unit No. 2-3 Urban Renewal Plan for the
24 Haddington Unit No. 2-3 Urban Renewal
25 Area.

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 This bill will authorize the
3 Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority to
4 acquire one vacant lot at 20 North 59th
5 Street. The acquisition will be funded
6 with proceeds from the NTI bonds issued.
7 The lot will be combined with other
8 properties to be developed as part of the
9 transit-oriented project that will
10 include mixed-income residential and
11 retail.

12 This project will promote the
13 elimination of blight and result in
14 expanded housing opportunities for low-
15 and moderate-income individuals and
16 restore properties to the tax rolls.

17 Chair and members of the
18 Committee, I respectfully request
19 favorable consideration of Bill No.
20 110793 and would also ask the suspension
21 of Council rules to allow first reading
22 on December 8th, 2011.

23 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you
24 very much.

25 There's no contemplated

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 amendments to this bill?

3 MR. COVINGTON: No.

4 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you.

5 Any questions for these
6 witnesses?

7 (No response.)

8 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Seeing
9 none, we will now move -- anyone else to
10 testify on this particular bill?

11 (No response.)

12 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: We will now
13 move to Bill No. 110798, an ordinance
14 approving the fortieth amendment of the
15 redevelopment proposal for the Model
16 Cities Urban Renewal Area, being the area
17 beginning at the northwest corner of
18 Front Street and Spring Garden Street,
19 including the thirty-second amendment to
20 the urban renewal plan and the
21 twenty-eighth amendment to the relocation
22 plan, which provides, inter alia, for the
23 additional land acquisition of
24 approximately 49 properties for
25 residential, institutional and related

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 uses; the provision of certain relocation
3 services, as required by law and
4 declaring that condemnation is not
5 imminent with respect to the Project.

6 Please identify yourself for
7 the record.

8 MR. REDDING: Again, good
9 morning, Mr. President and members of the
10 Rules Committee. I am Richard Redding,
11 Director of Community Planning at the
12 Philadelphia City Planning Commission,
13 testifying today in support of Bill No.
14 110798, approving the fortieth amendment
15 of the redevelopment proposal for the
16 Model Cities Urban Renewal Area.

17 The bill authorizes acquisition
18 of approximately 49 properties in several
19 sections of North Philadelphia, including
20 Strawberry Mansion, Norris Square and
21 Northern Liberties.

22 This action is in accord with
23 the North Philadelphia Redevelopment Area
24 Plan and the Philadelphia 2035 Citywide
25 Vision, the comprehensive plan approved

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 in June of this year.

3 The Planning Commission staff
4 approved this on October 20th, 2011, and
5 I'll be happy to answer any questions.
6 Thanks.

7 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you.

8 Please identify yourself again
9 for the record.

10 MR. COVINGTON: Good morning
11 once again. My name is Ed Covington,
12 Executive Director of the Philadelphia
13 Redevelopment Authority. I am here to
14 speak in support of Bill No. 110798,
15 which is the fortieth amendment to the
16 redevelopment proposal and thirty-second
17 amendment to the urban renewal plan for
18 the Model Cities Urban Renewal Area.

19 The proposal and plan provide
20 for the acquisition of a total of 49
21 properties, which are identified in a
22 list that is attached.

23 A total of nine properties -
24 one occupied structure, two vacant
25 structures and six vacant lots - will be

12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

acquired on behalf of Friends
Rehabilitation Program, Inc. FRP
proposes the development of the
Strawberry Mansion Homeownership
Development: Phase II. This
homeownership initiative is designed to
create 12 newly constructed homeownership
units for sale to low- and
moderate-income residents.

A total of 24 properties - two
occupied lots, three vacant structures,
nine occupied structures and ten vacant
lots - will be acquired on behalf of the
Philadelphia Housing Authority. PHA
proposes to develop approximately 50
rental units made up of townhouses and
duplexes.

A total of ten properties - one
vacant structure and nine vacant lots -
will be acquired on behalf of Norris
Square. Norris Square proposes to
develop ten newly constructed
homeownership units for sale to low- and
moderate-income residents.

12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

One vacant lot will be acquired on behalf of the Norris Square Civic Association. Norris Square proposes to develop this parcel in accordance with the existing Hunter Homes development using program income generated through the NSP2 sales program.

Three vacant lots will be acquired on behalf of Quality Community Health Care, Inc. These parcels will be assembled with three other City-owned parcels for the development of a new health care facility. VPRC has approved the sale of these parcels, pending the acquisition of the privately owned parcels.

The above properties will be acquired utilizing funds from the Neighborhood Transformation Initiative, NTI. Two vacant structures will be acquired on behalf of Tower Investments. This will facilitate the assemblage of sites for mixed-use and residential-related development. Tower

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 will provide funding for the acquisition
3 cost through an Assistance Agreement with
4 the Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority.

5 Please note that Section 5(a)
6 of the ordinance is amended to delete the
7 three Diamond Street properties from the
8 closing paragraph of that section, so
9 that the only properties not being funded
10 with NTI are 208 West Diamond and 1148
11 North 2nd.

12 Chair and members of the
13 Committee, I respectfully request
14 favorable consideration of Bill No.
15 110798 and would also ask a suspension of
16 Council rules to allow first reading on
17 December 8th, 2011.

18 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you
19 very much for your testimony.

20 Questions? Councilman
21 Greenlee.

22 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank
23 you, Mr. Chairman.

24 Good morning, gentlemen.
25 Mr. Covington, just -- and I don't have

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 your testimony in front of me, but I know
3 you said I think in each of those plans
4 there's some occupied properties?

5 MR. COVINGTON: Yes.

6 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Are there
7 plans what to do with the residents in
8 there? Do you know, are they homeowners,
9 owner residents? Do you know what the
10 plan is for the people who are living
11 there now, is what I'm getting at.

12 MR. COVINGTON: There was a
13 community meeting held on October 5th in
14 which this opportunity was aired in a
15 public forum. I'm going to ask Melvis
16 Dunbar, who leads our relocation efforts
17 for all of our residents, to speak
18 specifically to your question,
19 Councilman.

20 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Okay.
21 Thank you.

22 (Witness approached witness
23 table.)

24 MS. DUNBAR: Good morning.

25 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Excuse me,

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 ma'am. Do me a favor, could you please
3 pull the microphone close to you and
4 identify yourself for the record.

5 MS. DUNBAR: Yes. My name is
6 Melvis Dunbar. I'm the Director of Real
7 Estate Transactions at the Philadelphia
8 Redevelopment Authority.

9 In response to your question in
10 regards to the plans for relocation, the
11 Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority will
12 be working with each of the households,
13 some of which are homeowners and some are
14 renters. So we will work with them to
15 relocate them in and around the area,
16 which is the 31st, Arlington and Monument
17 Street.

18 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Okay.
19 Have those conversations happened yet or
20 are they in the planning stages?

21 MS. DUNBAR: We have not yet
22 had specific conversations with them
23 because the law basically prohibits us to
24 have specific discussions, but we did
25 discuss it in a general manner at the

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 meeting.

3 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Okay.

4 Thank you.

5 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

6 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you.

7 Councilman Clarke.

8 COUNCILMAN CLARKE: Thank you,
9 Mr. Chairman.

10 Good morning.

11 (Good morning.)

12 COUNCILMAN CLARKE: I want to
13 first, because you all were asked the
14 question, I was going to let you respond,
15 but I just wanted to get a little more
16 specific in terms of one of the
17 developments, the one in Strawberry
18 Mansion. Like Mr. Covington said, we did
19 have a community meeting. There were
20 certain things based on the law that the
21 Redevelopment Authority was prohibited to
22 have discussions about. Fortunately, I
23 was not bound by that particular law, so
24 at that community meeting, we got
25 in-depth conversations with some of the

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 residents who were interested in staying
3 in the neighborhood.

4 A block away from that
5 particular neighborhood -- I'm just
6 putting this out here for the record,
7 because the people who were in the room
8 who were at the meeting know this. We
9 have just completed approximately 28
10 units of for-sale housing by Friends
11 Rehab Development Corporation. As we
12 have done in several projects within the
13 North Philadelphia community based on
14 compensation of the proceeds from the
15 condemnation and relocation fees, we have
16 been in a position to actually utilize
17 those dollars and basically move people
18 into new homes in proximity to the
19 proposed development.

20 It's fully anticipated if
21 people are interested in doing that in
22 this particular case, we could very
23 conceivably, very well conceivably move
24 people from their existing location a
25 block away to a brand new house, because

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 we are very aggressively trying to sell
3 those new houses.

