

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
June 13, 2018

Page 1

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
COMMITTEE ON LABOR AND CIVIL SERVICE

Room 400, City Hall
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania
Wednesday, June 13, 2018
2:30 p.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCILWOMAN CHERELLE L. PARKER, CHAIR
COUNCILMAN ALLAN DOMB
COUNCILMAN DEREK GREEN
COUNCILWOMAN HELEN GYM
COUNCILMAN AL TAUBENBERGER

BILLS 180557 and 180599

- - -

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
June 13, 2018

Page 2

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Good
3 afternoon, everyone. This is a hearing
4 that is being called to order. This is
5 the public hearing of the City Council
6 Committee on Labor and Civil Service.
7 The purpose of this public hearing is to
8 hear testimony on both Bill Nos. 180577
9 [sic] and 180599.

10 I recognize the presence of a
11 quorum of Committee members. Members of
12 the Committee in attendance are, to my
13 left, Councilwoman Helen Gym, Councilman
14 Al Taubenberger, and to my right,
15 Councilman Allan Domb.

16 We also have another member of
17 the Committee, Councilman Green, who was
18 just here in the room. He's at his
19 office. He'll be coming back down.

20 I will now ask the Clerk to
21 read the title of the bill for
22 consideration today.

23 THE CLERK: Bill No. 180557, an
24 ordinance amending Title 22 of The
25 Philadelphia Code, entitled "Public

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 Employees Retirement Code," to expand
3 "Plan 16" to include certain employees,
4 to change contribution rates for certain
5 employees and the City, to amend various
6 provisions relating to the Deferred
7 Retirement Option Plan ("DROP"), and to
8 make technical amendments; all under
9 certain terms and conditions; and

10 Bill No. 180599, an ordinance
11 amending Title 22 of The Philadelphia
12 Code, entitled "Public Employees
13 Retirement Code," to provide for
14 additional members of Plan 16, to change
15 contribution rates and to specify the
16 Stacked Hybrid Cap for certain employees,
17 and to make technical amendments, all
18 under certain terms and conditions.

19 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
20 you. The Clerk will please call the
21 first witnesses to testify on the bills.

22 THE CLERK: Jackie Dunn and Rob
23 Dubow.

24 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
25 you.

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599

2 Good afternoon to each of you.

3 Please state your names for the record
4 and proceed with your testimony.

5 MS. DUNN: Good afternoon,
6 Councilwoman Parker and members of the
7 Committee. I am Jackie Dunn, Chief of
8 Staff to the Finance Director. With me
9 is Rob Dubow, Finance Director for the
10 City. I'm here to testify in support of
11 Bill No. 180557, which will implement the
12 pension reforms included in recent
13 arbitration awards with the Fraternal
14 Order of Police, the Deputy Sheriffs and
15 Register of Wills, and International
16 Association of Fire Fighters.

17 The arbitration awards for the
18 FOP and the IAFF require members to make
19 additional contributions to the pension
20 fund. Most current employees will pay an
21 additional 0.92 percent in FY18 and a
22 second 0.92, for a total additional
23 contribution of 1.84 percent starting in
24 FY19. New hires will pay an additional
25 2.5 percent above the contribution rates

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 currently in effect. These additional
3 contributions will increase the assets of
4 the pension fund over time.

5 For Deputy Sheriffs and
6 Register of Wills employees, current
7 members will participate in the tiered
8 contribution structure in place for
9 District Council 33. Under this tier
10 system, members with higher annual
11 salaries will pay a higher contribution
12 rate. Employees with annual salaries
13 from 45,001 to 55,000 would contribute an
14 additional 0.5. At the top tier,
15 employees with annual salaries exceeding
16 100,000 would pay an additional 3
17 percent. These additional contributions
18 increase the assets of the pension fund
19 over time.

20 The award also requires new
21 Deputy Sheriff and Register of Wills
22 members to participate in Plan 16, the
23 stacked hybrid plan. The stacked hybrid
24 plan combines a traditional defined
25 benefit for the first 50,000 of an

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 employee's earnings with an optional
3 401(k), with an employer match for
4 earnings above this amount. The stacked
5 hybrid plan provides retirement security
6 for City employees while also reducing
7 the pension system's liabilities.

8 The Deputy Sheriff and Register
9 of Wills award also removes the two-year
10 delay requirement to enter into the
11 Deferred Retirement Option Program, or
12 DROP, that was included in legislation
13 enacted in 2011, but maintains the lower
14 interest rate on DROP accounts
15 established in that ordinance.

16 Also, these arbitration awards
17 require the additional employee
18 contributions to be paid on top of the
19 City's required annual contribution to
20 the pension fund. This means that the
21 City will pay more than what is legally
22 required each year to improve the funding
23 status of the plan more quickly.

24 Over time, the reforms in these
25 three awards will help improve the health

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 of the City's pension fund.

3 This concludes my testimony,
4 and we are happy to answer any questions
5 you have.

6 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you
7 for your testimony.

8 Any questions from my
9 colleagues?

10 (No response.)

11 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: I just
12 want to -- and I'll wait until after we
13 actually finish with Bill No. 180599 and
14 just briefly state to you, Ms. Dunn, that
15 for both of these bills, I want to
16 sincerely commend the Administration,
17 along with labor here, representatives of
18 our municipal employees, along with our
19 Council leadership and Council President
20 Clarke and all of those who have been
21 involved.

22 I was sharing with Mr. Dubow
23 prior to this hearing that I did not know
24 of any major municipality, any major city
25 in the big ten who had achieved this

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 magnitude of pension reform via the
3 collective bargaining process. I mean,
4 immediately to me Detroit came to mind.
5 There was a decrease in retirement
6 benefits, but they were for existing
7 retirees, but that was done in
8 receivership through the courts, but you
9 have done this through the collective
10 bargaining process.

11 So we have found a way in the
12 best possible manner to enhance the
13 City's fiscal health and balance that
14 with the retirement security of our
15 municipal workforce. So we wanted to say
16 thank you for that.

17 Councilwoman Gym, did I see
18 your hand?

19 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: No.

20 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay.

21 MR. DUBOW: Thank you. And we
22 want to thank you and other
23 Councilmembers for all the support you've
24 given and paying particular attention to
25 this crucial issue.

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Are there
3 any other questions or comments from
4 members of this Committee or anyone in
5 the audience here left who wishes to
6 testify?

7 (No response.)

8 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay.
9 Well, this will conclude the public
10 hearing.

