

Committee on Law and Government
February 5, 2020

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
COMMITTEE ON LAW AND GOVERNMENT

Room 400, City Hall
1400 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19107
Wednesday, February 5, 2020
10:15 a.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCILWOMAN CHERELLE PARKER, CHAIR
COUNCILMAN DEREK S. GREEN, VICE-CHAIR
COUNCILWOMAN HELEN GYM
COUNCILMAN MARK SQUILLA
COUNCILWOMAN MARIA D. QUINONES-SANCHEZ
COUNCILWOMAN KATHERINE GILMORE RICHARDSON
COUNCILMAN DAVID OH
COUNCILWOMAN CINDY BASS
COUNCILMAN BRIAN O'NEILL

BILL: 200006
RESOLUTIONS: 200040

- - -

1 - - -

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Good
3 morning. This hearing is called to
4 order. This is a public hearing of the
5 City Council on Law and Government.
6 The purpose of this hearing is to hear
7 testimony on Bill No. 200006 and
8 Resolution No. 200040. Bill Nos.
9 200075, 200076, 200077 and 200078 and
10 Resolution Nos. 200079, 200080 and
11 200081 are being held at the request of
12 their sponsors and they will not be
13 heard today.

14 I want to recognize the
15 presence of a quorum of Committee
16 members. Members of the Committee in
17 attendance are to my left Councilman
18 Derek Green. To my right,
19 Councilmember Squilla, Quinones-Sanchez
20 and also to my left is Katherine
21 Gilmore Richardson who was appointed to
22 the Committee by the President.

23 With that being said, I want
24 to just make sure that I give some
25 opening remarks regarding today's

1 hearing. And for the benefit of the
2 public, I want you to know that the
3 first day of Council was just
4 two-and-a-half weeks ago. But in just
5 the first two Council sessions, 13
6 ballot questions were introduced. A
7 few ballot questions were envisioned
8 for elections later in 2020 or even in
9 2021.

10 However, that still left us
11 with 7 to 9 potential ballot questions
12 for the April 28th ballot. However, we
13 now have remaining 7 to 9 ballot
14 questions. We also didn't have the
15 luxury of time to wait several weeks
16 before hearing all of their associated
17 bills and resolutions, because for the
18 record with ballot questions the City
19 Commissioners must have them no later
20 than the end of February in order to
21 get them on the April ballot. And that
22 means any legislation must be passed by
23 Council and signed by the Mayor by the
24 end of February.

25 We scheduled two Law and

1 Government Committee hearings for this
2 week with about half of the potential
3 April ballot questions advertised for
4 Monday and then half for Wednesday.
5 With that being said, I want to say a
6 special thank you to all members of
7 Council who worked together so that we
8 can wean down the number of potential
9 ballot questions for April so that we
10 are now potentially only at three
11 ballot questions for April, and that's
12 much more manageable a number for our
13 City Commissioners and voters.

14 Two ballot questions passed
15 out of Committee on Monday; one
16 regarding political activity which
17 could be incredibly important during
18 this election; and one establishing a
19 permanent Department of Labor to better
20 enforce all worker protection bills
21 that this Council has passed in the few
22 years. And so, I will argue that these
23 ballot questions need to be on April's
24 ballot due to their sensitive nature.

25 And today we are considering

1 just one ballot question, which I would
2 say is just as time-sensitive as the
3 other two. The ballot question being
4 considered today is if graduates of
5 career and technical education should
6 get civil service preference when they
7 apply for City jobs. Now, in this time
8 when we have both high youth un and
9 underemployment and rising homicides,
10 we need to use every tool in our
11 toolbox to get more of our young people
12 into good stable jobs, and this is an
13 issue that can't wait and it needs to
14 be on April's ballot.

15 Now, I'm going to say this
16 for the record: If there is anyone
17 here and they're here to testify about
18 any specifics regarding how the civil
19 service preference may work, I just
20 want to remind you that the only
21 legislation we are considering today
22 are the bill and resolution associated
23 with the broadly-worded ballot
24 question. So again, if anyone is
25 concerned about the constructs of how

1 the civil service preference would
2 work, this is not that bill. That will
3 be done under a separate bill.

4 The bill that actually will
5 specify that is Bill No. 200007, and
6 that will be heard by this Committee at
7 a later date. And it's with that being
8 said that I now want to ask the sponsor
9 of the bill, our colleague Councilwoman
10 Katherine Gilmore Richardson to say a
11 few words.

12 And I also want to just state
13 for the record, Councilwoman, I want to
14 thank you for your due diligence. I
15 want to thank you for your research in
16 taking the lead on this very important
17 issue here in City Council because it's
18 one, as part of the solution, we need
19 to address a myriad of problems in the
20 City.

21 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE

22 RICHARDSON: Thank you, Madam
23 Chairwoman Parker and to Vice-chair
24 Green and my fellow colleagues. I want
25 to especially thank the members of the

1 public who came to have their voices
2 heard today and share their viewpoints
3 with this Committee. This bill was
4 introduced in a package with another
5 bill and resolution that were referred
6 to another Committee.

7 The bill in today's hearing
8 is simply about submitting an amendment
9 to the qualified electors of the City
10 of Philadelphia to provide for a
11 preference in civil service
12 examinations for graduates of career
13 and technical education programs and
14 schools within the School District of
15 Philadelphia.

16 The question states, shall
17 The Philadelphia Home Rule Charter be
18 amended to provide for a preference in
19 civil service examinations for any
20 qualified graduate of a career and
21 technical education program in the
22 School District of Philadelphia.

23 Moreover, I want to
24 acknowledge that we have made a
25 commitment to all of the stakeholders,

1 including the unions that may be
2 affected by this legislation, including
3 but not limited to, D.C. 33, D.C. 47,
4 the International Association of
5 Firefighters and the Fraternal Order of
6 Police, just to name a few.

7 We will be in constant
8 communication regarding the companion
9 bill and I look forward to doing that
10 over the coming weeks before the
11 Committee hearing in Labor and Civil
12 Service. And lastly I want to say
13 this, and I need everyone to hear me
14 very clearly, we suffer from a horrible
15 disease in the City of Philadelphia,
16 and it's a disease called apathy. If
17 we continue to do the same things, we
18 will be left with the same results of
19 unfilled in hard-to-fill positions
20 without a skilled workforce able to
21 take on these positions of
22 responsibility in our City government.

23 If we were doing such a great
24 job already, we would not have so many
25 open and/or hard-to-fill positions.

1 This is not about excluding anyone, but
2 increasing our ability to hire a
3 skilled and diverse workforce ready to
4 fulfill our City's needs on day 1.

5 This legislation allowing the qualified
6 electors to decide is a first step in a
7 multi-step conversation I intend to
8 lead around being serious about
9 workforce development in the City of
10 Philadelphia. Thank you, Madam Chair.

11 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
12 you, Councilwoman. Chair recognizes
13 Councilwoman Quinones-Sanchez.