4 So the meeting -- there were a
5 number of questions at that particular
6 meeting about some of the benefits
7 associated with some of the condemnation
8 process, and we got into great detail. I
9 actually see some of my former neighbors,
10 because I no longer live there, and I
11 know they may want to have some
12 questions. So I just wanted to put that
13 out there for the record.

14 MR. COVINGTON: Thank you,
15 Councilman.

16 COUNCILMAN CLARKE: You're
17 welcome.

18 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you
19 very much.

20 Any other questions for these
21 witnesses?

22 (No response.)

23 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Seeing
24 none, anyone else to testify on this
25 particular bill?

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 MR. ALI: Yes.

3 (Witness approached witness
4 table.)

5 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Good
6 morning.

7 MR. ALI: Good morning.

8 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Please
9 identify yourself for the record.

10 MR. ALI: My name is Jihad Ali.
11 I'm a founder of the Contractors
12 Roundtable, which is an African American
13 contractors association in Philadelphia.

14 My question I had about this
15 project, Councilman Clarke, is, on both
16 of the bills that the RDA came up here,
17 do we have an EOP plan?

18 COUNCILMAN CLARKE: The EOP --
19 we do not have an EOP plan on this
20 particular project because it's a
21 condemnation. So it's the City -- the
22 Redevelopment Authority actually taking
23 property into their ownership.

24 Subsequent to that, once we
25 consolidate ownership, we will then

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 convey that property to the Philadelphia
3 Housing Authority, and at that time,
4 there will be an ordinance with an EOP
5 plan attached, because at this point, we
6 don't have a project yet.

7 MR. ALI: Would that be in all
8 the projects, even the Tower Investment
9 project?

10 COUNCILMAN CLARKE: I can only
11 speak about the one.

12 MR. ALI: Is this something we
13 can find out about on all the other
14 projects that's involved in this bill?
15 Because the issue that I have is, when we
16 deal with the Redevelopment Authority --
17 and they're all gentlemen over there,
18 especially Mr. Covington and Mr. Koonce
19 has done -- he's done outstanding work on
20 behalf of the citizens of Philadelphia,
21 but when it comes to this issue about
22 minority participation, detail reports,
23 I've attended numerous Board meetings at
24 the RDA. All they do is pass around
25 papers that say -- they talk about --

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 they give an attestation of what
3 participation is, but it's always
4 percentages. We call them phantom
5 percentages, because we could be -- I've
6 said this before at the Board. We could
7 be talking about the same group of
8 contractors doing the same job throughout
9 the year, because all we see is
10 percentages.

11 So we're looking for a detailed
12 report. I can't get it from them,
13 without having an attorney and going
14 through this and going through that, our
15 Right to Know records. That's the only
16 way I can get this stuff. But ultimately
17 we're all in one accord about this issue,
18 especially you, Councilman Goode, so we
19 need to get access to the information.
20 That's really what I need. Even if they
21 give it to you, either one of the Council
22 offices. I'm confident that then I'll
23 get it.

24 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Mr. Koonce,
25 do you have anything you'd like to or

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 anyone from RDA would like to add to the
3 record?

4 (Witness approached witness
5 table.)

6 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Re-identify
7 yourself, please.

8 MR. COVINGTON: Good morning.
9 Ed Covington, Executive Director of the
10 Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority.

11 I guess with respect to EOP
12 plans in general, our process is very
13 consistent. As the Councilman alluded
14 to, all of these that we have presented
15 today for Rules Committee are
16 acquisitions, condemnations, and so there
17 is no EOP plan until we have projects
18 that we would then present to the Board
19 and to Council for their consideration
20 with respect to the EOP plans, and those
21 are publicly presented plans that are
22 contained within the proposals that we
23 present to Council, and so each of them
24 is shared in a transparent manner, in a
25 consistent manner. And that information

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 is available to the public for its
3 consideration and to Council.

4 MR. ALI: That's where we
5 disagree. Where Mr. Covington -- the
6 issue is not about consistency. It's
7 about transparency. His transparent is
8 not my transparent. Most of the time
9 when I'm out in the street, the
10 Councilpeople, I see the people that put
11 you there, and they all think that --
12 they all don't know what's happening, but
13 the reality is, you're fighting for us,
14 you're trying to get this stuff, but when
15 it goes over to these agencies, there's a
16 different reinterpretation of what
17 transparent is. All we want is documents
18 to show who is getting the work and their
19 dollar amounts.

20 Now, the process that he says
21 is transparent is that phantom number
22 thing I'm telling you about. You go
23 there, there's a Board, passes a
24 resolution, it gives the past performance
25 of contractors. It might say his name,

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 and then it will say they achieved X, Y,
3 Z in percentages. We want to know the
4 detail report so we can see who is making
5 the money so we can take our complaint to
6 them.

7 COUNCILMAN KENNEY:
8 Councilman -- I'm sorry.

9 MR. COVINGTON: Just a brief
10 response. Again, my name is Ed
11 Covington, the Executive Director of the
12 Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority.

13 We do not have -- the plans
14 that are set forth in our proposals that
15 come before Council's consideration
16 really contain a plan as the developers
17 have put together as to what the
18 components will be and how they will
19 attempt to deliver in accordance with
20 that plan. We cannot give information on
21 the front end of those. That is
22 unavailable, because those projects,
23 until they are approved, cannot be
24 commenced. We won't know until the
25 completion of the project as to how well

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 they have performed against the EOP
3 plans. And so there's no opportunity to
4 present an answer to a question at the
5 time that the Board and Council considers
6 it. We can only look at these results
7 after the fact.

8 We're actually pretty good
9 about identifying those developers who
10 have performed or not performed against
11 that. And I was looking at some recent
12 statistics and we've had about a 35
13 percent rate of participation of minority
14 vendors recently, as I looked at our
15 score card. So I think we've actually
16 done a reasonably decent job of ensuring
17 that our developers performed against the
18 EOP plans that they have set forth and
19 that we presented to Council.

20 MR. ALI: Mr. Covington, thank
21 you for your time.

22 This whole issue about
23 participation about what they've achieved
24 back to the phantom numbers, when they
25 say "minorities" -- I say "minority," I

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 mean African American men and African
3 American women. That's what I'm here
4 for. I'm not ashamed to admit it.
5 That's my concern.

6 But I can't get that
7 information in order to bring a complaint
8 to my Councilpeople. So, you know, the
9 issue is, we keep -- we're on a
10 treadmill. They can't tell us because
11 they haven't performed. When they have
12 performed, we can't get the reports. So
13 we're in this vicious cycle. And until
14 we can present this to you, our
15 Councilpeople, to at least see what's
16 going on, maybe if not this project,
17 maybe the next one we can do something
18 about it.

19 Thank you for allowing me to
20 speak into the record.

21 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you
22 very much.

23 Councilwoman Reynolds Brown.

24 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Good
25 morning, gentlemen. The both of you can

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 stay there.

3 I want to dig a little deeper
4 into the concern raised. Speak about the
5 35 percent again. What was that in
6 reference to?

7 MR. COVINGTON: That was a
8 recent analysis I had run by the folks
9 over in OHCD who do the compliance, Lynn
10 Newsome's group. So they went back and I
11 asked them to run the record of our
12 projects that had gone through with EOP
13 plans from, I believe it was, January
14 2010 to June of 2011 and to show me on a
15 static project-by-project basis really
16 how we had done with respect to MBE/WBE
17 performance with respect to the projects
18 where we had EOP plans. And I was
19 pleased to see that there was actually a
20 very solid performance on those projects.

21 One of the things that's
22 disconcerting when we look at some of
23 those numbers on a project-by-project
24 basis, if you look at a project that's 30
25 percent complete, the numbers may look

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 bad at the time of reporting, but really
3 the best way to judge how we're doing
4 against that is to look at it on a
5 completed project basis and see how did
6 we do, how did this developer do. And so
7 that's what we're building in the systems
8 to continuously manage, and that's why
9 they ran that report for me, because we
10 were very concerned to make sure that we
11 were actually delivering on those
12 objectives.

13 So we will do that on a
14 continuous basis to make sure that the
15 developers are delivering on these
16 objectives.

17 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: So all of
18 what you've just spoken about happens on
19 the back end, correct?

20 MR. COVINGTON: There's ongoing
21 reporting that's done by Lynn Newsome's
22 group.

23 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: That's
24 done by whom?