11 MR. DUBOW: We do --

12 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Well, the
13 next one. All right. Let's go to the
14 next one.

15 And let me also for the record
16 clarify this. We noted when we opened
17 that the bill numbers were 180577 and
18 180599. That first number was not
19 accurate. The bill numbers are 180557
20 and 180599. And we will now hear
21 testimony on Bill No. 180599.

22 State your name for the record.

23 MR. DUBOW: Good afternoon,
24 Councilwoman Parker and members of the
25 Labor and Service Committee. I'm Rob

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 Dubow, the City's Finance Director. I'm
3 here to testify in support of Bill No.
4 180599, which would enact pension reforms
5 for employees who are exempt from civil
6 service, employees who are in civil
7 service but not represented by a union,
8 and for elected officials. With me is
9 Jackie Dunn, Chief of Staff in the Office
10 of Director of Finance. There's also
11 amendments that we've presented to the
12 Clerk that would amend the bill to
13 reflect the tentative agreement that
14 we've reached with District Council 47.
15 The tentative agreement still needs
16 ratification. So the terms would now
17 apply to 47.

18 There's no more important
19 challenge facing the City's finances than
20 its underfunded pension system. The
21 General Fund's pension costs have grown
22 by over \$400 million since FY01. Rather
23 than growing stronger, while the City has
24 been incurring those increased costs, the
25 system has seen its funding percent drop

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 by almost -- from almost 80 percent to 45
3 percent.

4 Under this bill, current exempt
5 and non-represented employees and current
6 elected officials will participate in the
7 tiered contribution structure. And that
8 tiered contribution structure will be
9 changed to reflect agreement reached with
10 47 and the new tiered contribution
11 structure would also apply to 47 and 33.
12 Under that system, members of higher
13 annual salaries will pay a higher
14 contribution rate. Employees with
15 salaries from 45,001 to 55,000 would
16 contribute an additional 0.5 percent. At
17 the top tier, employees with annual
18 salaries exceeding 100,000 would pay an
19 additional 2.75 percent. These
20 additional contributions increase the
21 assets of the pension fund over time.

22 The bill would also require new
23 employees to participate in Plan 16, the
24 stacked hybrid plan. Under the stacked
25 hybrid plan, as proposed in this

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 legislation, employees would have a
3 combination of a traditional defined
4 benefit plan for the first 65,000 of an
5 employee's earnings and an optional
6 401(k) with an employee match for
7 earnings above this amount. While the
8 cap in the legislation is higher than the
9 level the Administration previously
10 proposed, the stacked hybrid will reduce
11 the pension fund's liabilities while
12 providing retirement security for City
13 employees.

14 The bill would exempt newly
15 elected officials from the stacked
16 hybrid. Instead, new elected officials
17 would continue to participate in the
18 existing pension plan while all other
19 non-uniform employees would participate
20 in the new stacked hybrid. The
21 Administration's goal is for all new
22 employees in the municipal plan to have
23 the same pension structure. Therefore,
24 we are requesting that the bill be
25 amended to include future elected

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 officials in the new stacked hybrid.

3 If the legislation is passed by
4 City Council, more than 85 percent or
5 higher, more than 90 percent of the
6 City's workforce will be participating in
7 pension reform. Actually, it's more than
8 99 percent would be participating in
9 pension reform, helping improve the
10 long-term health of the pension fund.
11 The Administration -- we won't continue
12 working with 47 because we have a
13 tentative agreement.

14 That concludes my testimony,
15 and we'd be happy to take any questions.

16 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
17 you.

18 The Chair recognizes Councilman
19 Green for comments.

20 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you,
21 Madam Chair.

22 Mr. Dubow, if you could give a
23 little more background. When you talked
24 about how these reforms will help improve
25 the City's pension fund, give me

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 perspective in reference to where we go
3 from our current funding level to future
4 funding levels based on this legislation
5 as amended.

6 MR. DUBOW: Our current funding
7 level is -- we were under 46 percent
8 funded. With this legislation and other
9 reforms, including dedicating sales
10 tax -- thank you, Councilwoman -- to
11 pensions, making sure the additional
12 contributions are above the MMO, all
13 those things together mean that we'll get
14 to 80 percent funded by 2030.

15 COUNCILMAN GREEN: By 2030?

16 MR. DUBOW: Yeah.

17 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Is that
18 consistent -- I know previously the
19 Administration talked about different
20 initiatives, and is this consistent with
21 that same timeline from before?

22 MR. DUBOW: It is, yes.

23 COUNCILMAN GREEN: And that
24 will be 80 percent funded of the pension
25 fund?

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599

2 MR. DUBOW: That's right. And
3 this is just another key part of what we
4 wanted to do, and we're very excited that
5 we're about to achieve it.

6 COUNCILMAN GREEN: And just one
7 last thing. In addition to this
8 legislation as amended, what other things
9 that we could be possibly doing to
10 enhance getting to that level quicker?

11 MR. DUBOW: So --

12 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Outside of
13 us getting a windfall of new revenue like
14 a certain company that smiles all the
15 time.

16 MR. DUBOW: The other
17 components of what we're doing are the
18 sales tax revenue, which is coming in a
19 little stronger. So I think that's
20 almost \$300 million over our Five Year
21 Plan. So that's a really huge help for
22 the fund. It's making sure these
23 additional contributions are over what's
24 in the plan. It's lowering our cost of
25 investment. We've changed the way we

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 invest at the pension fund. We've gone
3 towards more indexing. We've gotten rid
4 of all our hedge funds. I think that's
5 reduced our costs by over \$13 million a
6 year. At the same time, our returns have
7 been really strong. We were about 13
8 percent last year. We're going to beat
9 our earnings assumption, unless something
10 goes really haywire during the rest of
11 the month this year. So those are some
12 of the key elements.

13 COUNCILMAN GREEN: And I'll
14 close, because I introduced a resolution
15 for hearings a little while ago in
16 looking at the PICA tax, because that
17 will be sunsetting in the future, and
18 looking at that as another option. That
19 has a lot of different dynamics to it,
20 but that's a conversation we can continue
21 in reference to looking at ways that we
22 can possibly dedicate additional funding
23 to the pension fund.

24 So thank you, Madam Chair.

25 MR. DUBOW: Thank you.

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
3 you, Councilman Green.

4 Mr. Dubow, can you just for the
5 record, you mentioned sales tax revenue.
6 In addition to that, you talked about our
7 pension fund sort of just being 46
8 percent, and when we talk about the
9 unfunded liability, explain to the public
10 what you meant when you talked about
11 sales tax revenue and give them the
12 number that is our total unfunded
13 liability right now.