14 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-
15 SANCHEZ: Thank you so much. And I
16 want to thank Councilmember Gilmore
17 Richardson for proposing this and I
18 look forward to the conversations as we
19 work at the skills gap workforce
20 development, the space around how do we
21 create a pipeline that is different
22 than the one we keep talking about
23 which is a pipeline from schools to
24 jail.

25 I say this as the proud

1 graduate of a CTE program. For my
2 freshman year, I went to Girl's High
3 and I transferred over to Mastbaum
4 because I just wasn't sure if I was
5 college material. In my 11th grade, I
6 had the opportunity through a robust
7 CTE program, that we have to get to and
8 we'll talk about that later as we work
9 with the School District, in my junior
10 year I had the opportunity to go work
11 for Cigna. In my senior year when I
12 was credit-ready, I had again another
13 opportunity to come and work within
14 Corporate America.

15 These opportunities offered
16 me the ability to come downtown and see
17 things differently than what I knew in
18 my beloved Hunting Park. We need to be
19 talking about the re-alignment of CTE,
20 the expansion of CTE. I have so many
21 friends who went into career tracks.
22 Some of them decided to go to college
23 and advance further, and some of them
24 with their CTE graduation certificate
25 were able to produce or have fulfilling

1 careers.

2 So I want to thank
3 Councilwoman for highlighting this, for
4 looking at this space and saying what
5 other things we can do. We all know
6 because we've had many conversations
7 about the Human Resources Department,
8 its resources, its ability for its
9 testing process, all of the things that
10 we've talked, you know, the Rule of
11 Two, but we can't ask the private
12 sector to do things and provide
13 opportunities for returning citizens,
14 and our young people if government
15 doesn't do it first.

16 So I look at this as
17 government saying how do we elevate,
18 promote what we're doing, show folks
19 that these young people -- I proudly
20 have a lamp created by my Mastbaum
21 students in my office. The welding,
22 electrical, carpentry unit put it
23 together. When folks tell me that
24 young people aren't ready, I show them
25 my lamp and I turn it on.

1 And so, that's what we're
2 doing here, turning on and lighting up
3 a conversation so very necessary. And
4 then I will further add that this is
5 about an and, and an and, and an and,
6 the recognition that there's
7 specialized constituencies that bring
8 different skills to the table and that
9 should be recognized in our process.
10 It's not an either or.

11 So I look forward to this
12 conversation and many other
13 conversations as we better align CTE,
14 as we open up more opportunities. And
15 as government says, we can do better,
16 we're doing some things that are great,
17 but how about if we do more. And the
18 most important part of this is the
19 opportunity for the electors to know
20 that this is important to us. Thank
21 you, Madam Chair.

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
23 you. Chair recognizes Councilwoman
24 Gym.

25 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Yes, thank

1 you, Madam Chair. And I just wanted to
2 add my comments and especially to
3 members of the audience who are here
4 today about how much I appreciate the
5 sponsor of the bill bringing this issue
6 forward. As someone who's worked on
7 the issue of bringing our public
8 schools back to life, as we have worked
9 through many, many decades of
10 disinvestment around our public
11 schools, around our young people in
12 particular and have at the same time
13 matched it with lofty rhetoric about
14 how we can do anything and promise
15 anything to them, we are starting to
16 today merge those two things in a real
17 and meaningful way.

18 Our CTE programs and many of
19 us up here have been very supportive,
20 but we have seen a real resurgence in
21 them, a real investment in them. We
22 have wonderful outstanding principals
23 who have been leading schools for a
24 very long time. CTE programs are also
25 unique because they have to be

1 federally certified, qualified.

2 They are held to

3 extraordinarily rigorous standards.

4 The young people get smaller class

5 sizes. They overwhelmingly do better

6 and today what we want is that if we're

7 putting this effort into these young

8 people, if we're putting the effort

9 into their educators, their teachers,

10 their principals who have given their

11 heart and soul to giving them every

12 single opportunity, I've visited many

13 of these programs, I've visited their

14 schools, I've been to work sites like

15 Rebuilding Together where I've seen CTE

16 students with their principals working

17 on projects, we have to give them

18 opportunity and this is a promise.

19 Today is a promise to our

20 young people. Today is a real and

21 meaningful promise to our young people

22 that we are taking steps forward to

23 open doors in a real way, by allowing

24 them to have consideration within civil

25 service. This is not taking away from

1 any other group.

2 Those privileges still exist
3 for those other groups and will remain
4 in existence, but this is also opening
5 the door because our young people
6 deserve a promise, because their
7 teachers, their principals, the
8 educators deserve a promise and a
9 delivery and because their families do
10 it and because our City needs them. So
11 thank you very much to the sponsor of
12 this bill. I look forward to the
13 conversation and thank you, Madam
14 Chair.

15 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
16 you. The Chair first wants to
17 acknowledge the presence of
18 Councilwoman Cindy Bass, Councilman
19 David Oh who has just joined us and now
20 I recognize Councilman Oh for remarks.

21 COUNCILMAN OH: Thank you
22 very much. I too want to say that I
23 have nothing but respect for the
24 sponsor of the bill. Intelligent,
25 independent-minded, public-minded,

1 wonderful person, I'm so happy she got
2 elected. In our democracy, we will
3 have different opinions and this is one
4 of those times where I visited the
5 Councilwoman to say I will be voting
6 no.

7 And I just wanted to explain
8 that there should be a level playing
9 field. Every one has an opportunity,
10 and I know that there is a sincere
11 desire on the part of Council and the
12 sponsor of the bill to do the best they
13 can for those who are seeking jobs and
14 looking for opportunities to fulfill
15 the needs of our City in the career and
16 technical space.

17 The preference is for
18 veterans and for the children of those
19 who have died in the line of duty,
20 police officers and firefighters. That
21 is a special preference because of the
22 sacrifice that they have made. I want
23 to respect that preference and I
24 believe everyone on Council regardless
25 of their vote does respect that.

1 However, I will say that I
2 think it is something that if we begin
3 to erode by giving preferences to any
4 group of person's, for example 10
5 points or 5 points or 2 points for a
6 graduate of Philadelphia's career
7 technical schools, why not 3 points for
8 a graduate of Community College or a
9 victim of crime or someone who has had
10 a felony and has served their time.

11 It is a level playing field
12 other than the fact that those who
13 defend our freedoms have been given
14 this preference for their service where
15 they put their lives at risk for our
16 nation and to the actual municipal,
17 public servants who have taken up the
18 calling of fighting fires and fighting
19 crime and have died in the line of
20 duty, so we respect their service by
21 giving their children 10 points.

22 It will be very difficult. I
23 will try to be open-minded about what
24 you say, but I will say that I already
25 cannot see myself voting in favor of

1 the bill. Thank you.

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
3 you. The Chair recognizes the presence
4 of Councilman Brian O'Neill and also
5 recognizes Councilman Green for
6 remarks.

