

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
February 18, 2020

Page 1

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
COMMITTEE ON LABOR AND CIVIL SERVICE

Room 400, City Hall
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania
Tuesday, February 18, 2020
1:23 p.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCILWOMAN CHERELLE L. PARKER, CHAIR
COUNCILWOMAN KENDRA BROOKS
COUNCILMAN ALLAN DOMB
COUNCILWOMAN KATHERINE GILMORE RICHARDSON
COUNCILMAN DEREK S. GREEN
COUNCILWOMAN HELEN GYM
COUNCILMAN BRIAN J. O'NEILL
COUNCILWOMAN MARIA D. QUINONES-SANCHEZ

BILL 200007 - An ordinance amending Chapter
20-1100 of The Philadelphia Code, entitled
"Civil Service Preferences," to provide for a
civil service preference for qualified
graduates of Career Technical Education
Programs in the School District of
Philadelphia...

- - -

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
February 18, 2020

Page 2

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Good
3 afternoon. This hearing is called to
4 order. This is the public hearing of the
5 City Council Committee on Labor and Civil
6 Service. The purpose of this public
7 hearing is to hear testimony on Bill No.
8 200007.

9 I recognize the presence of a
10 quorum of Committee members. Members of
11 the Committee in attendance are, to my
12 left, Councilmember Domb, Councilwoman
13 Gilmore Richardson, and to my right,
14 Councilman Derek Green.

15 I wanted to ask any of my
16 colleagues if they have any opening
17 remarks.

18 (No response.)

19 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Any
20 opening remarks?

21 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Sure.

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The Chair
23 recognizes Councilwoman Gilmore
24 Richardson.

25 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Good

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 morning, Committee Chair Parker, Vice
3 Chair O'Neill, fellow members of the
4 Committee, and members of the public who
5 are in attendance today. I want to
6 especially thank the citizens of
7 Philadelphia that came here today to have
8 their voices heard.

9 The CTE preference Charter
10 change is a jobs bill to encourage some
11 of the roughly 5,000 Philadelphia CTE
12 students who go through 1,080 hours of
13 rigorous industry-level training and
14 leave with certifications to work here in
15 the great City of Philadelphia.

16 This bill is just one part of
17 an ongoing effort to change what has been
18 referred to as a school-to-prison
19 pipeline into a school-to-employment
20 pipeline.

21 As Mayor Kenney stated in his
22 recent address to the Chamber of
23 Commerce, there is no one single policy
24 that will even begin to turn the ship.
25 To make a meaningful change over the next

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 four years, we'll have to employ a
3 multi-pronged strategic effort that
4 invests in our young children, our K to
5 12 students, and the communities in which
6 they live.

7 This is just a single piece of
8 that effort.

9 My staff and I have met with
10 many organizations, stakeholders, and
11 groups to determine what the impact of
12 this legislation would be, and we have
13 worked hard to dispel some of the
14 misinformation that has appeared
15 regarding this bill.

16 Please allow me to share with
17 you some facts to dispel misinformation.

18 First, to our wonderful veteran
19 community, I want to thank you all so
20 much for taking the opportunity to meet
21 with us this afternoon. And to my
22 colleague Councilmember Domb, thank you
23 so much for sharing your concerns
24 relative to this legislation. Know that
25 I heard you, and I think we have a few

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 next steps to do after this process.

3 So this bill -- and some of the
4 misinformation that we received is that
5 this bill would hurt veterans or that it
6 would put high school graduates on the
7 same level as veterans or legacy
8 children. We listened to your concerns,
9 which is why we amended the bill to allow
10 a five point preference for our CTE
11 graduates, which will last only up to 36
12 months after graduation. Initially it
13 was ten. We heard you, veterans, and we
14 lowered it to five.

15 Meanwhile, the preference for
16 veterans and legacy children and
17 grandchildren remains at ten points, and
18 there is no time limit to when you can
19 use the benefit.

20 Last year, out of nearly 74,000
21 civil service applications, only about
22 1.3 percent of those applicants actually
23 used the veterans preference. The legacy
24 preference was only used by four of those
25 74,000 applicants. The fear that this

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 legislation would cause unfair hardship
3 on veterans and legacy applicants is
4 unwarranted.

5 Moreover, we do not believe it
6 is likely that veterans that use the
7 civil service preference and the CTE
8 students that will use this lesser
9 preference going forward will overlap
10 often. The CTE school graduates is less
11 than 2,000 students per year, and the
12 preference only lasts for three years
13 after graduation, compared to veterans
14 and legacy applicants whose preference
15 lasts for a lifetime.

16 We met with stakeholders from
17 our first responders. The amendment
18 before you today is designed to exclude
19 Police and Fire Departments from this
20 legislation since they have the Explorers
21 and the Cadets Program where they already
22 receive a preference, while leaving
23 intact the preference already afforded,
24 the specific preference programs already
25 connected to those two departments.

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 In addition, no one expects
3 that every graduate of a CTE program will
4 use this preference or apply for civil
5 service positions. Many will find
6 employment in the private sector, apply
7 to be apprentices with the building
8 trades, move on to college or
9 undergraduate technical school. This
10 bill is meant to serve the remaining
11 students that wish to remain in the City
12 of Philadelphia and join the municipal
13 workforce to fill some of the City's
14 skilled labor deficiencies.

15 The CTE programs in
16 Philadelphia better resemble
17 Philadelphia's makeup and, therefore,
18 encouraging them to apply would have an
19 added benefit.

20 While DC47 was not able to
21 attend, we thank them for sending a
22 letter of support. They represent over
23 6,000 employees in the City of
24 Philadelphia. And we have also been in
25 contact with DC33, representing a larger

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 number of employees in our city, and we
3 thank them for their support.

4 I ask my colleagues to vote yes
5 on this legislation that would put the
6 question before the qualified electors in
7 the City of Philadelphia. It is just one
8 part of a larger effort to give our
9 graduating students options in employment
10 and to move forward the City's goal of
11 reducing poverty and being serious about
12 workforce development in the City of
13 Philadelphia.

14 Thank you so much, Chairwoman
15 Parker.

16 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
17 you, Councilwoman Gilmore Richardson.

18 For the record, the Chair notes
19 the presence to my left of Councilwoman
20 Brooks. I want to thank the Councilwoman
21 for joining us here today. Although she
22 is not a voting member of this Committee,
23 she is a co-sponsor of the bill, and
24 because of her interest in workforce
25 development in this issue, she is joining

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 us today, and I want to say thank you,
3 Councilwoman Brooks, for the record.

4 The Clerk will now read the
5 title of the bill being considered today.

6 THE CLERK: Bill No. 200007, an
7 ordinance amending Chapter 20-1100 of The
8 Philadelphia Code, entitled "Civil
9 Service Preferences," to provide for a
10 civil service preference for qualified
11 graduates of Career Technical Education
12 Programs in the School District of
13 Philadelphia, under certain terms and
14 conditions.

15 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The Clerk
16 will please call the first panel of
17 witnesses to testify.

18 THE CLERK: Mike Zaccagni, Otis
19 Hackney, and Zakiyyah Ali.

20 (Witnesses approached witness
21 table.)

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: As our
23 first panel approaches, I just want to,
24 in the spirit of our Vice Chair and
25 veteran member, Councilman Brian O'Neill,

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 want to just remind all of our panels
3 that we do have your testimony in
4 writing. If you feel free to summarize
5 it, know that we accept that, but if you
6 read it, that's okay too. But Brian
7 O'Neill is a veteran member. He is in my
8 mind and always making sure that we
9 communicate that message to those who are
10 testifying.

11 Good afternoon, and please
12 state your name for the record and
13 proceed with your testimony.

14 MR. ZACCAGNI: Michael
15 Zaccagni, Interim HR Director for the
16 City of Philadelphia.

17 MS. ALI: Zakiyyah Ali,
18 Director of Workforce Programs, Office of
19 Workforce Development.

20 MR. HACKNEY: Otis Hackney,
21 Chief Education Officer, City of
22 Philadelphia, Mayor's Office of
23 Education.

24 MR. ZACCAGNI: I guess I will
25 go first, and I'm going to choose the

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 path of summarizing.

3 As we talked about last time,
4 and I know some of the Councilpeople may
5 not have been here, we support the goals
6 of this program. Creating opportunities
7 for high school students throughout the
8 City is something that we support
9 wholeheartedly. We look to do this in
10 many of the aspects of work that we do
11 within the Office of Human Resources, and
12 we feel that creating pipelines and
13 programs to give those opportunities to
14 high school students is an important
15 activity that we have to do.

16 I think as we talked about last
17 time, our only challenge is the way we do
18 it. So we do a lot of programming. We
19 think we can create better and more
20 programming. We can do most of what we
21 want to do through regulation. We're
22 just usually a little hesitant from doing
23 this through Charter and enforcement of
24 law from the standpoint of doing a
25 Charter change.

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 We have a lot of different
3 preferences that we do provide to
4 different applicants. The vast majority
5 of them are done through regulation, and
6 we also have programs that we work with
7 with the School District and continue to
8 work with them, as does Workforce
9 Development and the Mayor's Office of
10 Education.

11 I did see the changes in the
12 ordinance that address some of actually
13 the concerns. There are some questions
14 around what the preference would be,
15 whether it would be a complete preference
16 or not. That has been identified and
17 also has been clarified.

18 We also had some concerns on
19 the broad nature of the preference, that
20 it would also apply -- and two of the
21 positions have also been addressed here
22 to the sort of police/fire recruits, that
23 we could have somebody coming out of a
24 program. So I see that that's also
25 addressed within the context of the

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 ordinance.

3 And also the reason -- I just
4 wanted to explain, the reason we had put
5 this to 24 years, it sort of aligns with
6 our eligible list lasting 24 years -- 24
7 months. 24 years would have been a very
8 good preference. 24 months.

9 So when we're looking at this,
10 I think the bottom line is, we are really
11 supportive of making things happen for
12 the high school students. The only
13 hesitation that we have is really doing
14 this through a Charter change as opposed
15 to developing programming and regulations
16 to sort of implement the same type of
17 thing.

18 MR. HACKNEY: Good afternoon,
19 members of City Council. Otis Hackney,
20 Chief Education Officer of the City of
21 Philadelphia in the Mayor's Office of
22 Education. I'm here to address Bill
23 200007 regarding a hiring preference for
24 all civil service positions for career
25 and technical (CTE) students of the

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 School District of Philadelphia.

3 While I agree with the spirit
4 of the bill, I have concerns regarding
5 how its current form may impact some
6 students that attend Philadelphia schools
7 that are not part of the School District.
8 Within our City, students attend
9 District, charter, and some private or
10 parochial schools that have programs of
11 study that are considered work-ready
12 pathways which could lead to employment
13 upon graduation and program-specific
14 certification. While the majority of
15 students attend District schools, many of
16 those who do not still live in the same
17 neighborhood as District students. No
18 one wants to see a newly graduated
19 student with credentials not afforded the
20 same opportunity as a District student
21 simply because of a choice made perhaps
22 not even of their own while in 8th grade
23 during the high school selection process.

24 As a former high school
25 principal with CTE programs, I know

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 firsthand the opportunities students have
3 before them and I'm aware of the barriers
4 that prevent them from transitioning into
5 careers with meaningful salaries. This
6 is a start of a great conversation, but
7 we need to consider all credentialed
8 students to cast a wider net to attract
9 talent to the City of Philadelphia as an
10 employer and to encourage more students
11 and caregivers to enroll into CTE
12 programs so they can graduate with
13 marketable skills. Let's work with all
14 stakeholders to educate them on the great
15 opportunities CTE education can provide;
16 namely, a pathway to career readiness
17 that does not exclude college as an
18 option.

19 Regarding the preference, I
20 know that there already exists some
21 opportunities for such students with the
22 City, but we must ensure the preferences
23 are industry specific. I want students
24 to follow their passion, but as an
25 employer, we, the City, want a workforce

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 that has the prerequisite credentials for
3 the positions of highest need for a
4 diverse workforce. Therefore, let's
5 continue to have this discussion to
6 identify the best policy which will have
7 the most impact and provide the City as
8 an employer the most flexibility to be
9 nimble as needs change.

10 As written, this bill might
11 create some winners and losers, but with
12 a couple of strategic changes, such as
13 including all CTE students and aligning
14 the preference with a field of study with
15 specific job opening, the bill can create
16 a win-win situation for all stakeholders.
17 The Administration has proposed an
18 amendment to this effect and requests
19 that we consider it or be adopted.

20 Thank you for allowing me time
21 to testify, and I'm happy to answer any
22 questions.

23 MS. ALI: Good afternoon, City
24 Councilmembers. Again, my name is
25 Zakiyyah Ali and I'm the Director of

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 Workforce Programs with the Office of
3 Workforce Development. So on behalf of
4 our office, I want to thank City
5 Council's Committee on Labor and Civil
6 Service for considering our perspective
7 on this important topic. We also commend
8 Councilwoman Gilmore Richardson for the
9 interest and urgency you've brought to
10 the issue of strengthening pathways from
11 the School District's CTE programs to
12 City employment. We believe the issues
13 raised in Bill 200007 have the potential
14 to inspire work directly tied to the
15 following critical important objectives
16 related to meeting the City's current and
17 projected talent shortages; addressing
18 equity issues related to gender and
19 racial diversity; and impacting poverty
20 by ensuring that Philadelphia residents
21 can compete for good jobs that the City
22 provides, specifically those that pay a
23 living wage, offer benefits, and are tied
24 to a career ladder.

25 From our perspective, to

2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

achieve these objectives requires more than just civil service preference points. It requires us working together across City departments and in close partnership with the District's Michelle Armstrong, Executive Director of CTE Education, and her team to strengthen the systems and processes to ensure District CTE programs and curriculums continually inform the City's current and projected talent needs.

It also requires that we ensure that District CTE students have the right combination of education, training, and on-the-job experiences to be eligible for civil service exams in their field of study, as well as receive the information and support needed to complete the civil service application process.

In short, we believe that while points on the civil service exam may indeed be helpful, we can more effectively connect CTE graduates to City employment through a dedicated and

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 sustained focus on strengthening the ways
3 that we work together on a regular basis.

4 Specifically, it is my pleasure
5 to lead the City of Philadelphia's first
6 ever municipal-focused workforce
7 development program titled City as Model
8 Employer. This groundbreaking initiative
9 was launched in Fiscal Year 2018 to
10 create viable pathways to permanent
11 employment for seasonal and temporary
12 City workers under/unemployed
13 Philadelphians. This initiative
14 addresses and works to eliminate the
15 unique barriers these populations face
16 when attempting to secure employment with
17 the City of Philadelphia as a
18 public-sector employer.

19 City as Model Employer does
20 three things: prepares program
21 participants to qualify for, attain, and
22 retain City and private-sector positions.
23 It provides job-specific technical
24 training and career readiness
25 instruction, and it facilitates job

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 placement to fill vacancies and connect
3 graduates to high-quality employment.

4 So through partnerships both
5 with the Office of Human Resources, the
6 Civil Service Commission, Mayor's Office
7 of Labor, the locals of District Council
8 33, we're able to harness the collective
9 efforts of these stakeholders to drive
10 transformational systems change that
11 create specialized employment and career
12 opportunities for our participants.

13 Additionally, City departments
14 also benefit in that they have access to
15 a direct pipeline of trained, qualified
16 candidates to fill their open vacancies
17 and make meaningful contributions as
18 public servants.

19 City as Model Employer
20 administers eight career pathways
21 programs. A few notable ones include the
22 Office of Fleet Management's
23 Automotive-Internship and Apprenticeship
24 Program, which has been in existence for
25 25 years, for over 25 years, and it

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 recruits solely from CTE high schools in
3 the Philadelphia School District.

4 The Water Department's
5 Internship-Apprenticeship Program focuses
6 directly on the skilled trades, and they
7 also recruit from CTE high schools.

8 We have the Streets
9 Department's Philly Future Track Program,
10 the hospitality Careers Program with the
11 Division of Aviation out at the
12 Philadelphia International Airport, and
13 the Department of Parks and Recreation's
14 Pathways Apprenticeship Program.

15 As of December 30th, 2019, 262
16 Philadelphians secured permanent
17 employment through City as Model Employer
18 and over 80 percent of them are still
19 employed. 95 percent of those placements
20 filled an open vacancy within one of the
21 participating departments. So by design,
22 City as Model Employer is structured to
23 eliminate barriers to meaningful
24 employment related to lack of training,
25 lack of access, and lack of opportunity.

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 We're committed to developing a
3 pipeline of Philadelphians to become
4 public servants that our City departments
5 and local communities need. In a time
6 when too many adult jobseekers lack the
7 requisite level of education and training
8 essential to attaining life-sustaining
9 employment that pays a living wage,
10 provides benefits, and offers
11 opportunities for career development and
12 advancement, structured and comprehensive
13 career pathway programs serve as a
14 practical solution to address this skills
15 gap and talent shortage. So programs
16 like City as Model Employer provide our
17 participants with opportunities to
18 develop those in-demand technical skills
19 and interpersonal skills, earn
20 industry-recognized credentials,
21 understand how best to compete for
22 well-paying jobs, learn how to adapt to
23 organizational cultures, succeed in the
24 workplace, and exceed employer
25 expectations.

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 Our program utilizes grant
3 funds and City resources to build an
4 operational infrastructure that allows us
5 to recruit, assess, select, and onboard
6 participants that are truly ready for
7 post-secondary training and education;
8 provide those participants with workplace
9 and career readiness instruction via a
10 curriculum focused on essential job
11 skills; and procure external technical
12 training and credentialing courseware to
13 make those participants more marketable
14 in today's competitive job environment;
15 and we also facilitate job placement into
16 public and private-sector positions by
17 training and assisting our participants
18 and graduates with submitting error-free
19 online job applications using
20 technology-based applicant tracking
21 systems.

22 It's important to note that for
23 the programs that we actively manage, our
24 participants receive personalized
25 resume-building support, appropriate

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 workplace and interview attire, and
3 professional development coaching. All
4 of these things prepare our graduates to
5 compete for quality jobs, excel in the
6 workplace, and advance along a career
7 pathway where they can earn higher wages
8 and compensation and become viewed as
9 valued assets by their employers.

10 The career pathways approach is
11 a proven workforce solution that assists
12 jobseekers who are not college bound.
13 Absent a structured career pathway or
14 workforce program, young jobseekers,
15 including recent high school graduates,
16 remain at a disadvantage as they navigate
17 the complexities of attaining and
18 retaining high-quality employment on
19 their own with little to no guidance or
20 support. Research shows that jobseekers
21 with post-secondary education and
22 training earn more income over their
23 lifetimes and experience lower than
24 average unemployment compared to those
25 with merely a high school diploma or

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 equivalency.

3 So City as Model Employer has
4 laid the foundation upon which the City
5 as a public-sector employer can build
6 upon to ensure we have a pipeline of
7 trained workers to fill our vacancies.
8 Presently the median age of City
9 employees is 45 years old. Accordingly,
10 it's critical that we have the resources
11 to increase our capacity to continue
12 preparing a workforce to fill positions
13 that will become vacant as those older
14 workers retire. We plan to strengthen
15 our partnership with the School District
16 so that recent graduates are able to
17 connect to our programs and receive the
18 necessary training to qualify for and
19 attain civil service employment.

20 In closing, we reiterate our
21 commitment to serving young adult
22 jobseekers from CTE and other
23 Philadelphia high schools by preparing
24 and connecting them to employment. We
25 applaud Councilwoman Gilmore Richardson

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007
2 for advancing the conversation around how
3 we can better support Philadelphia
4 students in this effort.

5 Thank you for the opportunity
6 to testify today, and we're happy to
7 answer any questions you may have.

8 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
9 you.

10 The Chair recognizes
11 Councilwoman Gilmore Richardson.

12 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON:
13 First, thank you all so much for your
14 testimony. I think philosophically and
15 from a values perspective, we do align
16 with the intended goal of what we're all
17 trying to accomplish. So I just wanted
18 to say thank you for that.

19 I just had a few quick
20 questions that I wanted to ask relative
21 to some of the questions and statements
22 you've made in your testimony.

23 So out of all of our City
24 employees, how many are currently
25 eligible to retire?

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 MR. ZACCAGNI: I don't have
3 that number with me at this moment. We
4 can certainly get that to you. When we
5 look at that, we can give you the number
6 that are eligible to retire as well as
7 the number that are currently in the DROP
8 program.

9 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Sure.
10 That will be great and most helpful as we
11 move forward.

12 The other question was relative
13 to the testimony of Mr. Hackney regarding
14 increasing the preference to all CTE
15 programs, not just School District of
16 Philadelphia programs but private,
17 parochial CTE programs. How many
18 additional students would that be? How
19 many programs? Because right now from
20 the District perspective, I think we have
21 like around 5,000 students total that are
22 in CTE programs, but as far as in 12th
23 grade and getting ready to graduate, it's
24 only around 1,500, I believe, and they'll
25 give us the number shortly.

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 MR. HACKNEY: I know Michelle
3 could -- she can give you probably more
4 accurate numbers.

5 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Sure.

6 MR. HACKNEY: That's why I was
7 very particular in terms of using the
8 language around program of study, being
9 very particular around CTE programs and
10 programs of study, because there are some
11 programs that lead to credentials that
12 would produce students who are ready to
13 go directly into the workforce.

14 So what I'm thinking about and
15 I guess when I led with the spirit of
16 what you're trying to do, totally
17 agreement, so thank you for that, but
18 making sure that as we look at the needs
19 of the City as an employer, that we're
20 not eliminating students who have made
21 choices to attend different types of
22 schools, but they still entered into some
23 type of credit-bearing, industry-ready
24 program.

25 So we can see if we can work

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 together with the District to see how
3 many students that would encompass, but I
4 would hate for students, as I said in my
5 testimony, that would live in the same
6 neighborhood or same block and because
7 they went to a different school and
8 they're in a program of study, they're
9 not eligible for that, and they would
10 have the same basic needs that any other
11 Philadelphia student would have.

12 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: How
13 many more students would that be, though?
14 How many more --

15 MR. HACKNEY: That I don't
16 know. I would have to see if I can get
17 back to you on that number to see exactly
18 what that would be.

19 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: And
20 then the other question relative to City
21 positions and aligning the actual program
22 with the positions, and that I do
23 understand, but we were able to pull
24 directly from the City's Office of Human
25 Resources' applicant portal some examples

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007
2 of jobs that would be open typically in
3 the City, and you see under the exam
4 announcement details and after the title
5 and the number, the specific departments,
6 the competitive nature of the program,
7 that there are also a set of minimum
8 requirements relative to training,
9 education, and experience.

10 So it is of my belief that even
11 if we have the preference for a young
12 person who is graduating from a CTE
13 program, they would still need to
14 actually be able to apply for the
15 position with all the minimum training,
16 education, and experience required to
17 apply for the position, correct?

18 MR. ZACCAGNI: Yes.

19 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: So
20 just because they receive the CTE
21 preference doesn't mean that they're
22 qualified for the position that they're
23 applying to, correct?

24 MR. ZACCAGNI: No. There are
25 certainly positions that have very

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 specific job requirements and there are
3 others that are more general. A couple
4 of them you've addressed already, as I
5 mentioned in my opening statement, with
6 Police and Fire from the standpoint of
7 that. There's probably some other ones
8 too, but that certainly would limit it
9 because there are some specific language
10 around it.

11 And the one thing I do want to
12 also add is, we're actually looking at
13 other positions where we can build in
14 language that better guarantees that
15 students coming out of the CTE programs
16 will qualify with the years of
17 experience -- or with the experience that
18 they have in the technical
19 certifications. So we're currently going
20 through those positions trying to align
21 that also from the standpoint of building
22 those pipelines, if you want to say.

23 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Sure.
24 So that would be something that can
25 happen, though, relative to your office

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007
2 working with Civil Service around
3 ensuring that the specs and the
4 experience needed for these positions
5 align with the curriculum available at
6 the School District, correct? That's
7 something that you all can do no matter
8 what happens with this legislation,
9 correct?

10 MR. ZACCAGNI: Yes. We can
11 certainly look at that, and that's part
12 of, I think, the position that we take
13 from the standpoint that a lot of this
14 can be done through programming, through
15 reevaluating where our job descriptions
16 are and really aligning it from those
17 pathways as opposed to basically a
18 Charter change. So there's a lot of
19 things that we can do to create better
20 opportunities, and I think that we can
21 also, from a workforce development
22 standpoint, guarantee that they'll be
23 more successful.