25 MR. COVINGTON: Lynn Newsome's

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 group within OHCD. We don't have
3 compliance people within our shop. Those
4 are housed in the Office of Housing and
5 Community Development. But they will
6 advise when they see low performance on
7 MBE/WBE goals under the plan, they will
8 send a signal to the developer. We'll
9 get that signal. We'll reenforce that
10 signal with the developer to make sure
11 we're collaborating to send the right
12 messages to them to make sure that they
13 still have a plan to deliver against
14 those objectives.

15 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay. So
16 now let's speak about the very narrow
17 issue that's been raised, and that is
18 around condemnation. How does RDA handle
19 the process which ensures that MBE/WBEs
20 are involved in the condemnation stage of
21 what you do?

22 MR. COVINGTON: The
23 condemnation stage is not an EOP-based
24 initiative. It's really the projects
25 that result from the condemnations that

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 have an EOP plan.

3 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: So then
4 what internal mechanisms or signals do
5 you put in place to ensure that when
6 condemnation happens, it's reflective of
7 some commitment to MBE/WBE activity?

8 MR. COVINGTON: The MBE/WBE, if
9 I understand your question, is really I
10 believe activated at the moment of which
11 we have now assembled property which is
12 available for a development project.
13 It's that development project that must
14 then deliver a proposal that has the
15 MBE/WBE goals contained within it.

16 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay.

17 MR. COVINGTON: So once we have
18 acquired the property -- so, for example,
19 to use one of the cases that was before
20 us with Friends. Friends will then
21 deliver us a proposal to complete the
22 homeownership units that they have in
23 their mind. Within that proposal will be
24 an economic opportunity plan that will
25 meet the specifications and set goals and

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 parameters around MBE/WBE involvement.
3 It won't be in the condemnation phase; it
4 will be in the phase in which they
5 deliver their proposal.

6 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: All right.
7 And so -- I follow you, and my question
8 is, and why not in the condemnation
9 stage?

10 MR. COVINGTON: The
11 condemnation phase is totally handled by
12 the Redevelopment Authority. So there's
13 no other involvement in terms of a plan,
14 because we are in the process of
15 acquiring the property, dealing with
16 issues such as just compensation for the
17 individuals.

18 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: So that
19 means that there's staff persons --

20 MR. COVINGTON: Our staff is
21 taking care of that. There is no -- we
22 do not outsource the condemnation
23 process. That is totally handled by the
24 Redevelopment Authority. Melvis Dunbar,
25 who testified earlier, is the leader of

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 that team, and it's housed within our
3 agency.

4 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: That was
5 not clear to me.

6 Now, having heard that, do you
7 better understand that particular aspect
8 of the narrow issue you raised?

9 MR. ALI: Well, Councilwoman,
10 thank you. I do understand what he said.
11 But if you look at it, this Council
12 passed an ordinance about spending City
13 dollars, whatever the process is, whether
14 you want to call it condemnation or EOP
15 plans or minority participation. If
16 they're spending dollars in any stage of
17 that process, we need to have some type
18 of mechanism to ensure that those dollars
19 are being given to -- opportunities are
20 given to all our citizens. So even if
21 they're doing it in-shop, they should
22 have responsibility.

23 During his testimony, he talked
24 about OHCD. Really if you ask me, what
25 is that, compared to our Office of

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 Economic Opportunity, they are the ones
3 that have the responsibility in this city
4 to ensure participation, not OHCD, not
5 the RDA, but OEO. There's a disconnect
6 between what they report out of RDA to
7 OEO. The yearly reports you get, we get
8 a one-page document from OHCD and RDA on
9 what their participation is, one page
10 that talks about \$200 million and what
11 they achieved. We don't get the detail
12 report of OEO, and that's the one who
13 ultimately has responsibility, in my
14 opinion.

15 COUNCILMAN KENNEY:

16 Mr. Covington, is there any opportunity
17 for you to come back here once the
18 proposal, the plan of development, has
19 been accepted and begin to move forward?
20 Do you come back here?

21 MR. COVINGTON: We always do,
22 sir. We always submit -- there's nothing
23 that would come out of this condemnation
24 that would not reappear in front of
25 Council Chambers with respect to a

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 project with an EOP plan. It's not
3 possible for something to happen without
4 that.

5 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: So when the
6 development plan comes back to us, of
7 course, there'll be an economic
8 opportunity plan attached?

9 MR. COVINGTON: That is
10 correct.

11 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: At which
12 time we can now again have this
13 discussion about whether or not you think
14 it's real or not. The ultimate issue is
15 whether you -- not that they don't attach
16 the plan to the proposal, but whether or
17 not it's real; is that correct?

18 MR. ALI: Yes, sir.

19 MR. COVINGTON: I would also
20 add just for additional clarification of
21 the points, the OEO works very closely
22 with OHCD with respect to the goals that
23 we set and they review those performance
24 and provide feedback. So there's a very
25 close relationship with the Office of

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 Economic Opportunity with OHCD and with
3 Redevelopment Authority. So I believe
4 that all three parts of the City
5 government apparatus are aligned in their
6 objectives around these EOPs.

7 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: But the
8 ultimate question is whether or not this
9 gentleman, this witness, agrees with your
10 assessment at the end of the process.

11 MR. COVINGTON: I appreciate
12 that fact.

13 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Councilman
14 Goode.

15 COUNCILMAN GOODE: Just very
16 briefly for clarity of record. Thank you
17 for your testimony, Mr. Ali, and you are
18 correct, it's actually because of your
19 advocacy that we passed legislation this
20 fall that actually was signed into law.
21 And so I just want to make Mr. Covington
22 aware.

23 Aside from the fact that there
24 is not a project yet and if there was a
25 project that required an EOP, they would

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 have to be submitted to Council, you
3 should be aware and make your contractors
4 and developers aware that based on the
5 law that we passed this fall, those
6 contractors and developers have to
7 directly submit that information to the
8 Chief Clerk as well, so that it will be
9 public information.

10 MR. ALI: Thank you.

11 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you.

12 Councilman Clarke, do you have
13 anything else?

14 COUNCILMAN CLARKE: If I say
15 what I'm getting ready to say, it's going
16 to probably add an additional 15 minutes
17 to the hearing, so I'm not going to say
18 it.

19 But real quick. There's one
20 thing as it relates to Redevelopment
21 Authority activity on condemnation, and
22 I'm not clear to the extent, but I know
23 that appraisals are done. They are in
24 fact outsourced. So you may want to look
25 at that in terms of participation of the

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 appraisers, in addition to which I
3 believe there are some legal components
4 within the condemnation as it relates to
5 the filing with the courts. And I'm not
6 sure if that's outsourced or not, but I
7 don't want to get too deep. There are a
8 couple of --

9 MR. COVINGTON: The appraisal
10 work is third-party work. The legal work
11 we do inside with our legal team.

12 COUNCILMAN CLARKE: All of it?

13 MR. COVINGTON: Yes.

14 COUNCILMAN CLARKE: It's just a
15 minimal, but you may want to check.

16 MR. COVINGTON: To the extent
17 that we have legal actions subsequent to
18 the condemnation, there may be
19 periodically the involvement of
20 third-party counsel, but for the most
21 part, the appraisal would be the
22 limitation --

23 COUNCILMAN CLARKE: I would
24 recommend that you do a review of that,
25 because I'm sure it's going to come up.

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 MR. COVINGTON: Point noted.

3 Appreciate it.

4 COUNCILMAN CLARKE: Thank you,
5 Mr. Chair.

6 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: See, it
7 wasn't 15 minutes.

8 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Well,
9 actually --

10 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: It may be
11 15 minutes now. Councilwoman Brown.

12 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Councilman
13 Clarke is extremely knowledgeable about
14 what we're talking about. I'm learning
15 as we go along. So on appraisals, is
16 there any sensitivity given to the
17 prevailing issue amongst members of
18 Council and some department heads who
19 understand it and embrace it? Does the
20 appraisal list look like Philadelphia,
21 MBEs and WBES?

22 MR. COVINGTON: I can't give
23 you a specific response, but I certainly
24 will go back and make sure that we
25 re-evaluate to make sure that we are as

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 inclusive as possible with respect to
3 that activity.

4 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay. So
5 when can we see a copy of that list, the
6 existing list?

7 MR. COVINGTON: I don't know
8 that we have what I would call an
9 existing list. There is a process where
10 we have an appraisal team within the
11 Redevelopment Authority that goes and
12 solicits appraisals generally when we
13 have the need with respect to property
14 valuations. I'll be happy to --

15 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: So it's a
16 rotating list; it's not one standard hit
17 list?

18 MR. COVINGTON: That is
19 correct.

20 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay. All
21 right, then. Well, then know that this
22 question will come up again during budget
23 season.