7 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you,
8 Madam Chair. I know we're going to
9 have a good conversation today. I
10 respect all of the commentary made by
11 various members of this body. And I
12 want to thank the sponsor for this
13 piece of legislation. My understanding
14 that this being the Law and Government
15 Committee, the question that's up for
16 today is the question of whether it
17 should be on the ballot that a
18 preference in the civil service exams
19 be allowed for a qualified graduate of
20 a career and technical education
21 program. This piece of legislation
22 does not say what that preference may
23 be.

24 My understanding is that the
25 sponsor of the bill has been in

1 conversations with various entities.
2 For me, it's important as the son of a
3 veteran, it's important that we protect
4 and honor the service that our veterans
5 have provided over the years and my
6 understanding is the negotiation
7 process there could be a possibility as
8 a legislation, which will be another
9 committee, has that ability to still
10 honor the veterans at the level they're
11 currently honored.

12 In addition, as the uncle of
13 two police officers, one is no longer
14 with us, one is retired, I have a
15 strong perspective and support for
16 those men and women that protect and
17 serve the City of Philadelphia in their
18 capacity as a police officer, and we
19 need to make sure we honor that
20 preference in the City and the Civil
21 Service Commission.

22 And my understanding based on
23 the conversation I've had with the
24 sponsor, there's been multiple
25 conversations she has had with members

1 of both the Police Department and also
2 the Fire Department to make sure that
3 we continue to maintain and honor that
4 preference. But today's piece of
5 legislation, and we'll take testimony
6 on that in a few moments, is whether
7 there should be a preference in the
8 Civil Service Commission. My
9 understanding is we've provided
10 preference for those who are bilingual.

11 My understanding of the
12 legislation, and we'll hear from the
13 testimony to be provided, that this
14 only makes a request to the voters
15 whether a preference should be, not
16 what the preference will be. And I
17 feel fully confident with my new
18 colleague Councilmember Katherine
19 Gilmore Richardson and based on our
20 conversations, she will continue to
21 have both with members of the FOP as
22 well as Local 22 which is the
23 firefighters as well as others from
24 various veteran organizations, will be
25 able to maintain the rightful honor and

1 service and perspective to make sure
2 that those who are veterans are truly
3 honored at their full level as well as
4 those who are the children of officers
5 who've been slain in the line of duty
6 will also be protected.

7 So with that, I look forward
8 to hearing the conversation and the
9 deliberation regarding this bill.

10 Thank you, Madam Chair.

11 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Chair
12 recognizes Councilman O'Neill.

13 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Thank
14 you, Madam Chair. I just want to state
15 that my new colleague is in a hurry
16 because of the earlier primary this
17 year. I want it to be clear that I
18 think it's a good idea. I think 10 is
19 way too many looking at the whole broad
20 spectrum of the incentivizing we've
21 done.

22 I think police and fire,
23 paramedics should be off. If I have a
24 commitment for that before this is
25 over -- I don't like voting for

1 vagueness. And I know what Councilman
2 Green said is absolutely true, that
3 this is very general, but it's too
4 general for me not knowing what the
5 sponsor -- how much the sponsor wants
6 to limit it, because right now it's
7 unlimited.

8 It's just we're going to have
9 discussions and, you know, I'm looking
10 at the other ones we have. First of
11 all, I think it should be targeted to
12 specific tests that are appropriate for
13 the training that's given. Secondly,
14 it should be in the low single digits,
15 not the high or the low double digits,
16 and that it clearly shouldn't deal with
17 uniform first responders because that's
18 not what the training is. Now, there
19 is training for that, that gets
20 preferences.

21 If before this hearing is
22 over or if we continue this until
23 tomorrow morning for more of that
24 tightening up, I will wait and see.
25 All right. Because I do think it's a

1 good idea. I think everybody would
2 like to, first of all, incentivize
3 young people to go through these
4 schools and have an extra reason to do
5 it, but it's just the idea of voting
6 for something that is going to happen
7 later, but pretty good work coming out
8 of the chute. Thank you.

9 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Chair
10 recognizes Councilwoman Gilmore
11 Richardson.

12 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE
13 RICHARDSON: Thank you, Madam Chair.
14 And just for the record, I just wanted
15 to let my colleagues know that I have
16 made a commitment to all of the union
17 organizations that I've spoken with
18 last night and this morning, including
19 the firefighters, the FOP, D.C. 33 and
20 47, that we will have continued
21 conversation around the bill that has
22 been referred to Labor and Civil
23 Service and not this Committee. That
24 hearing has not been scheduled as of
25 this time.

1 Secondly, this legislation
2 would not -- well, that legislation in
3 Labor and Civil Service would not take
4 anything from the children or
5 grandchildren of Philadelphia
6 firefighters or police officers who
7 were killed in the line of duty or
8 veterans. It just adds that we are
9 adding a qualified graduate of a career
10 and technical education program in the
11 School District of Philadelphia.

12 I have indicated that I'm
13 willing to have additional conversation
14 around, you know, anything we need to
15 do to ensure that we have a comfort
16 level with the amount of the point
17 preference and I'm willing to do that
18 as we move forward in the process. So
19 I asked my colleague because of that
20 for your support. Thank you so much.

21 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
22 you. Now, I just want to note a bit of
23 housekeeping, because of the
24 longstanding commitments outside of
25 this bill that several of our members

1 have, we may have to recess our public
2 hearing and go into our public meeting
3 so that those members who have to leave
4 can actually cast their votes, and then
5 we will come back to our public hearing
6 to make sure we've heard all of the
7 scheduled testimony, so I just want
8 members of the public who are watching
9 if you see us sort of just make a
10 shift, not everyone is finishing
11 testifying, but if you see members
12 leaving their vote, it is because they
13 have longstanding commitments outside
14 of this building.

15 With that being said, I want
16 to ask the Clerk to read the title of
17 the bill and resolution for
18 consideration today.

19 THE CLERK: Bill 200006, an
20 Ordinance providing for the submission
21 to the qualified electors of the City
22 of Philadelphia of an amendment to The
23 Philadelphia Home Rule Charter to
24 provide for a preference in civil
25 service examinations for any qualified

1 graduate of a career technical
2 education program in the School
3 District of Philadelphia, as approved
4 by a resolution of this City Council.
5 Fixing the date of a special election
6 for such purpose, prescribing the form
7 of ballot question to be voted on and
8 authorizing the appropriate officers to
9 public notice and to make arrangements
10 for the special election.

11 And Resolution No. 200040, a
12 Resolution proposing an amendment to
13 The Philadelphia Home Rule Charter
14 providing for a preference in civil
15 service examinations for any qualified
16 graduate of a career technical
17 education program in the School
18 District of Philadelphia and providing
19 for the submission of the amendment of
20 the electors of Philadelphia.

21 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The
22 Clerk will please call the first panel
23 of witnesses to testify.