24 MS. ALI: And if I could add
25 again -- Zakiyyah Ali.

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 If I could add again that our
3 pathway programs, in addition to
4 providing the technical training, also
5 provide the on-the-job work experience
6 that's required to qualify for those
7 positions. So it's a combination both of
8 what an individual can learn in the
9 classroom, the credentials they can
10 attain, and then having the experience of
11 learning and doing the work under senior
12 professionals and supervisors. So that's
13 what the pathway programs provide that
14 sometimes the career and technical
15 education programs can't, which is the
16 on-the-job, hands-on work experience.

17 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: And
18 that program, though, was that created
19 under this Administration or is that
20 program going to go on forever in City
21 government?

22 MS. ALI: You mean City as
23 Model Employer?

24 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Yes.

25 MS. ALI: So City as Model

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 Employer was created under this current
3 Administration specifically by design to
4 set us up both as the hiring employer and
5 the workforce development provider. So
6 we serve both entities. In our office we
7 view those jobseekers as well as the City
8 departments as our client. So we're
9 trying to make both ends happen. So we
10 hope that the Office of Workforce
11 Development does become a permanent
12 department so that this work can continue
13 on beyond the present Administration.

14 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Which
15 is the reason why we suggested a Charter
16 change for the CTE preference, so that it
17 can continue beyond this Administration.

18 Mr. Zaccagni, relative to the
19 list of vacancies that could be aligned
20 to the CTE programs, under trade, there
21 was other and various, which totaled 28
22 positions. What are they? Could you
23 just detail those positions more? They
24 account for 28 out of the 204 total open
25 positions. Do you know what titles --

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 MR. ZACCAGNI: So we have
3 various trades, and even our trades
4 helper classes have specialties that
5 revolve around carpentry, electrician,
6 those sort of things. So if you want
7 that broken down specifically, I can
8 certainly get that to you.

9 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: But,
10 no. I think it just speaks to the fact
11 that your office, working with Civil
12 Service, would be able to determine how
13 we do the alignment, that we should not
14 entertain the amendment that was
15 presented at 10 o'clock this morning if
16 it's hard for us even in this trade list
17 of open positions to determine where
18 those positions should be aligned to
19 relative to the CTE program.

20 MR. ZACCAGNI: So --

21 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Do
22 you understand what I'm saying?

23 MR. ZACCAGNI: I think one of
24 our concerns is if the preference is for
25 all CTE students coming out. So you

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 could have an administrative or clerical
3 position and someone would get that
4 preference no matter what CTE program
5 that they would come out of. It may not
6 be aligned with those skill sets, but
7 they would still by, as I understand, if
8 I'm misunderstanding the ordinance, as I
9 understand the ordinance, they would
10 still get that preference.

11 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Yes,
12 but also they would still have to meet
13 the minimum training, education, and
14 experience required to apply for the
15 position.

16 MR. ZACCAGNI: To apply for the
17 position.

18 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: So
19 for instance, I have two different ones
20 here. Heavy equipment operator 1, which
21 is crane. The other one is surveyor 1.
22 It details in the training requirements
23 that the person would need to have,
24 whoever it is, one year of experience in
25 the class of equipment operator 2 or

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007
2 comparable city class or two years of
3 experience in the class of equipment
4 operator and/or for the surveyor position
5 to have education equivalent to the
6 completion of 12th grade and two years of
7 surveying experience and two years of
8 surveying experience which must have been
9 in the operation of an instrument.

10 MR. ZACCAGNI: They're not --

11 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: But
12 you understand what I'm saying?

13 MR. ZACCAGNI: Yes, but they're
14 not entry-level classes.

15 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Sure.

16 MR. ZACCAGNI: So they're
17 classes that are the next step beyond.
18 So they would not even sort of apply for
19 this program, because they are not
20 entry-level positions. They are
21 promotional positions within the City.

22 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Sure,
23 but currently only about 25 percent of
24 the level positions are entry or
25 trainees. It's 46 out of 204. So we're

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 not even talking about a large pool of
3 specific jobs, correct?

4 MR. ZACCAGNI: No. The
5 entry-level positions are obviously less
6 than all of the positions within the
7 City, but they are significant. For
8 example, with the office clerk or the
9 clerk 1, which is what we used to call
10 it, we've hired probably well over 150
11 applicants over the last several years
12 from the standpoint of that, and what we
13 will be doing is giving preference to no
14 matter what area you come out of in the
15 CTE programs, you'll be getting that
16 extra five points, whether it aligns with
17 your experience, as long as that position
18 is general enough from the standpoint of
19 the requirements. The couple positions
20 that you, as I had mentioned, highlighted
21 are positions that have experience
22 requirements to them. So equipment
23 operator crane, all of those would be
24 promotional opportunities from internal
25 within the City.

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 I can't remember a time where
3 we ever actually hired one of those
4 positions external to the City, a lot of
5 them within Streets Department, Water
6 Department, so forth. So what we're
7 looking at is entry-level positions that
8 may have a general enough
9 classification -- and as I said earlier,
10 two of those you've addressed with the
11 police recruit and the firefighter, that
12 this would have given those preferences
13 to those.

14 We probably still have a couple
15 other positions like that. I understand
16 your position that it's not a tremendous
17 amount, but what we're really trying to
18 do here is align the skill sets coming
19 out of the programs with the positions
20 just to make sure that they align. So if
21 we're able to look at that -- and that
22 was part of the thought behind why we
23 were looking at doing some type of
24 amendment there. If we are able to align
25 them more closely, from an employer's

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 standpoint we get somebody whose skill
3 sets align more closely with the
4 positions that we want. And making those
5 changes within the class specifications,
6 we can certainly do that.

7 That's part of the reason why I
8 think a lot of what we're talking about
9 here, we can certainly do by expanding
10 programming, either in Workforce
11 Development, expanding programming within
12 the Office of Human Resources or even
13 looking at the job specifications and
14 changing them, as we're trying to do with
15 positions such as trades helper and so
16 forth, so that they are giving credit
17 basically to students coming out of the
18 different programs.

19 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: But
20 we agree, though, that this is something
21 that your office can do?

22 MR. ZACCAGNI: I'd have to look
23 more closely at a couple of the specs. I
24 think for most of them, we probably
25 could, but I would have to look more

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 closely at a couple of the very general
3 specifications to make sure we could do
4 that.

5 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Okay.

6 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The Chair
7 recognizes Councilman Green.

8 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Yes. Thank
9 you, Madam Chair.

10 I just had some questions in
11 reference to your testimony from
12 Mr. Hackney as well as our Interim HR
13 Director. You made reference to an
14 amendment, which has not been provided,
15 but I wanted to get a sense of some of
16 the items on what you proposed as an
17 alternative. Because you stated there
18 were a number of issues and concerns you
19 had in reference to the legislation even
20 as amended by Councilmember Gilmore
21 Richardson, but I wanted to get a sense
22 of what are you talking about.

23 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Excuse
24 me. Point of information.

25 The Chair recognizes

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 Councilwoman Gilmore Richardson.

3 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: To
4 clarify, the amendments that we received
5 at 10:00 a.m. this morning was relative
6 to the Administration asking us to
7 further amend the legislation from three
8 years down to two and for us to try to
9 align the positions with the job
10 classifications. That's something that
11 can be done administratively. They don't
12 need an amendment to do that, and that's
13 what I asked Mr. Zaccagni just now. They
14 don't need an amendment to do that. If
15 that was something we wanted to do
16 relative to workforce development, we
17 could have done that last year.

18 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The Chair
19 recognizes Councilman Green.

20 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Just to
21 follow up. Can you answer the
22 Councilmember's questions?

23 MR. ZACCAGNI: Excuse me. I'm
24 sorry.

25 COUNCILMAN GREEN: I just want

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 to get a sense of -- Councilwoman Gilmore
3 Richardson kind of asked those questions
4 in a colloquy. I just wanted to follow
5 up in reference to what was the basis of
6 36 months in her legislation versus your
7 proposal of 24 months?

8 MR. ZACCAGNI: We were trying
9 to align it with what the normal eligible
10 list would expire after. So our eligible
11 lists expire after, at the most, 24
12 months. So that was our thought process.

13 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Are all of
14 your eligible lists 24 months?

15 MR. ZACCAGNI: Our eligible
16 lists by Charter can expire anywhere
17 between 12 and 24 months. So none can
18 last more than 24 months. They can
19 expire before then or they can be
20 exhausted, as many, especially in the
21 trades classes, do. Our trades positions
22 very seldom exist very long because we
23 usually run through those positions. We
24 pretty much appoint everyone who is on
25 the trades class position during that

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 life of that list, if not shorter, and
3 it's usually shorter.

4 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Also I
5 wanted to follow up, Mr. Hackney, in your
6 testimony, you talked about winners and
7 losers. Can you give me better context
8 what you mean by that.

9 MR. HACKNEY: That was just to
10 address students, like I said, who may
11 not attend a School District -- as it's
12 written, it states the School District of
13 Philadelphia CTE program. So that way
14 that students who don't attend a School
15 District of Philadelphia school but are
16 in a CTE program, that they are not
17 excluded from that, because you do have
18 like a particular charter school that is
19 technically not part of the School
20 District that has a CTE program and they
21 would not qualify for this preference.
22 And so those would be students that could
23 live in similar neighborhoods where they
24 would not get the preference, and that's
25 what I'm saying in terms of the winners

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 and losers.

3 COUNCILMAN GREEN: So you're
4 saying that those people who went to a
5 non-School District school that went to a
6 CTE program should get a preference?

7 MR. HACKNEY: What I'm saying,
8 that they should get a preference?

9 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Right.

10 MR. HACKNEY: They should be
11 considered the same way as any high
12 school graduate with -- either coming out
13 of a CTE program and industry credential,
14 yes.

15 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you,
16 Madam Chair.

17 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Just for
18 the record, the Chair wants to note to my
19 left the arrival of members Councilwoman
20 Helen Gym, Vice Chair of Labor and Civil
21 Service Committee Brian O'Neill, and to
22 my right, Councilwoman Quinones-Sanchez,
23 and I want to recognize her now.

24 Councilwoman Sanchez.

25 COUNCILWOMAN SANCHEZ: Thank

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 you.

3 So I think these are all
4 important conversations to have. I think
5 this Administration, particularly as the
6 budget documents have evolved, there's
7 been a real commitment to really look at
8 hiring and getting the City workforce to
9 better reflect not only the City
10 demographics, but really
11 Philadelphia-based folks and create a
12 pipeline.

13 So I think that this
14 conversation has been going on for quite
15 a bit of time, at least the 12 years I've
16 been here, but this Administration
17 through FastTrack and other programs have
18 tried to create that.

19 To the Councilwoman's point,
20 one of the things that we've learned from
21 the studies that have been done by Nolan
22 Atkinson both on the exempt side and the
23 non-exempt employees, that despite all of
24 the efforts, we're nowhere close to where
25 we need to be, right, demographically,

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 inclusion, like by every statistical
3 data. Because we're sitting here talking
4 about all the things we can't do, right?
5 Again, creating obstacles. And I think
6 as I was talking to the HR Director last
7 week, there's a lot of reform that your
8 office could evolve to doing. The
9 question for this here is, what of this
10 law limits your ability, as you're
11 developing and promulgating regulations
12 and application, does this legislation
13 limit you to do so that you can do
14 exactly what you're talking about around
15 the alignment? What of this bill does
16 not allow you to align?

17 MR. ZACCAGNI: It's an
18 excellent question. It's one that I've
19 actually wrestled with from the
20 standpoint of the position that I'm
21 taking on this, and the only thing I can
22 say is that I've been around quite a
23 while and one of the things that we get
24 beat up about is the fact that we're not
25 flexible enough, and part of that is

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 within regulation. Quite frankly, very
3 little of it is within Charter. There is
4 not a lot within the Charter that limits
5 things that we can do. I think that part
6 of what our limitations are has been
7 historically is, we view some of the
8 regulations that we have --

9 COUNCILWOMAN SANCHEZ: Your
10 regulations that you write or don't
11 rewrite or don't update.

12 MR. ZACCAGNI: When I say "our
13 regulations," I'm saying the City's
14 regulations.

15 COUNCILWOMAN SANCHEZ: Right.

16 MR. ZACCAGNI: As a city, that
17 we view our regulations sometimes as set
18 in stone.

19 My hesitation is because that's
20 the perspective I have, is that we have
21 to be more flexible, that anything that
22 we build today, we want to be agile to be
23 able to change it tomorrow, because I
24 don't know what's coming tomorrow.

25 We talked last meeting about

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 the fact that there's many businesses and
3 organizations starting to move away from
4 requiring college degrees for mid- and
5 upper-level managers. Who would have
6 thought that 10 or 15 years ago? I
7 certainly wouldn't have, because I was
8 pushing my children to go to college and
9 get a degree, pushing my children to go
10 get their Master's Degree. And then
11 finally my children pushed back and said,
12 why? Nobody is looking for it.

13 So that's really my hesitation.
14 I truly believe that building programs
15 that will get the youth in from the high
16 schools is the best way of doing it.
17 Doing regulations that next year, two
18 years from now that we can actually
19 change and have flexibility with is the
20 best way of doing it.

21 We can have an honest
22 disagreement about that, but that's truly
23 what I believe. But it's an excellent
24 question, Councilwoman, as to what --

25 COUNCILWOMAN SANCHEZ: I guess

2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

that's the point. I think the Councilwoman put forth something that addresses the conversation that's been going on for 12 years, as long as I've been in Council, and then more specifically under this Administration that really have tried to move to create pipelines to City employment. My frustration is the fact that you don't want to embrace this as opposed to using this to say, we got to go back and we got to align what the Councilwoman is proposing so that we meet the goals that the numbers say to us yearly we don't meet around pipelines, diversity, and offering opportunities to Philadelphia citizens.

So I think this is a semantic issue. I know part of it is an optic issue. I think the Councilwoman is saying create this process. You have all of the regulatory powers to redesign every single job description without coming to this body, going to your Civil

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 Service Commission folks, and work
3 through the collective bargaining
4 agreements that exist and others and
5 implement something. That's what she's
6 saying here. There is nothing here that
7 ties your hand other than her saying this
8 has to be prioritized, come back to us
9 and tell us how you're going to do it.

10 So I feel like we're getting
11 caught up in a bunch of stuff that
12 everybody agrees on the spirit, everybody
13 agrees on the intent, everybody
14 understands the need, because the numbers
15 speak for numbers. I mean, no one can
16 sit in this room and say we're inclusive
17 at all, right? I think there's a lot of
18 goodwill.

19 So it's really complicated,
20 because there's nothing in this bill that
21 prohibits you from doing your job and
22 coming back and giving us something that
23 is more seamless and that reaches the
24 spirit of it. So unless you guys can
25 give me this, I think we're just talking

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 around in semantic and circles.

3 I think what the Councilwoman
4 is proposing allows the HR and Civil
5 Service Commission to work to come up
6 with job descriptions that better reflect
7 this intent. Unless you show me
8 something in this bill, outside of the
9 Charter change -- we're not talking about
10 the Charter change. We're talking about
11 the bill. There's nothing in this bill
12 that limits your job.

13 MR. ZACCAGNI: No. Giving
14 someone a preference certainly doesn't,
15 and we have preferences for other types
16 of positions. The one thing I do want to
17 emphasize, I don't want to give the
18 impression that we're not doing things.
19 I mentioned about trades helper. The
20 team is working right now and has been
21 working with the School District to
22 reevaluate -- not reevaluate; to actually
23 just change the specification for trades
24 helper so that it better reflects the
25 students coming out of CTE programs.

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 We are doing things, and I'm
3 sure when we are back here in a few
4 weeks, we'll have more of that to share
5 with you as to what we're doing and what
6 we're trying to accomplish.

7 COUNCILWOMAN SANCHEZ: I think
8 what you see is a sense of this is slow,
9 way too slow. Last session there might
10 have been a dozen bills related to this.
11 I think our Chairwoman had something
12 around the Rule of Two and other things.
13 I think there is a sentiment that what
14 we're doing is not enough.

15 This is a priority, and I would
16 hope that you would be willing to work
17 with the bill sponsor around how you use
18 this bill to open up those discussions
19 and everything, but you can't tell us one
20 job description at a time. We will be
21 here until 2050 trying to get this done.

22 SEPTA has a good program that
23 works. FastTrack worked. We have some
24 stuff going on at the Water Department.

25 So this is about doing that and

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 that and that and that and that and this
3 in a way that moves this forward.

4 So, again, I know that this
5 conversation will keep going. Unless you
6 can tell me there's something here that
7 limits your ability to do your job, I
8 think we should just move forward.

9 Thank you, Madam Chair.

10 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
11 you.

12 Let me just also note for the
13 record that I appreciate HR noting for
14 the record that in no way, shape or form
15 would this legislation sort of tie your
16 hands relative to working with our Office
17 of Workforce Development, the School
18 District, and/or any other entity to
19 address many of these issues, but I
20 particularly just want to note for the
21 benefit of those people who are watching
22 at home and even sitting here in this
23 chamber, Zakiyyah, in your testimony the
24 first ever municipal-focused workforce
25 development program titled City as Model

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 Employer, it is groundbreaking. I was
3 happy when it occurred. I commended the
4 Administration and was actually really
5 pleased that Philadelphia was out front
6 when you compared us to the other big ten
7 cities across the nation relative to this
8 issue.

9 When I think of Councilwoman
10 Gilmore Richardson's legislative focus
11 here, our challenge is, it's not about
12 what this Administration is proposing
13 relative to rules and regs and/or
14 partnerships or interdepartmental
15 cooperation. The challenge is what
16 happens when the next leader is elected
17 in this city and they decide that City as
18 Model Employer is not something that they
19 want to do and they want to go into
20 another direction? And I'm not asking
21 for you to comment. I'm just telling you
22 when I think -- when you talk about the
23 spirit and intent of her legislation,
24 that is what we have to contend with.
25 What happens when this Administration is

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 no longer here?

3 So we're just talking about a
4 level of consistency and
5 institutionalizing what it is that is
6 being proposed, and to me, for the
7 record, in no way, shape or form not
8 attempting to say that this
9 Administration -- no one cannot say. I
10 mean, you just laid out very thoroughly
11 from Fleet to the Water Department,
12 Future Track, I know I've been talking
13 with the Streets Department about that,
14 the hospitality program over at the
15 airport, and the Parks and Recs pathways
16 program. So there's no one who can say
17 that we don't have a track record. The
18 issue is how do we find a way to
19 institutionalize the vehicle to get
20 there.

21 MS. ALI: Great. Thank you so
22 much for that question. One of the ways
23 that we institutionalized City as Model
24 Employer not just for this Administration
25 but for Administrations to come is by

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 working proactively with the Office of
3 Human Resources, the Civil Service
4 Commission, and the local of DC33 to
5 change the specifications that require
6 completion of the program to qualify for
7 the exam. That way, whether it's the CTE
8 high school graduate or anyone else that
9 comes through our program does not have
10 to on their own try to figure out how to
11 get the training, experience, and
12 education to qualify. The programs
13 provide that. So it's written into the
14 spec. So even if another administration
15 comes on, it's still required that that
16 programming happens through the Office of
17 Workforce Development. So that's one of
18 our ways of putting that into regulations
19 that are not going to change.

20 So we need to keep the office
21 in one way or another, because those
22 programs and those titles are predicated
23 on it being there providing that
24 pipeline.

25 The great work that we've done

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 under the leadership of Sheila Ireland,
3 we feel confident that we'll be able to
4 prove our meaningfulness, even if the
5 Department's name changes or anything
6 else. Our work is vital. We can't stop
7 working, because we have a poverty rate
8 in the City that is way too high, and one
9 of the key ways of bringing that down is
10 connecting people to high-quality jobs.

11 So we have worked to
12 institutionalize it and it's written into
13 those specs that have been changed under
14 this program.

15 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: And I
16 want to thank you for your response. The
17 only thing that I will ask people
18 watching at home and in this Chamber to
19 think about, if you don't think it is
20 possible in government, no matter how
21 much we've institutionalized something, I
22 just ask that you pay attention to
23 Washington, DC and look at everything
24 that I think our last chief executive
25 thought that he was institutionalizing in

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 the federal government and how much of
3 that work has been done through different
4 vehicles. And immediately for me,
5 Councilman Green, from a consumer
6 protection perspective, I think of the
7 CFPB and all of the rules that they have
8 pulled back. I mean, we were working on
9 retirement security. We had predatory
10 lending rulings that they had come up
11 with. And all of that great work through
12 the executive has just been rolled back,
13 because they have the power to put folks
14 in place who don't share the same values.

15 So I just want to -- I'm not
16 asking for you to comment on that. I
17 just want you to know the manner in which
18 we're thinking, those are the kinds of
19 things that we have to think about.

20 The Chair recognizes Councilman
21 Domb and then Councilman Green, in that
22 order.

23 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Thank you,
24 Madam Chairwoman.

25 I just have a question, I

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 guess, for Mr. Zaccagni. Right now for a
3 civil service job, if someone applies
4 today, what's the timeframe for them to
5 be hired?

6 MR. ZACCAGNI: It really varies
7 by the job. I know what you're referring
8 to from the conversations last year
9 around the Pew report. We're working on
10 that and have been working on that,
11 trying to get those positions down. I've
12 asked my staff actually to do an analysis
13 so that when we come, we can talk about
14 what that looks like for a number of the
15 positions, because we have to be able to
16 explain and also to demonstrate that it's
17 not 365 days on average. And it's not.
18 So what we're looking at is how do we
19 improve that time. We've been doing some
20 things around that, but it really does --
21 it depends on what you're looking at and
22 it depends on the position.

23 For example, we established the
24 labor list, I believe, in three to four
25 weeks from the time that that position

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 closed to the position's list got
3 established. Now, that doesn't require
4 an examination process, but there's a lot
5 of applications that we have to go
6 through. Sometimes it's not always able
7 to do everything with our applicant
8 tracking system.

9 Our rec leader trainee I think
10 we did in about two and a half to three
11 months. So what we're trying to do is
12 these pilot programs and really then
13 institutionalize that across the process.

14 So it's something that is a
15 major focus for us within City government
16 to make sure that we're getting that to a
17 point that is reasonable for City
18 government, because it's sort of a
19 bifurcated system. We have to do
20 something in the Office of Human
21 Resources and then the departments also
22 have to go through an interviewing
23 process. So it's sort of like two
24 processes in one from that standpoint.

25 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Because most

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 people could not go through the process
3 and not have a job for that amount of
4 time. So we're eliminating a tremendous
5 amount of people for these jobs. I
6 applaud you for trying to get that down,
7 but if we can get it down to two to four
8 weeks, that would be ideal, because I
9 don't think people can wait that kind of
10 length of time for employment.

11 MR. ZACCAGNI: We can talk more
12 about that, and I'd like to talk offline
13 to really go into some detail as to why
14 some of that for a governmental agency
15 would be extremely difficult to do. So
16 we can certainly have those
17 conversations.

18 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Okay. Thank
19 you. Thank you very much.

20 Thank you, Madam Chair.

21 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The Chair
22 recognizes Councilman Green.

23 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you,
24 Madam Chair.

25 I just wanted to follow up,

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 because I'm listening to the conversation
3 and this tension between -- some
4 traditional tension between the executive
5 and legislative branch between putting
6 things into the Charter and Code whereas
7 doing things by regulation. And, Mr.
8 Zaccagni, you made some statements in
9 your testimony earlier about the need for
10 flexibility, and I'm trying to get a
11 sense -- and you also made reference to
12 children going to college or also now
13 going to training programs and career
14 technical experiences, and from my
15 experience in a number of different
16 capacities but more principally as the
17 Labor Chair for Democratic Municipal
18 Officials, I visited 17 different
19 apprentice training facilities around the
20 greater Philadelphia region, and many of
21 them are seeing college graduates come as
22 apprentices at 26, 27, 28, because they
23 went to college and could not find a job.

24 So I'm trying to get an
25 understanding of how this legislation

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 would make things not flexible. I'm
3 trying to get that sense, because I don't
4 see how the legislation inhibits the
5 flexibility that you've been trying to
6 implement in your position.