24 MR. COVINGTON: Understood.

25 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Thank you.

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

3 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you
4 very much.

5 Any more questions for these
6 witnesses?

7 (No response.)

8 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Seeing
9 none, anyone else to testify on this
10 bill?

11 Please come forward.

12 (Witness approached witness
13 table.)

14 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Good
15 morning. Please identify yourself for
16 the record.

17 MS. CANTY: Good morning. My
18 name is Vernetta Canty. I live on
19 Arlington Street, one of the blocks
20 that's set for the condemnation, and
21 basically I just wanted to voice my
22 objection to the whole process, because
23 when the Redevelopment Society had came
24 in in regards to the meeting that was
25 actually held, no one actually gave us

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 some other alternatives, because there
3 are people who actually would like to
4 stay in the community. And we weren't
5 given any other alternatives as opposed
6 to them just coming in, taking over our
7 property and just moving us out to
8 another location. Because, as I said,
9 there are people like myself and some
10 other neighbors, there aren't a lot of us
11 on the block, but we are interested in
12 staying.

13 Now, I have driven around my
14 community where they have actually come
15 in and they've actually taken over some
16 of the other properties, and there are
17 properties that have actually been left
18 on these other blocks that were still
19 standing, and they're standing right now,
20 and I think given a choice, some of the
21 people on Arlington Street, maybe
22 Monument, I don't know for sure, but they
23 would like that choice.

24 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I think
25 that Councilman Clarke had made comment

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 earlier about the relocation within a
3 block or two of this particular project
4 into new housing. I believe he made some
5 comment earlier about that.

6 MS. CANTY: We're not talking
7 about relocation. We're talking about
8 actually staying where we are, because
9 what -- excuse me, I'm a little nervous.

10 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: That's
11 okay.

12 MS. CANTY: The houses that are
13 being built, when you look at them as
14 compared to the houses that are there,
15 they're a lot smaller. And I know
16 there's one family in particular, they're
17 a large family and they can't fit in one
18 of those houses like that, and they would
19 actually like to stay in their house.
20 And, like I said, I'm just trying to
21 voice it so that everyone knows my
22 objection and probably some of their
23 objections to this. I want it on the
24 record.

25 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Okay.

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 MS. CANTY: Because it seems to
3 me that the Redevelopment Corporation
4 doesn't have my interest really at heart.

5 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Okay.
6 Thank you for coming down and expressing
7 your opinion. I appreciate it. Thank
8 you.

9 MS. CANTY: Thank you.

10 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Anyone else
11 to testify on this bill?

12 Please come forward.

13 (Witness approached witness
14 table.)

15 MR. BAXTER: Hello.

16 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Please come
17 forward and have a seat. Please identify
18 yourself for the record.

19 MR. BAXTER: I'm Mark Baxter.

20 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Yes, sir.
21 Please proceed.

22 MR. BAXTER: Basically I have a
23 few holdups in this whole eminent domain
24 redevelopment thing. I'm an
25 entrepreneur, I'm an investor, and, you

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 know, growing up in a low socioeconomic
3 environment, always striving to get more
4 and attain more and be ahead of the
5 vision, I thought I was doing that. And
6 part of the reason why I purchased this
7 investment property was because I saw the
8 vision of the new development coming in
9 as sometime in the future and I will be a
10 part of that transformation. But what
11 I'm hearing is that I'm kind of forced to
12 be displaced. And ultimately as part of
13 the Council, you guys sell us the
14 American dream. I was actually chasing
15 that dream, and I just feel like I'm
16 getting cut a little short without any of
17 my doing.

18 I'm trying to do everything
19 right. I'm trying to live that,
20 quote/unquote, American dream, but yet
21 here I am being displaced, with no
22 rebuttal and I just have to accept it,
23 and I just -- you know, just being a
24 person of equality, I just don't think
25 that that's fair.

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Have you
3 had a discussion with the Redevelopment
4 Authority relative to --

5 MR. BAXTER: I have. I was at
6 the meeting and things like that. I have
7 another holdup as well. Being an
8 investor in real estate, they told me
9 that it's going to be a fair market
10 assessment as far as the appraisal and
11 things of that sort. Well, we know we're
12 in a recession. I mean, I know all of my
13 property values have dropped
14 significantly. So, okay, a fair market
15 assessment will not be a fair market
16 assessment probably in the next two years
17 and it wasn't probably two to three years
18 ago. So ultimately I'm at a total
19 disadvantage, you know. One, I'm being
20 displaced and not being able to live out
21 the American dream, and, two, I'm being
22 forced to accept the mediocre, at best,
23 value of my home, in which I thought it
24 would benefit my children. I got two
25 sons, you know. I don't want them to

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 struggle like I did.

3 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Have they
4 made an offer to you?

5 MR. BAXTER: No, none
6 whatsoever.

7 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I think the
8 offer -- I mean, that process is, I
9 guess, ongoing, and there's always the
10 opportunity to dispute that offer from a
11 legal standpoint. So, I mean, it's hard
12 for me to comment on something that
13 hasn't been offered yet.

14 MR. BAXTER: I understand.

15 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: To know
16 whether the offer is fair or not, or what
17 you paid for the property as opposed to
18 what they're offering to buy it from you,
19 how much they're willing to pay.

20 So I'm at -- we're at a bit of
21 a disadvantage in commenting on that
22 because it hasn't happened yet.

23 MR. BAXTER: Right. I
24 understand.

25 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: And it

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 can't happen unless we don't move this --
3 if we don't move this process forward, it
4 doesn't happen at all. So that's where
5 we are at this point.

6 MR. BAXTER: I understand. So
7 it's just stay in my place as usual as a
8 citizen and just wait to see what you
9 guys do to me?

10 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Well,
11 certainly no one is intending to do
12 anything to you. Through all the times
13 that I've chaired these hearings relative
14 to the RDA and these kind of processes,
15 there's always some folks that are upset
16 and unhappy, and we understand that, but
17 there are other issues that we need to
18 take into consideration.

19 MR. BAXTER: I understand.

20 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Hopefully
21 you'll get to an equal place or a fair
22 place with the RDA. And Councilman
23 Clarke's light is on.

24 COUNCILMAN CLARKE: Thank you,
25 Mr. Chairman.

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 Good morning.

3 MR. BAXTER: Good morning.

4 COUNCILMAN CLARKE: Good seeing
5 you again.

6 MR. BAXTER: You too.

7 COUNCILMAN CLARKE: Thank you
8 for coming to the meeting. You expressed
9 yourself at that meeting and here today
10 very well. I actually agree with you,
11 and I thank you for having that vision.
12 As a person who grew up in that
13 neighborhood, as you did, we understand
14 the necessities of bringing that
15 neighborhood back, because we do have
16 some challenges around there. We're
17 starting to see flickers of light as a
18 result of the new investment.

19 Again, not bound by the law, I
20 can say some things kind of off the cuff
21 that the Redevelopment Authority can't
22 say. I understand that there's always a
23 concern about new houses versus the
24 existing housing stock. It's always a
25 belief that the new houses aren't built

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 to the quality of the old houses, and
3 that's probably true. Materials are what
4 they are. But the good thing in this
5 particular neighborhood, there happens to
6 be opportunities within that same
7 neighborhood with housing stock that's
8 either owned by the City of Philadelphia
9 or that's being sold by a developer
10 that's exactly like the housing stock
11 that's being condemned today or very
12 comparable.

13 Speaking one, I was up on 31st
14 Street this Saturday speaking to the lady
15 about one of the older homes there.
16 There's currently a house -- and I'm not
17 here to market properties, but I guess I
18 am. There's currently a house for sale
19 in the middle of 31st Street that's a
20 rehabilitated house, and it's a
21 three-story structure, brick, large, as
22 large as the ones that are currently
23 being condemned, and, interestingly
24 enough, that particular house has had the
25 most interest in terms of people wanting

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 to buy it, because it looks like the
3 existing house in the neighborhood.

4 So I clearly understand that
5 mindset. There are actually a couple of
6 other properties in proximity to -- and I
7 don't want to get into specific
8 locations -- to the development that's
9 proposed that are also the same size that
10 are multi-unit properties that are
11 actually owned by some entities within
12 the government.

13 So as we have this
14 conversation, I would encourage you to
15 talk in some level of specificity about
16 if you want to stay in that immediate
17 neighborhood with your investment, talk
18 about some of the very specific
19 properties, and then another time I can
20 kind of talk to you a little bit about
21 what I know that's actually available in
22 that same area, because I would like for
23 you to stay in that neighborhood with
24 your investment and subsequently have
25 your family be a part of what we hope

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 will one day be a regenerated Strawberry
3 Mansion.

