

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
COMMITTEE ON LABOR AND CIVIL SERVICE

Room 400, City Hall
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania
Tuesday, November 27, 2012
10:15 a.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCILMAN JAMES KENNEY, CHAIR
COUNCILWOMAN CINDY BASS
COUNCILMAN W. WILSON GOODE, JR.
COUNCILMAN BOBBY HENON
COUNCILMAN CURTIS JONES, JR.
COUNCILMAN DENNIS O'BRIEN
COUNCILMAN DAVID OH
COUNCILWOMAN MARIA D. QUINONES-SANCHEZ
COUNCILMAN MARK SQUILLA

RESOLUTION 120929 - Resolution authorizing the
Committee on Labor and Civil Service to hold
public hearings to review the new policy put
forth by the Philadelphia Fire Department that
will initiate a firefighter rotation
process...

- - -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Good morning. Thank you for attending the hearing today. This is the Committee on Civil Service and Labor, a resolution authorizing the Committee on Labor and Civil Service to hold public hearings to review the new policy set forth by the Philadelphia Fire Department that will initiate a firefighter rotation process that will facilitate the reassignment of approximately 15 to 20 percent firefighters annually.

Let me acknowledge the presence of Councilmembers O'Neill, Goode, who is the Vice-Chair, Councilman Henon, also Majority Leader Curtis Jones, and Councilman O'Brien.

And I want to start the hearing with just a comment, that I don't want to paint all top-down transfer systems with the same brush, because when the right policy is implemented in a fire department at the right time, it can be extremely beneficial for individual

11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

cross-training and skill-building, a greater diversity of assignments, knowledge of different areas around the City, additional opportunities for career advancement, increased knowledge of the Fire Department as a whole rather than a single fire rotation -- single fire station, increased parity on serving at popular or less preferred stations, and the benefits gained by working with different crew members.

But there can be some real downsides to implementing a policy that may not be appropriate for this city, for which there is no buy-in by the very firefighters who are being forced to transfer and which is done so quickly that there is no time for discussion.

There are many real consequences of such hasty and unilateral action, including adding to the growing resentment from firefighters against their leadership for regulations not previously discussed, interruption of

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 cohesive and productive teams of
3 firefighters, and a huge safety issue
4 with facing the possibility of longer
5 response times as these transfers adjust
6 to new and unfamiliar locations.

7 We have conducted some research
8 in what fire departments in other cities
9 and counties around the country are
10 doing. We have looked at nearly 15 other
11 major cities, and not a single one has
12 ever considered a mandatory rotation of
13 senior firefighters, much less is doing
14 it successfully.

15 With that said, I would like to
16 give the opportunity for any members of
17 the Committee or any members of Council
18 to comment before we call Commissioner
19 Ayers as the first witness. Anyone?

20 (No response.)

21 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Seeing
22 none, we'd ask Commissioner Ayers to take
23 the witness table.

24 (Witnesses approached witness
25 table.)

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Good
3 morning, Commissioner. Please identify
4 yourself for the record and proceed with
5 your testimony.

6 Before we start, can we turn
7 down all cell phones and put them all on
8 vibrate and all that good stuff.

9 Whenever you're ready,
10 Commissioner.

11 Also, Councilwoman Bass has
12 also joined the Committee. Councilperson
13 Squilla has also joined the Committee,
14 off the Vine Street Expressway.

15 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Good
16 morning.

17 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Good
18 morning.

19 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Good
20 morning, Chairman Kenney, members of the
21 Committee on Labor and Civil Service and
22 other distinguished members. I am Fire
23 Commissioner Lloyd Ayers.

24 I am here today to respond to
25 concerns from many of you sitting before

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 me about the upcoming plans to rotate our
3 firefighters. I came into the
4 Philadelphia Fire Department in 1974.
5 That's 38 years ago. Throughout my
6 38-year career, I have held every rank in
7 this department. I have carried out
8 every job available to be done in the
9 fire stations as well as in the
10 community. I have worked this job nearly
11 my entire life. My goal is the safety of
12 our citizens and members. I pray every
13 day to keep them both safe from hurt,
14 harm, and danger, and my department plans
15 are made with these goals in mind. I
16 have been and will remain dedicated to
17 our mission.

18 The Fire Department will be
19 rotating 15 to 20 percent of our
20 firefighters annually starting in 2013.
21 The first rotation will include those who
22 have been in their current assignment for
23 longer than ten years. This move will
24 result in a five-year rotation process
25 for our members. Those being rotated are

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 required to notify us of their top five
3 selections for transfer in preference
4 order, and we will, in turn, try to
5 accommodate as many of our members as
6 possible. Not only are these rotations
7 transparent, they will help prepare this
8 department for the future.

9 A fire department operating at
10 optimal level of service is one in which
11 each of the members are able to acquire
12 and practice their skills safely in a
13 live and controlled environment where
14 they learn to anticipate and adapt to a
15 real fire situation. An assignment at
16 each of our many locations around the
17 City requires different skills, different
18 skill sets that are essential for our
19 members to learn. A rotation system is a
20 fair and predictable process that allows
21 everyone an equal opportunity to serve in
22 our many locations around the City. It
23 is because of my commitment to fortifying
24 our department's success in the future
25 that I am implementing this rotation

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 system.

3 The importance of this policy
4 is heightened by the reality of recent
5 resource constraints and shifts in
6 personnel capacity. In 2013, I
7 anticipate losing 150 firefighters and
8 officers to retirement. This is on the
9 back of losing 80 to 100 members in the
10 past two years. During the economic
11 downturn, we were unable to fund new
12 classes, forcing us to use overtime to
13 fulfill minimum staffing requirements.
14 We are now making up for this shortage
15 with a double class of cadets currently
16 up at the Academy and due to enter the
17 field this coming winter, along with a
18 planned double class to start next spring
19 scheduled to enter the field in the
20 summer. That's 320 new firefighters
21 being placed into the field in the next
22 12 months. The Fire Department must
23 prepare to move forward with these new
24 recruits and prepare them for a
25 professional career in the fire and

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 emergency medical services. We will do
3 this by opening positions previously
4 unavailable in our busiest locations
5 around the City. These locations are
6 typically more desirable to firefighters,
7 as they can enhance what they've learned
8 in training in a real-life scenario.

9 In addition to 320 new cadets
10 entering our force, there are countless
11 members trying to enter busy locations
12 every year. We receive hundreds of
13 transfer requests annually, most of which
14 we are unable to accommodate. These
15 transfer requests are more often than not
16 from members begging to get into an
17 assignment where they can develop their
18 skills and build their training at the
19 busiest locations. Everyone cannot have
20 the same assignment. And although we
21 train our members at the Academy with
22 live building burns, we do this in an
23 extremely controlled environment.

24 Again, in order to be the best
25 force that we can be, our members need to

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 acquire and practice their skills safely
3 in a live and controlled environment
4 where they can learn to anticipate and
5 adapt to a real fire situation. After
6 they receive their assignment, they work
7 alongside members with varied degrees of
8 experience. In order to get this done
9 effectively, without favoritism, we are
10 following the process previously
11 explained, which sets a predictable and
12 evenhanded process for determining who
13 will rotate, while achieving our mission
14 to train our members for every service
15 they're expected to provide. This allows
16 everyone an equal opportunity to serve in
17 many locations around the City,
18 practicing different skill sets required
19 in each assignment.

20 As an organization, we must
21 ensure our members have the opportunity
22 to grow in experience and improve
23 themselves as professional firefighters
24 and future officers by exposing them to
25 different fire education and safety

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 districts of the City.

3 The Fire Department saw the
4 value in rotations long ago. We have
5 been rotating our officers for over 40
6 years. I am now making what is a common
7 practice for our officers the standard
8 for the entire department. We must
9 change how we prepare and perform in the
10 fire service. The fact is, real
11 structure fires are down and decreasing
12 every day, decreasing every year.
13 Although we collectively celebrate this
14 in one breath, we must be vigilant in how
15 we prepare for fires that do occur. The
16 ultimate goal is preventing fires from
17 starting in the first place. When they
18 do occur, we must still give people
19 experience in these challenging
20 environments if we are going to have a
21 sustainable, prepared, adaptable, and
22 effective department.

23 You will hear from many people
24 today about why we shouldn't do this and
25 how it will hurt them personally. I

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 remind you that there are many more you
3 won't hear from today, but I certainly
4 hear from them, and they have been
5 looking for this opportunity, this
6 policy, this practice their entire
7 careers. They are a silent majority not
8 standing before you today, but like those
9 here today who are resistant to the
10 change, they have a stake in how the
11 department is operated.

12 It is my responsibility to
13 ensure this department is as well trained
14 and prepared as it possibly can be.
15 Under no circumstances will we have a
16 unit that's represented by all new
17 personnel. We are aware that some of our
18 members are saying these statements, but
19 it is simply not the case. In almost all
20 of the rotations, our firehouses will
21 have members with at least five to six
22 years on the job or possibly more. This
23 rotation system is the ideal way to build
24 a team with the addition of newly
25 graduated firefighters. We are reviewing

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 these teams on a case-by-case basis.

3 The rotation is being
4 implemented because it's the right thing
5 to do for the Philadelphia Fire
6 Department as a whole.

7 In closing, I hope this
8 testimony clarifies why we need the
9 rotations. If not, I am happy to take
10 questions or sit down personally with you
11 to discuss your concerns further.

12 Thank you.

13 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you
14 very much for your testimony. I have a
15 few questions, and I'm sure members of
16 the Committee and other members of
17 Council have questions.

18 Can you tell me another major
19 fire department in the country that has
20 mandatory rotation of senior firefighters
21 without their request?

22 COMMISSIONER AYERS: There are
23 some fire departments that rotate. It
24 may not be as large as this. We've
25 looked at other departments, what they

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 do.

3 We're looking at the
4 Philadelphia Fire Department, the City of
5 Philadelphia, what we have in front of
6 us, the rate at which we're reducing
7 fires, and the need for our forces to
8 gain other experiences, along with all of
9 those folks that you don't see and that
10 you don't hear that are looking for
11 rotations. And you know that this is
12 happening because many times we get
13 requests from others that ask can this or
14 that person be rotated because they need
15 to be rotated or because they want to be
16 rotated --

17 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Well --

18 COMMISSIONER AYERS: -- for
19 some personal reason. This is not about
20 personalities or reasons, other than the
21 need of the citizens of the City of
22 Philadelphia as well as the wellbeing of
23 our members, with training and other
24 things.

25 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Can you

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 identify any studies that the Fire
3 Department has conducted --

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I'm sorry,
5 sir. Could you start over.

6 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Could you
7 identify any study that the Fire
8 Department has conducted to kind of
9 validate this rotation plan? Has there
10 been any policy written or study
11 conducted to why this is effective when
12 it's not being done in New York or Los
13 Angeles or San Diego or Phoenix or
14 Chicago or Boston or Houston, Detroit,
15 Baltimore, Pittsburgh? None of these
16 departments do this.

17 (Applause.)

18 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I want to
19 know how we learned that this is the most
20 effective thing for the Philadelphia Fire
21 Department. What did we conduct to
22 determine that?

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: We looked
24 at data here in the Philadelphia Fire
25 Department. We looked at data here in

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 the Philadelphia Fire Department and we
3 looked at the different issues that we've
4 had based on the downturns, based on the
5 ability to train, and then also based on
6 what our future needs would look like.

7 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I mean, I
8 think our fire department is one of the
9 best, if not the best in the country, but
10 I also --

11 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I agree
12 with you.

13 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: But I also
14 look at New York and their pretty
15 impressive operation, and what they do in
16 order to get people the rotation that
17 they need is when you leave the academy,
18 you go to a station and they transfer you
19 after three years. After two rotations
20 in those three years, you go back to the
21 original station you were assigned to,
22 and you can stay there for the rest of
23 your career.

24 So I guess the question is, why
25 do we need older, more senior

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 firefighters moved forcibly to another
3 station when they're not asked to have
4 moved and we have between September 2011
5 and October 2012 270 firefighters have
6 submitted voluntary transfers and you've
7 only transferred 20? So if the people
8 who are asking to be rotated out to
9 another station, you only move 20 out of
10 270 requests, why are now 300 or so being
11 forced to move involuntarily?

12 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
13 that's part of the answer. That's part
14 of the answer, that we need a system in
15 the City of Philadelphia where we rotate
16 our firefighters where their skill sets
17 can be enhanced. One of the things that
18 you have to look at is not the past and
19 not some other city. You need -- I know
20 we benchmark and things like that, but
21 what's needed here in the City of
22 Philadelphia is an opportunity for our
23 firefighters to rotate so that they can
24 develop their skills, as well as go to
25 different areas of the City where they

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 can practice community risk reduction,
3 because the fires just aren't there.

4 We're in the process of
5 enhancing our training. We're looking at
6 upgrading our training facilities for the
7 future, because here in the City of
8 Philadelphia, the future is about zero
9 fire deaths and zero fires, and if
10 firefighters aren't going out on fires,
11 then they need to enhance the training.

12 So we're looking at a future
13 here in the City of Philadelphia where
14 there's less fires and we need to rotate
15 our firefighters so that people who have
16 less opportunity to have these live
17 experiences get in some of these places
18 where we have people who have been there
19 for a long period of time.

20 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Isn't best
21 practices a way in which government is
22 conducted, and best practices would
23 indicate that no other fire department in
24 the country thinks this is a best
25 practice.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well --

3 (Applause.)

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Sometimes
5 best practices are created based on the
6 situation in that location or area, and
7 one of the things that I believe that we
8 are doing here in the City of
9 Philadelphia is creating a best practice.
10 That best practice is utilizing a
11 firefighter's skills not only for some
12 anticipated disaster in the community
13 that -- of course, we want to train them
14 and make sure that they're ready, but
15 also for firefighters to have the
16 opportunity to go out into the community,
17 meet people, understand what their
18 situations are, and to make sure that
19 they do community risk reduction. That's
20 the highest and best use of our
21 firefighter today.

22 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: If I
23 may, Councilman, to follow up on your
24 question. Mike Resnick, the Director of
25 Public Safety.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 I don't know if those other
3 jurisdictions that you've mentioned have
4 the issues that we're facing in the
5 immediate future with the reduction in
6 staff due to retirements and DROP and the
7 increased over 300 new members, as the
8 Commissioner said, within the next year.

9 So this system, this organized
10 rotational system, the strategic
11 rotational system, gives everybody the
12 fair chance to be in those other areas to
13 experience other areas of the City, to
14 experience other types of situations,
15 also to get into the community to bring
16 their experience and their knowledge to
17 the community.

18 So we're doing what we're doing
19 because it's best for the City of
20 Philadelphia under the City of
21 Philadelphia's current circumstances, and
22 as the Commissioner said, this is perhaps
23 where best practice is born.

24 And to answer your question
25 with respect to the transfers, you know,

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 you need to have two people that want to
3 be transferred in order to transfer
4 somebody into that spot. If somebody
5 wants to be transferred into a spot but
6 somebody else in that location doesn't
7 want to go, where are you going to put
8 them? So this is an organized way --

9 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Do people
10 retire?

11 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: This is
12 an organized way to make sure that the
13 transfers --

14 (Audience members talking.)

15 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Please.

16 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: An
17 organized way to make sure that these are
18 done in a systemic approach. In
19 addition, I did remember hearing
20 President Gault probably a couple weeks
21 ago on the news talk about how dangerous
22 this was going to be, because
23 firefighters will be in new locations and
24 they won't know where to go. But then in
25 the same breath, he said that, just like

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 the comment that you made, there are over
3 200-some transfer requests pending, why
4 don't we just approve those. But it's
5 almost the same number. So if we
6 transfer approximately the 200 or plus in
7 his scenario --

8 (Audience members yelling.)

9 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Please, we
10 have to get through this. We have to get
11 through it. We have to get through it.

12 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: If we
13 grant the transfers that Mr. Gault
14 suggested we do, the numbers are
15 approximately the same as the 300 in the
16 rotational system.

17 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: But those
18 folks want to go. Those folks want to
19 transfer.

20 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: But the
21 point is, Mr. Gault said that if we do it
22 the way we're doing it, you'll have
23 people who won't know where they're
24 going, that won't know how to get to the
25 fire because they're new. If we transfer

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 them the way he wants to, they'll still
3 be transferred. Are they going to
4 magically know where they're going now
5 because they transferred? So it makes no
6 sense.

7 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Let me tell
8 you something, I have a GPS in my car,
9 and sometimes I plug in --

10 (Audience members yelling.)

11 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Let me
12 finish.

13 Sometimes I plug in an address
14 and it takes me to a dead end, because in
15 individual neighborhoods, there are train
16 trestles and dead ends and end of streets
17 and cul-de-sacs and things that you don't
18 know where you're going.

19 Now --

20 (Applause.)

21 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: The
22 diversity and the ability to know other
23 parts of the city in New York, for
24 example, is done in the early years of a
25 firefighter's career. They're assigned

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 and they're transferred to another part
3 of the city and transferred to another
4 part of the city and come back to their
5 original station designation. Why do we
6 need to do that with a guy who has been
7 in the department for 25, 28, 30 years?
8 I don't understand why uprooting them
9 from where they've served their entire
10 career is good for firefighting, it's
11 good for morale, it's good for fire
12 prevention.

13 We went through a long process
14 of bringing in Hispanic firefighters back
15 in late 1990s, 2000. We did that because
16 they had the language needed to
17 communicate with people in Hispanic
18 neighborhoods where they served. What's
19 the sense of moving them out? Do we
20 bring in --

21 (Applause.)

22 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I'm going
23 to relinquish the mic, but I want to read
24 something that was Commissioner Ayers'
25 General Memorandum No. 10-77, which

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 described the realignment that he was
3 doing at the time as both a cost-saving
4 measure and a team-building initiative.
5 He said that it fostered team building
6 by, quote, "having stability in all
7 companies, with members consistently
8 working with the same personnel."

9 Now, this seems to be in direct
10 opposition to that particular position
11 back in 2010.

12 COMMISSIONER AYERS: One of the
13 things that we are aware of first is
14 that, and as stated, we're looking at the
15 rotations on a case-by-case basis. Where
16 communities' needs are, we have assessed
17 that. We will continue to assess it, and
18 we'll make sure that those members are
19 where they need to be serving the
20 community. Absolutely. We wouldn't
21 transfer all of the folks that give that
22 service to the community out if there is
23 no one there, if we didn't have anyone to
24 make sure that that happened.

25 Also, one of the things that

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 you talked about was the senior folks,
3 everybody senior being moved. That's not
4 the case. It's not the case in every
5 situation. It is the case in many
6 situations, but under no circumstances is
7 there going to be a company where
8 everybody has been moved. And when we go
9 to a new company, just like in any
10 transfer, just like these firefighters
11 that's coming out of the Academy, they're
12 going to be moving straight into
13 Directive 31, in-service training, where
14 that officer, the officer, he or she has
15 the responsibility to ensure that the
16 training, driver training, community
17 familiarization, all of these things
18 happen. That's no different.

19 No matter where you go,
20 wherever you're transferred, wherever
21 I've been transferred in this city and
22 anyone that you have behind you, you have
23 officers, you have firefighters, you have
24 people who make sure that they bring them
25 into the team. It is a team-building

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 process, and that's what happens.

3 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I will tell
4 you, there's a lot of upsetment on the
5 team --

6 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yeah, I
7 understand that.

8 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: -- in this
9 team-building process.

10 Have you had discussions with
11 anyone outside of 3rd and Spring Garden
12 about this process or about this policy?

13 COMMISSIONER AYERS: We talked
14 with folks about it, but for the main
15 part --

16 (Audience members yelling.)

17 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: This is a
18 paramilitary organization, as you know.

19 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
20 understand that.

21 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: You have to
22 get -- the generals get the buy-in of
23 their troops on things. I know the
24 generals issue an order in the end, but,
25 again, your lower level personnel and

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 your officers hopefully need the buy-in
3 of this too. So there's no general
4 discussion about; it's kind of just a
5 directive and it's done.

6 What was the discussion? What
7 was the process that was undertaken to
8 explain this and why it was important?

9 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well, the
10 reason that it's important --

11 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: No. What
12 was the process to explain why it was
13 important?

14 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
15 we've talked about it in staff meetings.
16 That's outside of -- you might not know
17 that, but that is outside of 3rd and
18 Spring Garden. We've talked to several
19 chiefs. We've talked with firefighters.
20 We've talked with other folks. And,
21 again, you won't hear every voice in the
22 Philadelphia Fire Department that's for
23 this because of some of the situations
24 that you have right now. One of the
25 things that you see is, you see the high

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 resistance to that because it's been a
3 long time since we've had this type of a
4 change, but we have a very --

5 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: We've never
6 had this type of a change.

7 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Excuse me,
8 sir?

9 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Have we
10 ever had this type of a change? You said
11 it's been a long time. I don't think
12 we've ever had it.

13 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It's been
14 a long time. We've had this type of
15 change where we've had some movement for
16 training purposes to get new firefighters
17 into busier companies, and it was a lot
18 of resistance to that.

19 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: When did
20 that happen?

21 COMMISSIONER AYERS: When I
22 came in.

23 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Okay. But
24 there's not been this type of mass
25 rotation?

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 COMMISSIONER AYERS: No, it has
3 not.

4 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Ever in the
5 history of the Department?

6 COMMISSIONER AYERS: No, it has
7 not, but it's been thought about. We
8 have the circumstances and the things
9 that are confronting us where it's a
10 need. And I understand. We understand
11 what change brings. Change brings a lot
12 of angst, a lot of anxiety, a lot of
13 different things. Sometimes folks just
14 need to understand what they have to let
15 go of and what needs to be held on to,
16 the new change. And in that process,
17 you're going to have all of these things
18 that you hear, people saying, oh, how
19 dangerous it's going to be.

20 I will submit to you that our
21 firefighters train hard. They leave the
22 Academy. They train after they leave the
23 Academy. When they go to fires, they do
24 a great job. There's assessments of how
25 individuals are doing, how they did on

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 the job. They sit down at the kitchen
3 table and they talk about how to make it
4 better. You're not talking about a group
5 of men and women that don't know what
6 they're doing, and it sounds as if that
7 we have a group of people who don't know
8 what they're doing. They're
9 professionals. They have been
10 professionals. They go out, they do the
11 job very well. And also what they're
12 learning now, part of the change, that
13 part of it is going into the community
14 and preventing the fire before it
15 happens. That's what our Charter tells
16 us. Our Charter and what we swore to
17 says that what we'll do is we'll examine
18 each and every fire. We'll make sure
19 that the fire marshal goes out, finds out
20 what the origin and the cause is, then
21 take that to the Fire Prevention Division
22 and create programs so that the community
23 can be well aware of what the danger is,
24 and we need to put programs in to change
25 it. Then they go to the Academy and look

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 at whatever the fire was and train the
3 firefighters on how to prepare and be
4 safe the next time they encounter that
5 fire.

6 That's what our Charter tells
7 us to do, and in doing that, at some
8 point in the future, you'll come to a
9 point where you have a society where you
10 don't have fires, and our job is to
11 prevent fires from happening in the first
12 place by Charter.

13 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: How does
14 the forced movement of 300 firefighters
15 help that?

16 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It helps
17 it by understanding that along with this
18 move, there's going to be changes in how
19 we fight fire, community risk reduction
20 programs where firefighters help assess
21 what's going on in the community, what's
22 going on in commercial, business, et
23 cetera.

24 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Doesn't the
25 longer you're there in that community

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 make you more effective in that goal?

3 (Applause.)

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well, I
5 understand exactly what you're saying,
6 but that is a thought that we had. What
7 we're doing is, we're moving forward, and
8 why should not the entire City benefit
9 from the experience of other
10 firefighters? And why shouldn't it be
11 spread out so each and every community
12 has the opportunity for community risk
13 reduction, as well as the best training
14 in the stations that's available?

15 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: And you
16 said how many firefighters are going to
17 be leaving by 2015?

18 COMMISSIONER AYERS: By 2015,
19 around 320 or so.

20 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: So you're
21 going to have 320 openings?

22 COMMISSIONER AYERS: New
23 firefighters.

24 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: No. I'm
25 saying how many are leaving that are in

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 DROP and retiring in the next year or
3 two?

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS: About 150
5 or so.

6 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: So you have
7 150 slots you can put people in just by
8 the natural rotation of things.

9 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I mean, I
10 understand what you're saying.

11 (Applause.)

12 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
13 understand what you're saying, but to do
14 that would just be throwing people into
15 empty slots. It is better to -- excuse
16 me.

17 (Audience members talking.)

18 COMMISSIONER AYERS: What we
19 want to do is analyze what the teams look
20 like today and prepare for the future.
21 That's what we're doing. It's analyzing
22 what we're doing today and preparing for
23 the future. It doesn't smell good
24 sometimes, it doesn't taste good
25 sometimes, but in the beginning, I

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 remember swearing that wherever I needed
3 to go in the community based on the Fire
4 Department's needs, I swore that I would
5 do that and take the task. And I do
6 understand union and all of those
7 things --

8 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: It has
9 nothing to do with the union.

10 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I beg your
11 pardon?

12 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: For me it
13 has nothing to do with the union.

14 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
15 understand.

16 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Honest to
17 God, it really doesn't.

18 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Okay.
19 Well, for me it has nothing to do with
20 union either. I have to get around and
21 make -- excuse me. I have to get around
22 and make sure that the citizens are safe
23 and that the firefighters are safe as
24 they go forward as well, with training
25 and other things.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 We've adapted to situations.

3 We're making certain that we move into
4 the future with an eye on community risk
5 reduction. The citizens is who we work
6 for first, and that's what we work on. I
7 work on the membership. We want them
8 safe. We want to make sure that they get
9 the best training that they can have and
10 enjoy the best possible futures for
11 self-advancement and other things that
12 they can have, and this is what this is
13 all about as well.

14 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: There are
15 various types of firehouses in the City.
16 Some are busy, very busy. Some are
17 moderately busy. Some are kind of slow.
18 And you have a person who has been
19 working 25, 28, 30 years in a moderate or
20 slow house. Are you intending to move
21 those folks into heavy-run stations?
22 Does that not jeopardize potentially
23 their health when you're 55 years old?

24 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It's case
25 by case, and not all --

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 (Applause.)

3 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well, an
4 examination of what the process that we
5 have would show, which I'm prepared to
6 sit down with you if you would like,
7 would show that many of those areas we're
8 not looking at moving those people
9 necessarily from 62's or 58's into Engine
10 2 or whatever the case may be. We're
11 looking at it. You'll find out.

12 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Councilman
13 Henon -- Councilwoman Bass.

14 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Good
15 morning, Commissioner.

16 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Good
17 morning.

18 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: I just
19 wanted to ask just a couple of brief
20 questions and then I'm going to circle
21 back around, because I know everybody has
22 a few things that they'd like to talk
23 about this morning.

24 But could you just go back,
25 because I think process and how we got to

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 this point is really important. So can
3 you talk about how we developed this
4 policy, where it came from, what the
5 thinking was behind it. Was it from
6 consultants? Was it from the Fire
7 Department? Was it from the
8 Administration? Where did we get this
9 plan that we seem to be interested in
10 implementing that makes sense to some but
11 just really, you know, I think a lot of
12 us really can't make heads or tails of
13 it. Can you really give us an idea of
14 the thought process behind it and where
15 it came from.

16 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes. The
17 thought -- it came from Fire Department
18 administration and also research data
19 from different members of the executive
20 staff.

21 We've looked at the openings
22 that were available in the Department.
23 We looked at trends, national trends, and
24 these is from other departments of
25 community risk reduction as well, and we

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 looked at the need for folks to be able
3 to transfer, the fact that we had so many
4 transfers available. We looked at people
5 looking at possibly filing grievances for
6 not being able to be transferred, things
7 like that.

8 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: So you're
9 saying that this all came from within the
10 Fire Department itself? Was there no
11 other outside source contacted or
12 consulted or any additional input that
13 was sought in developing this policy?

14 COMMISSIONER AYERS: We looked
15 at some things that were in the Berkshire
16 report. That triggered some things that
17 we looked at. Some we agreed with; some
18 we didn't.

19 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Can you
20 give us some specifics, what kind of
21 things you looked at in terms of
22 developing this -- you know, how did we
23 really get here.

24 COMMISSIONER AYERS: We got
25 here through a process of looking at all

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 of the data that's in front of us, the
3 constraints that we have, the attrition
4 of the members that were going out,
5 losing so many senior members. All of
6 those things we took into account.

7 And to actually go through the
8 process, I heard it said that this
9 happened overnight. It didn't happen
10 overnight. We've been thinking about
11 this for a long time. We've had the
12 union at the table as well with us
13 talking about what we were going to do.
14 We've talked about it in different staff
15 meetings, and we stopped and we looked at
16 how this would best serve the citizens of
17 Philadelphia, looking at their needs as
18 well, and we came up with this process
19 that in every five years, approximately
20 every five years, to have a rotation of
21 the firefighters where they would have
22 the opportunity to work in different
23 sections of the City, whether it's North
24 Philadelphia, West Philadelphia, Center
25 City area, Port Richmond area, things

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 like that, so that they could have the
3 best opportunity to not only see these
4 areas, learn these communities, meet
5 these people, and become familiar in that
6 sense so that as many of them make
7 choices that they want to advance,
8 they'll look at these things. They'll
9 take that shared and varied experience to
10 use in their studies as they move up for
11 lieutenant, for captain, for battalion
12 chief, and when you stop at the
13 lieutenant's level, you have just one
14 station as you would have at the
15 firefighter level, just one station. So
16 you would become familiar with that one
17 community. Now, if you move to another
18 area, you become familiar with that area,
19 but as a captain, you start to become
20 familiar with the entire area, and you
21 have training opportunities for those
22 officers, those lieutenants, those
23 firefighters that move through to talk
24 about that community. Then when you stop
25 and you look at moving up to the chief's

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 level, the chief has a larger view of a
3 larger geographic area.

4 So when you start to build on
5 these types of opportunities for the
6 entire City of Philadelphia, you start --
7 in the future, you have a better rounded
8 firefighter and teams. In the future,
9 you're not going to see hundreds of fire
10 deaths like we had decades ago. It's
11 suddenly going down, along with the
12 fires, and that firefighter of the
13 future, we, you, we all have to look at
14 and say what does that firefighter look
15 like. We should look like a person or
16 persons, men and women, who are doing
17 community risk reduction, or as the
18 future goes forward, it will be something
19 else.

20 But we can't keep looking at a
21 long crawl down a hallway to put a fire
22 out in a back room or to rescue folks and
23 say that that's going to be the whole
24 future. We have to have those skill
25 sets, but you have to have a better skill

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 set now.

3 If we're not stopping the fire
4 before it starts, then we're not doing
5 what we have to do.

6 All of that was taken into
7 account as we looked at a rotation system
8 that's going to build a better
9 firefighter and a better Fire Department
10 for the future. So those are the things
11 that we looked at.

12 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: I hear what
13 you're saying. I think we do great
14 things in the City. I think this is the
15 best city ever. I love it here. I'm
16 born and raised in Philadelphia. But at
17 the same time, I recognize that we don't
18 have all the answers here in the City,
19 and that no matter what we do, it's my
20 personal opinion, is that we should look
21 elsewhere to see who is doing what,
22 what's working, what other cities are
23 implementing, what kind of programs and
24 procedures they have, and how can we use
25 what works in other cities and, of

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 course, discard what doesn't work and
3 find ways to make our city even better.
4 I believe we can be even better.

5 But to do such a -- I guess put
6 into place such a critical policy that
7 would have an effect on all of
8 Philadelphia, all Philadelphians would be
9 affected by this policy, and to not
10 seemingly take into account what other
11 cities may have done in the past or may
12 be currently doing in terms of their
13 transfer policy, I just think that maybe
14 you'll -- I hope that you would maybe
15 take a second look at that and consider
16 what some of the other cities that are
17 similar to Philadelphia, what they have
18 done. And there's a list that we've been
19 provided with that discusses transfer
20 policy, which is obviously very much
21 different than the policy that you're
22 proposing.

23 So I would just suggest that
24 maybe if there was a way to look at what
25 other cities are doing, it makes sense

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 for us to be able to do that. I
3 understand that you feel responsible.
4 You certainly are responsible as the
5 Commissioner for what happens in fire
6 safety here in the City of Philadelphia.
7 I think as a district member of Council,
8 we all as district members feel
9 responsible for what happens in our
10 district and fire safety and crime and
11 criminal activity. And so we want to do
12 what's best, and so if having someone in
13 a fire station who knows the neighbors,
14 who knows the neighborhoods, who has a
15 comfort factor with that particular
16 neighborhood is going to make them more
17 effective and, therefore, make citizens
18 safer, I just think it's something that
19 we need to take into account. So I just
20 want to say that.

21 Thank you.

22 (Applause.)

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I'd like
24 to say thank you, Councilwoman Bass, and
25 I assure you that all of those things are

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 things that we are looking at. And I
3 have to at the same time let you know
4 that many times people are looking at the
5 City of Philadelphia and the things that
6 we are doing as well.

7 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: You're
8 welcome.

9 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Councilman
10 Henon.

11 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you,
12 Mr. Chair.

13 I just want to point out a
14 couple things that has just been stated
15 in either your testimony or in some of
16 the questions.

17 You just stated that you're
18 using best practices to implement this
19 kind of transfer policy; is that correct?

20 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I meant --

21 COUNCILMAN HENON: Best
22 practices throughout the country?

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I beg your
24 pardon, sir?

25 COUNCILMAN HENON: Best

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 practices throughout the United States
3 with other departments?

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS: When we
5 start talking about best practices, it
6 depends on what we're looking at.
7 Sometimes it's not just about best
8 practices, but looking at what's
9 happening and being innovative as well.
10 And sometimes best practices and
11 benchmarking is the one that you're
12 sitting on, and that happens at times.
13 And that's what we're interested in.

14 When we stopped and we looked
15 at the things that we're doing, when we
16 had some sessions about our future vision
17 for the Fire Department, for the City of
18 Philadelphia, it all was not about
19 looking at deaths and necessarily looking
20 at how people are transferring and how
21 important that is.