7 MR. ZACCAGNI: As I said to the
8 Councilwoman, it's a really good question
9 and I have wrestled with this, and I
10 don't have the perfect answer for you.
11 My perception is, I guess, biased to some
12 extent about the few things that we do
13 have in the Charter. I think someone
14 mentioned about the Rule of Two, that
15 once something is in the Charter, it does
16 become much more difficult to make a
17 change. An ordinance can change more
18 easily. A regulation, even more easily.
19 So when we're looking at that and that's
20 from my perspective, is that when we --
21 and I've been here a long time and we've
22 worked with the Rule of Two for just as
23 long as I've been here and it pre-dates
24 me, which not much pre-dates me
25 unfortunately, but that's where I think

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 that my perspective comes in, is that
3 when we put this into a charter, I may
4 not be able to anticipate what change I
5 would need today, but if I go down the
6 road two, three or four years and
7 something comes up, now you go back and
8 change it in the Charter as opposed to
9 some other more flexible change that I
10 can make within the context of a charter.

11 I'm looking at it through the
12 lens of HR. There's very few
13 organizations -- and we're unique. We're
14 not like other organizations, even though
15 we want to align with some of the best
16 practices. I understand that. But
17 there's not a lot of organizations that
18 have things set into law where they can't
19 make changes if need be as industry
20 changes. That's where I am.

21 I don't have a perfect answer
22 for you, Councilman, but that's my
23 perspective.

24 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Right. But
25 the Charter question is more asking

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 whether that preference should be given
3 versus this legislation, which is in the
4 Code, that gives what that amount should
5 be, which we amend things in the Code all
6 the time. So are you saying that the
7 fact that we're amending the Charter
8 saying that a preference should be given
9 to CTE graduates causes some future
10 inflexibility?

11 MR. ZACCAGNI: Yes. It could.
12 I mean, if you put it into the Charter,
13 it's a much more different process to go
14 through as opposed to an ordinance or in
15 the Code, which you can change more
16 easily, or from my perspective, within
17 regulation that you can certainly change.

18 But I also understand the
19 concerns from the legislative
20 perspective, that one of the reasons that
21 we want to do this is someone comes along
22 and says, hey, we don't want to do this
23 and we're just going to make a change
24 here. So it's a balance between the two.

25 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay.

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 MR. ZACCAGNI: I'm not going to
3 try to pretend that I have the perfect
4 answer on that.

5 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay.

6 Thank you, Madam Chair.

7 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Are there
8 any questions or comments from members of
9 the Committee for these witnesses?

10 (No response.)

11 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you
12 all so very much for your testimony
13 today.

14 Will the Clerk please call the
15 second panel of witnesses to testify.

16 THE CLERK: Marie
17 Wilkins-Walker and Naderia Johns.

18 (Witnesses approached witness
19 table.)

20 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Good
21 afternoon. Thank you all so very much
22 for being here. Please feel free to
23 state your name for the record and
24 proceed with your testimony. You can
25 read it and/or summarize it, whatever is

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 convenient.

3 MS. WILKINS-WALKER: Good
4 afternoon. Marie Wilkins-Walker, CTE
5 instructor, School District of
6 Philadelphia.

7 MISS JOHNS: Naderia Johns.

8 MS. WILKINS-WALKER: It is with
9 great honor that I present to the Mayor,
10 City Council, and our great citizens of
11 Philadelphia a snapshot of the added pre
12 and post educational benefits of this
13 powerful legislation. The timing could
14 not be greater, as February is CTE Month.

15 The legislation has the ability
16 to impact CTE students on social and
17 economical platforms and is a powerful
18 leverage for parents looking for the best
19 educational and successful options for
20 their students. This legislation mirrors
21 the articulation agreements where
22 students receive college credits for
23 completion of CTE programs of study,
24 SOAR, Students Occupationally and
25 Academically Ready. These agreements

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 vary across the state, but impact CTE
3 students in a positive, value-added
4 method, reminding students of how
5 valuable industry and 21st century skills
6 are to the individual and our society.

7 Students in CTE programs across
8 the City understand the value of this
9 industry-level training and skills they
10 learn over a three-year program
11 commitment. Having the opportunity to
12 receive bonus points added to a civil
13 service exam score will encourage CTE
14 students to stay in Philadelphia after
15 high school and build our workforce
16 capacity.

17 It has been my experience over
18 my teaching career under the CTE umbrella
19 that Philadelphia students overall need
20 the opportunity to demonstrate their
21 greatness and passion. When these
22 opportunities exist, our students grow
23 socially and academically.

24 CTE programs build skilled
25 leaders that are college and career

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 ready. We as educators understand that
3 educated students have choices. This
4 legislation brings an additional
5 opportunity to earn a life-sustaining
6 wage to our students, opening doors to
7 career options and growth within our City
8 of Brotherly Love and Sisterly Affection.

9 The School District of
10 Philadelphia currently has approximately
11 5,200 CTE students enrolled in 113 CTE
12 programs of study, over ten of the 16
13 national career clusters. Our CTE
14 students receive over 1,080 hours of
15 training. The data reveals that CTE
16 students graduate on time and ready for
17 college and career.

18 The CTE programs provide
19 industry-driven real-world experience for
20 all participants. My student will give
21 you some example of that.

22 As I leave you with this
23 powerful data point, the U.S. Department
24 of Education states, Eight years after
25 their expected graduation date, students

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007
2 who focused on career and technical
3 education courses while in high school
4 had higher median annual earnings than
5 students who did not focus on CTE.

6 Please allow this legislation
7 to be the springboard for our future CTE
8 workforce and our commitment to the
9 students educated in the City of
10 Philadelphia.

11 Thank you for your time and
12 attention.

13 MISS JOHNS: My name is Naderia
14 Johns and I am a current senior at West
15 Philadelphia High School, AP student, and
16 Speed Girl. Yes, I am an athlete too.
17 I've been in my school's CTE program
18 since 10th grade. After being in this
19 program for three years, I recognize the
20 invaluable skills and opportunities that
21 I have gained due to this program. For
22 this reason, I feel compelled to inform
23 you of the many aspects of CTE programs
24 that makes it worthwhile for students at
25 West in hopes that you will seek just and

2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

equitable legislation for our future
workforce and students completing CTE
programs across the City.

Listed below are examples of
skills and opportunities that I have
gained since being a part of the career
and technical education program. In this
program I gained leadership skills by
being the project manager of Chromebook's
Battery Replacement. I was able to teach
other students how to replace batteries
and use different tools.

We have a class called the
MakerSpace, and in this class we are able
to participate in different STEM
activities.

CTE provides a social
economical boost for students and it
would build a skilled workforce of the
City of Philadelphia.

I was able to observe students
from my school competing in competitions
against students from all over in the
STEM industry at SkillsUSA conference in

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 Hershey, PA.

3 In 11th grade, we had a project
4 called Genius Hour where as though we had
5 a choice to do something on the career
6 interest of something we learned in
7 class. Mine was on cyber security. I
8 actually took an online class on this
9 because of my career interest in being an
10 FBI agent.

11 In my CTE program, we are able
12 to earn up to 13 college credits as
13 completers and we leave with an industry
14 certification.

15 I am currently interning at
16 Drexel University with Dr. Kareem Edouard
17 in the CSEA STEM Lab.

18 I will graduate college and
19 career ready.

20 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Naderia,
21 I'm biased. I'm biased. I'm biased.

22 Ms. Wilkins-Walker, I remember
23 doing our first hearing and now I
24 listened to you. I just want to say
25 thank you for your leadership and what

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 you do for our great City of Philadelphia
3 and CTE.

4 And, Naderia, you know, you get
5 us a little giddy, because we start
6 thinking about all the industries where
7 girls are represented in CTE, right? You
8 mentioned STEM in your testimony. I
9 think of the automotive industry. I
10 think of all the general trades. And you
11 give us hope that we're going to keep
12 hope alive. So thank you so very much.

13 And the Chair recognizes
14 Councilwoman Gym.

15 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: I also just
16 wanted to express my thanks to Ms.
17 Wilkins-Walker for your tremendous work,
18 especially in the area that you are in
19 for CTE. I've had the chance to visit a
20 number of the programs across the
21 District, and when we go into the schools
22 where they've actually been modernized
23 and developed with the work of our
24 tremendous CTE School District
25 Director -- thank you so much, we

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 appreciate you as well -- they're
3 extraordinary places. Dobbins computer
4 programs and graphic design programs are
5 cutting edge, and they remind us of
6 what's really -- not even as much as
7 what's possible. It's what our students
8 actually deserve and what this country
9 needs.

10 We are in desperate need to
11 show our young people that this is more
12 than just exposure. They need that
13 pipeline into opportunity. So it's one
14 thing to have state-of-the-art programs
15 in our schools and then to pretend that
16 when they graduate or anything, the door
17 suddenly closes. That door should
18 continue to open for young people. And
19 in part, I want to thank my Council
20 sponsor for thinking about how the door
21 continues to open for young people.

22 And I also want to say,
23 Naderia, it is such a pleasure to listen
24 to you and to hear from you on a personal
25 level how much it means to be at West. I

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 visited your school many times. We gave
3 you a brand new building, and we want to
4 give you the best, and you're certainly
5 the reason why we did it. So thank you
6 for being here --

7 MISS JOHNS: Thank you.

8 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: -- and
9 testifying and taking the time out of the
10 day, because it really makes a
11 difference.

12 MISS JOHNS: Thank you.

13 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The Chair
14 recognizes Councilwoman Gilmore
15 Richardson.

16 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Thank
17 you, Madam Chair.

18 I just wanted to echo the
19 sentiments of my colleague and say thank
20 you, Naderia, for coming to City Council.
21 My first experience with City Council was
22 while I was in high school. So to have
23 you here and to see you in this building
24 and know that your future is so bright,
25 it's just truly encouraging for all of

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 us. So thank you so much and for your
3 work. Thank you.

4 MS. WILKINS-WALKER: Thank you.

5 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER:

6 Councilwoman Gilmore Richardson, we have
7 flashbacks watching her, right? Yeah.

8 Because we don't know where
9 you're going to come back, you know, ten
10 years from now.

11 Are there any more questions or
12 comments from members of the Committee
13 for these witnesses?

14 (No response.)

15 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Hearing
16 none, thank you so very much for your
17 testimony.

18 We do, I just want to note for
19 the record, have written testimony that
20 we will provide to the stenographer, one
21 from Jonathan Jacobs, the Career
22 Awareness Specialist for the School
23 District of Philadelphia, and a letter
24 that was referenced by the sponsor
25 earlier from Cathy Scott, who is the

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 President of the American Federation of
3 State, County and Municipal Employees and
4 District Council 47.

5 Is there anyone else here to
6 testify on Bill No. 200007?

7 Yes. Would you please all come
8 up and sit at the table and state your
9 name for the record and proceed with your
10 testimony. I will say to you what we've
11 said to both of the other panels in the
12 spirit of our veteran member, Councilman
13 Brian O'Neill, that you can feel free to
14 summarize your testimony, but you also
15 can read it if you desire. Thank you.

16 (Witnesses approached witness
17 table.)

18 MR. EASTMAN: I got to go
19 first. Good afternoon. My name is Joe
20 Eastman. I'm a retired Navy officer, and
21 I'd just like to say that young lady,
22 that would be somebody we'd love to get
23 in the military with her credentials.
24 I'll be honest with you.

25 The military I joined back in

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 1971, if you had a strong back, you could
3 survive, have a good career. Our military
4 today is so technical, we need people
5 like that as well. So I commend her, and
6 keep at it. Keep at it. Don't let
7 anybody tell you you can't do something.

8 Real quickly, I've got to kind
9 of say something about something I heard
10 twice in kind of various forms today
11 about -- I think it happened along the
12 lines of veterans maybe not applying for
13 some of the positions that are open. I
14 told Councilwoman Gilmore this today. I
15 retired from the military in 1996,
16 finished up my degree and went to work
17 for an organization many of you may know,
18 the Greater -- it was then called the
19 Greater Philadelphia Urban Affairs
20 Coalition as a job developer, then became
21 job development manager for two or three,
22 I can't remember which, funded grant
23 programs, and I've kind of kept my hand
24 in that over the last 20 years working
25 with veterans.

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 A few years back, I would say
3 it was -- it wasn't in this
4 Administration, but we were approached by
5 a recruiter for the Philadelphia Police
6 Department about having veterans maybe
7 apply, et cetera, et cetera. Well, we
8 met with this person. We found a venue,
9 wouldn't cost the City a dime. The
10 veterans were even going to put up some
11 money and pay for the food. Again,
12 wouldn't cost the City a dime. Didn't
13 hear back for a couple weeks. Then we
14 got the word back, well, perhaps the
15 place we selected -- it was meeting with
16 some opposition because it wasn't very
17 diverse, is what we were told. And we
18 couldn't understand that, because this
19 was a place right square in the middle of
20 Center City, well known to a lot of
21 people, diverse groups of people, had
22 parking, close to public transportation,
23 and that's what we were told.

24 The second instance,
25 Philadelphia Police Department again, I

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 sat on a Police District Advisory Council
3 for 11 years. Recruiters came in, talked
4 to the Advisory Council. Somebody told
5 them I was a vet. The recruiters came to
6 me. They said, oh, we need to get
7 veterans, we need to get veterans. So I
8 sent out the e-mails they asked to have
9 sent out. Nothing ever, ever heard back.
10 Meantime, during these two times, we were
11 telling veterans, hey, get your resumes
12 ready, blah, blah, blah, blah, blah,
13 blah. And now when the City comes out
14 and says, well, we fell short -- I'm just
15 talking about the Police Department
16 now -- fell short of our recruiting
17 numbers, our veterans don't even answer
18 e-mails anymore because they've heard it
19 all before.

20 Another time, I have been big
21 about jobs for everybody on that Market
22 East development, from City Hall all the
23 way down to the river, and I approached
24 it the wrong way. I used to talk about
25 our veterans perhaps getting union

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 building trades job, but that necessarily
3 wasn't the way to go about it, because
4 those jobs are finite. Once that
5 building is built, that's it. They move
6 on to something else. But somebody has
7 to get employed inside that building, in
8 that office, in that store, et cetera, et
9 cetera.

10 I had a discussion with the
11 general counsel of a large real estate
12 organization -- it wasn't Councilman
13 Domb -- that overheard me or somebody
14 overheard me saying, you know, this
15 hasn't been very veteran friendly. And
16 this guy called me and made a whole bunch
17 of promises. That same day I talked to
18 an elected official in this building who
19 told me the exact opposite of what was
20 happening. So somebody misled me, misled
21 our veterans.

22 The other thing I want you to
23 think about as relative to hiring
24 veterans and we'll pick -- let's just
25 pick Police Department again. If I'm a

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 veteran, especially if I spend some time
3 in uniform, I probably have an idea of
4 what a police or firefighter job was or a
5 carpenter's job. I was a ship fitter in
6 the Navy, welder, pipefitter, plumber.
7 That was my trade in the Navy for 25
8 years until I got commissioned. I pretty
9 much have an idea of what that job
10 entails. And before I apply as a
11 veteran, I am probably going to do some
12 research on that job. I'm not going to
13 be like, say, somebody that's younger
14 that somebody says, hey, there's a job
15 over here, go over and apply. So when
16 you hire me, it's probably a one-time
17 hire. You're going to probably have to
18 pay for my training costs, the cost to
19 hire and stuff, but I'm probably going to
20 be around for 20 years, maybe even
21 longer. You're not going to have to
22 spend that amount of money on me again.

23 Maybe not so with somebody
24 that's younger, that, okay, this is too
25 hard, I don't want to be a cop,

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 firefighter, plumber, whatever. So now
3 you got to go out and hire somebody else
4 again.

5 So I just would like to keep
6 that in mind. And I would just kind of
7 close with that there's more that I think
8 this Committee could do relative to
9 hiring veterans. We hear a lot, but we
10 don't necessarily see it.

11 I like the Councilwoman's idea
12 about maybe a citywide job fair for
13 veterans for -- listen, our vets are not
14 going to apply for something they're not
15 interested in. They're not going to
16 waste anybody's time.

17 Now, I believe Council
18 President Clarke did that before a few
19 years ago, but there's no reason why we
20 couldn't do that every year, every other
21 year, things like that, because our men
22 and women -- I could not get in the
23 military today with the skills I had with
24 these men and women coming back now.
25 These people are trained. They're ready

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 to go to work.

3 And, again, I'm opposed to the
4 process as the way this came out. I'm
5 sure my colleagues will talk about that,
6 but I just wanted to give you another way
7 to think about this. And I want to thank
8 Councilman O'Neill, Councilman Domb, Oh,
9 and my Councilman Squilla and everybody
10 else that's sitting here listening to us.
11 We do appreciate that.

12 Thank you.

13 MR. FURRY: Hello. My name is
14 Joe Furry. I'm a Philadelphia democrat,
15 born and raised.

16 President Jackson drafted me
17 and I volunteered for Vietnam. Now, we
18 come home and the only good thing we had
19 was the veterans preference. So it was
20 ten percent. So that was great.

21 As far as the Councilwoman, I
22 met her. She seems well educated and
23 very intelligent.

24 The bill you're putting on
25 seems to be the fastest way to help these

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007
2 kids, to put it on the back of a veterans
3 preference. I think you should go back
4 and start from zero and start your own
5 bill, call it the Philadelphia high
6 school benefit, and then you can put
7 anything you want on it.

8 The reason we're opposed to
9 this, you're putting it on top of the
10 veterans. And if it goes up for a vote,
11 most Philadelphians, they vote yes
12 anyway. If they see something with
13 veteran on it, they're going to vote yes
14 anyway without reading the bill.

15 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Madam Chair,
16 could I just have a point of information?

17 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Before
18 your point of information, Councilwoman
19 Gym.

20 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Just a point
21 of decorum.

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Sure.
23 Sure.

24 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: And I know
25 you'll be clear.

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 So we all welcome all testimony
3 in this building. Absolutely. And I
4 think it's important that we are going to
5 look at things and it's possible that we
6 look at things very differently, but I
7 would ask, Madam Chair, and just for the
8 people in the audience, that there's a
9 large difference between disagreement and
10 discussing intelligence or any other
11 types of factors. That comes across as
12 being very, very -- in areas that are not
13 necessary within this body.

14 We absolutely support your
15 right to speak, to speak to the issues
16 that you choose to and to say very
17 clearly that you disagree with them and
18 that you can offer any alternative or
19 urge us to seek alternatives. But I
20 think when we get into areas where people
21 are disparaged based on things that we
22 don't all know each other in this room,
23 it makes it very hard for us to hear
24 stuff.

25 And so I would encourage you to

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 continue with your testimony, but I would
3 also ask, Madam Chair, that I think it is
4 important to have a level of decorum. We
5 can disagree. It doesn't mean that we
6 don't hear you at all. But myself,
7 people, we want to be careful about where
8 we're talking about when it deals with
9 other areas. If you disagree, please
10 state so. We give you open and ample
11 time to be able to discuss it, but I feel
12 very uncomfortable when people start
13 talking about individuals and other types
14 of things that is not really what's in
15 play.

16 Thank you, Madam Chair.

17 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
18 you, Councilwoman Gym.

19 I just want to state for the
20 record before you continue with your
21 testimony, particularly for the benefit
22 of those who may be watching at home,
23 that I do agree with you in that
24 Councilwoman Gilmore Richardson is a very
25 smart young woman, smart, prepared,

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 experienced having worked in government
3 and in public service since her very
4 youthful years.

5 I don't want to say you're not
6 youthful anymore, Councilwoman, but
7 you've definitely been around the block
8 and are more experienced than others.

9 In addition to that, I want to
10 note for the record that her
11 undergraduate degree is from West Chester
12 University, that she also has a Master's
13 degree from West Chester University in
14 Public Administration. And I was very
15 much excited when I realized that she was
16 only one -- how many people were in your
17 cohort at Yale?

18 One of 85 women who were
19 admitted into a Women in Leadership
20 program at Yale, the Ivy League Yale.
21 And I just wanted for the benefit of
22 people at home to know how very fortunate
23 we are to have you as a member of this
24 body. Not only your experience, but your
25 academic credentials speak for

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 themselves. So thank you, Councilwoman.

3 Thank you, sir. Please feel
4 free to proceed with your testimony.

5 MR. GINDER: Hello, everyone,
6 Councilpeople. My name is George Ginder.
7 I'm a combat-wounded veteran. I'm a U.S.
8 Army retiree. Suffice to say, I belong
9 to many veteran organizations, but I'm
10 here today to speak to you and urge you
11 to postpone any kind of a vote on this
12 amendment today, and the reason I ask you
13 to do so, this amendment has far-reaching
14 impact on everyone involved. Today
15 specifically it's for a high school
16 student who completes a program.
17 Tomorrow, next month it could be another
18 group or organization that feels as
19 though they should have preference points
20 also. So it's kind of opening up a door.

21 We've seen here this afternoon
22 many questions that were asked that could
23 not be answered specifically. What I'm
24 saying is, this should be worked out to a
25 point where everyone is in agreement. We

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 admit that it's kind of up in the air
3 right now. It was mentioned prior to
4 this meeting, well, there are things that
5 still need to be worked out. Why are we
6 voting on an amendment that still needs
7 to be worked out? Everything should be
8 laid out in writing, this is the way it
9 is and this is the way it's going to be,
10 not we'll cross that creek when we come
11 to it.

12 As stated, I'm opposed to this
13 as it reads right now.

14 My math -- and I'm a graduate
15 of a technical program myself prior to
16 entering the military, but my math says
17 to me and everything that I see, that if
18 currently today as a veteran I receive
19 ten preference points, that means I will
20 receive ten points more than any other
21 person taking the test who doesn't meet
22 the same qualifications as I do.

23 However, if you give five points to
24 another group of people, that erodes my
25 ten point preference. Now I only have a

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 five point preference. That's my math.
3 I don't know. Is that -- well, I don't
4 want to ask you a question, but that's
5 the way I see it.

6 Today I would urge all
7 Councilmembers who have a vote in this to
8 please consider that. Look in your heart
9 and let's postpone this until we can get
10 this right. It seems like there's some
11 kind of urge, rush to vote to get this
12 through.

13 I learned about this program as
14 a veteran and as a member of your
15 advisory group. I learned about this
16 program three weeks ago. I don't know
17 how long it's been in existence. Didn't
18 know anything about it until, as I said,
19 three weeks ago, and it seems like there
20 is just some kind of rush to get it
21 through. Last week it was ten preference
22 points. Now it's let's compromise, we'll
23 make it five preference points.

24 We're not bartering here.
25 Let's take the time to get this program

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 right, get this amendment right, because
3 we're going to be putting it to a vote,
4 and the people here in Philadelphia are
5 going to vote on this amendment.

6 So I urge you, for that reason,
7 I urge you to please postpone any type of
8 vote. Let's take a better look at this
9 and get it right right from the start.

10 Thank you for your time.

11 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The Chair
12 recognizes Councilman Green.

13 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you,
14 Madam Chair.

15 I actually have a point of
16 information for the sponsor of the bill.
17 So my understanding is that currently for
18 a military veteran, you have a ten point
19 preference, and under your amendment to
20 your original bill, you would have a five
21 point preference that's only open for 36
22 months. And under the current law, that
23 a military veteran has a ten point
24 preference for any time period; is that
25 correct?

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Yes.

3 So --

4 COUNCILMAN GREEN: And let me
5 just follow up on that question.

6 So do you have any perspective
7 on the average age of a person that's
8 coming out of the military service?

9 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: No,
10 but we can get that information.

11 COUNCILMAN GREEN: The reason
12 I'm asking the question, because it would
13 seem that -- and I've heard this
14 conversation in reference to the five
15 points takes away from the ten points,
16 but if most high school graduates -- and
17 you may be able to get this information
18 from the District. If most high school
19 graduates are coming out of high school
20 at the age of, let's say, 18 or 19, then
21 they would have to use this CTE
22 preference by the age of 21, which is
23 more -- and I'm not sure of the data, but
24 more likely than not someone coming out
25 of the military is probably going to be

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 an older age. And so this is not really
3 going to -- that five/ten point issue
4 would really not be an issue, because by
5 the time you come out of high school,
6 more likely you're going to be 21, maybe
7 22. By the time you come out of the
8 military service, you will be much older.
9 So an older person won't even be able to
10 get that five point preference, because
11 you have to use it at an earlier point
12 than someone who is a military
13 graduate -- I mean returning from
14 service. I'm sorry.