24 THE CLERK: Mike Zaccagni.

25 (Panel approached

1 Witness Table.)

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Let me
3 say good morning to each of you. Just
4 please state your name for the record
5 and proceed with your testimony. If
6 you decide as we're going through it,
7 if you decide to summarize your
8 testimony, I want you to know that it's
9 all right with us because we do
10 actually have copies and that's for
11 anyone scheduled to testify today. If
12 you decide to summarize, we have
13 copies. Thank you.

14 MR. ZACCAGNI: That's what I
15 was going to ask you. Michael
16 Zaccagni, Office of Human Resources.

17 MS. LEBLETA: Good morning.
18 Jenean Lebleta, Office of Human
19 Resources.

20 MS. JONES: Good morning.
21 Candi Jones, Office of Human Resources.

22 MR. ZACCAGNI: Good morning,
23 Councilwoman, and the members of the
24 Committee. First of all, I want to say
25 thank you for having us here and I want

1 to emphasize very strongly that the
2 goals I think we're aligned on, we want
3 to see more opportunities for students
4 throughout the Philadelphia school
5 system and all students.

6 The question here is just how
7 do we get that done. So we understand
8 the challenges and we also understand
9 the goals of what the Councilwoman
10 wants to do. We had a lovely
11 conversation with her not too long ago.
12 So what we look at from the standpoint
13 of Human Resources, how do we build
14 programs that are better aligned and
15 how do we align with the students that
16 are coming out not only the CTEs, but
17 the high schools generally.

18 So there are a couple of
19 programs that are identified in the
20 testimony similar to what we really
21 want to look at to do. So you have
22 Future Track that started with Streets
23 Department. You have initiatives in
24 the Water Department that creates
25 opportunities for students. A number

1 of these have already bore fruit, and I
2 know there's still a lot more we have
3 to do.

4 For example, since 19 --
5 since 2015 -- excuse me with the 19.
6 It just shows my age, I think. Since
7 2015, 80 percent of hires in the
8 positions of trades helper and public
9 works maintenance trainee, 80 percent
10 came from the Philadelphia School
11 District and 25 percent of them came
12 from CTE programs.

13 Again, we want to be able to
14 build those seamless transitions
15 between where the student is and where
16 the jobs are and provide them with the
17 competency they need in order to be
18 successful. One of the challenges, as
19 was said here earlier, is that us
20 looking for trades positions is a
21 difficult challenge for these types of
22 positions. In fact, we pretty much go
23 through all of these lists.

24 So what we're looking for
25 instead of perhaps a preference that we

1 think may or may not work is really how
2 do we build other types of programs.
3 It's an important point that the
4 programs we want to build certainly
5 will benefit CTE students, but they
6 will benefit all students throughout
7 the School District.

8 And as I said earlier, this
9 is more of not a difference in what the
10 goal should be. This is a difference
11 in how we get there. And we'd love to
12 partner with the Council. We'd love to
13 partner with -- and we already have
14 partnered with many agencies.

15 These two women next to me
16 have been working with the School
17 District and will continue to work with
18 different agencies. They're the ones
19 that make some of this stuff work. But
20 what we want to be able to do is look
21 to having agile programs that we can
22 effect, change and modify as the needs
23 acquire.

24 So much of what we're looking
25 to do here, we can do through

1 regulation. We can do through building
2 programs. If you want to say a
3 difference of opinion, I believe is the
4 need to do this through a Charter
5 change. That's the summary. You have
6 the rest of the testimony. I thank you
7 for the opportunity to meet with you.
8 We're ready for any questions and will
9 be thankful for any questions that you
10 have for us.

11 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Chair
12 recognizes Councilwoman Bass.

13 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Thank you
14 very much, Madam Chair. Can you talk
15 just a little bit further about your
16 differences with it being a Charter
17 change and how would you envision this
18 happening without the Charter change?

19 MR. ZACCAGNI: So what we're
20 looking to do is really align with the
21 students that are coming out of the
22 various different CTE programs. For
23 example, Future Track and also
24 Philadelphia Water Department has
25 programs that really align with what

1 the students are coming out. And what
2 we do is we try to build seamless
3 transitions between those students and
4 into the program, so we don't even have
5 to really get involved with how the
6 people are going to line up on the list
7 and so forth, so we're able to make
8 that seamless transition.

9 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: And I
10 heard you mention that earlier in your
11 testimony, but my question is, you
12 know, that's specific to one
13 department. So for all of the other
14 opportunities that exist for
15 employment, are there similar programs
16 and opportunities or is it a few here
17 and a few there, because I think the
18 idea behind the Charter change is that
19 it will be comprehensive and everything
20 will be covered?

21 I spoke with the bill sponsor
22 earlier today and I have some concerns
23 about it being a Charter change as
24 well, but if it's going to make sure
25 that there is the coverage that we

1 want, that it's comprehensive across
2 the board in the City of Philadelphia,
3 then that makes a big difference than a
4 few programs here and there. So I
5 don't know if you wanted to comment on
6 that further.

7 MR. ZACCAGNI: And I may ask
8 Jenean Lebleta to talk a little bit
9 about that too. So what we're doing is
10 we're trying to expand those programs.
11 But one of the things that we do is we
12 look at civil service positions that
13 align with CTEs. We try to make sure
14 that they clearly align. There's even
15 some language coming out of a program
16 that will also benefit them from the
17 standpoint of qualifying for the
18 different positions. Jenean, would you
19 like to or --

20 MS. JONES: So, for example,
21 to Mike's point, so the Office of --

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER:
23 Identify yourself for the record.

24 MS. JONES: Sorry. Candi
25 Jones, Office of Human Resources. Good

1 morning again, Council. For example,
2 the Office of Fleet Management aligns
3 specifically with programs at the
4 work -- for the school at Randolph for
5 the automotive maintenance program, so
6 those students start the summer before
7 their 11th grade year of high school
8 and they're working 40 hours a week
9 during the summer and during the normal
10 school year, they're working after
11 school.

12 And so, the program is
13 designed so that when they graduate and
14 we announce automotive apprentice, it's
15 so closely aligned to that CTE program.
16 Only those students that qualify for
17 that civil service position and title
18 and then so only those students are on
19 that eligible list and all of those
20 students are given that opportunity to
21 transition into civil service.

22 So what we're working to do
23 is align more of those programs looking
24 holistically at civil service entry-
25 level opportunities, looking at the CTE

1 programs to figure out how we can
2 expand and make those partnerships more
3 robust as we move forward.

4 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Okay.

5 MS. LEBLETA: Good morning.
6 Jenean Lebleta, Office of Human
7 Resources. To your question,
8 Councilwoman, I did want to point out
9 also Trades Helper is our entry-level
10 skilled trades --

11 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Say it
12 again.

