

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC PROPERTY AND
PUBLIC WORKS

Room 400, City Hall
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania
Tuesday, September 25, 2012
1:10 p.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCILMAN BOBBY HENON, CHAIR
COUNCILWOMAN JANNIE BLACKWELL
COUNCILMAN BILL GREEN
COUNCILMAN WILLIAM K. GREENLEE
COUNCILMAN JAMES KENNEY
COUNCILMAN MARK SQUILLA

BILL 120534 - An ordinance amending Title 10 of The Philadelphia Code, entitled "Regulation of Individual Conduct and Activity," to prohibit certain activities that damage, deface, or risk damage to, public artwork or memorials, and to provide for penalties for violations of such prohibitions, all under certain terms and conditions.

- - -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCILMAN HENON: Good
afternoon, ladies and gentlemen. We have
a quorum now. This is -- the start of
the Committee of Public Property and
Public Works is now in session.

Clerk, would you please read
the title of the bill.

THE CLERK: Bill No. 120534, an
ordinance amending Title 10 of The
Philadelphia Code, entitled "Regulation
of Individual Conduct and Activity," to
prohibit certain activities that damage,
deface, or risk damage to, public artwork
or memorials, and to provide for
penalties for violations of such
prohibitions, all under certain terms and
conditions.

COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you.
Again, I'd like to recognize
that we have a quorum present. To my
left, Councilman Greenlee. To my right,
Councilman Kenney and Councilman Squilla.

Thank you for joining today.
Is there anyone here from the

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 Administration that wishes to testify on
3 Bill No. 120534?

4 (Witnesses approached witness
5 table.)

6 COUNCILMAN HENON: Good
7 afternoon. Want to state your name for
8 the record, please.

9 MR. STEUER: Good afternoon.
10 My name is Gary Steuer. I'm the Chief
11 Cultural Officer for the City of
12 Philadelphia, and I also direct the
13 Office of Arts, Culture and the Creative
14 Economy. With me today is Margot Berg,
15 who is Public Art Director for the City,
16 and I thank you for the opportunity to
17 testify today in support of Bill No.
18 120534.

19 The bill prohibits
20 institutional vandalism, which is the
21 intentional desecration as defined in the
22 Crime Code; i.e., vandalizing, defacing,
23 defiling or damaging any public artwork
24 or memorial. This bill also prohibits
25 skateboarders, roller bladers or

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 bicyclists from intentionally coming into
3 contact with any such outdoor public
4 artwork or memorial or causing such
5 skateboard, roller blades or bicycle to
6 come into contact with any such outdoor
7 public artwork or memorial. The
8 penalties for violations of such
9 prohibition shall be a fine of up to
10 \$2,000 and imprisonment of up to 90 days.
11 However, imprisonment shall not be
12 imposed on a minor or his or her parent.

13 As you are aware, Philadelphia
14 is known throughout the world for the
15 high quality, extensive variety, and
16 sheer number of pieces of public art on
17 view throughout the City. As home to the
18 City's Public Art Program, the Office of
19 Arts, Culture and the Creative Economy is
20 responsible for the care and oversight of
21 the City's collection of public art and
22 monuments. It's our responsibility to
23 secure the funding to undertake
24 restoration projects for public sculpture
25 and to endeavor to treat the City-owned

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 sculptures that have been subject to
3 vandalism.

4 Our city's recognition as one
5 of the great public art cities in the
6 world with the oldest percent for art
7 program in America and more public art
8 than any other American city is an
9 important component of the City's tourism
10 promotion and of our reputation and
11 brand. Many of our works of public art
12 have become iconic, such as the Robert
13 Indiana LOVE sculpture and Claes
14 Oldenburg's Clothespin.

15 When these works of art are
16 defaced or damaged, it presents a
17 negative image to residents and visitors
18 alike. Damage to monuments shows
19 disrespect to those being honored and, in
20 fact, encourages additional vandalism.

21 This bill does not represent a
22 solution to a non-existent problem. In
23 fact, vandalism and defacement of
24 monuments and public art is an ongoing
25 problem. Examples include the LOVE

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 sculpture, which is regularly and
3 routinely hit with graffiti and stickers,
4 which requires a professional conservator
5 to clean so as not to damage the
6 sculpture's surface. Skateboarding off
7 the base of the William McKinley Memorial
8 has severely damaged the granite and
9 harmed its appearance. To repair this
10 would be extremely costly. In addition,
11 the recently installed Oldenburg Paint
12 Torch at the Pennsylvania Academy of Fine
13 Arts has also been impacted. The paint
14 glob adjacent to the brush has been
15 extremely damaged by skateboarding. The
16 Academy has already had to remove,
17 restore, and reinstall the glob in a
18 different position and installed textured
19 pavers to discourage this activity.
20 These repairs and changes have reduced
21 but not eliminated the problem. Also,
22 there are public sculptures in
23 neighborhood parks that have been damaged
24 by vandalism such that the cost to repair
25 them is prohibitive and may exceed their

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 value.

3 I support Bill 120534 as it
4 addresses the need to eliminate and
5 discourage the vandalism of our
6 collection and other elements in the
7 public realm. There are many public
8 monuments and sculptures that suffer the
9 destructive efforts of intentional and
10 unintentional vandalism and wrongful
11 contact, costing untold dollars to the
12 City and other property owners and often
13 putting these monuments at risk of loss.

14 The bill will help to
15 communicate that this kind of activity,
16 which demonstrates a disregard for public
17 spaces and monuments, is quite harmful
18 and has a significant cost associated
19 with it and won't be tolerated.

20 Philadelphia's public art is
21 there for all to enjoy. It represents an
22 investment in our shared environment,
23 meant to beautify and commemorate, to
24 elicit conversation, and encourage the
25 positive and communal use of our public

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 spaces. The defacement and destruction
3 of these one-of-a-kind artworks,
4 memorials, and monuments represents
5 costly and often permanent damage to our
6 shared public assets.

7 Thank you for the opportunity
8 to submit this testimony. We have
9 proposed clarifying amendments to be
10 considered for adoption, and I'm now
11 happy, along with my colleagues, to
12 answer any questions that you may have.

13 MS. BERG: And I should add, we
14 are requesting a suspension of the rules
15 today.

16 COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay. Thank
17 you.

18 Mr. Steuer, thank you for your
19 testimony. I have a few questions.

20 Can you tell me how much the
21 City spends in combatting the defacing
22 and the vandalism of our public works and
23 public memorials annually and how is it
24 budgeted?

25 MR. STEUER: I will give you an

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 answer and then I'll ask Margot to
3 elaborate.

4 There used to be a budget, I
5 believe of \$50,000, for conservation and
6 maintenance of public art, and in the
7 initial economic downturn in the middle
8 of Fiscal '09, that was eliminated from
9 the budget and has not been restored at
10 this point. So there is actually no
11 ongoing regular budget for conservation
12 and maintenance, and Margot will talk
13 about what she has to do to sort of
14 scrape together the resources to be able
15 to deal with this problem.

16 MS. BERG: Right. So there is
17 no set-aside funding anymore for
18 emergency work on public art. And this
19 bill also applies to privately owned
20 things in the public realm too, such as
21 the Vietnam Veterans Memorial. A lot of
22 these entities have maintenance
23 endowments associated with them, which is
24 what we always require now when any
25 public art is installed on City property

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 such that there is a dedicated funding
3 source ongoing for any kind of repairs,
4 any kind of damage, and then just general
5 routine maintenance. So for the things
6 that we have had to address, literally
7 eking out funds, little bits of funds,
8 from projects that are already ongoing
9 that we can find, but it's a total
10 struggle, and we're at zero.

11 COUNCILMAN HENON: Gary, can
12 you explain to the Committee the new
13 penalties and fines. What were they
14 based upon? Are they based upon other
15 best practices in other cities, and how
16 did you come up with the fine structure?

17 MR. STEUER: With that, I'd
18 have to turn to Law.

19 Do you have a sense of how the
20 fines were arrived at?

21 (Witness approached witness
22 table.)

23 MR. MURKEN: If I may, my name
24 is Bob Murken and I'm with the Appeals
25 and Legislation Unit in the Law

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 Department. And to answer your question,
3 I think the view was -- I can't really
4 speak to the policy firsthand, but the
5 view is really that the offenses are
6 rather serious and the City wants a
7 substantial deterrent to the activity.

8 COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay. Mr.
9 Steuer, can you tell us how many
10 violations were issued so far in FY12 and
11 last year under the current code that
12 deals with this issue?

13 MR. STEUER: I will have to get
14 back to you with that answer. I don't
15 know.

16 Do you know?

17 MS. BERG: I don't know either.
18 We'll get back to you.

19 COUNCILMAN HENON:
20 Specifically, skateboarding. I mean,
21 were there a lot -- I mean, just
22 generally -- you can provide to the Chair
23 at another time, of course, but have
24 there been an enormous amount or a lot of
25 violations written to, for instance,

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 skateboarding?

3 MR. STEUER: Well, there have
4 been substantial instances of damage
5 that's associated with it, but I don't
6 know how many of those have actually
7 resulted in actual violations being
8 issued, tickets being issued to
9 individuals. I'd have to get that
10 information back to you.

11 COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay. When
12 you get it, you can just provide it to
13 the Chair.

14 MR. STEUER: Sure.

15 COUNCILMAN HENON: Are there
16 any questions from the Committee?

17 (No response.)

18 COUNCILMAN HENON: Anybody else
19 from the Administration that wishes --
20 you know what, I have a final question
21 for the Administration.

22 So if this legislation passes
23 and leaves the Committee with a favorable
24 recommendation and becomes a law, is
25 there a plan in place to publicize the

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 new penalties and fines if it's approved?

3 MR. STEUER: We would certainly
4 be very eager to spread the word about
5 this and we would do all in our power and
6 work with our colleagues in the
7 Administration to make sure that the
8 message gets out there.

9 COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay. I
10 believe my colleague has a question.

11 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you.
12 It may state in the bill. This
13 is the first I've seen the bill, but who
14 is in charge of enforcement?

15 MS. BERG: The police, I
16 expect.

17 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: The way it
18 seems anecdotally that they're not
19 enforcing the current law. Why would
20 this \$2,000 scare anybody more than 300
21 if no one is going to enforce it?

22 MR. STEUER: Well, our hope
23 would be, one, that just the publicizing
24 of this would have a certain deterrent
25 effect, because the fine is significantly

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 larger. I don't know if there are plans
3 in place to step up enforcement, and
4 that's one thing that we can certainly
5 look into.

6 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Again, it's
7 a matter of personnel and available
8 individuals who are not doing anything
9 else to kind of do this. I keep on
10 trying to bring the Parking Authority
11 into a lot of these enforcement issues,
12 but there seems to be an Administration
13 reticence to deal with the Parking
14 Authority. So, I mean, I don't see
15 police officers writing tickets for
16 skateboarding. It probably would be more
17 effective if they took the skateboard and
18 made the parents come and pick it up or
19 not give it back. That would probably be
20 more effective than a fine or a citation.

21 But, again, I mean, I have no
22 problem supporting this legislation,
23 increasing the fine, but if there's no
24 enforcement, it could be \$10,000 an
25 incident and they're still going to

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 sticker up the LOVE statue and deface the
3 memorial, Vietnam Veterans Memorial on
4 Memorial Day. I mean, I don't know --
5 again, I'm certainly willing to support
6 the bill, but without an enforcement
7 mechanism, I don't see where it's going
8 to be effective at all.

9 MR. STEUER: I understand your
10 point, and we'll take that message back.

11 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: And if you
12 can bring back to the Administration the
13 part about the dreaded Parking
14 Authority -- and I mean that in the
15 nicest way -- probably is more effective
16 in issuing the citations, because they're
17 on the street and they're not fighting
18 major crime. So the police are diverted
19 and the Parking Authority is there.

20 So it's just a suggestion. If
21 you want to do an MOU to allow the
22 Parking Authority to write some of these
23 citations, it may be more effective,
24 because they're all over where -- all the
25 delineated parts of this bill where the

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 designations of the streets are, they're
3 all patrolled by the Parking Authority
4 anyway. So just a suggestion.

5 MR. STEUER: Great. Thank you.

6 MS. BERG: Good point.

7 COUNCILMAN HENON: For the
8 record, I want to recognize to my left
9 Councilwoman Blackwell joining us, as
10 well to my right Councilman Bill Green.

11 Thank you, Mr. Steuer.

12 Is there anyone else from the
13 Administration who wishes to testify on
14 Bill No. 120534, or any other questions
15 from the Committee?

16 (No response.)