15 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: So,
16 Madam Chair, just to respond to my
17 colleague, and thank you for bringing up
18 that point. The reason why we added 36
19 months, it gives you up to three years,
20 because most young people, some will go
21 to college, some will go to the miliary,
22 and when they come back, that three-year
23 time period will have lapsed for the
24 young people who did not go to college or
25 did not go to the military. So nine

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 times out of ten, anyone from the
3 military who is applying to a City job
4 would not even take the same exam as
5 someone who is right out of high school,
6 because they would not meet or match
7 based on the years. If you're 18 and
8 you're graduating from high school and
9 you're applying for a civil service exam
10 and you have the CTE program, you would
11 get the five points. If you're from the
12 military, you graduated high school, went
13 directly into the military, how long
14 would you have to be in the military for
15 basic training? I'm asking.

16 MR. GINDER: Nine weeks.

17 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Nine
18 weeks. And then after nine weeks, that's
19 it for your service, correct? How long
20 is that whole process?

21 MR. EASTMAN: I can tell you
22 like nuclear power school, if you go to
23 nuclear power school, you could be there
24 at your initial training for two years.
25 That might be the most rigorous academic

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 program the military has, and then you
3 have follow-on training. That's why your
4 initial enlistment would be six years
5 instead of four.

6 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: So if
7 the enlistment is four years to six
8 years, at that point the graduate of the
9 CTE program would no longer be eligible
10 to claim the preference. So the CTE
11 graduate and the veteran would not be on
12 the same list at all because of the years
13 of service based on your military
14 service.

15 MR. GINDER: That's true, and
16 you're identifying someone who's starting
17 out at the same time. We're talking
18 about veterans who have already served
19 their time or are getting out of service
20 today. Where are they at? They're going
21 to be losing five points.

22 Let me add at this juncture, if
23 I can, the intent of this program for
24 veterans and first responders was to
25 honor these people with the preference

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 points, ten preference points, because
3 veterans, they have in one way, shape or
4 form put their lives on the line or
5 agreed to put their lives on the line.
6 First responders, they do it all the
7 time. Firefighters rush into burning
8 fires. The police are honored police.
9 They're in danger every day. They're
10 putting their lives on the line. And a
11 high school student just starting out in
12 life, we're talking about if not -- in
13 the same paragraph identifying them as
14 receiving five preference points. It
15 doesn't add -- it just seems like it's
16 taking away from the honor of the other
17 people identified in that paragraph.

18 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: I
19 have a question for you. Are you aware
20 of any of the other preferences that are
21 already in effect in the City of
22 Philadelphia?

23 MR. GINDER: I believe that
24 there are other programs, but they're not
25 spelled out in this paragraph. So what

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 they are, I know that if you're involved
3 with the Explorers or some other
4 organizations, there's two or three
5 points that you receive, but that's
6 another program, right?

7 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: So I
8 just wanted to be clear that there's
9 already preferences on the books in the
10 City of Philadelphia. This would just be
11 codifying it forever going forward we
12 would have a preference for graduates of
13 CTE programs and schools up to three
14 years after they graduate. But a lot of
15 these programs are already on the books,
16 and you heard them from the Office of
17 Workforce Development and from the Office
18 of HR. Preferences already exist
19 throughout government already.

20 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
21 you.

22 The Chair recognizes
23 Councilwoman Gym.

24 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you
25 very much.

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 I, first of all, want to thank
3 this panel for coming forward. You know,
4 we've heard you in Council at public
5 testimony as well and really appreciate
6 service.

7 One of the things that I also
8 want to just share a little bit is that
9 my understanding is that there's one
10 thing about this, as I think was
11 referenced, this kind of symbolic nature
12 of what it means to hold status within
13 the City with the preference points. But
14 I think one of the other big concerns
15 that we're trying to deal with,
16 especially in conversations I've had with
17 your Executive Director for the Veterans
18 Advisory Committee, is that we do have an
19 abysmal hiring rate for civil service.
20 1.5, 1.4 percent of all hires are
21 veterans. I mean, that is also a
22 disservice.

23 And so I think one of the
24 things that I have been working and
25 talking with the Executive Director about

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 is especially for returning folks who are
3 coming back, feeding them into a pipeline
4 into a teaching program to go into
5 teaching into our public schools, for
6 example. We're in desperate need of
7 educators and teachers and people with
8 experience and background, especially
9 like if we've got schools -- we have a
10 whole school devoted to Philadelphia
11 Military Academy, for example. And it is
12 important for us to actualize something
13 as much as it is to hold on to the
14 symbolic nature of what the preference
15 points means.

16 I know that to the Council
17 sponsor's perspective, I believe strongly
18 in the veterans affairs. I'd love to
19 continue talking with our ED and with any
20 of our members about what it would look
21 like, especially for new and returning
22 veterans, to get involved with affordable
23 education programs so that they could go
24 into them relatively quickly and we can
25 get them into a steady, very responsible,

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 stable job within our public schools,
3 helping train the next generation and
4 raise the next generation.

5 But I wanted to let you know
6 that part of this conversation has to be
7 about how we can not just honor people
8 but actually honor them by getting them
9 jobs when they come back from service.
10 That is the biggest honor that we can do
11 and show, more than just anything
12 symbolic, and I will certainly make a
13 commitment to that and continue the
14 conversations that I've had with your
15 Executive Director, Carlo Aragoncillo.

16 So thank you, Madam Chair.

17 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The Chair
18 recognizes Councilwoman Gilmore
19 Richardson.

20 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Thank
21 you, Madam Chair.

22 I just wanted to echo the
23 sentiments of my colleague and talk about
24 our commitment to ensuring that we are
25 working with veterans so that you have

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 increased employment opportunities. And
3 I just want you to know from me to you
4 that my commitment has been to do the
5 same. I have a legislative aide who's
6 actually an attorney who drafted this
7 legislation in my office. Shawn Baldwin
8 is also an Army veteran and has served
9 three tours in Iraq and Afghanistan. So
10 internally in my office, I have that
11 commitment and have shown that, but do
12 want to express to you that we need to
13 further deepen that commitment throughout
14 the City of Philadelphia, and I pledge to
15 work with you to do that. So thank you
16 so much.

17 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
18 you. Thank you.

19 Is there anyone else here to
20 testify on this bill?

21 Thank you. As you approach --

22 MR. EASTMAN: Thank you.

23 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
24 you.

25 MR. GINDER: Thank you.

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you
3 so very much. We all look forward to
4 working with you, and we thank each and
5 every one of you for your service.

6 (Witnesses approached witness
7 table.)

8 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Please
9 state your name for the record and
10 proceed with your testimony.

11 MR. ALI: My name is Jihad Ali.
12 I'm a resident of Philadelphia and I'm
13 proud to say that I'm a veteran. I'm a
14 former member of the United States Marine
15 Corps. I served from 1973 to 1983 and I
16 was honorably discharged. I'm also proud
17 to say that I'm a former Philadelphia
18 police officer. I served from 1984 to
19 2001, and I left my job because I was
20 injured in the line of duty.

21 I'm here to say that I
22 benefited from the ten point preference
23 at the time that I was hired. And just
24 listening to the testimony before, just
25 reflecting back on my life, I was 24 when

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 I took that opportunity with the Police
3 Department. I was a young man trying to
4 find a job to support my family.

5 And just thinking about what
6 you said, Councilwoman, about the dismal
7 hiring practices currently now for
8 veterans. Now, keep in mind we currently
9 give veterans a ten point preference. So
10 really it plays to what the bill sponsor
11 said, Ms. Richardson, Councilwoman
12 Richardson, about you still have to
13 qualify. You still have the other
14 metrics that you have to make to become a
15 member of the Police Department and any
16 other civil service exam.

17 When the previous testimony
18 was -- I take no offense that you're
19 giving a young person a five point
20 preference. If it's a test, I'm still
21 going to be qualified ten points ahead of
22 that person. If it was one point, you
23 win elections based on one vote. I'm
24 still going to qualify because I'm --
25 whatever that number was.

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 I think that this is a step in
3 the right direction. Listening to the
4 testimony of the Administration, we had
5 the Office of Workforce Development, the
6 Chief Education Officer, Human Resources
7 Director speak. It's no wonder why young
8 people are in the problems that they
9 have. They've advocated doing the same
10 thing. The same problems, they've been
11 addressed in the same manner for years.
12 Look at the results.

13 When they talked about this
14 model program, the model employer
15 workforce development program, 262 people
16 that they placed. It's 150,000 young
17 people under the age of 18, between 18
18 and 15. Just say half of that, 75,000,
19 every year coming out.

20 The reason why I'm here to
21 testify today -- and most of my
22 development, I've been involved in
23 construction for 35 years, and union
24 construction. I'm a union carpenter, and
25 I'm proud to say I'm still a member of

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 the union. And this CTE program came to
3 our -- I became aware of that through the
4 numerous committees that I've been on,
5 the oversight boards. We kept coming to
6 this question about apprentice programs
7 and why weren't CTE students given a
8 preference, because in the union world,
9 in the apprentice program, we're talking
10 about young people starting off at zero,
11 zero experience and zero job
12 qualification. So we said, well, if
13 they're coming through the CTE program
14 and they have over 1,000 hours of
15 training, why aren't they given a
16 preference for at least a two-year
17 apprentice program, at least a new
18 apprentice, the second-year apprentice?
19 Why aren't they admitted? And the
20 question kept coming back, well, the
21 unions just wouldn't go for it.

22 But when you really think about
23 it, they've been in training. Every
24 year -- I think they start at the 10th
25 grade -- they advance a level. Most of

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 the former instructors of the CTE program
3 are people that held occupations for 30
4 years, and they are the testers. They
5 advance out of test, they move up to the
6 next level. They test out, they move up
7 to the next level. And finally they get
8 out. They're given accreditation by the
9 national organization and they're
10 advanced, yet they're not able to get
11 into the building trades.

12 One of the positions I've had
13 is to be on the oversight board of the
14 new Patient Pavilion project. It's a
15 \$1.2 billion hospital under construction
16 right now at the University of
17 Pennsylvania. And this question came up,
18 the CTE, and there was another program
19 called the Penn First Program, and in the
20 Penn First Program, I think we placed 15
21 students in the Penn First program, and
22 of the 15, that's roughly like 181,000
23 man hours.

24 At the construction site, we
25 billed a million man hours. So when you

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 look at the dent that it made, it really
3 makes no dent.

4 But I do think that this is a
5 step in the right direction. I think
6 that this gives a helping hand to young
7 people who are facing the pipeline of
8 prison. And if we look back over all
9 these years and see what happened to
10 these young people, it's either a job or
11 they're going to prison. Most of these
12 young people will face the same
13 challenges that I faced as a young man
14 coming from the Marine Corps, and that
15 was seeking employment to provide for my
16 family. So this is a step in the right
17 direction.

18 I'd like to quote Dr. King, and
19 I only want to quote what his -- his
20 famous words were, "let me remind you."
21 And I'd like to remind you all that
22 you're all here as members that were
23 elected by 1,312,000 people in the City
24 of Philadelphia that elected you to do
25 just what you're doing. You can't look

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 at -- the Administration, they have
3 appointed people. You are the people's
4 representative, and I would like to
5 remind you you're carrying out the solemn
6 duty that we gave you.

7 People want to see change.
8 We're tired of turning on the news,
9 seeing young black men and women and
10 other races killed out in the street,
11 lives thrown away at 14, 13, 15, 17, just
12 thrown away forever.

13 So this is a step in the right
14 direction, because we got to keep
15 changing. We have to keep evolving. And
16 I just wanted to say for the record, we
17 all -- there's many veterans here.
18 There's a Vietnam veteran over there
19 sitting along the side that I know he
20 served in time of war. We don't have any
21 problem with this. And the fact of the
22 matter is that these people deserve a
23 chance. They're in a similar program.
24 They're serving as citizens. They're
25 going through a program just like we as

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 veterans, we come out, I don't -- it's
3 not my opinion that I feel slighted
4 because they're on -- they're given a
5 preference for me. I know what I did. I
6 know my service. I know I got that
7 discharge. I know that my name is down
8 in history as a veteran in the United
9 States government.

10 So I don't have any problem at
11 all giving these children a preference,
12 giving them a handout and changing their
13 path from prison to becoming productive
14 citizens. I applaud you for doing the
15 right thing.

16 Thank you for allowing me to
17 testify.

18 MR. BOYLE: Good afternoon,
19 Councilmembers, Madam Chairman. For the
20 record, I'm Anthony F. Boyle, B-O-Y-L-E.
21 I'm a member of Council's Veterans
22 Advisory Council and I'm also a member of
23 the Police Department and have been for a
24 number of years. I'm here as the
25 Commissioner on the Veterans Advisory

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 Council, but I also have a stake in this
3 as a Philadelphia police officer as well.
4 And I have a couple of reservations with
5 this legislation with the Charter change
6 attempt as well that I would like again
7 to put on the record.

8 And one thing I would -- that I
9 want to point out is that with
10 preferences, preferences that are given
11 for almost anything but particularly for
12 hiring should be under very exceptional
13 circumstances and shouldn't be something
14 that is done except in those exceptional
15 circumstances. I certainly believe that
16 being a veteran is one of those
17 exceptions, and I absolutely believe that
18 being a child or a grandchild of a police
19 officer or firefighter that has been
20 killed in the line of duty is indeed an
21 exceptional circumstance and one
22 circumstance that absolutely every one of
23 them do not want to be in or to be in a
24 position to get that benefit, and it is
25 our way of acknowledging the sacrifice of

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 their family.

3 And I think that that is how
4 high the bar should be. I don't believe
5 that the bar should be as low as we have
6 it now. And I certainly can argue as
7 well for some of the preferences that are
8 already being given to individuals other
9 than veterans and other than survivor
10 family members.

11 And although it was -- and I
12 think that the argument that it hurts
13 veterans is warranted, as it does also
14 hurt survivor families. It's not just
15 veterans, but this hurts family members
16 of the survivors that will apply for City
17 jobs. Even though they go in with a ten
18 point preference and these are
19 competitive -- in many cases a
20 competitive process, their ten points is
21 diluted by five by competing with someone
22 who I don't believe exception meets the
23 bar that theirs does, and yet their ten
24 points is now diluted by those five
25 points. And it's not a matter of there

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 might be a low number of survivor
3 families who apply or a low number of
4 veterans. The number of people applying
5 for that has nothing to do with it. It
6 is still just a one-to-one effect and
7 ratio. So I have a problem with that.

8 Also with the, what I believe
9 is, confusion over the argument of age
10 and that a veteran who comes out in his
11 20's is not competing against the CTE
12 graduates because they were 18 when they
13 graduated, et cetera. It has nothing to
14 do with the age of the veteran. It has
15 to do with the time that both of them are
16 taking the test. It is a clear
17 competition in those respects.

18 I myself, I was to start the
19 Police Academy in October of 1972 and
20 Uncle Sam had different ideas for me, and
21 so I was drafted and entered the military
22 in October as well of '72. I didn't come
23 back to compete for my position on the
24 Police Department again until May of '75
25 and was hired one year later, May of '76,

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 because of lawsuits and all sorts of
3 things. So I was 23, 24 when -- I was
4 probably 23 when I took the test again,
5 and if this CTE preference was in place,
6 I would be competing against that 18- or
7 19-year-old. So that my age is
8 inconsequential to it. The time that you
9 take the test is when you are in
10 competition with those CTE students that
11 would be getting that preference.

12 And also with the Charter
13 change aspect of this, I agree with the
14 HR officials that it does put a
15 restriction that is, I think, a little
16 too onerous on this process, particularly
17 down the road where we -- as opposed to
18 all of the leeway and the ability that
19 you have legislatively and
20 administratively without the Charter
21 change to accomplish this goal and many
22 more goals, and I'm concerned with the
23 rush that we've seen in this entire
24 process.

25 I've also heard the argument

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 that we need this to fill the vacancies.

3 If we have vacancies that aren't being

4 filled, all the preferences in the world

5 aren't going to help you with that,

6 because except for the exceptional

7 positions that have specialized

8 requirements out of the ordinary, if you

9 can't fill the vacancies, then you don't

10 have enough applicants in the first

11 place. You don't have enough people

12 competing. You could give them 100

13 points preference and if you don't have

14 them coming up for the job, then no

15 legislation is going to help you fill

16 these vacancies.

17 I've been directly involved in

18 the filling of vacancies in the Police

19 Department both with sworn personnel as

20 well as civilian personnel as police

21 communications dispatchers, and every

22 single obstacle that we've encountered in

23 hiring people, both sworn and civilian,

24 are City-implemented obstacles, not the

25 fact that we don't have enough people

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 applying for the job, that we don't have
3 enough qualified people that want it. It
4 is the self-inflicted wounds from the
5 obstacles placed by the City of
6 Philadelphia that stops us from filling
7 our classes, from getting people hired.
8 We constantly have vacancies for police
9 dispatchers, and it's not because people
10 don't want the job. We just can't get
11 through the bureaucracy that holds us
12 down from filling those vacancies. And,
13 again, preferences, they're not going to
14 change that situation as well.

15 And I do agree that if
16 preferences are given to CTE students,
17 that they should be for the jobs relative
18 to their training. If you give a
19 preference to a CTE graduate for the
20 police communication dispatcher position,
21 which has no equivalence to what their
22 CTE training was, but yet now they have a
23 five point advantage over every other
24 student from a public school, from a
25 charter school, from every school in the

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 City, yet their preference -- their
3 training in CTE has nothing to do with
4 the test that they are getting that
5 advantage for. And I think that's not
6 fair to the other public school
7 graduates, to the GED graduates, to any
8 graduate that they're competing with if
9 it is not for a position that their CTE
10 education gives them that leg up for.

11 We've also heard today in other
12 testimonies that CTE graduates are more
13 successful both from an earnings
14 standpoint but a hiring standpoint once
15 they've completed their job. So if
16 they've already gotten that advantage
17 from CTE, then maybe the focus should be
18 on the students who haven't been able to
19 get into a CTE program that may need that
20 extra help to get into the City
21 employment process as opposed to a
22 student who through the CTE is already
23 advantaged because of the education in
24 CTE.

25 And just as a side note,

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 because I know it was brought up before
3 or in past testimony in communication
4 with the Committee, the hiring of
5 veterans by the City of Philadelphia is
6 hampered by the City and not by the
7 veterans' desire to be hired. The
8 process of hiring in this city is
9 shameful, and veteran or non-veteran,
10 applicants that sign up and want to
11 become a police officer, the length of
12 time that they have to wait to be hired
13 from the City for the Police Department
14 and the lack of communication, months and
15 months and months of hearing nothing, is
16 as discouraging as it can be, and it has
17 nothing to do with any preference on the
18 test.

19 New York City comes down to our
20 city and has for years and years and
21 recruited at all of our colleges and hire
22 people so quickly, and yet we lag behind.
23 Council has done a great favor for the
24 veteran community and the Police
25 Department by getting rid of the

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 requirement to have been a resident for a
3 year prior to getting on. The change in
4 the residency requirement has been
5 terrific with our ability to recruit at
6 colleges, not only local ones but also
7 colleges and bases, military bases, away
8 from the City, because now we can take
9 them on. Before we couldn't even go to
10 the colleges here and be successful in
11 our recruiting, because most of the
12 students, if they weren't City residents,
13 we couldn't even -- they've have to move
14 in for a year before we could hire them.
15 That's changed, but it is still an
16 unbelievable process for somebody to go
17 to and stay encouraged about becoming a
18 Philadelphia police officer when they
19 wait for a year or more before there's
20 even any interaction to get them hired,
21 and we would love to see that change.
22 I'm speaking not for the Department, but
23 for myself.

24 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Again,
25 just for the record, want to thank both

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 of you for your testimony and a sincere
3 thank you for your service to our great
4 nation. I want you to know that that is
5 not lost.

6 Particularly for the others
7 even who were on the previous panel, we
8 want you to know that we don't take your
9 service lightly, and we appreciate you
10 adding your voice to this debate.

11 Are there any other questions?

12 (No response.)

13 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Is there
14 anyone else here to testify on Bill No.
15 200007?

16 (No response.)

17 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: There
18 being no one else here to testify on the
19 bill before this Committee, this
20 concludes the public hearing. We will
21 now go into the public meeting to
22 consider the action to be taken on the
23 legislation heard today.

24 The Chair recognizes
25 Councilwoman Gilmore Richardson for a

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007
2 motion on the amendment to Bill No.
3 200007.

4 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Thank
5 you, Madam Chair. I offer an amendment
6 to Bill No. 200007. A copy of the
7 amendment has been circulated to all
8 members of the Committee. I move that
9 the amendment to Bill No. 200007 be
10 approved.

11 (Duly seconded.)

12 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: It has
13 been moved and properly seconded that the
14 amendment to Bill No. 200007 be approved.

15 All those in favor of the
16 motion will signify by saying aye.

17 (Aye.)

18 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Those
19 opposed?

20 (No response.)

21 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The ayes
22 have it and the motion carries, and the
23 amendment to Bill No. 200007 has been
24 approved.

25 The Chair recognizes

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 Councilmember Gilmore Richardson for a
3 motion on Bill No. 200007, as amended.

4 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Thank
5 you, Madam Chair. I move that Bill No.
6 200007, as amended, be reported from this
7 Committee with a favorable recommendation
8 and further move that the rules of
9 Council be suspended to permit first
10 reading of this bill at the next session
11 of Council.

12 (Duly seconded.)

13 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: It's been
14 moved and properly seconded that Bill No.
15 200007, as amended, be reported from this
16 Committee with a favorable recommendation
17 and further moved that the rules of
18 Council be suspended to permit first
19 reading of this bill at the next session
20 of Council.

21 All those in favor of the
22 motion will signify by saying aye.

23 (Aye.)

24 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Those
25 opposed?

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
February 18, 2020

Page 124

1 2/18/20 - LABOR - BILL 200007

2 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: No.

3 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: One no.

4 The ayes have it and the motion carries.

5 Bill No. 200007, as amended, will be

6 reported from this Committee with a

7 favorable recommendation with a request

8 that the rules of Council be suspended to

9 permit first reading at the next session

10 of Council.

11 This concludes the business of

12 the Committee on Labor and Civil Service

13 for today. We want to thank each and

14 every one of you for your patience and

15 attendance. Have a good day.

16 Thank you all to my colleagues.

17 (Committee on Labor and Civil

18 Service concluded at 3:18 p.m.)

19 - - -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the
proceedings, evidence and objections are
contained fully and accurately in the
stenographic notes taken by me upon the
foregoing matter, and that this is a true and
correct transcript of same.

MICHELE L. MURPHY
RPR-Notary Public

(The foregoing certification of this
transcript does not apply to any reproduction
of the same by any means, unless under the
direct control and/or supervision of the
certifying reporter.)