13 MS. LEBLETA: Trades helper
14 is our entry-level into a career in
15 civil service in the skilled trades,
16 which align with many of these programs
17 throughout the City, and the CTE
18 programs, those lists are open
19 competitive lists to the public and are
20 used by the departments throughout the
21 City.

22 So your concern about
23 one-offs and only the Water Department
24 or only the Streets Department, all of
25 our City departments hire from certain

1 entry-level open competitive lists. We
2 have about 2,000 skilled trades in the
3 City. We have many vacancies, as you
4 know, that we're trying to fill in
5 those skilled trade areas, so it is not
6 only for programs that are stabilized
7 apprenticeships housed within one
8 department, but we do have open
9 competitive. Like our Public Works
10 maintenance trainee is also used by
11 various departments, not just the two
12 we've cited in our example. Thank you.

13 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Okay.

14 MR. ZACCAGNI: And just to --
15 I'm sorry. And just to add, the Office
16 of Workforce Development is also
17 looking at this from a holistic
18 standpoint and working with many
19 departments across the City now, now
20 that that has been established.

21 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: How many
22 positions do you see connecting
23 assuming that this bill would be
24 passed? How many positions do you see
25 that the CTE graduates from

1 Philadelphia schools would be filling
2 that are open right now as an example
3 from the number of vacancies?

4 MR. ZACCAGNI: I don't have
5 the vacancy number right now as to what
6 they look like. We can certainly look
7 at that and get that from that
8 standpoint.

9 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Okay.
10 Yes, I think that's important so we can
11 get a sense of the scope of the impact
12 of this bill. And also, if there is
13 any additional information that you can
14 provide to us in terms of -- or provide
15 to the sponsor in terms of the impact
16 in reaching the trades, and
17 particularly around the issue of
18 diversity in the trades.

19 Philadelphia has had a
20 longstanding problem of lack of
21 diversity. The trades are pretty much
22 all white and all male. In 2020, it's
23 still the same, it's still ridiculous.
24 It's still totally unacceptable that we
25 have these public works project that

1 don't reflect Philadelphia when it
2 comes to the folks who are on the job,
3 on the site. And so, there's still a
4 lot of work to do there.

5 I know you said there's a
6 program that hires directly from the
7 schools and they can go right into the
8 trades, but it just didn't feel as if
9 this is something that's actually
10 happening. So any numbers that you
11 have on that, I would appreciate.
12 Thank you. Thank you, Madam Chair.

13 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Chair
14 recognizes Councilwoman Gilmore
15 Richardson.

16 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE
17 RICHARDSON: Thank you, Madam Chair.
18 First, thank you all so much for your
19 testimony and for the meetings we had
20 prior to the hearing. I look forward
21 to continuing to work with you as we
22 look to how we do workforce development
23 better in the City of Philadelphia.

24 So quickly, I just wanted to
25 ask how many open positions do you

1 currently have in the City of
2 Philadelphia in general?

3 MR. ZACCAGNI: That's
4 something we would have to get. I just
5 don't have that number off the top of
6 my head. Are you looking for open
7 positions as they relate to the
8 students coming out of CTE programs?

9 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE

10 RICHARDSON: Both. So how many open
11 positions, how many that relate to a
12 CTE program and/or skilled trades. I
13 also wanted to ask you about the Philly
14 Future program. I think they had a
15 connection with the Sanitation
16 Department. Could you talk about the
17 Philly Future Track program?

18 MR. ZACCAGNI: Philly Future
19 Track was a little bit different from
20 the Philly Future's program. The
21 Philly Future Track was designed by
22 Streets. It's got to be 10 years ago
23 now. And now, it's sort of being
24 managed through the Office of Workforce
25 Development. And what I would do is

1 ask Zakiyyah because I haven't been
2 involved with that program for a little
3 while. Zakiyyah Ali can come up and
4 she can talk a little bit about the
5 Future Track program.

6 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE

7 RICHARDSON: Okay.

8 MS. ALI: Good morning,
9 Council. Zakiyyah Ali, Office of
10 Workforce Development. So the Philly
11 Future Track was designed several years
12 ago by the Streets Department
13 specifically to provide opportunities
14 to Philadelphia residents, particularly
15 opportunity youth that were either not
16 in school or not working.

17 And so, those individuals
18 received on-the-job training through
19 the Streets Department. And if there
20 were open opportunities, some of those
21 individuals were able to apply for
22 those positions and transition into
23 permanent employment with the Streets
24 Department in positions such as field
25 investigator, public works maintenance

1 trainee and engineering aide trainee.

2 Since the Office of Workforce
3 Development has come along, our
4 partnership with the Streets Department
5 has strengthened, and what we've done
6 is we've redesigned the program
7 somewhat so that individuals are better
8 prepared to meet the needs of the
9 Streets Department, both from a
10 technical training standpoint as well
11 as from a soft skills standpoint. So
12 we've enhanced the curriculums, both on
13 the job and added a robust classroom
14 component, so that once individuals
15 graduate, they are either on track to
16 move into a position with the Streets
17 Department or with a private sector
18 employer.

19 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE

20 RICHARDSON: Thank you. So just to
21 clarify for the record, that program or
22 participation in the program I believe
23 it was five months, was not a guarantee
24 of full-time employment or any type of
25 leg-up in the civil service application

1 process.

2 MS. ALI: So just to clarify,
3 like many employers, employment is not
4 guaranteed. Individuals do have to
5 complete specific requirements to
6 graduate. Upon graduation, individuals
7 are eligible for specific civil service
8 positions. What we help them do is to
9 apply for those positions while they're
10 still in the program so that upon
11 completion, many of them move into
12 continuing to doing online -- I'm
13 sorry, on-the-job training, so that
14 when the vacancy is open, they can more
15 seamlessly move directly into that
16 position, so there is a direct pipeline
17 from graduation into permanent
18 employment.

19 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE

20 RICHARDSON: And how many young people
21 would you say are currently employees
22 of the City of Philadelphia who
23 graduated from that program and how
24 many young people completed the program
25 in total?

1 MS. ALI: We would have to
2 pull some specific data, but I'll tell
3 you what I have for the two years that
4 we've been managing the program in
5 partnership with the Streets
6 Department. When you say young people,
7 we do track their ages so I wanted to
8 be clear that young people can be a bit
9 relative. We can pull some very
10 specific data to cut off for what we
11 consider opportunity youth versus any
12 individuals that might be above that
13 because we don't necessarily
14 discriminate on age for these programs,
15 although we do primarily recruit from
16 certain populations where young people
17 have opportunities.

18 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE

19 RICHARDSON: Sure.

20 MS. ALI: And I'll continue
21 to take questions until I pull up our
22 placement data.

23 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE

24 RICHARDSON: So how many current
25 programs do we have in total across the

1 City of Philadelphia?

2 MS. ALI: So under City is
3 Model Employer. We have eight career
4 pathway programs, and that's not to say
5 that other departments might not have
6 some programming as well. But
7 specifically under that initiative,
8 there are eight programs.