22 COUNCILMAN HENON:
23 Commissioner, if I may. I'm sorry to
24 interrupt you, but the question is, this
25 transfer policy, is it being used -- I

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 just want to hear it one more time. Is
3 it being used as best practices in any
4 other fire departments throughout the
5 United States? Because I have a list up
6 here of over 15 in which it's not.

7 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It is the
8 best practices in our circumstances in
9 our city. Whether it's good for New
10 York, and they have many boroughs, or Los
11 Angeles with their geographic layout and
12 the way that they do it, I'm not certain,
13 and I'm sure that they didn't draw from
14 the same set of circumstances, the same
15 set of information and data, so --

16 COUNCILMAN HENON: Do you have
17 a study to show that it would be best
18 practice for this huge in-surge transfers
19 of new cadets and transferring
20 experienced members of the Fire
21 Department that protect our
22 neighborhoods? Is there a study?

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well, in
24 stopping and looking at 38 years since
25 I've been here --

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 COUNCILMAN HENON: So the
3 answer is no; is that correct?

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS: No, the
5 answer is not no. I'm getting ready to
6 give you my answer. I didn't say that.
7 I'm telling you that the best practice is
8 what we're looking at based on the data,
9 based on what Philadelphia is, its
10 community, its tapestry of different
11 areas, and the opportunity that we have
12 to make this city more safe, the changing
13 department, not only the way the
14 department -- the changing department and
15 the things that we need to do to go
16 forward.

17 When I came in 38 years ago,
18 there were many senior members, folks who
19 had long times in one or more stations,
20 displaced. They were displaced. They
21 were sent to other locations. And there
22 was an uproar. It was an uproar, but
23 these stations took these young
24 firefighters and they turned them around.
25 They trained them and they -- it turned

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 out positive, very positive. That's what
3 happened. But there was an uproar. For
4 two weeks or more I couldn't even go into
5 the kitchen, because I had displaced some
6 person.

7 So there was a lot of angst
8 with the change, but eventually they did
9 what they had to do. The team went into
10 what teams do. They formed. I was new.
11 They went through all of the process of
12 storming and training. They started to
13 normalize and understand who they were as
14 a team, what their responsibilities were,
15 following directives, operational
16 procedures, learning their job and being
17 professional, and then they started to
18 perform the way they do, as good
19 firefighting teams in the City of
20 Philadelphia. And we should not expect
21 anything less from any of our
22 firefighters.

23 To think that a firefighter
24 and -- first, to think that we're going
25 to move everybody out of every station

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 and there's going to be this big void of
3 knowledge in a fire station is just not
4 true. That's not true. It's not going
5 to happen. Fifteen to 20 percent. But
6 there'll be firefighters with knowledge
7 of the area. There'll be an officer.
8 Should we not remember that there's an
9 officer that has responsibility taking
10 care of this.

11 This practice that's getting
12 ready to start, this rotation, is good
13 for the future of the City of
14 Philadelphia and it's good for our
15 firefighters and their members.

16 COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay. I
17 have several questions here, Commissioner
18 and Mr. Resnick. So you had stated as
19 well that you consulted with not only the
20 union leadership but your own chief
21 officers with this new transfer policy;
22 is that correct?

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes. We
24 talked with several officers.

25 COUNCILMAN HENON: They were

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 part of the process. And has your own
3 chief officers and the union officials
4 and members agreed to this policy?

5 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well --

6 COUNCILMAN HENON: Their input.

7 COMMISSIONER AYERS: We
8 absolutely don't have agreement on this.

9 COUNCILMAN HENON: What was
10 their input?

11 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Their
12 input was some concerns that we're
13 talking about right now. Their input was
14 concerns and maybe even less --
15 stretching out the time period. Maybe
16 not five, maybe a little more time.

17 But not everybody disagreed
18 that this is a way to move forward in the
19 future. Some of it was when, how, some
20 of the process stuff. Not that this is
21 not good for the future of the City.
22 Questions about how it works, that type
23 of thing.

24 COUNCILMAN HENON: Do you think
25 that having such a mass transfer policy

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 initiated at once is putting the City
3 in -- do you think -- what would be the
4 negative effects of such a huge transfer
5 at one time? Me as a citizen, not just
6 as an elected official who represents
7 159,000 people, but a citizen myself in
8 the City of Philadelphia, I think there
9 are a lot of questions that I have, one
10 with the brown-outs and the closing,
11 which we say brown-outs, but they're
12 actually closing of the stations. The
13 lack of, as you already indicated, the
14 lack of filled vacancies is over 300; is
15 that correct? Filled vacancies?

16 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I'm not
17 certain of the exact number now. That is
18 the number of people that we will be
19 slotting over the next year.

20 COUNCILMAN HENON: Do you know
21 how many vacancies are available at this
22 present time?

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I'm not
24 certain. I'm certain that it's over --
25 around 200, maybe 160 or 170, maybe more.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 COUNCILMAN HENON: Are there
3 some firehouses that are overstaffed and
4 some other houses that are severely
5 understaffed?

6 COMMISSIONER AYERS: That's
7 what vacancies are. We have vacancies in
8 different fire stations.

9 But the other thing is, you
10 made a statement and said that this is a
11 mass transfer. It is not a mass
12 transfer. It's about 15 to 20 percent of
13 the department.

14 COUNCILMAN HENON: It's a
15 mass -- in your own words, you said it's
16 providing an opportunity. I think it's a
17 mass mandate on --

18 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I beg your
19 pardon?

20 COUNCILMAN HENON: In your own
21 words, you a little while ago said that
22 it's an opportunity for transfers. In my
23 own words, I'm saying it's a mass mandate
24 for people to go somewhere that is, I
25 think, a detriment to the morale of the

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 firehouses and I think and I believe
3 that -- I have some serious concerns
4 about the inexperience of a house maybe
5 left with -- you know, I understand that
6 there's a lot of younger men being
7 promoted to lieutenants and rank. So you
8 have -- and this is my concern, and I've
9 spoken to a lot of firefighters, as you
10 well know. I go to church fundraisers
11 and I'm walking down the street and into
12 Wawa and I get cornered by ten of my
13 friends personally, and one of the senior
14 men said, who is an officer, had said,
15 Look -- you do three-year transfers for
16 supervisors; is that correct?

17 COMMISSIONER AYERS: That's
18 correct.

19 COUNCILMAN HENON: Every three
20 years. So you're transferring
21 supervisors every three years and then
22 you're going to be transferring
23 experienced men who have been there for
24 over ten years, who knows the terrain,
25 the traffic patterns, understands that if

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 they don't have that experience, response
3 times could be greater. And he had said
4 to me, At any new station that you
5 rotate, look for the senior men and women
6 for help and advice and guidance. Do you
7 believe that to be true?

8 (Applause.)

9 COUNCILMAN HENON: Would you
10 rely on that advice?

11 COMMISSIONER AYERS: We see
12 that in many instances, not every
13 instance.

14 COUNCILMAN HENON: That's not
15 good sound advice?

16 COMMISSIONER AYERS: No; it is
17 good sound advice if they can -- if
18 that's the situation in the station. We
19 have a lot of young folks --

20 COUNCILMAN HENON:
21 Commissioner, the reality is is when you
22 get a call and somebody says, Hey,
23 remember that 100 block of -- or that
24 3500 block of Shelmire Street. I'm just
25 using an example. It's only a 100, just

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 one block long. And just say, Hey, be
3 careful out there, guys. You know,
4 there's only one block and the fire
5 hydrant is in the middle of the block.

6 So that's the experience that
7 these men provide to the supervisors and
8 to the young men who are just coming in
9 as cadets. You well know that because
10 you came through it.

11 (Applause.)

12 COUNCILMAN HENON: Do you think
13 that kind of experience is in jeopardy
14 here with these mass transfers all at
15 once?

16 COMMISSIONER AYERS: No,
17 because we're not pulling everybody out
18 of every station. You keep saying that.

19 COUNCILMAN HENON: I do because
20 we had 270 applications for transfers and
21 only 20 of them were honored, and it's
22 been acknowledged on the record here
23 today. So why wouldn't this mandate
24 transfer policy take place that you're
25 talking about?

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 COMMISSIONER AYERS: We have a
3 policy that's in place that's going to
4 give these men and women that have to be
5 moved an opportunity for five choices
6 where they can go. We're going to have
7 other folks who are or firefighters who
8 are in that station that have five and
9 six years, some more of experience.
10 That's nothing. Some people would say
11 that.

12 What we have is, we have a
13 change in the way that the fire service
14 is going to operate in the future. Here
15 in the City of Philadelphia, it's
16 different. It's changing, and we are
17 changing. We're changing forward.

18 COUNCILMAN HENON: Do you think
19 morale, both you guys, do you think,
20 Mr. Resnick and Commissioner, do you
21 think morale is important to a firehouse
22 and home in the department?

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Of course
24 we think that. We know that morale is
25 important.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay. So
3 you have -- and you're fully aware of
4 this -- you have contract negotiations
5 coming up in a few weeks and you have a
6 history of transfers not being honored.
7 You have a history of paramedics being --
8 transfer policies that's already put in
9 place. You have a history of a contract
10 that has been appealed, binding
11 arbitration has been appealed and
12 appealed. And with this policy, this --
13 not saying that there shouldn't be a
14 transfer policy. I mean, that's what you
15 got to do. I think at one time here and
16 the way it's happening is, there's a lot
17 of unanswered questions and questions for
18 public safety and for the right reasons.

19 Do you think that with all
20 those combined, this is just another shot
21 in the arm into the morale of the men and
22 women who protect our city, and shouldn't
23 this -- did you ever consider talking
24 about this in negotiations?

25 (Standing ovation.)

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 COUNCILMAN HENON: I'm just
3 questioning the timing of this as well.

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS: The answer
5 to that last is no. The other part is
6 that this is a great opportunity -- and I
7 understand the morale issues and those
8 things that you talked about. We
9 understand what's happening in the media
10 right now and all of the angst about the
11 change. We've seen it before. We
12 understand what that is.

13 I think that morale is a good
14 thing, and morale starts at the company
15 level as well. The morale starts with my
16 office. They meet in the middle
17 somewhere, where you have to make sure
18 the people understand the reason for
19 change and not just try to scare the
20 people of Philadelphia to death, because
21 that's what's been happening as far as
22 when you start talking about
23 negotiations, you're talking about the
24 union. The union has tried to scare the
25 City of Philadelphia, our residents, into

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 thinking that they're less safe.

3 (Audience members booing.)

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS: They have
5 also --

6 (Audience member yelling, "Get
7 your facts straight.")

8 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well, I
9 have the facts. Here's the facts right
10 here. This is what we do. Skull and
11 crossbones in the doors. Our
12 firefighters on duty, what they do is,
13 they knock on doors and put fire
14 prevention literature, not skull and
15 crossbones trying to scare our people.
16 They educate our people, and that's what
17 it's about, knocking on the doors, making
18 sure that they take care of folks.
19 That's the positive side of it. And they
20 do it, and it is morale building.

21 I have the new cadets -- excuse
22 me. Newer cadets as well as many of the
23 firefighters that are out there doing
24 that now, and it's a new aspect of the
25 job, and they enjoy it. They say that it

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 allowed them to meet the people behind
3 the door, allowed them to talk to folks
4 and to do something for someone. But
5 when you stop and you think about scaring
6 people, telling people that the
7 brown-outs are going to cause deaths,
8 telling people that --

9 (Audience members yelling.)

10 COMMISSIONER AYERS: But that's
11 not all about firefighters that do that.
12 They understand that going out and
13 engaging the community is the right way.
14 It's about community risk reduction. And
15 I understand the other issues that you
16 mentioned, but right now I'm talking
17 about what's best for the City of
18 Philadelphia going forward in the future.

19 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I just want
20 to say one thing relative to the skull
21 and crossbones and all the other stuff.

22 (Audience member yelling "How
23 about brown-outs in your neighborhood.")

24 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Hold on.

25 Hold on.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 In all fairness --

3 (Applause.)

4 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: In all
5 fairness -- and this is not necessarily
6 directed at you, but I will tell you that
7 some of the things that people do in
8 frustration is when over a five-year
9 period, they were treated totally
10 disrespectfully in every aspect of the
11 employer-employee situation.

12 (Standing ovation.)

13 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: And I'm not
14 saying that's your decision. I respect
15 you for that. I'm not saying that's your
16 decision, but when you have what we have
17 in the state, is binding arbitration for
18 uniformed employees who cannot strike and
19 it's appealed and appealed and appealed
20 and appealed and it's going to probably
21 be appealed again --

22 (Applause.)

23 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: -- do you
24 expect people to want to come to work in
25 a cheerful manner when they're treated so

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 disrespectfully by their employer? We
3 don't have this problem in the Police
4 Department. Why is that, Deputy
5 Commissioner?

6 (Standing ovation.)

7 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: That's not
8 a question for you. That's a question
9 for Deputy Commissioner Resnick. We let
10 our Police Department, police officers,
11 move out of the City. We allowed that to
12 happen. That was negotiated. I'm just
13 telling you --

14 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: You know
15 we have to have a contract.

16 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Did you
17 oppose it? Did you appeal that?

18 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: We have
19 to have a contract --

20 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Did you
21 appeal that?

22 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: -- that
23 is affordable for the City.

24 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Did you
25 appeal the ability for a police officer

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 to move out of the City?

3 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: You know
4 we didn't.

5 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I know you
6 didn't. So why do you continue to appeal
7 this stuff?

8 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: As I
9 said, we have to have a contract that the
10 City can afford.

11 (Applause.)

12 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: You get
13 respect when you give respect. You get
14 cooperation when you give cooperation.
15 And this has been nothing but a tooth
16 pull the entire five years with this
17 department. It's disgraceful.

18 (Standing ovation.)

19 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Councilman
20 Squilla.

21 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.

22 I have a couple of questions.
23 The first one was just when we talked
24 about the transfers of requests and why
25 they may or may not be honored, I know,

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 Mr. Resnick, you said because there's not
3 enough places for these people to go,
4 but, Commissioner Ayers, why would these
5 transfers not be honored?

6 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Why would
7 the transfers not -- some of the
8 transfers are honored.

9 (Audience members yelling
10 "20.")

11 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Okay.

12 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Not every
13 location and not every transfer that a
14 person puts in has an available slot. We
15 get that a lot, and that's been the
16 history of the transfers here in the City
17 of Philadelphia.

18 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: As the
19 requests went in and there are available
20 slots, are there any cases where that
21 request would still not be honored?

22 (Audience members yelling
23 "Yes.")

24 COMMISSIONER AYERS: For the
25 most part, we honor every available

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 request that we can honor where there's a
3 spot.

4 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Okay.

5 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Sometimes
6 there's also been a look at where we
7 would have extra slots. In the past
8 there were more slots in a station
9 where -- than was able to be filled or
10 that could be filled. Like at an engine
11 company, an officer and three, we have an
12 officer and four assigned. Ladder
13 company, an officer and four, we have an
14 officer and five assigned, things like
15 that. Some things that we have to do at
16 a managerial level to make sure that the
17 platoons are balanced, to make sure that
18 we have available personnel, things like
19 that.

20 Also, there are slots where we
21 have -- say, for instance, we have over
22 70-some people that's off long-term
23 injured. We have 60-some people that's
24 long-term sick, and we don't necessarily
25 right away fill those slots. So there

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 may be a slot there, but it may not be
3 filled. And that's officers. One
4 instance, a chief officer. And when you
5 stop and you look at the number, it's
6 like four or five companies like that.
7 So we have to be mindful that those
8 people are still in the job. They're
9 still being paid. They're just not in
10 that slot right now, and it's maybe about
11 five or six companies worth of people
12 that's off sick or off injured. So we
13 have to hold those spots.

14 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: I was
15 talking about actually open spots,
16 because there's plenty. I know you have
17 stated I guess there's 150 people
18 retiring next year and from 80 to 100
19 spots that are already open.

20 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.

21 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So there's
22 a lot of spots that are available without
23 sick people and without people that are
24 hurt already.

25 COMMISSIONER AYERS: And we

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 have a lot of --

3 (Applause.)

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS: And we
5 have a lot of spots that need to be
6 available when we have the graduation of
7 our cadets. That's going to be in
8 January. And this is all part of what
9 we're doing now, putting these -- making
10 this transfer, making these rotations
11 something that's going to be a fit for
12 the City going forward, as well as what's
13 best for our membership.

14 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All right.
15 In the statement that you made, you said
16 it's my responsibility to ensure the
17 department is as well trained and
18 prepared as it possibly can be. Under no
19 circumstances will you have a unit that
20 is represented by all new firefighters or
21 all new personnel.

22 What training is being provided
23 now after the initial class that's come
24 in there by the department?

25 COMMISSIONER AYERS: After the

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 initial -- excuse me. Your question is
3 for these cadets?

4 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: No; after
5 the cadets are now put into their
6 firehouses.

7 COMMISSIONER AYERS: After the
8 cadets go to the firehouse, they're
9 firefighters. We have a directive. It's
10 called in-service training. It's called
11 in-service training, and what it does is,
12 it clearly outlines the responsibility of
13 the firefighter, the responsibility of
14 the officer, the lieutenant or the
15 captain, the responsibility of the chief
16 officer, as well as the deputy, and the
17 Fire Academy in ensuring that this new
18 cadet has the proper training, not only
19 the studies of the operational
20 procedures, the directives that they have
21 to know, but also any key element that's
22 particular to that fire safety and
23 education district that they're going to
24 be assigned to. And that fire safety and
25 education district officer, whether

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 lieutenant, captain, he or she has to
3 ensure that this process takes progress
4 and advances to getting this new cadet to
5 their six-month test as well as their
6 year test, and part of that is knowing
7 the local area and being able to maneuver
8 in the local area, drive in the local
9 area, all of those things.

10 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And who
11 trains -- the actual firefighters that
12 are in those stations actually help train
13 them, correct?

14 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes, they
15 do help train, but it's not the
16 firefighters' responsibility. It is the
17 officer's responsibility to ensure that
18 it gets done.

19 (Audience members talking.)

20 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Do you
21 think the training companies worked?

22 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I beg your
23 pardon?

24 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Do you
25 think that training companies worked when

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 you were training the officers through a
3 process that I guess done earlier where
4 the new officers actually come in and be
5 trained by actually training companies to
6 perform their duties?

7 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Training
8 companies? Could you restate that,
9 please.

10 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Yes. When
11 a new firefighter comes into the new
12 station that they're in, they are then
13 worked on, you said, by the -- I guess
14 the officer of the station, but don't the
15 actual key senior operators in that
16 station really teach the new firefighters
17 what they need to do to fight a fire?

18 (Applause.)

19 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes. It's
20 a part of that whole team congruity that
21 we talked about, but the responsibility
22 to ensure that it happens is on the
23 officer. Those firefighters that these
24 new recruits are going to be around,
25 these are firefighters that have five,

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 six and more years of experience, some up
3 to just below ten years of experience, a
4 decade of experience. So what has to
5 happen is, that officer, it's his or her
6 responsibility to ensure that Directive
7 31 happens. They take them out. They go
8 through the community. They go on the
9 hydrant checks. They go on block checks.
10 They go on driver training. They go and
11 install smoke alarms. They go out and
12 they talk with schools. They monitor
13 school activities where children evacuate
14 the schools. They go out and they talk
15 to people who call in and say, Could you
16 come to my block party. They go
17 throughout the entire fire safety and
18 education district, because that's their
19 job, and that's a part of that whole
20 process. It's something that happens.
21 It's not some void or some vacuum. This
22 is dynamic, it's ongoing, it's moving,
23 and it's active. It's active. It's not
24 something that's not happening.

25 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: But the

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 senior officers are very important in
3 this process.

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Senior
5 officers are important in any process.

6 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And senior
7 firefighters too.

8 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Senior
9 firefighters are important in any
10 process. They're going to be there, and
11 if we -- one of the things that you have
12 to understand is, this is a dynamic
13 process. This is not just some process
14 where you have to have some senior guy
15 that's going to make sure that everything
16 happens. We don't pay the senior person.
17 That's part of team congruity and
18 something that's been age old in the fire
19 service, 139 years old even.

20 So what I'm saying is, to make
21 sure that you have firefighters assigned
22 in areas and they do what they're
23 supposed to do, their directives, their
24 operational procedures, their training,
25 that should be happening. It shouldn't

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 be a situation where you have -- if
3 somebody is stagnating, an officer is not
4 doing their job, that's a different
5 story. That's a much different story,
6 and we take care of those things when we
7 have to. But for the most part, the
8 officers are out there doing their duty,
9 doing their job, making sure people get
10 trained, and that's why you've seen fires
11 going down, you've seen accidents going
12 down, you've seen firefighter injuries
13 going down. All of those things are a
14 part of an ongoing process.

15 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So this
16 transfer policy that came up you said was
17 made in executive staff. Who was part of
18 the decision-making process beside you
19 and, I guess, Mr. Resnick? Who else was
20 involved in that?

21 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I rely on
22 our executive team.

23 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Who is
24 that?

25 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Myself,

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 Deputy Commissioner Hargett, Deputy
3 Commissioner Devlin, Deputy Commissioner
4 Beatrice. We have my executive chief,
5 Chief Davidson, Richard Davidson; my
6 executive chief of safety, Deputy --
7 excuse me; Executive Chief Henry Costo.
8 He's over safety. And we look at the
9 data. Also, we'll bring in other chiefs.
10 My chief officer of Fire Communication
11 Center, he's the chief dispatcher, Mike
12 Moore. And we tap other areas where we
13 need to bring in data, especially EMS
14 data, things like that, and make sure
15 that we comb through this data. We look
16 at it. We look at things that need to be
17 changed and we make those decisions.

18 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: When you
19 have -- obviously the Fire Department
20 works as a team, and when you have a
21 team, there's practice, and practice
22 makes the team better, and the more teams
23 that are together longer practice better
24 and become a better team. And what we
25 seem to be doing is, as the longer they

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 practice together and become a really
3 good team, coherent team that really
4 knows each other's moves, if you're going
5 to go to the basket and you know a guy is
6 going to go a certain direction, you know
7 how to give him the ball.

8 When you're a firefighter and
9 you know how a guy is going to react to a
10 certain situation, doesn't that make you
11 a stronger team when you're going in to
12 fight a fire? They say, All right, we're
13 going to take the liter out.

14 (Applause.)

15 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Our
16 firefighters do a good job. The teams
17 come together. They go through the
18 process of forming and bonding. They do
19 the things that we've done for ages, and
20 they go in and they do a good job in the
21 communities they have to go into.

22 Things are changing. We are
23 having less and less fires. We are going
24 to have less fires. Technology says
25 we're going to have less fires. There's

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 codes that say we're going to have less
3 fires, and education that we've been
4 doing that say we're going to have less
5 fires.

6 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: It doesn't
7 matter how many less fires we have. It's
8 the one fire, if it's your daughter, your
9 family, your friend that's in that fire,
10 we don't have to be prepared because
11 we're going to have less fires.

12 (Applause.)

13 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: We need to
14 be prepared for that one fire. And just
15 because we may have less, that one fire
16 is going to be a big disaster to some
17 family here in the City of Philadelphia,
18 and that's what we're here to protect.

19 (Applause.)

20 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Sir, I
21 submit to you, that's even more the
22 reason to ensure that we are able to
23 share some of those experiences, some of
24 those age-old whatever you're describing,
25 to be able to make sure that we have the

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 experience of our firefighters spread
3 across the City, moving around, sharing
4 and building other teams. If that's -- I
5 wish that that was the paramount of what
6 goes into building a team and what our
7 firefighters are in these different
8 firehouses.

9 I submit to you, and I'm going
10 to tell you, that these firefighters with
11 five, six, eight years experience, they
12 are not who you think they are. They are
13 people who are well trained and who put
14 their lives on the line doing the right
15 thing, following operational procedures,
16 going in, fighting fires, putting them
17 out, and doing that every day around this
18 city.

19 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Nobody is
20 arguing that point. Nobody is arguing
21 about our firefighters and what they're
22 able to do. We just want the best
23 possible firefighters in the best
24 possible situation to handle, take care
25 of our residents here in the City of

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 Philadelphia. And if we have a
3 team-building process which starts with
4 morale, starts with practice, and if we
5 lose that, if we lose the morale, start
6 splitting up our teams, what happens
7 is -- what happens to the guy who is
8 leading that? What happens to the coach?
9 The coach gets fired, right? Because we
10 got to get a new coach, because he's not
11 doing his job.

12 (Applause.)

13 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So what we
14 need to do is, we need to take all these
15 things into consideration, because at the
16 end of the day, safety, like you said and
17 you stated all through your statement
18 here, is the main important process here,
19 and we know that the best way to have
20 safety is to have a good working,
21 cohesive group of people who have good
22 morale, understand what they need to have
23 done. And I just feel that this transfer
24 policy that's now being put in place is
25 being put in place to break that down,

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 and it seems to be that's the way that's
3 done --

4 (Applause.)

5 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: The belief
6 of also the citizens of the City of
7 Philadelphia.

8 If that's not the case, explain
9 to me, just explain to me how the
10 transfer by just -- instead of saying
11 that they're going to be trained better
12 because there's the two-story house in
13 South Philadelphia is different from the
14 two-story house down in Roxborough and
15 different from the two-story house
16 somewhere else. So if they fight a fire
17 in Roxborough, they'd be better qualified
18 after five years to come to South Philly
19 to fight because they can learn about the
20 houses in South Philly.

21 But besides saying that moving
22 them around makes them more educated or
23 well-rounded, how does that benefit our
24 whole community as a firefighting
25 community and as the safety for the City

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 residents?

3 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Two
4 things. First of all, to believe that
5 the senior person is in charge of the
6 fire ground is -- you shouldn't believe
7 that. If somebody told you that, it's
8 not so. The officer in charge of that
9 company is the person that is sworn, paid
10 for, and who runs that company, not only
11 on the fire ground but in the station,
12 and if they don't do a good job,
13 absolutely, that's what would happen to
14 them.

15 But the other piece to this is
16 this: What I'm explaining to you is that
17 that shared experience in an environment
18 of less and no fires is what we're
19 entering into and what we have to change
20 into, and what that environment is going
21 to be, which is going to make the
22 citizens safer and make the firefighters
23 safer, is the constant reduction of fires
24 and hazards and risks in the community.
25 That's going to happen. So in doing

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 that, one of the things that we have to
3 do is ensure that all of our firefighters
4 have an opportunity to have a
5 full-rounded knowledge of what the City
6 is about, what the different cultures
7 are, what the communities are, all of
8 those things, and that's going to make us
9 stronger. It's going to make us
10 stronger.

11 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So right
12 now we have firefighters that have put in
13 for transfers that no open spots or maybe
14 you feel like they can't be moved for
15 whatever reasons. There also is, I
16 guess -- do you approve what they call, I
17 guess, swaps where people want to go from
18 one station and swap with another
19 station? Is that something that you
20 would do?

21 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Right now
22 our goal is to move forward and to set
23 up --

24 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: That
25 wasn't my question.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Our goal
3 is to move forward and to set up a
4 situation where we have, as we looked at,
5 firefighters with more than a decade of
6 service in the firehouse into another
7 area. We're giving them five choices
8 where they can select and make a choice
9 of where they want to go. We're giving
10 them five choices to select an area. And
11 we're looking at any particular hardships
12 that we need to handle as well as on a
13 case-to-case basis, and that's what we're
14 doing.

15 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Okay. I
16 guess we have to take that for what it's
17 worth, but my --

18 (Applause.)

19 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: My last
20 question, it just seems -- it's
21 frustrating to me, so I can imagine what
22 it is to the firefighters that are out
23 there. When we see that there's a bunch
24 of people that want to be transferred,
25 people may want to swap stations and do

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 things and maneuver people around and get
3 them well trained and the answer is that
4 we're not going to do it that way, we're
5 going to do it our way and it doesn't
6 matter what anybody else thinks, it makes
7 it very difficult for us --

8 (Applause.)

9 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: But,
10 again, Councilman, we keep going back to
11 that, and if the fundamental argument
12 against this is that the City will be an
13 unsafe place because there will be a
14 whole host of new people in unfamiliar
15 areas, if we do the transfers as you
16 suggest, we'll have a whole host of new
17 people in unfamiliar areas. So if the
18 argument against this is for safety, why
19 would we transfer that many firefighters,
20 because you will get the same end result.
21 The Commissioner has described this as a
22 systemic rotation process, not an ad hoc
23 transfer process.

24 And to pick up on your analogy
25 of team building, teams make trades all

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 the time to become better and stronger
3 teams. Why would we think that the
4 senior members who have the experience
5 are somehow going to go to a new place
6 and they're not going to get along and
7 morale in the new place is going to be
8 bad and they won't be the leaders that
9 they are in their old place?

10 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: I'm not
11 saying that. Some teams do make trades
12 and some people want to get traded, and
13 in this case, we have enough people that
14 want to do that, and if they already want
15 to do that and it affects morale in a
16 positive way, I would think, as the
17 Administration, we would want to work
18 toward that process instead of doing what
19 we're doing and forcing it.

20 (Applause.)

21 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So I agree
22 totally with you. I agree 100 percent
23 with you, and I think we should look at
24 that avenue and do it that way, and that
25 would make more sense, and I think we

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 wouldn't even need to have these hearings
3 if you do what you said.

4 (Applause.)

5 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: My
6 comment was just addressing the
7 underlying logic of the fact that if
8 we're going to be unsafe doing this,
9 where it's approximately the same number
10 of individuals, then the logic holds we
11 would be unsafe if we did the same number
12 of transfers and came up with --

13 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Those
14 people want to go. Those people want to
15 be transferred. Those people want to be
16 transferred.

17 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK:
18 Regardless of whether they want to be,
19 Councilman, they're still going to be new
20 in the area. That's my point, the
21 underlying argument.

22 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: But can't
23 you accomplish the same --

24 (Audience members yelling.)

25 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: You can't

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 accomplish the same thing you're trying
3 to accomplish by having people
4 voluntarily go transfer?

5 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: That's
6 not my point, Councilman.

7 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: That's my
8 point. My point is, you have 270 people
9 who want to transfer. You're going to
10 force people who don't want to transfer
11 to transfer to accomplish the same goal
12 you can accomplish with the 270.

13 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: But the
14 underlying argument is not to do what
15 we're planning on doing because it will
16 be unsafe. You're still talking about
17 the same number approximately of people
18 who will be moved who will go to new
19 places, so why won't we be unsafe then if
20 we're going to be unsafe now? That's my
21 point, the underlying logic of that
22 argument.

23 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: But I don't
24 know what the level of service is for the
25 people who have requested transfers. I'm

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 sure it's not people with 20 or more
3 years experience, I would think. After
4 being in the station house that long,
5 they probably are not the ones that are
6 asking to go, and they're the senior
7 people --

8 (Applause.)

9 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: And they're
10 the senior people with the local
11 knowledge. So none of this makes any
12 sense.

13 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well, if
14 you stop --

15 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: It makes no
16 sense to anybody I've talked to. It
17 makes no sense to anybody I've talked to
18 outside this department. When I explain
19 to them what they're doing, they say,
20 Why? What's that about? Like what's
21 going on? I mean, people who are former
22 commissioners, current commissioners,
23 people from other cities are like, What
24 is this -- what are you guys doing down
25 there? What is going on? No one has

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 said to me, We agree, that's a great
3 idea. That's a great idea. Not one
4 person.

5 COMMISSIONER AYERS: One of the
6 things that when you talk about 270 slots
7 or 270 people wanting to be transferred,
8 there's not places for 270 people.

9 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: You're
10 going to make places for 300 of them.

11 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
12 listen what I'm --

13 (Applause.)

14 COMMISSIONER AYERS: What I'm
15 saying to you, sir, is this, is that if
16 you have 270 people trying to get in four
17 different stations, there's not room.
18 You can't do it. One of the things that
19 you have to understand is that things are
20 changing, which is one of the reasons
21 that this is happening, and that this is
22 going to be the best thing not just for
23 the members but for the citizens of
24 Philadelphia, who need our service and
25 who pay for our service, and that's what

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 we should be doing. It's first and
3 foremost about as to whether or not we
4 can ensure and make sure that our
5 firefighters are safe and trained and can
6 do their jobs and do them well, which
7 they do, and also to make sure that the
8 opportunity to move forward as a fire
9 service, making sure that the community
10 is well taken care of, which is our job,
11 that we do it.

12 The fires aren't there.
13 They're not going to be there. We need
14 to move forward and make sure that we
15 have an organization that understands
16 what community risk reduction is and that
17 understands that this thing about putting
18 out fires is not going to always be here.

19 COUNCILMAN KENNEY:

20 Councilwoman Sanchez.

21 COUNCILWOMAN SANCHEZ: Thank
22 you, Commissioner. I want to thank all
23 of the men and women who serve in the
24 Fire Department. It still astonishes me
25 when we do a community event and a young

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 person looks up at those fire trucks with
3 the amazement in their eyes, and I think
4 it's one of the most unique departments
5 that we had. I had an opportunity to
6 share with one of my firehouses recently
7 and have lunch with the gentlemen, and as
8 Councilman Henon says, these houses are
9 homes for them, and it is amazing to see
10 the level of camaraderie and the level of
11 commitment, the pride that they take in
12 their equipment and what they have, even
13 when it's limited. And I'm always amazed
14 and have a level of respect for this
15 particular department, because they have
16 been under a cloud with their contracts,
17 with the arbitration, and for me, there's
18 two areas of particular concern around
19 this policy that I would hope that the
20 Administration reconsiders. One is those
21 senior officers with 29 years in, 36
22 years in, are on DROP, have a set
23 retirement date, and then we're going to
24 transfer them. I think that is a group,
25 just as we write these policies, the

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 folks that we can say, You know what,
3 someone is on DROP, date certain, they
4 should not be subjected to any rotation,
5 let alone what we can agree on.

6 (Applause.)