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
February 18, 2020

Page 1

A	actively	56:25	95:2	alive 74:12	answer 16:21	117:2	asked 42:13
a.m 42:5	23:23	administra...	106:17	ALLAN 1:11	26:7 42:21	appoint	43:3 60:12
ability 47:10	activities	36:2	114:9,14	allow 4:16	64:10	43:24	81:8 90:22
54:7 68:15	72:17	administra...	115:7	5:9 47:16	65:21 67:4	appointed	asking 42:6
115:18	activity 11:15	42:11	agency 62:14	71:6	81:17	110:3	55:20
120:5	actual 29:21	115:20	agent 73:10	allowing	answered	appreciate	59:16
able 7:20	actualize	admit 91:2	agile 48:22	16:20	90:23	54:13 75:2	65:25
20:8 25:16	101:12	admitted	ago 49:6	111:16	Anthony	85:11	94:12
29:23	adapt 22:22	89:19	84:19	allows 23:4	111:20	100:5	96:15
30:14	add 31:12	107:19	92:16,19	52:4	anticipate	121:9	aspect 115:13
35:12	32:24 33:2	adopted	agree 14:3	alternative	65:4	apprentice	aspects 11:10
39:21,24	97:22	16:19	40:20	41:17	anybody 79:7	63:19	71:23
48:23 58:3	98:15	adult 22:6	88:23	87:18	anybody's	107:6,9,17	assess 23:5
60:15 61:6	added 7:19	25:21	115:13	alternatives	84:16	107:18,18	assets 24:9
65:4 72:11	68:11	advance 24:6	117:15	87:19	anymore	apprentices	assisting
72:15,22	69:12	107:25	agreed 98:5	amend 42:7	81:18 89:6	7:7 63:22	23:17
73:11	95:18	108:5	agreement	66:5	anyway	Apprentice...	assists 24:11
88:11	adding	advanced	28:17	amended 5:9	86:12,14	20:23	athlete 71:16
94:17 95:9	121:10	108:10	90:25	41:20	AP 71:15	21:14	Atkinson
108:10	addition 7:2	advancement	agreements	123:3,6,15	appeared	approach	46:22
118:18	33:3 89:9	22:12	51:4 68:21	124:5	4:14	24:10	attain 19:21
Absent 24:13	additional	advancing	68:25	amending	applaud	103:21	25:19
absolutely	27:18 70:4	26:2	agrees 51:12	1:16 9:7	25:25 62:6	approached	33:10
87:3,14	Additionally	advantage	51:13	66:7	111:14	9:20 67:18	attaining
112:17,22	20:13	117:23	ahead 105:21	amendment	applicant	78:16 80:4	22:8 24:17
abysmal	address 3:22	118:5,16	aide 103:5	6:17 16:18	23:20	81:23	attempt
100:19	12:12	advantaged	air 91:2	35:14	29:25 61:7	104:6	112:6
academic	13:22	118:23	airport 21:12	39:24	applicants	approaches	attempting
89:25	22:14	advisory 81:2	56:15	41:14	5:22,25 6:3	9:23	19:16 56:8
96:25	44:10	81:4 92:15	Ali 9:19	42:12,14	6:14 12:4	appropriate	attend 7:21
academically	54:19	100:18	10:17,17	90:12,13	38:11	23:25	14:6,8,15
68:25	addressed	111:22,25	16:23,25	91:6 93:2,5	116:10	approved	28:21
69:23	12:21,25	advocated	32:24,25	93:19	119:10	122:10,14	44:11,14
Academy	31:4 39:10	106:9	33:22,25	122:2,5,7,9	application	122:24	attendance
101:11	106:11	affairs 79:19	56:21	122:14,23	18:20	approxima...	2:11 3:5
114:19	addresses	101:18	104:11,11	amendments	47:12	70:10	124:15
accept 10:5	19:14 50:4	Affection	align 26:15	42:4	applications	Aragoncillo	attention
access 20:14	addressing	70:8	31:20 32:5	American	5:21 23:19	102:15	58:22
21:25	17:17	affordable	39:18,20,24	78:2	61:5	area 38:14	71:12
accomplish	administers	101:22	40:3 42:9	amount	applies 60:3	74:18	attire 24:2
26:17 53:6	20:20	afforded 6:23	43:9 47:16	39:17 62:3	apply 7:4,6	areas 87:12	attorney
115:21	administra...	14:19	50:13	62:5 66:4	7:18 12:20	87:20 88:9	103:6
account	16:17	Afghanistan	65:15	83:22	30:14,17	argue 113:6	attract 15:8
34:24	33:19 34:3	103:9	aligned 34:19	ample 88:10	36:14,16	argument	audience
accreditation	34:13,17	afternoon 2:3	35:18 36:6	analysis	37:18 80:7	113:12	87:8
108:8	42:6 46:5	4:21 10:11	aligning	60:12	83:10,15	114:9	automotive
accurate 28:4	46:16 50:7	13:18	16:13	and/or 37:4	84:14	115:25	74:9
accurately	55:4,12,25	16:23	29:21	54:18	113:16	Armstrong	Automotiv...
125:5	56:9,24	67:21 68:4	32:16	55:13	114:3	18:7	20:23
achieve 18:2	57:14 80:4	78:19	alignment	67:25	125:21	Army 90:8	available
acknowled...	89:14	90:21	35:13	125:23	applying	103:8	32:5
112:25	106:4	111:18	47:15	announcem...	30:23	arrival 45:19	average
action 121:22	110:2	age 25:8 94:7	aligns 13:5	30:4	79:12 96:3	articulation	24:24
	Administra...	94:20,22	38:16	annual 71:4	96:9 114:4	68:21	60:17 94:7

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
February 18, 2020

Page 2

Aviation 21:11	basically 32:17	biased 64:11 73:21,21,21	78:1,6 79:1 80:1 81:1	boards 107:5	C	cause 6:2	111:19
aware 15:3 98:19 107:3	40:17 basis 19:3 43:5	bifurcated 61:19	82:1 83:1 84:1 85:1	body 50:25 87:13 89:24	Cadets 6:21	causes 66:9	Chairwoman 8:14 53:11
Awareness 77:22	batteries 72:12	big 55:6 81:20 100:14	85:24 86:1 86:5,14 87:1 88:1	bonus 69:12 books 99:9 99:15	call 9:16 38:9 67:14 86:5	Center 80:20	59:24
aye 122:16 122:17 123:22,23	Battery 72:11	biggest 102:10	89:1 90:1 91:1 92:1	boost 72:19 born 85:15	called 2:3 72:14 73:4 79:18 82:16 108:19	century 69:5	challenge 11:17
ayes 122:21 124:4	beat 47:24 becoming 111:13 120:17	bill 1:16 2:1,7 3:1,10,16 4:1,15 5:1 5:3,5,9 6:1 7:1,10 8:1 8:23 9:1,5 9:6 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1,22 14:1,4 15:1 16:1,10,15 17:1,13 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 47:15 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1,20 52:1,8,11 52:11 53:1 53:17,18 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1 63:1 64:1 65:1 66:1 67:1 68:1 69:1 70:1 71:1 72:1 73:1 74:1 75:1 76:1 77:1	93:1,16,20 94:1 95:1 96:1 97:1 98:1 99:1 100:1 101:1 102:1 103:1,20 104:1 105:1,10 106:1 107:1 108:1 109:1 110:1 111:1 112:1 113:1 114:1 115:1 116:1 117:1 118:1 119:1 120:1 121:1,14,19 122:1,2,6,9 122:14,23 123:1,3,5 123:10,14 123:19 124:1,5	bottom 13:10 bound 24:12 Boyle 111:18 111:20 branch 63:5 brand 76:3 Brian 1:13 9:25 10:6 45:21 78:13 bright 76:24 bringing 58:9 95:17 brings 70:4 broad 12:19 broken 35:7 Brooks 1:10 8:20 9:3 Brotherly 70:8 brought 17:9 119:2 budget 46:6 build 23:3 25:5 31:13 48:22 69:15,24 72:20 building 7:7 31:21 49:14 76:3 76:23 82:2 82:5,7,18 87:3 108:11 built 82:5 bunch 51:11 82:16 bureaucracy 117:11 burning 98:7 business 124:11 businesses 49:2	capacities 63:16 capacity 25:11 69:16 career 1:18 9:11 13:24 15:16 17:24 19:24 20:11,20 22:11,13 23:9 24:6 24:10,13 33:14 63:13 69:18,25 70:7,13,17 71:2 72:7 73:5,9,19 77:21 79:3 careers 15:5 21:10 careful 88:7 caregivers 15:11 Carlo 102:15 carpenter 106:24 carpenter's 83:5 carpentry 35:5 carries 122:22 124:4 carrying 110:5 cases 113:19 cast 15:8 Cathy 77:25 caught 51:11	27:4 30:25 31:8 32:11 35:8 40:6,9 49:7 52:14 62:16 66:17 76:4 102:12 112:15 113:6 CERTIFIC... 125:2 certification 14:14 73:14 125:20 certifications 3:14 31:19 CERTIFY 125:3 certifying 125:24 cetera 80:7,7 82:8,9 114:13 CFPB 59:7 Chair 1:10 2:22 3:2,3 8:18 9:24 26:10 41:6 41:9,25 42:18 45:16,18,20 54:9 59:20 62:20,21,24 63:17 67:6 74:13 76:13,17 86:15 87:7 88:3,16 93:11,14 95:16 99:22 102:16,17 102:21 121:24 122:5,25 123:5 Chairman	55:11,15 challenges 109:13 chamber 3:22 54:23 58:18 chance 74:19 110:23 change 3:10 3:17,25 11:25 13:14 16:9 20:10 32:18 34:16 48:23 49:19 52:9 52:10,23 57:5,19 64:17,17 65:4,8,9 66:15,17,23 110:7 112:5 115:13,21 117:14 120:3,21 changed 58:13 120:15 changes 12:11 16:12 40:5 58:5 65:19 65:20 changing 40:14 110:15 111:12 Chapter 1:16 9:7 charter 3:9 11:23,25 13:14 14:9 32:18 34:15 43:16 44:18 48:3
B	behalf 17:3 belief 30:10 believe 6:5 17:12 18:21 27:24 49:14,23 60:24 84:17 98:23 101:17 112:15,17 113:4,22 114:8 belong 90:8 benefit 5:19 7:19 20:14 54:21 86:6 88:21 89:21 112:24 benefited 104:22 benefits 17:23 22:10 68:12 best 16:6 22:21 49:16,20 65:15 68:18 76:4 better 7:16 11:19 26:3 31:14 32:19 44:7 46:9 52:6 52:24 93:8 beyond 34:13 34:17 37:17	big 55:6 81:20 100:14 biggest 102:10 bill 1:16 2:1,7 3:1,10,16 4:1,15 5:1 5:3,5,9 6:1 7:1,10 8:1 8:23 9:1,5 9:6 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1,22 14:1,4 15:1 16:1,10,15 17:1,13 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 47:15 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1,20 52:1,8,11 52:11 53:1 53:17,18 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1 63:1 64:1 65:1 66:1 67:1 68:1 69:1 70:1 71:1 72:1 73:1 74:1 75:1 76:1 77:1	78:1,6 79:1 80:1 81:1 82:1 83:1 84:1 85:1 85:24 86:1 86:5,14 87:1 88:1 89:1 90:1 91:1 92:1 93:1,16,20 94:1 95:1 96:1 97:1 98:1 99:1 100:1 101:1 102:1 103:1,20 104:1 105:1,10 106:1 107:1 108:1 109:1 110:1 111:1 112:1 113:1 114:1 115:1 116:1 117:1 118:1 119:1 120:1 121:1,14,19 122:1,2,6,9 122:14,23 123:1,3,5 123:10,14 123:19 124:1,5 billed 108:25 billion 108:15 bills 53:10 bit 46:15 100:8 black 110:9 blah 81:12,12 81:12,12,12 81:13 block 29:6 89:7 board 108:13	boards 107:5 body 50:25 87:13 89:24 bonus 69:12 books 99:9 99:15 boost 72:19 born 85:15 bottom 13:10 bound 24:12 Boyle 111:18 111:20 branch 63:5 brand 76:3 Brian 1:13 9:25 10:6 45:21 78:13 bright 76:24 bringing 58:9 95:17 brings 70:4 broad 12:19 broken 35:7 Brooks 1:10 8:20 9:3 Brotherly 70:8 brought 17:9 119:2 budget 46:6 build 23:3 25:5 31:13 48:22 69:15,24 72:20 building 7:7 31:21 49:14 76:3 76:23 82:2 82:5,7,18 87:3 108:11 built 82:5 bunch 51:11 82:16 bureaucracy 117:11 burning 98:7 business 124:11 businesses 49:2	C Cadets 6:21 call 9:16 38:9 67:14 86:5 called 2:3 72:14 73:4 79:18 82:16 108:19 candidates 20:16 capacities 63:16 capacity 25:11 69:16 career 1:18 9:11 13:24 15:16 17:24 19:24 20:11,20 22:11,13 23:9 24:6 24:10,13 33:14 63:13 69:18,25 70:7,13,17 71:2 72:7 73:5,9,19 77:21 79:3 careers 15:5 21:10 careful 88:7 caregivers 15:11 Carlo 102:15 carpenter 106:24 carpenter's 83:5 carpentry 35:5 carries 122:22 124:4 carrying 110:5 cases 113:19 cast 15:8 Cathy 77:25 caught 51:11	cause 6:2 causes 66:9 Center 80:20 century 69:5 certain 9:13 certainly 27:4 30:25 31:8 32:11 35:8 40:6,9 49:7 52:14 62:16 66:17 76:4 102:12 112:15 113:6 CERTIFIC... 125:2 certification 14:14 73:14 125:20 certifications 3:14 31:19 CERTIFY 125:3 certifying 125:24 cetera 80:7,7 82:8,9 114:13 CFPB 59:7 Chair 1:10 2:22 3:2,3 8:18 9:24 26:10 41:6 41:9,25 42:18 45:16,18,20 54:9 59:20 62:20,21,24 63:17 67:6 74:13 76:13,17 86:15 87:7 88:3,16 93:11,14 95:16 99:22 102:16,17 102:21 121:24 122:5,25 123:5 Chairman	111:19 Chairwoman 8:14 53:11 59:24 challenge 11:17 55:11,15 challenges 109:13 chamber 3:22 54:23 58:18 chance 74:19 110:23 change 3:10 3:17,25 11:25 13:14 16:9 20:10 32:18 34:16 48:23 49:19 52:9 52:10,23 57:5,19 64:17,17 65:4,8,9 66:15,17,23 110:7 112:5 115:13,21 117:14 120:3,21 changed 58:13 120:15 changes 12:11 16:12 40:5 58:5 65:19 65:20 changing 40:14 110:15 111:12 Chapter 1:16 9:7 charter 3:9 11:23,25 13:14 14:9 32:18 34:15 43:16 44:18 48:3

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
February 18, 2020

Page 3

48:4 52:9	18:5,24	18:22 20:6	coaching	87:11	119:4	completes	17:6
52:10 63:6	19:5,7,12	25:19 32:2	24:3	114:10	121:19	90:16	consistency
64:13,15	19:17,19,22	35:11	Coalition	119:19	122:8	completing	56:4
65:3,8,10	20:13,19	45:20	79:20	coming 12:23	123:7,16	72:3	constantly
65:25 66:7	21:17,22	50:25 52:4	Code 1:16	31:15	124:6,12,17	completion	117:8
66:12	22:4,16	57:3 60:3	9:8 63:6	35:25	committees	37:6 57:6	construction
112:5	23:3 25:3,4	69:12 96:9	66:4,5,15	39:18	107:4	68:23	106:23,24
115:12,20	25:8 26:23	100:19	codifying	40:17	communicate	complexities	108:15,24
117:25	28:19	105:16	99:11	45:12	10:9	24:17	consumer
CHERELLE	29:20 30:3	124:12,17	cohort 89:17	48:24	communica...	complicated	59:5
1:10	33:20,22,25	civilian	colleague	50:25	117:20	51:19	contact 7:25
Chester	34:7 37:2	116:20,23	4:22 76:19	51:22	119:3,14	comprehen...	contained
89:11,13	37:21 38:7	claim 97:10	95:17	52:25	communica...	22:12	125:5
chief 10:21	38:25 39:4	clarified	102:23	76:20	116:21	compromise	contend
13:20	46:8,9	12:17	colleagues	84:24 94:8	communities	92:22	55:24
58:24	48:16 50:9	clarify 42:4	2:16 8:4	94:19,24	4:5 22:5	computer	context 12:25
106:6	54:25	Clarke 84:18	85:5	100:3	community	75:3	44:7 65:10
child 112:18	55:17,17	class 36:25	124:16	101:3	4:19	concerned	continually
children 4:4	56:23 58:8	37:2,3 40:5	collective	106:19	119:24	115:22	18:10
5:8,16 49:8	61:15,17	43:25	20:8 51:3	107:5,13,20	comparable	concerns	continue 12:7
49:9,11	68:10 69:8	72:14,15	college 7:8	109:14	37:2	4:23 5:8	16:5 25:11
63:12	70:7 71:9	73:7,8	15:17	116:14	compared	12:13,18	34:12,17
111:11	72:4,21	classes 35:4	24:12 49:4	commend	6:13 24:24	14:4 35:24	75:18 88:2
choice 14:21	74:2 76:20	37:14,17	49:8 63:12	17:7 79:5	55:6	41:18	88:20
73:5	76:21 80:9	43:21	63:21,23	commended	compelled	66:19	101:19
choices 28:21	80:12,20	117:7	68:22	55:3	71:22	100:14	102:13
70:3	81:13,22	classification	69:25	comment	compensati...	concluded	continues
choose 10:25	96:3 98:21	39:9	70:17	55:21	24:8	124:18	75:21
87:16	99:10	classificatio...	73:12,18	59:16	compete	concludes	contributions
Chromebo...	100:13	42:10	95:21,24	comments	17:21	121:20	20:17
72:10	103:14	classroom	colleges	67:8 77:12	22:21 24:5	124:11	control
circles 52:2	109:23	33:9	119:21	Commerce	114:23	conditions	125:23
circulated	113:16	clear 86:25	120:6,7,10	3:23	competing	9:14	convenient
122:7	117:5	99:8	colloquy 43:4	Commission	72:23	conference	68:2
circumstance	118:2,20	114:16	combat-wo...	20:6 51:2	113:21	72:25	conversation
112:21,22	119:5,6,8	clearly 87:17	90:7	52:5 57:4	114:11	confident	15:6 26:2
circumstan...	119:13,19	clerical 36:2	combination	commission...	115:6	58:3	46:14 50:4
112:13,15	119:20	clerk 9:4,6,15	18:15 33:7	83:8	116:12	confusion	54:5 63:2
cities 55:7	120:8,12	9:18 38:8,9	come 36:5	Commissio...	118:8	114:9	94:14
citizens 3:6	City's 7:13	67:14,16	38:14 51:8	111:25	competition	connect	102:6
50:18	8:10 17:16	client 34:8	52:5 56:25	commitment	114:17	18:24 20:2	conversatio...
68:10	18:11	close 18:5	59:10	25:21 46:7	115:10	25:17	46:4 60:8
110:24	29:24	46:24	60:13	69:11 71:8	competitions	connected	62:17
111:14	48:13	80:22 84:7	63:21 77:9	102:13,24	72:23	6:25	100:16
city 1:2,6 2:5	City-imple...	closed 61:2	78:7 85:18	103:4,11,13	competitive	connecting	102:14
3:15 7:11	116:24	closely 39:25	91:10 95:5	committed	23:14 30:6	25:24	cooperation
7:23 8:2,7	citywide	40:3,23	95:7,22	22:2	113:19,20	58:10	55:15
8:12 10:16	84:12	41:2	102:9	Committee	complete	consider 15:7	cop 83:25
10:21 11:8	civil 1:3,17	closes 75:17	111:2	1:3 2:5,10	12:15	16:19 92:8	copy 122:6
13:19,20	1:17 2:5	closing 25:20	114:22	2:11 3:2,4	18:19	121:22	Corps 104:15
14:8 15:9	5:21 6:7	clusters	comes 57:9	8:22 17:5	completed	considered	109:14
15:22,25	7:4 9:8,10	70:13	57:15 65:2	45:21 67:9	118:15	9:5 14:11	correct 30:17
16:7,23	13:24 17:5	co-sponsor	65:7 66:21	77:12 84:8	completers	45:11	30:23 32:6
17:4,12,21	18:3,17,19	8:23	81:13	100:18	73:13	considering	32:9 38:3

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
February 18, 2020

Page 4

93:25	11:4 90:6	105:6,11	critical 17:15	71:14	degrees 49:4	101:6	diploma
96:19	Councilwo...	120:24	25:10	93:22	democrat	despite 46:23	24:25
125:8	1:10,10,11	121:13,17	cross 91:10	currently	85:14	detail 34:23	direct 20:15
cost 80:9,12	1:12,13 2:2	121:25	CSEA 73:17	26:24 27:7	Democratic	62:13	125:23
83:18	2:12,19,21	122:4,12,18	CTE 3:9,11	31:19	63:17	details 30:4	direction
costs 83:18	2:22,23,25	122:21	5:10 6:7,10	37:23	demograph...	36:22	55:20
Council 1:2	8:16,17,19	123:4,13,24	7:3,15	70:10	46:25	determine	106:3
2:5 13:19	8:20 9:3,15	124:3	13:25	73:15	demograph...	4:11 35:12	109:5,17
20:7 50:6	9:22 17:8	Councilwo...	14:25	91:18	46:10	35:17	110:14
68:10	25:25 26:8	46:19	15:11,15	93:17	demonstrate	develop	directly
75:19	26:11,12	84:11	16:13	105:7,8	60:16	22:18	17:14 21:6
76:20,21	27:9 28:5	counsel 82:11	17:11 18:7	curriculum	69:20	developed	28:13
78:4 81:2,4	29:12,19	country 75:8	18:10,14,24	23:10 32:5	dent 109:2,3	74:23	29:24
84:17	30:19	County 78:3	21:2,7	curriculums	department	developer	96:13
100:4	31:23	couple 16:12	25:22	18:10	21:13	79:20	116:17
101:16	33:17,24	31:3 38:19	27:14,17,22	cutting 75:5	34:12 39:5	developing	Director
111:22	34:14 35:9	39:14	28:9 30:12	cyber 73:7	39:6 53:24	13:15 22:2	10:15,18
112:2	35:21	40:23 41:2	30:20		56:11,13	47:11	16:25 18:7
119:23	36:11,18	80:13	31:15	D	70:23 80:6	development	41:13 47:6
123:9,11,18	37:11,15,22	112:4	34:16,20	D 1:13	80:25	8:12,25	74:25
123:20	40:19 41:5	courses 71:3	35:19,25	danger 98:9	81:15	10:19 12:9	100:17,25
124:8,10	41:6,23	courseware	36:4 38:15	data 47:3	82:25	17:3 19:7	102:15
Council's	42:2,3,18	23:12	44:13,16,20	70:15,23	105:3,15	22:11 24:3	106:7
17:5	43:2 45:17	crane 36:21	45:6,13	94:23	111:23	32:21 34:5	disadvantage
111:21	45:19,22,24	38:23	52:25 57:7	date 70:25	114:24	34:11	24:16
Councilman	45:25 48:9	create 11:19	66:9 68:4	day 76:10	116:19	40:11	disagree
1:11,12,13	48:15	16:11,15	68:14,16,23	82:17 98:9	119:13,25	42:16	87:17 88:5
2:14 9:25	49:24,25	19:10	69:2,7,13	124:15	120:22	54:17,25	88:9
41:7,8	50:3,13,21	20:11	69:18,24	days 60:17	Departmenten...	57:17	disagreement
42:19,20,25	52:3 53:7	32:19	70:11,11,13	DC 58:23	21:4,9 58:5	79:21	49:22 87:9
43:13 44:4	54:10 55:9	46:11,18	70:15,18	DC33 7:25	departments	81:22	discharge
45:3,9,15	58:15	50:8,22	71:5,7,17	57:4	6:19,25	99:17	111:7
59:5,20,21	62:21 64:8	created 33:18	71:23 72:3	DC47 7:20	18:5 20:13	106:5,15,22	discharged
59:23	67:7,11,20	34:2	72:18	deal 100:15	21:21 22:4	devoted	104:16
61:25	73:20	creating 11:6	73:11 74:3	deals 88:8	30:5 34:8	101:10	discouraging
62:18,22,23	74:14,15	11:12 47:5	74:7,19,24	debate	61:21	difference	119:16
65:22,24	76:8,13,14	credential	94:21	121:10	depends	76:11 87:9	discuss 88:11
66:25 67:5	76:16 77:5	45:13	96:10 97:9	December	60:21,22	different	discussing
78:12	77:6,15	credentialed	97:10	21:15	Derek 1:12	12:2,4	87:10
82:12 85:8	79:14	15:7	99:13	decide 55:17	2:14	28:21 29:7	discussion
85:8,9	85:21	credentialing	107:2,7,13	decorum	description	36:19	16:5 82:10
93:12,13	86:15,17,18	23:12	108:2,18	86:21 88:4	50:24	40:18 59:3	discussions
94:4,11	86:20,22,24	credentials	114:11	dedicated	53:20	63:15,18	53:18
124:2	88:17,18,24	14:19 16:2	115:5,10	18:25	descriptions	66:13	dismal 105:6
Councilme...	89:6 90:2	22:20	117:16,19	deepen	32:15 52:6	72:13,16	disparaged
2:12 4:22	93:11 94:2	28:11 33:9	117:22	103:13	deserve 75:8	114:20	87:21
41:20	94:9 95:15	78:23	118:3,9,12	deficiencies	110:22	differently	dispatcher
123:2	96:17 97:6	89:25	118:17,19	7:14	design 21:21	87:6	117:20
Councilme...	98:18 99:7	credit 40:16	118:22,24	definitely	34:3 75:4	difficult	dispatchers
42:22	99:20,23,24	credit-bear...	cultures	89:7	designed 6:18	62:15	116:21
Councilme...	102:17,18	28:23	22:23	degree 49:9	desire 78:15	64:16	117:9
16:24 92:7	102:20	credits 68:22	current 14:5	49:10	119:7	diluted	dispel 4:13
111:19	103:17,23	73:12	17:16	79:16	desperate	113:21,24	4:17
Councilpeo...	104:2,8	creek 91:10	18:11 34:2	89:11,13	75:10	dime 80:9,12	disservice