4 MR. BAXTER: I mean, I
5 appreciate it. I mean, I understand both
6 sides. You guys have to satisfy a side,
7 but as a citizen that's looking at my
8 future forecast, two children, you know,
9 I want to be appeased as well. So that's
10 basically it.

11 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you.
12 Thanks for coming in.

13 MR. BAXTER: No problem.

14 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Anyone else
15 to testify on this bill?

16 (No response.)

17 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Seeing
18 none, we will now move to -- by the way,
19 I want to just make an announcement that
20 Bill No. 110846, which is the commercial
21 advertising district in the eastern part
22 of Center City, the bill sponsored by
23 Councilman DiCicco, is being held, so it
24 won't be heard today. So if you're here
25 to testify on that bill, it won't be

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 considered until next term.

3 The next bill for consideration
4 is Bill No. 110847, which is an ordinance
5 to amend the Institutional Development
6 District Master Plan of the Aria Health
7 System - Torresdale Campus (formerly
8 Frankford Hospital), located at 10800
9 Knights Road, by allowing for the
10 construction of a building addition to be
11 used for emergency and outpatient
12 services.

13 Mr. Kramer.

14 (Witnesses approached witness
15 table.)

16 MR. KRAMER: Good morning,
17 Councilman Kenney and members of the
18 Rules Committee. I am William Kramer,
19 Division Director of the Development
20 Division of the Philadelphia City
21 Planning Commission. I am here to
22 testify on Bill No. 110847, which was
23 introduced into City Council November
24 17th, 2011.

25 Bill No. 110847 amends the

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 Master Plan for the Aria Health System -
3 Torresdale Campus (Formerly Frankford
4 Hospital) Institutional Development
5 District. The campus is located at 10800
6 Knights Road at the intersection of
7 Knights Road and Red Lion Road in
8 Northeast Philadelphia.

9 Bill No. 110847 will permit an
10 addition to the main hospital structure,
11 which will be used for emergency and
12 outpatient services. The addition will
13 include a five-story building located to
14 the west of the existing main hospital
15 structure and will be used as the new
16 emergency department. The new building
17 will include a main entrance and
18 reception lobby, an ambulance interface
19 area, urgent care and trauma units,
20 diagnostic imaging facilities, two
21 stories of outpatient functions, lab
22 space and other accessory spaces.

23 The proposed construction will
24 displace the hospital's existing annex
25 building and temporary ER structure.

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 Site improvements will include parking
3 and traffic upgrades, comprehensive
4 signage, stormwater management facilities
5 and landscaping. The project will create
6 approximately 40 new full-time jobs on
7 top of the more than the already existing
8 1,500 full-time positions.

9 The Philadelphia City Planning
10 Commission at its meeting of November
11 15th, 2011 recommended approval for this
12 proposed IDD amendment. Therefore, Bill
13 No. 110847 is considered an item in
14 accord with previous policy.

15 I would be happy to answer any
16 questions you may have.

17 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you
18 very much.

19 Any questions for Mr. Kramer?

20 (No response.)

21 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Seeing
22 none, we will now call Mr. Tantala, Erin
23 Kelly and Christine Winn.

24 (Witnesses approached witness
25 table.)

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Whoever
3 would like to go first, please identify
4 yourself for the record and proceed.

5 MR. TANTALA: Members of the
6 Committee, good morning. My name is
7 Michael Tantala. I'm an engineer working
8 with Aria Health in support of their
9 proposed IDD Master Plan amendment to
10 include an emergency and outpatient
11 services addition at their Torresdale
12 Campus in Northeast Philadelphia. With
13 me today is Ms. Christine Winn, Executive
14 Director for Aria Health; Ms. Erin Kelly,
15 Project Architect with Francis Cauffman
16 Architects; Mr. Mark Leemaster, Project
17 Manager for this expansion; and Mr. Herb
18 Young, Regional Director of Community
19 Affairs for Turner Construction Company.

20 At this time, Ms. Kelly will
21 present the merits of the proposed
22 emergency department expansion, and
23 Ms. Winn will speak on behalf of the
24 hospital. We're happy to answer any
25 questions that the Committee may have.

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Before we
3 get started, I'd like to put the horse
4 before the cart. Do you have an EOP plan
5 attached to your legislation?

6 MS. WINN: We do not. We're
7 actually working with the office at this
8 point.

9 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Okay.

10 MS. WINN: But the construction
11 company that we have selected, Turner,
12 actually does have an EOP plan.

13 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: And is it
14 available to be attached as an amendment
15 or as an exhibit?

16 MR. TANTALA: We have a copy of
17 the plan, their plan. We're not certain
18 yet if it's approved by the OEO, but we
19 are communicating and working with the
20 OEO. We'll attach it, but that may
21 change to more fit the format of the OEO.

22 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Without
23 objection, I'll allow you to proceed. If
24 the Committee could see a copy of it,
25 that would be helpful. And please

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 continue with your testimony.

3 MS. KELLY: Good morning. My
4 name is Erin Kelly. I'm with Francis
5 Cauffman Architects. I'm working with
6 Aria Health on the addition of a new
7 emergency department and outpatient
8 services building on the Aria Health
9 Torresdale Campus.

10 This IDD Master Plan amendment
11 would provide for a new five-story
12 addition, approximately 153,000 square
13 feet, that would house a new emergency
14 department and outpatient services, as
15 well as providing a new outpatient lobby
16 entry. Site improvements would be made
17 to provide new circulation and parking
18 for both patients and visitors.

19 The new building addition will
20 contain five stories, and on the first
21 level, there will be plant engineering
22 mechanical support spaces for the
23 hospital. The main entry, the ground
24 level floor, will be the emergency
25 department, which will be a

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 state-of-the-art facility, expanding
3 their current facility from 30 treatment
4 bays to 46, introducing a new enlarged
5 trauma suite and dedicated radiology
6 imaging within the department.

7 The upper two levels will
8 contain outpatient services that will be
9 a combination of physician suites and
10 specialty physician suites.

11 The top floor, the fifth floor
12 on the rendering, you'll see is the
13 mechanical penthouse, which will house
14 mechanical infrastructure to support this
15 building.

16 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I don't
17 believe there are any questions for this
18 witness. Whoever else has testimony to
19 offer, please.

20 MS. WINN: Thank you.

21 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Please pull
22 that microphone just a little closer to
23 you.

24 MS. WINN: My name is Christine
25 Winn. I'm the Executive Director for

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 Aria Torresdale. Pleasure to be here
3 this morning.

4 As you may or may not know,
5 we're a 258-bed hospital located in the
6 Northeast. We serve a population of
7 about 12 zip codes. That makes up about
8 390,000 residents of Philadelphia. Our
9 projections in the future look that our
10 population of the over 65 group will be
11 increasing, and so one of the reasons why
12 we'd like to make better access for our
13 residents.

14 We did a recent community needs
15 assessment, and that points to issues
16 being included diabetes, obesity and
17 hypertension. We have 14,000 discharges
18 and 50,000 emergency visits currently,
19 which 20 percent are admitted.

20 We've been a trauma center for
21 over 20 years, and we see about 1,100
22 patients from that service. With our
23 proximity to many nursing homes as well
24 as major highways, we see mechanism of
25 injury being mostly falls as well as

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 motor vehicle accidents.

3 This project allows for us to
4 increase access, and I'll speak very
5 quickly to an incident that happened
6 yesterday with the Father Judge High
7 School. As you know, many of the
8 residents of that area did come to Aria
9 Torresdale. We served over 100 people
10 yesterday, which was a complete surge for
11 our emergency department. We actually
12 doubled our visits. And in response to
13 that, we did have to open a conference
14 room in order to appropriately treat the
15 patients. With a new department such as
16 this, that would allow for us to have the
17 capacity to be able to surge in a
18 treatment space.

19 We're incorporating
20 evidence-based design elements, and this
21 campus access will also be improved
22 through straightening roads,
23 beautification of the campus with trees
24 added, new pedestrian crosswalks and
25 drop-offs, and a new Knights Road

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 entrance and exit, which will open early
3 summer 2012. We will also reduce the
4 congestion as part of this project on Red
5 Lion Road, and that entrance or exit will
6 officially close as of winter 2014.

7 So in conclusion, this
8 expansion will help us serve our
9 community better. It will improve our
10 campus throughput and creates
11 opportunities now for jobs. So I
12 respectfully request approval of our
13 project, Bill 110847.

14 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you
15 for your testimony.

16 Are there any questions for
17 these witnesses?

18 (No response.)