17 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you
18 for coming.

19 MR. STEUER: Thank you.

20 COUNCILMAN HENON: I understand
21 we have Michael Norris, who is Vice
22 President for External Relations at the
23 Greater Philadelphia Cultural Alliance,
24 and Jimmie Greeno, head of security for
25 the Pennsylvania Academy of Fine Arts,

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 here to testify on Bill No. 120534. Can
3 we hear first from Mr. Norris, please.

4 (Witness approached witness
5 table.)

6 MR. NORRIS: Good afternoon,
7 members of Council. My name is Michael
8 Norris. I'm the Vice President of
9 External Relations at the Greater
10 Philadelphia Cultural Alliance. The
11 Alliance represents over 400 regional
12 non-profit arts and cultural
13 organizations, including the Association
14 for Public Art, the Mural Arts Program,
15 the City Parks Association, the Fairmount
16 Park Conservancy, the Parkway Council,
17 and the Preservation Alliance, all
18 organizations dedicated to promoting and
19 preserving our city's public art.

20 As Gary testified, the depth of
21 public art in Philadelphia is
22 unparalleled. There are over 1,400
23 catalogued pieces in the Association of
24 Public Arts inventory alone, and if you
25 include murals and privately commissioned

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 work, Philadelphia is home to thousands
3 of amazing public works of art, making us
4 truly a free and accessible museum
5 without walls, a city recognized
6 internationally for its incredible civic
7 landscape.

8 But that asset for our city is
9 also a serious responsibility. Those
10 works must be maintained and protected.
11 Weather, pollution, and the passing of
12 time require the City, the Office of Arts
13 and Culture, the Association of Public
14 Art, and other civic and non-profit
15 agencies to dedicate significant
16 resources to preserving and maintaining
17 these iconic works of art. To add
18 vandalism and damage from misuse tips the
19 scales and makes the maintenance of these
20 works unsustainable. This is why we
21 support this bill.

22 With limited resources to
23 maintain wear and tear and without the
24 passage of this bill, even minor illegal
25 damage to these public works runs the

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 risk of destroying the delicate balance
3 of resources available. Not unlike the
4 broken window theory, even a small amount
5 of damage left unrepaired can cause a
6 domino effect of further misuse. This
7 bill would prevent that cycle.

8 In a city that was the first to
9 establish a percent for art program in
10 1959, a city known around the world for
11 the LOVE statue and the Clothespin, it
12 would be a tragedy if these works were
13 put at risk. If they are not protected,
14 future artists will be less willing to
15 contribute their time and talent to
16 beautifying our city, and future
17 generations will not have the wealth of
18 public beauty that we are so lucky to
19 experience today.

20 It is ironic that many of our
21 signature public artworks, particularly
22 our murals, were created to combat civic
23 decay and to revitalize communities
24 around the City. Many of our public art
25 projects, especially our murals, engage

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 community members themselves, working
3 alongside professional artists in the
4 artistic process. In this way, public
5 art has a stabilizing influence on
6 neighborhoods, and that can be seen not
7 just in Center City but across
8 Philadelphia. Love letters, a series of
9 over four dozen murals in West
10 Philadelphia, beautified properties once
11 prized by graffiti artists, with the
12 artist himself, Steve Powers,
13 transforming walls that he once illegally
14 vandalized in his teens. This bill
15 ensures that the transformative impact of
16 public works such as Love Letters, the
17 split button at the University of
18 Pennsylvania or, my personal favorite,
19 Three-Way Piece Number 1 by Henry Moore
20 at 16th and the Parkway remain vibrant,
21 beautiful, and accessible for all.

22 Yesterday the Cultural Alliance
23 released an economic impact report, Arts,
24 Culture and Economic Prosperity, that
25 documented the incredible impact of our

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 cultural sector on the region, generating
3 billions in spending, supporting tens of
4 thousands of jobs in every neighborhood
5 of the City, and attracting high-spending
6 tourists from across the world. But we
7 have also documented that the cultural
8 sector operates on incredibly thin
9 margins. These works of public art are
10 not just gifts to the citizens of
11 Philadelphia; they are our
12 responsibility. They represent who we
13 are, our collective identity, a symbol of
14 how we define ourselves as a city and as
15 a community.

16 Thank you again for giving me
17 this opportunity to speak today, and I
18 urge you to pass this bill to protect
19 these works of art and to ensure that
20 Philadelphia remains a world-class city.

21 Thank you.

22 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you,
23 Mr. Norris. I'm going to ask a question.
24 How much do you spend or have spent on
25 maintenance and repair, emergency repair,

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 to combat defacing vandalism of all the
3 murals and public art?

4 MR. NORRIS: That would be
5 zero, but that's not in our mandate, our
6 mission. We're really a service
7 organization and a leadership
8 organization for the sector. So we help
9 our members, like the ones I mentioned,
10 Association for Public Art, Mural Arts,
11 Fairmount Park Conservancy, et cetera,
12 strengthen their management and
13 operations so they can be better
14 positioned to fulfill their own missions.

15 COUNCILMAN HENON: Have you
16 been hearing a climb, an increase of
17 vandalism and defacing of some of the art
18 and the public property in the
19 association that you've been dealing
20 with?

21 MR. NORRIS: Yeah. You know,
22 we try to stay pretty plugged in to
23 what's going on in the community. So
24 when things get damaged or there's
25 sometimes skateboarders particularly sort

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 of get interested in the same things and
3 it attracts sort of a ripple effect of
4 interest, we become aware of those things
5 either from our own observation or from
6 communications from our members.

7 COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay. Thank
8 you.

9 Any other questions from the
10 Committee?

11 (No response.)

12 COUNCILMAN HENON: I have no
13 further questions.

14 MR. NORRIS: Thank you.

15 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you.

16 Mr. Jimmie Greeno.

17 (Witness approached witness
18 table.)

19 MR. GREENO: Good afternoon,
20 Mr. President and members of Council. I
21 want to thank you for this opportunity to
22 address this ordinance.

23 I support Bill No. 120534, as
24 it addresses the need to eliminate and
25 discourage the vandalism of our recently

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 installed Claes Oldenburg Paint Torch.
3 The Oldenburg sculpture is part of the
4 Lenfest Plaza, which is a
5 multi-million-dollar investment and
6 valued partnership with the City,
7 Pennsylvania Academy of Fine Arts, and
8 the Lenfests. The sculpture has become
9 an icon for the City, and it brings the
10 number of works to four in Philadelphia
11 by this world-renowned artist, the most
12 of any city in the world. It has
13 appeared on the cover of five art and
14 tourism magazines. Recently, the Toronto
15 Globe and Mail described it as the
16 signpost for the arts in Philadelphia.
17 The proposed ordinance and enforcement of
18 it will help us to protect our investment
19 and the City's in Lenfest Plaza.

20 The paint glob adjacent to the
21 brush has been vastly damaged by
22 skateboards and bikes. Both the
23 skateboarders and bicyclists ride on the
24 glob portion of the Oldenburg frequently
25 during the mornings, evenings, and late

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 nights. We already had to remove the
3 glob temporarily so that the deep
4 scratches and gouges could be filled and
5 then repainted. When the glob returned,
6 we had to reorient the glob so that the
7 tip now faces Broad Street. This makes
8 it difficult to jump on the glob from the
9 Broad Street side, but it does not
10 entirely eliminate the damages.

11 We also had to add textured
12 pavers around the sculpture to prevent
13 skateboarders from gaining momentum
14 needed to jump onto the glob. At a cost
15 of more than 10,000, these repairs and
16 changes have reduced but not eliminated
17 the damages that we continue to endure.
18 The skateboarders and the bicyclists have
19 changed their approach by attempting to
20 jump on the glob from the 15th Street
21 side. It may be difficult to jump on the
22 glob from this direction, but it is not
23 impossible to do. The security staff at
24 PAFA has told me that some skateboarders
25 are still able to jump on the glob with

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 no problems.

3 In the past, we have hired
4 security officers to stand outside to
5 prevent this, but it became very
6 dangerous and costly to have security
7 posted on the Lenfest Plaza. The riders
8 would get violent and have threatened the
9 security officers when they were asked to
10 not ride on the glob. This solution
11 still did not prevent skateboarders and
12 bicyclists from jumping the glob
13 constantly. The cost of full-time
14 security was even higher than the
15 repairs.

16 Thank you for the opportunity
17 to submit this testimony on behalf of the
18 Pennsylvania Academy of Fine Arts. I'm
19 happy to answer any questions you may
20 have.

21 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you,
22 Mr. Greeno.

23 Does anybody from the Committee
24 have any questions?

25 (No response.)

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you.

3 Is there anyone else here who
4 wishes to testify? Is there Josh Nimo?

5 MR. NIMS: Josh Nims.

6 COUNCILMAN HENON: Nims.

7 (Witness approached witness
8 table.)

9 COUNCILMAN HENON: Please state
10 your name for the record, please.

11 MR. NIMS: My name is Josh
12 Nims. I'm the founder of Franklin's
13 Paine Skatepark Fund, which is the
14 primary advocate for skateboarders in the
15 City of Philadelphia. I'm also, a
16 separate hat, the Operations Manager for
17 Schuylkill River Development Corporation,
18 who manages the Schuylkill Trail. So I'm
19 coming to you conflicted, if you will.

20 I spend a great deal of my time
21 with my staff removing graffiti, removing
22 stickers, and repairing damage to all
23 parts of the Schuylkill Trail. Over a
24 million people in Philadelphia use that
25 trail every year, and we're very proud of

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 its success and proud of how clean we are
3 able to keep it. So I'm very sensitive
4 to the cost and the difficulty involved
5 in repairing and maintaining vandalism
6 and other damage to both public spaces
7 and to public art.

8 On the other side, though,
9 Franklin's Paine Skatepark Fund just in
10 the last year received a hundred thousand
11 dollar grant from the Knight Foundation
12 to create skateable sculpture around the
13 City in four different projects in West
14 Philadelphia. I hope that that
15 immediately resonates that that's part of
16 where some of this is coming from, that
17 we have -- skateboarding finds its way
18 into the urban environment, and without
19 supporting in any way any damage to
20 veterans memorials or other monuments in
21 the City, understanding that
22 skateboarding in the urban environment
23 isn't necessarily a malicious act,
24 although it does cause damage.

25 As a representative of

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 Franklin's Paine Skatepark Fund and of
3 the skateboarders, 50,000 of them in the
4 City of Philadelphia, my concern is with
5 the \$2,000 fine that's involved in this
6 bill. I completely understand the need
7 for a bill like this, to expand it.

8 We've had a great deal of damage to the
9 Vietnam Veterans Memorial near the
10 Delaware. I come from a long line of
11 Marines, and I feel very strongly against
12 that.

13 That being said, we sort of
14 take our 12-year-old. That's a lot of
15 times my example, because most
16 skateboarders are under the age of 14.
17 You're not always conscious of what that
18 piece of granite on the edge of the
19 sidewalk means. Certainly lessons should
20 be learned. Confiscation of the
21 skateboard, the \$300 fine that's already
22 in effect for the existing code I think
23 is an effective remedy against folks that
24 age, and that's most of who you're going
25 to be dealing with.

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 So that is really why I'm here.

3 I'd like you to consider not the overall
4 bill being a bad bill, because I think
5 it's a good bill, and I think Gary and I
6 think everybody else in the City has
7 worked very hard on this bill and the
8 Mayor, Councilman Oh, et cetera, but I am
9 concerned that \$2,000 is an awful lot to
10 saddle the parent of a child under 18,
11 and it could in many ways ruin the life
12 of someone 18 or older. Ninety days in
13 jail certainly is a way to ruin the life
14 of someone 18 years or older. Again,
15 they may have done something you didn't
16 want them to do, but I'm not sure the
17 punishment fits the crime.

18 So that's my statement to you.

19 COUNCILMAN HENON: Councilwoman
20 Blackwell.

21 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
22 you.

23 MR. NIMS: Hi, Councilwoman.

24 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Nice
25 to see you. And I thank you for the

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 skateboarding award that I received some
3 years ago. We went through many of this
4 at LOVE Park.

5 MR. NIMS: Yes, ma'am.

6 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: So
7 you're saying that Part A that talks
8 about a civil penalty of \$300 against a
9 child and his parent shouldn't exceed
10 that \$300 based upon each violation by a
11 child, that part you can live with?

12 MR. NIMS: Yes, ma'am. My
13 concern is our Section B, "penalty for a
14 violation of subsection (3) shall be a
15 fine of \$2,000 and imprisonment of up to
16 90 days."