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
February 18, 2020

Page 5

100:22 District 1:18 9:12 12:7 14:2,7,9,15 14:17,20 18:9,14 20:7 21:3 25:15 27:15,20 29:2 32:6 44:11,12,15 44:20 45:5 52:21 54:18 68:5 70:9 74:21 74:24 77:23 78:4 81:2 94:18 District's 17:11 18:6 diverse 16:4 80:17,21 diversity 17:19 50:16 Division 21:11 Dobbins 75:3 documents 46:6 doing 11:22 11:24 13:13 33:11 38:13 39:23 47:8 49:16,17,20 51:21 52:18 53:2 53:5,14,25 60:19 63:7 73:23 106:9 109:25 111:14 Domb 1:11 2:12 4:22 59:21,23 61:25 62:18 82:13 85:8 door 75:16 75:17,20 90:20	doors 70:6 dozen 53:10 Dr 73:16 109:18 drafted 85:16 103:6 114:21 Drexel 73:16 drive 20:9 DROP 27:7 due 71:21 Duly 122:11 123:12 duty 104:20 110:6 112:20 E e-mails 81:8 81:18 earlier 39:9 63:9 77:25 95:11 earn 22:19 24:7,22 70:5 73:12 earnings 71:4 118:13 easily 64:18 64:18 66:16 East 81:22 Eastman 78:18,20 96:21 103:22 echo 76:18 102:22 economical 68:17 72:19 ED 101:19 edge 75:5 Edouard 73:16 educate 15:14 educated 70:3 71:9 85:22 education 1:18 9:11 10:21,23 12:10	13:20,22 15:15 18:8 18:15 22:7 23:7 24:21 30:9,16 33:15 36:13 37:5 57:12 70:24 71:3 72:8 101:23 106:6 118:10,23 educational 68:12,19 educators 70:2 101:7 effect 16:18 98:21 114:6 effectively 18:24 effort 3:17 4:3,8 8:8 26:4 efforts 20:9 46:24 eight 20:20 70:24 either 40:10 45:12 109:10 elected 55:16 82:18 109:23,24 elections 105:23 electors 8:6 electrician 35:5 eligible 13:6 18:16 26:25 27:6 29:9 43:9 43:10,14,15 97:9 eliminate 19:14 21:23 eliminating 28:20 62:4 embrace 50:11 emphasize	52:17 employ 4:2 employed 21:19 82:7 employees 7:23 8:2 25:9 26:24 46:23 78:3 employer 15:10,25 16:8 19:8 19:18,19 20:19 21:17,22 22:16,24 25:3,5 28:19 33:23 34:2 34:4 55:2 55:18 56:24 106:14 employer's 39:25 employers 24:9 employment 7:6 8:9 14:12 17:12 18:25 19:11,16 20:3,11 21:17,24 22:9 24:18 25:19,24 50:9 62:10 103:2 109:15 118:21 encompass 29:3 encountered 116:22 encourage 3:10 15:10 69:13 87:25 encouraged 120:17 encouraging 7:18 76:25 ends 34:9 enforcement	11:23 enlistment 97:4,7 enroll 15:11 enrolled 70:11 ensure 15:22 18:9,13 25:6 ensuring 17:20 32:3 102:24 entails 83:10 entered 28:22 114:21 entering 91:16 entertain 35:14 entire 115:23 entities 34:6 entitled 1:16 9:8 entity 54:18 entry 37:24 entry-level 37:14,20 38:5 39:7 environment 23:14 equipment 36:20,25 37:3 38:22 equitable 72:2 equity 17:18 equivalence 117:21 equivalency 25:2 equivalent 37:5 erodes 91:24 error-free 23:18 especially 3:6 43:20 74:18 83:2 100:16 101:2,8,21 essential 22:8 23:10 established	60:23 61:3 estate 82:11 et 80:7,7 82:8 82:8 114:13 everybody 51:12,12,13 81:21 85:9 evidence 125:4 evolve 47:8 evolved 46:6 evolving 110:15 exact 82:19 exactly 29:17 47:14 exam 18:22 30:3 57:7 69:13 96:4 96:9 105:16 examination 61:4 example 38:8 60:23 70:21 101:6,11 examples 29:25 72:5 exams 18:17 exceed 22:24 excel 24:5 excellent 47:18 49:23 exception 113:22 exceptional 112:12,14 112:21 116:6 exceptions 112:17 excited 89:15 exclude 6:18 15:17 excluded 44:17 Excuse 41:23 42:23 executive 18:7 58:24 59:12 63:4	100:17,25 102:15 exempt 46:22 exhausted 43:20 exist 43:22 51:4 69:22 99:18 existence 20:24 92:17 exists 15:20 expanding 40:9,11 expectations 22:25 expected 70:25 expects 7:2 experience 24:23 30:9 30:16 31:17,17 32:4 33:5 33:10,16 36:14,24 37:3,7,8 38:17,21 57:11 63:15 69:17 70:19 76:21 89:24 101:8 107:11 experienced 89:2,8 experiences 18:16 63:14 expire 43:10 43:11,16,19 explain 13:4 60:16 Explorers 6:20 99:3 exposure 75:12 express 74:16 103:12 extent 64:12 external 23:11 39:4	extra 38:16 118:20 extraordin... 75:3 extremely 62:15 F F 111:20 face 19:15 109:12 faced 109:13 facilitate 23:15 facilitates 19:25 facilities 63:19 facing 109:7 fact 35:10 47:24 49:2 50:10 66:7 110:21 116:25 factors 87:11 facts 4:17 fair 84:12 118:6 families 113:14 114:3 family 105:4 109:16 113:2,10,15 famous 109:20 far 27:22 85:21 far-reaching 90:13 fastest 85:25 FastTrack 46:17 53:23 favor 119:23 122:15 123:21 favorable 123:7,16 124:7 FBI 73:10 fear 5:25 February 1:7 68:14
---	--	--	--	---	---	---	--

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
February 18, 2020

Page 6

Federation	108:21	99:11	38:18 39:8	107:7,15	80:10	14:18	94:4,11
78:2	116:10	110:12	41:2 74:10	108:8	83:11,12,17	96:12	groundbre...
feeding 101:3	123:9,18	form 14:5	82:11	111:4	83:19,21	114:13	19:8 55:2
feel 10:4	124:9	54:14 56:7	generation	112:10	84:14,15	graduates	group 90:18
11:12	firsthand	98:4	102:3,4	113:8	86:13 87:4	1:18 5:6,11	91:24
51:10 58:3	15:2	former 14:24	Genius 73:4	117:16	91:9 93:3,5	6:10 9:11	92:15
67:22	Fiscal 19:9	104:14,17	George 90:6	gives 66:4	94:25 95:3	18:24 20:3	groups 4:11
71:22	fitter 83:5	108:2	getting 27:23	95:19	95:6 97:20	23:18 24:4	80:21
78:13	five 5:10,14	forms 79:10	38:15 46:8	109:6	99:11	24:15	grow 69:22
88:11 90:3	38:16	forth 39:6	51:10	118:10	105:21,24	25:16	growth 70:7
111:3	91:23 92:2	40:16 50:3	61:16	giving 38:13	109:11	63:21 66:9	guarantee
feels 90:18	92:23	fortunate	81:25	40:16	110:25	94:16,19	32:22
fell 81:14,16	93:20	89:22	97:19	51:22	116:5,15	99:12	guarantees
fellow 3:3	94:14	forward 6:9	102:8	52:13	117:13	114:12	31:14
field 16:14	95:10	8:10 27:11	115:11	105:19	good 2:2,25	118:7,7,12	guess 10:24
18:17	96:11	54:3,8	117:7	111:11,12	10:11 13:8	graduating	28:15
figure 57:10	97:21	99:11	118:4	go 3:12 10:25	13:18	8:9 30:12	49:25 60:2
fill 7:13 20:2	98:14	100:3	119:25	28:13	16:23	96:8	64:11
20:16 25:7	105:19	104:3	120:3	33:20 49:8	17:21	graduation	guidance
25:12	113:21,24	found 80:8	giddy 74:5	49:9 50:12	53:22 64:8	5:12 6:13	24:19
116:2,9,15	117:23	foundation	Gilmore 1:11	55:19 61:5	67:20 68:3	14:13	guy 82:16
filled 21:20	five/ten 95:3	25:4	2:13,23	61:22 62:2	78:19 79:3	70:25	guys 51:24
116:4	flashbacks	four 4:2 5:24	8:17 17:8	62:13 65:5	85:18	grandchild	Gym 1:12
filling 116:18	77:7	60:24 62:7	25:25	65:7 66:13	111:18	112:18	45:20
117:6,12	Fleet 20:22	65:6 97:5,7	26:11	74:21	124:15	grandchild..	74:14,15
finally 49:11	56:11	frankly 48:2	41:20 42:2	78:18 82:3	goodwill	5:17	76:8 86:15
108:7	flexibility	free 10:4	43:2 55:10	83:15 84:3	51:18	grant 23:2	86:19,20,24
find 7:5	16:8 49:19	67:22	76:14 77:6	85:2 86:3	gotten 118:16	79:22	88:18
56:18	63:10 64:5	78:13 90:4	79:14	95:20,21,24	government	graphic 75:4	99:23,24
63:23	flexible 47:25	friendly	88:24	95:25	33:21	great 3:15	
105:4	48:21 64:2	82:15	102:18	96:22	58:20 59:2	15:6,14	H
finished	65:9	front 55:5	121:25	101:4,23	61:15,18	27:10	Hackney
79:16	focus 19:2	frustration	123:2	107:21	89:2 99:19	56:21	9:19 10:20
finite 82:4	55:10	50:10	Ginder 90:5	113:17	111:9	57:25	10:20
Fire 6:19	61:15 71:5	fully 125:5	90:6 96:16	120:9,16	governmen...	59:11 68:9	13:18,19
31:6	118:17	funded 79:22	97:15	121:21	62:14	68:10 74:2	27:13 28:2
firefighter	focused	funds 23:3	98:23	goal 8:10	grade 14:22	85:20	28:6 29:15
39:11 83:4	23:10 71:2	Furry 85:13	103:25	26:16	27:23 37:6	119:23	41:12 44:5
84:2	focuses 21:5	85:14	Girl 71:16	115:21	71:18 73:3	121:3	44:9 45:7
112:19	folks 46:11	further 42:7	girls 74:7	goals 11:5	107:25	greater 63:20	45:10
Firefighters	51:2 59:13	103:13	give 8:8	50:14	graduate 7:3	68:14	half 61:10
98:7	101:2	123:8,17	11:13 27:5	115:22	15:12	79:18,19	106:18
fires 98:8	follow 15:24	future 21:9	27:25 28:3	goes 86:10	27:23	greatness	Hall 1:6
first 4:18	42:21 43:4	56:12 66:9	44:7 51:25	going 6:9	45:12 57:8	69:21	81:22
6:17 9:16	44:5 62:25	71:7 72:2	52:17	10:25	70:16	Green 1:12	hampered
9:23 10:25	94:5	76:24	70:20	31:19	73:18	2:14 41:7,8	119:6
19:5 26:13	follow-on		74:11 76:4	33:20	75:16	42:19,20,25	hand 51:7
54:24	97:3	G	85:6 88:10	46:14 50:5	91:14	43:13 44:4	79:23
73:23	following	gained 71:21	91:23	50:25 51:9	95:13 97:8	45:3,9,15	109:6
76:21	17:15	72:7,9	105:9	53:24 54:5	97:11	59:5,21	handout
78:19	food 80:11	gap 22:15	116:12	57:19	99:14	62:22,23	111:12
97:24 98:6	foregoing	GED 118:7	117:18	63:12,13	117:19	65:24	hands 54:16
100:2	125:7,20	gender 17:18	given 39:12	66:23 67:2	118:8	66:25 67:5	hands-on
108:19,20	forever 33:20	general 31:3	66:2,8	74:11 77:9	graduated	93:12,13	33:16

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
February 18, 2020

Page 7

happen 13:11 31:25 34:9	Hershey 73:2	112:12 116:23	I	33:8 69:6	instruction 19:25 23:9	Ireland 58:2	117:17
happened 79:11	hesitant 11:22	118:14	idea 83:3,9	individuals 88:13	instructor 68:5	issue 8:25	jobseekers 22:6 24:12
109:9	hesitation 13:13	119:4,8	84:11	113:8	instructors 108:2	17:10	24:14,20
happening 82:20	48:19	historically 48:7	ideas 114:20	industries 74:6	instrument 37:9	50:20,21	25:22 34:7
happens 32:8	49:13	history 111:8	identified 12:16	industry 15:23	intact 6:23	55:8 56:18	Joe 78:19
55:16,25	hey 66:22	hold 100:12	98:17	45:13	intelligence 87:10	95:3,4	85:14
57:16	81:11	101:13	identify 16:6	65:19 69:5	intelligent 85:23	issues 17:12	Johns 67:17
happy 16:21	83:14	holds 117:11	identifying 97:16	72:25	intended 26:16	17:18	68:7,7
26:6 55:3	high 5:6 11:7	home 54:22	98:13	73:13 74:9	intent 51:13	41:18	71:13,14
hard 4:13	11:14	58:18	immediately 59:4	industry-dr... 70:19	52:7 55:23	54:19	76:7,12
35:16	13:12	85:18	impact 4:11	industry-le... 3:13 69:9	97:23	87:15	join 7:12
83:25	14:23,24	88:22	14:5 16:7	industry-re... 28:23	interaction 120:20	items 41:16	joined 78:25
87:23	21:2,7	89:22	68:16 69:2	industry-re... 22:20	interdepart... 55:14	Ivy 89:20	joining 8:21
hardship 6:2	24:15,25	honest 49:21	90:14	inflexibility 66:10	interest 8:24	J	8:25
harness 20:8	25:23	78:24	impacting 17:19	inform 18:11	17:9 73:6,9	J 1:13	Jonathan 77:21
hate 29:4	45:11	honor 68:9	implement 13:16 51:5	71:22	interested 84:15	Jackson 85:16	juncture 97:22
hear 2:7	49:15 57:8	97:25	64:6	information 18:18	Interim 10:15	Jacobs 77:21	K
75:24	58:8 69:15	98:16	important 11:14 17:7	41:24	41:12	Jihad 104:11	K 4:4
80:13 84:9	71:3,15	102:7,8,10	17:15	86:16,18	internal 38:24	job 16:15	Kareem 73:16
87:23 88:6	76:22 86:5	honorably 104:16	23:22 46:4	93:16	internally 103:10	19:25	KATHERL... 1:11
heard 3:8	90:15	honored 98:8	87:4 88:4	infrastruct... 23:4	79:20,21	23:10,14,15	keep 54:5
4:25 5:13	94:16,18,19	hope 34:10	101:12	inhibits 64:4	82:2 83:4,5	23:19 31:2	57:20
79:9 81:9	95:5 96:5,8	53:16	impression 52:18	initial 96:24	83:9,12,14	32:15	74:11 79:6
81:18	96:12	74:11,12	60:19	97:4	84:12 96:3	40:13 42:9	79:6 84:5
94:13	98:11	hopes 71:25	in-demand 22:18	Initially 5:12	102:2	50:24	105:8
99:16	113:4	hospital 108:15	include 20:21	initiative 19:8,13	104:19	51:21 52:6	110:14,15
100:4	high-quality 20:3 24:18	hospitality 21:10	16:13	injured 104:20	105:4	52:12	KENDRA 1:10
115:25	58:10	56:14	improve 24:15	inside 82:7	107:11	53:20 54:7	Kenney 3:21
118:11	higher 24:7	Hour 73:4	inclusion 47:2	inspire 17:14	109:10	60:3,7 62:3	kept 79:23
121:23	71:4	hours 3:12	inclusive 51:16	instance 36:19	116:14	63:23	107:5,20
hearing 2:3,4	highest 16:3	70:14	income 24:22	institutiona... 56:19	117:2,10	79:20,21	key 58:9
2:7 73:23	highlighted 38:20	107:14	inconsequ... 115:8	instituti... 58:12	118:15	82:2 83:4,5	kids 86:2
77:15	83:20	108:23,25	increase 25:11	institutiona... 56:23	job-specific 19:23	83:9,12,14	killed 110:10
119:15	hire 83:16,17	HR 10:15	increased 103:2	institutiona... 58:21	jobs 3:10	84:12 96:3	112:20
121:20	83:19 84:3	41:12 47:6	increasing 27:14	institutiona... 56:5 58:25	17:21	102:2	kind 43:3
heart 92:8	119:21	52:4 54:13	individual		22:22 24:5	104:19	62:9 79:8
Heavy 36:20	120:14	65:12			30:2 38:3	105:4	79:10,23
held 108:3	hired 38:10	99:18			58:10 62:5	107:11	84:6 90:11
Helen 1:12	39:3 60:5	115:14			81:21 82:4	109:10	90:20 91:2
45:20	104:23	Human 11:11			102:9	116:14	92:11,20
Hello 85:13	114:25	20:5 29:24			113:17	117:2,10	100:11
90:5	117:7	40:12 57:3				118:15	kinds 59:18
help 85:25	119:7,12	61:20				job-specific 19:23	King 109:18
116:5,15	120:20	106:6				jobs 3:10	know 4:24
118:20	hires 100:20	hurt 5:5				17:21	10:5 11:4
helper 35:4	hiring 13:23	113:14				22:22 24:5	14:25
40:15	34:4 46:8	hurts 113:12				30:2 38:3	15:20 28:2
52:19,24	82:23 84:9	113:15				58:10 62:5	
helpful 18:23	100:19					81:21 82:4	
27:10	105:7					102:9	
helping 102:3						113:17	

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
February 18, 2020

Page 8

29:16	54:1 55:1	lag 119:22	32:8 41:19	98:4,5,10	looking 13:9	man 105:3	meaningful...
34:25	56:1 57:1	laid 25:4	42:7 43:6	104:20	31:12 39:7	108:23,25	58:4
48:24	58:1 59:1	56:10 91:8	47:12	112:20	39:23	109:13	means 75:25
50:20 54:4	60:1,24	language	54:15	lines 79:12	40:13	manage	91:19
56:12	61:1 62:1	28:8 31:9	55:23	list 13:6	49:12	23:23	100:12
59:17 60:7	63:1,17	31:14	63:25 64:4	34:19	60:18,21	Manageme...	101:15
74:4 76:24	64:1 65:1	lapsed 95:23	66:3 68:13	35:16	64:19	20:22	125:22
77:8,9	66:1 67:1	large 38:2	68:15,20	43:10 44:2	65:11	manager	meant 7:10
79:17	68:1 69:1	82:11 87:9	70:4 71:6	60:24 61:2	68:18	72:10	median 25:8
82:14	70:1 71:1	larger 7:25	72:2 103:7	97:12	looks 60:14	79:21	71:4
86:24	72:1 73:1	8:8	112:5	Listed 72:5	losers 16:11	managers	meet 4:20
87:22	74:1 75:1	lasting 13:6	116:15	listen 75:23	44:7 45:2	49:5	36:12
89:22 92:3	76:1 77:1	lasts 6:12,15	121:23	84:13	losing 97:21	manner	50:14,16
92:16,18	78:1 79:1	launched	legislative	listened 5:8	lost 121:5	59:17	91:21 96:6
99:2 100:3	80:1 81:1	19:9	55:10 63:5	73:24	lot 11:18 12:2	106:11	meeting
101:16	82:1 83:1	law 11:24	66:19	listening 63:2	32:13,18	MARIA 1:13	17:16
102:5	84:1 85:1	47:10	103:5	85:10	39:4 40:8	Marie 67:16	48:25
103:3	86:1 87:1	65:18	legislatively	104:24	47:7 48:4	68:4	80:15 91:4
110:19	88:1 89:1	93:22	115:19	106:3	51:17 61:4	Marine	121:21
111:5,6,6,7	90:1 91:1	lawsuits	lending 59:10	lists 43:11,14	65:17	104:14	meets 113:22
119:2	92:1 93:1	115:2	length 62:10	43:16	80:20 84:9	109:14	member 8:22
121:4,8	94:1 95:1	lead 14:12	119:11	little 11:22	99:14	Market	9:25 10:7
known 80:20	96:1 97:1	19:5 28:11	lens 65:12	24:19 48:3	love 70:8	81:21	78:12
L	98:1 99:1	leader 55:16	lesser 6:8	74:5 100:8	78:22	marketable	89:23
L 1:10 125:14	100:1	61:9	let's 15:13	115:15	101:18	15:13	92:14
Lab 73:17	101:1	leaders 69:25	16:4 82:24	live 4:6 14:16	120:21	23:13	104:14
labor 1:3 2:1	102:1	leadership	92:9,22,25	29:5 44:23	low 113:5	Master's	105:15
2:5 3:1 4:1	103:1	58:2 72:9	93:8 94:20	lives 98:4,5	114:2,3	49:10	106:25
5:1 6:1 7:1	104:1	73:25	letter 7:22	98:10	lower 24:23	89:12	111:21,22
7:14 8:1	105:1	89:19	77:23	110:11	lowered 5:14	match 96:6	members
9:1 10:1	106:1	League 89:20	level 5:7 22:7	living 17:23	M	math 91:14	2:10,10 3:3
11:1 12:1	107:1	learn 22:22	37:24 56:4	22:9	Madam 41:9	91:16 92:2	3:4 13:19
13:1 14:1	108:1	33:8 69:10	75:25 88:4	local 22:5	45:16 54:9	matter 32:7	45:19 67:8
15:1 16:1	109:1	learned	107:25	57:4 120:6	59:24	36:4 38:14	77:12
17:1,5 18:1	110:1	46:20 73:6	108:6,7	locals 20:7	62:20,24	58:20	101:20
19:1 20:1,7	111:1	92:13,15	leverage	long 38:17	67:6 76:17	110:22	109:22
21:1 22:1	112:1	112:1	68:18	43:22 50:5	86:15 87:7	113:25	113:10,15
23:1 24:1	113:1	33:11	life 44:2	64:21,23	88:3,16	125:7	122:8
25:1 26:1	114:1	leave 3:14	98:12	92:17	93:14	Mayor 3:21	men 84:21,24
27:1 28:1	115:1	70:22	104:25	96:13,19	95:16	68:9	110:9
29:1 30:1	116:1	73:13	life-sustaini...	longer 56:2	102:16,21	Mayor's	mentioned
31:1 32:1	117:1	leaving 6:22	22:8 70:5	83:21 97:9	111:19	10:22 12:9	31:5 38:20
33:1 34:1	118:1	led 28:15	lifetime 6:15	look 11:9	122:5	13:21 20:6	52:19
35:1 36:1	119:1	leeway	lifetimes	27:5 28:18	123:5	mean 30:21	64:14 74:8
37:1 38:1	120:1	115:18	24:23	32:11	major 61:15	33:22 44:8	91:3
39:1 40:1	121:1	left 2:12 8:19	lightly 121:9	39:21	56:10 59:8	51:15	merely 24:25
41:1 42:1	122:1	45:19	limit 5:18	40:22,25	66:12 88:5	65:13	message 10:9
43:1 44:1	123:1	104:19	31:8 47:13	46:7 58:23	14:14	95:13	met 4:9 6:16
45:1,20	124:1,12,17	leg 118:10	limitations	87:5,6 92:8	MakerSpace	100:21	80:8 85:22
46:1 47:1	lack 21:24,25	legacy 5:7,16	48:6	93:8	72:15	meaningful	method 69:4
48:1 49:1	21:25 22:6	5:23 6:3,14	limits 47:10	101:20	makeup 7:17	3:25 15:5	metrics
50:1 51:1	119:14	legislation	48:4 52:12	104:3	making 10:8	20:17	105:14
52:1 53:1	ladder 17:24	4:12,24 6:2	54:7	106:12	13:11	21:23	Michael
	lady 78:21	6:20 8:5	line 13:10	109:2,8,25	28:18 40:4		10:14