7 COUNCILWOMAN SANCHEZ: And I
8 saw these gentlemen 36 years in, the
9 level of expertise and training that they
10 offer these officers, you want to keep
11 those guys in those houses for those new
12 cadets that come in. You want them to
13 train under those guys, because they know
14 those streets, they know all the
15 factories that I have in the area or even
16 the illegal duplex conversions that I
17 have. They know what's a single-family
18 and what's a duplex in the area, and I
19 think that's important. And I hope that
20 the Administration really heeds --
21 because I think that's one of the areas
22 on this that should be open for
23 discussion regardless of the other
24 policy.

25 The other thing -- and I'm glad

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 Councilman Kenney brought it up earlier
3 as I watched in the beginning of the
4 hearings -- was the issue of language,
5 and I'm particularly concerned in the
6 firehouses, because this is a public
7 safety issue not only for the potential
8 victims of fire but for the officers.

9 I want to get some assurances
10 that there will be someone who speaks
11 Spanish in some particular neighborhoods
12 in each one of those schedules, because
13 that is a grave concern, because it's
14 taken us years, and Councilman Kenney
15 knows, to add some.

16 COMMISSIONER AYERS:

17 Absolutely.

18 COUNCILWOMAN SANCHEZ: And you
19 know. You and I have this discussion
20 every year and every time you set up a
21 class about the hiring of folks with
22 different languages in the City.

23 So those are the two areas that
24 I'm particularly concerned with. Someone
25 served those 29, 36 years, we should not

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 uproot them in their last two years of
3 service or three years of service.

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Thank you,
5 Councilwoman.

6 (Applause.)

7 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I can
8 assure you that we've looked at that, and
9 some members that we may have
10 consideration for are those seniors
11 who -- those senior members who are in
12 the DROP and have a small amount of time
13 left in the DROP, and that we will be
14 looking at that.

15 COUNCILWOMAN SANCHEZ: And that
16 may be the trigger point. People do DROP
17 four years out. Folks should know with
18 certainty. They're telling us with
19 certainty their date of the end of their
20 public service. We should at least be
21 able to thank them for their years of
22 service by saying we're not going to
23 uproot you.

24 (Applause.)

25 COMMISSIONER AYERS: And also,

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 as we said, case-by-case basis, there are
3 things that we are looking at, and the
4 language issues are certainly one of
5 those issues that we are looking at.

6 COUNCILWOMAN SANCHEZ: Thank
7 you.

8 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Councilman
9 O'Brien.

10 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Thank you,
11 Mr. Chairman.

12 I'm curious. I think that's a
13 necessary part of a DNA for a Councilman
14 or a legislator in fulfilling our
15 obligation in an oversight function. I'm
16 also puzzled and challenged. If this was
17 such a good idea, why didn't the Fire
18 Department take advantage of Councilman
19 Kenney's committee or Councilman Jones'
20 committee and bring this wonderful idea
21 that's never been done before before
22 Council and -- that's a question. This
23 has become somewhat of an adversarial
24 situation here. And I'm not running for
25 President of the United States. I leave

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 confrontation to them. I'm looking for
3 the details, as every other member of
4 Council is asking for. Where did this
5 idea come from and why wasn't this forum
6 used to educate us and the other
7 firefighters as to the efficacy of this?

8 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well, it
9 certainly wasn't out of disrespect for
10 the Council at all. I will assure you
11 that. But it also was a part of
12 understanding the organization, the Fire
13 Department, some of the issues that were
14 there and also understanding the
15 firefighters, who they are, what they do
16 every day. And this is going to enhance
17 the safety of the citizens, not be a
18 detriment to the safety of the citizens.

19 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: I have a
20 follow-up question to that, but,
21 Commissioner, you're in the DROP. Many
22 of your top commanders are in the DROP.
23 Can you tell us how long you're going to
24 be around? Because it seems like this is
25 a bomb being dropped right in the middle

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 of this Fire Department, and what
3 assurances do we have that the successors
4 to you and the other top command officers
5 are even going to consider and embrace
6 this structure?

7 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I can't
8 tell you as to whether or not they'll
9 embrace it. The only thing I can tell
10 you is what's good for the citizens right
11 now. We have a track record that shows
12 these are practices that's good for the
13 citizens. We are --

14 COUNCILMAN HENON: Who
15 practices it, Commissioner?

16 COMMISSIONER AYERS: When I say
17 "practices," I'm talking about what's at
18 the base of what we're doing, and what's
19 at the base of what we're doing is
20 ensuring that we have firefighters going
21 into the future that not only understands
22 what it is about firefighting, but also
23 understands what it is like to go into a
24 community, learn what that fire safety
25 and education district is about, deliver

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 those services, and put in programs
3 that's going to reduce the risk in those
4 communities so that there's not a fire in
5 the first place. That's where we're
6 going.

7 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN:
8 Commissioner, again, I'd like to follow
9 up on my colleagues in Council about the
10 process. You realize this transfer
11 practice goes in opposition to what other
12 departments are doing. The police, the
13 DAs, the public defenders, everyone now
14 is going towards zones so they have more
15 familiarity with the area. Being
16 familiar with areas make you better. The
17 Fire Department essentially wants to do
18 the opposite. Can you tell me why?

19 (Applause.)

20 COMMISSIONER AYERS: This is
21 the Fire Department. We do make sure
22 that we're familiar with an area. One of
23 the things that each fire safety and
24 education district does is, they have
25 rotations as far as making sure that they

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 get into the community, familiarize
3 themselves with it, and that's what they
4 do. We're looking at a situation where,
5 again, the fires are going down. What
6 you're talking about when you start
7 saying how familiar you are with a street
8 or a run, they learn that. They know
9 that. They go out. It's pre-planned.
10 We do these things. It's not like it's
11 something that's going to be a danger.

12 We're going to be having less
13 and less fires. That's what we're
14 looking at, and the vision is that some
15 day in the future, you're going to have a
16 citizenry that understands their
17 partnership with the fire service, and
18 that partnership with the fire service is
19 not to have the fire in the first place
20 so that we have -- so that we -- you have
21 to believe in education as well. You
22 have to believe in making sure that the
23 citizens can learn to be safe. That's
24 what we've been doing, and it's proven.
25 We have the proof.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 So one of the things that you
3 have to understand is, it's not so much
4 about being familiar with a run as it is
5 being familiar with the community, the
6 businesses, where the hospitals are,
7 where you service and how you service.

8 As far as firefighting, it's
9 going to be on the decline, and it should
10 be on the decline, and as we allow these
11 firefighters in different areas of the
12 City to have those experiences, those
13 folks that look at the risk reduction,
14 the opportunities, the different
15 situations, those folks are going to be
16 more familiar and they'll be more
17 professional as related to what the
18 future firefighter looks like.

19 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN:

20 Commissioner, I still don't understand
21 how you reconcile that with what the
22 other major departments are doing. We're
23 going to zone courts. We're building
24 expertise. We're building a knowledge
25 base so that we can better respond to the

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 individual sections of the City.

3 There was a question that was
4 asked by Councilman Kenney as to what
5 studies support this move. My office
6 called Chicago. They're not doing it.
7 Councilman Henon says there's 15 other
8 cities that aren't doing this. I have
9 here the National Fire Protection
10 Association. That is an organization
11 that writes standards. They were founded
12 in 1896. They were dedicated to the
13 concept of voluntary consensus standards
14 writing. While it's not an enforcing
15 agency -- and I said this in the October
16 11th hearing -- NFPA enjoys a unique
17 representation. Its standards have been
18 adopted by all levels of government. In
19 many cases the standards have the force
20 of law. Each NFPA standard undergoes
21 revision every five years to ensure that
22 it's kept current with new fire
23 protection knowledge and technology. The
24 NFPA process is open, and anyone can
25 participate.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 Can you tell me, do you believe
3 that these are the standards and where --
4 I haven't read everything that they
5 publish, but I can't find anything that
6 even comes close to this practice.

7 (Applause.)

8 COMMISSIONER AYERS: They deal
9 with processes. They don't deal with
10 management rights.

11 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: You still
12 haven't answered what studies you point
13 to, Commissioner, with all due respect.
14 You talk about a command structure of a
15 half a dozen or more people who
16 contributed to this policy creation.
17 Where I come from, when we did the
18 tobacco settlement, I deal with my kids
19 with disabilities, we start with
20 evidence-based practices, which is what
21 my Council colleagues are pointing to.
22 You have data. We have epidemiologists
23 that study our data. What they do is,
24 they strip that data of its bias, they
25 establish new goals, and they create a

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 timeline for implementation.

3 I asked at the October 11th
4 hearing for a series of information
5 regarding training. I specifically asked
6 what the role of the NFPA was. Does the
7 Philadelphia Fire Department adhere to
8 these standards? How much of the Fiscal
9 Year '12 budget was spent on training?
10 How often does officer development
11 training occur? Is the Philadelphia Fire
12 Department training in line with these
13 standards? And I asked for a dossier of
14 training logs for the last three years,
15 which I think Councilman Squilla was
16 alluding to. Can you tell me when we're
17 going to get this information?

18 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: Your
19 request, Councilman, at that hearing was
20 given to the Chief of Staff.

21 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: I'm sorry?

22 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: Your
23 request at that hearing, Councilman, your
24 request for that information after that
25 hearing was communicated to the Mayor's

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 Chief of Staff.

3 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Well, the
4 other thing that Councilman Kenney --

5 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I'm sorry.
6 I didn't hear the answer. Transmitted to
7 who?

8 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: It was
9 communicated to the Mayor's Chief of
10 Staff, Councilman.

11 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you.

12 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: To the
13 Mayor's Chief of Staff?

14 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: The
15 Mayor's Chief of Staff, Councilman.

16 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Thank you.
17 Perhaps he's listening or we can find an
18 answer to that.

19 I'm really trying to be
20 respectful here. When you have a policy
21 of this magnitude, the first issue is, I
22 believe Councilman Kenney said there's a
23 buy-in process. That buy-in can take
24 place by you coming forward to his
25 committee or Councilman Jones' committee

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 explaining the efficacy of this.

3 I know what we should be about.

4 We should be about professional

5 development and capacity building. I

6 can't get my arms around that in this

7 proposal. I see the water balloon

8 effect, where we push the water balloon

9 down and we're not seeing what the

10 consequences are.

11 You talk about a buy-in and you

12 talk about people that are happy with the

13 status quo. Okay? You're labeling these

14 people as being happy with the status quo

15 and they resist any change. You're also

16 telling us that there are a whole bunch

17 of people that buy into this. Can you

18 please tell me who is buying into this

19 other than the command structure?

20 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,

21 first of all, you said that I said that

22 everybody was happy with this. I did not

23 say that.

24 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: I wrote it

25 right down when you said it. There are

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 people happy with the status quo. I
3 wrote it right down here. We have a
4 stenographer. I'll ask her --

5 COMMISSIONER AYERS: All right.
6 Excuse me. I thought you was talking
7 about present company.

8 What I want to say and what I
9 will say is that we see the transfers
10 that come in. We talk to some of the
11 younger firefighters. We know that a lot
12 of the younger firefighters would like to
13 have opportunities in other areas of the
14 City where currently there are no
15 opportunities to go into those locations.
16 This was done, as I stated, years ago
17 where you had people with certain levels
18 of time in stations give room so that the
19 newer firefighters coming into the job
20 could go into those stations and have the
21 opportunity to develop their experience.
22 And that's what's happening here.

23 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Well,
24 Commissioner, I'm looking at this, and I
25 don't remember when DROP happened in

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 Philly. I wasn't here. Somebody told me
3 in '92. Can somebody help me with that?

4 I have no idea.

5 In around there?

6 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Around mid
7 '90s.

8 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Well, the
9 idea was that I heard from a land far
10 away up in Harrisburg was that it was
11 because of Police and Fire Department
12 vacancies that were going to occur and we
13 needed professional development. I'm
14 aghast to try to understand now since
15 1998 while this policy comes forward just
16 now. It's almost like a jump out of the
17 bushes kind of thing, and say now we have
18 a crisis. This crisis has been here
19 since 1998, or maybe I heard different
20 information where I come from. But,
21 again, when I look at this, I look at the
22 lack of training over the last six years,
23 the lack of capacity building, the lack
24 of professional development, and I wonder
25 why this is the best solution we can have

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 to a crisis that we've known about for
3 all these many years. Can you respond to
4 that?

5 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
6 first of all, it's not a jump out of the
7 bushes for certain. It's something
8 that's been growing over time. It's
9 something that happened in a crises that
10 happened in the country. This city was
11 not immune to it. We did go through a
12 financial crisis. We didn't have the
13 opportunity to hire some classes in the
14 past. Now these classes are coming in in
15 conjunction with the DROP program. So
16 you have a larger vacancy. You have a
17 larger issue that you have to deal with.
18 And also some of the other things that
19 happened is, from the hard work of our
20 community as well as our firefighters, we
21 have reduced fires and we have reduced
22 fire deaths, and that's a part of the
23 change.

24 Now, how do we go forward?

25 Many of my colleagues across the country

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 have situations in their departments as
3 well where they are starting to practice
4 community risk reduction so that we can
5 get our fire deaths down, and part of
6 that is training for that, making sure
7 that we create a future --

8 (Audience member yelling.)

9 COMMISSIONER AYERS: -- so that
10 we can create a future that says this is
11 the work that we'll be doing. It will be
12 more training than firefighting, and
13 that's what we're starting to experience.
14 We're looking at enhancing our Academy so
15 that we can have more hands-on fire
16 burning situations, two-room fires, high
17 rise fires, things like that, so that we
18 can better enhance those firefighters,
19 because they're not going to have that
20 experience, that long-term experience
21 that 30 years ago or 20 years ago some of
22 the firefighters that we're talking about
23 who will be a part of the rotation,
24 they're not going to have that
25 experience. That experience will get

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 shared across the entire department now.
3 They'll be going to other stations where
4 they'll be able to share those
5 experiences with firefighters. That's
6 what will be happening.

7 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN:
8 Commissioner, I'm going to ask the
9 question one more time. I still have not
10 satisfied -- maybe I'm dense -- what the
11 studies are that prove that this is good
12 public policy. Where did you get the 20
13 percent? Did you pull that out of the
14 air or what study got you to the 20
15 percent and what number, what number
16 would represent a mass transfer? If it's
17 not 20 percent, what number would we have
18 to get to before this is considered a
19 mass transfer?

20 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well, it's
21 not a mass transfer, and the number is 15
22 to 20 percent, and we're looking at
23 firefighters who have over a decade in a
24 firehouse.

25 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN:

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 Commissioner, I'll just ask one more
3 question and I asked it at Councilman
4 Kenney's October 11th hearing. And I
5 don't know that we're getting to the more
6 important issues by this process or the
7 recommendation of these mass transfers.
8 I call them mass.

9 There was in 1999 the Worcester
10 6 fire in Massachusetts. In December of
11 2010, there was a fire in Chicago that
12 killed two and injured 19 firefighters.
13 We had our own recent fire tragedy in
14 Philadelphia. The NIOSH, the National
15 Institute of Occupational Safety and
16 Health, reported on these tragic events.
17 Both reports recommended fire department
18 and building departments to work together
19 to identify and mark abandoned buildings
20 that present hazards to firefighters and
21 the public.

22 Wouldn't you think that having
23 a process that identifies these core
24 issues and looking at those two studies
25 would make us a better Fire Department

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 and a better use of our time in City
3 Council and utilizing the professionalism
4 that exists right now in the Fire
5 Department?

6 (Applause.)

7 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Why aren't
8 we focused on those issues? Why aren't
9 we focused on those issues? And how does
10 this process get to the core of that
11 problem?

12 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It's
13 called community risk reduction. I
14 understand that you don't understand.
15 It's something that's evolving.

16 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: I'm going
17 to ask one more time. What are the
18 studies, the epidemiology evidence that
19 proves this is a good direction to go for
20 the City of Philadelphia? Please answer
21 that question.

22 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: What
23 studies exist that show it's not going to
24 be a good thing for the City of
25 Philadelphia, Councilman?

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Well, the
3 world that I come from, we have precious
4 few resources, whether they're fiscal,
5 but the definition of infrastructure is
6 people, whether it's in healthcare,
7 whether it's in teaching, whether it's in
8 the Fire Department or the Police
9 Department. The infrastructure that
10 really counts is people.

11 COMMISSIONER AYERS:
12 Absolutely.

13 (Standing ovation.)

14 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Thank you,
15 Councilman.

16 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Thank you,
17 Mr. Chairman. Maybe somebody else can
18 get those studies.

19 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you,
20 Councilman.

21 Councilman Oh.

22 COUNCILMAN OH: Thank you,
23 Chairman.

24 Commissioner, Deputy Mayor,
25 thank you very much for being here to

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 answer our questions. There were several
3 Councilpeople who co-sponsored this
4 resolution and other resolutions for
5 hearings, this one particularly about the
6 transfers. And I did hear your testimony
7 in the entirety, as it is broadcast
8 throughout City Hall right now, and so I
9 would have an observation and a comment
10 to share with an ask on the end.

11 I do respect the command
12 structure and all the expertise and
13 experience that's on your command staff
14 that has come up with this process, but
15 the reason we have this hearing is
16 because we were concerned, and 17 members
17 of Council signed that resolution. And
18 after hearing the testimony, I personally
19 cannot agree with the reasoning behind
20 it, with due respect to the command staff
21 and yourself.

22 The reason I believe we're here
23 is that as the Fire Commissioner -- and I
24 know you try to do a good job for the
25 citizens of this city on behalf of the

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 Mayor of our city, but the information
3 that you're getting back from almost
4 everyone on this Council is that we don't
5 have confidence in this rotation.

6 (Applause.)

7 COUNCILMAN OH: And that may be
8 something for this Council to deal with
9 the Mayor over. I'm not sure. But if
10 this is your command and control, if this
11 is your initiative, would you consider
12 our concerns about how this is being
13 implemented just to revisit it with your
14 command staff? Would you consider
15 re-discussing to see how your goals of
16 kind of this community firefighting
17 initiative can be achieved through the
18 voluntary transfers primarily and then
19 looking at selected transfers? Is that
20 something that you could delay the
21 implementation of this or reconsider
22 this?

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: There are
24 several points that have been made that
25 we will actually take a look at, I will

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 assure you that, as we review many of the
3 concerns.

4 As far as delaying this, we
5 have two cadet classes that's getting
6 ready to come out. We are going to be
7 going forward with a rotation. We do
8 want to talk with some of the other
9 command staff, some other people that
10 have given some concerns so that they can
11 have some input. Absolutely. To delay
12 moving forward with a rotation process
13 that's going to put Philadelphia, not
14 Chicago, not New York or anybody else,
15 that's going to put Philadelphia on the
16 correct path for our firefighters as we
17 move into the future I think would be --
18 would not be good for the citizens in the
19 community.

20 We have a track record that
21 shows not only have we tried to do good
22 for the citizens, we've done well for the
23 citizens, and it's getting better. To
24 put this in place, it's going to enhance
25 the firefighters' opportunity to get into

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 the community and do the things that we
3 need to do, make the changes, which, as
4 you understand, it's a lot of change and
5 angst in this and it's going to take time
6 to get this and for people to go into
7 their teams and form, but the duties and
8 things that we do always that we've done
9 forever is going to continue to get done.

10 So I will submit to you that,
11 yes, there's opportunity to take a look
12 at some of the other things that was
13 talked about.

14 COUNCILMAN OH: Well, thank you
15 very much for that. Could I just say
16 that what you've said is that there is no
17 failings on the part of the firefighters.
18 There's been no failings on the part of
19 the Department. There's been no failings
20 on the part of any fire station, that the
21 record of firefighting is actually very
22 good right now.

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: When you
24 say "failings," I --

25 COUNCILMAN OH: You've

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 identified no failings that would require
3 immediate corrective action. In other
4 words, things actually from your
5 testimony -- I believe your testimony is
6 that firefighting is being practiced
7 above standard in an exemplary manner
8 here in Philadelphia. Is that correct?

9 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I will
10 submit to you that day to day the
11 firefighters are out there putting fires
12 out. Just yesterday we had a tragic
13 fire. Just yesterday we had a tragic
14 fire, but those firefighters went out,
15 they did a good job. We're in the
16 process of investigating it. That
17 happens only once in a while here in the
18 City where we lose people. But there are
19 other fires every day that the
20 firefighters go out, they stretch line,
21 they put the fire out, and most of the
22 times now people are out of the fire,
23 they know what to do.

24 So I'm saying that there's
25 failings in any system. Absolutely. I'm

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 not saying that the firefighters are par
3 excellent and better than the whole -- I
4 mean, I'm not saying that. I'm saying
5 that this is a system that's gotten
6 better as far as how we interact with the
7 community and we see results there. This
8 is also a system that's been under
9 pressure based on all of the things that
10 Councilman Kenney kind of laid out.
11 Councilman Henon also laid out many of
12 the issues, and we understand those
13 pressures. But in doing their job, in
14 doing their job in the firehouse, going
15 out, responding into the community, I'll
16 say that they do a good job every day, as
17 well as our emergency medical services,
18 our paramedics. These officers, they
19 take those members out and they do a good
20 job.

21 COUNCILMAN OH: Okay. So being
22 that they do a good job and with so much
23 doubt being communicated to you about
24 implementing the rotations right now,
25 couldn't you wait until we go through

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 this a little more and not implement
3 these rotations? In other words, you've
4 kind of identified that the firefighters
5 and the Department are doing a good job.
6 It doesn't seem to me sincere or of face
7 value that given the concerns that are
8 expressed, that you couldn't wait and, as
9 a good Commissioner trying to leave a
10 good legacy with this department,
11 consider seriously and at face value the
12 doubts that we're expressing that are a
13 reflection of the citizens and the
14 firefighters here in Philadelphia to
15 reconsider how to better implement the
16 rotation. Maybe you'll want to implement
17 the rotation just the same, but it
18 doesn't seem there's any reason why you
19 would not be able to postpone
20 indefinitely these rotations until it's
21 been re-looked at.

22 (Applause.)

23 COUNCILMAN OH: Would you
24 consider it?

25 COMMISSIONER AYERS: We are

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 willing to look at some of the issues
3 that are brought up here. We are willing
4 to look at some of the issues that were
5 brought up here. One of the things that
6 I'm saying is that we have a cadet class
7 of 160 cadets that's about to be put out
8 into the firehouses, and I think that
9 their experience, the experience that
10 they have and experience that the other
11 firefighters that have some five, some
12 six years experience who will also be a
13 part of this rotation, five or six years,
14 that this experience going forward is
15 going to be one that's needed. That's
16 needed. The change is needed.

17 COUNCILMAN OH: I understand,
18 Commissioner. What I see happening is
19 Councilmembers ready to write a
20 resolution on this issue and other
21 issues. It seems there's an imbalance
22 and maybe even an unfairness in the
23 totality of the circumstance, and I would
24 hope that we don't end up in that
25 direction, because I think you may have

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 a -- I know you have a desire to make
3 this city safer, and I think we're all on
4 one sheet of music, citizens, firefighter
5 safety and wellbeing, the fire
6 administration and the Administration of
7 this city, in that order, but I think
8 we're coming to a point where we might be
9 at an impasse here, because I think this
10 room is full of stubborn people and we're
11 determined, and I respect your
12 determination, but I think it's also a
13 good thing when so many different people
14 from so many different sectors, different
15 sections of the City, different walks of
16 life, we all are asking that this not be
17 implemented and that it be re-looked at,
18 because there are serious doubts about
19 the value and the wisdom of its
20 implementation. And that's as honestly
21 as I could put it, with all due respect.

22 (Applause.)

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Thank you,
24 sir.

25 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: I

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 appreciate your concerns, Councilman, and
3 I can tell you that the Administration is
4 willing to have continued dialogue with
5 yourself, with Councilman Kenney,
6 Councilman Henon, the rest of the City
7 Council, Local 22 regarding this, but
8 given the Commissioner's -- the urgency
9 given the fact that there are so many
10 cadets that are coming out, I don't think
11 we'd be willing to postpone the
12 implementation, but we will be willing --

13 (Audience members yelling.)

14 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: -- to
15 discuss the issues further and have more
16 dialogue with you, with Council, with
17 whoever else is concerned.

18 COUNCILMAN OH: Well, I would
19 love the dialogue, and I'm sure we'll all
20 like to do that.

21 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK: Plus
22 there were some very good issues that
23 were raised by Councilwoman
24 Quinones-Sanchez that I think the
25 Commissioner would like to revisit it and

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 take a look at with respect to
3 implementation.

4 COUNCILMAN OH: I think we're
5 all kind of firm on this implementation
6 issue. And I don't know where this goes
7 from here, but I think we're all pretty
8 firm about that. But thank you very
9 much.

10 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Thank you,
11 sir.

12 (Applause.)

13 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Follow-up
14 question with Councilman Henon.

15 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you,
16 Mr. Chairman.

17 Commissioner, I'm not sure if
18 this should be directed at you or
19 Mr. Resnick. Some of the numbers about
20 the number of vacancies and transfers and
21 everything like that, I'm going to submit
22 some questions and ask that you get them
23 back to the Chair, please, as we move
24 forward. The total amount of vacancies
25 that are actually open and available, the

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 amount of transfers over the past five
3 years, and also the question of
4 attrition, how many firefighters are we
5 losing on a monthly basis for whatever
6 reason, whether it's out on disability or
7 not on active duty or just through
8 retirement and then moving forward over
9 the next five years for -- next four
10 years with DROP.

11 DEPUTY MAYOR RESNICK:
12 Projected retirement?

13 COUNCILMAN HENON: So we can
14 fully take a better and deeper look at,
15 from my standpoint and our standpoint, in
16 the interest of public safety. Because I
17 too am going to ask that you reconsider
18 the implementation of this policy as it
19 is, as it is. So your willingness to
20 take a look at it deeper and a lot of the
21 suggestions here, maybe more inclusion.
22 Having the discussion with no
23 implementation doesn't really work with
24 us. We would like to see some action
25 here for obviously life and safety

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 reasons.

3 As you may or may not know, my
4 previous life before being elected to
5 City Council here, I used to install NFPA
6 life safety systems. So I understand to
7 a certain point, and I also understand as
8 being a rank and file electrician serving
9 an apprenticeship, which is -- I would
10 analogize that as maybe a new cadet or
11 somebody going through the training with
12 less experience, and also being a
13 supervisor and a foreman. I never put
14 inexperienced men and women in a
15 situation that didn't have experienced
16 and senior people who were there to train
17 them.

18 (Applause.)

19 COUNCILMAN HENON: I'm speaking
20 from my experience, and if you take -- I
21 think Councilman Squilla used some, I
22 guess, sporting analogies. You have
23 dynasty football teams that quarterbacks
24 change, the coach changes, the ownership
25 changes and management changes, but you

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 still have a dynasty. We have a dynasty
3 in our firefighters here and in our
4 police force. If the play doesn't work,
5 don't use it. You can't throw four Hail
6 Marys and four downs and hope to score.
7 Get rid of the play. Let's start over.
8 Let's take some of the suggestions here,
9 please. I would respectfully ask that
10 you do so. And when in doubt, throw it
11 out, and let's come up with something
12 that works for everybody.

13 Thank you.

14 (Applause.)

15 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I want to
16 let these witnesses go, but I want to
17 read something that was sent to me, and I
18 will not name the firefighter, for
19 obvious reasons.

20 This has been my firehouse for
21 28 years. It has been my privilege to
22 serve this neighborhood and the nearby
23 neighborhoods for 28 years. I have spent
24 many years learning this neighborhood and
25 feel confident in being able to protect

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 it.

3 When walking to work, I am
4 greeted by residents and merchants with a
5 smile. I know their faces and they know
6 mine. I have seen kids grow old and
7 their grandparents die. I am protecting
8 what I feel is my neighborhood. This is
9 what being a member of the local
10 firehouse means.

11 Over the years, I have fought
12 many of the major Center City fires,
13 including the Meridian and the Chinatown
14 10th Street fire. I know the streets,
15 the standpipes, and the stairways of
16 buildings that most people just walk
17 past. It took me years to learn this.
18 When I go to calls, I look for the other
19 senior guys on the other fire apparatus.
20 These guys are the core of what turns
21 chaos into a smooth firefighting
22 operation. This is what puts the fire
23 out.

24 I am typical of the senior guy.
25 We love our firehouse and we love

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 protecting their neighborhood. We pass
3 this pride and knowledge to the younger
4 firefighters at our stations. This is
5 essence of Philadelphia fire prevention.

6 Please ask the Administration
7 to rethink their transfer policy.

8 And with that, I thank you for
9 your testimony.

10 (Applause.)

11 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I'm sorry.
12 Councilman O'Brien has hopefully one more
13 question.

14 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN:
15 Commissioner, this Thursday I'm
16 introducing another resolution that deals
17 with training. Respectfully and echoing
18 what Councilman Kenney and Councilman
19 Henon have suggested, and you've embraced
20 to a certain extent that you have learned
21 things from this hearing, I respectfully
22 request, along with my colleagues, that
23 we take into consideration the
24 informational requests that we have from
25 the Deputy Mayor. We look at the NIOSH

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 report from the tragic events in the
3 Worcester 6 and the Chicago fire, and we
4 peruse the National Fire Protection
5 Association standards and that we create
6 a new opportunity to look at training.
7 And I'm not saying putting this off in
8 the distant future. Let's create a new
9 box of opportunity where we
10 comprehensively address these issues.

11 But I respectfully request that
12 the implementation be put off until we in
13 City Council have an opportunity to
14 create a work group with you to look at
15 the occupational issues that you're
16 facing and that we can look at real data,
17 real studies, perhaps even engage in
18 epidemiologists to look at the data so
19 that we're all on the same page, that we
20 agree there's no bias in that data, and
21 we look for fundamental direction going
22 forward. I respectfully request and
23 reinforce what my colleagues are
24 requesting, that the implementation of
25 this be delayed until we come up with a

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 comprehensive plan in the next couple
3 months to set new standards of training
4 and opportunity for the Fire Department.

5 (Applause.)

6 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: The next
7 two witnesses is retired Battalion Chief
8 Edward Marks and Deputy Chief James
9 Bonner.

10 (Standing ovation.)

11 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Whoever is
12 ready to go first, please identify
13 yourself for the record.

14 DEPUTY CHIEF BONNER: I'm James
15 H. Bonner.

16 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Please
17 proceed with your testimony.

18 DEPUTY CHIEF BONNER: I have a
19 paper that I think is available to you.
20 I'd like to read it aloud, but Council
21 has made some of those arguments already,
22 but I'm going to proceed. If it's too
23 lengthy, please feel free to jump in and
24 stop me.

25 Good morning, Chairman Kenney,

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 members of the Committee on Labor and
3 Civil Service and other Councilmembers
4 that are here today. I am James H.
5 Bonner, a member of the Philadelphia
6 Firefighters and Paramedic Union Local
7 22. I hold the rank of Deputy Chief in
8 the Philadelphia Fire Department.

9 Here today I offer my sincere
10 thoughts.

11 The craft of urban
12 firefighting, the multitude of other
13 emergencies where firefighters and
14 paramedics respond require a unique
15 collection of education and experience.
16 The firefighter who must immediately
17 react to a variety of emergency
18 situations must merge up-to-date
19 education along with tried and tested
20 techniques that are handed down from
21 those with years of experience. To be an
22 accomplished paramedic, you must be fully
23 capable in reacting with effective skills
24 to the automobile crash, the shooting or
25 the heart attack of the beloved family

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 member.

3 The backbone of the U.S.
4 military is the specialist. Guidance of
5 these specialists is served well by
6 managers who have a thorough knowledge of
7 the operations of other divisions, making
8 for a well-rounded, enlightened
9 administrator, who is aware of the varied
10 solutions available within an
11 organization. In regards to the
12 ground-level workforce, the people that
13 produce the service to the public,
14 rotation removes the specialists and
15 turns the workforce into generalists,
16 with an overview of the mission; however,
17 less fluency of the specific abilities,
18 situational awareness, experience or
19 skill to cut the learning curve and solve
20 the latent calamity.

21 Tell a sergeant major in the
22 Army that you're going to rotate the
23 personnel in their division so that
24 they'll be well-rounded. You can only
25 imagine the answer you'll receive.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 When we arrive, we have to be
3 effective immediately. We cannot play
4 with trial and error. Ours is not a
5 meeting where ideas are discussed. We
6 must operate as a well-oiled machine
7 without delay. The paramedic crew
8 arriving at an auto accident with a child
9 bleeding profusely, the engine company
10 agonizing, struggling over maintaining
11 their water line in a hallway with zero
12 visibility and extreme temperatures while
13 the ladder company frantically searches
14 the floor above, or the crew raising a
15 35-foot ladder through PECO wires on a
16 20-degree snowy night with a mother
17 preparing to drop her children from the
18 third floor. Do we want a company who
19 consistently works with the same
20 personnel, a team built on the
21 experiences of the senior members,
22 paramedics who know each other's
23 thoughts? Of course we do.

24 Every year, the Department is
25 successful with these missions and you

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 seldom hear of them on the local news,
3 because the news only covers and gives
4 times to the tragedies, the times that we
5 are not successful. We are rotating the
6 people that make these scenarios come out
7 positively. Their expertise is required
8 with the refinery, high rises, large
9 residential and industrial complexes, the
10 hospitals, universities, any place where
11 a senior veteran will guide the group
12 directly to the boiler room, the HVAC
13 floor, the steam shutoff, the sprinkler
14 controls, the alarm panel, elevator
15 controls, and locations of remote
16 hydrants. We are sending a convoluted
17 message to hospital fire marshals, the
18 university safety staff, and building
19 engineers by expecting them to have
20 trained personnel at the front desk with
21 full knowledge of the infrastructure, but
22 we will be sending crews where we change
23 personnel to align with a three- to
24 five-year rotation.