14 MR. DUBOW: So our unfunded
15 liability now is about \$6.1 billion.
16 Sales tax money under legislation passed
17 at the state 2011, we are able to take a
18 portion of sales tax money and dedicate
19 it towards the pension fund, and that has
20 added substantial assets to the fund and
21 will continue to. As I said, I think
22 about 300 million over our Five Year
23 Plan. And we've also treated that as
24 being above the MMO as opposed to
25 replacing the contribution that we

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 already make. So it's a straight help to
3 the pension fund's health.

4 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: When you
5 mention the \$6.1 billion of unfunded
6 liability, is that number -- would I be
7 accurate if I said that approximately 5.1
8 billion of that is attributed to Plan 67
9 that we often refer to as legacy costs or
10 would it be a little bit less than 5.1,
11 maybe 5 billion?

12 MR. DUBOW: I think that's in
13 the right range. I mean, it's
14 predominantly the old plan into which
15 people haven't been able to enter since
16 probably '92. But, yes, it is mostly the
17 old plan.

18 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The old
19 plan, okay.

20 The Chair recognizes Councilman
21 Domb.

22 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Thank you,
23 Madam Chair.

24 Thank you, Finance Director
25 Dubow, and thank you, Jackie, too for

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 your testimony. I just had a couple
3 questions I wanted to make sure I
4 understood.

5 It sounds like our liability is
6 about 11 billion 400 million, roughly?

7 MR. DUBOW: Something in that
8 range, that's right.

9 COUNCILMAN DOMB: I did the
10 math in the inverse. The 6.1 billion
11 represents 54 percent that's not funded,
12 because 46 percent is funded.

13 MR. DUBOW: That's right.
14 About 54 and a half percent unfunded; 45
15 and a half.

16 COUNCILMAN DOMB: And to get to
17 80 percent, that would mean we would have
18 to -- how much in dollars would that be
19 lowering from the 6.1 that's unfunded?
20 Is it about three and a half billion?

21 MR. DUBOW: I think that sounds
22 about right, but you got to remember that
23 this is over 13 years. So there are
24 payments going out, earnings every year.
25 So it's a little different from that, but

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 that's the basic math.

3 COUNCILMAN DOMB: We're in
4 2018. You're saying 2030. So it's 13
5 years from now we're going to catch up
6 three and a half billion on the pension?

7 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

8 COUNCILMAN DOMB: That's a
9 great catchup if we can do it. Okay. It
10 just seems like a big catchup. Isn't
11 this still now considered the number one
12 issue from --

13 MR. DUBOW: I'm sorry. There's
14 one other thing that I haven't said about
15 what we're doing. We've also been
16 lowering our earnings assumption every
17 year, and with a lower earnings
18 assumption, it means that our
19 contribution goes up. So one of the
20 other big elements of this plan is
21 increasing our contribution each year by
22 making our earnings assumption more
23 conservative.

24 COUNCILMAN DOMB: And the other
25 question is, is it 15 or 16 percent of

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 the annual budget of the City goes
3 towards pensions?

4 MR. DUBOW: I think it's about
5 16.

6 COUNCILMAN DOMB: 16.

7 MR. DUBOW: It varies by year.

8 COUNCILMAN DOMB: That's
9 really, when you think about it, for
10 every dollar we receive, we only get to
11 work with 84 cents basically.

12 MR. DUBOW: That's right.

13 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Thank you
14 very much.

15 Thank you, Madam Chairwoman.

16 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The Chair
17 recognizes Councilman Green.

18 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you,
19 Madam Chair.

20 Councilman Domb actually
21 reminded me of another follow-up
22 question. We did reduce the earnings
23 assumption, and what was it before and
24 what is it now?

25 MR. DUBOW: So we have reduced

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 it to 7.65 percent. We also this year
3 for the first time, we voted two
4 reductions. So next year we're reducing
5 it to 7.6 percent. When we really
6 started kind of aggressively reducing it,
7 it had been at 8.75 percent. So we've
8 gone down a substantial amount.

9 COUNCILMAN GREEN: And what is
10 the current -- from a market perspective,
11 what is the current rate of return?

12 MR. DUBOW: So this year our
13 return to date has been about 8.8
14 percent. Obviously that changes day to
15 day, but we're 11 months into the fiscal
16 year, so hopefully the markets will be
17 relatively stable and stay around there.

18 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Hopefully.
19 And then also the follow-up on
20 Councilman Domb's point about a 13-year
21 timeline to get fully funded. That's
22 also incumbent upon the market rate of
23 return staying at a healthy rate over
24 that period of time, and one of the
25 concerns, that we're doing all that we

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 can, but we don't know what the market
3 will bear, and considering that we've had
4 a very long, long low market, it's a
5 possibility that we could be on the
6 horizon of a recession or some type of
7 bad market in a year, two years, three
8 years. So that's always a possibility,
9 which may impact our ability to get to
10 fully funding by 2030.

11 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. And the
12 earnings assumption is a long-term
13 earnings assumption. So we understand
14 there will be some years where we are
15 below and some years above it. We hope
16 that it averages out.

17 COUNCILMAN GREEN: You try to
18 smooth that out, I understand.

19 Thank you, Madam Chair.

20 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The Chair
21 recognizes Councilman Domb.

22 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Thank you,
23 Madam Chair.

24 I forgot to ask you another
25 question. You were expecting that,

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 though.

3 In the last two years, we've
4 had a pretty good market as far as
5 investments are concerned. I know the
6 pension fund has done pretty well. How
7 much of a dent have we made in this
8 really good market in the last two years?

9 MR. DUBOW: So there are two
10 things that we've done. One is the
11 funding percent has gone up. The other
12 thing is, there's kind of a collar around
13 which your assets -- take a step back.
14 We look at actuarial value of assets
15 rather than market value, and the
16 actuarial assets have to be within a
17 collar of the market value. So you could
18 be within 80 and 120 percent.

19 We were below the 100 percent,
20 so we've caught up in that collar and
21 we've increased our funding percent.

22 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Let me give
23 you the simple -- let me simplify the
24 question for a minute.

25 MR. DUBOW: While reducing

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599

2 our --

3 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Right. If
4 we're at 6.1 now, what were we -- I don't
5 remember -- two years ago?

6 MR. DUBOW: We'll get back to
7 you. I don't know that.

8 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Okay. All
9 right. Thank you. Thank you for your
10 testimony.