19 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Seeing
20 none, thank you.

21 Is there anyone else to testify
22 on this bill?

23 MR. ALI: Yes.

24 (Witness approached witness
25 table.)

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 MR. ALI: Good morning.

3 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Good
4 morning. Please identify yourself.

5 MR. ALI: My name is Jihad Ali.
6 I'm President of the Contractors
7 Roundtable. I'm here to speak on behalf
8 of Bill 110847.

9 Councilman Kenney, I'd like to
10 commend you for asking about the EOP
11 plan, but I think this Council has
12 already put down -- you drew a line in
13 the sand. You said, look, don't come to
14 this Council without an EOP plan. Now,
15 if we're going to take people serious,
16 they have to have it. I'm asking that
17 you oppose this bill until they provide
18 you with what you required them to have.

19 It's good to see that they have
20 Turner Construction. I would like to say
21 a word of support for Herb Young from
22 Turner. He's been outstanding. He's a
23 member. He's working in a very difficult
24 environment. He works for a firm that
25 originally didn't take this matter

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 seriously. Since Mr. Turner has been
3 there, he steadily increased
4 opportunities. He's one of the reasons
5 we have a Contractors Roundtable. Twenty
6 years ago they had an initiative where
7 they helped contractors come together and
8 organize their selves and move forward.

9 If the hospital does anything,
10 I'd like them to consider funding another
11 program that Mr. Turner can provide them
12 with the details on to help include
13 participation.

14 You know, one thing about
15 hospitals, we all know that they do an
16 outstanding job in saving citizens,
17 because they deal with one thing that
18 they can never forget. That's that we
19 all share one blood. So when they
20 operate, they operate in blood. They
21 know we're all one. But when you get
22 outside of the operating world, in the
23 real world, out here, there's a black and
24 a white world. As I said before, I hate
25 to speak frank and blunt, but the reality

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 is, the white side of this construction
3 industry is not giving opportunities to
4 African American men and women. So it's
5 not until we have these EOP plans, until
6 we see who is the -- Councilman, one
7 thing I would like to know is if they
8 do -- have they reached for an EOP plan
9 provider, because that's important to
10 know.

11 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: We're
12 looking at what they've submitted at the
13 moment, but Councilman Goode.

14 COUNCILMAN GOODE: Can Aria
15 come back to the table.

16 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Christine,
17 could you please come back.

18 And, sir, from Turner, can you
19 please come forward.

20 (Witnesses approached witness
21 table.)

22 COUNCILMAN GOODE: Someone from
23 your organization e-mailed me last
24 Thursday or Friday inquiring about EOP
25 requirements. What was your follow-up?

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 MS. WINN: In terms of our
3 follow-up, we've reviewed the document
4 and we're working with the office right
5 now.

6 COUNCILMAN GOODE: I don't know
7 what that means.

8 MS. WINN: We've reviewed the
9 template document that was provided to us
10 so that we can develop and fully develop
11 a plan of our own.

12 COUNCILMAN GOODE: That's kind
13 of funny, because it's a template. So
14 how would you be developing a plan of
15 your own? If it's a template, and I know
16 what the template is, all you do is put
17 the numbers within the template. It's
18 that simple.

19 MS. WINN: Well, we're working
20 with Turner to actually evaluate the --

21 COUNCILMAN GOODE: You don't
22 have to work with Turner to evaluate it.
23 It's a template. So either you had
24 participation goals or you did not.

25 Someone e-mailed me on Thursday

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 or Friday inquiring about this hearing,
3 inquiring about economic opportunity plan
4 requirements. I referred them to the
5 Office of Economic Opportunity --

6 MS. WINN: Exactly.

7 COUNCILMAN GOODE: -- for a
8 template. It doesn't take that long.
9 You were trying to prepare for the
10 hearing. Obviously at some point you
11 decided not to prepare for the hearing.

12 MS. WINN: As we reviewed this
13 template, respectfully, some of these
14 things that are addressed in the template
15 don't necessarily apply to a hospital in
16 terms of the contracts and such.

17 COUNCILMAN GOODE: It's not
18 negotiable.

19 MS. WINN: It's not negotiable.

20 COUNCILMAN GOODE: It's a
21 template.

22 MS. WINN: We obviously need
23 further work on our plan.

24 COUNCILMAN GOODE: Once again,
25 it's a template, which means there are

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 only two sections where you plug in
3 numbers. So what do you need to work on?

4 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Sir, would
5 you please identify yourself for the
6 record.

7 MR. YOUNG: My name is Herb
8 Young. I'm Regional Manager of Community
9 Affairs for Turner Construction Company.

10 And, Councilman Goode, I just
11 received the plan, the EOP plan, from the
12 Office of Economic Opportunity from
13 Ms. Angela Dowd-Burton and it has the
14 goals for the project, and we would
15 adhere to the goals that she has set. We
16 will work --

17 COUNCILMAN GOODE: Can we have
18 a copy of it now?

19 MR. YOUNG: I have it in my
20 hand now, yes.

21 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Is this
22 different from what was already handed
23 out?

24 MR. TANTALA: This is the
25 template.

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 MR. YOUNG: This is the
3 template. I have the template. The
4 goals that we had, we have a minimum of
5 20 percent minority business
6 participation.

7 COUNCILMAN GOODE: We need a
8 copy of it.

9 MR. YOUNG: Pardon me?

10 COUNCILMAN GOODE: We need a
11 copy of it.

12 MR. YOUNG: I think -- did
13 you --

14 MS. WINN: That's been
15 submitted, yeah.

16 MR. YOUNG: That's Turner's
17 plan that we submitted.

18 COUNCILMAN GOODE: We need a
19 copy of the EOP.

20 MR. YOUNG: The template here?

21 COUNCILMAN GOODE: Yes.

22 MR. YOUNG: Well, we'll redo it
23 and submit it to you.

24 COUNCILMAN GOODE: We need a
25 copy of it now.

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 MR. YOUNG: Oh, you need it
3 now? Okay.

4 MR. TANTALA: This isn't
5 tailored for the Aria Health.

6 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I'm sorry.
7 You're going to have to identify yourself
8 for the stenographer and pull the
9 microphone close. The question I have
10 is, is what Mr. Young is giving to the --
11 okay. That is different.

12 COUNCILMAN GOODE: It's empty.
13 The boxes are blank.

14 MR. YOUNG: I'm sorry. I
15 didn't hear you.

16 COUNCILMAN GOODE: The boxes
17 are blank.

18 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: The
19 Councilman said there's no numbers in the
20 boxes.

21 MR. TANTALA: Sir, Michael
22 Tantala.

23 That is the draft template that
24 we received. Turner Construction has
25 their own plan that we're going to have

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 approved by the OEO.

3 COUNCILMAN GOODE: There's no
4 such thing as a draft template. There is
5 a formal template. All you have to do is
6 plug in the numbers to these boxes.
7 That's all you're required to do. You
8 inquired about this last week in
9 preparation for the hearing and then you
10 didn't do it.

11 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Councilman
12 Greenlee.

13 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: I guess I
14 was just wondering, when can you get
15 those numbers? How quickly can you get
16 those numbers that the Councilman is
17 asking for?

18 MR. TANTALA: Today, sir.

19 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: And I
20 guess the question -- I'm not trying to
21 be smart here, but if you asked for it a
22 week ago, why don't you have them today?

23 MR. TANTALA: Sir, we asked for
24 it Friday. OEO, Ms. Dowd-Burton,
25 responded Friday afternoon late. We

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 forwarded the document to Aria and Turner
3 Construction, and they provided their
4 economic opportunity plan, which is not
5 in the same format as the City's OEO
6 plan. They're tailoring it to have it
7 approved by the OEO, but it's not
8 complete.

9 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Councilman
10 Goode.

11 COUNCILMAN GOODE: Once again,
12 we're not going to keep going back and
13 forth on this. It's a template. All you
14 do is plug in the numbers. It's not
15 negotiable. You don't take Turner's plan
16 and convert it into an EOP. You use the
17 EOP template and plug in the numbers.
18 And you've had the template since the end
19 of last week. So, in other words, you
20 don't know what the participation goals
21 for the project are?

22 MR. YOUNG: Yes. Excuse me.
23 My name is Herb Young, Regional Manager
24 for Community Affairs.

25 We have a minimum of 20

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 percent. The template doesn't have any
3 numbers. So what I need to do is find
4 out from Angela Dowd-Burton what is it
5 that she want us to have -- what is it
6 that she requires us to do for the
7 project. Then I will input that data
8 here, give it back to Aria Health and
9 they'll submit it to Angela Dowd-Burton.