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
February 18, 2020

Page 9

MICHELE 125:14	month 68:14 90:17	nation 55:7 121:4	nimble 16:9	116:22	okay 10:6	38:24	13:19
Michelle 18:6	months 5:12	national 70:13	nine 95:25	obstacles 47:5	41:5 62:18	50:17	outside 52:8
28:2	13:7,8 43:6	108:9	96:16,17,18	116:24	66:25 67:5	69:22	overall 69:19
mid- 49:4	43:7,12,14	nature 12:19	Nolan 46:21	117:5	83:24	71:20 72:6	overheard 82:13,14
middle 80:19	43:17,18	30:6	non-exempt 46:23	obviously 38:5	old 25:9	103:2	overlap 6:9
Mike 9:18	61:11	100:11	non-School 45:5	Occupation... 68:24	older 25:13	4:20 14:20	oversight 107:5
miliary 79:3	93:22	101:14	non-veteran 119:9	occupations 108:3	on-the-job 18:16 33:5	21:25 26:5	108:13
95:21	95:19	navigate 24:16	normal 43:9	occurred 55:3	33:16	69:11,20	
military	119:14,15	Navy 78:20	notable 20:21	October 114:19,22	onboard 23:5	70:5 75:13	P
78:23,25	119:15	83:6,7	note 23:22	offense 105:18	once 64:15	105:2	p.m 1:7
79:15	morning 3:2	nearly 5:20	45:18	offer 17:23	82:4	opposed 13:14	124:18
84:23	35:15 42:5	necessarily 82:2 84:10	54:12,20	87:18	118:14	32:17	PA 73:2
91:16	motion 122:2	25:18	77:18	122:5	one-time 83:16	50:11 65:8	panel 9:16,23
93:18,23	122:16,22	87:13	89:10	offering 50:17	one-to-one 114:6	66:14 85:3	67:15
94:8,25	123:3,22	need 15:7	118:25	offers 22:10	onerous 115:16	86:8 91:12	100:3
95:8,12,25	124:4	16:3 22:5	notes 8:18	office 10:18	ones 20:21	115:17	121:7
96:3,12,13	move 7:8	30:13	125:6	10:22	31:7 36:19	118:21	panels 10:2
96:14 97:2	8:10 27:11	36:23	noting 54:13	11:11 12:9	120:6	122:19	78:11
97:13	49:3 50:8	42:12,14	nuclear 96:22,23	13:21 17:2	ongoing 3:17	123:25	paragraph 98:13,17,25
101:11	54:8 82:5	46:25	number 8:2	17:4 20:5,6	online 23:19	opposite 82:19	parents 68:18
114:21	108:5,6	51:14	27:3,5,7,25	20:22	73:8	opposition 80:16	Parker 1:10
120:7	120:13	57:20 63:9	29:17 30:5	29:24	open 20:16	optic 50:20	2:2,19,22
million	122:8	65:5,19	41:18	31:25 34:6	21:20 30:2	option 15:18	3:2 8:15,16
108:25	123:5,8	69:19	60:14	34:10	34:24	options 8:9	9:15,22
mind 10:8	moved 122:13	75:10,12	63:15	35:11 38:8	35:17	68:19 70:7	26:8 41:6
84:6 105:8	123:14,17	79:4 81:6,7	74:20	40:12,21	53:18	order 2:4	41:23
Mine 73:7	moves 54:3	91:5 101:6	105:25	47:8 54:16	75:18,21	59:22	42:18
minimum	multi-pron... 4:3	103:12	114:2,3,4	57:2,16,20	79:13	ordinance 1:16 9:7	45:17
30:7,15	municipal 7:12 63:17	116:2	numbers 28:4 50:15	61:20 82:8	88:10	12:12 13:2	54:10
36:13	78:3	118:19	51:14,15	99:16,17	93:21	36:8,9	58:15
mirrors	municipal-f... 19:6 54:24	needed 18:19	81:17	103:7,10	opening 2:16	64:17	62:21 67:7
68:20	MURPHY 125:14	32:4	numerous 107:4	106:5	2:20 16:15	66:14	67:11,20
misinforma...	N	needs 16:9	O	officer 10:21	31:5 70:6	ordinary 116:8	73:20
4:14,17 5:4	Naderia 67:17 68:7	18:12	o'clock 35:15	13:20	90:20	organization 79:17	76:13 77:5
misled 82:20	71:13	28:18	O'Neill 1:13	78:20	operation 37:9	82:12	86:17,22
82:20	73:20 74:4	29:10 75:9	3:3 9:25	104:18	operational 23:4	90:18	88:17
misunderst...	75:23	91:6	10:7 45:21	106:6	operator 36:20,25	108:9	93:11
36:8	76:20	neighborho... 14:17 29:6	78:13 85:8	112:3,19	37:4 38:23	organizatio... 22:23	99:20
model 19:7	name 10:12	neighborho... 44:23	124:2	119:11	opinion 111:3	organizatio... 4:10 49:3	102:17
19:19	16:24 58:5	net 15:8	objections 125:4	120:18	opportunities 11:6,13	65:13,14,17	103:17,23
20:19	67:23	new 76:3	objectives 17:15 18:2	official 82:18	15:2,15,21	90:9 99:4	104:2,8
21:17,22	71:13 78:9	101:21	observe 72:22	officials 63:18	20:12	original 93:20	120:24
22:16 25:3	78:19	107:17	obstacle	offline 62:12	22:11,17	Otis 9:18	121:13,17
33:23,25	85:13 90:6	108:14		oh 81:6 85:8	32:20	10:20	122:12,18
54:25	104:9,11	119:19					122:21
55:18	111:7	newly 14:18					123:13,24
56:23		news 110:8					124:3
106:14,14							parking 80:22
modernized							
74:22							
moment 27:3							
money 80:11							
83:22							

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
February 18, 2020

Page 10

Parks 21:13 56:15 parochial 14:10 27:17 part 3:16 8:8 14:7 32:11 39:22 40:7 44:19 47:25 48:5 50:20 72:7 75:19 102:6 participants 19:21 20:12 22:17 23:6 23:8,13,17 23:24 70:20 participate 72:16 participating 21:21 particular 28:7,9 44:18 particularly 46:5 54:20 88:21 112:11 115:16 121:6 partnership 18:6 25:15 partnerships 20:4 55:14 passion 15:24 69:21 path 11:2 111:13 pathway 15:16 22:13 24:7 24:13 33:3 33:13 pathways 14:12 17:10 19:10 20:20 21:14 24:10 32:17	56:15 patience 124:14 Patient 108:14 Pavilion 108:14 pay 17:22 58:22 80:11 83:18 pays 22:9 Penn 108:19 108:20,21 Pennsylvania 1:6 108:17 people 45:4 54:21 58:10,17 62:2,5,9 75:11,18,21 79:4 80:21 80:21 84:25 87:8 87:20 88:7 88:12 89:16,22 91:24 93:4 95:20,24 97:25 98:17 101:7 102:7 106:8,15,17 107:10 108:3 109:7,10,12 109:23 110:3,7,22 114:4 116:11,23 116:25 117:3,7,9 119:22 people's 110:3 percent 5:22 21:18,19 37:23 85:20 100:20 perception 64:11 perfect 64:10	65:21 67:3 period 93:24 95:23 permanent 19:10 21:16 34:11 permit 123:9 123:18 124:9 person 30:12 36:23 80:8 91:21 94:7 95:9 105:19,22 personal 75:24 personalized 23:24 personnel 116:19,20 perspective 17:6,25 26:15 27:20 48:20 59:6 64:20 65:2 65:23 66:16,20 94:6 101:17 Pew 60:9 Philadelphia 1:2,6,16,19 3:7,11,15 7:12,16,24 8:7,13 9:8 9:13 10:16 10:22 13:21 14:2 14:6 15:9 17:20 19:17 21:3 21:12 25:23 26:3 27:16 29:11 44:13,15 50:17 55:5 63:20 68:6 68:11 69:14,19 70:10 71:10,15	72:21 74:2 77:23 79:19 80:5 80:25 85:14 86:5 93:4 98:22 99:10 101:10 103:14 104:12,17 109:24 112:3 117:6 119:5 120:18 Philadelphi... 7:17 19:5 Philadelphi... 46:11 Philadelphi... 19:13 21:16 22:3 86:11 Philly 21:9 philosophic... 26:14 pick 82:24,25 piece 4:7 pilot 61:12 pipefitter 83:6 pipeline 3:19 3:20 20:15 22:3 25:6 46:12 57:24 75:13 101:3 109:7 pipelines 11:12 31:22 50:9 50:16 place 59:14 80:15,19 115:5 116:11 placed 106:16 108:20 117:5 placement 20:2 23:15 placements	21:19 places 75:3 plan 25:14 platforms 68:17 play 88:15 plays 105:10 please 4:16 9:16 10:11 67:14,22 71:6 78:7 88:9 90:3 92:8 93:7 104:8 pleased 55:5 pleasure 19:4 75:23 pledge 103:14 plumber 83:6 84:2 point 5:10 41:24 46:19 50:2 61:17 70:23 86:16,18,20 90:25 91:25 92:2 93:15,18,21 93:23 95:3 95:10,11,18 97:8 104:22 105:9,19,22 112:9 113:18 117:23 points 5:17 18:4,22 38:16 69:12 90:19 91:19,20,23 92:22,23 94:15,15 96:11 97:21 98:2 98:2,14 99:5 100:13 101:15 105:21 113:20,24	113:25 116:13 police 6:19 31:6 39:11 80:5,25 81:2,15 82:25 83:4 98:8,8 104:18 105:2,15 111:23 112:3,18 114:19,24 116:18,20 117:8,20 119:11,13 119:24 120:18 police/fire 12:22 policy 3:23 16:6 pool 38:2 populations 19:15 portal 29:25 position 30:15,17,22 32:12 36:3 36:15,17 37:4 38:17 39:16 43:25 47:20 60:22,25 64:6 112:24 114:23 117:20 118:9 position's 61:2 positions 7:5 12:21 13:24 16:3 19:22 23:16 25:12 29:21,22 30:25 31:13,20 32:4 33:7 34:22,23,25 35:17,18	37:20,21,24 38:5,6,19 38:21 39:4 39:7,15,19 40:4,15 42:9 43:21 43:23 52:16 60:11,15 79:13 108:12 116:7 positive 69:3 possible 58:20 75:7 87:5 post 68:12 post-secon... 23:7 24:21 postpone 90:11 92:9 93:7 potential 17:13 poverty 8:11 17:19 58:7 power 59:13 96:22,23 powerful 68:13,17 70:23 powers 50:23 practical 22:14 practices 65:16 105:7 pre 68:11 pre-dates 64:23,24 predatory 59:9 predicated 57:22 preference 1:17 3:9 5:10,15,23 5:24 6:7,9 6:12,14,22 6:23,24 7:4 9:10 12:14 12:15,19 13:8,23 15:19	16:14 18:3 27:14 30:11,21 34:16 35:24 36:4 36:10 38:13 44:21,24 45:6,8 52:14 66:2 66:8 85:19 86:3 90:19 91:19,25 92:2,21,23 93:19,21,24 94:22 95:10 97:10,25 98:2,14 99:12 100:13 101:14 104:22 105:9,20 107:8,16 111:5,11 113:18 115:5,11 116:13 117:19 118:2 119:17 preferences 1:17 9:9 12:3 15:22 39:12 52:15 98:20 99:9 99:18 112:10,10 113:7 116:4 117:13,16 prepare 24:4 prepared 88:25 prepares 19:20 preparing 25:12,23 prerequisite 16:2 presence 2:9 8:19
--	---	--	---	---	--	--	--

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
February 18, 2020

Page 11

present 1:9 34:13 68:9	67:24 78:9 90:4	73:11 89:20	71:23 72:4 74:20 75:4	provides 17:22	44:21 57:6 57:12	reading 86:14	69:12 70:14
presented 35:15	104:10	90:16	75:4,14	19:23	105:13,24	123:10,19	91:18,20
Presently 25:8	proceedings 125:4	91:15	79:23	22:10	quality 24:5	124:9	99:5
President 78:2 84:18	process 5:2	92:13,16,25	98:24	72:18	question 8:6	reads 91:13	received 5:4
85:16	14:23	96:10 97:2	99:13,15	providing 33:4 57:23	27:12	ready 23:6	42:4
pretend 67:3	18:20	97:9,23	101:23	public 2:4,6	29:20 47:9	27:23	receiving 98:14
75:15	43:12	99:6 101:4	107:6	3:4 20:18	47:18	28:12	recognize 2:9
pretty 43:24	50:22 61:4	106:14,15	prohibits 51:21	22:4 23:16	49:24	68:25 70:2	recognizes 2:23 26:10
83:8	61:13,23	107:2,9,13	project 72:10	80:22 89:3	56:22	70:16	45:23
prevent 15:4	62:2 66:13	107:17	73:3	89:14	59:25 64:8	73:19	71:19
previous 105:17	85:4 96:20	108:2,18,19	108:14	100:4	65:25 92:4	81:12	recognizes 41:7,25
121:7	113:20	108:20,21	projected 17:17	101:5	94:5,12	84:25	42:19
principal 14:25	115:16,24	110:23,25	18:11	102:2	98:19	real 46:7 79:8	59:20
principally 63:16	118:21	118:19	promises 82:17	107:6,20	108:17	real-world 70:19	62:22
prior 91:3,15	119:8	program-s... 14:13	promotional 37:21	117:24	questions 12:13	realized 89:15	74:13
120:3	120:16	programmi... 11:18,20	38:24	118:6	16:22 26:7	really 13:10	76:14
prioritized 51:8	processes 18:9 61:24	13:15	promulgati... 47:11	121:20,21	26:20,21	13:13	93:12
priority 53:15	procure 23:11	32:14	properly 122:13	public-sector 19:18 25:5	41:10	32:16	99:22
prison 109:8	produce 28:12	40:10,11	123:14	pull 29:23	42:22 43:3	39:17 46:7	102:18
109:11	productive 111:13	57:16	proposal 43:7	pulled 59:8	67:8 77:11	46:10	121:24
111:13	professional 24:3	programs 1:18 6:24	proposed 16:17	purpose 2:6	90:22	49:13 50:8	122:25
private 7:6	professionals 33:12	7:15 9:12	41:16 56:6	pushed 49:11	121:11	51:19 55:4	recommen... 123:7,16
14:9 27:16	program 6:21 7:3	10:18	proposing 50:14 52:4	pushing 49:8	quick 26:19	60:6,20	124:7
private-sec... 19:22	11:6 12:24	11:13 12:6	55:12	49:9	quickly 79:8	61:12	record 8:18
23:16	19:7,20	14:10,25	protection 59:6	put 5:6 8:5	101:24	62:13 64:8	9:3 10:12
proactively 57:2	20:24 21:5	15:12 17:2	proud 104:13	13:4 50:3	119:22	75:6 76:10	45:18
probably 28:3 31:7	21:9,10,14	17:11	104:16	59:13 65:3	Quinones-S... 1:13 45:22	88:14 95:2	54:13,14
38:10	23:2 24:14	18:10	106:25	66:12	quite 46:14	95:4 100:5	56:7,17
39:14	27:8 28:8	20:21	prove 58:4	80:10 86:2	47:22 48:2	105:10	67:23
40:24 83:3	28:24 29:8	22:13,15	proven 24:11	86:6 98:4,5	quorum 2:10	107:22	77:19 78:9
83:11,16,17	29:21 30:6	23:23	provide 1:17	112:7	quote 109:18	109:2	88:20
83:19	30:13	25:17	9:9 12:3	115:14	109:19	reason 13:3,4	89:10
94:25	33:18,20	27:15,16,17	15:15 16:7	putting 57:18	R	34:15 40:7	104:9
115:4	35:19 36:4	27:19,22	22:16 23:8	63:5 85:24	rac 110:10	71:22 76:5	110:16
problem 110:21	37:19	28:9,10,11	33:5,13	86:9 93:3	racial 17:19	84:19 86:8	111:20
111:10	44:13,16,20	31:15 33:3	57:13	98:10	raise 102:4	90:12 93:6	112:7
114:7	45:6,13	33:13,15	70:18	Q	raised 17:13	94:11	120:25
problems 106:8,10	53:22	34:20	77:20	qualification 107:12	85:15	95:18	Recreation's 21:13
proceed 10:13	54:25	38:15	109:15	qualificatio... 91:22	rate 58:7	106:20	recruit 21:7
	56:14,16	39:19	provided 41:14	qualified 1:17 8:6	100:19	reasonable 61:17	23:5 39:11
	57:6,9	40:18	provider 34:5	9:10 20:15	ratio 114:7	reasons 66:20	120:5
	58:14	46:17		30:22	reaches 51:23	rec 61:9	recruited 119:21
	69:10	49:14		105:21	read 9:4 10:6	receive 6:22	recruiter 80:5
	71:17,19,21	52:25		117:3	67:25	18:18	recruiters 81:3,5
	72:8,9	57:12,22		qualify 19:21	78:15	23:24	recruiting 81:16
		61:12		25:18	readiness 15:16	25:17	
		63:13		31:16 33:6	19:24 23:9	30:20	
		68:23 69:7				68:22	
		69:24					
		70:12,18					

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
February 18, 2020

Page 12

120:11 recruits 12:22 21:2 Recs 56:15 redesign 50:23 reducing 8:11 reevaluate 52:22,22 reevaluating 32:15 reference 41:11,13,19 43:5 63:11 94:14 referenced 77:24 100:11 referred 3:18 referring 60:7 reflect 46:9 52:6 reflecting 104:25 reflects 52:24 reform 47:7 regarding 4:15 13:23 14:4 15:19 27:13 region 63:20 regs 55:13 regular 19:3 regulation 11:21 12:5 48:2 63:7 64:18 66:17 regulations 13:15 47:11 48:8 48:10,13,14 48:17 49:17 57:18 regulatory 50:23 reiterate 25:20 related 17:16 17:18 21:24	53:10 relative 4:24 26:20 27:12 29:20 30:8 31:25 34:18 35:19 42:5 42:16 54:16 55:7 55:13 82:23 84:8 117:17 relatively 101:24 remain 7:11 24:16 remaining 7:10 remains 5:17 remarks 2:17 2:20 remember 39:2 73:22 79:22 remind 10:2 75:5 109:20,21 110:5 reminding 69:4 replace 72:12 Replacement 72:11 report 60:9 reported 123:6,15 124:6 reporter 125:24 represent 7:22 representat... 110:4 represented 74:7 representing 7:25 reproduction 125:21 request 124:7 requests 16:18 require 57:5	61:3 required 30:16 33:6 36:14 57:15 requirement 120:2,4 requirements 30:8 31:2 36:22 38:19,22 116:8 requires 18:2 18:4,13 requiring 49:4 requisite 22:7 research 24:20 83:12 resemble 7:16 reservations 112:4 residency 120:4 resident 104:12 120:2 residents 17:20 120:12 resources 11:11 20:5 23:3 25:10 40:12 57:3 61:21 106:6 Resources' 29:25 respects 114:17 respond 95:16 responders 6:17 97:24 98:6 response 2:18 58:16 67:10 77:14 121:12,16 122:20 responsible	101:25 restriction 115:15 results 106:12 resume-bui... 23:25 resumes 81:11 retain 19:22 retaining 24:18 retire 25:14 26:25 27:6 retired 78:20 79:15 retiree 90:8 retirement 59:9 returning 95:13 101:2,21 reveals 70:15 revolve 35:5 rewrite 48:11 Richardson 1:11 2:13 2:21,24,25 8:17 17:8 25:25 26:11,12 27:9 28:5 29:12,19 30:19 31:23 33:17,24 34:14 35:9 35:21 36:11,18 37:11,15,22 40:19 41:5 41:21 42:2 42:3 43:3 76:15,16 77:6 88:24 94:2,9 95:15 96:17 97:6 98:18 99:7 102:19,20 105:11,12 121:25 122:4 123:2,4	Richardson's 55:10 rid 119:25 right 2:13 18:14 27:19 45:9 45:22 46:25 47:4 48:15 51:17 52:20 60:2 65:24 74:7 77:7 80:19 87:15 91:3 91:13 92:10 93:2 93:2,9,9 96:5 99:6 106:3 108:16 109:5,16 110:13 111:15 rigorous 3:13 96:25 river 81:23 road 65:6 115:17 rolled 59:12 room 1:6 51:16 87:22 roughly 3:11 108:22 RPR-Notary 125:15 Rule 53:12 64:14,22 rules 55:13 59:7 123:8 123:17 124:8 rulings 59:10 run 43:23 rush 92:11,20 98:7 115:23 S S 1:12 sacrifice 112:25 salaries 15:5 Sam 114:20	Sanchez 45:24,25 48:9,15 49:25 53:7 sat 81:2 saying 35:22 37:12 44:25 45:4 45:7 48:13 50:22 51:6 51:7 66:6,8 82:14 90:24 122:16 123:22 says 66:22 81:14 83:14 91:16 school 1:18 5:6 6:10 7:9 9:12 11:7,14 12:7 13:12 14:2,7,23 14:24 17:11 21:3 24:15,25 25:15 27:15 29:7 32:6 44:11 44:12,14,15 44:18,19 45:5,12 52:21 54:17 57:8 68:5 69:15 70:9 71:3 71:15 72:23 74:24 76:2 76:22 77:22 86:6 90:15 94:16,18,19 95:5 96:5,8 96:12,22,23 98:11 101:10 117:24,25 117:25 118:6 school's 71:17	school-to-e... 3:19 school-to-p... 3:18 schools 14:6 14:10,15 21:2,7 25:23 28:22 49:16 74:21 75:15 99:13 101:5,9 102:2 score 69:13 Scott 77:25 seamless 51:23 seasonal 19:11 second 67:15 80:24 second-year 107:18 seconded 122:11,13 123:12,14 sector 7:6 secure 19:16 secured 21:16 security 59:9 73:7 see 12:11,24 14:18 28:25 29:2 29:16,17 30:3 53:8 64:4 76:23 84:10 86:12 91:17 92:5 109:9 110:7 120:21 seeing 63:21 110:9 seek 71:25 87:19 seeking 109:15 seen 90:21 115:23	seldom 43:22 select 23:5 selected 80:15 selection 14:23 self-inflicted 117:4 semantic 50:19 52:2 sending 7:21 senior 33:11 71:14 sense 41:15 41:21 43:2 53:8 63:11 64:3 sent 81:8,9 sentiment 53:13 sentiments 76:19 102:23 SEPTA 53:22 serious 8:11 servants 20:18 22:4 serve 7:10 22:13 34:6 served 97:18 103:8 104:15,18 110:20 service 1:3,17 1:17 2:6 5:21 6:7 7:5 9:9,10 13:24 17:6 18:3,17,20 18:22 20:6 25:19 32:2 35:12 45:21 51:2 52:5 57:3 60:3 69:13 89:3 94:8 95:8,14 96:9,19 97:13,14,19 100:6,19 102:9 104:5 105:16 111:6
---	--	---	---	---	---	---	---