17 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL:
18 Mr. Chairman, as Mr. Nims has said, they
19 pretty much created skateboarding in the
20 City, and, as you know, we're getting
21 ready to do a skateboarding park in West
22 Philly, as you know. I believe that the
23 City is big enough for every sport, every
24 person, and that it's not what we do but
25 how we do it, and we have to find a way

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 to work together. And I'm happy to
3 support his recommendation as one who
4 started and created the whole
5 skateboarding movement in our city and
6 that I'm happy to support Mr. Nims in his
7 request that we have Part A violation and
8 not Part B.

9 MR. NIMS: Thank you,
10 Councilwoman.

11 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you,
12 Councilwoman.

13 Any other questions from the
14 Committee?

15 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: I have a
16 question.

17 At this point, how often have
18 violations been issued as far as
19 skateboarders, fines that you know of?

20 MR. NIMS: We have not had a
21 heavy year for enforcement. Councilman
22 Kenney earlier stepped out, but he
23 actually had asked a similar question to
24 another member here, and there hasn't
25 been a lot of enforcement on the current

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 code up to this point. LOVE Park has
3 been extremely popular for skateboarding
4 this past year despite the existing ban,
5 largely because officers have other
6 places to be in the City right now.

7 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: I mean, I
8 sort of agree with Councilwoman
9 Blackwell, that we could raise the fine
10 to whatever we want. If we don't enforce
11 them, it's really not going to have any
12 value whatsoever. Whether the fines were
13 300 or 10,000 doesn't mean anything.
14 You're saying a \$300 fine would still be
15 a deterrent if it was issued?

16 MR. NIMS: I believe it would,
17 certainly for the younger skateboarders,
18 because their mom and dad is paying that
19 fine, and I don't think anybody has \$300
20 to throw away right now.

21 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And
22 confiscation of the skateboard.

23 MR. NIMS: And confiscation of
24 the skateboard.

25 There is an additional segment

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 there that if you pay quickly and promise
3 not to fight the ticket, I believe you
4 can get off with a \$75 fine, but your
5 parents have to come pick up the
6 skateboard as well. So if I'm correct --
7 and I shouldn't bring that up
8 necessarily, but I do know that
9 there's -- yes. It's under Enforcement
10 on our Page 4, Subsection (c). It's
11 basically a no contest fine.

12 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Is that
13 still in effect even with the \$2,000
14 fine?

15 MR. NIMS: That wasn't clear to
16 me. I was reading over this this
17 morning, and that was not clear to me. I
18 think that may be another clarification
19 that perhaps is needed in this bill. I
20 know there were some other clarifications
21 that are being requested by the Cultural
22 Office as well.

23 COUNCILMAN HENON: Counselor,
24 Mr. Bob Murken, could you please
25 approach.

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 (Witness approached witness
3 table.)

4 COUNCILMAN HENON: A few
5 questions. Some clarity on the question
6 at hand, and I think we have a few
7 questions after that.

8 MR. MURKEN: Sure. In terms of
9 institutional vandalism, this would be
10 subject to 112 of the code, which would
11 allow it to be enforced through a \$75
12 basically CVN amount. It's the amount
13 that you pay to quickly settle the ticket
14 without actually disputing it in court.
15 So it could be enforced through the \$75
16 route, the first half of it, the
17 institutional vandalism half of the
18 ordinance.

19 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So the
20 fine, even the fine of \$2,000 could be
21 settled for \$75?

22 MR. MURKEN: That's correct.

23 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Then why
24 are we raising it to \$2,000?

25 MR. MURKEN: If somebody were

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 to ignore the CVN, if you write the
3 ticket and say, I'm going to dispute
4 this, and the City actually goes through
5 to enforce it and it goes to court, then
6 the judge could impose a fine of up to
7 \$2,000. The ordinance does not require
8 the fine to be \$2,000, and generally
9 that's how courts will enforce it.
10 They'll use their discretion. It will be
11 somewhere between \$1 and \$2,000.

12 COUNCILMAN HENON: To your
13 knowledge -- and I believe it to be true
14 in my experience -- this is up to a
15 \$2,000 penalty for the lack of payment
16 for the CVN going to court, that's
17 somewhat of a standard practice elsewhere
18 within the City of Philadelphia?

19 MR. MURKEN: Yes. The City
20 frequently enforces the code in that
21 manner.

22 COUNCILMAN HENON: So somebody
23 would need to willfully ignore the CVN
24 and the adjudication hearing, the right
25 to contest the fine or violation at the

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 Bureau of Administration; is that
3 correct?

4 MR. MURKEN: Correct. Most
5 likely they'd have to go to court, put up
6 a real fight and lose, and then the judge
7 would be considering the facts of the
8 case and could impose a fine much less
9 than \$2,000. Two thousand dollars is the
10 upper limit.

11 COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay. And
12 that's the upper limit, that's the
13 ceiling which they can mandate on --

14 MR. MURKEN: That is correct.
15 My understanding is that judges
16 frequently do not impose the maximum fine
17 under the code. In fact, that's almost
18 the rule, that they won't impose the
19 maximum fine under the code unless
20 there's a real strong reason to do so.

21 COUNCILMAN HENON: All right.

22 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: What have
23 we done so far to this date of collection
24 of fines for these violations?

25 MR. MURKEN: Councilman,

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 unfortunately I don't have those facts at
3 hand. I couldn't tell you. I'd be happy
4 to -- the Administration may be in a
5 better position to supply that
6 information.

7 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Is there
8 anybody here from the Administration?

9 No. Okay.

10 MR. STEUER: We don't have an
11 answer to that question.

12 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All right.
13 Because I was wondering what the common
14 level fine is. Even if it's up to 300,
15 they probably wouldn't even have been
16 fined 300. Maybe the judge might fine
17 them a hundred dollars or something and
18 may have happened in the past.

19 MR. MURKEN: I'm sorry. I
20 don't understand the question.

21 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: The
22 current fine of \$300, so when they went
23 to court, the judge could actually fine
24 them for less than \$300, a fine of a
25 hundred or \$50?

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 MR. MURKEN: That's correct.

3 Generally when the code says the fine
4 shall be \$300, the courts will read that
5 to mean up to \$300. So courts can impose
6 significantly less.

7 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: How about
8 the imprisonment now, for the 90 days
9 imprisonment for the violation?

10 MR. MURKEN: Again, that's
11 within the discretion of the court. I
12 think it is -- it would be incredibly
13 unusual for a court to impose
14 imprisonment, and I think the DA would
15 have to seek that and go out of their way
16 to do that. I think it would be a rather
17 unusual circumstance. It would have to
18 be a very flagrant situation, but, again,
19 it's within the discretion of the court.

20 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Okay.
21 Thank you.

22 MR. MURKEN: And I should add,
23 not in any way mandatory.

24 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Right.

25 COUNCILMAN HENON: Councilwoman

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 Blackwell.

3 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
4 you.

5 But if we say it's within the
6 discretion of the court, I don't believe
7 that it is up to our body to,
8 quote/unquote, pass the buck. I don't
9 believe that we should say we don't think
10 in most cases it should be 2,000, we
11 don't think that we should lock people
12 up, but we want to give the courts the
13 authority to do so. I think we stand up
14 for those things we believe. I think, as
15 Mr. Nims has said, the punishment should
16 meet the crime.

17 I don't believe if you're
18 skateboarding on LOVE Park that you
19 should face the possibility. It seems to
20 me a penalty of \$300 and they talk about
21 each violation, based upon each violation
22 of the child, and it seems to me that we
23 have legislation on the books, and just
24 locking someone up and fining them at
25 \$2,000 in this economy, my God, we have

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 people who are hungry. We can't even get
3 that straight and we want to lock people
4 up for 2,000. Geez. I'd rather us worry
5 about what we're going to do to try to
6 feed some of those people standing out
7 there.

8 But we come for this kind of
9 punitive legislation when there's so many
10 things that we should spend our time on,
11 and I believe locking people up for up to
12 90 days and fining them \$2,000 is just a
13 bit much.

14 Mr. Chairman, that's just my
15 opinion.

16 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you,
17 Councilwoman.

18 Mr. Murken, can you just
19 quickly please explain to the Committee
20 again the different penalties, the \$75
21 penalty, the \$300 penalty and again the
22 \$2,000.

23 MR. MURKEN: Well --

24 COUNCILMAN HENON: Up to
25 \$2,000, court imposed.

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 MR. MURKEN: For the first
3 offense, which is institutional
4 vandalism, if you look under 10-203, the
5 penalty for any act of institutional
6 vandalism under the bill would be up to
7 \$2,000. When it says Class III offense,
8 that means up to \$2,000 and an
9 imprisonment of up to 90 days. That is
10 if it is fully litigated in court. That
11 provision for institutional vandalism can
12 be enforced through the CVN process where
13 essentially you would pay \$75 and never
14 go to court and the case goes away.

15 With respect to the other piece
16 of the bill, which is the specific
17 provisions that deal with skateboarding
18 and bicycling and roller blading, again,
19 the same basic fine structure applies.
20 It's up to \$2,000 and the potential to
21 seek 90 days imprisonment, although,
22 again, that's not necessarily likely.
23 But that can be -- there's an additional
24 provision to that that tweaks the CVN
25 process, so that the CVN amount for that

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 is \$500 rather than \$75. And --

3 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Where did
4 that come from?

5 MR. MURKEN: Councilman, if you
6 look under -- it should be the last page.

7 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Down the
8 bottom. I see it.

9 MR. MURKEN: "Pursuant to the
10 procedures set forth at 1-112, except
11 that the amount to be remitted pursuant
12 to 112(3) in response to a notice of
13 violation shall be \$500."

14 Also with respect to the
15 skateboarding and bicycling and roller
16 blading provision, the City would have
17 the power to forfeit the equipment, the
18 skateboard, the bike or the roller
19 blades, just take it away from the
20 person.

21 And I should also add under
22 the -- let's just call it for short, the
23 skateboarding provision, minors are not
24 subject to imprisonment. It's only for
25 adults.

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So the
3 \$500 is in place of the \$75?

4 MR. MURKEN: Correct.

5 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So if this
6 passes, for you to be able to settle this
7 without going to court, you have to pay
8 \$500?

9 MR. MURKEN: That's correct.

10 COUNCILMAN HENON: Any
11 questions from the Committee, members of
12 the Committee?

13 Councilman Greenlee.

14 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank
15 you, Mr. Chairman. I didn't think it was
16 going to take this long, but I guess
17 every question leads to another one.

18 Just so I'm clear, the \$2,000,
19 where did that figure -- I think this was
20 asked earlier, but I just want to be
21 clear. Where did that figure come from?

22 MR. MURKEN: Councilman, I
23 think that's a policy issue. I don't
24 want to tread on the domain of the
25 Administration. Perhaps Mr. Steuer can

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 speak to that.

3 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Like I
4 said, I know that was asked before,
5 because I think one of the concerns is,
6 at least by some of the members, it's a
7 little high. So the question is -- and
8 it might be a fair figure. I'm not
9 saying it's not. I'm just trying to
10 figure out where that came from, you
11 know. I mean, it would seem kind of like
12 a basic question.

13 MR. MURKEN: Mr. Steuer can
14 speak to that.

15 (Witness approached witness
16 table.)

17 MR. STEUER: I don't have
18 information on how that specific number
19 was arrived at. This sort of arrived in
20 my bailiwick after that number had been
21 set already, but my assumption is that an
22 attempt was made to set a number high
23 enough so that its existence would have a
24 deterrent value.

25 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: And

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 obviously by saying that, \$300, in the
3 Administration's opinion, did not serve
4 as a deterrent; is that right?

5 MR. STEUER: Correct.

6 COUNCILMAN HENON: Councilwoman
7 Blackwell.

8 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: If we
9 are not enforcing 300, then why would we
10 raise it to 2,000? And to say you're not
11 going to arrest children does not in any
12 way allay any of my concerns. It's
13 insulting. But I don't -- if you're not
14 dealing with the 300, why are we raising
15 it? Why don't we just talk about
16 enforcement? And it seems to me if the
17 Chair asks and my colleague Councilman
18 Greenlee asks where the \$2,000 amount
19 came from, somebody should be able to
20 answer the question. It didn't come from
21 the moon. Somebody had to make a
22 determination. How can you expect us to
23 pass this punitive legislation when you
24 can't even say where it came from?
25 Somebody came up with the figure. So how

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 can you expect us to raise the figure to
3 \$2,000 when you don't know where it came
4 from? Why can't we talk about enforcing
5 the laws on the books?