11 Thank you, Madam Chair.

12 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
13 you.

14 Mr. Dubow, I want to follow up
15 on Councilman Green's comments relative
16 to preparation if in fact another
17 recession comes. And so while we are not
18 expecting you to be magicians and project
19 when a black swan effect is coming, I
20 want you to, for the benefit of retirees
21 who may be watching now, to share with
22 them the reprieve that you received from
23 Harrisburg relative to the City's minimum
24 municipal obligation when we were in the
25 midst of a crisis. What is that process

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 and how was the City assisted and did
3 Harrisburg help?

4 MR. DUBOW: So state law has
5 something called a minimum municipal
6 obligation, and we're required to pay
7 that each year. What the state did
8 during the fiscal crisis is say that for
9 two years, we could pay below that --
10 it's called the MMO -- below the MMO, so
11 long as we made up the amount that we
12 didn't pay with interest within -- they
13 gave us a set of amount of time, and we
14 actually paid it back early. So that was
15 the kind of relief that we got.

16 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: So, in
17 essence, it was really just some
18 breathing room. We did make do, but it
19 was when we saw the climate begin to
20 change and as the market was turning
21 around and the City could meet its
22 obligation to just provide general City
23 services and to just fund itself.

24 MR. DUBOW: That's right. And
25 the other thing that the Pension Board

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 has done is try to look at the asset
3 allocation to make sure that there are
4 some protections against down markets.
5 The goal is to participate as much as you
6 can in the up market while not getting
7 hurt in the down market. So that's what
8 we try to look at too.

9 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Great.
10 The final thing, and I know this is
11 not -- we heard from them specifically
12 during our budget hearings, and I just
13 wanted you to note for the record since
14 the issue of performance was brought up,
15 I just want you to note for the record,
16 because you may remember, my mind is a
17 little cloudy right now, but for some odd
18 reason I remember reading an article, and
19 I said I couldn't believe they printed
20 this, that the City's fund actually
21 performed better than some of the other
22 surrounding counties. And I said, whoa,
23 you know, this has happened, but people
24 wrote it? Can you just remind us for the
25 record?

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599

2 MR. DUBOW: Yes. So for Fiscal
3 Year '17, our return was about 13
4 percent, and that compared favorably both
5 to -- we've been compared to Montgomery
6 County a few years. It was better than
7 that, and it was better than a couple of
8 the state funds too, and I think it was
9 in the top quartile nationwide of return.

10 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
11 you.

12 Are there any other questions
13 from our colleagues?

14 (No response.)

15 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Is there
16 anyone else here who wishes to testify on
17 this bill?

18 (No response.)

19 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: This will
20 conclude the public hearing and we will
21 now go into the public meeting to
22 consider the action to be taken on these
23 bills today.

24 We are now in the public
25 meeting, and the Chair recognizes

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 Councilmember Taubenberger for an
3 amendment to Bill No. 180557.

4 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Thank
5 you, Madam Chair. I offer an amendment
6 to Bill No. 180557. A copy of the
7 amendment has been circulated to all
8 members of the Committee, and I move the
9 amendment to Bill No. 180557 be approved.

10 (Duly seconded.)

11 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: It's been
12 moved and properly seconded that the
13 amendment to Bill No. 180557 be approved.

14 All those in favor of the
15 motion will signify by saying aye.

16 (Aye.)

17 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Those
18 opposed?

19 (No response.)

20 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The ayes
21 have it and the motion carries, and the
22 amendment to Bill No. 180557 has been
23 approved.

24 The Chair recognizes
25 Councilmember Taubenberger for an

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 amendment to Bill No. 180599.

3 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Thank
4 you, Madam Chair. I offer an amendment
5 to Bill No. 80599 [sic]. A copy of the
6 amendment has been circulated to all
7 members of the Committee, and I move that
8 the amendment to Bill No. 80599 be
9 approved.

10 (Duly seconded.)

11 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: I just
12 want to just note for the record -- I
13 don't know if -- we just want to note
14 that the number, the bill number is
15 180599, and I may have taken off a 1,
16 Councilman, on yours.

17 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Oh,
18 I'm sorry.

19 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: I may
20 have taken off a 1. Don't kill me. It's
21 my fault, not the Councilman.

22 Is there a second?

23 (Duly seconded.)

24 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: It's been
25 moved and properly seconded that the

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599
2 amendment to Bill No. 180599 be approved.

3 All those in favor of the
4 motion will signify by saying aye.

5 (Aye.)

6 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Those
7 opposed?

8 (No response.)

9 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The ayes
10 have it and the motion carries, and the
11 amendment to Bill No. 180599 has been
12 approved.

13 The Chair now recognizes
14 Councilmember Taubenberger for a single
15 motion on Bill No. 180557, as amended,
16 and Bill No. 180599, as amended.

17 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Thank
18 you, Madam Chair. I move that Bill No.
19 180557, as amended, and Bill No. 180599,
20 as amended, be reported from this
21 Committee with a favorable recommendation
22 and further move that the rules of
23 Council be suspended to permit first
24 reading of these bills at the next
25 session of Council.

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599

2 (Duly seconded.)

3 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: It's been
4 moved and properly seconded that Bill No.
5 180557, as amended, and Bill No. 180599,
6 as amended, be reported from this
7 Committee with a favorable recommendation
8 and further moved that the rules of
9 Council be suspended to permit first
10 reading of these bills at the next
11 session of Council.

12 All those in favor of the
13 motion will signify by saying aye.

14 (Aye.)

15 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Those
16 opposed?

17 (No response.)

18 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The ayes
19 have it and the motion carries. Bill No.
20 180557, as amended, and Bill No. 180599,
21 as amended, will be reported from this
22 Committee with a favorable recommendation
23 with a request that the rules of Council
24 be suspended to permit first reading at
25 the next session of Council.

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
June 13, 2018

Page 33

1 6/13/18 - LABOR - BILLS 180557 & 180599

2 This concludes the business of
3 the Committee of Labor and Civil Service
4 for today.

5 Thank you all very much for
6 your attendance, and congratulations.

7 Thank you.

8 (Committee on Labor and Civil
9 Services concluded at 2:55 p.m.)

10 - - -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the
proceedings, evidence and objections are
contained fully and accurately in the
stenographic notes taken by me upon the
foregoing matter, and that this is a true and
correct transcript of same.

MICHELE L. MURPHY
RPR-Notary Public

(The foregoing certification of this
transcript does not apply to any reproduction
of the same by any means, unless under the
direct control and/or supervision of the
certifying reporter.)