10 COUNCILMAN GOODE: You have
11 probably two options. One option is to
12 take your goals and write them into the
13 template right there.

14 MR. YOUNG: Right.

15 COUNCILMAN GOODE: We'll make
16 copies and do it as an amendment to the
17 bill. Or we can recess the hearing until
18 you have an EOP.

19 MS. WINN: We can do it now.

20 MR. YOUNG: We'll do it now.
21 We'll write them in.

22 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: What I
23 would suggest is, you don't need to do it
24 right at the table. I would retire to
25 another location in the room and do what

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 you need to do so we can move forward and
3 then bring you back formally to accept
4 the plan.

5 MR. YOUNG: All right.

6 MS. WINN: Okay. Thank you.

7 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Who else
8 here is to testify on this bill?

9 (No response.)

10 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN:
11 Councilman, just a quick question.

12 COUNCILMAN KENNEY:
13 Councilwoman Brown.

14 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: I'm
15 curious to know, is the Aria Health
16 System, are there any public dollars in
17 its project at all, state, local or
18 federal?

19 MS. WINN: Yes. We have --
20 Christine Winn, Executive Director.

21 Yes. We have an RAP grant --
22 RACP grant. Sorry.

23 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN:
24 Understanding that, has -- I'll wait
25 until the recessed hearing of Rules and

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 re-raise the question then.

3 MS. WINN: Okay.

4 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Thank you.

5 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you.

6 Anyone else to testify on this
7 bill?

8 (No response.)

9 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Seeing
10 none, we will hold in abeyance our
11 decision on the prior bill and move to
12 Bill No. 110842, which is an ordinance
13 repealing an ordinance (Bill No. 110083),
14 entitled "An ordinance amending Section
15 14-1607 of The Philadelphia Code,
16 entitled 'Special District Controls for
17 the Center City Commercial Area,' and
18 Section 14-1605 of The Philadelphia Code,
19 entitled 'Regulated Uses,' and Section
20 14-305 of The Philadelphia Code, entitled
21 'C-4 Commercial Districts,' by adding to
22 all Sections special provisions relating
23 to the area bounded by Chestnut Street,
24 12th Street, 13th Street, and Sansom
25 Street, all under certain terms and

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 conditions."

3 Mr. Kramer.

4 MR. KRAMER: Good morning,
5 Councilman Kenney and members of the
6 Rules Committee. I am William Kramer,
7 Division Director of the Development
8 Division of the Philadelphia City
9 Planning Commission. I'm here to testify
10 on Bill No. 110842, which was introduced
11 into City Council November 17th, 2011.

12 Bill No. 110842 repeals Bill
13 No. 110083, which amended the Zoning Code
14 to allow for the reuse of the existing
15 building located at 1200 Chestnut Street
16 as an upscale billiards hall in the
17 existing Mellon Bank Building.
18 Additionally, it allowed for a rooftop
19 addition to the existing structure. Bill
20 No. 110083 was approved and signed into
21 law on April 27th, 2011.

22 It is our understanding that
23 the sponsoring Councilman is proposing to
24 amend Bill No. 110842 by extending the
25 effective date and provisions of this

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 ordinance.

3 The Philadelphia City Planning
4 Commission at its meeting of February
5 15th, 2011 recommended approval of Bill
6 No. 110083. While Bill No. 110842
7 repeals the former legislation, as
8 amended, it is considered the same as
9 having placed a sunset provision on the
10 original legislation and is therefore
11 considered an item in accord with
12 previous policy.

13 That concludes my testimony.
14 I'd be happy to answer any questions you
15 may have.

16 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you
17 very much for your testimony.

18 Any questions for Mr. Kramer?

19 (No response.)

20 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Seeing
21 none, anyone else to testify on this
22 bill?

23 (No response.)

24 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Seeing
25 none, we will now move to Bill No.

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 110826, which is an ordinance amending
3 Title 9 of The Philadelphia Code,
4 entitled "Regulation of Businesses,
5 Trades and Professions," by amending
6 Section 9-1004, entitled "Contractors,"
7 by requiring that certain information be
8 reported to the Department of Licenses
9 and Inspections for certain construction
10 projects and providing for the posting of
11 certain information at the construction
12 site, providing for penalties for
13 violations, and making certain technical
14 changes, all under certain terms and
15 conditions.

16 This bill was heard in a prior
17 hearing. We have some amendments that
18 have been circulated we're going to offer
19 today. And I believe we have one person
20 testifying, Mr. Sherman, if he's still
21 here.

22 (No response.)

23 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Seeing
24 none, we will take up the amendments in
25 the meeting of the Rules Committee.

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 Is there anyone else to testify
3 on this bill?

4 MR. ALI: Yes.

5 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Yes, sir.

6 (Witness approached witness
7 table.)

8 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Please
9 identify yourself for the record.

10 MR. ALI: Good morning. My
11 name is Jihad Ali. I'm with the
12 Contractors Roundtable organization. I'm
13 here to give testimony on Bill No.
14 110826.

15 Mr. Kenney, members of this
16 Committee, I support this bill, but I
17 support this bill for a different reason,
18 and that reason is, oftentimes those of
19 us from the African American community,
20 when we're out there in the field, we're
21 constantly told when they bid on jobs,
22 our members, Your price is too high, your
23 price is too high. Well, it really is,
24 because there are other members out here
25 that are competing against us for

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 projects and they're not playing by the
3 rules.

4 But one thing I would like to
5 ask this Committee, our elected
6 officials, when we're going to do this
7 bill, a lot of times through Councilwoman
8 Donna Reed Miller, you led the fight for
9 inclusion at the Convention Center. One
10 of the things that constantly came up was
11 when we asked the unions about
12 information, we can't get it. So if
13 we're going to do something on behalf of
14 them, let them do something on behalf of
15 us, which is we want to know what those
16 unions are composed of, who their
17 membership is. If we're requiring
18 License and Inspection to have
19 information readily available on what
20 contractors and subcontractors are doing,
21 then on the flip side of this, the
22 citizen should know what are the unions
23 doing. It's only an ethical question.
24 We should be given the same rights that
25 they're requiring of our elected

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 officials.

3 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you.

4 One of the reasons -- well, the main
5 reason this bill was introduced is
6 relative to the lost revenue and the lost
7 tax money and lost workmen's compensation
8 benefits and the things that your members
9 pay, which increases your cost of
10 bidding, and hopefully if we can
11 eliminate these kind of 1099 guys and
12 these cash-in-the-envelope guys from the
13 industry, we'll have more opportunities
14 for your folks, your members, to bid
15 fairly with those individuals.

16 And I do agree with you on your
17 comments relative to union transparency
18 and who is on the site. That is not
19 addressed. Clearly it's not addressed in
20 this bill, but certainly we would
21 entertain opportunities in the next term
22 to have that more prominently displayed.

23 MR. ALI: Well, I'll come back
24 next term hopefully, but one thing I
25 would like to say is, it's really deeper

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 than just me and my members. It's
3 really -- it's almost affecting 600,000
4 African American men and women out there.

5 You know, one thing that I'm
6 clear on, I'm just one of those here. I
7 didn't -- none of them voted for me, but
8 they voted for you. So I'm here just as
9 one voice so you don't have an empty
10 chair to say, Hey, look, we're still out
11 here, we still see you, we still know
12 what you're doing, and we're still
13 fighting. And as long as that fight
14 takes, Councilman DiCicco, Councilwoman
15 Miller, good luck in your retirement,
16 you've done your best. The fight will
17 continue, and hopefully I'll be here next
18 term.

19 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Well, I
20 just want to let you know that I get
21 equally aggravated driving by a
22 construction site and seeing more New
23 Jersey license plates than I see
24 Pennsylvania license plates. So you can
25 be assured I'm on the same page with you

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 regarding that situation.

3 MR. ALI: Thank you,

4 Councilman.

5 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you.

6 Anyone else to testify on this

7 bill?

8 (No response.)

9 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Seeing

10 none, that should bring us to the

11 conclusion of this public hearing.

12 Before we go into a public meeting, I

13 just want to take a moment to speak

14 personally about the end of this term.

15 I've chaired this Committee for

16 20 years. I want to thank former Council

17 President Street and then Mayor Street

18 and Council President Verna, who is

19 leaving, for giving me the opportunity as

20 Vice-Chair of this Committee to actually

21 chair this Committee de facto over the

22 past 20 years. It has been probably the

23 one single issue that has allowed me to

24 grow and mature as a Councilmember,

25 running this Committee and running these

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 hearings. We've had amazingly
3 controversial things that have come
4 through here, and it's been a tutorial
5 for me in allowing people to speak and be
6 heard and try to come to some balance.