25 It is not about knowing the

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 streets in a given area, as Mr. Resnick
3 or Mr. McDonald have mentioned. Their
4 paraphrased statement that if
5 firefighters and paramedics can work
6 overtime around the City, then why can't
7 they rotate? This demonstrates a lack of
8 knowledge of the fire and EMS service.
9 Battalion chiefs will assign overtime
10 personnel to fill out the staffing and
11 assign members from that station. The
12 battalion chiefs fully realize the
13 benefit of crew integrity. It is
14 imperative to know the intricacies of the
15 residential and industrial complexes that
16 we respond to. Getting there is not the
17 problem; it's when you arrive, you
18 immediately have to make the situation
19 better. The driver, pump operators, and
20 tiller personnel must be from that
21 station. Navigating fire apparatus
22 through our streets must be done by
23 people experienced in specific locals or
24 accidents occur. Presently company
25 officers are held monetarily responsible

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 for apparatus accidents. What is
3 devastating to that company officer is
4 losing the senior person who instructs
5 junior members on how to delicately
6 maneuver and tactically place the
7 apparatus. We will lose the senior
8 person that suggests to the company
9 officer a more effective positioning of
10 the initial attack line based on ample
11 knowledge of the property, streets, and
12 alleys. I know. I have exploited these
13 senior people throughout my entire
14 35-year career.

15 On the EMS side, providing a
16 consistent service is having regular
17 partners working in the same area of the
18 City. They know the complex facilities
19 and connect with hospital staff, police
20 personnel, and the fire companies that
21 pick up their frequent overflow work.

22 Having served as a company
23 officer for 18 of my 35 years, winning
24 over the senior person gave me firsthand
25 knowledge of the personnel and the

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 complex facilities in our local area.

3 And may I add a little story here. After
4 confining a fire to the basement elevator
5 shaft at St. Joseph's Hospital, the
6 senior member used an office phone and
7 called the hospital fire marshal at home
8 at 3:00 a.m. My surprised look caused
9 him to respond to me, Well, he said to
10 call him any time if we need him. The
11 CEO of the hospital will want him. He
12 was right. The CEO and the fire marshal
13 walked through the door 20 minutes later.

14 In a recent general memorandum,
15 the Fire Department initiated a sign-up
16 mentoring program. Mentors are the
17 lifeblood of any organization. The
18 mentors are already in place and have
19 been tutoring our newer personnel for
20 decades. Two mentors who imprinted me
21 with methods and work ethic chose to
22 never advance past the rank of
23 firefighter, and I was their supervisor.
24 They treated their co-workers,
25 supervisors, and the public in a very

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 professional manner. They consistently
3 desired to learn and, as our profession
4 demands, pushed themselves physically
5 until there was nothing left. Mentors
6 are in place. Why are we rewarding them
7 by moving them?

8 With thousands of career fire
9 departments across the country, I have
10 not been able to locate any that rotate
11 paramedics or firefighters. I researched
12 through the National Fire Academy's
13 library and used contacts with fire
14 service leaders, and I have found not a
15 word on paramedic or firefighter
16 rotation, and only a few fire departments
17 rotate their officers. We rotate our
18 officers every three years, all the more
19 reason to leave the senior members in
20 place.

21 Recently there have been five
22 major changes within the Philadelphia
23 Fire Department. In 2009, we had a medic
24 schedule change, all for various reasons.
25 In 2011, we had a medic/paramedic

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 rotation. Starting this year, we had a
3 major change in our EMS management
4 system. Later in 2012, firefighter
5 schedule changed, and again right after
6 that, the firefighter rotation general
7 memo.

8 Now, all these documents were
9 published with no input from our chief
10 officers.

11 Some of our chief officers in
12 Philadelphia serve as instructors in
13 other cities or nearby counties to share
14 experiences with their newly promoted
15 officers or instruct on the management of
16 extra alarm fires or how to handle the
17 enormous undertaking of a high-rise fire
18 and how we keep our overburdened EMS
19 system from fracturing. Other
20 municipalities have our present and
21 retired chief officers consult on their
22 operations in an effort to make them more
23 efficient and effective. The reason
24 given that the Fire Department did not
25 consult their own chief officers is

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 because they are members of Local 22.

3 Police Commissioner Ramsey encourages

4 input from his chief inspectors,

5 inspectors, captains, and they're also

6 members of the FOP, yet he allows them to

7 contribute thoughts, experiences, and

8 ideas on a regular basis. I am sure the

9 other City departments consult members of

10 District Councils 47 and 33. With these

11 five major changes to the Fire

12 Department, the chief officers were never

13 consulted.

14 Change is a must in our

15 belt-tightening economy. I am for

16 change, change for the better. During

17 the promotional testing process chief

18 officers participated in, the oral exam

19 was graded by chief officers from other

20 metropolitan fire departments. One

21 portion involved demonstrating your

22 ability to create a change policy. We

23 were required to lay out a plan, to

24 gather all pertinent information, and

25 canvas the involved and interested

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 parties. We explained how committees or
3 task groups need establishment with a
4 clear agenda. Results created a plan
5 that garnered buy-in from the rank and
6 file and alternate plans if the results
7 were poor. All of our chief officers in
8 Philadelphia convinced chiefs from other
9 cities that we could handle an effort in
10 change, but Philadelphia refused to
11 involve us in these changes.

12 At a recent staff meeting
13 conducted by the Fire Department
14 administration, when the chief officers
15 asked, How do we sell this; in particular
16 for me, a senior member who has
17 accumulated over 5,000 sick hours with
18 over 30 years of experience and he has
19 trained each new member assigned to the
20 station. This person also rejected a
21 full disability from having a building
22 collapse on him. He exercised himself
23 back to peak physical condition. He
24 lives his life with a significant facial
25 disfigurement. But when asked about

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 these people, the chief officers were
3 told, I didn't ask you to sell it. Is
4 this how we treat our devoted, valued
5 firefighters or how we treat educated
6 chief officers who are interested in
7 being a contributing asset of the
8 organization?

9 What research has been done to
10 justify these five major changes in the
11 Fire Department? Has research involved
12 the United States Fire Administration's
13 National Fire Academy or the
14 International Association of Fire Chiefs?
15 The old mantra stands, do we have to
16 reinvent the wheel? How have these ideas
17 worked elsewhere? They haven't.

18 Which lends credence to the
19 accusation that these changes are a
20 result of retaliation, retaliation over
21 the lengthy, expensive court battle
22 involving the contract or the FLSA
23 lawsuit brought by some paramedics and
24 firefighters. These changes started with
25 the City filing to remove the paramedics

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 from the union. The relationship between
3 the Mayor's Office and Local 22 is so
4 wounded. So much money spent on legal
5 battles.

6 For years, the Fire Department
7 has been giving back. We suffered
8 company closings, brown-outs, and the
9 elimination of a host of very important
10 training initiatives. I watch how the
11 City spends elsewhere. Enough already.
12 The Fire Department is at rock bottom.
13 We've had four recent incidents where
14 firefighters were severely injured or
15 killed:

16 March 2011, 24th and Jefferson
17 Street, a PHA high-rise building with a
18 wind-driven fire severely injured a
19 firefighter who was rescued and
20 hospitalized and he was found with no air
21 remaining in his air pack;

22 April 2011, 5th and Poplar,
23 three firefighters severely burned and
24 scarred with one permanently disabled due
25 to trauma injuries after being driven

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 from a window three stories high;
3 December of 2011, 19th and
4 Norris, three firefighters had to bail
5 from the third floor window to escape
6 smoke and flames that were below them,
7 and on that incident, a total of ten
8 firefighters were injured;

9 And then April of 2012 in York
10 Street and Kensington resulted in the
11 deaths of Bob Neary and Dan Sweeney.

12 No department investigations.
13 Other departments routinely conduct an
14 in-depth safety investigation on
15 incidents resulting in significant injury
16 or death. Lessons learned are developed
17 for all to benefit. Some of our very own
18 chief officers participate in injury
19 investigations in other municipalities.

20 With all of this cost-cutting,
21 now more than ever our Fire Department
22 needs the senior personnel. Cutbacks in
23 Fire Department spending have eliminated
24 most training. An example is our driver
25 training, EVOC, emergency vehicle

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 operator course. We have company
3 officers, some of them not even qualified
4 to operate the vehicle assigned to them,
5 yet that same company officer is
6 responsible to instruct firefighters and
7 paramedics on how to drive, operate the
8 pump, tiller, position at emergencies, et
9 cetera, a further example of the value of
10 senior members. Also eliminated has been
11 our highly touted officer development
12 program where newly promoted captains and
13 lieutenants are schooled in effective
14 management and safe operations in
15 dangerous situations. I have provided
16 our officer development syllabus to other
17 cities to use in their program. Recent
18 communications with these cities result
19 in shock and dismay that Philadelphia
20 would subject the program to elimination
21 due to cutbacks.

22 Progressive municipalities have
23 a command school for newly promoted chief
24 officers, some lasting a month or more.
25 Philadelphia gives you the chief's

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 uniform and sends you out to command
3 incidents, and certification is reserved
4 only for new members. Nationally
5 firefighters are certified
6 department-wide. A very creative deputy
7 chief had one-eighth of our department
8 complete certification in a
9 cost-effective approach that was also
10 prevented from moving forward due to
11 cutbacks.

12 From a risk management
13 perspective, we are teetering on a major
14 loss. Once the physical loss occurs, the
15 lawsuits generated will provide the
16 financial sting. We expect our chief
17 officers and company officers to arrive
18 to an incident, take command, make
19 decisions that will dictate either the
20 next few minutes or the next few hours,
21 and keep all safe, given all this
22 responsibility with no very little formal
23 training. We now find ourselves in the
24 midst of a grand jury and civil lawsuits
25 being prepared that will expose

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 operational deficiencies due to the
3 City's conscious decision to eliminate
4 critical training initiatives.

5 How much do you expect the rank
6 and file to take? Now the City enjoys
7 the dedication of people showing up early
8 for work on Christmas, Thanksgiving,
9 during hurricanes, and when we have three
10 feet of snow on the ground. When will
11 the heavy-handed changes and cutbacks
12 truly affect morale? When will we start
13 placing companies out of service because
14 people are calling out sick or we run out
15 of people to call for overtime? This is
16 something I thought I'd never see.

17 I personally have nothing to
18 gain from my comments today other than
19 maybe the disdain of my superiors. I
20 only wish for the citizens of
21 Philadelphia and members of this
22 department to boast of a first-rate fire
23 and EMS service.

24 I always ask of subordinates
25 who complain to supply solutions.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 Rotation of new members through active
3 companies would be ideal. The quandary
4 is, due to a lack of hiring in the past,
5 we now have a sudden influx of four
6 classes back to back. This is a problem
7 created by the City Administration that
8 has not hired in years and throws in the
9 face of the union, It's all about
10 overtime. With gradual hiring, we can
11 blend new people into the Department.
12 After the Academy, new members can rotate
13 through active companies over the first
14 year. Then with a solid background, they
15 would be given an assignment.

16 Some ideas: All solutions take
17 work and have unexpected impacts, but
18 they have to be worked through. Some
19 ideas are, leave people in place and
20 demand accountability in treating the
21 public with respect, constant improvement
22 of their skills, and total involvement in
23 providing a safe environment for all
24 citizens, workers, and visitors in their
25 local area.

11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 Create an opening in active
3 companies for a trainee position with
4 trainees rotating through on a quarterly
5 or semi-annual basis. Involve the deputy
6 chiefs and battalion chiefs in a
7 participatory management style to
8 overcome the problem of over 300 new
9 members.

10 Fire service people from other
11 cities are always surprised to find out
12 that we do not have a transfer policy
13 such as a bid system or a seniority
14 system. With a transfer policy in place,
15 an individual will have some
16 predictability of when access to a
17 specific station will become available.
18 This could be years down the road, but it
19 gives some information as to career
20 assessment.

21 And I would ask that Council
22 would appropriate money to backfill
23 companies permitting training to back to
24 basics, basement fires, fundamental
25 engine and ladder operations, EMS

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 associated with special operations, and
3 officer development.

4 In conclusion, please take this
5 as an attempt to assist you in becoming
6 more aware of your Philadelphia Fire
7 Department. These opinions are my own,
8 along with Local 22, in an effort to
9 bypass the hyperbole that inundates you.
10 The safety of our citizens, including our
11 firefighters and paramedics, is
12 paramount.

13 Thank you for your attention.
14 (Standing ovation.)

15 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Chief,
16 please identify yourself for the record
17 and proceed with your testimony.

18 BATTALION CHIEF MARKS: Yes.
19 My name is Edward Marks. I'm recently
20 retired from the Fire Department. I
21 retired in September with 38 years of
22 service. Of the 38 years, I was a
23 firefighter for 15 years, a lieutenant
24 for five, captain for nine, and I retired
25 as a battalion chief with a little over

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 nine years.

3 Chief Bonner pretty much laid
4 out in his presentation here the concerns
5 that I have and the guys from the local
6 have. I just wanted to take a few
7 minutes of the time to add a little -- my
8 input into it.

9 As an officer for 23 years as a
10 lieutenant, a captain and battalion
11 chief, I also rotated, and I know the
12 concerns of rotating into a company that
13 you're not familiar with. When I rotated
14 into Ladder 12 as a lieutenant, I walked
15 in there, I knew one of the firefighters.
16 So it's even harder for an officer
17 rotating, because you have to feel out
18 all the guys, know who the players are,
19 know who the go-to people are, and you
20 rely on the senior man.

21 The second day that I was in
22 Ladder 12 we responded to a fire in a
23 building at 12th and Allegheny. It
24 wasn't hard finding the fire because as
25 soon as we pulled out of the station, we

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 saw the smoke. I had a guy yelling at me
3 in through the back window by the name of
4 Joe Murray, who was the senior guy
5 telling me, We've had multiple fires in
6 here, the roofs have holes in it, the
7 floors are deplorable, the walls are
8 crumbling in. So I knew that when I got
9 there, there wasn't going to be an
10 interior tackle. We were just going to
11 set up and have a surround and drown
12 operation. But it was the information
13 that gets provided to you by these senior
14 guys that makes your job as the officer
15 even easier.

16 The Commissioner stated that
17 the officer is ultimately responsible,
18 and he is, but when you're newly assigned
19 to a company and you don't know the
20 surroundings or you're not familiar with
21 the geographical area, it's the senior
22 guys that you rely on.

23 Another incident when I went to
24 Engine 2 as a senior guy, we got a cadet
25 out of fire school. Now, I know what the

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 OP tells you and the Director tells you
3 as far as in-service training, and I was
4 preparing to do my job to train him, but
5 once again, you rely on the senior guys
6 that are in that company. We had a guy
7 by the name of Mike Malia. He personally
8 took this guy under his wing, and he made
9 my job a lot easier, because all I had to
10 do was concern myself with the
11 administrative parts of it. Mike took
12 him every day and drilled him. And I can
13 still remember Mike saying to him, If you
14 screw up on the fire ground, that means
15 Engine 2 screwed up, and Engine 2 don't
16 screw up, kid, so get it straight, you
17 know.

18 So that's what I'm just trying
19 to reiterate a little bit about the
20 importance of the senior guy.

21 One thing I wanted to touch on
22 also -- and I know that Mr. Resnick and
23 the Commissioner kept referring to these
24 classes that are going to be coming out
25 in January, these recruit classes. When

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 I first got promoted to battalion chief,
3 my first assignment was Deputy Director
4 of Training up at the Academy, and I had
5 about an hour and a half interview with
6 Commissioner Hairston at the time, and he
7 was talking to me. Now, I had a lot of
8 experience up at the Academy, because I
9 was up there as an adjunct instructor for
10 four classes. So I was familiar with the
11 recruits and how the process is and when
12 they get assigned and everything when
13 they graduate from the Academy. Well,
14 the plan that I laid out to the
15 Commissioner -- and it could very well
16 easily be implemented -- is if -- our
17 classes are usually approximately 80.
18 Now, they're saying 160 because there are
19 back-to-back classes, and I understand
20 that. But if you have a class of 80 that
21 comes out, the way the Fire Department is
22 structured, we have four platoons. You
23 could put 20 on a platoon. We have two
24 divisions. That would be ten a division,
25 and they would be assigned to a pool.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 They wouldn't get assigned to a station,
3 so to speak. And then the deputy chief
4 who is in charge of that division, if he
5 has five or six battalions, he just
6 breaks it down further and says, All
7 right, Battalion 11, you're getting these
8 two guys for a month, but then they're
9 going to go to Battalion 3, then they're
10 going to go to Battalion 4, then they're
11 going to go to Battalion 7. And they
12 would have the opportunity to work in
13 busier companies, slower companies,
14 busier ladders, engines, medic units.
15 They would work for five different
16 battalion chiefs and many company
17 officers.

18 So the process of assigning
19 cadets to a particular company -- and
20 there's a lot of guys that want the
21 slower companies -- that could be
22 eliminated if they put them in this pool
23 and they rotated them for a year.

24 Now, like they stated, we do
25 have this influx of retirees coming in

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 June. There's going to be 150 spots,
3 along with the spots that are out there
4 now. So they can maybe honor the
5 transfers that are already on record to
6 try and move these people where they
7 wanted to, and then as the retirements
8 comes along, you take the guys from the
9 pool and start to fill them in there.

10 There is alternate plans, but
11 the bottom line is, when we go to the
12 staff meetings like they were stated,
13 there is no input. They never asked for
14 any input. The plan, like I said, I gave
15 to Commissioner Hairston, he didn't
16 particularly care for it, so he shot it
17 down and it was never implemented. But
18 it is an alternate as to what we're
19 dealing with now. And I understand when
20 the classes get out in January, you got
21 to do something with them. There's no
22 reason why they couldn't be put into a
23 pool and moved around for the first year
24 that they're in the job before they would
25 be given an assignment.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 We have --

3 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Isn't that
4 what's done with newly promoted
5 lieutenants and captains? Isn't there a
6 period of a float?

7 BATTALION CHIEF MARKS: No.
8 Well, I shouldn't say no, Councilman,
9 because it all depends on how many people
10 are promoted. If there's, say, ten
11 lieutenant vacancies and they promote 15,
12 ten of them would get spots and then the
13 other five would float. As an officer, I
14 floated twice as a lieutenant and I
15 floated once as a captain, and that
16 period of time as a captain I floated for
17 15 months before there was a spot for me
18 to take and I went to the firehouse at
19 4th and Snyder. But I floated twice as a
20 lieutenant and I floated once as a
21 captain. So it is something that they
22 do, but it's only if there's no vacancies
23 for them.

24 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: But what
25 you're suggesting in your plan was to

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 float the newly entered firefighters
3 coming out of school?

4 BATTALION CHIEF MARKS: I
5 wouldn't refer to it as floating. I
6 would refer to as a pool where they would
7 know that you're going to work at, say,
8 Engine 7 for the next two months and then
9 you're going to go to Engine 58, which is
10 farther up in the Northeast, for the next
11 two months, and that rotation would
12 encompass a year and they would move
13 around their particular battalions --
14 their particular divisions into
15 battalions for a year.

16 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Isn't that
17 a way to backfill some of the spots that
18 are vacated temporarily through injury
19 and other types of things? So you have
20 to hold the spot for the senior
21 firefighter who is injured, but you can
22 fill the spot --

23 BATTALION CHIEF MARKS: That's
24 what it would be ideal for. If you have
25 somebody off with an extended injury or

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 an extended sickness, they could move
3 into those spots for that period of time.

4 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Okay. It's
5 sad to say I don't sense from the last
6 round of testimony that there's
7 willingness to even consider any of this.
8 So we're trying to figure out -- and we
9 were up here kind of conversing as to
10 what we do next to try to continue to
11 focus on this issue and come out with
12 some acceptable remedy, but I
13 overwhelmingly sense that they were here
14 to give me the same answer over and over
15 again and no interest in really changing
16 it. So we're going to have to strategize
17 as to what we can do as a legislative
18 body to continue to effect this.

19 Any questions?

20 (No response.)

21 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Do you have
22 anything else to add?

23 BATTALION CHIEF MARKS: I just
24 want to add a couple more things. We
25 have two firefighters that are going to

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 be coming up here testifying in a few
3 minutes, and I got to tell you, they're
4 excellent firemen, senior firemen, and
5 they're men of a few words. My last
6 assignment as a battalion chief was at
7 Battalion 10 on the C Platoon. Battalion
8 10 is housed in the same station with
9 Ladder 10 where we lost Lieutenant Neary
10 and Dan Sweeney. A lot of people don't
11 realize, but Firefighter Joe Steinmetz
12 over here, he was the fourth guy working
13 in the ladder that night. You had
14 Lieutenant Neary, then you had Sweeney,
15 Nally and Chaney. Joe was there that
16 night. Jose Luciano from the engine, he
17 was there that night. When that wall
18 came down, those guys were in there on
19 the pile digging them out. Their names
20 are on this transfer list to be moved. I
21 have no idea why they would even consider
22 it. The Commissioner sat here and said
23 we're going to do it on a one-for-one
24 basis. We're going to review all this
25 stuff. Their names shouldn't have even

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 appeared on there.

3 I mean, I worked with these
4 guys. When I retired in September -- I
5 was off the night of the fire when they
6 were killed. It was actually Easter. It
7 was Easter Monday, that morning. And I
8 was off. I had a holiday. Easter Sunday
9 I sat in the yard and I was talking to my
10 wife, and I said to her that I was going
11 to make an appointment with the Board of
12 Pensions because I was going to leave
13 early. Rather than wait until September,
14 I was going to go out around sometime
15 now. The next day when I got the call, I
16 went right to the hospital, and my wife
17 said to me, What you are going to do?

18 I said, I'm not leaving. I got
19 to stay with these guys. Because I've
20 been through this before. I was on the
21 funeral team in the Fire Department for
22 12 years. I buried a lot of guys. I
23 lost my closest friend, John Redmond, in
24 Ladder 11. I worked with him down there.
25 So I know what these guys are going to go

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 through, and there's a healing process.
3 And these guys -- the day that I retired,
4 they gave me a little sendoff. And I
5 talked to them all in the office, and I
6 basically said to them, You're on the
7 road. You're on the road to recovery. I
8 think you've got over the hurdle, but
9 it's still a long time.

10 I'm never going to forget John
11 Redmond. I'm never going to forget Dan
12 Sweeney and Bob Neary either, but it gets
13 easier as time goes on, and that's all
14 part of the healing process. And like I
15 said, to move these guys, it was just
16 ridiculous.

17 And that's pretty much --

18 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Well, as
19 part of my life experience, I'm sure you
20 have some information as to my background
21 growing up, my father being part of this
22 fire service and being lifelong friends
23 with John Redmond, it saddens me to see
24 what this department has come to. And
25 they call -- I think they call it a house

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 for a reason, because people actually
3 live together, and I sense that it's
4 almost gone, and I think that's sad.

5 BATTALION CHIEF MARKS: I don't
6 want to interrupt you, but the time that
7 I spent at the Academy -- and I know that
8 a lot of the Councilpeople come up there
9 for graduation ceremonies and award
10 ceremonies and everything. If you look
11 around that auditorium, you see banners
12 hanging there with words like
13 "commitment," "responsibility,"
14 "loyalty," "morale," "integrity." This
15 is the stuff that the men and the women,
16 that the medics and the firefighters are
17 engrained in them when they come through
18 there, and it's making it tougher and
19 tougher for them every day to come to
20 work and do their job when they're
21 getting beaten down with their contracts
22 being -- and if they're the words that
23 we're supposed to live by, where's the
24 Administration? Why don't they live by
25 those words and why don't the Fire

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 Department administration?

3 (Applause.)

4 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Councilman
5 Henon.

6 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you,
7 Mr. Chairman.

8 I want to thank you both for
9 being here, and I want to commend you for
10 your career of serving this city and
11 public safety. My question I guess would
12 be addressed to both of you regarding
13 this policy. To me it's certainly about
14 safety, but it's about working
15 conditions. If you have unsettled and
16 you have working conditions that may not
17 be safe, you have the morale that's down,
18 I would think people would be working in
19 the conditions of fear with this kind of
20 policy all at once. Would that be a
21 correct --

22 BATTALION CHIEF MARKS: Yes.

23 DEPUTY CHIEF BONNER: Well, I
24 think --

25 COUNCILMAN HENON: Just from

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 somebody who has not been through the
3 force.

4 DEPUTY CHIEF BONNER: It's nice
5 to have a feeling of you know what's in
6 the future, you know what's lying ahead.
7 If I study, I can make lieutenant. If I
8 stay here, I can be the senior
9 firefighter at Engine 7. It's nice to
10 have that. A lot of people chose that
11 path in life, and the way things are, you
12 can't work towards a path because you
13 don't know what's coming next. You don't
14 have that path to work towards.

15 So I've learned so much from
16 firefighters, not my officers and my
17 bosses. I learned from them too, but
18 some of the troops on the ground just
19 teach you something every day.

20 COUNCILMAN HENON: It's not
21 fair for anybody to show up to work, bad
22 morale, unsafe working conditions, and
23 working under the pretense of fear
24 because of a bad policy.

25 BATTALION CHIEF MARKS: Well,

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 it all comes down to a productive
3 employee too. You stated -- it was
4 stated many times today that if you take
5 somebody who don't want to go somewhere
6 and you just up and move them out, do you
7 think he's going to be the productive
8 employee that he was where he left? You
9 know, naturally, I mean, it's human
10 nature that, you know...

11 COUNCILMAN HENON: Councilman
12 Kenney said it, basically to summarize
13 it, a happy employee is a good employee,
14 right, and that goes to the working
15 relationship with the employee/employer.

16 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Well, I
17 think the other thing, frankly, is
18 that -- and I respect all our City
19 employees, people who work in the Rec
20 Department, people who work in the
21 Streets Department, people who work in
22 the Health Department. This is a
23 different job. This is not
24 sit-behind-the-desk job and go home at 5
25 o'clock. And I think that the lack of

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 respect based on the amount of danger and
3 the willingness to lay down your life and
4 not have that respect from your employer,
5 when you have it from the citizens, you
6 have it from the public -- I mean, no one
7 dislikes firefighters. You may have a
8 problem with a police officer, you know,
9 he'll lock you up or something, but no
10 one -- when you guys are coming, we're
11 happy to see you on all circumstances,
12 because you're generally going to save us
13 from something. That's a different --

14 (Applause.)

15 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I think
16 that's the genesis of the lack of
17 respect, that it's not viewed as a
18 special job. And it is a special job,
19 because only special people do it.

20 So I thank you for your service
21 and for your testimony today. Thank you.

22 DEPUTY CHIEF BONNER: You're
23 welcome.

24 (Standing ovation.)

25 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: The last

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 two witnesses on the list are Firefighter
3 Luciano and Firefighter Steinmetz.

4 (Witnesses approached witness
5 table.)

6 (Standing ovation.)

7 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you
8 for being here and for listening to all
9 of this, and thank you for your
10 testimony. Please, whoever is willing to
11 go first, identify yourself for the
12 record and proceed.

13 FIREFIGHTER STEINMETZ: Fireman
14 Joe Steinmetz, Ladder 10 on the C
15 Platoon. I'm not a unit official. I'm
16 not a lawyer. But my thing that I call,
17 this hostile work environment. Being at
18 the firehouse -- everyone else has been
19 saying it -- it's like a family, and
20 they're ripping our family apart.

21 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I'm sorry.
22 Please proceed.

23 FIREFIGHTER STEINMETZ: I'm
24 done.

25 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Oh, okay.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 You are?

3 (Applause.)

4 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: He bills
5 you appropriately as a man of few words.

6 Firefighter, please.

7 FIREFIGHTER LUCIANO:

8 Firefighter Jose Luciano, member of
9 Engine 7 for 17 years.

10 It's pretty hard to say
11 anything after Chief Marks and Chief
12 Bonner. They said everything. They
13 touched on every subject that was in my
14 mind and I wanted to say, and the Council
15 itself had great questions and brought up
16 great topics that I had in my mind to
17 say. So I really -- it's hard to say
18 anything else, but...

19 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I
20 appreciate you being here, and I just
21 want to say that after more than 20 years
22 in Council, this is the first time I've
23 ever felt that I've had to do this, that
24 I've had to -- and you sit and you wait
25 over years and you see things happening

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 and you go, that wasn't right, and you
3 see people getting disciplined for stuff,
4 and that wasn't right, but you kind of
5 keep quite, until you get to a point
6 where you're just like, this is beyond
7 any reason. And I've never seen a
8 Council that's had to take this bull by
9 the horns before with this particular
10 department, and the fact that we're even
11 sitting here is disgraceful in that we
12 have to be here.

13 (Applause.)

14 BATTALION CHIEF MARKS:

15 Councilman, like I said, these guys are
16 of few words. That's why I stayed up
17 here with them. But what they do is,
18 they basically reflect everybody that you
19 see out here in the audience. These are
20 people that go to work every day, they do
21 their job, they lay their lives on the
22 line every day, and all they want is a
23 fair shake and not have their life turned
24 upside down with this rotation. It's
25 totally unnecessary and not needed.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: We

3 appreciate your testimony and your

4 sentiments, and we will continue -- I

5 don't see anyone in this Council of the

6 17 members that are on the opposite side

7 of this issue from where we are. So

8 we'll continue to push and figure out

9 whatever strategy we can to make them

10 stop going after the arbitration award,

11 which has now been upheld by a judge

12 again, and to do what we can to stop

13 these forced transfers. So hang in there

14 with us and we'll do our best, I promise.

15 Thank you.

16 BATTALION CHIEF MARKS: Thank

17 you.

18 (Standing ovation.)

19 (Witnesses approached witness

20 table.)

21 MS. GARVIN: Excuse me. Can I

22 say a few words real quick? I'm sorry.

23 I've been waiting to speak.

24 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Anybody

25 else that wants to speak. Anybody else

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 that wants to speak. Thank you.

3 MS. GARVIN: Hi. My name is
4 Theresa Garvin. I'm the President of the
5 Families Association for the Philadelphia
6 Fire Department. So I have a different
7 take than the firefighters. And I'm also
8 a tax-paying citizen here in
9 Philadelphia. And I just want to say
10 everything -- thank you so much for your
11 support. And I was here at City Council
12 Chambers when the bill was passed
13 forward. And I'm sickened. I can't even
14 begin to say how it makes us feel as
15 families, that we sacrifice so much for
16 this Fire Department because we love our
17 firefighters, and to see that they're
18 being slapped in the face and kicked in
19 their teeth over and over and over again
20 is appalling. I can't begin to describe
21 how demoralizing it is to them, how their
22 morale -- and we started this group
23 initially because we were against
24 brown-outs and we teamed up with the
25 Media Mobilizing Project and talked with

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 them about -- and kind of collaborated
3 ideas. And then I just saw them so --
4 their morale, they have none. It's just
5 ridiculous. And my husband used to
6 practically skip out to work. His
7 grandfather was a firefighter and his dad
8 was a cop. And I never thought these
9 words were going to come out of my
10 husband's mouth. He said, I think I
11 should have been a cop.

12 He was a proud firefighter his
13 whole life, and to see what they're
14 putting him through, I don't understand
15 it. So, I mean, between the time change,
16 the contract, I don't know what more can
17 happen.

18 But as a firefighter's wife and
19 a citizen of Philadelphia, I just want to
20 say that this is so dangerous, and they
21 know it is, and I don't understand why
22 they keep just lying about it. And
23 there's no other reason. And
24 Commissioner Ayers said that he was doing
25 it because he wanted this community thing

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 or whatever for fire safety. Why can't
3 they do that in the groups they're in
4 now? Why do you have to make these
5 transfers? They would be more effective
6 as they are now.

7 And, you know, my husband gets
8 transferred every three years as it is
9 because he's a lieutenant, and I depend
10 as a wife and a mother of three children
11 that that senior man is going to make
12 sure my husband knows -- he looks to him.
13 He looks to them to show them the ropes.
14 And to take that out of -- and you ask
15 anybody who has five, six years on. They
16 know they don't know everything. And he
17 kept saying they have five, six years on.
18 They're the first ones to say, I don't
19 have enough experience to tell a
20 lieutenant, and they're still in the
21 ropes. It's actually so ignorant I can't
22 even believe that we're having this
23 discussion.

24 So I just want to say thank you
25 so much for everything you guys are

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 doing, and I just -- as the Families
3 Association, we try to be positive about
4 everything. We try to bring the families
5 together. We try to do -- but I can't
6 take it anymore. I can't see these guys
7 that I love -- my brother is a
8 firefighter, my best friend is a
9 firefighter, and my husband and a million
10 friends that I've made over the last 20
11 years. So 20 years ago my husband took
12 an oath to protect the citizens of
13 Philadelphia, and he's done it over and
14 over again. But you know what? That day
15 he looked at me and he said to me, You
16 know what this means. When I leave you
17 guys, the citizens of Philadelphia are my
18 priority and my brothers and sisters. So
19 that day I took an oath too to the Fire
20 Department, because I love my husband,
21 and I don't -- I want him to be
22 respected. I want them all to be
23 respected, because they've done nothing
24 but deserve the best. These guys are
25 great. I've worked with them over and

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 over again. We went to Diane Neary's
3 house. They redid her whole house. We
4 were there -- she was in tears,
5 overwhelmed.

6 These are good people. They're
7 good people, and they shouldn't be
8 treated like they're being treated.

9 So I just want to say, please
10 do everything you can, because it's just
11 ridiculous. The time change, I know
12 that's in effect, but that affects us
13 families too. My husband at
14 Thanksgiving, I could either have an
15 early dinner or a late dinner. Now what?
16 Nine o'clock at night? No. You know,
17 it's just not fair. I'm coming from a
18 family perspective. And they're not
19 objects. They're people with families,
20 and all these decisions are affecting us.

21 (Applause.)

22 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you.
23 Please identify yourself.

24 MS. HOGAN: My name is Lisa
25 Hogan. My husband has been a fireman for

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 16 years. My father was a firefighter
3 for 33 years. I was raised in this proud
4 tradition of the Fire Department, and
5 it's very sad to see what the
6 Administration has brought it to.

7 I've embraced Diane Neary a few
8 days after her husband passed. I
9 embraced Marian Sweeney a few days after
10 she lost her only son, her only son. And
11 there are days when I sit in my kitchen
12 when my husband leaves for work and I
13 wonder, am I next? Am I the next widow?
14 Are my children the next children that
15 will grow up without a father? Because
16 incompetency seems to rule this
17 Administration.

18 Enough is enough. There needs
19 to be an endpoint, and I think this
20 needs to be it.

21 (Standing ovation.)

22 (Witness approached witness
23 table.)