9 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE

10 RICHARDSON: Thank you.

11 MS. ALI: For the Philly
12 Future Track program within the last
13 two fiscal years, 32 individuals have
14 transitioned to full-time permanent
15 employment in the Streets Department
16 and 2 individuals have transitioned to
17 full-time permanent employment in the
18 private sector.

19 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE

20 RICHARDSON: Thank you.

21 MS. ALI: You're welcome.

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Are
23 there any other questions or comments
24 from members of the Committee for these
25 witnesses?

1 (No response.)

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: We want
3 to thank you all so very much for your
4 testimony. And before you leave, let
5 me just note for the record just a few
6 data points that when we do have our
7 hearing on Bill No. 200007, I would
8 like for you to come prepared with just
9 asking on average how many civil
10 service jobs open up in one year, just
11 on average.

12 And I don't want the answers
13 right now. But when you come back, how
14 many veterans apply for civil service
15 jobs in a year, how many legacies,
16 meaning their parents died in the line
17 of duty applied for civil service jobs
18 in a year. And then on average, how
19 many CTE grads apply for civil service
20 jobs in a year.

21 In addition to that, can you
22 come prepared with data on the
23 following: The current percentage of
24 people of color in both police and
25 fire; how many people were a part of

1 the new police class and how many of
2 those people were people of color
3 because we want to demonstrate
4 Philadelphia's demographic. And then
5 we want to talk about the overall
6 demographic for the City of
7 Philadelphia's workforce across the
8 board, so if you can come prepared to
9 just give us that information.

10 And I don't know whether or
11 not because I know we've talked about
12 this offline at another meeting, is it
13 at all possible without getting into
14 any privacy issues, is there a way for
15 us to map by zip code Philadelphia
16 employees without no privacy issues, no
17 addresses? So mapping, so in zip code
18 19141 we have X number of Philadelphia
19 employees?

20 MR. ZACCAGNI: I believe we
21 should be able to do that. It's going
22 to be whether we get that information
23 now and we can work with someone from
24 the geo spectrum the standpoint of
25 mapping that out. We should be able to

1 do that, but let me go back and talk to
2 our tech people.

3 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Because
4 that's a really good snapshot even for
5 residents in the City of Philadelphia
6 just in general to know that City of
7 Philadelphia workers are everywhere and
8 in every zip code across the board, so
9 that would be very helpful from a
10 transparency perspective. Thank you so
11 much for your testimony.

12 MR. ZACCAGNI: Thank you very
13 much for having us.

14 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Will
15 the Clerk please call the second panel
16 of witnesses to testify. And again, I
17 just want to note for the record at
18 approximately 11:20 we are going to
19 briefly recess our public hearing and
20 go into our public meeting.

21 THE CLERK: Patrick Clancy.

22 (Witness approached
23 Witness Table.)

24 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: I want
25 to say good morning to you, Mr. Clancy.

1 It's always an honor to see you. And
2 when I see you, I always think
3 workforce development expert. Please
4 state your name for the record and feel
5 free to proceed with your testimony.

6 MR. CLANCY: Sure. Good
7 morning, Councilwoman. Thank you very
8 much for the opportunity. I'm Patrick
9 Clancy, President and CEO of
10 Philadelphia Works. We are the City's
11 Workforce Development Board charged
12 with investing the federal and state
13 funds that are awarded to the City of
14 Philadelphia for people who are in
15 transition.

16 So today I come to you
17 excitedly to talk a little bit about
18 why we are in support of this ballot
19 question. We believe that giving our
20 young people who are transitioning from
21 school to work as many options as
22 possible. We believe that the CTE
23 programs that they have been embarking
24 upon for the past couple of years
25 really are a career pathway.

1 And I think when we think of
2 where do young people want to go work,
3 I think looking at the City of
4 Philadelphia as a great place. Having
5 some people I know personally that work
6 for the City, they love the
7 opportunity, they love the pathways and
8 we believe that this is a great option
9 for some of our students.

10 We also believe that our
11 students are really very well-educated.
12 The stats will show that if the
13 students will take two or more CTE
14 courses are less likely to drop out of
15 high school. We also know that
16 students concentrating in CTE have test
17 scores equal to those who are college
18 prep students. So we believe that our
19 students who are at the District of
20 Philadelphia receiving CTE programming,
21 that this will give them a chance to
22 look at sort of middle class jobs,
23 right.

24 And I think part of the
25 challenge that we see with some of our

1 other customers is if they have gone to
2 college and unable to secure
3 employment, they have a huge debt load
4 which is crushing us as a system and as
5 a city. So we believe if many options
6 as they are as possible for young
7 people to engage in work and have this
8 be an incentive as one of them would be
9 a great opportunity for them. Thank
10 you for the opportunity to testify.

11 How quick was that, huh, pretty quick?

12 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: It was.
13 He did well. He's been here before.
14 You can tell. He's an expert,
15 Councilman Oh. He's an expert. Chair
16 recognizes Councilwoman Gilmore
17 Richardson.

18 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE
19 RICHARDSON: First, I want to say thank
20 you for your testimony and for your
21 ongoing commitment to workforce
22 development in the City of
23 Philadelphia. It's been an honor to
24 work with you and visit your office.
25 You and Mr. Joynes, all the work you're

1 doing is really, really excellent, so
2 thank you so much.

3 I just wanted to ask you a
4 quick question relative to partnerships
5 in and around Philadelphia Works
6 relative to the private sector.

7 MR. CLANCY: Sure.

8 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE

9 RICHARDSON: Can you talk about some of
10 those CTE pathways to employment
11 programs and/or initiatives that you
12 know of and/or work within the private
13 sector?

14 MR. CLANCY: Yes. So we've
15 been working with the University of
16 Penn through a program called Penn
17 First which was helping some of our CTE
18 graduates actually get jobs that were
19 aligned with the huge construction of
20 the Penn project.

21 We also do a lot of work with
22 the healthcare sector, so we actually
23 have apprenticeships into healthcare
24 careers. We have apprenticeships into
25 Temple University Hospital. We also

1 have apprenticeships into Aramark. We
2 are working on apprenticeships into
3 Comcast and other large corporations.

4 Our Board is 51 percent
5 private sector. We actually have a
6 Youth Standing Committee that makes
7 sure that our investments in youth
8 actually align well with what the
9 economy is sort of baring at this point
10 in time. So we are definitely looking
11 at more and more private sector
12 partnerships.

13 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE

14 RICHARDSON: Thank you. And relative
15 to looking at the labor market forecast
16 for the City of Philadelphia, how do
17 you work with those private sector
18 companies to ensure that we are
19 aligning or your company is aligning
20 job opportunities for young people
21 and/or underemployed or unemployed
22 individuals?

23 MR. CLANCY: Yes, very good
24 question. So what we do first is
25 actually meet with the employer to

1 actually design the training program
2 with them. I think the years of us
3 just training people and hoping they go
4 to work just wasn't relevant, and I
5 think having the employers be part of
6 the conversation to design it but also
7 add incentives.