6 MR. STEUER: Well, all I can
7 say was that I think the sense was that
8 since resources are so limited in terms
9 of enforcement right now -- and I
10 certainly understand. I would like to
11 see more enforcement as well -- that
12 perhaps the message that would be sent by
13 a larger penalty would have a deterrent
14 effect, which would help with this
15 problem.

16 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: I
17 still do not feel, Mr. Chairman and
18 members of this Committee, that it is our
19 job to nickel and dime the public to
20 death. Here we go with another fine,
21 another way we raise money for the City,
22 and I just don't think this is the way to
23 do it. I think, again, that we should
24 deal with enforcement, ask the City to
25 talk about that, and not say here's

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 another way we can raise money for the
3 City. That's what it seems to me this
4 is, another tax on the citizens of our
5 city. I don't agree with it.

6 MS. BERG: May I add one thing?
7 I think also part of the sense of raising
8 the fine is to have it in some way
9 reflect the cost that the City and the
10 taxpayers end up paying in repairing and
11 remediating the effects of types of
12 vandalism on the public sculptures and
13 memorials. Because they are the nature
14 that they are, that they're in fact
15 artworks and they're not just throwing
16 down a new paver, the cost is high and
17 the risk of loss to these sort of
18 invaluable assets is high. And so I
19 think that's part of the reason for this
20 number, that it is more of a deterrent
21 and reflects that cost to the taxpayers.

22 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: But
23 you don't indicate that in those -- no
24 statement says it costs this much to do
25 that. This is the cost. This is why we

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 need to raise it. This is the cost to
3 the City. This is the cost to that
4 beautiful artwork or sculpture. That's
5 not in here.

6 MS. BERG: It varies depending
7 on what the thing is.

8 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Well,
9 you can't ask us for money but say, Just,
10 you know, listen to me, it costs us
11 money, but you won't say what it costs.

12 We're expected to make
13 intelligent decisions about issues
14 affecting the public and what we charge
15 them, but you've got to give us the
16 information we request if you expect us
17 to do that. If you want me to raise
18 money and you're saying that the money --
19 are you saying that the money goes to
20 repair these artworks, then how much does
21 that cost? I mean, it could cost from \$5
22 to \$5,000. I don't know. We have no
23 idea, but you don't say that either. And
24 I don't think that it's fair that you
25 would ask us to raise money and you don't

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 give us the information that we
3 requested. We haven't gotten it here
4 today.

5 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: My
6 question too, if the fines are collected,
7 where does those funds, where do they go?

8 MR. STEUER: My understanding
9 is, they go to the General Fund. So
10 they're not specifically dedicated to --

11 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL:
12 Another tax, gentlemen.

13 MR. STEUER: -- repair of
14 the --

15 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So it goes
16 to the General Fund, but it may not go to
17 repairing what you need to get repaired?

18 MR. STEUER: Correct.

19 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.

20 COUNCILMAN HENON: If I could
21 bring up Mr. Murken again one more time,
22 please.

23 (Witness approached witness
24 table.)

25 COUNCILMAN HENON: Counselor,

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 if you could just so -- it seems to be a
3 little confusing here, as you can
4 imagine. You have different types of
5 fines for different types of public works
6 defacing and vandalism.

7 When it comes to the \$2,000
8 fine, penalty, the maximum, I just want
9 it to be a clear response, is this
10 consistent throughout the City of
11 Philadelphia for most violations that we
12 have that ends up in court? Like if we
13 have -- for instance, L&I, if there's a
14 notice of violation, somebody doesn't fix
15 their problems, their issues, it goes to
16 court. Is there a maximum fine that the
17 court is allowed to impose?

18 MR. MURKEN: The maximum fine
19 that the City is allowed to impose for
20 any violation of the code is \$2,000.
21 When the City sets a \$2,000 fine in the
22 code or a fine of any amount, courts
23 generally will read that to give them the
24 discretion of imposing an amount up to
25 that amount that was set in the code.

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 COUNCILMAN HENON: That's for
3 any violation? And I'm just trying to
4 get clear, because I do know the answer.

5 So any violation in the City of
6 Philadelphia that ends up in court has a
7 maximum fine of \$2,000 that the court can
8 impose, if they choose?

9 MR. MURKEN: Let me qualify
10 that. If the code says a fine of \$300
11 shall be imposed, the court can't go
12 above \$300. If the code says a fine of
13 \$2,000 shall be imposed, the court can't
14 go over \$2,000.

15 COUNCILMAN HENON: Or up to
16 \$2,000.

17 MR. MURKEN: Correct. It can
18 go up to \$2,000.

19 COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay. Is
20 that helpful to anybody up here?

21 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: I
22 still think, Mr. Chairman, for us to just
23 tax people for the General Fund, another
24 way to bring in revenue, all we're
25 talking about here is another tax on

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 people who feel nickeled and dimed to

3 death. I don't think that we should do

4 it. I don't think it's fair, and they

5 have not said anything to dispute those

6 facts or figures. They've given us no

7 costs. They have not talked about what

8 repairs cost. They admit that we don't

9 have enforcement of 300. So why should

10 we pass something that says up to 2,000?

11 It seems to me that if the law

12 already states that it's 300, I think

13 then we talk about enforcement. I think

14 we're where it seems that it's

15 reasonable, or those who were here who

16 passed this legislation before thought

17 so, and I would hope that we wouldn't

18 pass legislation around which we have not

19 received information.

20 MS. BERG: May I just reiterate

21 one thing in terms of the budget? Just

22 the fact that there is no budget on hand

23 ongoing right now to make repairs when

24 vandalism happens. So I just --

25 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Then

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 why didn't you ask for that? Why didn't
3 you come in and say if a statue is
4 vandalized, this is what we're asking
5 for. You're not doing that. You're
6 saying let's lock somebody up up to 90
7 days, charge them \$2,000 if they
8 vandalize.

9 If you need money to repair
10 art, why don't you say that? That's not
11 what you're saying. That's not what this
12 legislation calls for. This is just
13 another tax or fine on the citizens of
14 Philadelphia. And you do us a favor
15 telling us you won't lock up children,
16 and that's the most insulting thing I've
17 heard all day. I think it's ridiculous.

18 MS. BERG: I think we're in a
19 situation where the incidences are
20 increasing and there's fewer resources to
21 handle it, and that's what we feel.

22 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: I
23 think you all should have thought about
24 what you want. You want money to repair
25 art. That should have been the

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 legislation. That would have been a
3 whole different question. But just to
4 fine people and lock them up up to 90
5 days and charge them \$2,000 when we're
6 not even enforcing 300 is just
7 ridiculous.

8 MS. BERG: Again, we're hoping
9 this is a deterrent when people get the
10 message that it's defining what public
11 art and memorials are, why it's
12 important, that to repair it comes out of
13 taxpayer dollars and that this is
14 something we'd like to discourage.

15 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: We're all
16 for it. I think everybody here is all
17 for repairing artwork and making sure
18 it's not destroyed and getting some extra
19 money into these programs, but this
20 doesn't even guarantee that, because if
21 you do raise the fines and the fine goes
22 into the General Fund, who's to say it's
23 ever going to be spent to repair
24 anything? Where do you get that gain
25 that it's going to be fixed? The

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 Administration can say, Well, if we do
3 get the extra money, we will give it to
4 you, and that's fine too, but there's no
5 correlation between the fines and fixing
6 the things that get destroyed.

7 Our goal should be to go there,
8 everything that does get destroyed gets
9 fixed from maybe some of the funds that
10 come in from these violations, and we
11 should try to actually try to enforce
12 what is there now so we could go and get
13 some extra money. But it still doesn't
14 guarantee us as Council or as the
15 organization to try to fix these
16 monuments and art pieces any of those
17 funds would actually go back to fixing
18 it. So why would we do it?

19 MS. BERG: We would love this
20 to go directly to a maintenance fund. My
21 understanding is that's not necessarily
22 something that's possible, that these
23 fees always go directly into the General
24 Fund, these collected penalties.

25 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Well,

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 maybe we could change that on Council.

3 COUNCILMAN GREEN:

4 Mr. Chairman, I agree with the purpose of
5 the bill. I agree with creating a
6 disincentive for people to -- you're
7 talking about someone taking an
8 affirmative action that mars or damages
9 public art in the public right-of-way in
10 some way, and the consequences for that
11 should be as severe as permissible under
12 state law, which is \$2,000.

13 And so I'm prepared to vote
14 this bill out of Committee, if the
15 Chairman wants to move it. I do have a 2
16 o'clock meeting that I have to go for.
17 So if we plan to move this bill, I'd be
18 happy to recess the public hearing, go
19 into the public meeting, record my vote
20 as aye and move on. If we're not going
21 to move the bill, I will move on.

22 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Can I
23 just ask one question. It should be
24 short.

25 Thank you. Just, again, so

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 we're real clear on this -- and I was
3 talking to the Chairman, and maybe we are
4 overcomplicating it a little bit, but the
5 maximum possible fine only comes in when
6 somebody ignores the violation and has to
7 go to court. Am I right, Mr. Murken?

8 MR. MURKEN: That is correct.

9 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Okay.

10 So --

11 MR. MURKEN: They can also go
12 to court and fight it, and in that case,
13 it would be possible for the court to
14 impose the maximum fine, but, again,
15 that's based -- in general, the facts
16 would have to be fairly egregious for
17 that.

18 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: I mean, I
19 have to tell you, I came in fully
20 prepared to vote for it. I think there's
21 been some legitimate questions raised,
22 but I guess in the long run, I kind of go
23 with what Councilman Green said, that
24 this is -- and I think the Chairman
25 said -- you're making this consistent.

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 This 2,000 is kind of a consistent
3 figure. It doesn't mean that's where
4 most fines will wind up, right? I mean,
5 you used the word "egregious." I mean,
6 in all honesty, it would have to be
7 somebody who kind of constantly violates
8 or showed a total disregard. Would that
9 be a fair -- I know you can't talk for
10 every judge, and that's, I think, our
11 concern here.

12 MR. MURKEN: I think that's
13 correct. My --

14 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Because I
15 think what we don't want is one kid being
16 stupid one day and getting locked up for
17 90 days, you know, or a young adult,
18 let's put it. I mean, that's a little
19 bit overboard. But I understand -- I
20 just wish the Administration came in with
21 a little bit more definitive reason why
22 it went from one figure to the next. I'm
23 still -- except to make it consistent,
24 I'm guess I'm not hearing that. And then
25 my question would be, why wasn't it

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 consistent to start with?

3 MR. MURKEN: Those are policy
4 questions. I know as your lawyer and the
5 Administration's lawyer, I can't really
6 get into policy, but with the
7 Administration --

8 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Okay. I
9 got you.

10 But I think I'd be willing to
11 move it with some reservations,
12 Mr. Chairman. Thank you.

13 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you.

14 Again, for clarity on process,
15 somebody gets a fine for -- the violation
16 for defacing or vandalism, whatever it
17 is, \$75, \$300, \$500, a hearing gets set
18 up with the Bureau of Administration, the
19 BAA, just like a parking ticket. You
20 don't show up to that hearing, you're
21 either -- or you appeal the violation.
22 So there's a process. So you don't show
23 up at the hearing. What happens next?
24 You get another letter saying, Hey,
25 whatever the fine was, plus penalties and

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 interest, and then you willfully ignore
3 and not pay that fine that was issued
4 regardless of the amount. Then it could
5 be nine months down the road. The Law
6 Department can choose to take it to court
7 or the City could take it to court; is
8 that correct?

9 MR. MURKEN: That's correct.
10 It may not necessarily be the Law
11 Department, is my understanding, but
12 eventually the City would file a code
13 complaint against you in Municipal Court.

14 COUNCILMAN HENON: Which could
15 take up to six, nine months?

16 MR. MURKEN: I'm not exactly
17 sure what the timeframe is, but that
18 doesn't sound off base.

19 COUNCILMAN HENON: I just want
20 to be clear on this. So you don't get a
21 piece of paper for a violation, a CVN,
22 for defacing and vandalism and saying,
23 Hey, you're subject up to \$2,000.

24 MR. MURKEN: They're enforcing
25 it under the CVN procedure. That's

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 completely correct.

3 COUNCILMAN HENON: I have no
4 further questions.

5 Any other members have any
6 questions?

7 (No response.)

8 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you.

9 Is there anyone else here that
10 wishes to testify on Bill No. 120534?

11 (No response.)

12 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you
13 for your testimony.

14 Seeing none, this concludes our
15 public hearing. We will now move to our
16 public meeting.

17 The Chair recognizes Councilman
18 Greenlee.

19 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank
20 you, Mr. Chairman. I move that Bill No.
21 120534 be reported out of Committee with
22 a favorable recommendation, rules
23 suspension to allow for first reading at
24 our next session of Council.