24 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Please
25 identify yourself for the record.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 BATTALION CHIEF SCHULLY: My
3 name is Joseph Schully (ph). I hold the
4 rank of Battalion Chief and I'm currently
5 assigned to the 4th Battalion located at
6 4th and Arch Street.

7 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: How old are
8 you?

9 BATTALION CHIEF SCHULLY:
10 Forty-one.

11 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: God bless.

12 BATTALION CHIEF SCHULLY:
13 Before I begin the prepared text, I'd
14 just like to point out to the Committee
15 that I feel that this Administration
16 holds us in such little regard that
17 nearly every Commissioner that was here
18 walked out as soon as they finished their
19 testimony. I find that to be personally
20 insulting.

21 (Applause.)

22 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Well, I can
23 tell you at the last hearing we had on
24 Buck, they didn't come at all. So
25 progress.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 BATTALION CHIEF SCHULLY: But
3 this is the standard operating procedure.
4 Much like Chief Bonner said, at the staff
5 meeting, if we do attempt to speak in
6 adversary to anything that they present,
7 you're quickly slapped down like a dog,
8 and that's just how it is at our
9 meetings. So we have no interjection
10 into any of the policies that they're
11 coming forth with.

12 With that, I'd like to begin
13 the prepared text.

14 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you.

15 BATTALION CHIEF SCHULLY:
16 According to the general memo from the
17 Fire Department, the purpose of this
18 transfer policy is to enhance the
19 firefighters' ability to achieve greater
20 opportunities to facilitate upward
21 mobility through the ranks.
22 Additionally, by ensuring that all
23 firefighters serve at least one rotation
24 in the busiest battalions during their
25 career, the on-the-job training that

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 results from experience is more likely to
3 occur.

4 I would agree that experience
5 is critical to the development of a
6 firefighter, but the current policy is
7 inconsistent with the objectives
8 described above and will most definitely
9 create a dangerous level of inexperience
10 in certain engine and ladder companies.

11 To address the inconsistency,
12 of the 156 senior members slated to be
13 transferred in order to create vacancies
14 in busy companies for inexperienced
15 members, at least 56 of them are
16 currently assigned to less active fire
17 companies. Why would we transfer
18 experienced firefighters already assigned
19 to slower companies?

20 Of the 57 junior firefighters
21 slated to move to more active companies,
22 at least 21 of them are currently
23 assigned to active companies. Why would
24 we move inexperienced firefighters who
25 are currently assigned to active

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 companies?

3 This leaves approximately 36
4 inexperienced firefighters slated to move
5 to slower companies. According to the
6 Fire Department's current vacancy list,
7 there are enough openings in more active
8 companies to accommodate all of these
9 firefighters.

10 Of course, we must consider new
11 firefighters coming from the Fire
12 Academy. Simply increasing the quotas in
13 busier companies and creating training
14 companies that they had in the past would
15 surely go a long way to accomplish the
16 Department's objectives.

17 As I previously stated, the
18 current rotation policy is a recipe for
19 disaster. In January, this policy will
20 leave several companies with either all
21 new members or one current member
22 assigned. For instance, all but one
23 member assigned to Ladder 9, Platoon C,
24 including the officer, will be rotated in
25 January. Only one member will have any

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 knowledge of the response routes or the
3 idiosyncrasies of the structures in the
4 local. This includes the building
5 construction, the fire protective
6 systems, and the special occupancies of
7 these buildings. By the way, Ladder 9 is
8 located at 21st and Market Street, which
9 is the high rise district in Philadelphia
10 containing the most complex buildings in
11 the City.

12 A fire company is a team that
13 works together at an emergency scene.
14 The level of member fluctuation this
15 policy will create will be dangerous not
16 only to the firefighters but also to the
17 civilians we're here to protect.

18 It is widely accepted
19 throughout the fire service, particularly
20 in major cities, that it takes
21 approximately five years for a
22 firefighter to become proficient in a
23 local district. Once this plan is fully
24 implemented, no engine or ladder company
25 will have a firefighter or officer

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929
2 assigned with more than five years
3 experience in that company. And that's
4 contrary to what the Commissioner was
5 saying, but when this is fully
6 implemented, every five years a fireman
7 will be rotated out of the spot that
8 they're in.

9 I cannot express to this
10 Committee strongly enough how dangerous
11 this fact is. The number one priority of
12 all officers in the Philadelphia Fire
13 Department is life safety. This includes
14 the safety of the public as well as the
15 safety of the members under their
16 command. Not having experienced members
17 in a company means the officer will have
18 to direct more attention to micromanaging
19 the company, thereby directing less
20 attention to the incredible function of
21 saving civilian lives. In addition to a
22 sharp increase in fire vehicle accidents,
23 this policy will surely increase both
24 civilian and firefighter injuries and
25 deaths.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 In closing, I would urge this
3 Committee to compel the Fire Department
4 to suspend this policy until a more
5 comprehensive transfer and training
6 policy could be established considering
7 the Department's needs as well as the
8 welfare of the public and firefighters.

9 Thank you.

10 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you
11 for your testimony.

12 (Standing ovation.)

13 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Please
14 identify yourself for the record.

15 MR. GELMAN: I'm Jack Gelman,
16 Sergeant-At-Arms of Local 22.

17 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Please
18 proceed.

19 MR. GELMAN: The Paramedic
20 Committee of Local 22 asked me to read
21 this for them. Because they were
22 members, they were already rotated in
23 these mass transfers, and they have felt
24 already what's going to happen to us.

25 And it says, We would like to

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 bring to your attention the facts
3 surrounding the Department's plan to
4 again rotate a group of its members. I
5 would like to present to some and remind
6 others that approximately one year ago to
7 date, the fire service paramedics, which
8 equated to 211 members, were mass rotated
9 throughout the entire city. This mass
10 rotation, as it would do our brother
11 firefighters, is still affecting response
12 times, members' awareness of their new
13 locals, and an overall safety concern for
14 our citizens in receiving prompt
15 emergency attention. This dissection of
16 experienced members and citywide
17 disruption has and will on a grand scale
18 cost. The price before us yesterday for
19 our medics and tomorrow for our brother
20 firefighters is lives. These are very --
21 these are the very souls that all members
22 of our department seek to save under the
23 defining words on the patch that we all
24 wear: dedication and service.

25 This platform today was not

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 afforded to our paramedic members a year
3 ago due to the election process and
4 pending the new additions to your Council
5 last January. With your full and
6 undivided attention, our union and its
7 members strongly oppose any future mass
8 rotations of all members unless otherwise
9 bargained under Act 111 negotiations. We
10 stand before you today shoulder to
11 shoulder as a family asking for your
12 support that our concentration not to be
13 on the stress of these movements, but
14 protecting your family members today and
15 tomorrow.

16 Thank you again.

17 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you.

18 (Applause.)

19 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Anyone else
20 besides Mr. Gault?

21 MR. GAULT: I think I'll take
22 care of it. On behalf of Local 22, its
23 4,000 members, firefighters and
24 paramedics, thank you very much for
25 having this hearing today.

1 11/27/12 - LABOR - RES. 120929

2 (Applause.)

3 MR. GAULT: Councilman, it's
4 broke. Please help us fix it.

5 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I hear you.
6 I hear you.

7 MR. GAULT: Thank you very
8 much.

9 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: The
10 Committee on Labor and Civil Service will
11 be recessed until the call of the Chair.

12 (Committee on Labor and Civil
13 Service recessed at 1:10 p.m.)

14 - - -

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the
proceedings, evidence and objections are
contained fully and accurately in the
stenographic notes taken by me upon the
foregoing matter on November 27, 2012, and
that this is a true and correct transcript of
same.

MICHELE L. MURPHY
RPR-Notary Public

(The foregoing certification of this
transcript does not apply to any reproduction
of the same by any means, unless under the
direct control and/or supervision of the
certifying reporter.)

A	accurately 190:5 accusation 144:19 achieve 181:19 achieved 116:17 achieving 10:13 acknowledge 2:14 acknowledged 57:22 acquire 7:11 10:2 Act 188:9 action 3:22 119:3 126:24 active 73:23,23 126:7 150:2,13 151:2 182:16,21 182:23,25 183:7 activities 73:13 activity 45:11 actual 71:11 72:15 ad 85:22 adapt 7:14 10:5 adaptable 11:21 adapted 36:2 add 94:15 139:3 153:7 161:22,24 adding 3:22 addition 9:9 12:24 21:19 185:21 additional 3:5 39:12 Additionally 181:22 additions 188:4 address 23:13 131:10 182:11 addressed 166:12 addressing 87:6 adhere 104:7 adjunct 156:9 adjust 4:5 administration 38:8,18 86:17 92:20 93:20 123:6,6 124:3 130:6 143:14	150:7 165:24 166:2 179:6,17 180:15 Administration's 144:12 administrative 155:11 administrator 134:9 adopted 102:18 advance 41:7 139:22 advancement 3:6 advances 71:4 advantage 96:18 adversarial 96:23 adversary 181:6 advice 56:6,10,15 56:17 affect 149:12 afford 65:10 affordable 64:23 afforded 188:2 age 74:18 agency 102:15 agenda 143:4 ages 77:19 age-old 78:24 aghost 108:14 ago 6:5 11:4 21:21 42:10 49:17 54:21 107:16 110:21 110:21 177:11 187:6 188:3 agonizing 135:10 agree 16:11 86:21 86:22 90:2 93:5 115:19 131:20 182:4 agreed 39:17 52:4 agreement 52:8 ahead 167:6 air 111:14 145:20 145:21 alarm 136:14 141:16	alarms 73:11 align 136:23 Allegheny 153:23 alleys 138:12 allow 101:10 allowed 62:2,3 64:11 allows 7:20 10:15 142:6 alluding 104:16 alongside 10:7 aloud 132:20 alternate 143:6 158:10,18 amazed 92:13 amazement 92:3 amazing 92:9 amount 95:12 125:24 126:2 169:2 ample 138:10 analogies 127:22 analogize 127:10 analogy 85:24 analyze 34:19 analyzing 34:21 and/or 190:23 Angeles 15:13 48:11 angst 30:12 50:7 60:10 118:5 annually 2:13 6:20 9:13 answer 17:13,14 20:24 49:3,5,6 60:4 85:3 105:6 105:18 113:20 115:2 134:25 161:14 answered 103:12 answers 43:18 anticipate 7:14 8:7 10:4 anticipated 19:12 anxiety 30:12 anybody 85:6 89:16,17 117:14	167:21 173:24 173:25 176:15 anymore 177:6 apart 170:20 appalling 174:20 apparatus 129:19 137:21 138:2,7 appeal 64:17,21 64:25 65:6 appealed 59:10 59:11,12 63:19 63:19,19,20,21 appeared 163:2 Applause 15:17 19:3 23:20 24:21 33:3 34:11 37:2 45:22 56:8 57:11 63:3,22 65:11 69:3 72:18 77:14 78:12,19 80:12 81:4 84:18 85:8 86:20 87:4 89:8 90:13 93:6 95:6 95:24 99:19 103:7 113:6 116:6 121:22 123:22 125:12 127:18 128:14 130:10 132:5 166:3 169:14 171:3 172:13 178:21 180:21 188:18 189:2 applications 57:20 apply 190:21 appointment 163:11 appreciate 124:2 171:20 173:3 apprenticeship 127:9 approach 21:18 148:9 approached 4:24
---	--	---	--	--

170:4 173:19 179:22 appropriate 3:15 151:22 appropriately 171:5 approve 22:4 83:16 approximately 2:12 22:6,15 40:19 87:9 88:17 156:17 183:3 184:21 187:6 April 145:22 146:9 arbitration 59:11 63:17 92:17 173:10 Arch 180:6 area 19:6 40:25 40:25 41:18,18 41:20 42:3 51:7 71:7,8,9 84:7,10 87:20 93:15,18 99:15,22 137:2 138:17 139:2 150:25 154:21 areas 3:4 17:25 20:12,13 37:7 41:4 49:11 74:22 76:12 85:15,17 92:18 93:21 94:23 99:16 101:11 107:13 arguing 79:20,20 argument 85:11 85:18 87:21 88:14,22 arguments 132:21 arm 59:21 arms 106:6 Army 134:22 arrive 135:2 137:17 148:17	arriving 135:8 asked 17:3 102:4 104:3,5,13 112:3 143:15,25 158:13 186:20 asking 17:8 89:6 97:4 123:16 188:11 aspect 61:24 63:10 assess 25:17 32:20 assessed 25:16 assessment 151:20 assessments 30:24 asset 144:7 assign 137:9,11 assigned 16:21 23:25 67:12,14 70:24 74:21 143:19 147:4 154:18 156:12 156:25 157:2 180:5 182:16,18 182:23,25 183:22,23 185:2 assigning 157:18 assignment 6:22 7:15 9:17,20 10:6,19 150:15 156:3 158:25 162:6 assignments 3:3 assist 152:5 associated 152:2 Association 102:10 131:5 144:14 174:5 177:3 assurances 94:9 98:3 assure 45:25 95:8 97:10 117:2 astonishes 91:24 attack 133:25 138:10	attempt 152:5 181:5 attending 2:3 attention 152:13 185:18,20 187:2 187:15 188:6 attrition 40:3 126:4 audience 21:14 22:8 23:10 27:16 34:17 61:3,6 62:9,22 66:9,22 71:19 87:24 110:8 124:13 172:19 auditorium 165:11 authorizing 1:15 2:6 auto 135:8 automobile 133:24 available 6:8 33:14 38:22 39:4 53:21 66:14,19,25 67:18 68:22 69:6 125:25 132:19 134:10 151:17 avenue 86:24 award 165:9 173:10 aware 12:17 25:13 31:23 59:3 134:9 152:6 awareness 134:18 187:12 Ayers 4:19,22 5:15,19,23 13:22 14:18 15:4,23 16:11 17:12 19:2,4 24:24 25:12 27:6,13,19 28:9 28:14 29:7,13	29:21 30:2,6 32:16 33:4,18 33:22 34:4,9,12 34:18 35:10,14 35:18 36:24 37:3,16 38:16 39:14,24 45:23 46:20,23 47:4 48:7,23 49:4 51:23 52:5,7,11 53:16,23 54:6 54:18 55:17 56:11,16 57:16 58:2,23 60:4 61:4,8 62:10 66:4,6,12,24 67:5 68:20,25 69:4,25 70:7 71:14,22 72:7 72:19 74:4,8 75:21,25 77:15 78:20 82:3 83:21 84:2 89:13 90:5,11 90:14 94:16 95:4,7,25 97:8 98:7,16 99:20 103:8 106:20 107:5 109:5 110:9 111:20 113:12 114:11 114:14 116:23 118:23 119:9 121:25 123:23 125:10 175:24 a.m 1:7 139:8 B back 8:9 16:20 24:4,14 25:11 37:21,24 42:22 85:10 116:3 125:23 143:23 145:7 150:6,6 151:23 154:3 backbone 134:3 backfill 151:22	160:17 background 150:14 164:20 back-to-back 156:19 bad 86:8 167:21 167:24 bail 146:4 balanced 67:17 ball 77:7 balloon 106:7,8 Baltimore 15:15 banners 165:11 bargained 188:9 base 98:18,19 101:25 based 16:4,4,5 19:5 35:3 49:8,9 120:9 138:10 169:2 basement 139:4 151:24 basically 164:6 168:12 172:18 basics 151:24 basis 13:2 25:15 84:13 96:2 126:5 142:8 151:5 162:24 basket 77:5 Bass 1:10 5:11 37:13,14,18 39:8,19 43:12 45:24 46:7 battalion 41:11 132:7 137:9,12 151:6 152:18,25 153:10 156:2 157:7,9,10,11 157:16 159:7 160:4,23 161:23 162:6,7,7 165:5 166:22 167:25 172:14 173:16 180:2,4,5,9,12 181:2,15 battalions 157:5
--	---	---	---	--

160:13,15 181:24 battle 144:21 battles 145:5 beaten 165:21 Beatrice 76:4 becoming 152:5 beg 35:10 46:23 54:18 71:22 begging 9:16 beginning 34:25 94:3 behalf 115:25 188:22 belief 81:5 believe 19:7 44:4 55:2 56:7 82:4,6 100:21,22 103:2 105:22 115:22 119:5 176:22 beloved 133:25 belt-tightening 142:15 benchmark 17:20 benchmarking 47:11 beneficial 2:25 benefit 33:8 81:23 137:13 146:17 benefits 3:11 Berkshire 39:15 best 9:24 16:9,9 18:20,22,24 19:5,9,10,20 20:19,23 33:13 36:9,10 40:16 41:3 43:15 45:12 46:18,21 46:25 47:5,7,10 48:3,8,17 49:7 62:17 69:13 79:22,23 80:19 90:22 108:25 173:14 177:8,24 better 31:4 34:15 42:7,25 43:8,9 44:3,4 76:22,23	76:24 81:11,17 86:2 99:16 101:25 110:18 112:25 113:2 117:23 120:3,6 121:15 126:14 137:19 142:16 beyond 172:6 bias 103:24 131:20 bid 151:13 big 51:2 78:16 bill 174:12 bills 171:4 binding 59:10 63:17 bit 155:19 bleeding 135:9 blend 150:11 bless 180:11 block 56:23,24 57:2,4,5 73:9,16 Board 163:11 boast 149:22 Bob 146:11 164:12 BOBBY 1:11 body 161:18 boiler 136:12 bomb 97:25 bonding 77:18 Bonner 132:9,14 132:15,18 133:5 153:3 166:23 167:4 169:22 171:12 181:4 booing 61:3 born 20:23 43:16 boroughs 48:10 bosses 167:17 Boston 15:14 bottom 145:12 158:11 box 131:9 break 80:25 breaks 157:6 breath 11:14	21:25 brief 37:19 bring 20:15 24:20 26:24 76:9,13 96:20 177:4 187:2 bringing 24:14 brings 30:11,11 broadcast 115:7 broke 189:4 brother 177:7 187:10,19 brothers 177:18 brought 94:2 122:3,5 144:23 171:15 179:6 brown-outs 53:10 53:11 62:7,23 145:8 174:24 brush 2:22 Buck 180:24 budget 104:9 build 9:18 12:23 42:4 43:8 building 9:22 25:5 61:20 79:4 79:6 85:25 101:23,24 106:5 108:23 112:18 136:18 143:21 145:17 153:23 184:4 buildings 112:19 129:16 184:7,10 built 135:20 bull 172:8 bunch 84:23 106:16 buried 163:22 burned 145:23 burning 110:16 burns 9:22 bushes 108:17 109:7 busier 29:17 157:13,14 183:13	busiest 9:4,19 181:24 business 32:22 businesses 101:6 busy 9:11 36:16 36:16,17 182:14 buy 106:17 buying 106:18 buy-in 3:16 27:22 28:2 105:23,23 106:11 143:5 bypass 152:9	captains 142:5 147:12 159:5 car 23:8 care 51:10 61:18 75:6 79:24 91:10 158:16 188:22 career 3:5 6:6 8:25 16:23 23:25 24:10 138:14 140:8 151:19 166:10 181:25 careers 12:7 careful 57:3 carried 6:7 case 12:19 26:4,4 26:5 36:24,25 37:10 81:8 86:13 cases 66:20 102:19 case-by-case 13:2 25:15 96:2 case-to-case 84:13 cause 31:20 62:7 caused 139:8 celebrate 11:13 cell 5:7 Center 40:24 76:11 129:12 CEO 139:11,12 ceremonies 165:9 165:10 certain 36:3 48:12 53:17,24,24 77:6,10 93:3 107:17 109:7 127:7 130:20 182:10 certainly 12:3 45:4 96:4 97:9 166:13 certainty 95:18 95:19 CERTIFICATE
--	---	--	--	---

190:2 certification 148:3,8 190:20 certified 148:5 CERTIFY 190:3 certifying 190:24 cetera 32:23 147:9 Chair 1:10 46:12 125:23 189:11 Chairman 5:20 96:11 114:17,23 125:16 132:25 166:7 challenged 96:16 challenging 11:19 Chambers 174:12 chance 20:12 Chaney 162:15 change 11:9 12:10 29:4,6,10,15 30:11,11,16 31:12,24 50:8 58:13 60:11,19 82:19 106:15 109:23 118:4 122:16 127:24 136:22 140:24 141:3 142:14,16 142:16,22 143:10 175:15 178:11 changed 76:17 141:5 changes 32:18 118:3 127:24,25 127:25 140:22 142:11 143:11 144:10,19,24 149:11 changing 49:12 49:14 58:16,17 58:17 77:22 90:20 161:15 chaos 129:21 charge 82:5,8 157:4	Charter 31:15,16 32:6,12 checks 73:9,9 cheerful 63:25 Chicago 15:14 102:6 112:11 117:14 131:3 chief 41:12 42:2 51:20 52:3 68:4 70:15 76:4,5,6,7 76:10,11 104:20 105:2,9,13,15 132:7,8,14,18 133:7 141:9,11 141:21,25 142:4 142:12,17,19 143:7,14 144:2 144:6 146:18 147:23 148:7,16 152:15,18,25 153:3,11 156:2 157:3 159:7 160:4,23 161:23 162:6 165:5 166:22,23 167:4 167:25 169:22 171:11,11 172:14 173:16 180:2,4,9,12 181:2,4,15 chiefs 28:19 76:9 137:9,12 143:8 144:14 151:6,6 157:16 chief's 41:25 147:25 child 135:8 children 73:13 135:17 176:10 179:14,14 Chinatown 129:13 choice 84:8 choices 41:7 58:5 84:7,10 chose 139:21 167:10	Christmas 149:8 church 55:10 CINDY 1:10 circle 37:20 circumstance 122:23 circumstances 12:15 20:21 26:6 30:8 48:8 48:14 69:19 169:11 cities 4:8,11 43:22 43:25 44:11,16 44:25 89:23 102:8 141:13 143:9 147:17,18 151:11 184:20 citizen 53:5,7 174:8 175:19 citizenry 100:16 citizens 6:12 14:21 35:22 36:5 40:16 45:17 81:6 82:22 90:23 97:17,18 98:10 98:13 100:23 115:25 117:18 117:22,23 121:13 123:4 149:20 150:24 152:10 169:5 177:12,17 187:14 city 1:2,6 3:5,15 7:17,22 9:5 10:17 11:2 14:4 14:21 17:15,19 17:21,25 18:7 18:13 19:8 20:13,19,20 23:23 24:3,4 26:21 33:8 36:15 40:23,25 42:6 43:14,15 43:18 44:3 45:6 46:5 47:17 48:9	49:12 50:19 51:13 52:21 53:2,8 58:15 59:22 60:25 62:17 64:11,23 65:2,10 66:16 69:12 78:17 79:3,18,25 81:6 81:25 83:5 85:12 94:22 101:12 102:2 107:14 109:10 113:2,20,24 115:8,25 116:2 119:18 123:3,7 123:15 124:6 127:5 129:12 131:13 137:6 138:18 142:9 144:25 145:11 149:6 150:7 166:10 168:18 174:11 184:11 187:9 citywide 187:16 City's 149:3 civil 1:3,16 2:5,7 5:21 133:3 148:24 189:10 189:12 civilian 185:21,24 civilians 184:17 clarifies 13:8 class 8:15,18 69:23 94:21 122:6 156:20 classes 8:12 109:13,14 117:5 150:6 155:24,25 156:10,17,19 158:20 clear 143:4 clearly 70:12 close 103:6 closest 163:23 closing 13:7 53:10 53:12 186:2	closings 145:8 cloud 92:16 coach 80:8,9,10 127:24 codes 78:2 coherent 77:3 cohesive 4:2 80:21 collaborated 175:2 collapse 143:22 colleagues 99:9 103:21 109:25 130:22 131:23 collection 133:15 collectively 11:13 comb 76:15 combined 59:20 come 24:4 32:8 63:24 69:23 72:4 73:16 77:17 81:18 93:12 97:5 103:17 107:10 108:20 114:3 115:14 117:6 128:11 131:25 136:6 161:11 164:24 165:8,17 165:19 175:9 180:24 comes 72:11 103:6 108:15 156:21 158:8 168:2 comfort 45:15 coming 8:17 26:11 57:8 59:5 105:24 107:19 109:14 123:8 124:10 155:24 157:25 160:3 162:2 167:13 169:10 178:17 181:11 183:11 command 98:4 103:14 106:19
---	--	--	---	---

116:10,14 117:9 147:23 148:2,18 185:16 commanders 97:22 commend 166:9 comment 2:20 4:18 22:2 87:6 115:9 comments 149:18 commercial 32:22 Commissioner 4:18,22 5:3,10 5:15,19,23 13:22 14:18 15:4,23 16:11 17:12 19:2,4 20:8,22 24:24 25:12 27:6,13 27:19 28:9,14 29:7,13,21 30:2 30:6 32:16 33:4 33:18,22 34:4,9 34:12,18 35:10 35:14,18 36:24 37:3,15,16 38:16 39:14,24 45:5,23 46:20 46:23 47:4,23 48:7,23 49:4 51:17,23 52:5,7 52:11 53:16,23 54:6,18 55:17 56:11,16,21 57:16 58:2,20 58:23 60:4 61:4 61:8 62:10 64:5 64:9 66:4,6,12 66:24 67:5 68:20,25 69:4 69:25 70:7 71:14,22 72:7 72:19 74:4,8 75:21,25 76:2,3 76:3 77:15 78:20 82:3 83:21 84:2	85:21 89:13 90:5,11,14 91:22 94:16 95:4,7,25 97:8 97:21 98:7,15 98:16 99:8,20 101:20 103:8,13 106:20 107:5,24 109:5 110:9 111:8,20 112:2 113:12 114:11 114:14,24 115:23 116:23 118:23 119:9 121:9,25 122:18 123:23 124:25 125:10,17 130:15 142:3 154:16 155:23 156:6,15 158:15 162:22 175:24 180:17 185:4 commissioners 89:22,22 Commissioner's 124:8 commitment 7:23 92:11 165:13 committee 1:3,16 2:4,6 4:17 5:12 5:13,21 13:16 96:19,20 105:25 105:25 133:2 180:14 185:10 186:3,20 189:10 189:12 committees 143:2 common 11:6 communicate 24:17 communicated 104:25 105:9 120:23 Communication 76:10 communications 147:18	communities 25:16 41:4 77:21 83:7 99:4 community 6:10 18:2 19:12,16 19:19 20:15,17 25:20,22 26:16 31:13,22 32:19 32:21,25 33:11 33:12 35:3 36:4 38:25 41:17,24 42:17 49:10 62:13,14 73:8 81:24,25 82:24 91:9,16,25 98:24 100:2 101:5 109:20 110:4 113:13 116:16 117:19 118:2 120:7,15 175:25 companies 25:7 29:17 68:6,11 71:21,25 72:5,8 138:20 149:13 150:3,13 151:3 151:23 157:13 157:13,21 182:10,14,17,19 182:21,23 183:2 183:5,8,13,14 183:20 company 26:7,9 60:14 67:11,13 82:9,10 107:7 135:9,13,18 137:24 138:3,8 138:22 145:8 147:2,5 148:17 153:12 154:19 155:6 157:16,19 184:12,24 185:3 185:17,19 compel 186:3 complain 149:25 complete 148:8 complex 138:18	139:2 184:10 complexes 136:9 137:15 comprehensive 132:2 186:5 comprehensively 131:10 concentration 188:12 concept 102:13 concern 55:8 92:18 94:13 155:10 187:13 concerned 94:5 94:24 115:16 124:17 concerns 5:25 13:11 52:12,14 55:3 116:12 117:3,10 121:7 124:2 153:4,12 conclusion 152:4 condition 143:23 conditions 166:15 166:16,19 167:22 conduct 15:21 146:13 conducted 4:7 15:3,8,11 18:22 143:13 confidence 116:5 confident 128:25 confining 139:4 confrontation 97:2 confronting 30:9 congruity 72:20 74:17 conjunction 109:15 connect 138:19 conscious 149:3 consensus 102:13 consequences 3:21 106:10 consider 44:15	59:23 98:5 116:11,14 121:11,24 161:7 162:21 183:10 consideration 80:15 95:10 130:23 considered 4:12 111:18 considering 186:6 consistent 138:16 consistently 25:7 135:19 140:2 constant 82:23 150:21 constraints 8:5 40:3 construction 184:5 consult 141:21,25 142:9 consultants 38:6 consulted 39:12 51:19 142:13 contacted 39:11 contacts 140:13 contained 190:5 containing 184:10 continue 25:17 65:6 118:9 161:10,18 173:4 173:8 continued 124:4 contract 59:4,9 64:15,19 65:9 144:22 175:16 contracts 92:16 165:21 contrary 185:4 contribute 142:7 contributed 103:16 contributing 144:7 control 116:10 190:23 controlled 7:13
---	---	---	--	---

9:23 10:3 controls 136:14 136:15 conversing 161:9 conversions 93:16 convinced 143:8 convoluted 136:16 cooperation 65:14,14 cop 175:8,11 core 112:23 113:10 129:20 cornered 55:12 correct 46:19 49:3 51:22 53:15 55:16,18 71:13 117:16 119:8 166:21 190:8 corrective 119:3 cost 187:18 Costo 76:7 cost-cutting 146:20 cost-effective 148:9 cost-saving 25:3 Council 1:2 4:17 13:17 45:7 96:22 97:4,10 99:9 103:21 113:3 115:17 116:4,8 124:7 124:16 127:5 131:13 132:20 151:21 171:14 171:22 172:8 173:5 174:11 188:4 Councilman 1:10 1:11,11,12,12 1:13,14 2:2,16 2:18 4:21 5:2,17 13:13 14:17,25 15:6,18 16:7,13 18:20 19:23	21:9,15 22:9,17 23:7,11,21 24:22 27:3,8,17 27:21 28:11 29:5,9,19,23 30:4 32:13,24 33:15,20,24 34:6 35:8,12,16 36:14 37:12,12 46:9,9,11,21,25 47:22 48:16 49:2 51:16,25 52:6,9,24 53:20 54:2,14,20 55:19 56:9,14 56:20 57:12,19 58:18 59:2 60:2 62:19,24 63:4 63:13,23 64:7 64:16,20,24 65:5,12,19,19 65:21 66:11,18 67:4 68:14,21 69:14 70:4 71:10,20,24 72:10 73:25 74:6 75:15,23 76:18 78:6,13 79:19 80:13 81:5 83:11,24 84:15,19 85:10 86:10,21 87:13 87:19,22,25 88:6,7,23 89:9 89:15 90:9 91:19 92:8 94:2 94:14 96:8,8,10 96:13,18,19 97:19 98:14 99:7 101:19 102:4,7 103:11 104:15,19,21,23 105:3,4,5,10,11 105:12,15,16,22 105:25 106:24 107:23 108:6,8 111:7,25 112:3	113:7,16,25 114:2,15,16,19 114:20,21,22 116:7 118:14,25 120:10,11,21 121:23 122:17 124:2,5,6,18 125:4,13,14,15 126:13 127:19 127:21 128:15 130:11,12,14,18 130:18 132:6,11 132:16 152:15 159:3,8,24 160:16 161:4,21 164:18 166:4,4 166:6,25 167:20 168:11,11,16 169:15,25 170:7 170:21,25 171:4 171:19 172:15 173:2,24 178:22 179:24 180:7,11 180:22 181:14 186:10,13,17 188:17,19 189:3 189:5,9 Councilmembers 2:15 122:19 133:3 Councilpeople 115:3 165:8 Councilperson 5:12 Councils 142:10 Councilwoman 1:10,13 5:11 37:13,14,18 39:8,19 43:12 45:24 46:7 91:20,21 93:7 94:18 95:5,15 96:6 124:23 counties 4:9 141:13 countless 9:10 country 4:9 13:19	16:9 18:24 46:22 109:10,25 140:9 counts 114:10 couple 21:20 37:19 46:14 65:22 132:2 161:24 course 19:13 44:2 58:23 135:23 147:2 183:10 court 144:21 courts 101:23 covers 136:3 co-sponsored 115:3 co-workers 139:24 craft 133:11 crash 133:24 crawl 42:21 create 31:22 103:25 110:7,10 131:5,8,14 142:22 151:2 182:9,13 184:15 created 19:5 143:4 150:7 creating 19:9 183:13 creation 103:16 creative 148:6 credence 144:18 crew 3:12 135:7 135:14 137:13 crews 136:22 crime 45:10 criminal 45:11 crises 109:9 crisis 108:18,18 109:2,12 critical 44:6 149:4 182:5 crossbones 61:11 61:15 62:21 cross-training 3:2 crumbling 154:8	cultures 83:6 cul-de-sacs 23:17 curious 96:12 current 6:22 20:21 89:22 102:22 182:6 183:6,18,21 currently 8:15 44:12 107:14 180:4 182:16,22 182:25 Curtis 1:12 2:17 curve 134:19 cut 134:19 cutbacks 146:22 147:21 148:11 149:11 D D 1:13 dad 175:7 Dan 146:11 162:10 164:11 danger 6:14 31:23 100:11 169:2 dangerous 21:21 30:19 147:15 175:20 182:9 184:15 185:10 DAs 99:13 data 15:24,25 38:18 40:2 48:15 49:8 76:9 76:13,14,15 103:22,23,24 131:16,18,20 date 92:23 93:3 95:19 187:7 daughter 78:8 DAVID 1:13 Davidson 76:5,5 day 6:13 11:12 79:17 80:16 97:16 100:15 119:10,10,19 120:16 153:21 155:12 163:15
--	--	---	--	--