7 So whoever is in this position
8 next term, I pledge my support and help
9 and advice, if needed, but I wanted to
10 just tell everyone here and for the
11 record and the members of the Committee,
12 it's been a real privilege to have
13 chaired this Committee de facto for this
14 long and, again, thanking Council
15 President Street and Council President
16 Verna. And I know that ex officio the
17 new Council President chairs this
18 Committee, and if he decides that he's
19 going to chair it, then I have no
20 problem. I'm confident that we will move
21 forward in a good fashion. If he chooses
22 to do what Council President Street did
23 for me for another member, I pledge my
24 support and help for them. But it has
25 been a terrific committee to be chair of,

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 and I just have been privileged to have
3 the opportunity.

4 So I'd like to call back for
5 the hearing the Aria folks to get this
6 done.

7 (Witnesses approached witness
8 table.)

9 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Okay.
10 Please identify yourself for the record.

11 MS. WINN: Christine Winn, Aria
12 Health, Executive Director.

13 MR. YOUNG: Herb Young,
14 Regional Manager of Community Affairs for
15 Turner Construction Company.

16 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Please
17 proceed.

18 MR. YOUNG: I reached out to
19 Angela Dowd-Burton. The goals for the
20 project will be 30 percent minority
21 business and 5 percent women business.
22 And she indicated if we needed her to
23 sign off on it, I can have her -- I can
24 fax it over and have her sign off on it.

25 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Do you have

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 a document that's filled out in order to
3 be attached as an amendment to this bill?

4 MR. YOUNG: Yes, I do.

5 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Can we have
6 it?

7 Councilwoman Brown.

8 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Good
9 morning again. Is this a first for
10 either Aria or Turner where it is clear
11 that this City Council now looks with a
12 laser beam at participation rates,
13 participation activity? Is this a first
14 where you've been asked to deliver on
15 that?

16 MR. YOUNG: No, not for Turner
17 Construction Company, but --

18 MS. WINN: Yes, it is for Aria
19 Health.

20 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Have you
21 done any other building in the City of
22 Philadelphia boundaries or is this a
23 first?

24 MS. WINN: Not recently, no.

25 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: This form

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 is not fully filled out relative to
3 professional services.

4 MS. WINN: The contract that we
5 are engaging in with Turner is for
6 construction services.

7 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: But you're
8 here before this body asking for
9 legislative approval to move forward,
10 which puts you in the same bailiwick with
11 professional services and construction.
12 And I don't -- I mean, I don't think the
13 sentiment of the Committee is to allow it
14 to move forward unless it's clearly
15 amended into the bill what your goals are
16 relative to professional services. So I
17 don't know what to suggest. I mean, we
18 could potentially recess this portion of
19 the hearing until tomorrow, but, I
20 mean --

21 MS. WINN: We can take a
22 sidebar if you would like and confer with
23 our professional services, which would be
24 our architect, who is also here.

25 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: You said

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 your architect is here?

3 MS. WINN: Yes. And that would
4 be the only professional services that we
5 would have.

6 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Rather than
7 kind of bat this badminton back and forth
8 here, what I'd like to do is, I'm going
9 to recess just this portion of the
10 hearing until 9 o'clock tomorrow, which
11 is a date certain and time certain at 9
12 o'clock tomorrow morning, give you the
13 opportunity over night to come back with
14 this. We will move all the bills out of
15 Committee here and then keep the recess
16 open until tomorrow at 9 o'clock.

17 MS. WINN: Okay. Thank you.

18 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: For the
19 record, we are recessing this particular
20 Rules Committee hearing.

21 We're now going to convene a
22 public meeting, and the Chair recognizes
23 Councilmember Goode for a motion on Bill
24 No. 110793.

25 COUNCILMAN GOODE: Thank you,

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 Mr. Chairman. I move that Bill No.
3 110793 be reported out of the Committee
4 with a favorable recommendation, that the
5 rules of Council be suspended so as to
6 permit first reading at our next Council
7 session.

8 (Duly seconded.)

9 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Moved and
10 seconded.

11 All in favor?

12 (Aye.)

13 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: There are
14 none opposed. Bill No. 110793 will
15 report out of this Committee favorably
16 and a request has been made for rules
17 suspension to allow for first reading at
18 our next Council session.

19 The Chair recognizes
20 Councilmember Clarke for a motion to
21 approve the amendment to Bill No. 110798.

22 COUNCILMAN CLARKE: Thank you,
23 Mr. Chairman. I move for the adoption of
24 the amendment to Bill No. 110798.

25 (Duly seconded.)

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Moved and
3 seconded.

4 All in favor?

5 (Aye.)

6 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: There are
7 none opposed. Bill No. 110798 will be
8 amended accordingly.

9 The Chair now recognizes
10 Councilmember Clarke for a motion on the
11 amended bill.

12 COUNCILMAN CLARKE: Thank you,
13 Mr. Chair. I move that Bill 110798, as
14 amended, be reported out of the Committee
15 with a favorable recommendation, rules
16 suspension as to allow reading at the
17 next session of Council.

18 (Duly seconded.)

19 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Moved and
20 seconded.

21 All in favor?

22 (Aye.)

23 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: There are
24 none opposed. Bill No. 110798, as
25 amended, will report out of this

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 Committee favorably and a request made
3 for rules suspension to allow for first
4 reading at our next Council session.

5 The Chair recognizes
6 Councilmember DiCicco for a motion to
7 approve the amendment to Bill No. 110842.

8 COUNCILMAN DiCICCO: Thank you,
9 Mr. Chairman. I move that the amendment
10 to Bill No. 110842 be approved.

11 (Duly seconded.)

12 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Moved and
13 seconded.

14 All in favor?

15 (Aye.)

16 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: There are
17 none opposed. Bill No. 110842 will be
18 amended accordingly.

19 The Chair recognizes
20 Councilmember DiCicco on the amended
21 bill.

22 COUNCILMAN DiCICCO: Thank you,
23 Mr. Chairman. I move that Bill No.
24 110842, as amended, be reported out of
25 this Committee with a favorable

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 recommendation, that the rules of Council
3 be suspended so as to permit first
4 reading at the next session of City
5 Council.

6 (Duly seconded.)

7 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Moved and
8 seconded.

9 All in favor?

10 (Aye.)

11 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: There are
12 none opposed. Bill No. 110842, as
13 amended, will report out of this
14 Committee favorably and a request has
15 been made for rules suspension to allow
16 for first reading at our next Council
17 session.

18 Bill No. 110846 is being held.
19 Bill No. 110847 will be heard tomorrow at
20 the Rules Committee at 9 o'clock.

21 The Chair recognizes
22 Councilmember Brown for a motion to
23 approve the amendment of Bill No. 110826.

24 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN:

25 Mr. Chairman, I move that Bill No. 110826

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.

2 be amended.

3 (Duly seconded.)

4 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Moved and
5 seconded.

6 All in favor?

7 (Aye.)

8 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: There are
9 none opposed. Bill No. 110826 -- the
10 amendment is approved.

11 The Chair now recognizes
12 Councilmember Miller for a motion on the
13 amended Bill 110826.

14 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Thank
15 you, Mr. Chair. I move that Bill No.
16 110826 be approved favorably as amended
17 out of this Committee with a rules
18 suspension so it can be read at our next
19 Council session.

20 (Duly seconded.)

21 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Moved and
22 seconded.

23 All in favor?

24 (Aye.)

25 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: There are

1 12/6/11 - RULES - 110793, ETC.
2 none opposed. Bill No. 110826, as
3 amended, will report out of this
4 Committee favorably and a request will be
5 made for rules suspension to allow first
6 reading at our next Council session.

7 This meeting and hearing is
8 recessed until tomorrow at 9:00 a.m. in
9 order to hear the amendments to Bill No.
10 110847.

11 Thank you.

12 (Committee on Rules recessed at
13 11:25 a.m.)

14 - - -

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2 CERTIFICATE

3 I HEREBY CERTIFY that the
4 proceedings, evidence and objections are
5 contained fully and accurately in the
6 stenographic notes taken by me upon the
7 foregoing matter on December 6, 2011, and that
8 this is a true and correct transcript of same.

9
10
11
12
13 -----
14 MICHELE L. MURPHY
15 RPR-Notary Public
16
17
18

19 (The foregoing certification of this
20 transcript does not apply to any reproduction
21 of the same by any means, unless under the
22 direct control and/or supervision of the
23 certifying reporter.)
24
25