25 (Duly seconded.)

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 COUNCILMAN HENON: It has been
3 moved and seconded.

4 All those in favor?

5 (Aye.)

6 COUNCILMAN HENON: All those
7 opposed?

8 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Nay.

9 COUNCILMAN HENON: The ayes
10 have it.

11 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Wait a
12 minute. We have to pass amendments. I'm
13 sorry. I'm doing it too fast. We have
14 to pass the amendments.

15 COUNCILMAN HENON: The Chair
16 recognizes Councilman Greenlee.

17 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank
18 you, Mr. Chairman. Just to go back, I
19 move the adoption of the amendments to
20 Bill No. 120534.

21 (Duly seconded.)

22 COUNCILMAN HENON: All those in
23 favor?

24 (Aye.)

25 COUNCILMAN HENON: The ayes

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534

2 have it.

3 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Nay.

4 COUNCILMAN HENON: Let the

5 record reflect that Councilwoman

6 Blackwell is recorded as a nay.

7 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Mr.

8 Chair.

9 COUNCILMAN HENON: Councilman

10 Greenlee.

11 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank

12 you, Mr. Chairman. I move that Bill No.

13 120534, as amended, be reported out of

14 Committee with a favorable recommendation

15 and that the rules of Council be

16 suspended to allow for first reading at

17 our next session.

18 (Duly seconded.)

19 COUNCILMAN HENON: All those in

20 favor?

21 (Aye.)

22 COUNCILMAN HENON: All those

23 opposed?

24 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Nay.

25 COUNCILMAN HENON: The ayes

1 9/25/12 - PUBLIC PROPERTY - BILL 120534
2 have it.

3 This concludes our public
4 meeting.

5 Thank you.

6 (Committee on Public Property
7 and Public Works concluded at 2:05 p.m.)

8 - - -

9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the
proceedings, evidence and objections are
contained fully and accurately in the
stenographic notes taken by me upon the
foregoing matter on September 25, 2012, and
that this is a true and correct transcript of
same.

MICHELE L. MURPHY
RPR-Notary Public

(The foregoing certification of this
transcript does not apply to any reproduction
of the same by any means, unless under the
direct control and/or supervision of the
certifying reporter.)

A	3:9 17:6 23:19	approach 25:19 34:25	17:15,23 18:13 22:10,19	31:22 33:16 34:3 36:13 40:6 40:9,14,17 41:11
able 9:14 25:25 28:3 44:6 46:19	age 29:16,24	approached 3:4 10:21 17:4 23:17 27:7 35:2 45:15 50:23	assumption 45:21	Berg 3:14 8:13 9:16 11:17 13:15 16:6 48:6 49:6 53:20 54:18 55:8 56:19
Academy 6:12,16 16:25 24:7 26:18	agencies 18:15	approved 13:2	attempt 45:22	best 10:15
accessible 18:4 20:21	ago 31:3	arrest 46:11	attempting 25:19	better 22:13 38:5
accurately 66:5	agree 33:8 48:5 57:4,5	arrived 10:20 45:19,19	attracting 21:5	bicycle 4:5
act 28:23 42:5	alike 5:18	art 3:15 4:16,18 4:21 5:5,6,7,11 5:15,24 7:20 9:6 9:18,25 17:14 17:19,21 18:3 18:14,17 19:9 19:24 20:5 21:9 21:19 22:3,10 22:17 24:13 28:7 54:10,25 55:11 56:16 57:9	attracts 23:3	bicycling 42:18 43:15
action 57:8	allay 46:12	artist 20:12 24:11	authority 14:10 14:14 15:14,19 15:22 16:3 40:13	bicyclists 4:2 24:23 25:18 26:12
activities 1:16 2:13	Alliance 16:23 17:10,11,17 20:22	artistic 20:4	available 14:7 19:3	bill 1:12,15 2:8,9 3:1,3,17,19,24 4:1 5:1,21 6:1 7:1,3,14 8:1 9:1 9:19 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1,12,13 14:1 15:1,6,25 16:1,10,14 17:1 17:2 18:1,21,24 19:1,7 20:1,14 21:1,18 22:1 23:1,23 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1,6,7 30:1,4,4,5,7 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1,19 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1,6,16 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1,5,14 57:17,21 58:1
activity 1:16 2:12 6:19 7:15 11:7	allow 15:21 35:11 62:23 64:16	artists 19:14 20:3 20:11	award 31:2	
actual 12:7	allowed 51:17,19	arts 3:13 4:19 6:13 16:25 17:12,14,24 18:12 20:23 22:10 24:7,16 26:18	aware 4:13 23:4	
add 8:13 18:17 25:11 39:22 43:21 48:6	alongside 20:3	artwork 1:17 2:14 3:23 4:4,7 49:4 55:17	awful 30:9	
addition 6:10	amazing 18:3	artworks 8:3 19:21 48:15 49:20	aye 57:20 63:5,24 64:21	
additional 5:20 33:25 42:23	amended 64:13	asked 26:9 32:23 44:20 45:4	ayes 63:9,25 64:25	
address 10:6 23:22	amending 1:15 2:10	asking 54:4		
addresses 7:4 23:24	amendments 8:9 63:12,14,19	asks 46:17,18	B	
adjacent 6:14 24:20	America 5:7	asset 18:8	B 31:13 32:8	
adjudication 36:24	American 5:8	assets 8:6 48:18 associated 7:18 9:23 12:5	BAA 60:19	
Administration 3:2 12:19,21 13:7 14:12 15:12 16:13 37:2 38:4,8 44:25 56:2 59:20 60:7,18	amount 11:24 19:4 35:12,12 42:25 43:11 46:18 51:22,24 51:25 61:4	association 17:13	back 11:14,18 12:10 14:19 15:10,12 56:17 63:18	
Administration's 46:3 60:5	and/or 66:23		bad 30:4	
admit 53:8	anecdotally 13:18		bailiwick 45:20	
adoption 8:10 63:19	annually 8:23		balance 19:2	
adult 59:17	answer 8:12 9:2 11:2,14 26:19 38:11 46:20 52:4		ban 33:4	
adults 43:25	anybody 12:18 13:20 26:23 33:19 38:8 52:20		base 6:7 61:18	
advocate 27:14	anymore 9:17		based 10:14,14 31:10 40:21 58:15	
affirmative 57:8	anyway 16:4		basic 42:19 45:12	
afternoon 2:3 3:7	appeal 60:21		basically 34:11 35:12	
	Appeals 10:24		beautified 20:10	
	appearance 6:9		beautiful 20:21 49:4	
	appeared 24:13		beautify 7:23	
	applies 9:19 42:19		beautifying 19:16	
	apply 66:21		beauty 19:18	
			behalf 26:17	
			believe 9:5 13:10	

59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1,10,20 63:1 63:20 64:1,12 65:1 billions 21:3 bit 41:13 58:4 59:19,21 bits 10:7 Blackwell 1:11 16:9 30:20,21 30:24 31:6,17 33:9 40:2,3 46:7 46:8 47:16 48:22 49:8 50:11 52:21 53:25 54:22 63:8 64:3,6,24 bladers 3:25 blades 4:5 43:19 blading 42:18 43:16 Bob 10:24 34:24 BOBBY 1:11 body 40:7 books 40:23 47:5 bottom 43:8 brand 5:11 bring 14:10 15:12 34:7 50:21 52:24 brings 24:9 Broad 25:7,9 broken 19:4 brush 6:14 24:21 buck 40:8 budget 9:4,9,11 53:21,22 budgeted 8:24 Bureau 37:2 60:18 button 20:17	case 37:8 42:14 58:12 cases 40:10 catalogued 17:23 cause 19:5 28:24 causing 4:4 ceiling 37:13 Center 20:7 certain 1:16,18 2:13,17 13:24 certainly 13:3 14:4 15:5 29:19 30:13 33:17 47:10 CERTIFICATE 66:2 certification 66:20 CERTIFY 66:3 certifying 66:24 cetera 22:11 30:8 Chair 1:11 11:22 12:13 46:17 62:17 63:15 64:8 Chairman 31:18 41:14 44:15 47:17 52:22 57:4,15 58:3,24 60:12 62:20 63:18 64:12 change 57:2 changed 25:19 changes 6:20 25:16 charge 13:14 49:14 54:7 55:5 Chief 3:10 child 30:10 31:9 31:11 40:22 children 46:11 54:15 choose 52:8 61:6 circumstance 39:17 citation 14:20 citations 15:16,23	cities 5:5 10:15 citizens 21:10 48:4 54:13 city 1:2,7 3:11,15 4:17 5:8 7:12 8:21 9:25 11:6 17:15 18:5,8,12 19:8,10,16,24 20:7 21:5,14,20 24:6,9,12 27:15 28:13,21 29:4 30:6 31:20,23 32:5 33:6 36:4 36:18,19 43:16 47:21,24 48:3,5 48:9 49:3 51:10 51:19,21 52:5 61:7,12 city's 4:18,21 5:4 5:9 17:19 24:19 City-owned 4:25 civic 18:6,14 19:22 civil 31:8 Claes 5:13 24:2 clarification 34:18 clarifications 34:20 clarifying 8:9 clarity 35:5 60:14 Class 42:7 clean 6:5 28:2 clear 34:15,17 44:18,21 51:9 52:4 58:2 61:20 Clerk 2:7,9 climb 22:16 Clothespin 5:14 19:11 code 1:15 2:11 3:22 11:11 29:22 33:2 35:10 36:20 37:17,19 39:3 51:20,22,25 52:10,12 61:12	colleague 13:10 46:17 colleagues 8:11 13:6 collected 50:6 56:24 collection 4:21 7:6 37:23 collective 21:13 combat 19:22 22:2 combatting 8:21 come 4:6 10:16 14:18 29:10 34:5 41:8 43:4 44:21 46:20 54:3 56:10 comes 51:7 55:12 58:5 coming 4:2 16:18 27:19 28:16 commemorate 7:23 commissioned 17:25 Committee 1:3 2:5 10:12 12:16 12:23 16:15 23:10 26:23 32:14 41:19 44:11,12 47:18 57:14 62:21 64:14 65:6 common 38:13 communal 7:25 communicate 7:15 communications 23:6 communities 19:23 community 20:2 21:15 22:23 complaint 61:13 completely 29:6 62:2 component 5:9	concern 29:4 31:13 59:11 concerned 30:9 concerns 45:5 46:12 concluded 65:7 concludes 62:14 65:3 conditions 1:18 2:18 Conduct 1:16 2:12 confiscation 29:20 33:22,23 conflicted 27:19 confusing 51:3 conscious 29:17 consequences 57:10 Conservancy 17:16 22:11 conservation 9:5 9:11 conservator 6:4 consider 30:3 considered 8:10 considering 37:7 consistent 51:10 58:25 59:2,23 60:2 constantly 26:13 59:7 contact 4:3,6 7:11 contained 66:5 contest 34:11 36:25 continue 25:17 contribute 19:15 control 66:23 conversation 7:24 Corporation 27:17 correct 34:6 35:22 37:3,4,14 39:2 44:4,9 46:5 50:18 52:17 58:8 59:13 61:8
---	--	---	--	---