164:3 165:19 167:19 172:20 172:22 177:14 177:19 days 179:8,9,11 dead 23:14,16 deal 103:8,9,18 109:17 116:8 dealing 158:19 deals 130:16 death 60:20 146:16 deaths 18:9 42:10 47:19 62:7 109:22 110:5 146:11 185:25 decade 73:4 84:5 111:23 decades 42:10 139:20 December 112:10 146:3 decision 63:14,16 149:3 decisions 76:17 148:19 178:20 decision-making 75:18 decline 101:9,10 decreasing 11:11 11:12 dedicated 6:16 102:12 dedication 149:7 187:24 deeper 126:14,20 defenders 99:13 deficiencies 149:2 defining 187:23 definitely 182:8 definition 114:5 degrees 10:7 delay 116:20 117:11 135:7 delayed 131:25 delaying 117:4 delicately 138:5	deliver 98:25 demand 150:20 demands 140:4 demonstrates 137:7 demonstrating 142:21 demoralizing 174:21 DENNIS 1:12 dense 111:10 department 1:17 2:9,24 3:7 6:4,7 6:14,18 7:8,9 8:22 11:3,8,22 12:11,13 13:6 13:19 14:4 15:3 15:8,21,25 16:2 16:8 18:23 24:7 28:22 30:5 38:7 38:17,22 39:10 43:9 47:17 48:21 49:13,14 49:14 54:13 58:22 64:4,10 65:17 69:17,24 76:19 89:18 91:24 92:15 96:18 97:13 98:2 99:17,21 104:7,12 108:11 111:2 112:17,25 113:5 114:8,9 118:19 121:5,10 132:4 133:8 135:24 139:15 140:23 141:24 142:12 143:13 144:11 145:6,12 146:12,21,23 148:7 149:22 150:11 152:7,20 156:21 163:21 164:24 166:2 168:20,21,22 172:10 174:6,16 177:20 179:4	181:17 185:13 186:3 187:22 departments 4:8 13:23,25 15:16 38:24 47:3 48:4 92:4 99:12 101:22 110:2 112:18 140:9,16 142:9,20 146:13 department's 7:24 35:4 183:6 183:16 186:7 187:3 department-wide 148:6 depend 176:9 depends 47:6 159:9 deplorable 154:7 deputy 19:22 21:11,16 22:12 22:20 64:4,9,14 64:18,22 65:3,8 70:16 76:2,2,3,6 85:9 87:5,17 88:5,13 104:18 104:22 105:8,14 113:22 114:24 123:25 124:14 124:21 126:11 130:25 132:8,14 132:18 133:7 148:6 151:5 156:3 157:3 166:23 167:4 169:22 describe 174:20 described 25:2 85:21 182:8 describing 78:24 deserve 177:24 designation 24:5 desirable 9:6 desire 123:2 desired 140:3 desk 136:20 details 97:3	determination 123:12 determine 15:22 determined 123:11 determining 10:12 detriment 54:25 97:18 Detroit 15:14 devastating 138:3 develop 9:17 17:24 107:21 developed 38:3 146:16 developing 39:13 39:22 development 104:10 106:5 108:13,24 147:11,16 152:3 182:5 Devlin 76:3 devoted 144:4 dialogue 124:4,16 124:19 Diane 178:2 179:7 dictate 148:19 die 129:7 Diego 15:13 different 3:4,12 7:17,17 10:18 10:25 16:3 17:25 26:18 30:13 38:19 40:14,22 44:21 49:10 54:8 58:16 75:4,5 79:7 81:13,15 83:6 90:17 94:22 101:11,14 108:19 123:13 123:14,14,15 157:15 168:23 169:13 174:6 difficult 85:7 digging 162:19	dinner 178:15,15 direct 25:9 185:18 190:23 directed 63:6 125:18 directing 185:19 direction 77:6 113:19 122:25 131:21 directive 26:13 28:5 70:9 73:6 directives 50:15 70:20 74:23 directly 136:12 Director 19:24 155:2 156:3 disabilities 103:19 disability 126:6 143:21 disabled 145:24 disagreed 52:17 disaster 19:12 78:16 183:19 discard 44:2 disciplined 172:3 discuss 13:11 124:15 discussed 3:25 135:5 discusses 44:19 discussion 3:19 28:4,6 93:23 94:19 126:22 176:23 discussions 27:10 disdain 149:19 disfigurement 143:25 disgraceful 65:17 172:11 dislikes 169:7 dismay 147:19 dispatcher 76:11 displaced 49:20 49:20 50:5 disrespect 97:9
--	--	---	---	--

disrespectfully 63:10 64:2 disruption 187:17 dissection 187:15 distant 131:8 distinguished 5:22 district 45:7,8,10 70:23,25 73:18 98:25 99:24 142:10 184:9,23 districts 11:2 diversity 3:3 23:22 division 31:21 134:23 156:24 157:4 divisions 134:7 156:24 160:14 DNA 96:13 documents 141:8 dog 181:7 doing 4:10,13 19:8 20:18,18 22:22 25:3 30:25 31:6,8 32:7 33:7 34:21 34:22 42:16 43:4,21 44:12 44:25 46:6 47:15 61:23 69:9 75:4,8,9 76:25 78:4 79:14,17 80:11 82:25 84:14 86:18,19 87:8 88:15 89:19,24 91:2 98:18,19 99:12 100:24 101:22 102:6,8 110:11 120:13 120:14 121:5 175:24 177:2 door 62:3 139:13 doors 61:11,13,17 dossier 104:13 double 8:15,18	doubt 120:23 128:10 doubts 121:12 123:18 downs 128:6 downsides 3:14 downturn 8:11 downturns 16:4 dozen 103:15 draw 48:13 drilled 155:12 drive 71:8 147:7 driven 145:25 driver 26:16 73:10 137:19 146:24 drop 20:6 34:2 92:22 93:3 95:12,13,16 97:21,22 107:25 109:15 126:10 135:17 dropped 97:25 drown 154:11 due 8:16 20:6 103:13 115:20 123:21 145:24 147:21 148:10 149:2 150:4 188:3 duplex 93:16,18 duties 72:6 118:7 duty 61:12 75:8 126:7 dynamic 73:22 74:12 dynasty 127:23 128:2,2 E earlier 72:3 94:2 early 23:24 149:7 163:13 178:15 easier 154:15 155:9 164:13 easily 156:16 Easter 163:6,7,8	echoing 130:17 economic 8:10 economy 142:15 educate 61:16 97:6 educated 81:22 144:5 education 10:25 70:23,25 73:18 78:3 98:25 99:24 100:21 133:15,19 Edward 132:8 152:19 effect 44:7 106:8 161:18 178:12 effective 11:22 15:11,20 33:2 45:17 133:23 135:3 138:9 141:23 147:13 176:5 effectively 10:9 effects 53:4 efficacy 97:7 106:2 efficient 141:23 effort 141:22 143:9 152:8 eight 79:11 either 35:20 46:15 148:19 164:12 178:14 183:20 elected 53:6 127:4 election 188:3 electrician 127:8 element 70:21 elevator 136:14 139:4 eliminate 149:3 eliminated 146:23 147:10 157:22 elimination 145:9 147:20 embrace 98:5,9 embraced 130:19 179:7,9	emergencies 133:13 147:8 emergency 9:2 120:17 133:17 146:25 184:13 187:15 employee 168:3,8 168:13,13 employees 63:18 168:19 employee/empl... 168:15 employer 64:2 169:4 employer-empl... 63:11 empty 34:15 EMS 76:13 137:8 138:15 141:3,18 149:23 151:25 encompass 160:12 encounter 32:4 encourages 142:3 ends 23:16 enforcing 102:14 engage 131:17 engaging 62:13 engine 37:9 67:10 135:9 151:25 154:24 155:15 155:15 160:8,9 162:16 167:9 171:9 182:10 184:24 engineers 136:19 engines 157:14 engrained 165:17 enhance 9:7 18:11 97:16 110:18 117:24 181:18 enhanced 17:17 enhancing 18:5 110:14 enjoy 36:10 61:25 enjoys 102:16 149:6	enlightened 134:8 enormous 141:17 ensure 10:21 12:13 26:15 69:16 71:3,17 72:22 73:6 78:22 83:3 91:4 102:21 ensuring 70:17 98:20 181:22 enter 8:16,19 9:11 entered 160:2 entering 9:10 82:19 entire 6:11 11:8 12:6 24:9 33:8 41:20 42:6 65:16 73:17 111:2 138:13 187:9 entirety 115:7 environment 7:13 9:23 10:3 82:17 82:20 150:23 170:17 environments 11:20 epidemiologists 103:22 131:18 epidemiology 113:18 equal 7:21 10:16 equated 187:8 equipment 92:12 error 135:4 escape 146:5 especially 76:13 essence 130:5 essential 7:18 essentially 99:17 establish 103:25 established 186:6 establishment 143:3 et 32:22 147:8 ethic 139:21 evacuate 73:13
--	--	---	---	--

evenhanded 10:12	33:9 41:9 56:2 57:6,13 58:9	eye 36:4 eyes 92:3	117:4 120:6 155:3	16:8 18:9,23 22:25 24:11
event 91:25	73:2,3,4 79:2,11	F	farther 160:10	28:22 31:14,18
events 112:16 131:2	82:17 86:4 89:3 107:21 110:13	face 121:6,11 150:9 174:18	father 164:21 179:2,15	31:19,21 32:2,5 32:19 35:3 38:6
eventually 50:8	110:20,20,25,25	faces 129:5	favoritism 10:9	38:17 39:10
everybody 20:11 26:3,8 37:21	115:13 122:9,9 122:10,12,14	facial 143:24	fear 166:19 167:23	42:9,21 43:3,9 45:5,10,13
50:25 52:17	127:12,20	facilitate 2:11 181:20	feel 45:3,8 80:23 83:14 128:25	47:17 48:4,20 51:3 54:8 57:4
57:17 106:22	133:15,21	facilities 18:6 138:18 139:2	129:8 132:23 153:17 174:14	58:13 61:13 70:17,22,24
128:12 172:18	134:18 143:18	facing 4:4 20:4 131:16	180:15	72:17 73:17 74:18 76:10,19
evidence 113:18 190:4	156:8 164:19 176:19 182:2,4 185:3	fact 11:10 39:3 87:7 124:9	feeling 167:5	77:12 78:8,9,14 78:15 81:16
evidence-based 103:20	experienced 48:20 55:23	172:10 185:11	feet 149:10	82:6,11 91:8,24 92:2 94:8 96:17
EVOC 146:25	127:15 137:23	factor 45:15	felt 171:23 186:23	97:12 98:2,24 99:4,17,21,23
evolving 113:15	182:18 185:16 187:16	factories 93:15	field 8:17,19,21	100:17,18,19 102:9,22 104:7
exact 53:17	experiences 14:8 18:17 78:23	facts 61:7,9,9 187:2	Fifteen 51:5	104:11 108:11 109:22 110:5,15
exactly 33:5	101:12 111:5	failings 118:17,18 118:19,24 119:2	fight 32:19 72:17 77:12 81:16,19	112:10,11,13,17 112:25 113:4
exam 142:18	135:21 141:14 142:7	119:25	fighting 79:16	114:8 115:23 118:20 119:13
examination 37:4	expertise 93:9 101:24 115:12	fair 7:20 20:12 167:21 172:23	figure 161:8 173:8	119:14,21,22 123:5 129:14,19
examine 31:17	136:7	178:17	file 127:8 143:6 149:6	129:22 130:5 131:3,4 132:4
example 23:24 56:25 146:24	explain 28:8,12 81:8,9 89:18	fairness 63:2,5	filing 39:5 144:25	133:8 136:17 137:8,21 138:20
147:9	explained 10:11 143:2	familiar 41:5,16 41:18,20 99:16	fill 67:25 137:10 158:9 160:22	139:4,7,12,15 140:8,12,13,16
excellent 120:3 162:4	explaining 82:16 106:2	99:22 100:7 101:4,5,16	filled 53:14,15 67:9,10 68:3	140:23 141:17 141:24 142:11
excuse 29:7 34:15 35:21 61:21	exploited 138:12	153:13 154:20 156:10	financial 109:12 148:16	142:20 143:13 144:11,12,13,14
70:2 76:7 107:6	expose 148:25	familiarity 99:15	find 37:11 44:3 103:5 105:17	145:6,12,18 146:21,23
173:21	exposing 10:24	familiarization 26:17	148:23 151:11 180:19	149:22 151:10 152:6,20 153:22
executive 38:19 75:17,22 76:4,6 76:7	express 185:9	families 174:5,15 177:2,4 178:13	finding 153:24	153:24 154:25 155:14 156:21
exemplary 119:7	expressed 121:8	178:19	finds 31:19	163:5,21 164:22
exercised 143:22	expressing 121:12	family 78:9,17 133:25 170:19	finish 23:12	
exist 113:23	Expressway 5:14	170:20 178:18 188:11,14	finished 180:18	
exists 113:4	extended 160:25 161:2	far 60:21 99:25 101:8 108:9	fire 1:17 2:9,23 3:7,8,8 4:8 5:22	
expect 50:20 63:24 148:16 149:5	extent 130:20		6:4,9,18 7:9,15 8:22,25 10:5,25	
expected 10:15	extra 67:7 141:16		11:3,10 13:5,19 13:23 14:4 15:2	
expecting 136:19	extreme 135:12		15:7,20,24 16:2	
expensive 144:21	extremely 2:25 9:23			
experience 10:8 10:22 11:19 20:13,14,16				

165:25 174:6,16 176:2 177:19 179:4 181:17 182:16 183:6,11 184:5,12,19 185:12,22 186:3 187:7 fired 80:9 firefighter 1:17 2:10 19:21 41:15 42:8,12 42:14 43:9 50:23 70:13 72:11 75:12 77:8 101:18 123:4 128:18 133:16 139:23 140:15 141:4,6 145:19 152:23 160:21 162:11 167:9 170:2,3 170:13,23 171:6 171:7,8 175:7 175:12 177:8,9 179:2 182:6 184:22,25 185:24 firefighters 2:13 3:17,23 4:3,13 6:3,20 8:7,20 9:6 10:23 12:25 13:20 17:2,5,16 17:23 18:10,15 19:15 21:23 24:14 26:10,23 28:19 29:16 30:21 32:3,14 32:20 33:10,16 33:23 35:23 40:21 41:23 49:24 50:22 51:6,15 55:9 58:7 61:12,23 62:11 69:20 70:9 71:11,16 72:16,23,25 74:7,9,21 77:16	79:2,7,10,21,23 82:22 83:3,12 84:5,22 85:19 91:5 97:7,15 98:20 101:11 107:11,12,19 109:20 110:18 110:22 111:5,23 112:12,20 117:16,25 118:17 119:11 119:14,20 120:2 121:4,14 122:11 126:4 128:3 130:4 133:6,13 137:5 140:11 144:5,24 145:14 145:23 146:4,8 147:6 148:5 152:11 153:15 160:2 161:25 165:16 167:16 169:7 174:7,17 181:19,23 182:18,20,24 183:4,9,11 184:16 186:8 187:11,20 188:23 firefighter's 19:11 23:25 175:18 firefighting 24:10 50:19 81:24 98:22 101:8 110:12 116:16 118:21 119:6 129:21 133:12 firehouse 58:21 70:8 84:6 111:24 120:14 128:20 129:10 129:25 159:18 170:18 firehouses 12:20 36:15 54:3 55:2 70:6 79:8 92:6	94:6 122:8 fireman 170:13 178:25 185:6 firemen 162:4,4 fires 11:11,15,16 14:7 18:3,9,10 18:14 30:23 32:10,11 42:12 75:10 77:23,24 77:25 78:3,5,7 78:11 79:16 82:18,23 91:12 91:18 100:5,13 109:21 110:16 110:17 119:11 119:19 129:12 141:16 151:24 154:5 firm 125:5,8 first 4:19 6:21 11:17 25:13 32:11 36:6 50:24 65:23 82:4 91:2 99:5 100:19 105:21 106:21 109:6 132:12 150:13 156:2,3 158:23 170:11 171:22 176:18 firsthand 138:24 first-rate 149:22 fiscal 104:8 114:4 fit 69:11 five 7:2 12:21 40:19,20 52:16 58:5,8 65:16 67:14 68:6,11 72:25 79:11 81:18 84:7,10 102:21 122:11 122:13 126:2,9 140:21 142:11 144:10 152:24 157:5,15 159:13 176:15,17 184:21 185:2,6	five-year 6:24 63:8 136:24 fix 189:4 flames 146:6 float 159:6,13 160:2 floated 159:14,15 159:16,19,20 floating 160:5 floor 135:14,18 136:13 146:5 floors 154:7 FLSA 144:22 fluctuation 184:14 fluency 134:17 focus 161:11 focused 113:8,9 folks 14:9 22:18 22:18 25:21 26:2 27:14 28:20 30:13 36:21 39:2 42:22 49:18 56:19 58:7 61:18 62:3 93:2 94:21 95:17 101:13,15 follow 19:23 99:8 following 10:10 50:15 79:15 follow-up 97:20 125:13 football 127:23 FOP 142:6 force 9:10,25 88:10 102:19 128:4 167:3 forced 3:17 17:11 32:14 173:13 forces 14:7 forcibly 17:2 forcing 8:12 86:19 foregoing 190:7 190:20 foreman 127:13	foremost 91:3 forever 118:9 forget 164:10,11 form 118:7 formal 148:22 formed 50:10 former 89:21 forming 77:18 forth 1:17 2:8 181:11 fortifying 7:23 Forty-one 180:10 forum 97:5 forward 8:23 33:7 35:24 42:18 49:16 52:18 58:17 62:18 69:12 83:22 84:3 91:8,14 105:24 108:15 109:24 117:7,12 122:14 125:24 126:8 131:22 148:10 174:13 fostered 25:5 fought 129:11 found 140:14 145:20 founded 102:11 four 67:12,13 68:6 90:16 95:17 126:9 128:5,6 145:13 150:5 156:10,22 fourth 162:12 fracturing 141:19 frankly 168:17 frantically 135:13 free 132:23 frequent 138:21 friend 78:9 163:23 177:8 friends 55:13 164:22 177:10 front 14:5 40:2 136:20 frustrating 84:21
---	---	---	---	--

frustration 63:8	189:3,7	73:7,8,9,10,10	82:25 83:8,9	123:13 124:22
fulfill 8:13	Gelman 186:15	73:11,14,16	85:4,5,10 86:5,6	132:25 168:13
fulfilling 96:14	186:15,19	77:5,6,17,20,21	86:7 87:8,19	178:6,7
full 123:10 136:21	general 24:25	83:17 84:9 86:5	88:9,20 89:21	Goode 1:11 2:15
143:21 188:5	28:3 139:14	87:14 88:4,18	89:25 90:10,22	gotten 120:5
fully 59:3 126:14	141:6 181:16	89:6 98:23	91:13,18 92:23	government
133:22 137:12	generalists	100:9 107:15,20	95:22 97:16,23	18:21 102:18
184:23 185:5	134:15	109:11,24	98:5,20 99:3,6	go-to 153:19
190:5	generally 169:12	113:19 118:6	99:14 100:5,11	GPS 23:8
full-rounded 83:5	generals 27:22,24	119:20 120:25	100:12,15 101:9	graded 142:19
function 96:15	generated 148:15	128:16 129:18	101:15,23	gradual 150:10
185:20	genesis 169:16	132:12 157:9,10	104:17 108:12	graduate 156:13
fund 8:11	gentlemen 92:7	157:11 158:11	110:19,24 111:3	graduated 12:25
fundamental	93:8	160:9 163:14,25	111:8 113:16,23	graduation 69:6
85:11 131:21	geographic 42:3	168:5,24 170:11	117:6,7,13,15	165:9
151:24	48:11	172:2,20 183:15	117:24 118:5,9	grand 148:24
fundraisers 55:10	geographical	goal 6:11 11:16	120:14 122:14	187:17
funeral 163:21	154:21	33:2 83:22 84:2	122:15 125:21	grandfather
further 13:11	getting 49:5 51:11	88:11	126:17 127:11	175:7
124:15 147:9	71:4 112:5	goals 6:15 103:25	131:21 132:22	grandparents
157:6	116:3 117:5,23	116:15	134:22 154:9,10	129:7
future 7:8,24	137:16 157:7	God 35:17 180:11	155:24 157:9,10	grant 22:13
10:24 16:6 18:7	165:21 172:3	goes 31:19 42:18	157:11 158:2	grave 94:13
18:8,12 20:5	give 4:16 11:18	79:6 99:11	160:7,9 161:16	great 30:24 43:13
32:8 34:20,23	25:21 38:13	125:6 164:13	161:25 162:23	60:6 90:2,3
36:4 42:7,8,13	39:20 49:6 58:4	168:14	162:24 163:10	171:15,16
42:18,24 43:10	65:13,14 77:7	going 11:20 18:10	163:12,14,17,25	177:25
47:16 51:13	107:18 161:14	21:7,22 22:24	164:10,11 168:7	greater 3:3 56:3
52:19,21 58:14	given 104:20	23:3,4,18 24:22	169:12 173:10	181:19
62:18 98:21	117:10 121:7	26:7,12 30:17	175:9 176:11	greeted 129:4
100:15 101:18	124:8,9 137:2	30:19 31:13	186:24	grievances 39:5
110:7,10 117:17	141:24 148:21	32:18,21,22	good 2:2 5:2,8,15	ground 82:6,11
131:8 167:6	150:15 158:25	33:16,21 37:20	5:17,19 24:10	149:10 155:14
188:7	gives 20:11 136:3	40:4,13 42:9,11	24:11,11 34:23	167:18
futures 36:10	147:25 151:19	42:23 43:8	34:24 37:14,16	ground-level
	giving 84:7,9	45:16 50:24	48:9 50:18	134:12
	145:7	51:2,4 55:22	51:12,14 52:21	group 31:4,7
G	glad 93:25	58:3,6,14 62:7	56:15,17 60:13	80:21 92:24
gain 14:8 149:18	go 16:18,20 17:24	62:12,18 63:20	77:3,16,20	131:14 136:11
gained 3:11	19:16 21:7,24	69:7,11,12	80:20,21 82:12	174:22 187:4
Garden 27:11	22:18 26:8,19	70:23 72:24	96:17 98:10,12	groups 143:3
28:18	30:15,23 31:10	74:10,15 75:11	111:11 113:19	176:3
garnered 143:5	31:25 35:3,24	75:11,13 77:4,6	113:24 115:24	grow 10:22 129:6
Garvin 173:21	37:24 40:7	77:9,11,13,23	117:18,21	179:15
174:3,4	49:15 50:4	77:25 78:2,4,11	118:22 119:15	growing 3:22
gather 142:24	54:24 55:10	78:16 79:9,16	120:16,19,22	109:8 164:21
Gault 21:20 22:13	58:6 66:3 70:8	81:11 82:20,21	121:5,9,10	guess 16:24 44:5
22:21 188:20,21				

68:17 72:3,13 75:19 83:16,17 84:16 127:22 166:11 guidance 56:6 134:4 guide 136:11 guy 24:6 74:14 77:5,9 80:7 129:24 154:2,4 154:24 155:6,8 155:20 162:12 guys 57:3 58:19 89:24 93:11,13 129:19,20 153:5 153:18 154:14 154:22 155:5 157:8,20 158:8 162:18 163:4,19 163:22,25 164:3 164:15 169:10 172:15 176:25 177:6,17,24	107:25 109:9,10 109:19 happening 14:12 32:11 47:9 59:16 60:9,21 73:24 74:25 90:21 107:22 111:6 122:18 171:25 happens 27:2 31:15 45:5,9 47:12 72:22 73:7,20 74:16 80:6,7,8 119:17 happy 13:9 106:12,14,22 107:2 168:13 169:11 hard 30:21 109:19 153:24 171:10,17 harder 153:16 hardships 84:11 Hargett 76:2 harm 6:14 Harrisburg 108:10 hasty 3:21 hazards 82:24 112:20 heads 38:12 healing 164:2,14 health 36:23 112:16 168:22 healthcare 114:6 hear 11:23 12:3,4 14:10 28:21 30:18 43:12 48:2 105:6 115:6 136:2 189:5,6 heard 40:8 108:9 108:19 hearing 2:4,19 21:19 102:16 104:4,19,23,25 112:4 115:15,18	130:21 180:23 188:25 hearings 1:16 2:7 87:2 94:4 115:5 heart 133:25 heavy-handed 149:11 heavy-run 36:21 heeds 93:20 heightened 8:4 held 6:6 30:15 137:25 help 7:7 32:15,20 56:6 71:12,15 108:3 189:4 helps 32:16 Henon 1:11 2:16 37:13 46:10,11 46:21,25 47:22 48:16 49:2 51:16,25 52:6,9 52:24 53:20 54:2,14,20 55:19 56:9,14 56:20 57:12,19 58:18 59:2 60:2 92:8 98:14 102:7 120:11 124:6 125:14,15 126:13 127:19 130:19 166:5,6 166:25 167:20 168:11 Henry 76:7 Hey 56:22 57:2 he'll 169:9 Hi 174:3 high 28:25 110:16 136:8 146:2 184:9 highest 19:20 highly 147:11 high-rise 141:17 145:17 hire 109:13 hired 150:8 hiring 94:21	150:4,10 Hispanic 24:14,17 history 30:5 59:6 59:7,9 66:16 hoc 85:22 Hogan 178:24,25 hold 1:16 2:7 62:24,25 68:13 133:7 160:20 180:3 holds 87:10 180:16 holes 154:6 holiday 163:8 home 58:22 139:7 168:24 homes 92:9 Honest 35:16 honestly 123:20 honor 66:25 67:2 158:4 honored 57:21 59:6 65:25 66:5 66:8,21 hope 13:7 44:14 92:19 93:19 122:24 128:6 hopefully 28:2 130:12 horns 172:9 hospital 136:17 138:19 139:5,7 139:11 163:16 hospitalized 145:20 hospitals 101:6 136:10 host 85:14,16 145:9 hostile 170:17 hour 156:5 hours 143:17 148:20 house 36:20 55:4 81:12,14,15 89:4 164:25 178:3,3	housed 162:8 houses 54:4 81:20 92:8 93:11 Houston 15:14 huge 4:3 48:18 53:4 human 168:9 hundreds 9:12 42:9 hurdle 164:8 hurricanes 149:9 hurt 6:13 11:25 68:24 husband 175:5 176:7,12 177:9 177:11,20 178:13,25 179:8 179:12 husband's 175:10 HVAC 136:12 hydrant 57:5 73:9 hydrants 136:16 hyperbole 152:9
H				I
H 132:15 133:4 Hail 128:5 Hairston 156:6 158:15 half 103:15 156:5 Hall 1:6 115:8 hallway 42:21 135:11 handed 133:20 handle 79:24 84:12 141:16 143:9 hands-on 110:15 hang 173:13 hanging 165:12 happen 26:18 29:20 40:9 51:5 64:12 73:5 82:13,25 175:17 186:24 happened 25:24 40:9 50:3				idea 38:13 90:3,3 96:17,20 97:5 108:4,9 162:21 ideal 12:23 150:3 160:24 ideas 135:5 142:8 144:16 150:16 150:19 175:3 identified 119:2 121:4 identifies 112:23 identify 5:3 15:2 15:7 112:19 132:12 152:16 170:11 178:23 179:25 186:14 idiosyncrasies 184:3 ignorant 176:21 illegal 93:16 imagine 84:21 134:25

imbalance 122:21	including 3:22	initiate 1:17 2:10	interjection 181:9	James 1:10 132:8
immediate 20:5	129:13 152:10	initiated 53:2	International	132:14 133:4
119:3	183:24	139:15	144:14	January 69:8
immediately	inclusion 126:21	initiative 25:4	interrupt 47:24	155:25 158:20
133:16 135:3	incompetency	116:11,17	165:6	183:19,25 188:5
137:18	179:16	initiatives 145:10	interruption 3:25	Jefferson 145:16
immune 109:11	inconsistency	149:4	interview 156:5	jeopardize 36:22
impacts 150:17	182:11	injured 67:23	intricacies 137:14	jeopardy 57:13
impasse 123:9	inconsistent	68:12 112:12	introducing	job 6:8,10 12:22
imperative	182:7	145:14,18 146:8	130:16	30:24 31:2,11
137:14	increase 185:22	160:21	inundates 152:9	32:10 50:16
implement 46:18	185:23	injuries 75:12	investigating	61:25 68:8
121:2,15,16	increased 3:6,9	145:25 185:24	119:16	73:19 75:4,9
implementation	20:7	injury 146:15,18	investigation	77:16,20 80:11
104:2 116:21	increasing 183:12	160:18,25	146:14	82:12 91:10
123:20 124:12	incredible 185:20	innovative 47:9	investigations	107:19 115:24
125:3,5 126:18	indefinitely	input 39:12 52:6	146:12,19	119:15 120:13
126:23 131:12	121:20	52:10,12,13	involuntarily	120:14,16,20,22
131:24	indicate 18:23	117:11 141:9	17:11	121:5 154:14
implemented	indicated 53:13	142:4 153:8	involve 143:11	155:4,9 158:24
2:23 13:4	individual 2:25	158:13,14	151:5	165:20 168:23
116:13 123:17	23:15 102:2	inspectors 142:4	involved 75:20	168:24 169:18
156:16 158:17	151:15	142:5	142:21,25	169:18 172:21
184:24 185:6	individuals 30:25	install 73:11	144:11	jobs 91:6
implementing	87:10	127:5	involvement	Joe 154:4 162:11
3:14 7:25 38:10	industrial 136:9	instance 56:13	150:22	162:15 170:14
43:23 120:24	137:15	67:21 68:4	involving 144:22	John 163:23
importance 8:3	inexperience 55:4	183:22	in-depth 146:14	164:10,23
155:20	182:9	instances 56:12	in-service 26:13	joined 5:12,13
important 28:8	inexperienced	Institute 112:15	70:10,11 155:3	Jones 1:12 2:17
28:10,13 38:2	127:14 182:14	instruct 141:15	in-surge 48:18	96:19 105:25
47:21 58:21,25	182:24 183:4	147:6	issue 4:3 27:24	Jose 162:16 171:8
74:2,5,9 80:18	influx 150:5	instructor 156:9	94:4,7 105:21	Joseph 180:3
93:19 112:6	157:25	instructors	109:17 122:20	Joseph's 139:5
145:9	information	141:12	125:6 161:11	JR 1:11,12
impressive 16:15	48:15 104:4,17	instructs 138:4	173:7	judge 173:11
imprinted 139:20	104:24 108:20	insulting 180:20	issues 16:3 20:4	jump 108:16
improve 10:22	116:2 142:24	integrity 137:13	60:7 62:15 96:4	109:6 132:23
improvement	151:19 154:12	165:14	96:5 97:13	June 158:2
150:21	164:20	intending 36:20	112:6,24 113:8	junior 138:5
incident 146:7	informational	interact 120:6	113:9 120:12	182:20
148:18 154:23	130:24	interest 126:16	122:2,4,21	jurisdictions 20:3
incidents 145:13	infrastructure	161:15	124:15,22	jury 148:24
146:15 148:3	114:5,9 136:21	interested 38:9	131:10,15	justify 144:10
include 6:21	initial 69:23 70:2	47:13 142:25		
includes 184:4	138:10	144:6		
185:13	initially 174:23	interior 154:10		
			J	K
			Jack 186:15	keep 6:13 42:20

57:18 85:10	112:4	138:18 153:11	57:1 58:1 59:1	165:1 166:1
93:10 141:18	Kensington	153:18,19	60:1 61:1 62:1	167:1 168:1
148:21 172:5	146:10	154:19,25	63:1 64:1 65:1	169:1 170:1
175:22	kept 102:22	155:17,22 160:7	66:1 67:1 68:1	171:1 172:1
Kenney 1:10 2:2	155:23 176:17	163:25 165:7	69:1 70:1 71:1	173:1 174:1
4:21 5:2,17,20	key 70:21 72:15	167:5,6,13	72:1 73:1 74:1	175:1 176:1
13:13 14:17,25	kicked 174:18	168:9,10 169:8	75:1 76:1 77:1	177:1 178:1
15:6,18 16:7,13	kid 155:16	175:16,21 176:7	78:1 79:1 80:1	179:1 180:1
18:20 21:9,15	kids 103:18 129:6	176:16,16	81:1 82:1 83:1	181:1 182:1
22:9,17 23:7,11	killed 112:12	177:14,16	84:1 85:1 86:1	183:1 184:1
23:21 24:22	145:15 163:6	178:11,16	87:1 88:1 89:1	185:1 186:1
27:3,8,17,21	kind 15:8 28:4	knowing 71:6	90:1 91:1 92:1	187:1 188:1
28:11 29:5,9,19	36:17 39:20	136:25	93:1 94:1 95:1	189:1,10,12
29:23 30:4	43:23 46:19	knowledge 3:4,6	96:1 97:1 98:1	lack 53:13,14
32:13,24 33:15	57:13 108:17	20:16 51:3,6	99:1 100:1	108:22,23,23
33:20,24 34:6	116:16 120:10	83:5 89:11	101:1 102:1	137:7 150:4
35:8,12,16	121:4 125:5	101:24 102:23	103:1 104:1	168:25 169:16
36:14 37:12	161:9 166:19	130:3 134:6	105:1 106:1	ladder 67:12
46:9 62:19,24	172:4 175:2	136:21 137:8	107:1 108:1	135:13,15
63:4,13,23 64:7	kitchen 31:2 50:5	138:11,25 184:2	109:1 110:1	151:25 153:14
64:16,20,24	179:11	known 109:2	111:1 112:1	153:22 162:9,13
65:5,12,19	knew 153:15	knows 45:13,14	113:1 114:1	163:24 170:14
87:13,22,25	154:8	55:24 77:4	115:1 116:1	182:10 183:23
88:7,23 89:9,15	knock 61:13	94:15 176:12	117:1 118:1	184:7,24
90:9 91:19 94:2	knocking 61:17		119:1 120:1	ladders 157:14
94:14 96:8	know 14:11 15:19	L	121:1 122:1	laid 120:10,11
102:4 105:4,5	17:19 20:2,25	L 190:15	123:1 124:1	153:3 156:14
105:11,22 108:6	21:24 22:23,24	labeling 106:13	125:1 126:1	land 108:9
114:19 120:10	23:4,18,22	Labor 1:3,16 2:5	127:1 128:1	language 24:16
124:5 125:13	27:18,23 28:16	2:6 3:1 4:1 5:1	129:1 130:1	94:4 96:4
128:15 130:11	31:5,7 37:21	5:21 6:1 7:1 8:1	131:1 132:1	languages 94:22
130:18 132:6,11	38:11 39:22	9:1 10:1 11:1	133:1,2 134:1	large 13:24 136:8
132:16,25	46:3 53:20 55:5	12:1 13:1 14:1	135:1 136:1	larger 42:2,3
152:15 159:3,24	55:10 57:3,9	15:1 16:1 17:1	137:1 138:1	109:16,17
160:16 161:4,21	58:24 64:14	18:1 19:1 20:1	139:1 140:1	lasting 147:24
164:18 166:4	65:3,5,25 68:16	21:1 22:1 23:1	141:1 142:1	late 24:15 178:15
168:12,16	70:21 77:5,6,9	24:1 25:1 26:1	143:1 144:1	latent 134:20
169:15,25 170:7	80:19 88:24	27:1 28:1 29:1	145:1 146:1	law 102:20
170:21,25 171:4	93:2,13,14,17	30:1 31:1 32:1	147:1 148:1	lawsuit 144:23
171:19 173:2,24	94:19 95:17	33:1 34:1 35:1	149:1 150:1	lawsuits 148:15
178:22 179:24	100:8 106:3	36:1 37:1 38:1	151:1 152:1	148:24
180:7,11,22	107:11 112:5	39:1 40:1 41:1	153:1 154:1	lawyer 170:16
181:14 186:10	115:24 119:23	42:1 43:1 44:1	155:1 156:1	lay 142:23 169:3
186:13,17	123:2 125:6	45:1 46:1 47:1	157:1 158:1	172:21
188:17,19 189:5	127:3 129:5,5	48:1 49:1 50:1	159:1 160:1	layout 48:11
189:9	129:14 135:22	51:1 52:1 53:1	161:1 162:1	Leader 2:17
Kenney's 96:19	137:14 138:12	54:1 55:1 56:1	163:1 164:1	leaders 86:8