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
June 13, 2018

Page 1

A	2:24 3:11	awards 4:13	3:1,21 4:1	16:24 18:20	8:9	continue	31:14
ability 23:9	amendment	4:17 6:16	5:1 6:1 7:1	18:23 21:16	combination	12:17 13:11	Councilme...
able 17:17	29:3,5,7,9	6:25	7:15 8:1 9:1	21:19 23:19	12:3	16:20 17:21	8:23
18:15	29:13,22	aye 29:15,16	10:1 11:1	23:20,23	combines	contribute	Councilwo...
accounts 6:14	30:2,4,6,8	31:4,5	12:1 13:1	25:11 28:25	5:24	5:13 11:16	1:10,11 2:2
accurate 9:19	31:2,11	32:13,14	14:1 15:1	29:5,24	comes 25:17	contribution	2:13 3:19
18:7	amendments	ayes 29:20	16:1 17:1	30:4 31:13	coming 2:19	3:4,15 4:23	3:24 4:6 7:6
accurately	3:8,17	31:9 32:18	18:1 19:1	31:18	15:18 25:19	4:25 5:8,11	7:11 8:17
34:5	10:11		20:1 21:1	Chairwoman	commend	6:19 11:7,8	8:19,20 9:2
achieve 15:5	amount 6:4	B	22:1 23:1	21:15	7:16	11:10,14	9:8,12,24
achieved 7:25	12:7 22:8	back 2:19	24:1 25:1	challenge	comments 9:3	17:25 20:19	13:16 14:10
action 28:22	26:11,13	24:13 25:6	26:1 27:1	10:19	13:19 25:15	20:21	17:2 18:4
actuarial	and/or 34:24	26:14	28:1,23	change 3:4,14	Committee	contributions	18:18 21:16
24:14,16	annual 5:10	background	29:1 30:1	26:20	1:3 2:6,11	4:19 5:3,17	23:20 25:12
added 17:20	5:12,15	13:23	31:1,24	changed 11:9	2:12,17 4:7	6:18 11:20	26:16 27:9
addition 15:7	6:19 11:13	bad 23:7	32:1,10	15:25	9:4,25 29:8	14:12 15:23	28:10,15,19
17:6	11:17 21:2	balance 8:13	33:1	changes	30:7 31:21	control 34:24	29:11,17,20
additional	answer 7:4	bargaining	bit 18:10	22:14	32:7,22	conversation	30:11,19,24
3:14 4:19	apply 10:17	8:3,10	black 25:19	CHERELLE	33:3,8	16:20	31:6,9 32:3
4:21,22,24	11:11 34:22	based 14:4	Board 26:25	1:10	company	copy 29:6	32:15,18
5:2,14,16	approved	basic 20:2	breathing	Chief 4:7	15:14	30:5	counties
5:17 6:17	29:9,13,23	basically	26:18	10:9	compared	correct 34:8	27:22
11:16,19,20	30:9 31:2	21:11	briefly 7:14	circulated	28:4,5	cost 15:24	County 28:6
14:11 15:23	31:12	bear 23:3	brought	29:7 30:6	components	costs 10:21	couple 19:2
16:22	approximat...	beat 16:8	27:14	city 1:2,6 2:5	15:17	10:24 16:5	28:7
Administra...	18:7	believe 27:19	budget 21:2	3:5 4:10 6:6	concerned	18:9	courts 8:8
7:16 12:9	arbitration	benefit 5:25	27:12	6:21 7:24	24:5	Council 1:2	crisis 25:25
13:11 14:19	4:13,17	12:4 25:20	business 33:2	10:23 12:12	concerns	2:5 5:9 7:19	26:8
Administra...	6:16	benefits 8:6		13:4 21:2	22:25	7:19 10:14	crucial 8:25
12:21	article 27:18	best 8:12	C	26:2,21,22	conclude 9:9	13:4 31:23	current 4:20
afternoon 2:3	asset 27:2	better 27:21	call 3:20	City's 6:19	28:20	31:25 32:9	5:6 11:4,5
4:2,5 9:23	assets 5:3,18	28:6,7	called 2:4	7:2 8:13	concluded	32:11,23,25	14:3,6
aggressively	11:21 17:20	big 7:25	26:5,10	10:2,19	33:9	Councilman	22:10,11
22:6	24:13,14,16	20:10,20	cap 3:16 12:8	13:6,25	concludes 7:3	1:10,11,12	currently 5:2
ago 16:15	assisted 26:2	bill 2:8,21,23	carries 29:21	25:23 27:20	13:14 33:2	2:13,15,17	
25:5	Association	3:10 4:11	31:10 32:19	civil 1:3 2:6	conditions	13:18,20	D
agreement	4:16	7:13 9:17	catch 20:5	10:5,6 33:3	3:9,18	14:15,17,23	date 22:13
10:13,15	assumption	9:19,21	catchup 20:9	33:8	congratulat...	15:6,12	day 22:14,15
11:9 13:13	16:9 20:16	10:3,12	20:10	clarify 9:16	33:6	16:13 17:3	decrease 8:5
Al 1:12 2:14	20:18,22	11:4,22	caught 24:20	Clarke 7:20	conservative	18:20,22	dedicate
Allan 1:10	21:23 23:12	12:14,24	cents 21:11	Clerk 2:20,23	20:23	19:9,16	16:22 17:18
2:15	23:13	28:17 29:3	certain 3:3,4	3:20,22	consider	20:3,8,24	dedicating
allocation	attendance	29:6,9,13	3:9,16,18	10:12	28:22	21:6,8,13	14:9
27:3	2:12 33:6	29:22 30:2	15:14	climate 26:19	consideration	21:17,18,20	Deferred 3:6
amend 3:5	attention	30:5,8,14	CERTIFIC...	close 16:14	2:22	22:9,18,20	6:11
10:12	8:24	31:2,11,15	34:2	cloudy 27:17	considered	23:17,21,22	defined 5:24
amended	attributed	31:16,18,19	certification	Code 2:25 3:2	20:11	24:22 25:3	12:3
12:25 14:5	18:8	32:4,5,19	34:21	3:12,13	considering	25:8,15	delay 6:10
15:8 31:15	audience 9:5	32:20	CERTIFY	collar 24:12	23:3	29:4 30:3	dent 24:7
31:16,19,20	averages	billion 17:15	34:3	24:17,20	consistent	30:16,17,21	Deputy 4:14
32:5,6,20	23:16	18:5,8,11	certifying	colleagues 7:9	14:18,20	31:17	5:5,21 6:8
32:21	award 5:20	19:6,10,20	34:25	28:13	contained	Councilme...	DEREK 1:11
amending	6:9	20:6	Chair 1:10	collective 8:3	34:5	29:2,25	Detroit 8:4
		bills 1:14 2:1	13:18,21				different