C

c 34:10
call 43:22
calls 54:12
care 4:20

61:9 62:2 66:8 correlation 56:5 cost 6:24 7:18 25:14 26:13 28:4 48:9,16,21 48:25 49:2,3,21 49:21 53:8 costing 7:11 costly 6:10 8:5 26:6 costs 48:24 49:10 49:11 53:7 Council 1:2 17:7 17:16 23:20 56:14 57:2 62:24 64:15 Councilman 1:11 1:12,12,13,13 2:2,19,22,23,23 3:6 8:16 10:11 11:8,19 12:11 12:15,18 13:9 13:11,17 14:6 15:11 16:7,10 16:17,20 21:22 22:15 23:7,12 23:15 26:21 27:2,6,9 30:8,19 32:11,15,21 33:7,21 34:12 34:23 35:4,19 35:23 36:12,22 37:11,21,22,25 38:7,12,21 39:7 39:20,24,25 41:16,24 43:3,5 43:7 44:2,5,10 44:13,14,22 45:3,25 46:6,17 50:5,15,19,20 50:25 52:2,15 52:19 55:15 56:25 57:3,22 58:9,18,23 59:14 60:8,13 61:14,19 62:3,8 62:12,17,19	63:2,6,9,11,15 63:16,17,22,25 64:4,7,9,9,11,19 64:22,25 Councilwoman 1:11 16:9 30:19 30:21,23,24 31:6,17 32:10 32:12 33:8 39:25 40:3 41:17 46:6,8 47:16 48:22 49:8 50:11 52:21 53:25 54:22 63:8 64:3 64:5,24 Counselor 34:23 50:25 course 11:23 court 35:14 36:5 36:16 37:5 38:23 39:11,13 39:19 40:6 41:25 42:10,14 44:7 51:12,16 51:17 52:6,7,11 52:13 58:7,12 58:13 61:6,7,13 courts 36:9 39:4,5 40:12 51:22 cover 24:13 create 28:12 created 19:22 31:19 32:4 creating 57:5 Creative 3:13 4:19 crime 3:22 15:18 30:17 40:16 cultural 3:11 16:23 17:10,12 20:22 21:2,7 34:21 Culture 3:13 4:19 18:13 20:24 current 11:11 13:19 32:25	38:22 CVN 35:12 36:2 36:16,23 42:12 42:24,25 61:21 61:25 cycle 19:7 D DA 39:14 dad 33:18 damage 1:16,17 2:13,14 5:18 6:5 8:5 10:4 12:4 18:18,25 19:5 27:22 28:6,19 28:24 29:8 damaged 5:16 6:8 6:15,23 22:24 24:21 damages 25:10,17 57:8 damaging 3:23 dangerous 26:6 date 37:23 day 15:4 54:17 59:16 days 4:10 30:12 31:16 39:8 41:12 42:9,21 54:7 55:5 59:17 deal 9:15 14:13 27:20 29:8 42:17 47:24 dealing 22:19 29:25 46:14 deals 11:12 death 47:20 53:3 decay 19:23 decisions 49:13 dedicate 18:15 dedicated 10:2 17:18 50:10 deep 25:3 deface 1:17 2:14 15:2 defaced 5:16 defacement 5:23	8:2 defacing 3:22 8:21 22:2,17 51:6 60:16 61:22 defiling 3:23 define 21:14 defined 3:21 defining 55:10 definitive 59:21 Delaware 29:10 delicate 19:2 delineated 15:25 demonstrates 7:16 Department 11:2 61:6,11 depending 49:6 depth 17:20 described 24:15 deseccration 3:21 designations 16:2 despite 33:4 destroyed 55:18 56:6,8 destroying 19:2 destruction 8:2 destructive 7:9 determination 46:22 deterrent 11:7 13:24 33:15 45:24 46:4 47:13 48:20 55:9 Development 27:17 different 6:18 28:13 41:20 51:4,5 55:3 difficult 25:8,21 difficulty 28:4 dime 47:19 dimed 53:2 direct 3:12 66:23 direction 25:22 directly 56:20,23	Director 3:15 discourage 6:19 7:5 23:25 55:14 discretion 36:10 39:11,19 40:6 51:24 disincentive 57:6 dispute 36:3 53:5 disputing 35:14 disregard 7:16 59:8 disrespect 5:19 diverted 15:18 documented 20:25 21:7 doing 14:8 54:5 63:13 dollar 28:11 dollars 7:11 37:9 38:17 55:13 domain 44:24 domino 19:6 downturn 9:7 dozen 20:9 dreaded 15:13 Duly 62:25 63:21 64:18 E eager 13:4 earlier 32:22 44:20 economic 9:7 20:23,24 economy 3:14 4:19 40:25 edge 29:18 effect 13:25 19:6 23:3 29:22 34:13 47:14 effective 14:17,20 15:8,15,23 29:23 effects 48:11 efforts 7:9 egregious 58:16 59:5
--	---	---	--	---

either 11:17 23:5 49:23 60:21 eking 10:7 elaborate 9:3 elements 7:6 elicit 7:24 eliminate 7:4 23:24 25:10 eliminated 6:21 9:8 25:16 emergency 9:18 21:25 encourage 7:24 encourages 5:20 endeavor 4:25 endowments 9:23 ends 51:12 52:6 endure 25:17 enforce 13:21 33:10 36:5,9 56:11 enforced 35:11,15 42:12 enforcement 13:14 14:3,11 14:24 15:6 24:17 32:21,25 34:9 46:16 47:9 47:11,24 53:9 53:13 enforces 36:20 enforcing 13:19 46:9 47:4 55:6 61:24 engage 19:25 enjoy 7:21 enormous 11:24 ensure 21:19 ensures 20:15 entirely 25:10 entities 9:22 entitled 1:15 2:11 environment 7:22 28:18,22 equipment 43:17 especially 19:25 essentially 42:13	establish 19:9 et 22:11 30:8 evenings 24:25 eventually 61:12 everybody 30:6 55:16 evidence 66:4 exactly 61:16 example 29:15 Examples 5:25 exceed 6:25 31:9 existence 45:23 existing 29:22 33:4 expand 29:7 expect 13:16 46:22 47:2 49:16 expected 49:12 experience 19:19 36:14 explain 10:12 41:19 extensive 4:15 External 16:22 17:9 extra 55:18 56:3 56:13 extremely 6:10,15 33:3 F face 40:19 faces 25:7 fact 5:20,23 37:17 48:14 53:22 facts 37:7 38:2 53:6 58:15 fair 45:8 49:24 53:4 59:9 fairly 58:16 Fairmount 17:15 22:11 far 11:10 32:18 37:23 fast 63:13 favor 54:14 63:4	63:23 64:20 favorable 12:23 62:22 64:14 favorite 20:18 feed 41:6 feel 29:11 47:17 53:2 54:21 fees 56:23 fewer 54:20 fight 34:3 37:6 58:12 fighting 15:17 figure 44:19,21 45:8,10 46:25 47:2 59:3,22 figures 53:6 file 61:12 filled 25:4 final 12:20 find 10:9 31:25 finds 28:17 fine 4:9 6:12 10:16 13:25 14:20,23 16:25 24:7 26:18 29:5 29:21 31:15 33:9,14,19 34:4 34:11,14 35:20 35:20 36:6,8,25 37:8,16,19 38:14,16,22,23 38:24 39:3 42:19 47:20 48:8 51:8,16,18 51:21,22 52:7 52:10,12 54:13 55:4,21 56:4 58:5,14 60:15 60:25 61:3 fined 38:16 fines 10:13,20 13:2 32:19 33:12 37:24 50:6 51:5 55:21 56:5 59:4 fining 40:24 41:12 first 13:13 17:3	19:8 35:16 42:2 62:23 64:16 firsthand 11:4 Fiscal 9:8 fits 30:17 five 24:13 fix 51:14 56:15 fixed 55:25 56:9 fixing 56:5,17 flagrant 39:18 folks 29:23 foregoing 66:7,20 forfeit 43:17 forth 43:10 Foundation 28:11 founder 27:12 four 20:9 24:10 28:13 Franklin's 27:12 28:9 29:2 free 18:4 frequently 24:24 36:20 37:16 fulfill 22:14 fully 42:10 58:19 66:5 full-time 26:13 fund 27:13 28:9 29:2 50:9,16 52:23 55:22 56:20,24 funding 4:23 9:17 10:2 funds 10:7,7 50:7 56:9,17 further 19:6 23:13 62:4 future 19:14,16 FY12 11:10 G gain 55:24 gaining 25:13 Gary 3:10 10:11 17:20 30:5 Geez 41:4 general 10:4 50:9	50:16 52:23 55:22 56:23 58:15 generally 11:22 36:8 39:3 51:23 generating 21:2 generations 19:17 gentlemen 2:3 50:12 getting 31:20 55:18 59:16 gifts 21:10 give 8:25 14:19 40:12 49:15 50:2 51:23 56:3 given 53:6 giving 21:16 glob 6:14,17 24:20,24 25:3,5 25:6,8,14,20,22 25:25 26:10,12 Globe 24:15 go 37:5 39:15 42:14 47:20 50:7,9,16 52:11 52:14,18 56:7 56:12,17,20,23 57:16,18 58:7 58:11,22 63:18 goal 56:7 God 40:25 goes 36:4,5 42:14 49:19 50:15 51:15 55:21 going 13:21 14:25 15:7 21:23 22:23 29:24 33:11 36:3,16 41:5 44:7,16 46:11 55:23,25 57:20 good 2:2 3:6,9 16:6 17:6 23:19 30:5 gotten 50:3 gouges 25:4 graffiti 6:3 20:11
--	---	--	--	--

27:21 granite 6:8 29:18 grant 28:11 great 5:5 16:5 27:20 29:8 Greater 16:23 17:9 Green 1:12 16:10 57:3 58:23 Greenlee 1:12 2:22 43:3 44:13 44:14 45:3,25 46:18 57:22 58:9,18 59:14 60:8 62:18,19 63:11,16,17 64:7,10,11 Greeno 16:24 23:16,19 26:22 guarantee 55:20 56:14 guess 44:16 58:22 59:24	heavy 32:21 help 7:14 22:8 24:18 47:14 helpful 52:20 HENON 1:11 2:2 2:19 3:6 8:16 10:11 11:8,19 12:11,15,18 13:9 16:7,17,20 21:22 22:15 23:7,12,15 26:21 27:2,6,9 30:19 32:11 34:23 35:4 36:12,22 37:11 37:21 39:25 41:16,24 44:10 46:6 50:20,25 52:2,15,19 60:13 61:14,19 62:3,8,12 63:2,6 63:9,15,22,25 64:4,9,19,22,25 Henry 20:19 Hey 60:24 61:23 Hi 30:23 high 4:15 45:7,22 48:16,18 higher 26:14 high-spending 21:5 hired 26:3 hit 6:3 home 4:17 18:2 honesty 59:6 honored 5:19 hope 13:22 28:14 53:17 hoping 55:8 hundred 28:10 38:17,25 hungry 41:2	identity 21:13 ignore 36:2,23 61:2 ignores 58:6 III 42:7 illegal 18:24 illegally 20:13 image 5:17 imagine 51:4 immediately 28:15 impact 20:15,23 20:25 impacted 6:13 important 5:9 55:12 impose 36:6 37:8 37:16,18 39:5 39:13 51:17,19 52:8 58:14 imposed 4:12 41:25 52:11,13 imposing 51:24 impossible 25:23 imprisonment 4:10,11 31:15 39:8,9,14 42:9 42:21 43:24 incidences 54:19 incident 14:25 include 5:25 17:25 including 17:13 increase 22:16 increasing 14:23 54:20 incredible 18:6 20:25 incredibly 21:8 39:12 Indiana 5:13 indicate 48:23 Individual 1:16 2:12 individuals 12:9 14:8 influence 20:5	information 12:10 38:6 45:18 49:16 50:2 53:19 initial 9:7 installed 6:11,18 9:25 24:2 instance 11:25 51:13 instances 12:4 institutional 3:20 35:9,17 42:3,5 42:11 insulting 46:13 54:16 intelligent 49:13 intentional 3:21 7:9 intentionally 4:2 interest 23:4 61:2 interested 23:2 internationally 18:6 invaluable 48:18 inventory 17:24 investment 7:22 24:5,18 involved 28:4 29:5 ironic 19:20 issue 11:12 44:23 issued 11:10 12:8 12:8 32:18 33:15 61:3 issues 14:11 49:13 51:15 issuing 15:16 i.e 3:22	joining 2:24 16:9 Josh 27:4,5,11 judge 36:6 37:6 38:16,23 59:10 judges 37:15 jump 25:8,14,20 25:21,25 jumping 26:12
H half 35:16,17 Hall 1:7 hand 35:6 38:3 53:22 handle 54:21 happened 38:18 happens 53:24 60:23 happy 8:11 26:19 32:2,6 38:3 57:18 hard 30:7 harmed 6:9 harmful 7:17 hat 27:16 head 16:24 hear 17:3 heard 54:17 hearing 22:16 36:24 57:18 59:24 60:17,20 60:23 62:15	I icon 24:9 iconic 5:12 18:17 idea 49:23	J jail 30:13 JAMES 1:13 JANNIE 1:11 Jimmie 16:24 23:16 job 47:19 jobs 21:4	K K 1:12 keep 14:9 28:3 Kenney 1:13 2:23 13:11,17 14:6 15:11 32:22 kid 59:15 kind 7:15 10:3,4 14:9 41:8 45:11 58:22 59:2,7 Knight 28:11 know 11:15,16,17 12:6,20 14:2 15:4 22:21 31:20,22 32:19 34:8,20 45:4,11 47:3 49:10,22 52:4 59:9,17 60:4 knowledge 36:13 known 4:14 19:10	L L 66:15 lack 36:15 ladies 2:3 landscape 18:7 largely 33:5 larger 14:2 47:13 late 24:25 law 10:18,25 12:24 13:19 53:11 57:12 61:5,10 laws 47:5 lawyer 60:4,5 leadership 22:7 leads 44:17 learned 29:20