140:14	153:14 159:11	150:25 152:8	15:23,25 16:3	lying 167:6
leadership 3:24	159:14,20 162:9	153:5 184:4,23	38:21,23 39:2,4	175:22
51:20	162:14 167:7	186:16,20	39:14,17,21	
leading 80:8	176:9,20	188:22	40:15 43:7,11	M
learn 7:14,19 10:4	lieutenants 41:22	locals 137:23	47:14 84:4 95:8	machine 135:6
41:4 81:19	55:7 147:13	187:13	177:15	magically 23:4
98:24 100:8,23	159:5	locate 140:10	looking 12:5 14:3	magnitude
129:17 140:3	lieutenant's 41:13	located 180:5	14:10 18:5,12	105:21
learned 9:7 15:19	life 6:11 123:16	184:8	25:14 37:8,11	main 27:14 80:18
130:20 146:16	126:25 127:4,6	location 19:6 21:6	39:5,25 40:17	maintaining
167:15,17	143:24 164:19	66:13	42:20 46:2,4	135:10
learning 31:12	167:11 169:3	locations 4:6 7:16	47:6,8,19,19	major 4:11 13:18
50:16 128:24	172:23 175:13	7:22 9:4,5,11,19	48:24 49:8	101:22 129:12
134:19	185:13	10:17 21:23	84:11 95:14	134:21 140:22
leave 16:17 30:21	lifeblood 139:17	49:21 107:15	96:3,5 97:2	141:3 142:11
30:22 96:25	lifelong 164:22	136:15	100:4,14 107:24	144:10 148:13
121:9 140:19	limited 92:13	lock 169:9	110:14 111:22	184:20
150:19 163:12	line 79:14 104:12	logic 87:7,10	112:24 116:19	majority 2:17
177:16 183:20	119:20 135:11	88:21	looks 92:2 101:18	12:7
leaves 179:12	138:10 158:11	logs 104:14	176:12,13	making 8:14 11:6
183:3	172:22	long 11:4 18:19	Los 15:12 48:10	36:3 61:17 69:9
leaving 33:17,25	Lisa 178:24	24:13 29:3,11	lose 80:5,5 119:18	69:10 75:9 91:9
163:18	list 44:18 48:5	29:14 40:11	138:7	99:25 100:22
left 55:5 95:13	162:20 170:2	42:21 49:19	losing 8:7,9 40:5	110:6 134:7
140:5 168:8	183:6	57:2 89:4 97:23	126:5 138:4	165:18
legacy 121:10	listen 90:12	164:9 183:15	loss 148:14,14	Malia 155:7
legal 145:4	listening 105:17	longer 4:4 6:23	lost 162:9 163:23	man 153:20 171:5
legislative 161:17	170:8	32:25 76:23,25	179:10	176:11
legislator 96:14	liter 77:13	long-term 67:22	lot 27:4 29:17	management
lends 144:18	literature 61:14	67:24 110:20	30:11,12,12	103:10 127:25
lengthy 132:23	little 52:16 54:21	look 16:6,14	38:11 50:7 53:9	141:3,15 147:14
144:21	121:2 139:3	17:18 31:25	55:6,9 56:19	148:12 151:7
Lessons 146:16	148:22 152:25	34:19 41:8,25	59:16 66:15	managerial 67:16
let's 128:7,8,11	153:7 155:19	42:13,14,15	68:22 69:2,5	managers 134:6
131:8	164:4 180:16	43:20 44:15,24	107:11 118:4	mandate 54:17,23
level 7:10 27:25	live 7:13 9:22	55:15 56:5 67:6	126:20 155:9	57:23
41:13,15 42:2	10:3 18:16	68:5 76:8,15,16	156:7 157:20	mandatory 4:12
60:15 67:16	165:3,23,24	86:23 101:13	162:10 163:22	13:20
88:24 92:10,10	lives 79:14 143:24	108:21,21	165:8 167:10	maneuver 71:7
92:14 93:9	172:21 185:21	116:25 118:11	love 43:15 124:19	85:2 138:6
182:9 184:14	187:20	122:2,4 125:2	129:25,25	manner 63:25
levels 102:18	Lloyd 5:23	126:14,20	174:16 177:7,20	119:7 140:2
107:17	local 71:7,8,8	129:18 130:25	lower 27:25	mantra 144:15
library 140:13	89:10 124:7	131:6,14,16,18	loyalty 165:14	March 145:16
lieutenant 41:11	129:9 133:6	131:21 139:8	Luciano 162:16	MARIA 1:13
70:14 71:2	136:2 139:2	165:10	170:3 171:7,8	Marian 179:9
152:23 153:10	142:2 145:3	looked 4:10 13:25	lunch 92:7	mark 1:14 112:19

Market 184:8	media 60:9	149:21 150:2,12	mindful 68:7	52:18 64:11
Marks 132:8	174:25	151:9 173:6	mine 129:6	65:2 83:22 84:3
152:18,19 159:7	medic 140:23	182:12,15	minimum 8:13	91:8,14 102:5
160:4,23 161:23	157:14	183:21 185:15	minutes 139:13	117:17 125:23
165:5 166:22	medical 9:2	185:16 186:22	148:20 153:7	158:6 160:12
167:25 171:11	120:17	187:4,8,12,16	162:3	161:2 164:15
172:14 173:16	medics 165:16	187:21 188:2,7	mission 6:17	168:6 182:21,24
marshal 31:19	187:19	188:8,14,23	10:13 134:16	183:4
139:7,12	medic/paramedic	membership 36:7	missions 135:25	moved 17:2,4
marshals 136:17	140:25	69:13	mobility 181:21	26:3,8 58:5
Marys 128:6	meet 19:17 41:4	memo 141:7	Mobilizing	83:14 88:18
mass 29:24 52:25	60:16 62:2	181:16	174:25	158:23 162:20
54:11,11,15,17	meeting 135:5	memorandum	moderate 36:19	movement 29:15
54:23 57:14	143:12 181:5	24:25 139:14	moderately 36:17	32:14
111:16,19,21	meetings 28:15	men 31:5 42:16	Monday 163:7	movements
112:7,8 186:23	40:15 158:12	55:6,14,23 56:5	monetarily	188:13
187:8,9 188:7	181:9	57:7,8 58:4	137:25	moves 77:4
Massachusetts	member 45:7	59:21 91:23	money 145:4	moving 24:19
112:10	61:6 62:22 97:3	127:14 162:5	151:22	26:12 33:7 37:8
matter 26:19	110:8 129:9	165:15	monitor 73:12	41:25 73:22
43:19 78:7 85:6	133:5 134:2	mentioned 20:3	month 147:24	79:3 81:21
190:7	139:6 143:16,19	62:16 137:3	157:8	117:12 126:8
Mayor 19:22	171:8 183:21,23	mentoring 139:16	monthly 126:5	140:7 148:10
21:11,16 22:12	183:25 184:14	mentors 139:16	months 8:22	multiple 154:5
22:20 64:14,18	members 3:12	139:18,20 140:5	132:3 159:17	multitude 133:12
64:22 65:3,8	4:16,17 5:20,22	merchants 129:4	160:8,11	municipalities
85:9 87:5,17	6:12,25 7:5,11	merge 133:18	Moore 76:12	141:20 146:19
88:5,13 104:18	7:19 8:9 9:11,16	Meridian 129:13	morale 24:11	147:22
104:22 105:8,14	9:21,25 10:7,14	message 136:17	54:25 58:19,21	MURPHY 190:15
113:22 114:24	10:21 12:18,21	methods 139:21	58:24 59:21	Murray 154:4
116:2,9 123:25	13:15,16 14:23	metropolitan	60:7,13,14,15	music 123:4
124:14,21	20:7 21:14 22:8	142:20	61:20 80:4,5,22	
126:11 130:25	23:10 25:7,18	mic 24:23	86:7,15 149:12	
Mayor's 104:25	27:16 34:17	MICHELE	165:14 166:17	N
105:9,13,15	38:19 40:4,5	190:15	167:22 174:22	Nally 162:15
145:3	45:8 48:20	micromanaging	175:4	name 128:18
McDonald 137:3	49:18 51:15	185:18	morning 2:3 5:3	152:19 154:3
mean 16:7 34:9	52:4 61:3 62:9	mid 108:6	5:16,18,20	155:7 174:3
59:14 89:21	66:9,22 71:19	middle 57:5 60:16	37:15,17,23	178:24 180:3
120:4 163:3	86:4 87:24	97:25	132:25 163:7	names 162:19,25
168:9 169:6	90:23 95:9,11	midst 148:24	mother 135:16	national 38:23
175:15	115:16 120:19	Mike 19:24 76:11	176:10	102:9 112:14
means 129:10	124:13 133:2	155:7,11,13	mouth 175:10	131:4 140:12
155:14 177:16	135:21 137:11	military 134:4	move 6:23 8:23	144:13
185:17 190:22	138:5 140:19	million 177:9	17:9,11 32:18	Nationally 148:4
meant 46:20	142:2,6,9	mind 6:15 171:14	36:3,20 41:10	natural 34:8
measure 25:4	147:10 148:4	171:16	41:17,23 50:25	naturally 168:9
				nature 168:10

Navigating 137:21 nearby 128:22 141:13 nearly 4:10 6:10 180:17 Neary 146:11 162:9,14 164:12 179:7 Neary's 178:2 necessarily 37:9 47:19 63:5 67:24 necessary 96:13 need 9:25 13:8 14:7,14,21 16:17,25 17:14 17:19 18:11,14 21:2 24:6 25:19 28:2 30:10,14 31:24 39:2 45:19 49:15 69:5 72:17 76:13,16 78:13 80:14,14,22 84:12 87:2 90:24 91:13 118:3 139:10 143:3 needed 17:21 24:16 35:2 108:13 122:15 122:16,16 172:25 needs 16:6 25:16 30:15 35:4 40:17 146:22 179:18,20 186:7 negative 53:4 negotiated 64:12 negotiations 59:4 59:24 60:23 188:9 neighborhood 45:16 62:23 128:22,24 129:8 130:2	neighborhoods 23:15 24:18 45:14 48:22 94:11 128:23 neighbors 45:13 never 29:5 96:21 127:13 139:22 142:12 149:16 158:13,17 164:10,11 172:7 175:8 new 1:16 2:8 4:6 8:11,20,23 9:9 12:16 15:12 16:14 20:7 21:23 22:25 23:23 26:9 29:16 30:16 33:22 48:9,19 50:10 51:21 56:4 61:21,24 69:20,21 70:17 71:4 72:4,11,11 72:16,24 80:10 85:14,16 86:5,7 87:19 88:18 93:11 102:22 103:25 117:14 127:10 131:6,8 132:3 143:19 148:4 150:2,11 150:12 151:8 183:10,21 187:12 188:4 newer 61:22 107:19 139:19 newly 12:24 141:14 147:12 147:23 154:18 159:4 160:2 news 21:21 136:2 136:3 NFPA 102:16,20 102:24 104:6 127:5 nice 167:4,9 night 135:16	162:13,16,17 163:5 178:16 nine 152:24 153:2 178:16 NIOSH 112:14 130:25 normalize 50:13 Norris 146:4 North 40:23 Northeast 160:10 notes 190:6 notify 7:2 November 1:7 190:7 number 22:5 53:17,18 68:5 87:9,11 88:17 111:15,15,17,21 125:20 185:11 numbers 22:14 125:19	164:5 officer 26:14,14 51:7,9 55:14 64:25 67:11,12 67:13,14 68:4 70:14,16,25 72:14,23 73:5 75:3 76:10 82:8 104:10 138:3,9 138:23 147:5,11 147:16 152:3 153:9,16 154:14 154:17 159:13 169:8 183:24 184:25 185:17 officers 8:8 10:24 11:5,7 26:23 28:2 41:22 51:21,24 52:3 64:10 68:3 72:2 72:4 74:2,5 75:8 92:21 93:10 94:8 98:4 120:18 137:25 140:17,18 141:10,11,15,21 141:25 142:12 142:18,19 143:7 143:14 144:2,6 146:18 147:3,24 148:17,17 157:17 167:16 185:12 officer's 71:17 official 53:6 170:15 officials 52:3 oh 1:13 30:18 114:21,22 116:7 118:14,25 120:21 121:23 122:17 124:18 125:4 170:25 okay 29:23 35:18 51:16 59:2 66:11 67:4 84:15 106:13	120:21 161:4 170:25 old 36:23 74:18 74:19 86:9 129:6 144:15 180:7 older 16:25 once 53:2 57:15 119:17 148:14 155:5 159:15,20 166:20 184:23 ones 89:5 176:18 one-eighth 148:7 one-for-one 162:23 ongoing 73:22 75:14 on-the-job 181:25 OP 155:2 open 68:15,19 83:13 93:22 102:24 125:25 opening 9:3 151:2 openings 33:21 38:21 183:7 operate 58:14 135:6 147:4,7 operated 12:11 operating 7:9 181:3 operation 16:15 129:22 154:12 operational 50:15 70:19 74:24 79:15 149:2 operations 134:7 141:22 147:14 151:25 152:2 operator 147:2 operators 72:15 137:19 opinion 43:20 opinions 152:7 opportunities 3:5 41:21 42:5 101:14 107:13 107:15 181:20
--	--	--	---	--

opportunity 4:16 7:21 10:16,21 12:5 17:22 18:16 19:16 33:12 40:22 41:3 49:11 54:16,22 58:5 60:6 83:4 91:8 92:5 107:21 109:13 117:25 118:11 131:6,9 131:13 132:4 157:12	186:12 overall 187:13 overburdened 141:18 overcome 151:8 overflow 138:21 overnight 40:9,10 oversight 96:15 overstaffed 54:3 overtime 8:12 137:6,9 149:15 150:10 overview 134:16 overwhelmed 178:5 overwhelmingly 161:13 ownership 127:24 O'Brien 1:12 2:18 96:9,10 97:19 99:7 101:19 103:11 104:21 105:3,12,16 106:24 107:23 108:8 111:7,25 113:7,16 114:2 114:16 130:12 130:14 o'clock 168:25 178:16 O'Neill 2:15	140:11 144:23 144:25 147:7 152:11 187:7 188:24 paramilitary 27:18 paramount 79:5 152:12 paraphrased 137:4 pardon 35:11 46:24 54:19 71:23 parity 3:9 part 17:13,13 24:2,4 27:15 31:12,13 52:2 60:5 66:25 69:8 71:6 72:20 73:19 74:17 75:7,14,17 96:13 97:11 109:22 110:5,23 118:17,18,20 122:13 164:14 164:19,21 participate 102:25 146:18 participated 142:18 participatory 151:7 particular 25:10 45:15 70:22 84:11 92:15,18 94:11 143:15 157:19 160:13 160:14 172:9 particularly 94:5 94:24 115:5 158:16 184:19 parties 143:2 partners 138:17 partnership 100:17,18 parts 23:23 155:11	party 73:16 pass 130:2 passed 174:12 179:8 patch 187:23 path 117:16 167:11,12,14 patterns 55:25 pay 74:16 90:25 peak 143:23 PECO 135:15 pending 22:3 188:4 Pennsylvania 1:6 Pensions 163:12 people 11:18,23 16:16 17:7 18:15,18 19:17 21:2,9 22:23 24:17 26:24 30:18 31:7 34:7 34:14 37:8 39:4 41:5 46:4 47:20 53:7,18 54:24 58:10 60:18,20 61:15,16 62:2,6 62:6,8 63:7,24 66:3 67:22,23 68:8,11,17,23 68:23 73:15 75:9 79:13 80:21 83:17 84:24,25 85:2 85:14,17 86:12 86:13 87:14,14 87:15 88:3,8,10 88:17,25 89:2,7 89:10,21,23 90:7,8,16 95:16 103:15 106:12 106:14,17 107:2 107:17 114:6,10 117:9 118:6 119:18,22 123:10,13 127:16 129:16 134:12 136:6	137:23 138:13 144:2 149:7,14 149:15 150:11 150:19 151:10 153:19 158:6 159:9 162:10 165:2 166:18 167:10 168:19 168:20,21 169:19 172:3,20 178:6,7,19 percent 2:12 6:19 51:5 54:12 86:22 111:13,15 111:17,22 perform 11:9 50:18 72:6 period 18:19 52:15 63:9 159:6,16 161:3 permanently 145:24 permitting 151:23 person 14:14 36:18 42:15 50:6 66:14 74:16 82:5,9 90:4 92:2 138:4 138:8,24 143:20 personal 14:19 43:20 personalities 14:20 personally 11:25 13:10 55:13 115:18 149:17 155:7 180:19 personnel 8:6 12:17 25:8 27:25 67:18 69:21 134:23 135:20 136:20 136:23 137:10 137:20 138:20 138:25 139:19 146:22
---	---	---	---	--

persons 42:16 perspective 148:13 178:18 pertinent 142:24 peruse 131:4 ph 180:3 PHA 145:17 Philadelphia 1:2 1:6,17 2:9 6:4 13:5 14:4,5,22 15:20,24 16:2 17:15,22 18:8 18:13 19:9 20:20 28:22 40:17,24,24 42:6 43:16 44:8 44:17 45:6 46:5 47:18 49:9 50:20 51:14 53:8 58:15 60:20,25 62:18 66:17 78:17 80:2 81:7,13 90:24 104:7,11 112:14 113:20 113:25 117:13 117:15 119:8 121:14 130:5 133:5,8 140:22 141:12 143:8,10 147:19,25 149:21 152:6 174:5,9 175:19 177:13,17 184:9 185:12 Philadelphians 44:8 Philadelphia's 20:21 Philly 81:18,20 108:2 Phoenix 15:13 phone 139:6 phones 5:7 physical 143:23 148:14 physically 140:4	pick 85:24 138:21 piece 82:15 pile 162:19 Pittsburgh 15:15 place 11:17 32:12 44:6 57:24 58:3 59:9 80:24,25 85:13 86:5,7,9 99:5 100:19 105:24 117:24 136:10 138:6 139:18 140:6,20 150:19 151:14 placed 8:21 places 18:17 66:3 88:19 90:8,10 placing 149:13 plan 15:9 38:9 132:2 142:23 143:4 156:14 158:14 159:25 184:23 187:3 planned 8:18 planning 88:15 plans 6:2,14 143:6 158:10 platform 187:25 platoon 156:23 162:7 170:15 183:23 platoons 67:17 156:22 play 128:4,7 135:3 players 153:18 please 5:3 21:15 22:9 72:9 106:18 113:20 125:23 128:9 130:6 132:12,16 132:23 152:4,16 170:10,22 171:6 178:9,23 179:24 186:13,17 189:4 plenty 68:16 plug 23:9,13 plus 22:6 124:21	point 22:21 32:8,9 38:2 46:13 79:20 87:20 88:6,8,8,21 95:16 103:12 123:8 127:7 172:5 179:19 180:14 pointing 103:21 points 116:24 police 64:3,10,10 64:25 99:12 108:11 114:8 128:4 138:19 142:3 169:8 policies 59:8 92:25 181:10 policy 1:16 2:8,23 3:14 8:3 12:6 15:10 27:12 38:4 39:13 44:6 44:9,13,20,21 46:19 47:25 51:21 52:4,25 57:24 58:3 59:12,14 75:16 80:24 92:19 93:24 103:16 105:20 108:15 111:12 126:18 130:7 142:22 151:12,14 166:13,20 167:24 181:18 182:6 183:18,19 184:15 185:23 186:4,6 pool 156:25 157:22 158:9,23 160:6 poor 143:7 Poplar 145:22 popular 3:10 Port 40:25 portion 142:21 position 25:10 147:8 151:3	positioning 138:9 positions 9:3 positive 50:2,2 61:19 86:16 177:3 positively 136:7 possibility 4:4 possible 7:6 36:10 79:23,24 possibly 12:14,22 39:5 69:18 postpone 121:19 124:11 potential 94:7 potentially 36:22 practically 175:6 practice 7:12 10:2 11:7 12:6 18:2 18:25 19:9,10 20:23 48:18 49:7 51:11 76:21,21,23 77:2 80:4 99:11 103:6 110:3 practiced 119:6 practices 18:21 18:22 19:5 46:18,22 47:2,5 47:8,10 48:3,8 98:12,15,17 103:20 practicing 10:18 pray 6:12 precious 114:3 predictability 151:16 predictable 7:20 10:11 preference 7:3 preferred 3:10 prepare 7:7 8:23 8:24 11:9,15 32:3 34:20 prepared 11:21 12:14 37:5 69:18 78:10,14 148:25 180:13	181:13 preparing 34:22 135:17 155:4 presence 2:14 present 1:9 53:22 107:7 112:20 141:20 181:6 187:5 presentation 153:4 Presently 137:24 President 21:20 96:25 174:4 pressure 120:9 pressures 120:13 pretense 167:23 pretty 16:14 125:7 153:3 164:17 171:10 prevent 32:11 prevented 148:10 preventing 11:16 31:14 prevention 24:12 31:21 61:14 130:5 previous 127:4 previously 3:25 9:3 10:10 183:17 pre-planned 100:9 price 187:18 pride 92:11 130:3 primarily 116:18 priority 177:18 185:11 privilege 128:21 probably 21:20 63:20 89:5 problem 64:3 113:11 137:17 150:6 151:8 169:8 procedure 181:3 procedures 43:24 50:16 70:20
--	---	---	--	--

74:24 79:15	43:23 99:2	134:13 139:25	111:9 112:3	realignment 25:2
proceed 5:4	progress 71:3	150:21 166:11	113:21 125:14	reality 8:4 56:21
132:17,22	180:25	169:6 185:14	126:3 130:13	realize 99:10
152:17 170:12	Progressive	186:8 190:16	166:11	137:12 162:11
170:22 186:18	147:22	publish 103:5	questioning 60:3	really 35:17 38:2
proceedings	Project 174:25	published 141:9	questions 13:10	38:11,12,13
190:4	Projected 126:12	pull 65:16 111:13	13:15,17 37:20	39:23 72:16
process 1:18 2:10	promise 173:14	pulled 153:25	46:16 51:17	77:2,3 93:20
6:24 7:20 10:10	promote 159:11	pulling 57:17	52:22 53:9	105:19 114:10
10:12 18:4	promoted 55:7	pump 137:19	59:17,17 65:22	126:23 161:15
24:13 27:2,9,12	141:14 147:12	147:8	115:2 125:22	171:17
28:7,12 30:16	147:23 156:2	purpose 181:17	161:19 171:15	real-life 9:8
37:4,25 38:14	159:4,10	purposes 29:16	quick 173:22	reason 14:19
39:25 40:8,18	promotional	push 106:8 173:8	quickly 3:18	28:10 60:18
50:11 52:2,20	142:17	pushed 140:4	181:7	78:22 115:15,22
71:3 72:3 73:20	prompt 187:14	put 1:16 5:7 21:7	Quinones-Sanc...	121:18 126:6
74:3,5,10,13,13	proof 100:25	31:24 34:7	1:13 124:24	140:19 141:23
75:14,18 77:18	proper 70:18	42:21 44:5 59:8	quite 172:5	158:22 165:2
80:3,18 85:22	property 138:11	61:13 70:5	quo 106:13,14	172:7 175:23
85:23 86:18	proposal 106:7	79:13 80:24,25	107:2	reasoning 115:19
99:10 102:24	proposing 44:22	83:12 99:2	quotas 183:12	reasons 14:20
105:23 112:6,23	protect 48:21	117:13,15,24	quote 25:6	59:18 83:15
113:10 115:14	59:22 78:18	119:21 122:7		90:20 127:2
117:12 119:16	128:25 177:12	123:21 127:13	R	128:19 140:24
142:17 156:11	184:17	131:12 156:23	raised 43:16	reassignment
157:18 164:2,14	protecting 129:7	157:22 158:22	124:23 179:3	2:11
188:3	130:2 188:14	puts 66:14 129:22	raising 135:14	Rec 168:19
processes 103:9	protection 102:9	putting 53:2 69:9	Ramsey 142:3	receive 9:12 10:6
produce 134:13	102:23 131:4	79:16 91:17	rank 6:6 55:7	134:25
productive 4:2	protective 184:5	119:11 131:7	127:8 133:7	receiving 187:14
168:2,7	proud 175:12	175:14	139:22 143:5	recessed 189:11
profession 140:3	179:3	puzzled 96:16	149:5 180:4	189:13
professional 8:25	prove 111:11	p.m 189:13	ranks 181:21	recipe 183:18
10:23 50:17	proven 100:24		rate 14:6	recognize 43:17
101:17 106:4	proves 113:19	Q	react 77:9 133:17	recommendation
108:13,24 140:2	provide 10:15	qualified 81:17	reacting 133:23	112:7
professionalism	57:7 148:15	147:3	read 24:23 103:4	recommended
113:3	provided 44:19	quandary 150:3	128:17 132:20	112:17
professionals	69:22 147:15	quarterbacks	186:20	reconcile 101:21
31:9,10	154:13	127:23	ready 5:9 19:14	reconsider 116:21
proficient 184:22	providing 54:16	quarterly 151:4	49:5 51:12	121:15 126:17
profusely 135:9	138:15 150:23	question 16:24	117:6 122:19	reconsiders 92:20
program 109:15	public 1:16 2:7	19:24 20:24	132:12	record 5:4 57:22
139:16 147:12	19:25 59:18	47:24 64:8,8	real 3:13,20 7:15	98:11 117:20
147:17,20	94:6 95:20	70:2 83:25	10:5 11:10	118:21 132:13
programs 31:22	99:13 111:12	84:20 96:22	131:16,17	152:16 158:5
31:24 32:20	112:21 126:16	97:20 102:3	173:22	170:12 179:25

186:14	remain 6:16	16:1 17:1 18:1	138:1 139:1	66:2 75:19 85:9
recovery 164:7	remaining 145:21	19:1 20:1 21:1	140:1 141:1	87:5,17 88:5,13
recruit 155:25	remedy 161:12	22:1 23:1 24:1	142:1 143:1	104:18,22 105:8
recruits 8:24	remember 21:19	25:1 26:1 27:1	144:1 145:1	105:14 113:22
72:24 156:11	35:2 51:8 56:23	28:1 29:1 30:1	146:1 147:1	123:25 124:14
redid 178:3	107:25 155:13	31:1 32:1 33:1	148:1 149:1	124:21 125:19
Redmond 163:23	remind 12:2	34:1 35:1 36:1	150:1 151:1	126:11 137:2
164:11,23	187:5	37:1 38:1 39:1	152:1 153:1	155:22
reduce 99:3	remote 136:15	40:1 41:1 42:1	154:1 155:1	resolution 1:15,15
reduced 109:21	remove 144:25	43:1 44:1 45:1	156:1 157:1	2:5 115:4,17
109:21	removes 134:14	46:1 47:1 48:1	158:1 159:1	122:20 130:16
reducing 14:6	report 39:16	49:1 50:1 51:1	160:1 161:1	resolutions 115:4
reduction 18:2	131:2	52:1 53:1 54:1	162:1 163:1	resource 8:5
19:19 20:5	reported 112:16	55:1 56:1 57:1	164:1 165:1	resources 114:4
32:19 33:13	reporter 190:24	58:1 59:1 60:1	166:1 167:1	respect 20:25
36:5 38:25	reports 112:17	61:1 62:1 63:1	168:1 169:1	63:14 65:13,13
42:17 62:14	represent 111:16	64:1 65:1 66:1	170:1 171:1	92:14 103:13
82:23 91:16	representation	67:1 68:1 69:1	172:1 173:1	115:11,20
101:13 110:4	102:17	70:1 71:1 72:1	174:1 175:1	123:11,21 125:2
113:13	represented	73:1 74:1 75:1	176:1 177:1	150:21 168:18
refer 160:5,6	12:16 69:20	76:1 77:1 78:1	178:1 179:1	169:2,4,17
referring 155:23	represents 53:6	79:1 80:1 81:1	180:1 181:1	respected 177:22
refinery 136:8	reproduction	82:1 83:1 84:1	182:1 183:1	177:23
reflect 172:18	190:21	85:1 86:1 87:1	184:1 185:1	respectful 105:20
reflection 121:13	request 13:21	88:1 89:1 90:1	186:1 187:1	respectfully 128:9
refused 143:10	66:21 67:2	91:1 92:1 93:1	188:1 189:1	130:17,21
regard 180:16	104:19,23,24	94:1 95:1 96:1	rescue 42:22	131:11,22
regarding 104:5	130:22 131:11	97:1 98:1 99:1	rescued 145:19	respond 5:24
124:7 166:12	131:22	100:1 101:1	research 4:7	101:25 109:3
regardless 87:18	requested 88:25	102:1 103:1	38:18 144:9,11	133:14 137:16
93:23	requesting 131:24	104:1 105:1	researched	139:9
regards 134:11	requests 9:13,15	106:1 107:1	140:11	responded 153:22
regular 138:16	14:13 17:10	108:1 109:1	resentment 3:23	responding
142:8	22:3 65:24	110:1 111:1	reserved 148:3	120:15
regulations 3:24	66:19 130:24	112:1 113:1	residential 136:9	response 4:5,20
reinforce 131:23	require 119:2	114:1 115:1	137:15	56:2 161:20
reinvent 144:16	133:14	116:1 117:1	residents 60:25	184:2 187:11
reiterate 155:19	required 7:2	118:1 119:1	79:25 82:2	responsibilities
rejected 143:20	10:18 136:7	120:1 121:1	129:4	50:14
related 101:17	142:23	122:1 123:1	resist 106:15	responsibility
relationship	requirements	124:1 125:1	resistance 29:2,18	12:12 26:15
145:2 168:15	8:13	126:1 127:1	resistant 12:9	51:9 69:16
relative 62:20	requires 7:17	128:1 129:1	Resnick 19:22,24	70:12,13,15
relinquish 24:23	RES 3:1 4:1 5:1	130:1 131:1	21:11,16 22:12	71:16,17 72:21
rely 56:10 75:21	6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1	132:1 133:1	22:20 51:18	73:6 148:22
153:20 154:22	10:1 11:1 12:1	134:1 135:1	58:20 64:9,14	165:13
155:5	13:1 14:1 15:1	136:1 137:1	64:18,22 65:3,8	responsible 45:3