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
June 13, 2018

Page 2

14:19 16:19 19:25 direct 34:24 Director 4:8 4:9 10:2,10 18:24 District 5:9 10:14 doing 15:9,17 20:15 22:25 dollar 21:10 dollars 19:18 Domb 1:10 2:15 18:21 18:22 19:9 19:16 20:3 20:8,24 21:6,8,13 21:20 23:21 23:22 24:22 25:3,8 Domb's 22:20 drop 3:7 6:12 6:14 10:25 Dubow 3:23 4:9 7:22 8:21 9:11 9:23 10:2 13:22 14:6 14:16,22 15:2,11,16 16:25 17:4 17:14 18:12 18:25 19:7 19:13,21 20:7,13 21:4,7,12 21:25 22:12 23:11 24:9 24:25 25:6 25:14 26:4 26:24 28:2 Duly 29:10 30:10,23 32:2 Dunn 3:22 4:5,7 7:14 10:9 dynamics 16:19	6:4 12:5,7 16:9 19:24 20:16,17,22 21:22 23:12 23:13 effect 5:2 25:19 elected 10:8 11:6 12:15 12:16,25 elements 16:12 20:20 employee 6:17 12:6 employee's 6:2 12:5 employees 3:2,3,5,12 3:16 4:20 5:6,12,15 6:6 7:18 10:5,6 11:5 11:14,17,23 12:2,13,19 12:22 employer 6:3 enact 10:4 enacted 6:13 enhance 8:12 15:10 enter 6:10 18:15 entitled 2:25 3:12 essence 26:17 established 6:15 evidence 34:4 exceeding 5:15 11:18 excited 15:4 exempt 10:5 11:4 12:14 existing 8:6 12:18 expand 3:2 expecting 23:25 25:18 explain 17:9	fault 30:21 favor 29:14 31:3 32:12 favorable 31:21 32:7 32:22 favorably 28:4 Fighters 4:16 final 27:10 Finance 4:8,9 10:2,10 18:24 finances 10:19 finish 7:13 Fire 4:16 first 3:21 5:25 9:18 12:4 22:3 31:23 32:9,24 fiscal 8:13 22:15 26:8 28:2 Five 15:20 17:22 follow 25:14 follow-up 21:21 22:19 FOP 4:18 foregoing 34:7,21 forgot 23:24 found 8:11 Fraternal 4:13 fully 22:21 23:10 34:5 fund 4:20 5:4 5:18 6:20 7:2 11:21 13:10,25 14:25 15:22 16:2,23 17:7,19,20 24:6 26:23 27:20 fund's 10:21 12:11 18:3 funded 14:8 14:14,24 19:11,12 22:21	funding 6:22 10:25 14:3 14:4,6 16:22 23:10 24:11,21 funds 16:4 28:8 further 31:22 32:8 future 12:25 14:3 16:17 FY01 10:22 FY18 4:21 FY19 4:24	H half 19:14,15 19:20 20:6 Hall 1:6 hand 8:18 happened 27:23 happy 7:4 13:15 Harrisburg 25:23 26:3 haywire 16:10 He'll 2:19 health 6:25 8:13 13:10 18:3 healthy 22:23 hear 2:8 9:20 heard 27:11 hearing 2:3,5 2:7 7:23 9:10 28:20 hearings 16:15 27:12 hedge 16:4 Helen 1:11 2:13 help 6:25 13:24 15:21 18:2 26:3 helping 13:9 higher 5:10 5:11 11:12 11:13 12:8 13:5 hires 4:24 hope 23:15 hopefully 22:16,18 horizon 23:6 huge 15:21 hurt 27:7 hybrid 3:16 5:23,23 6:5 11:24,25 12:10,16,20 13:2	impact 23:9 implement 4:11 important 10:18 improve 6:22 6:25 13:9 13:24 include 3:3 12:25 included 4:12 6:12 including 14:9 increase 5:3 5:18 11:20 increased 10:24 24:21 increasing 20:21 incumbent 22:22 incurring 10:24 indexing 16:3 initiatives 14:20 interest 6:14 26:12 International 4:15 introduced 16:14 inverse 19:10 invest 16:2 investment 15:25 investments 24:5 involved 7:21 issue 8:25 20:12 27:14	24:12 26:15 know 7:23 14:18 23:2 24:5 25:7 27:10,23 30:13 L L 1:10 34:15 labor 1:3 2:1 2:6 3:1 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1 7:17 8:1 9:1 9:25 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1,3,8 law 26:4 leadership 7:19 left 2:13 9:5 legacy 18:9 legally 6:21 legislation 6:12 12:2,8 13:3 14:4,8 15:8 17:16 Let's 9:13 level 12:9 14:3,7 15:10 levels 14:4 liabilities 6:7 12:11 liability 17:9 17:13,15 18:6 19:5 little 13:23 15:19 16:15 18:10 19:25 27:17 long 23:4,4 26:11 long-term 13:10 23:12	look 24:14 27:2,8 looking 16:16 16:18,21 lot 16:19 low 23:4 lower 6:13 20:17 lowering 15:24 19:19 20:16 M Madam 13:21 16:24 18:23 21:15 21:19 23:19 23:23 25:11 29:5 30:4 31:18 magicians 25:18 magnitude 8:2 maintains 6:13 major 7:24 7:24 making 14:11 15:22 20:22 manner 8:12 market 22:10 22:22 23:2 23:4,7 24:4 24:8,15,17 26:20 27:6 27:7 markets 22:16 27:4 match 6:3 12:6 math 19:10 20:2 matter 34:7 mean 8:3 14:13 18:13 19:17 means 6:20 20:18 34:23 meant 17:10 meet 26:21 meeting 28:21,25 member 2:16
E early 26:14 earnings 6:2	F facing 10:19 fact 25:16 far 24:4		G general 10:21 26:22 getting 15:10 15:13 27:6 give 13:22,25 17:11 24:22 given 8:24 go 9:13 14:2 28:21 goal 12:21 27:5 goes 16:10 20:19 21:2 going 16:8 19:24 20:5 good 2:2 4:2 4:5 9:23 24:4,8 gotten 16:3 great 20:9 27:9 Green 1:11 2:17 13:19 13:20 14:15 14:17,23 15:6,12 16:13 17:3 21:17,18 22:9,18 23:17 Green's 25:15 growing 10:23 grown 10:21 Gym 1:11 2:13 8:17 8:19	I IAFF 4:18 immediately 8:4	K key 15:3 16:12 kill 30:20 kind 22:6		