leaves 12:23 left 2:22 16:8 19:5 legislation 10:25 12:22 14:22 40:23 41:9 46:23 53:16,18 54:12 55:2 legitimate 58:21 Lenfest 24:4,19 26:7 Lenfests 24:8 lessons 29:19 letter 60:24 letters 20:8,16 let's 43:22 54:6 59:18 level 38:14 life 30:11,13 limit 37:10,12 limited 18:22 47:8 line 29:10 listen 49:10 literally 10:6 litigated 42:10 little 10:7 45:7 51:3 58:4 59:18 59:21 live 31:11 lock 40:11 41:3 54:6,15 55:4 locked 59:16 locking 40:24 41:11 long 29:10 44:16 58:22 look 14:5 42:4 43:6 lose 37:6 loss 7:13 48:17 lot 9:21 11:21,24 14:11 29:14 30:9 32:25 love 5:13,25 15:2 19:11 20:8,16 31:4 33:2 40:18 56:19	lucky 19:18 L&I 51:13 M magazines 24:14 Mail 24:15 maintain 18:23 maintained 18:10 maintaining 18:16 28:5 maintenance 9:6 9:12,22 10:5 18:19 21:25 56:20 major 15:18 making 18:3 55:17 58:25 malicious 28:23 management 22:12 Manager 27:16 manages 27:18 mandate 22:5 37:13 mandatory 39:23 manner 36:21 margins 21:9 Margot 3:14 9:2 9:12 Marines 29:11 MARK 1:13 mars 57:8 matter 14:7 66:7 maximum 37:16 37:19 51:8,16 51:18 52:7 58:5 58:14 Mayor 30:8 ma'am 31:5,12 McKinley 6:7 mean 11:20,21 14:14,21 15:4 15:14 33:7,13 39:5 45:11 49:21 58:18 59:3,4,5,18 means 29:19 42:8	66:22 meant 7:23 mechanism 15:7 meet 40:16 meeting 57:16,19 62:16 65:4 member 32:24 members 17:7 20:2 22:9 23:6 23:20 44:11 45:6 47:18 62:5 memorial 3:24 4:4,7 6:7 9:21 15:3,3,4 29:9 memorials 1:17 2:15 8:4,23 28:20 48:13 55:11 mentioned 22:9 message 13:8 15:10 47:12 55:10 Michael 16:21 17:7 MICHELE 66:15 middle 9:7 million 27:24 minor 4:12 18:24 minors 43:23 minute 63:12 mission 22:6 missions 22:14 misuse 18:18 19:6 mom 33:18 momentum 25:13 money 47:21 48:2 49:9,11,18,18 49:19,25 54:9 54:24 55:19 56:3,13 months 61:5,15 monuments 4:22 5:18,24 7:8,13 7:17 8:4 28:20 56:16 moon 46:21 Moore 20:19	morning 34:17 mornings 24:25 MOU 15:21 move 57:15,17,20 57:21,21 60:11 62:15,20 63:19 64:12 moved 63:3 movement 32:5 multi-million-d... 24:5 Municipal 61:13 Mural 17:14 22:10 murals 17:25 19:22,25 20:9 22:3 Murken 10:23,24 34:24 35:8,22 35:25 36:19 37:4,14,25 38:19 39:2,10 39:22 41:18,23 42:2 43:5,9 44:4 44:9,22 45:13 50:21 51:18 52:9,17 58:7,8 58:11 59:12 60:3 61:9,16,24 MURPHY 66:15 museum 18:4 N name 3:7,10 10:23 17:7 27:10,11 nature 48:13 nay 63:8 64:3,6 64:24 near 29:9 necessarily 28:23 34:8 42:22 56:21 61:10 need 7:4 23:24 29:6 36:23 49:2 50:17 54:9 needed 25:14	34:19 negative 5:17 neighborhood 6:23 21:4 neighborhoods 20:6 never 42:13 new 10:12 13:2 48:16 Nice 30:24 nicest 15:15 nickel 47:19 nickeled 53:2 nights 25:2 Nimo 27:4 Nims 27:5,5,6,11 27:12 30:23 31:5,12,18 32:6 32:9,20 33:16 33:23 34:15 40:15 nine 61:5,15 Ninety 30:12 non-existent 5:22 non-profit 17:12 18:14 Norris 16:21 17:3 17:6,8 21:23 22:4,21 23:14 notes 66:6 notice 43:12 51:14 number 4:16 20:19 24:10 45:18,20,22 48:20 O objections 66:4 observation 23:5 obviously 46:2 offense 42:3,7 offenses 11:5 Office 3:13 4:18 18:12 34:22 Officer 3:11 officers 14:15
---	---	--	--	--

26:4,9 33:5 Oh 30:8 Okay 8:16 11:8 12:11 13:9 23:7 37:11 38:9 39:20 52:19 58:9 60:8 Oldenburg 6:11 24:2,3,24 Oldenburg's 5:14 older 30:12,14 oldest 5:6 once 20:10,13 ones 22:9 one-of-a-kind 8:3 ongoing 5:24 9:11 10:3,8 53:23 operates 21:8 operations 22:13 27:16 opinion 41:15 46:3 opportunity 3:16 8:7 21:17 23:21 26:16 opposed 63:7 64:23 ordinance 1:15 2:10 23:22 24:17 35:18 36:7 organization 22:7 22:8 56:15 organizations 17:13,18 outdoor 4:3,6 outside 26:4 overall 30:3 overboard 59:19 overcomplicating 58:4 oversight 4:20 owned 9:19 owners 7:12 o'clock 57:16 P	PAFA 25:24 page 34:10 43:6 Paine 27:13 28:9 29:2 paint 6:11,13 24:2 24:20 paper 61:21 parent 4:12 30:10 31:9 parents 14:18 34:5 park 17:16 22:11 31:4,21 33:2 40:18 parking 14:10,13 15:13,19,22 16:3 60:19 parks 6:23 17:15 Parkway 17:16 20:20 part 15:13 24:3 28:15 31:7,11 32:7,8 48:7,19 particularly 19:21 22:25 partnership 24:6 parts 15:25 27:23 pass 21:18 40:8 46:23 53:10,18 63:12,14 passage 18:24 passed 53:16 passes 12:22 44:6 passing 18:11 patrolled 16:3 paver 48:16 pavers 6:19 25:12 pay 34:2 35:13 42:13 44:7 61:3 paying 33:18 48:10 payment 36:15 penalties 1:17 2:16 4:8 10:13 13:2 41:20 56:24 60:25 penalty 31:8,13	36:15 40:20 41:21,21 42:5 47:13 51:8 Pennsylvania 1:7 6:12 16:25 20:18 24:7 26:18 people 27:24 40:11 41:2,3,6 41:11 52:23 53:2 55:4,9 57:6 percent 5:6 19:9 permanent 8:5 permissible 57:11 person 31:24 43:20 personal 20:18 personnel 14:7 Philadelphia 1:2 1:7,15 2:11 3:12 4:13 16:23 17:10,21 18:2 20:8,10 21:11 21:20 24:10,16 27:15,24 28:14 29:4 36:18 51:11 52:6 54:14 Philadelphia's 7:20 Philly 31:22 pick 14:18 34:5 piece 20:19 29:18 42:15 61:21 pieces 4:16 17:23 56:16 place 12:25 14:3 44:3 places 33:6 plan 12:25 57:17 plans 14:2 Plaza 24:4,19 26:7 please 2:7 3:8 17:3 27:9,10 34:24 41:19 50:22	plugged 22:22 plus 60:25 point 9:10 15:10 16:6 32:17 33:2 police 13:15 14:15 15:18 policy 11:4 44:23 60:3,6 pollution 18:11 popular 33:3 portion 24:24 position 6:18 38:5 positioned 22:14 positive 7:25 possibility 40:19 possible 56:22 58:5,13 posted 26:7 potential 42:20 power 13:5 43:17 Powers 20:12 practice 36:17 practices 10:15 prepared 57:13 58:20 present 1:10 2:21 presents 5:16 Preservation 17:17 preserving 17:19 18:16 President 16:22 17:8 23:20 pretty 22:22 31:19 prevent 19:7 25:12 26:5,11 primary 27:14 privately 9:19 17:25 prized 20:11 probably 14:16 14:19 15:15 38:15 problem 5:22,25 6:21 9:15 14:22 47:15	problems 26:2 51:15 procedure 61:25 procedures 43:10 proceedings 66:4 process 20:4 42:12,25 60:14 60:22 professional 6:4 20:3 program 4:18 5:7 17:14 19:9 programs 55:19 prohibit 1:16 2:13 prohibition 4:9 prohibitions 1:18 2:17 prohibitive 6:25 prohibits 3:19,24 projects 4:24 10:8 19:25 28:13 promise 34:2 promoting 17:18 promotion 5:10 properties 20:10 property 1:3 2:5 3:1 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1,12 8:1 9:1 9:25 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1,18 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1 63:1 64:1
--	--	---	---	---

65:1,6 proposed 8:9 24:17 Prosperity 20:24 protect 21:18 24:18 protected 18:10 19:13 proud 27:25 28:2 provide 1:17 2:15 11:22 12:12 provision 42:11 42:24 43:16,23 provisions 42:17 public 1:3,4,17 2:5,6,14 3:1,15 3:23 4:1,3,7,16 4:18,21,24 5:1,5 5:7,11,24 6:1,22 7:1,7,16,20,25 8:1,6,22,23 9:1 9:6,18,20,25 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1,14,19 17:21,24 18:1,3 18:13,25 19:1 19:18,21,24 20:1,4,16 21:1,9 22:1,3,10,18 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1,6 28:7 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1,19 48:1,12 49:1,14 50:1 51:1,5 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1 55:10 56:1 57:1 57:9,9,18,19 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1,15,16 63:1 64:1 65:1,3	65:6,7 66:16 publicize 12:25 publicizing 13:23 punishment 30:17 40:15 punitive 41:9 46:23 purpose 57:4 pursuant 43:9,11 put 19:13 37:5 59:18 putting 7:13 p.m 1:8 65:7 Q qualify 52:9 quality 4:15 question 11:2 12:20 13:10 21:23 32:16,23 35:5 38:11,20 44:17 45:7,12 46:20 50:6 55:3 57:23 59:25 questions 8:12,19 12:16 16:14 23:9,13 26:19 26:24 32:13 35:5,7 44:11 58:21 60:4 62:4 62:6 quickly 34:2 35:13 41:19 quite 7:17 quorum 2:4,21 quote/unquote 40:8 R raise 33:9 46:10 47:2,21 48:2 49:2,17,25 55:21 raised 58:21 raising 35:24 46:14 48:7 read 2:7 39:4 51:23	reading 34:16 62:23 64:16 ready 31:21 real 37:6,20 58:2 really 11:3,5 22:6 30:2 33:11 60:5 realm 7:7 9:20 reason 37:20 48:19 59:21 reasonable 53:15 received 28:10 31:2 53:19 recess 57:18 recognition 5:4 recognize 2:20 16:8 recognized 18:5 recognizes 62:17 63:16 recommendation 12:24 32:3 62:22 64:14 record 3:8 16:8 27:10 57:19 64:5 recorded 64:6 reduced 6:20 25:16 reflect 48:9 64:5 reflects 48:21 regardless 61:4 region 21:2 regional 17:11 regular 9:11 regularly 6:2 Regulation 1:15 2:11 reinstall 6:17 reiterate 53:20 Relations 16:22 17:9 released 20:23 remain 20:20 remains 21:20 remediating 48:11 remedy 29:23	remitted 43:11 remove 6:16 25:2 removing 27:21 27:21 reorient 25:6 repainted 25:5 repair 6:9,24 21:25,25 49:20 50:13 54:9,24 55:12,23 repaired 50:17 repairing 27:22 28:5 48:10 50:17 55:17 repairs 6:20 10:3 25:15 26:15 53:8,23 report 20:23 reported 62:21 64:13 reporter 66:24 represent 5:21 21:12 representative 28:25 represents 7:21 8:4 17:11 reproduction 66:21 reputation 5:10 request 32:7 49:16 requested 34:21 50:3 requesting 8:14 require 9:24 18:12 36:7 requires 6:4 reservations 60:11 residents 5:17 resonates 28:15 resources 9:14 18:16,22 19:3 47:8 54:20 respect 42:15 43:14	response 12:17 16:16 23:11 26:25 43:12 51:9 62:7,11 responsibility 4:22 18:9 21:12 responsible 4:20 restoration 4:24 restore 6:17 restored 9:9 resulted 12:7 reticence 14:13 returned 25:5 revenue 52:24 revitalize 19:23 ride 24:23 26:10 riders 26:7 ridiculous 54:17 55:7 right 2:22 9:16 16:10 33:6,20 36:24 37:21 38:12 39:24 46:4 47:9 53:23 58:7 59:4 right-of-way 57:9 ripple 23:3 risk 1:17 2:14 7:13 19:2,13 48:17 River 27:17 road 61:5 Robert 5:12 roller 3:25 4:5 42:18 43:15,18 Room 1:7 route 35:16 routine 10:5 routinely 6:3 RPR-Notary 66:16 ruin 30:11,13 rule 37:18 rules 8:14 62:22 64:15 run 58:22 runs 18:25
---	--	--	--	--