45:4,9 137:25 147:6 154:17 rest 16:22 124:6 restate 72:8 result 6:24 85:20 144:20 147:18 resulted 146:10 resulting 146:15 results 120:7 143:4,6 182:2 retaliation 144:20 144:20 rethink 130:7 retire 21:10 retired 132:7 141:21 152:20 152:21,24 163:4 164:3 retirees 157:25 retirement 8:8 92:23 126:8,12 retirements 20:6 158:7 retiring 34:2 68:18 review 1:16 2:8 117:2 162:24 reviewing 12:25 revision 102:21 revisit 116:13 124:25 rewarding 140:6 re-discussing 116:15 re-looked 121:21 123:17 Richard 76:5 Richmond 40:25 rid 128:7 ridiculous 164:16 175:5 178:11 right 2:22,24 13:4 28:24 52:13 59:18 60:10 61:9 62:13,16 67:25 68:10 69:14 77:12	79:14 80:9 83:11,21 97:25 98:10 106:25 107:3,5 113:4 115:8 118:22 120:24 139:12 141:5 157:7 163:16 168:14 172:2,4 rights 103:10 ripping 170:20 rise 110:17 184:9 rises 136:8 risk 18:2 19:19 32:19 33:12 36:4 38:25 42:17 62:14 91:16 99:3 101:13 110:4 113:13 148:12 risks 82:24 road 151:18 164:7 164:7 rock 145:12 role 104:6 roofs 154:6 room 1:6 42:22 90:17 107:18 123:10 136:12 ropes 176:13,21 rotate 6:2 10:13 13:23 17:15,23 18:14 56:5 134:22 137:7 140:10,17,17 150:12 187:4 rotated 6:25 14:14,15,16 17:8 153:11,13 157:23 183:24 185:7 186:22 187:8 rotating 6:19 11:5 136:5 151:4 153:12,17 rotation 1:17 2:10 3:8 4:12 6:21,24	7:19,25 12:23 13:3,20 15:9 16:16 29:25 34:8 40:20 43:7 51:12 85:22 93:4 110:23 116:5 117:7,12 121:16,17 122:13 134:14 136:24 140:16 141:2,6 150:2 160:11 172:24 181:23 183:18 187:10 rotational 20:10 20:11 22:16 rotations 7:6 11:4 12:20 13:9 14:11 16:19 25:15 69:10 99:25 120:24 121:3,20 188:8 round 161:6 rounded 42:7 routes 184:2 routinely 146:13 Roxborough 81:14,17 RPR-Notary 190:16 rule 179:16 run 100:8 101:4 149:14 running 96:24 runs 82:10 S sacrifice 174:15 sad 161:5 165:4 179:5 saddens 164:23 safe 6:13 32:4 35:22,23 36:8 49:12 61:2 91:5 100:23 147:14 148:21 150:23 166:17	safely 7:12 10:2 safer 45:18 82:22 82:23 123:3 safety 4:3 6:11 10:25 19:25 45:6,10 59:18 70:22,24 73:17 76:6,8 80:16,20 81:25 85:18 94:7 97:17,18 98:24 99:23 112:15 123:5 126:16,25 127:6 136:18 146:14 152:10 166:11 166:14 176:2 185:13,14,15 187:13 San 15:13 Sanchez 91:20,21 93:7 94:18 95:15 96:6 sat 162:22 163:9 satisfied 111:10 save 169:12 187:22 saving 185:21 saw 11:3 93:8 154:2 175:3 saying 12:18 30:18 33:5,25 34:10,13 39:9 43:13 54:23 57:18 59:13 63:14,15 74:20 81:10,21 86:11 90:15 95:22 100:7 119:24 120:2,4,4 122:6 131:7 155:13 156:18 170:19 176:17 185:5 says 31:17 56:22 77:24 92:8 102:7 110:10 157:6 186:25 scale 187:17	scare 60:19,24 61:15 scaring 62:5 scarred 145:24 scenario 9:8 22:7 scenarios 136:6 scene 184:13 schedule 140:24 141:5 scheduled 8:19 schedules 94:12 school 73:13 147:23 154:25 160:3 schooled 147:13 schools 73:12,14 Schully 180:2,3,9 180:12 181:2,15 score 128:6 screw 155:14,16 screwed 155:15 searches 135:13 second 44:15 153:21 sections 40:23 102:2 123:15 sectors 123:14 see 14:9 28:25,25 41:3 42:9 43:21 56:11 84:23 92:9 106:7 107:9 116:15 120:7 122:18 126:24 149:16 164:23 165:11 169:11 171:25 172:3,19 173:5 174:17 175:13 177:6 179:5 seeing 4:21 106:9 seek 187:22 seemingly 44:10 seen 60:11 75:10 75:11,12 129:6 172:7 seldom 136:2 select 84:8,10
---	--	---	---	---

selected 116:19	serve 7:21 10:16	sheet 123:4	10:5 19:6 26:5	146:6 154:2
selections 7:3	40:16 91:23	Shelmire 56:24	56:18 63:11	smooth 129:21
self-advancement	128:22 141:12	shifts 8:5	75:2 77:10	snow 149:10
36:11	181:23	shock 147:19	79:24 84:4	snowy 135:16
sell 143:15 144:3	served 24:9,18	shooting 133:24	96:24 100:4	Snyder 159:19
semi-annual	94:25 134:5	shortage 8:14	127:15 137:18	society 32:9
151:5	138:22	shot 59:20 158:16	situational 134:18	solid 150:14
sending 136:16,22	service 1:3,16 2:5	shoulder 188:10	situations 19:18	solution 108:25
sendoff 164:4	2:7 5:21 7:10	188:11	20:14 26:6	solutions 134:10
sends 148:2	10:14 11:10	show 37:5,7 48:17	28:23 36:2	149:25 150:16
senior 4:13 13:20	25:22 58:13	113:23 167:21	101:15 110:2,16	solve 134:19
16:25 26:2,3	74:19 84:6	176:13	133:18 147:15	somebody 21:4,4
40:5 49:18	88:24 90:24,25	showing 149:7	sit-behind-the-...	21:6 56:22 75:3
55:13 56:5	91:9 95:3,3,20	shows 98:11	168:24	82:7 108:2,3
72:15 74:2,4,6,8	95:22 100:17,18	117:21	six 12:21 58:9	114:17 127:11
74:14,16 82:5	101:7,7 133:3	shutoff 136:13	68:11 73:2	160:25 167:2
86:4 89:6,10	134:13 137:8	sick 67:24 68:12	79:11 108:22	168:5
92:21 95:11	138:16 140:14	68:23 143:17	122:12,13 157:5	somewhat 96:23
127:16 129:19	149:13,23	149:14	176:15,17	son 179:10,10
129:24 135:21	151:10 152:22	sickened 174:13	six-month 71:5	soon 153:25
136:11 138:4,7	164:22 169:20	sickness 161:2	skill 7:18 10:18	180:18
138:13,24 139:6	184:19 187:7,24	side 61:19 138:15	17:16 42:24,25	sorry 15:4 47:23
140:19 143:16	189:10,13	173:6	134:19	104:21 105:5
146:22 147:10	services 9:2 99:2	signed 115:17	skills 7:12,17 9:18	130:11 170:21
153:20 154:4,13	120:17	significant 143:24	10:2 17:24	173:22
154:21,24 155:5	serving 3:9 25:19	146:15	19:11 133:23	sought 39:13
155:20 160:20	127:8 166:10	sign-up 139:15	150:22	souls 187:21
162:4 167:8	sessions 47:16	silent 12:7	skill-building 3:2	sound 56:15,17
176:11 182:12	set 2:8 43:2 48:14	similar 44:17	skip 175:6	sounds 31:6
seniority 151:13	48:15 83:22	simply 12:19	skull 61:10,14	source 39:11
seniors 95:10	84:3 92:22	183:12	62:20	South 81:13,18,20
sense 23:6 24:19	94:20 132:3	sincere 121:6	slapped 174:18	Spanish 94:11
38:10 41:6	154:11	133:9	181:7	speak 157:3
44:25 86:25	sets 7:18 10:11,18	single 3:8,8 4:11	slated 182:12,21	173:23,25 174:2
89:12,16,17	17:16 42:25	single-family	183:4	181:5
161:5,13 165:3	settlement 103:18	93:17	slot 66:14 68:2,10	speaking 127:19
sent 49:21 128:17	severely 54:4	sir 15:5 29:8	slots 34:7,15	speaks 94:10
sentiments 173:4	145:14,18,23	46:24 78:20	66:20 67:7,8,20	special 152:2
September 17:4	shaft 139:5	90:15 123:24	67:25 90:6	169:18,18,19
152:21 163:4,13	shake 172:23	125:11	slotting 53:19	184:6
sergeant 134:21	share 78:23 92:6	sisters 177:18	slow 36:17,20	specialist 134:4
Sergeant-At-Ar...	111:4 115:10	sit 13:10 31:2	slower 157:13,21	specialists 134:5
186:16	141:13	37:6 171:24	182:19 183:5	134:14
series 104:4	shared 41:9 82:17	179:11	small 95:12	specific 134:17
serious 55:3	111:2	sitting 5:25 47:12	smell 34:23	137:23 151:17
123:18	sharing 79:3	172:11	smile 129:5	specifically 104:5
seriously 121:11	sharp 185:22	situation 7:15	smoke 73:11	specifics 39:20

spending 146:23	stairways 129:15	States 47:2 48:5	61:7 155:16	78:21 79:9
spends 145:11	stake 12:10	96:25 144:12	strategic 20:10	118:10 119:10
spent 104:9	stand 188:10	station 3:9 16:18	strategize 161:16	125:21
128:23 145:4	standard 11:7	16:21 17:3,9	strategy 173:9	submitted 17:6
165:7	102:20 119:7	24:5 41:14,15	street 5:14 55:11	subordinates
splitting 80:6	181:3	45:13 50:25	56:24 100:7	149:24
spoken 55:9	standards 102:11	51:3 56:4,18	129:14 145:17	success 7:24
sporting 127:22	102:13,17,19	57:18 58:8 67:8	146:10 180:6	successful 135:25
spot 21:4,5 67:3	103:3 104:8,13	72:12,14,16	184:8	136:5
159:17 160:20	131:5 132:3	82:11 83:18,19	streets 23:16	successfully 4:14
160:22 185:7	standing 12:8	89:4 118:20	93:14 129:14	successors 98:3
spots 68:13,15,19	59:25 63:12	137:11,21	137:2,22 138:11	sudden 150:5
68:22 69:5	64:6 65:18	143:20 151:17	168:21	suddenly 42:11
83:13 158:2,3	114:13 132:10	153:25 157:2	stress 188:13	suffered 145:7
159:12 160:17	152:14 169:24	162:8	stretch 119:20	suggest 44:23
161:3	170:6 173:18	stations 3:10 6:9	stretching 52:15	85:16
spread 33:11 79:2	179:21 186:12	33:14 36:21	strike 63:18	suggested 22:14
spring 8:18 27:11	standpipes	49:19,23 53:12	strip 103:24	130:19
28:18	129:15	54:8 71:12	stronger 77:11	suggesting 159:25
sprinkler 136:13	standpoint	84:25 90:17	83:9,10 86:2	suggestions
Squilla 1:14 5:13	126:15,15	107:18,20 111:3	strongly 185:10	126:21 128:8
65:20,21 66:11	stands 144:15	130:4	188:7	suggests 138:8
66:18 67:4	start 2:19 5:6	status 106:13,14	structure 11:11	summarize
68:14,21 69:14	8:18 15:5 41:19	107:2	98:6 103:14	168:12
70:4 71:10,20	42:4,6 47:5	stay 16:22 163:19	106:19 115:12	summer 8:20
71:24 72:10	51:12 60:22	167:8	structured 156:22	Sunday 163:8
73:25 74:6	80:5 100:6	stayed 172:16	structures 184:3	superiors 149:19
75:15,23 76:18	103:19 128:7	steam 136:13	struggling 135:10	supervision
78:6,13 79:19	149:12 158:9	Steinmetz 162:11	stubborn 123:10	190:23
80:13 81:5	started 50:12,17	170:3,13,14,23	studies 15:2 41:10	supervisor 127:13
83:11,24 84:15	144:24 174:22	stenographer	70:19 102:5	139:23
84:19 86:10,21	starting 6:20	107:4	103:12 111:11	supervisors 55:16
104:15 127:21	11:17 110:3,13	stenographic	112:24 113:18	55:21 57:7
St 139:5	141:2	190:6	113:23 114:18	139:25
stability 25:6	starts 43:4 60:14	sting 148:16	131:17	supply 149:25
staff 20:6 28:15	60:15 80:3,4	stop 41:12,24	study 15:7,10	support 102:5
38:20 40:14	state 63:17	62:5 68:5 89:14	48:17,22 103:23	174:11 188:12
75:17 104:20	stated 25:14	132:24 173:10	111:14 167:7	supposed 74:23
105:2,10,13,15	46:14,17 51:18	173:12	stuff 5:8 52:20	165:23
115:13,20	68:17 80:17	stopped 40:15	62:21 65:7	sure 13:15 19:14
116:14 117:9	107:16 154:16	47:14	162:25 165:15	19:18 21:12,17
136:18 138:19	157:24 158:12	stopping 43:3	172:3	25:18,24 26:24
143:12 158:12	168:3,4 183:17	48:24	style 151:7	31:18 35:22
181:4	statement 54:10	stories 146:2	subject 147:20	36:8 48:13
staffing 8:13	69:15 80:17	storming 50:12	171:13	60:17 61:18
137:10	137:4	story 75:5,5 139:3	subjected 93:4	67:16,17 74:15
stagnating 75:3	statements 12:18	straight 26:12	submit 30:20	74:21 75:9

76:14 78:25 89:2 91:4,7,9,14 99:21,25 100:22 110:6 116:9 124:19 125:17 142:8 164:19 176:12 surely 183:15 185:23 surprised 139:8 151:11 surround 154:11 surrounding 187:3 surroundings 154:20 suspend 186:4 sustainable 11:21 swap 83:18 84:25 swaps 83:17 swearing 35:2 Sweeney 146:11 162:10,14 164:12 179:9 swore 31:16 35:4 sworn 82:9 syllabus 147:16 system 7:19 8:2 12:23 17:14 20:9,10,11 22:16 43:7 119:25 120:5,8 141:4,19 151:13 151:14 systemic 21:18 85:22 systems 2:21 127:6 184:6	31:21 35:5 41:9 44:10,15 45:19 57:24 61:18 73:7 75:6 77:13 79:24 80:14 84:16 92:11 96:18 105:23 116:25 118:5,11 120:19 125:2 126:14,20 127:20 128:8 130:23 148:18 149:6 150:16 152:4 153:6 158:8 159:18 168:4 172:8 174:7 176:14 177:6 188:21 taken 43:6 91:10 94:14 190:6 takes 23:14 71:3 184:20 talk 21:21 31:3 37:22 38:3 41:23 62:3 73:12,14 90:6 103:14 106:11 106:12 107:10 117:8 talked 26:2 27:13 28:15,18,19,20 40:14 51:24 60:8 65:23 72:21 89:16,17 118:13 164:5 174:25 talking 21:14 31:4 34:17 40:13 47:5 52:13 57:25 59:23 60:22,23 62:16 68:15 71:19 88:16 98:17 100:6 107:6 110:22 156:7 163:9 tap 76:12	tapestry 49:10 task 35:5 143:3 taste 34:24 tax-paying 174:8 teach 72:16 167:19 teaching 114:7 team 12:24 25:5 26:25 27:5 50:9 50:14 72:20 74:17 75:22 76:20,21,22,24 77:3,3,11 79:6 85:25 135:20 163:21 184:12 teamed 174:24 teams 4:2 13:2 34:19 42:8 50:10,19 76:22 77:16 79:4 80:6 85:25 86:3,11 118:7 127:23 team-building 25:4 26:25 27:9 80:3 tears 178:4 techniques 133:20 technology 77:24 102:23 teetering 148:13 teeth 174:19 tell 13:18 23:7 27:3 63:6 79:10 97:23 98:8,9 99:18 103:2 104:16 106:18 124:3 134:21 162:3 176:19 180:23 telling 49:7 62:6,8 64:13 95:18 106:16 154:5 tells 31:15 32:6 155:2,2 temperatures 135:12	temporarily 160:18 ten 6:23 55:12,24 73:3 146:7 156:24 159:10 159:12 terms 39:21 44:12 terrain 55:24 test 71:5,6 tested 133:19 testifying 162:2 testimony 5:5 13:8,14 46:15 115:6,18 119:5 119:5 130:9 132:17 152:17 161:6 169:21 170:10 173:3 180:19 186:11 testing 142:17 text 180:13 181:13 thank 2:3 13:12 13:13 45:21,24 46:11 65:21 91:21,22 95:4 95:21 96:6,10 105:11,16 114:14,16,19,22 114:25 118:14 123:23 125:8,10 125:15 128:13 130:8 152:13 166:6,8 169:20 169:21 170:7,9 173:15,16 174:2 174:10 176:24 178:22 181:14 186:9,10 188:16 188:17,24 189:7 Thanksgiving 149:8 178:14 Theresa 174:4 they'd 37:22 81:17 thing 13:4 15:20 52:23 54:9	60:14 62:20 79:15 88:2 90:22 91:17 93:25 98:9 105:4 108:17 113:24 123:13 155:21 168:17 170:16 175:25 things 14:24 17:17,20 19:7 23:17 25:13,25 26:17 27:23 28:25 30:8,13 30:17 34:8 35:7 35:25 36:11 37:22 39:6,15 39:16,21 40:6 40:25 41:8 43:10,14 45:25 46:2,5,14 47:15 49:15 60:8 63:7 67:14,15,18 71:9 74:11 75:6 75:13 76:14,16 77:19,22 80:15 82:4 83:2,8 85:2 90:6,18,19 96:3 99:23 100:10 101:2 109:18 110:17 118:2,8 118:12 119:4 120:9 122:5 130:21 160:19 161:24 167:11 171:25 think 16:8 29:11 37:25 38:11 43:13,14 44:13 45:7,18 50:23 50:24 52:24 53:3,8 54:16,25 55:2 57:12 58:18,19,21,24 59:15,19 60:13 62:5 71:21,25 79:12 86:3,16 86:23,25 89:3
---	---	--	--	---

92:3,24 93:19 93:21 96:12 104:15 112:22 117:17 122:8,25 123:3,7,9,12 124:10,24 125:4 125:7 127:21 132:19 164:8,25 165:4 166:18,24 168:7,17,25 169:15 175:10 179:19 188:21 thinking 38:5 40:10 61:2 thinks 18:24 85:6 third 135:18 146:5 thorough 134:6 thought 30:7 33:6 38:14,17 107:6 149:16 175:8 thoughts 133:10 135:23 142:7 thousands 140:8 three 16:19,20 55:19,21 67:11 95:3 104:14 136:23 140:18 145:23 146:2,4 149:9 176:8,10 three-year 55:15 throw 128:5,10 throwing 34:14 throws 150:8 Thursday 130:15 tiller 137:20 147:8 time 2:24 3:19 18:19 25:3 29:3 29:11,14 32:4 40:11 43:17 46:3 48:2 52:15 52:16 53:5,22 59:15 86:2 94:20 95:12 107:18 109:8 111:9 113:2,17	118:5 139:10 153:7 156:6 159:16 161:3 164:9,13 165:6 171:22 175:15 178:11 timeline 104:2 times 4:5 14:12 46:4 47:12 49:19 56:3 119:22 136:4,4 168:4 187:12 timing 60:3 tobacco 103:18 today 2:4 5:24 11:24 12:3,8,9 19:21 34:20,22 57:23 133:4,9 149:18 168:4 169:21 187:25 188:10,14,25 told 82:7 108:2 144:3 tomorrow 187:19 188:15 tooth 65:15 top 7:2 97:22 98:4 topics 171:16 top-down 2:21 total 125:24 146:7 150:22 totality 122:23 totally 63:9 86:22 172:25 touch 155:21 touched 171:13 tougher 165:18 165:19 touted 147:11 track 98:11 117:20 traded 86:12 trades 85:25 86:11 tradition 179:4 traffic 55:25 tragedies 136:4	tragedy 112:13 tragic 112:16 119:12,13 131:2 train 9:21 10:14 16:5 19:13 23:15 30:21,22 32:2 71:12,15 93:13 127:16 155:4 trained 12:13 49:25 69:17 72:5 75:10 79:13 81:11 85:3 91:5 136:20 143:19 trainee 151:3 trainees 151:4 training 9:8,18 14:23 18:5,6,11 26:13,16,16 29:16 33:13 35:24 36:9 41:21 50:12 69:22 70:10,11 70:18 71:21,25 72:2,5,7 73:10 74:24 93:9 104:5,9,11,12 104:14 108:22 110:6,12 127:11 130:17 131:6 132:3 145:10 146:24,25 148:23 149:4 151:23 155:3 156:4 181:25 183:13 186:5 trains 71:11 transcript 190:8 190:21 transfer 2:21 3:18 7:3 9:13,15 16:18 21:3 22:3 22:6,19,25 25:21 26:10 39:3 44:13,19 46:19 47:25	51:21 52:25 53:4 54:11,12 57:24 59:8,14 66:13 69:10 75:16 80:23 81:10 85:19,23 88:4,9,10,11 92:24 99:10 111:16,19,21 130:7 151:12,14 162:20 181:18 182:17 186:5 transferred 17:7 21:3,5 23:3,5 24:2,3 26:20,21 39:6 84:24 87:15,16 90:7 176:8 182:13 transferring 47:20 48:19 55:20,22 transfers 4:5 17:6 20:25 21:13 22:13 39:4 48:18 54:22 55:15 57:14,20 59:6 65:24 66:5 66:7,8,16 83:13 85:15 87:12 88:25 107:9 112:7 115:6 116:18,19 125:20 126:2 158:5 173:13 176:5 186:23 Transmitted 105:6 transparent 7:7 trauma 145:25 treat 144:4,5 treated 63:9,25 139:24 178:8,8 treating 150:20 trends 38:23,23 trestles 23:16 trial 135:4 tried 60:24	117:21 133:19 trigger 95:16 triggered 39:16 troops 27:23 167:18 trucks 92:2 true 51:4,4 56:7 190:8 truly 149:12 try 7:4 60:19 108:14 115:24 158:6 161:10 177:3,4,5 trying 9:11 61:15 88:2 90:16 105:19 121:9 155:18 161:8 Tuesday 1:7 turn 5:6 7:4 turned 49:24,25 172:23 turns 129:20 134:15 tutoring 139:19 twice 159:14,19 two 8:10 16:19 21:2 34:3 50:4 82:3 92:18 94:23 95:2 112:12,24 117:5 132:7 139:20 156:23 157:8 160:8,11 161:25 170:2 two-room 110:16 two-story 81:12 81:14,15 type 29:3,6,10,14 29:24 52:22 types 20:14 36:15 42:5 160:19 typical 129:24 typically 9:6
--	---	--	---	--

U

ultimate 11:16
ultimately 154:17

unable 8:11 9:14	102:16 133:14	vacuum 73:21	22:18,18 24:23	156:21 160:17
unanswered	unit 12:16 69:19	validate 15:9	34:19 36:7,8	167:11 183:15
59:17	170:15	value 11:4 121:7	41:7 45:11,20	184:7
unavailable 9:4	United 47:2 48:5	121:11 123:19	46:13 48:2	ways 44:3
undergoes 102:20	96:25 144:12	147:9	62:19 63:24	wear 187:24
underlying 87:7	units 157:14	valued 144:4	79:22 83:17	weeks 21:20 50:4
87:21 88:14,21	universities	varied 10:7 41:9	84:9,24,25	59:5
understaffed 54:5	136:10	134:9	86:12,14,14,17	welcome 46:8
understand 19:17	university 136:18	variety 133:17	87:14,14,15,18	169:23
24:8 27:7,20	unnecessary	various 36:15	88:9,10 91:22	welfare 186:8
30:10,10,14	172:25	140:24	93:10,12 94:9	wellbeing 14:22
33:5 34:10,13	unsafe 85:13 87:8	vehicle 146:25	107:8 117:8	123:5
35:6,15 45:3	87:11 88:16,19	147:4 185:22	121:16 128:15	well-oiled 135:6
50:13 55:5 60:7	88:20 167:22	veteran 136:11	128:16 135:18	well-rounded
60:9,12,18	unsettled 166:15	vibrate 5:8	139:11 157:20	81:23 134:8,24
62:12,15 74:12	upcoming 6:2	Vice-Chair 2:16	161:24 165:6	went 24:13 50:9
80:22 90:19	upgrading 18:6	victims 94:8	166:8,9 168:5	50:11 66:19
101:3,20 108:14	upheld 173:11	view 42:2	171:21 172:22	119:14 154:23
113:14,14 118:4	uproar 49:22,22	viewed 169:17	174:9 175:19	159:18 163:16
120:12 122:17	50:3	vigilant 11:14	176:24 177:21	178:2
127:6,7 156:19	uproot 95:2,23	Vine 5:14	177:22 178:9	West 40:24
158:19 175:14	uprooting 24:8	visibility 135:12	wanted 37:19	we'll 25:18 31:17
175:21	upsetment 27:4	vision 47:16	153:6 155:21	31:17,18 76:9
understanding	upside 172:24	100:14	158:7 171:14	85:16 110:11
32:17 97:12,14	upward 181:20	visitors 150:24	175:25	124:19 173:8,14
understands	up-to-date 133:18	voice 28:21	wanting 90:7	we're 14:3,6 18:4
55:25 91:15,17	urban 133:11	void 51:2 73:21	wants 21:5 23:2	18:5,12 20:4,18
98:21,23 100:16	urge 186:2	voluntarily 88:4	99:17 173:25	20:18 22:22
undertaken 28:7	urgency 124:8	voluntary 17:6	174:2	25:14 33:7,7
undertaking	use 8:12 19:20	102:13 116:18	wasn't 83:25 97:5	34:21,22 36:3
141:17	41:10 43:24		97:9 108:2	37:7,10 43:3,4
undivided 188:6	113:2 128:5		153:24 154:9	47:6,13,15 49:8
unexpected	147:17		172:2,4	50:24 52:12
150:17	usually 156:17		watch 145:10	57:17 58:6,17
unfairness 122:22	utilizing 19:10		watched 94:3	69:9 77:12,25
unfamiliar 4:6	113:3		water 106:7,8	78:2,4,11,18
85:14,17	U.S 134:3		135:11	82:18 84:7,9,11
uniform 148:2			Wawa 55:12	84:13 85:4,4
uniformed 63:18			way 12:23 18:21	86:19 87:8
unilateral 3:21			21:8,12,17	88:15,20 92:23
union 35:6,9,13			22:22 23:2	95:22 98:18,19
35:20 40:12			44:24 48:12	99:5,22 100:4
51:20 52:3			49:13 50:18	100:12,13
60:24,24 133:6			52:18 58:13	101:22,23,24
145:2 150:9			59:16 62:13	104:16 106:9
188:6			80:19 81:2 85:4	110:13,14,22
unique 92:4			85:5 86:16,24	111:22 112:5

115:22 119:15	women 31:5	52:22 76:20	122:12,13 126:3	112:4
121:12 123:3,8	42:16 56:5 58:4	128:12 135:19	126:9,10 128:21	11/27/12 3:1 4:1
123:10 125:4,7	59:22 91:23	184:13	128:23,24	5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1
131:19 158:18	127:14 165:15	world 114:3	129:11,17	9:1 10:1 11:1
161:8,16 162:23	wonder 108:24	worth 68:11	133:21 138:23	12:1 13:1 14:1
162:24 165:23	179:13	84:17	140:18 143:18	15:1 16:1 17:1
169:10 172:10	wonderful 96:20	wouldn't 25:20	145:6 150:8	18:1 19:1 20:1
176:22 184:17	Worcester 112:9	57:23 87:2	151:18 152:21	21:1 22:1 23:1
we've 13:24 16:3	131:3	112:22 157:2	152:22,23 153:2	24:1 25:1 26:1
28:15,18,19,20	word 140:15	160:5	153:9 163:22	27:1 28:1 29:1
29:3,5,12,14,15	words 54:15,21	wounded 145:4	171:9,21,25	30:1 31:1 32:1
36:2 38:21	54:23 119:4	write 92:25	176:8,15,17	33:1 34:1 35:1
40:10,11,14	121:3 162:5	122:19	177:11,11 179:2	36:1 37:1 38:1
44:18 60:11	165:12,22,25	writes 102:11	179:3 184:21	39:1 40:1 41:1
77:19 78:3 95:8	171:5 172:16	writing 102:14	185:2,6	42:1 43:1 44:1
100:24 109:2	173:22 175:9	written 15:10	yelling 22:8 23:10	45:1 46:1 47:1
117:22 118:8	187:23	wrote 106:24	27:16 61:6 62:9	48:1 49:1 50:1
145:13 154:5	work 10:6 36:5,6	107:3	62:22 66:9,22	51:1 52:1 53:1
wheel 144:16	36:7 40:22 44:2		87:24 110:8	54:1 55:1 56:1
widely 184:18	63:24 86:17	Y	124:13 154:2	57:1 58:1 59:1
widow 179:13	109:19 110:11	yard 163:9	yesterday 119:12	60:1 61:1 62:1
wife 163:10,16	112:18 126:23	Yeah 27:6	119:13 187:18	63:1 64:1 65:1
175:18 176:10	128:4 129:3	year 9:12 11:12	York 15:12 16:14	66:1 67:1 68:1
willing 122:2,3	131:14 137:5	20:8 34:2 53:19	23:23 48:10	69:1 70:1 71:1
124:4,11,12	138:21 139:21	68:18 71:6	117:14 146:9	72:1 73:1 74:1
170:10	149:8 150:17	94:20 104:9	young 49:23	75:1 76:1 77:1
willingness	157:12,15 160:7	135:24 141:2	56:19 57:8	78:1 79:1 80:1
126:19 161:7	165:20 167:12	150:14 157:23	91:25	81:1 82:1 83:1
169:3	167:14,21	158:23 160:12	younger 55:6	84:1 85:1 86:1
WILSON 1:11	168:19,20,21	160:15 187:6	107:11,12 130:3	87:1 88:1 89:1
window 146:2,5	170:17 172:20	188:2		90:1 91:1 92:1
154:3	175:6 179:12	years 6:5,23 8:10	Z	93:1 94:1 95:1
wind-driven	worked 6:10	11:6 12:22	zero 18:8,9	96:1 97:1 98:1
145:18	71:21,25 72:13	16:19,20 23:24	135:11	99:1 100:1
wing 155:8	144:17 150:18	24:7 36:19,23	zone 101:23	101:1 102:1
winning 138:23	163:3,24 177:25	40:19,20 48:24	zones 99:14	103:1 104:1
winter 8:17	workers 150:24	49:17 55:20,21		105:1 106:1
wires 135:15	workforce 134:12	55:24 58:9	1	107:1 108:1
wisdom 123:19	134:15	65:16 73:2,3	1:10 189:13	109:1 110:1
wish 79:5 149:20	working 3:11	74:19 79:11	10 162:7,8,9	111:1 112:1
witness 4:19,23	25:8 36:19	81:18 89:3	170:14	113:1 114:1
4:24 170:4	43:22 80:20	92:21,22 93:8	10th 129:14	115:1 116:1
173:19 179:22	138:17 162:12	94:14,25 95:2,3	10-77 24:25	117:1 118:1
179:22	166:14,16,18	95:17,21 102:21	10:15 1:7	119:1 120:1
witnesses 4:24	167:22,23	104:14 107:16	100 8:9 56:23,25	121:1 122:1
128:16 132:7	168:14	108:22 109:3	68:18 86:22	123:1 124:1
170:2,4 173:19	works 43:25	110:21,21	11 157:7 163:24	125:1 126:1
			11th 102:16 104:3	

127:1 128:1	32:1 33:1 34:1	149:1 150:1	2 37:10 154:24	300 17:10 20:7
129:1 130:1	35:1 36:1 37:1	151:1 152:1	155:15,15	22:15 32:14
131:1 132:1	38:1 39:1 40:1	153:1 154:1	20 2:12 6:19 17:7	53:14 90:10
133:1 134:1	41:1 42:1 43:1	155:1 156:1	17:9 51:5 54:12	151:8
135:1 136:1	44:1 45:1 46:1	157:1 158:1	57:21 66:10	31 26:13 73:7
137:1 138:1	47:1 48:1 49:1	159:1 160:1	89:2 110:21	320 8:20 9:9
139:1 140:1	50:1 51:1 52:1	161:1 162:1	111:12,14,17,22	33:19,21
141:1 142:1	53:1 54:1 55:1	163:1 164:1	139:13 156:23	33 142:10 179:3
143:1 144:1	56:1 57:1 58:1	165:1 166:1	171:21 177:10	35 138:23
145:1 146:1	59:1 60:1 61:1	167:1 168:1	177:11	35-foot 135:15
147:1 148:1	62:1 63:1 64:1	169:1 170:1	20-degree 135:16	35-year 138:14
149:1 150:1	65:1 66:1 67:1	171:1 172:1	200 22:6 53:25	3500 56:24
151:1 152:1	68:1 69:1 70:1	173:1 174:1	200-some 22:3	36 92:21 93:8
153:1 154:1	71:1 72:1 73:1	175:1 176:1	2000 24:15	94:25 183:3
155:1 156:1	74:1 75:1 76:1	177:1 178:1	2009 140:23	38 6:5 48:24
157:1 158:1	77:1 78:1 79:1	179:1 180:1	2010 25:11 112:11	49:17 152:21,22
159:1 160:1	80:1 81:1 82:1	181:1 182:1	2011 17:4 140:25	38-year 6:6
161:1 162:1	83:1 84:1 85:1	183:1 184:1	145:16,22 146:3	
163:1 164:1	86:1 87:1 88:1	185:1 186:1	2012 1:7 17:5	4
165:1 166:1	89:1 90:1 91:1	187:1 188:1	141:4 146:9	4 157:10
167:1 168:1	92:1 93:1 94:1	189:1	190:7	4th 159:19 180:5
169:1 170:1	95:1 96:1 97:1	139 74:19	2013 6:20 8:6	180:6
171:1 172:1	98:1 99:1 100:1	15 2:12 4:10 6:19	2015 33:17,18	4,000 188:23
173:1 174:1	101:1 102:1	48:6 54:12	21 182:22	40 11:5
175:1 176:1	103:1 104:1	102:7 111:21	21st 184:8	400 1:6
177:1 178:1	105:1 106:1	152:23 159:11	211 187:8	47 142:10
179:1 180:1	107:1 108:1	159:17	22 124:7 133:7	5
181:1 182:1	109:1 110:1	150 8:7 34:4,7	142:2 145:3	5 168:24
183:1 184:1	111:1 112:1	68:17 158:2	152:8 186:16,20	5th 145:22
185:1 186:1	113:1 114:1	156 182:12	188:22	5,000 143:17
187:1 188:1	115:1 116:1	159,000 53:7	23 153:9	55 36:23
189:1	117:1 118:1	16 179:2	24th 145:16	56 182:15
111 188:9	119:1 120:1	160 53:25 122:7	25 24:7 36:19	57 182:20
12 8:22 104:9	121:1 122:1	156:18	27 1:7 190:7	58 160:9
153:14,22	123:1 124:1	17 115:16 171:9	270 17:5,10 57:20	58's 37:9
163:22	125:1 126:1	173:6	88:8,12 90:6,7,8	
12th 153:23	127:1 128:1	170 53:25	90:16	6
120929 1:15 3:1	129:1 130:1	18 138:23	28 24:7 36:19	6 112:10 131:3
4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1	131:1 132:1	1896 102:12	128:21,23	60-some 67:23
8:1 9:1 10:1	133:1 134:1	19 112:12	29 92:21 94:25	62's 37:9
11:1 12:1 13:1	135:1 136:1	19th 146:3		7
14:1 15:1 16:1	137:1 138:1	1974 6:4	3	7 157:11 160:8
17:1 18:1 19:1	139:1 140:1	1990s 24:15	3 157:9	167:9 171:9
20:1 21:1 22:1	141:1 142:1	1998 108:15,19	3rd 27:11 28:17	70-some 67:22
23:1 24:1 25:1	143:1 144:1	1999 112:9	3:00 139:8	
26:1 27:1 28:1	145:1 146:1	2	30 24:7 36:19	8
29:1 30:1 31:1	147:1 148:1		110:21 143:18	

80 8:9 68:18
156:17,20

9

9 183:23 184:7
90s 108:7
92 108:3