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
February 18, 2020

Page 13

121:3,9	116:22	35:6 37:18	springboard	STEM 72:16	29:3,4,13	33:12	96:4
124:12,18	sir 90:3	54:15	71:7	72:25	31:15	support 7:22	105:18
serving 25:21	Sisterly 70:8	61:18,23	square 80:19	73:17 74:8	35:25	8:3 11:5,8	115:9
110:24	sit 51:16 78:8	sorts 115:2	Squilla 85:9	stenographer	40:17	18:19	120:8
session 53:9	site 108:24	speak 51:15	stable 102:2	77:20	44:10,14,22	23:25	121:8
123:10,19	sitting 47:3	87:15,15	staff 4:9	stenographic	52:25	24:20 26:3	taken 121:22
124:9	54:22	89:25	60:12	125:6	68:16,20,22	87:14	125:6
set 30:7 34:4	85:10	90:10	stake 112:2	step 37:17	68:24 69:3	105:4	takes 94:15
48:17	110:19	106:7	stakeholders	106:2	69:4,7,14	supportive	talent 15:9
65:18	situation	speaking	4:10 6:16	109:5,16	69:19,22	13:11	17:17
sets 36:6	16:16	120:22	15:14	110:13	70:3,6,11	sure 2:21	18:12
39:18 40:3	117:14	speaks 35:10	16:16 20:9	steps 5:2	70:14,16,25	10:8 27:9	22:15
shameful	six 97:4,7	spec 57:14	standpoint	stone 48:18	71:5,9,24	28:5,18	talk 55:22
119:9	skill 36:6	Specialist	11:24 31:6	stop 58:6	72:3,12,19	31:23	60:13
shape 54:14	39:18 40:2	77:22	31:21	stops 117:6	72:22,24	37:15,22	62:11,12
56:7 98:3	skilled 7:14	specialized	32:13,22	store 82:8	75:7 107:7	39:20 41:3	81:24 85:5
share 4:16	21:6 69:24	20:11	38:12,18	strategic 4:3	108:21	53:3 61:16	102:23
53:4 59:14	72:20	116:7	40:2 47:20	16:12	115:10	85:5 86:22	talked 11:3
100:8	skills 15:13	specialties	61:24	street 110:10	117:16	86:23	11:16 44:6
sharing 4:23	22:14,18,19	35:4	118:14,14	Streets 21:8	118:18	94:23	48:25 81:3
Shawn 103:7	23:11 69:5	specific 6:24	start 15:6	39:5 56:13	120:12	surveying	82:17
Sheila 58:2	69:9 71:20	15:23	74:5 86:4,4	strengthen	studies 46:21	37:7,8	106:13
ship 3:24	72:6,9	16:15 30:5	88:12 93:9	18:8 25:14	study 14:11	surveyor	talking 38:2
83:5	84:23	31:2,9 38:3	107:24	strengtheni...	16:14	36:21 37:4	40:8 41:22
short 18:21	SkillsUSA	specifically	114:18	17:10 19:2	18:18 28:8	survive 79:3	47:3,6,14
81:14,16	72:25	17:22 19:4	starting 49:3	strong 79:2	28:10 29:8	survivor	51:25 52:9
shortage	slighted	34:3 35:7	97:16	strongly	68:23	113:9,14	52:10 56:3
22:15	111:3	50:7 90:15	98:11	101:17	70:12	114:2	56:12
shortages	slow 53:8,9	90:23	107:10	structured	stuff 51:11	survivors	81:15 88:8
17:17	smart 88:25	specification	state 10:12	21:22	53:24	113:16	88:13
shorter 44:2	88:25	52:23	67:23 69:2	22:12	83:19	suspended	97:17
44:3	snapshot	specifications	78:3,8	24:13	87:24	123:9,18	98:12
shortly 27:25	68:11	40:5,13	88:10,19	student 14:19	submitting	124:8	100:25
show 52:7	SOAR 68:24	41:3 57:5	104:9	14:20	23:18	sustained	101:19
75:11	social 68:16	specs 32:3	state-of-the...	29:11	succeed	19:2	107:9
102:11	72:18	40:23	75:14	70:20	22:23	sworn 116:19	teach 72:11
shown	socially 69:23	58:13	stated 3:21	71:15	successful	116:23	teachers
103:11	society 69:6	Speed 71:16	41:17	90:16	32:23	symbolic	101:7
shows 24:20	solely 21:2	spelled 98:25	91:12	98:11	68:19	100:11	teaching
side 46:22	solemn 110:5	spend 83:2	statement	117:24	118:13	101:14	69:18
110:19	solution	83:22	31:5	118:22	120:10	102:12	101:4,5
118:25	22:14	spirit 9:24	statements	students 3:12	suddenly	system 61:8	team 18:8
sign 119:10	24:11	14:3 28:15	26:21 63:8	4:5 6:8,11	75:17	61:19	52:20
significant	somebody	51:12,24	states 44:12	7:11 8:9	Suffice 90:8	systems 18:9	technical
38:7	12:23 40:2	55:23	70:24	11:7,14	suggested	20:10	1:18 7:9
signify	78:22 81:4	78:12	104:14	13:12,25	34:15	23:21	9:11 13:25
122:16	82:6,13,20	sponsor	111:9	14:6,8,15	summarize		19:23
123:22	83:13,14,23	53:17	statistical	14:17 15:2	10:4 67:25	T	22:18
similar 44:23	84:3	75:20	47:2	15:8,10,21	78:14	table 9:21	23:11
110:23	120:16	77:24	status 100:12	15:23	summarizing	67:19 78:8	31:18 33:4
simply 14:21	sorry 42:24	93:16	stay 69:14	16:13	11:2	78:17	33:14
sincere 121:2	95:14	105:10	120:17	18:14 26:4	supervision	104:7	63:14 71:2
single 3:23	sort 12:22	sponsor's	steady	27:18,21	125:23	take 32:12	72:8 79:4
4:7 50:24	13:5,16	101:17	101:25	28:12,20	supervisors	92:25 93:8	91:15

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
February 18, 2020

Page 14

technically 44:19	74:8 77:17 77:19	thanks 74:16	85:7 86:3	92:25	trade 34:20	57:10 67:3	19:12
technology-... 23:20	78:10,14	theirs 113:23	87:4,20	93:10,24	35:16 83:7	trying 26:17	undergrad... 7:9 89:11
tell 51:9	87:2 88:2	thing 13:17	88:3	95:5,7,23	trades 7:8	28:16	understand 22:21
53:19 54:6	88:21 90:4	31:11	100:10,14	97:17,19	21:6 35:3,3	31:20 34:9	29:23
79:7 96:21	100:5	47:21	100:23	98:7	40:15	39:17	35:22 36:7
telling 55:21	104:10,24	52:16	106:2	104:23	43:21,21,25	40:14 43:8	36:9 37:12
81:11	105:17	58:17	107:22,24	110:20	52:19,23	53:6,21	39:15
temporary 19:11	106:4	75:14	108:20	114:15	74:10 82:2	60:11	65:16
ten 5:13,17	109:3	82:22	109:4,5	115:8	108:11	61:11 62:6	66:18 69:8
55:6 70:12	119:3	85:18	113:3,12	119:12	traditional 63:4	63:10,24	70:2 80:18
77:9 85:20	121:2	100:10	115:15	timeframe 60:4	train 102:3	64:3,5	understand... 63:25
91:19,20,25	thank 3:6	106:10	118:5	times 76:2	trained 20:15	100:15	93:17
92:21	4:19,22	111:15	thinking 28:14	81:10 96:2	25:7 84:25	105:3	100:9
93:18,23	7:21 8:3,14	112:8	59:18 74:6	timing 68:13	trainee 61:9	Tuesday 1:7	understands 51:14
94:15 96:2	8:16,20 9:2	things 13:11	75:20	tired 110:8	trainees 37:25	turn 3:24	unemploy... 24:24
98:2	16:20 17:4	32:19 35:6	105:5	title 9:5 30:4	training 3:13	turning 110:8	unfair 6:2
104:22	26:5,8,13	46:20 47:4	thoroughly 56:10	titled 19:7	18:15	twice 79:10	unfortunat... 64:25
105:9,21	26:18	47:23 48:5	thought 39:22	54:25	19:24	two 6:25	uniform 83:3
113:17,20	45:15,25	52:18 53:2	43:12 49:6	57:22	21:24 22:7	12:20	union 81:25
113:23	54:9,10	53:12	58:25	today 3:5,7	23:7,12,17	36:19 37:2	106:23,24
tension 63:3	56:21	59:19	three 6:12	6:18 8:21	24:22	37:6,7	107:2,8
63:4	58:16	60:20 63:6	19:20 42:7	9:2,5 26:6	25:18 30:8	39:10 42:8	unions 107:21
terms 9:13	59:23	63:7 64:2	60:24	48:22 60:4	30:15 33:4	49:17	unique 19:15
28:7 44:25	62:18,19,20	64:12	61:10 65:6	65:5 67:13	36:13,22	53:12	United 104:14
terrific 120:5	62:23 67:6	65:18 66:5	71:19	79:4,10,14	57:11	61:10,23	111:8
test 91:21	67:11,21	84:21 87:5	79:21	84:23	63:13,19	62:7 64:14	University 73:16
105:20	71:11	87:6,21	92:16,19	90:10,12,14	69:9 70:15	64:22 65:6	89:12,13
108:5,6	73:25	88:14 91:4	95:19 99:4	91:18 92:6	83:18	66:24	108:16
114:16	74:12,25	100:7,24	99:13	97:20	96:15,24	79:21	unwarranted 6:4
115:4,9	75:19 76:5	115:3	103:9	106:21	97:3	81:10	update 48:11
118:4	76:7,12,16	think 4:25	three-year 69:10	118:11	107:15,23	96:24 99:4	upper-level 49:5
119:18	76:19 77:2	11:16,19	95:22	121:23	117:18,22	two-year 107:16	Urban 79:19
testers 108:4	77:3,4,16	13:10	110:11,12	124:13	118:3	type 13:16	urge 87:19
testify 9:17	78:15 85:7	26:14	thrown 110:11,12	today's 23:14	transcript 125:8,21	28:23	90:10 92:6
16:21 26:6	85:12	27:20	110:11,12	told 79:14	20:10	39:23 93:7	92:11 93:6
67:15 78:6	88:16,17	32:12,20	tie 54:15	80:17,23	transforma... 20:10	types 28:21	93:7
103:20	90:2,3	35:10,23	tied 17:14,23	81:4 82:19	transitioning 15:4	52:15	urgency 17:9
106:21	93:10,13	40:8,24	ties 51:7	tomorrow 48:23,24	transportat... 80:22	87:11	use 5:19 6:6,8
111:17	95:17	46:3,4,13	time 5:18	90:17	tremendous 39:16 62:4	88:13	7:4 53:17
121:14,18	99:20,24	47:5 48:5	11:3,17	tools 72:13	tried 46:18	typically 30:2	72:13
testifying 10:10 76:9	100:2	50:2,19,21	16:20 22:5	top 86:9	50:8	U	94:21
testimonies 118:12	102:16,20	51:17,25	39:2 46:15	topic 17:7	true 97:15	umbrella 69:18	95:11
testimony 2:7	103:15,17	52:3 53:7	53:20	total 27:21	125:7	unbelievable 120:16	
26:14,22	103:18,21	53:11,13	60:19,25	34:24	truly 23:6	Uncle 114:20	
27:13 29:5	103:22,23	54:8 55:9	62:4,10	totaled 34:21	49:14,22	uncomfort... 88:12	
41:11 44:6	103:25	55:22	64:21 66:6	totally 28:16	76:25	under/une...	
54:23 63:9	104:2,4	58:19,19,24	70:16	tours 103:9	try 42:8		
67:12,24	111:16	59:6,19	71:11 76:9	tracking 23:20 61:8			
	120:25	61:9 62:9	81:20 83:2				
	121:3	64:13,25	84:16				
	122:4	74:9,10	88:11				
	123:4	79:11					
	124:13,16	82:23 84:7					

February 18, 2020

Page 15

usually 11:22 43:23 44:3 utilizes 23:2	80:10 81:7 81:7,11,17 81:25 82:21,24 84:9,13 85:19 86:2 86:10 97:18,24 98:3 100:17,21 101:18,22 vacancy 102:25 105:8,9 110:17 111:2,21,25 113:9,13,15 114:4 119:5	want 3:5 4:19 8:20 9:2,23 10:2 11:21 15:23,25 17:4 31:11 31:22 35:6 40:4 42:25 45:23 48:22 50:11 52:16,17 54:20 55:19,19 58:16 59:15,17 65:15 66:21,22 73:24 75:19,22 76:3 77:18 82:22 83:25 85:7 86:7 88:7 88:19 89:5 89:9 92:4 100:2,8 103:3,12 109:19 110:7 112:9,23 117:3,10 119:10 120:25 121:4,8 124:13	80:16 82:3 82:12 waste 84:16 watching 54:21 58:18 77:7 88:22 Water 21:4 39:5 53:24 56:11 way 11:17 44:13 45:11 49:16,20 53:9 54:3 54:14 56:7 56:18 57:7 57:21 58:8 81:23,24 82:3 85:4,6 85:25 91:8 91:9 92:5 98:3 112:25 ways 19:2 56:22 57:18 58:9 we'll 4:2 53:4 58:3 82:24 91:10 92:22 we're 11:21 13:9 20:8 22:2 26:6 26:16 28:19 31:12,19 34:8 37:25 39:6,17,21 40:8,14 46:24 47:3 47:24 51:10,16,25 52:9,10,18 53:5,6,14 56:3 59:18 60:9,18 61:11,16 62:4 64:19 65:13,13 66:7,23 74:11 86:8 88:8 92:24 93:3 97:17	98:12 100:15 101:6 107:9 110:8 we've 38:10 46:20 57:25 58:21 60:19 64:21 78:10 90:21 100:4 101:9 115:23 116:22 118:11 week 47:7 92:21 weeks 53:4 60:25 62:8 80:13 92:16,19 96:16,18,18 welcome 87:2 welder 83:6 well-paying 22:22 went 29:7 45:4,5 63:23 79:16 96:12 weren't 107:7 120:12 West 71:14 71:25 75:25 89:11,13 wholeheart... 11:9 wider 15:8 Wilkins-W... 67:17 68:3 68:4,8 73:22 74:17 77:4 willing 53:16 win 105:23 win-win 16:16 winners	16:11 44:6 44:25 wish 7:11 witness 9:20 67:18 78:16 104:6 witnesses 9:17,20 67:9,15,18 77:13 78:16 104:6 woman 88:25 women 84:22 84:24 89:18,19 110:9 wonder 106:7 wonderful 4:18 word 80:14 words 109:20 work 3:14 11:10 12:6 12:8 15:13 17:14 19:3 28:25 33:5 33:11,16 34:12 51:2 52:5 53:16 57:25 58:6 59:3,11 74:17,23 77:3 79:16 85:2 103:15 work-ready 14:11 worked 4:13 53:23 58:11 64:22 89:2 90:24 91:5 91:7 workers 19:12 25:7 25:14 workforce 7:13 8:12 8:24 10:18 10:19 12:8 15:25 16:4	17:2,3 19:6 24:11,14 25:12 28:13 32:21 34:5 34:10 40:10 42:16 46:8 54:17,24 57:17 69:15 71:8 72:3,20 99:17 106:5,15 working 18:4 32:2 35:11 52:20,21 54:16 57:2 58:7 59:8 60:9,10 79:24 100:24 102:25 104:4 workplace 22:24 23:8 24:2,6 works 19:14 53:23 world 107:8 116:4 worthwhile 71:24 wouldn't 49:7 80:9 80:12 107:21 wounds 117:4 wrestled 47:19 64:9 write 48:10 writing 10:4 91:8 written 16:10 44:12 57:13 58:12 77:19 wrong 81:24	Yale 89:17,20 89:20 Yeah 77:7 year 5:20 6:11 19:9 36:24 42:17 49:17 60:8 84:20,21 106:19 107:24 114:25 120:3,14,19 yearly 50:15 years 4:2 6:12 13:5,6 13:7 20:25 20:25 25:9 31:16 37:2 37:6,7 38:11 42:8 46:15 49:6 49:18 50:5 65:6 70:24 71:19 77:10 79:24 80:2 81:3 83:8 83:20 84:19 89:4 95:19 96:7 96:24 97:4 97:7,8,12 99:14 106:11,23 108:4 109:9 111:24 119:20,20 York 119:19 young 4:4 24:14 25:21 30:11 75:11,18,21 78:21 88:25 95:20,24 105:3,19 106:7,16 107:10 109:6,10,12 109:13 110:9
V							
vacancies 20:2,16 25:7 34:19 116:2,3,9 116:16,18 117:8,12	85:19 86:2 86:10 97:18,24 98:3 100:17,21 101:18,22	31:22 35:6 40:4 42:25 45:23 48:22 50:11 52:16,17 54:20 55:19,19 58:16 59:15,17 65:15 66:21,22 73:24 75:19,22 76:3 77:18 82:22 83:25 85:7 86:7 88:7 88:19 89:5 89:9 92:4 100:2,8 103:3,12 109:19 110:7 112:9,23 117:3,10 119:10 120:25 121:4,8 124:13	58:18 77:7 88:22 Water 21:4 39:5 53:24 56:11 way 11:17 44:13 45:11 49:16,20 53:9 54:3 54:14 56:7 56:18 57:7 57:21 58:8 81:23,24 82:3 85:4,6 85:25 91:8 91:9 92:5 98:3 112:25 ways 19:2 56:22 57:18 58:9 we'll 4:2 53:4 58:3 82:24 91:10 92:22 we're 11:21 13:9 20:8 22:2 26:6 26:16 28:19 31:12,19 34:8 37:25 39:6,17,21 40:8,14 46:24 47:3 47:24 51:10,16,25 52:9,10,18 53:5,6,14 56:3 59:18 60:9,18 61:11,16 62:4 64:19 65:13,13 66:7,23 74:11 86:8 88:8 92:24 93:3 97:17	98:12 100:15 101:6 107:9 110:8 we've 38:10 46:20 57:25 58:21 60:19 64:21 78:10 90:21 100:4 101:9 115:23 116:22 118:11 week 47:7 92:21 weeks 53:4 60:25 62:8 80:13 92:16,19 96:16,18,18 welcome 87:2 welder 83:6 well-paying 22:22 went 29:7 45:4,5 63:23 79:16 96:12 weren't 107:7 120:12 West 71:14 71:25 75:25 89:11,13 wholeheart... 11:9 wider 15:8 Wilkins-W... 67:17 68:3 68:4,8 73:22 74:17 77:4 willing 53:16 win 105:23 win-win 16:16 winners	16:11 44:6 44:25 wish 7:11 witness 9:20 67:18 78:16 104:6 witnesses 9:17,20 67:9,15,18 77:13 78:16 104:6 woman 88:25 women 84:22 84:24 89:18,19 110:9 wonder 106:7 wonderful 4:18 word 80:14 words 109:20 work 3:14 11:10 12:6 12:8 15:13 17:14 19:3 28:25 33:5 33:11,16 34:12 51:2 52:5 53:16 57:25 58:6 59:3,11 74:17,23 77:3 79:16 85:2 103:15 work-ready 14:11 worked 4:13 53:23 58:11 64:22 89:2 90:24 91:5 91:7 workers 19:12 25:7 25:14 workforce 7:13 8:12 8:24 10:18 10:19 12:8 15:25 16:4	17:2,3 19:6 24:11,14 25:12 28:13 32:21 34:5 34:10 40:10 42:16 46:8 54:17,24 57:17 69:15 71:8 72:3,20 99:17 106:5,15 working 18:4 32:2 35:11 52:20,21 54:16 57:2 58:7 59:8 60:9,10 79:24 100:24 102:25 104:4 workplace 22:24 23:8 24:2,6 works 19:14 53:23 world 107:8 116:4 worthwhile 71:24 wouldn't 49:7 80:9 80:12 107:21 wounds 117:4 wrestled 47:19 64:9 write 48:10 writing 10:4 91:8 written 16:10 44:12 57:13 58:12 77:19 wrong 81:24	Yale 89:17,20 89:20 Yeah 77:7 year 5:20 6:11 19:9 36:24 42:17 49:17 60:8 84:20,21 106:19 107:24 114:25 120:3,14,19 yearly 50:15 years 4:2 6:12 13:5,6 13:7 20:25 20:25 25:9 31:16 37:2 37:6,7 38:11 42:8 46:15 49:6 49:18 50:5 65:6 70:24 71:19 77:10 79:24 80:2 81:3 83:8 83:20 84:19 89:4 95:19 96:7 96:24 97:4 97:7,8,12 99:14 106:11,23 108:4 109:9 111:24 119:20,20 York 119:19 young 4:4 24:14 25:21 30:11 75:11,18,21 78:21 88:25 95:20,24 105:3,19 106:7,16 107:10 109:6,10,12 109:13 110:9
W							
wage 17:23 22:9 70:6 wages 24:7 wait 62:9 119:12 120:19	veterans' 119:7 vets 84:13 viable 19:10 Vice 3:2 9:24 45:20 Vietnam 85:17 110:18 view 34:7 48:7,17 viewed 24:8 visit 74:19 visited 63:18 76:2 vital 58:6 voice 121:10 voices 3:8 volunteered 85:17 vote 8:4 86:10,11,13 90:11 92:7 92:11 93:3 93:5,8 105:23 voting 8:22 91:6	wanted 2:15 13:4 26:17 26:20 41:15,21 42:15 43:4 44:5 62:25 74:16 76:18 85:6 89:21 99:8 102:5,22 110:16 wants 14:18 45:18 war 110:20 warranted 113:13 Washington 58:23 wasn't 80:3	80:16 82:3 82:12 waste 84:16 watching 54:21 58:18 77:7 88:22 Water 21:4 39:5 53:24 56:11 way 11:17 44:13 45:11 49:16,20 53:9 54:3 54:14 56:7 56:18 57:7 57:21 58:8 81:23,24 82:3 85:4,6 85:25 91:8 91:9 92:5 98:3 112:25 ways 19:2 56:22 57:18 58:9 we'll 4:2 53:4 58:3 82:24 91:10 92:22 we're 11:21 13:9 20:8 22:2 26:6 26:16 28:19 31:12,19 34:8 37:25 39:6,17,21 40:8,14 46:24 47:3 47:24 51:10,16,25 52:9,10,18 53:5,6,14 56:3 59:18 60:9,18 61:11,16 62:4 64:19 65:13,13 66:7,23 74:11 86:8 88:8 92:24 93:3 97:17	98:12 100:15 101:6 107:9 110:8 we've 38:10 46:20 57:25 58:21 60:19 64:21 78:10 90:21 100:4 101:9 115:23 116:22 118:11 week 47:7 92:21 weeks 53:4 60:25 62:8 80:13 92:16,19 96:16,18,18 welcome 87:2 welder 83:6 well-paying 22:22 went 29:7 45:4,5 63:23 79:16 96:12 weren't 107:7 120:12 West 71:14 71:25 75:25 89:11,13 wholeheart... 11:9 wider 15:8 Wilkins-W... 67:17 68:3 68:4,8 73:22 74:17 77:4 willing 53:16 win 105:23 win-win 16:16 winners	16:11 44:6 44:25 wish 7:11 witness 9:20 67:18 78:16 104:6 witnesses 9:17,20 67:9,15,18 77:13 78:16 104:6 woman 88:25 women 84:22 84:24 89:18,19 110:9 wonder 106:7 wonderful 4:18 word 80:14 words 109:20 work 3:14 11:10 12:6 12:8 15:13 17:14 19:3 28:25 33:5 33:11,16 34:12 51:2 52:5 53:16 57:25 58:6 59:3,11 74:17,23 77:3 79:16 85:2 103:15 work-ready 14:11 worked 4:13 53:23 58:11 64:22 89:2 90:24 91:5 91:7 workers 19:12 25:7 25:14 workforce 7:13 8:12 8:24 10:18 10:19 12:8 15:25 16:4	17:2,3 19:6 24:11,14 25:12 28:13 32:21 34:5 34:10 40:10 42:16 46:8 54:17,24 57:17 69:15 71:8 72:3,20 99:17 106:5,15 working 18:4 32:2 35:11 52:20,21 54:16 57:2 58:7 59:8 60:9,10 79:24 100:24 102:25 104:4 workplace 22:24 23:8 24:2,6 works 19:14 53:23 world 107:8 116:4 worthwhile 71:24 wouldn't 49:7 80:9 80:12 107:21 wounds 117:4 wrestled 47:19 64:9 write 48:10 writing 10:4 91:8 written 16:10 44:12 57:13 58:12 77:19 wrong 81:24	Yale 89:17,20 89:20 Yeah 77:7 year 5:20 6:11 19:9 36:24 42:17 49:17 60:8 84:20,21 106:19 107:24 114:25 120:3,14,19 yearly 50:15 years 4:2 6:12 13:5,6 13:7 20:25 20:25 25:9 31:16 37:2 37:6,7 38:11 42:8 46:15 49:6 49:18 50:5 65:6 70:24 71:19 77:10 79:24 80:2 81:3 83:8 83:20 84:19 89:4 95:19 96:7 96:24 97:4 97:7,8,12 99:14 106:11,23 108:4 109:9 111:24 119:20,20 York 119:19 young 4:4 24:14 25:21 30:11 75:11,18,21 78:21 88:25 95:20,24 105:3,19 106:7,16 107:10 109:6,10,12 109:13 110:9