S saddle 30:10 saying 31:7 33:14 45:9 46:2 49:18 49:19 54:6,11 60:24 61:22 says 39:3 42:7 48:24 52:10,12 53:10 scales 18:19 scare 13:20 Schuylkill 27:17 27:18,23 scrape 9:14 scratches 25:4 sculpture 4:24 5:13 6:2 24:3,8 25:12 28:12 49:4 sculptures 5:2 6:22 7:8 48:12 sculpture's 6:6 seconded 62:25 63:3,21 64:18 Section 31:13 sector 21:2,8 22:8 secure 4:23 security 16:24 25:23 26:4,6,9 26:14 see 14:14 15:7 30:25 43:8 47:11 Seeing 62:14 seek 39:15 42:21 seen 13:13 20:6 segment 33:25 sense 10:19 47:7 48:7 sensitive 28:3 sent 47:12 separate 27:16 September 1:8 66:7 series 20:8 serious 11:6 18:9 serve 46:3	service 22:6 session 2:6 62:24 64:17 set 43:10 45:21,22 51:25 60:17 sets 51:21 settle 35:13 44:6 settled 35:21 set-aside 9:17 severe 57:11 severely 6:8 shared 7:22 8:6 sheer 4:16 short 43:22 57:24 show 60:20,22 showed 59:8 shows 5:18 side 25:9,21 28:8 sidewalk 29:19 signature 19:21 significant 7:18 18:15 significantly 13:25 39:6 signpost 24:16 similar 32:23 situation 39:18 54:19 six 61:15 skateable 28:12 skateboard 4:5 14:17 29:21 33:22,24 34:6 43:18 skateboarders 3:25 22:25 24:23 25:13,18 25:24 26:11 27:14 29:3,16 32:19 33:17 skateboarding 6:6,15 11:20 12:2 14:16 28:17,22 31:2 31:19,21 32:5 33:3 40:18 42:17 43:15,23	skateboards 24:22 Skatepark 27:13 28:9 29:2 small 19:4 solution 5:22 26:10 somebody 35:25 36:22 46:19,21 46:25 51:14 54:6 58:6 59:7 60:15 somewhat 36:17 sorry 38:19 63:13 sort 9:13 22:25 23:3 29:13 33:8 45:19 48:17 sound 61:18 source 10:3 spaces 7:17 8:2 28:6 speak 11:4 21:17 45:2,14 specific 42:16 45:18 specifically 11:20 50:10 spend 21:24 27:20 41:10 spending 21:3 spends 8:21 spent 21:24 55:23 split 20:17 sport 31:23 spread 13:4 Squilla 1:13 2:23 32:15 33:7,21 34:12 35:19,23 37:22 38:7,12 38:21 39:7,20 39:24 43:7 44:2 44:5 50:5,15,19 55:15 56:25 stabilizing 20:5 staff 25:23 27:21 stand 26:4 40:13 standard 36:17	standing 41:6 start 2:4 60:2 started 32:4 state 3:7 13:12 27:9 57:12 statement 30:18 48:24 states 53:12 statue 15:2 19:11 54:3 stay 22:22 stenographic 66:6 step 14:3 stepped 32:22 Steuer 3:9,10 8:18,25 10:17 11:9,13 12:3,14 13:3,22 15:9 16:5,11,19 38:10 44:25 45:13,17 46:5 47:6 50:8,13,18 Steve 20:12 sticker 15:2 stickers 6:3 27:22 straight 41:3 street 15:17 25:7 25:9,20 streets 16:2 strengthen 22:12 strong 37:20 strongly 29:11 structure 10:16 42:19 struggle 10:10 stupid 59:16 subject 5:2 35:10 43:24 61:23 submit 8:8 26:17 subsection 31:14 34:10 substantial 11:7 12:4 success 28:2 suffer 7:8 suggestion 15:20 16:4	supervision 66:23 supply 38:5 support 3:17 7:3 15:5 18:21 23:23 32:3,6 supporting 14:22 21:3 28:19 sure 12:14 13:7 30:16 35:8 55:17 61:17 surface 6:6 suspended 64:16 suspension 8:14 62:23 symbol 21:13 <tr> <td colspan="5" data-bbox="1250 730 1510 772">T</td></tr> table 3:5 10:22 17:5 23:18 27:8 35:3 45:16 50:24 take 15:10 29:14 43:19 44:16 61:6,7,15 taken 66:6 talent 19:15 talk 9:12 40:20 46:15 47:4,25 53:13 59:9 talked 53:7 talking 52:25 57:7 58:3 talks 31:7 tax 48:4 50:12 52:23,25 54:13 taxpayer 55:13 taxpayers 48:10 48:21 tear 18:23 teens 20:14 tell 8:20 11:9 38:3 58:19 telling 54:15 temporarily 25:3 tens 21:3 terms 1:18 2:17 35:8 47:8 53:21	T				
T									

testified 17:20	54:23	tweaks 42:24	54:4	52:24 57:10
testify 3:2,17	thousand 28:10	Two 37:9	vandalizing 3:22	ways 30:11
16:13 17:2 27:4	37:9	types 48:11 51:4,5	varies 49:6	wealth 19:17
62:10	thousands 18:2		variety 4:15	wear 18:23
testimony 8:8,19	21:4	U	vastly 24:21	Weather 18:11
26:17 62:13	threatened 26:8	understand 15:9	veterans 9:21	went 31:3 38:22
textured 6:18	Three-Way 20:19	16:20 29:6	15:3 28:20 29:9	59:22
25:11	throw 33:20	38:20 47:10	vibrant 20:20	West 20:9 28:13
thank 2:19,24	throwing 48:15	59:19	Vice 16:21 17:8	31:21
3:16 8:7,16,18	ticket 34:3 35:13	understanding	Vietnam 9:21	we'll 11:18 15:10
13:11 16:5,11	36:3 60:19	28:21 37:15	15:3 29:9	we're 10:10 22:6
16:17,19 21:16	tickets 12:8 14:15	50:8 56:21	view 4:17 11:3,5	27:25 31:20
21:21,22 23:7	time 11:23 18:12	61:11	violates 59:7	41:5 49:12
23:14,15,21	19:15 27:20	undertake 4:23	violation 31:10,14	52:24 53:14
26:16,21 27:2	41:10 50:21	unfortunately	32:7 36:25 39:9	54:4,18 55:5,8
30:21,25 32:9	timeframe 61:17	38:2	40:21,21 43:13	55:15 57:20
32:11 39:21	times 29:15	unintentional	51:14,20 52:3,5	58:2
40:3 41:16	tip 25:7	7:10	58:6 60:15,21	We've 29:8
44:14 50:19	tips 18:18	Unit 10:25	61:21	whatsoever 33:12
57:25 60:12,13	title 1:15 2:8,10	University 20:17	violations 1:18	willfully 36:23
62:8,12,19	today 2:24 3:14	unparalleled	2:16 4:8 11:10	61:2
63:17 64:11	3:17 8:15 19:19	17:22	11:25 12:7	William 1:12 6:7
65:5	21:17 50:4	unrepaired 19:5	32:18 37:24	willing 15:5 19:14
theory 19:4	told 25:24	unsustainable	51:11 56:10	60:10
they'd 37:5	tolerated 7:19	18:20	violent 26:8	wind 59:4
thin 21:8	Torch 6:12 24:2	untold 7:11	visitors 5:17	window 19:4
thing 14:4 48:6	Toronto 24:14	unusual 39:13,17	vote 57:13,19	wish 59:20
49:7 53:21	total 10:9 59:8	upper 37:10,12	58:20	wishes 3:2 12:19
54:16	tourism 5:9 24:14	urban 28:18,22		16:13 27:4
things 9:20 10:5	tourists 21:6	urge 21:18	W	62:10
22:24 23:2,4	tragedy 19:12	use 7:25 27:24	Wait 63:11	witness 3:4 10:21
40:14 41:10	trail 27:18,23,25	36:10	walls 18:5 20:13	10:21 17:4,4
56:6	transcript 66:8,21	V	want 3:7 15:21	23:17,17 27:7,7
think 11:3 29:22	transformative	value 7:2 33:12	16:8 23:21	35:2,2 45:15,15
30:4,5,6 33:19	20:15	45:24	30:16 33:10	50:23,23
34:18 35:6	transforming	valued 24:6	40:12 41:3	Witnesses 3:4
39:12,14,16	20:13	vandalism 3:20	44:20,24 49:17	wondering 38:13
40:9,11,13,14	tread 44:24	5:3,20,23 6:24	51:8 54:24,24	word 13:4 59:5
44:15,19,23	treat 4:25	7:5,10 8:22	59:15 61:19	work 9:18 13:6
45:5 47:7,22,23	true 36:13 66:8	18:18 22:2,17	wants 11:6 57:15	18:2 32:2
48:7,19 49:24	truly 18:4	23:25 28:5 35:9	59:25	worked 30:7
52:22 53:3,4,12	try 22:22 41:5	35:17 42:4,6,11	wasn't 34:15	working 20:2
53:13 54:17,18	56:11,11,15	48:12 51:6	59:25	works 1:4 2:6
54:23 55:16	trying 14:10 45:9	53:24 60:16	way 13:17 15:15	5:11,15 8:22
58:20,24 59:10	52:3	61:22	20:4 28:17,19	18:3,10,17,20
59:12,15 60:10	Tuesday 1:8	vandalize 54:8	30:13 31:25	18:25 19:12
thought 53:16	turn 10:18	vandalized 20:14	39:15,23 46:12	20:16 21:9,19
			47:21,22 48:2,8	

24:10 51:5 65:7 world 4:14 5:6 19:10 21:6 24:12 world-class 21:20 world-renowned 24:11 worry 41:4 wouldn't 38:15 53:17 write 15:22 36:2 writing 14:15 written 11:25 wrongful 7:10	60:17 \$5 49:21 \$5,000 49:22 \$50 38:25 \$50,000 9:5 \$500 43:2,13 44:3 44:8 60:17 \$75 34:4 35:11,15 35:21 41:20 42:13 43:2 44:3 60:17	62:1,10,21 63:1 63:20 64:1,13 65:1 14 29:16 15th 25:20 16th 20:20 18 30:10,12,14 1959 19:10	48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1 63:1 64:1 65:1 90 4:10 31:16 39:8 41:12 42:9 42:21 54:6 55:4 59:17
Y	0	2	
Yeah 22:21 year 11:11 27:25 28:10 32:21 33:4 years 30:14 31:3 Yesterday 20:22 young 59:17 younger 33:17	09 9:8	2 57:15 2,000 40:10 41:4 46:10 53:10 59:2 2:05 65:7 2012 1:8 66:7 25 1:8 66:7	
Z	1	3	
zero 10:10 22:5	1 20:19 1,400 17:22 1-112 43:10 1:10 1:8 10 1:15 2:10 10,000 25:15 33:13 10-203 42:4 112 35:10 112(3) 43:12 12-year-old 29:14 120534 1:15 2:9 3:1,3,18 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1,3 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1,14 17:1,2 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 23:23 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1	3 31:14 300 13:20 33:13 38:14,16 46:9 46:14 53:9,12 55:6	
\$		4	
\$1 36:11 \$10,000 14:24 \$2,000 4:10 13:20 29:5 30:9 31:15 34:13 35:20,24 36:7,8,11,15 37:9 40:25 41:12,22,25 42:7,8,20 44:18 46:18 47:3 51:7 51:20,21 52:7 52:13,14,16,18 54:7 55:5 57:12 61:23 \$300 29:21 31:8 31:10 33:14,19 38:22,24 39:4,5 40:20 41:21 46:2 52:10,12		4 34:10 400 1:7 17:11	
		5	
		9	
		9/25/12 3:1 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1	