8 We have some federal and
9 state incentives around on-the-job
10 training that really help mitigate the
11 risk, right. So when you look at some
12 employers who may be a little hesitant
13 to hire some of our customers, we
14 utilize that tool to help them better
15 understand that these individuals just
16 need a chance.

17 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE

18 RICHARDSON: Thank you.

19 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Chair
20 recognizes Councilman Oh.

21 COUNCILMAN OH: Thank you
22 very much, Chairwoman. Mr. Clancy,
23 would you be in favor of giving
24 preference points to graduates of
25 Community College?

1 MR. CLANCY: So in all
2 transparency, I'm on the Board of
3 Community College, I'm on the Board of
4 Trustees so I think that's somewhat of
5 a loaded question. I did hear your
6 statements earlier and having the
7 question posed as a ballot question is
8 really important. I think getting into
9 the specifics of how the preference
10 will work out, I think the devil will
11 be in the details later.

12 COUNCILMAN OH: Okay. Thank
13 you.

14 MR. CLANCY: Sure.

15 COUNCILMAN OH: Would you be
16 in favor of giving a preference to
17 persons with physical disabilities?

18 MR. CLANCY: Would I be in --
19 so that would -- in terms of what? In
20 terms of?

21 COUNCILMAN OH: Giving a
22 hiring preference.

23 MR. CLANCY: So --

24 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE
25 RICHARDSON: Madam Chair, point of

1 information.

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Chair
3 recognizes Councilwoman Gilmore
4 Richardson.

5 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE

6 RICHARDSON: Madam Chair, I'd just like
7 to state for the record that this
8 hearing is relative to the legislation
9 to give a preference for career and
10 technical education programs and I
11 respectfully disagree with the line of
12 questioning from my colleague. Thank
13 you very much.

14 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
15 you. Point noted, and our colleague,
16 help us.

17 COUNCILMAN OH: Thank you
18 very much. I'll try to get to the
19 point as best I can. I'm going to
20 assume that you're in favor of any kind
21 of preference for persons who you deem
22 to be disadvantaged and that you would
23 like to help them to be able to get a
24 job. I would also assume that you
25 would not be in favor of disadvantaging

1 any group of persons such as single
2 moms, graduates of two-year degrees.

3 The giving of a 10-point
4 preference is an advantage and a
5 disadvantage in a competitive setting,
6 and there's been a limited preference
7 for veterans and children of those who
8 have died in the line of duty. I'm
9 just understanding that you are
10 generally in favor of giving
11 preferences of some level to help
12 people get jobs.

13 MR. CLANCY: So I would say
14 that as an organization that is charged
15 with getting as many people back to
16 work on career pathways, that that's
17 really where we focus our energies and
18 our investments. We make sure that
19 individuals are highly trained, that
20 they're relevant for the workforce that
21 is in demand right now but also in the
22 future.

23 So I would say I'm a big
24 proponent of maximizing the use of our
25 private sector minds that are on our

1 Board and making sure that we make
2 those investments properly.

3 COUNCILMAN OH: If a
4 preference is given for CTE as in this
5 case, does that increase a disadvantage
6 for graduates of a community college?

7 MR. CLANCY: You know what, I
8 don't think I have the expertise to
9 comment on that to be honest.

10 COUNCILMAN OH: Thank you
11 very much.

12 MR. CLANCY: Sure.

13 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Are
14 there any other questions for this
15 panel of witnesses?

16 (No response.)

17 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Hearing
18 none, I want to thank you, Mr. Clancy,
19 and again, an honor and privilege to
20 always have you in this Council. Your
21 years of experience in workforce
22 development, particularly for my tenure
23 in Harrisburg and the work that you do
24 with us here in the City of
25 Philadelphia is very much appreciated

1 and I just wanted to say that for the
2 record.

3 MR. CLANCY: Thank you very
4 much. I appreciate it. Have a great
5 day. Thank you.

6 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
7 you. Will the Clerk please call the
8 third panel of witnesses to testify?

9 THE CLERK: Jonathan Jacobs,
10 Marie Wilkins Walker, Jose Morales, Jr.
11 and Naderia Johns.

12 (Panel approached
13 Witness Table.)

14 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Again,
15 I just want to remind all of those
16 coming to testify, we do have copies of
17 the testimony that you submitted. I
18 want you to feel free to summarize your
19 testimony. If you choose to read it,
20 it's up to you, but I just wanted to
21 make sure that option was available.

22 And as you're seated, I want
23 whomever starts first, just make sure
24 you identify yourself for the record
25 and the benefit of our stenographer,

1 and feel free to proceed with your
2 testimony. Thank you.

3 MR. JACOBS: Good morning.

4 My name is Jonathan Jacobs. I'm a
5 career awareness specialist with the
6 School District of Philadelphia. I'm
7 speaking today also as a veteran and
8 educator and a concerned citizen that's
9 born and raised here in Philadelphia
10 and also a graduate from a neighborhood
11 public high school in Philadelphia.

12 As a veteran, I believe that
13 education is also a national security
14 issue. Preparing and assuring the City
15 has an educated and qualified workforce
16 is crucial to the success of this city,
17 country in attracting development and
18 maintaining our infrastructure, safety
19 and security.

20 As you know, Philadelphia was
21 founded in 1682 and our houses, roads,
22 bridges, water treatment systems,
23 electrical systems, environment
24 remediation is lacking and we need the
25 students and the skills that we have

1 here in our youth that we are lacking
2 to build our city back up and providing
3 them the opportunity.

4 According to Philly Works,
5 the Department of Labor, the careers
6 related to the fields that would fix
7 these up are all high priority
8 occupations, and the demand shortage
9 goes through the year 2026. And most
10 of these careers that we're talking
11 about have also remained high priority
12 occupations going back to 2002.

13 So for me, providing the
14 City's youth, most of whom who live in
15 poverty which we invested so much time
16 and money and opportunities to earn a
17 living wage and career after high
18 school, is also a way to fight crime.
19 By giving them this opportunity to have
20 a career, we've seen students that go
21 on and buy houses two, three years out
22 of high school.

23 And so, connecting them to
24 work is also another way to keep them
25 engaged in school while they're there.

1 And, in fact, the record -- that it
2 does show that CTE graduates have a
3 higher rate of graduation than
4 traditional public school students. As
5 an educator involved with job
6 development for numerous years, I have
7 seen firsthand many of our students
8 being passed up or not being given
9 opportunities due to not having
10 established connections as other
11 students in the suburbs or other City
12 students might have.

13 I've seen many unions hire
14 family members and other union members
15 that are friends and family, and I
16 fight very hard to find these
17 opportunities for the youth and
18 usually I have to find these allies
19 that will help get the students, but
20 they're never sustainable as that
21 person leaves.