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
June 13, 2018

Page 3

members 2:11,11 3:14 4:6,18 5:7,10,22 9:4,24 11:12 29:8 30:7 mention 18:5 mentioned 17:5 MICHELE 34:15 midst 25:25 million 10:22 15:20 16:5 17:22 19:6 mind 8:4 27:16 minimum 25:23 26:5 minute 24:24 MMO 14:12 17:24 26:10 26:10 money 17:16 17:18 Montgomery 28:5 month 16:11 months 22:15 motion 29:15 29:21 31:4 31:10,15 32:13,19 move 29:8 30:7 31:18 31:22 moved 29:12 30:25 32:4 32:8 municipal 7:18 8:15 12:22 25:24 26:5 municipality 7:24 MURPHY 34:15 N name 9:22 names 4:3 nationwide 28:9	needs 10:15 new 4:24 5:20 11:10,22 12:16,20,21 13:2 15:13 newly 12:14 non-represe... 11:5 non-uniform 12:19 Nos 2:8 note 27:13,15 30:12,13 noted 9:16 notes 34:6 number 9:18 17:12 18:6 20:11 30:14 30:14 numbers 9:17 9:19 O objections 34:4 obligation 25:24 26:6 26:22 Obviously 22:14 odd 27:17 offer 29:5 30:4 office 2:19 10:9 officials 10:8 11:6 12:15 12:16 13:2 Oh 30:17 okay 8:20 9:8 18:19 20:9 25:8 old 18:14,17 18:18 opened 9:16 opposed 17:24 29:18 31:7 32:16 option 3:7 6:11 16:18 optional 6:2 12:5 order 2:4 4:14	ordinance 2:24 3:10 6:15 Outside 15:12 P p.m 1:7 33:9 paid 6:18 26:14 Parker 1:10 2:2 3:19,24 4:6 7:6,11 8:20 9:2,8 9:12,24 13:16 17:2 18:4,18 21:16 23:20 25:12 26:16 27:9 28:10 28:15,19 29:11,17,20 30:11,19,24 31:6,9 32:3 32:15,18 part 15:3 participate 5:7,22 11:6 11:23 12:17 12:19 27:5 participating 13:6,8 particular 8:24 passed 13:3 17:16 pay 4:20,24 5:11,16 6:21 11:13 11:18 26:6 26:9,12 paying 8:24 payments 19:24 Pennsylvania 1:6 pension 4:12 4:19 5:4,18 6:7,20 7:2 8:2 10:4,20 10:21 11:21 12:11,18,23 13:7,9,10 13:25 14:24	16:2,23 17:7,19 18:3 20:6 24:6 26:25 pensions 14:11 21:3 people 18:15 27:23 percent 4:21 4:23,25 5:17 10:25 11:2,3,16 11:19 13:4 13:5,8 14:7 14:14,24 16:8 17:8 19:11,12,14 19:17 20:25 22:2,5,7,14 24:11,18,19 24:21 28:4 performance 27:14 performed 27:21 period 22:24 permit 31:23 32:9,24 perspective 14:2 22:10 Philadelphia 1:2,6 2:25 3:11 PICA 16:16 place 5:8 plan 3:3,7,14 5:22,23,24 6:5,23 11:23,24,25 12:4,18,22 15:21,24 17:23 18:8 18:14,17,19 20:20 please 3:20 4:3 point 22:20 Police 4:14 portion 17:18 possibility 23:5,8 possible 8:12 possibly 15:9	16:22 predomina... 18:14 preparation 25:16 presence 2:10 PRESENT 1:9 presented 10:11 President 7:19 pretty 24:4,6 previously 12:9 14:18 printed 27:19 prior 7:23 probably 18:16 proceed 4:4 proceedings 34:4 process 8:3 8:10 25:25 Program 6:11 project 25:18 properly 29:12 30:25 32:4 proposed 11:25 12:10 protections 27:4 provide 3:13 26:22 provides 6:5 providing 12:12 provisions 3:6 public 2:5,7 2:25 3:12 9:9 17:9 28:20,21,24 34:16 purpose 2:7 Q quartile 28:9 question 20:25 21:22 23:25 24:24 questions 7:4	7:8 9:3 13:15 19:3 28:12 quicker 15:10 quickly 6:23 quorum 2:11 R range 18:13 19:8 rate 5:12 6:14 11:14 22:11 22:22,23 rates 3:4,15 4:25 ratification 10:16 reached 10:14 11:9 read 2:21 reading 27:18 31:24 32:10 32:24 really 15:21 16:7,10 21:9 22:5 24:8 26:17 reason 27:18 receive 21:10 received 25:22 receivership 8:8 recession 23:6 25:17 recognize 2:10 recognizes 13:18 18:20 21:17 23:21 28:25 29:24 31:13 recommend... 31:21 32:7 32:22 record 4:3 9:15,22 17:5 27:13 27:15,25 30:12 reduce 12:10 21:22 reduced 16:5 21:25	reducing 6:6 22:4,6 24:25 reductions 22:4 refer 18:9 reference 14:2 16:21 reflect 10:13 11:9 reform 8:2 13:7,9 reforms 4:12 6:24 10:4 13:24 14:9 Register 4:15 5:6,21 6:8 relating 3:6 relative 25:15 25:23 relatively 22:17 relief 26:15 remember 19:22 25:5 27:16,18 remind 27:24 reminded 21:21 removes 6:9 replacing 17:25 reported 31:20 32:6 32:21 reporter 34:25 representat... 7:17 represented 10:7 represents 19:11 reprieve 25:22 reproduction 34:22 request 32:23 requesting 12:24 require 4:18 6:17 11:22 required 6:19	6:22 26:6 requirement 6:10 requires 5:20 resolution 16:14 response 7:10 9:7 28:14 28:18 29:19 31:8 32:17 rest 16:10 retirees 8:7 25:20 retirement 3:2,7,13 6:5 6:11 8:5,14 12:12 return 22:11 22:13,23 28:3,9 returns 16:6 revenue 15:13,18 17:5,11 rid 16:3 right 2:14 9:13 15:2 17:13 18:13 19:8,13,22 21:12 25:3 25:9 26:24 27:17 Rob 3:22 4:9 9:25 room 1:6 2:18 26:18 roughly 19:6 RPR-Notary 34:16 rules 31:22 32:8,23 S salaries 5:11 5:12,15 11:13,15,18 sales 14:9 15:18 17:5 17:11,16,18 saw 26:19 saying 20:4 29:15 31:4 32:13 second 4:22
---	--	---	--	---	--	--	--

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
June 13, 2018

Page 4

30:22 seconded 29:10,12 30:10,23,25 32:2,4 security 6:5 8:14 12:12 see 8:17 seen 10:25 service 1:3 2:6 9:25 10:6,7 33:3 services 26:23 33:9 session 31:25 32:11,25 set 26:13 share 25:21 sharing 7:22 Sheriff 5:21 6:8 Sheriffs 4:14 5:5 sic 2:9 30:5 signify 29:15 31:4 32:13 simple 24:23 simplify 24:23 sincerely 7:16 single 31:14 smiles 15:14 smooth 23:18 sorry 20:13 30:18 sort 17:7 sounds 19:5 19:21 specifically 27:11 specify 3:15 stable 22:17 stacked 3:16 5:23,23 6:4 11:24,24 12:10,15,20 13:2 Staff 4:8 10:9 started 22:6 starting 4:23 state 4:3 7:14 9:22 17:17 26:4,7 28:8	status 6:23 stay 22:17 staying 22:23 stenographic 34:6 step 24:13 straight 18:2 strong 16:7 stronger 10:23 15:19 structure 5:8 11:7,8,11 12:23 substantial 17:20 22:8 sunsetting 16:17 supervision 34:24 support 4:10 8:23 10:3 sure 14:11 15:22 19:3 27:3 surrounding 27:22 suspended 31:23 32:9 32:24 swan 25:19 system 5:10 10:20,25 11:12 system's 6:7 T take 13:15 17:17 24:13 taken 28:22 30:15,20 34:6 talk 17:8 talked 13:23 14:19 17:6 17:10 Taubenber... 1:12 2:14 29:2,4,25 30:3,17 31:14,17 tax 14:10 15:18 16:16 17:5,11,16 17:18	technical 3:8 3:17 ten 7:25 tentative 10:13,15 13:13 terms 3:9,18 10:16 testify 3:21 4:10 9:6 10:3 28:16 testimony 2:8 4:4 7:3,7 9:21 13:14 19:2 25:10 thank 3:19,24 7:6 8:16,21 8:22 13:16 13:20 14:10 16:24,25 17:2 18:22 18:24,25 21:13,15,18 23:19,22 25:9,9,11 25:12 28:10 29:4 30:3 31:17 33:5 33:7 thing 15:7 20:14 24:12 26:25 27:10 things 14:13 15:8 24:10 think 15:19 16:4 17:21 18:12 19:21 21:4,9 28:8 three 6:25 19:20 20:6 23:7 tier 5:9,14 11:17 tiered 5:7 11:7,8,10 time 5:4,19 6:24 11:21 15:15 16:6 22:3,24 26:13 timeline 14:21 22:21 title 2:21,24	3:11 today 2:22 28:23 33:4 top 5:14 6:18 11:17 28:9 total 4:22 17:12 traditional 5:24 12:3 transcript 34:8,22 treated 17:23 true 34:7 try 23:17 27:2,8 turning 26:20 two 22:3 23:7 24:3,8,9 25:5 26:9 two-year 6:9 type 23:6 U underfunded 10:20 understand 23:13,18 understood 19:4 unfunded 17:9,12,14 18:5 19:14 19:19 union 10:7 V value 24:14 24:15,17 varies 21:7 various 3:5 voted 22:3 W wait 7:12 want 7:12,15 8:22 25:14 25:20 27:15 30:12,13 wanted 8:15 15:4 19:3 27:13 watching 25:21 way 8:11	15:25 ways 16:21 we'll 14:13 25:6 we're 15:4,5 15:17 16:8 20:3,5,15 22:4,15,25 25:4 26:6 we've 10:11 10:14 15:25 16:2,3 17:23 20:15 22:7 23:3 24:3,10,20 24:21 28:5 Wednesday 1:7 whoa 27:22 Wills 4:15 5:6 5:21 6:9 windfall 15:13 wishes 9:5 28:16 witnesses 3:21 work 21:11 workforce 8:15 13:6 working 13:12 wrote 27:24 X Y Yeah 14:16 23:11 year 6:22 15:20 16:6 16:8,11 17:22 19:24 20:17,21 21:7 22:2,4 22:12,16 23:7 26:7 28:3 years 19:23 20:5 23:7,8 23:14,15 24:3,8 25:5 26:9 28:6	Z 0 0.5 5:14 11:16 0.92 4:21,22 1 1 30:15,20 1.84 4:23 100 24:19 100,000 5:16 11:18 11 19:6 22:15 120 24:18 13 1:7 16:5,7 19:23 20:4 28:3 13-year 22:20 15 20:25 16 3:3,14 5:22 11:23 20:25 21:5 21:6 17 28:3 180557 1:14 2:1,23 3:1 4:1,11 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1,19 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1,3,6,9 29:13,22 30:1 31:1 31:15,19 32:1,5,20 33:1 180577 2:8 9:17 180599 1:14 2:1,9 3:1,10 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1,13 8:1 9:1,18,20 9:21 10:1,4	11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1,2 30:15 31:1 31:2,11,16 31:19 32:1 32:5,20 33:1 2 2.5 4:25 2.75 11:19 2:30 1:7 2:55 33:9 2011 6:13 17:17 2018 1:7 20:4 2030 14:14 14:15 20:4 23:10 22 2:24 3:11 3 3 5:16 300 15:20 17:22 33 5:9 11:11 4 400 1:6 10:22 19:6 401(k) 6:3 12:6 45 11:2 19:14 45,001 5:13 11:15 46 14:7 17:7 19:12 47 10:14,17 11:10,11 13:12 5 5 18:11 5.1 18:7,10 50,000 5:25 54 19:11,14	55,000 5:13 11:15 6 6.1 17:15 18:5 19:10 19:19 25:4 6/13/18 2:1 3:1 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 65,000 12:4 67 18:8 7 7.6 22:5 7.65 22:2 8 8.75 22:7 8.8 22:13 80 11:2 14:14 14:24 19:17 24:18 80599 30:5,8 84 21:11 85 13:4 9 90 13:5 92 18:16 99 13:8
---	--	--	--	---	--	--	--