22 When our students do get in,
23 the company is usually surprised that
24 our students do excel and do amazingly
25 well. CTE students go through a

1 rigorous 1,080 hours of technical
2 training in their field. They receive
3 numerous industry certifications and
4 take exams that are not graded by their
5 teachers, but by others in industry
6 giving them their relevance.

7 Any resource that allows for
8 opportunities for students to be
9 qualified in high demand fields keeps
10 the talent local and improves the
11 quality of life not just for the
12 students, but all Philadelphians and
13 it's a great way to start breaking the
14 cycle of poverty.

15 I appreciate all of the
16 stakeholders invested in helping us
17 diversify fields in giving Philly youth
18 the opportunity they need to compete.
19 The City of Philadelphia really can be
20 a shining example to other business
21 showing just how qualified our kids are
22 and lead by example that they too
23 should be providing opportunity to our
24 youth. Let me them follow your
25 example. Thank you.

1 MR. MORALES: Good morning,
2 Councilwoman and Councilmembers.
3 First, I would like to thank Jonathan
4 Jacobs and the Councilmembers for
5 allowing me to speak as an alumni of
6 the CTE school. My name is Jose
7 Morales, Jr. I'm a graduate of Jules
8 E. Mastbaum, Class of 2013.

9 The CTE program I chose
10 during my high school years was
11 residential wiring. It was during
12 these years of high school where my
13 curiosity for learning the theory
14 behind electricity and the application
15 of the group. I am here to ask that
16 you vote yes for the CTE preference
17 bill.

18 While I was going through
19 high school, I was able to complete
20 five internships with companies such as
21 PECO, Amtrak, D.C. 21, District Council
22 21. These internships were attainable
23 because of the hard work and
24 connections made through the staff at
25 Mastbaum and the rest of the staff

1 members in the Philadelphia School
2 District down on 440 North Broad
3 Street.

4 These opportunities allowed
5 me to share the room with people who
6 were in charge of hiring and firing.
7 And in summary, it allowed me to shine,
8 you know, as a young adult. CTE
9 students in Philadelphia commit to
10 doing hard work like this every year
11 and I believe rewarding them with a job
12 preference is a good way to put them to
13 work right here in Philadelphia.

14 After high school I attempted
15 to get my degree as an electrical
16 engineer at Bloomsburg University. I
17 quickly realized I couldn't work in an
18 office setting being diagnosed with
19 mild obstructive sleep apnea. After
20 three years, I decided to drop out
21 because of financial reasons.

22 I went back to Philadelphia
23 and I was working in the Franklin Mills
24 mall in a retail store. While working
25 there, I decided to apply to the

1 Electricians union in April 2017.
2 Thankful to a man by the name of
3 Charles Lewis who is retired, who
4 worked for the Philadelphia School
5 District, and Julio Padiilla who also
6 worked at Mastbaum during my years at
7 Mastbaum for connecting me with an
8 individual who is actually a retiree
9 from the Electricians union who put
10 together a program called CAPP,
11 Construction Apprentice Proprietary
12 Program.

13 With that connection,
14 fast-forward to today, I'm a
15 fourth-year apprentice electrician for
16 IBW Local 98. Having had the pleasure
17 of doing what I was fascinated, you
18 know, starting in my sophomore year in
19 high school. I think giving students
20 the preference for getting into a City
21 job is a first step, but I think what's
22 more important is overseeing giving
23 students an opportunity and an option.

24 I would have never known
25 about the Electricians union if someone

1 hadn't gave me the option to apply. If
2 I would have known they were offering
3 City jobs when I was in school, I would
4 have probably applied to multiple. The
5 important thing is to give students
6 options and opportunities. So I would
7 have probably never been in the
8 Electricians union if it weren't for
9 Charles Lewis and Julio Padilla, if
10 Councilwoman Blackwell didn't help put
11 together the PennAssist Program and
12 Mr. Clancy and Mr. Jones for
13 Philadelphia Works for putting that
14 program together.

15 My father wouldn't have been
16 working for Amtrak if Steve Herring,
17 who is another employee of the
18 Philadelphia School District, didn't
19 present the opportunity to intern at
20 Amtrak when he did. By voting yes on
21 this bill, many of the students may
22 have similar opportunities to land a
23 good skilled labor position in the
24 City, one that I did not know was
25 available when I graduated the program.

1 Again, I ask you all to vote yes on
2 this bill in order to help the students
3 that work hard to learn a skill, get
4 gainful employment right here in
5 Philadelphia. Thank you.

6 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: We want
7 to thank you so very much for your
8 testimony. And before we begin, I just
9 have to note for the record that now we
10 have this little procedural process
11 that we need to go to, so please be
12 patient with us.

13 It has come to my attention
14 that certain members of this Committee
15 need to leave on Council business, so I
16 will very briefly recess the public
17 hearing and go into a public meeting to
18 allow those members to leave their
19 votes for the record before they
20 depart.

21 We will now recess the public
22 hearing and go into the public meeting.
23 And the Chair recognizes Councilmember
24 Gym.

25 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you

1 very much, Madam Chair. And I just
2 want to thank this panel for your
3 wonderful testimony and appreciate the
4 deeply personal perspective that you
5 bring to this conversation. That's
6 really very much appreciated and want
7 to give a shout out to our fantastic
8 School District Directors of CTE in our
9 audience there, thank you for
10 supporting this program for believing
11 in it, for bringing it to life and this
12 is again an effort to make a promise to
13 you, your team and your hard work, and
14 of course, to all the young people who
15 are here, so thank you very much.

16 So thank you, Madam Chair. I
17 need to leave the public hearing for
18 official Council business and wish to
19 be recorded as voting aye on any motion
20 to support Bill No. 200006 from this
21 Committee and ask that favorably with
22 rules of suspension to permit first
23 reading at the next session of Council,
24 and I would like to also be recorded as
25 voting aye on any motion to report

1 Resolution No. 200040 from this
2 Committee with a favorable
3 recommendation.

4 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
5 you very much. The Chair now
6 recognizes Councilwoman Bass.

7 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Thank
8 you, Madam Chair. I need to leave the
9 public hearing on Council business and
10 wish to be recorded as voting aye on
11 any motion to report Bill No. 200006
12 from this Committee favorably with a
13 rules suspension to permit first
14 reading at the next session of Council
15 and aye on any motion to report
16 Resolution No. 200040 from this
17 Committee with a favorable
18 recommendation.

19 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The
20 Chair thanks the Councilwoman. Thank
21 you, Councilmember Gym and Councilwoman
22 Bass. We will now return to the public
23 hearing and continue taking testimony,
24 and we only have two members left of
25 this panel and want to thank you all so

1 very much for your patience. We
2 appreciate it.

3 Please state your name for
4 the record and proceed with your
5 testimony.

6 MS. WILKINS WALKER: Good
7 morning. My name is Marie Wilkins
8 Walker, a CTE instructor of the
9 Philadelphia School District. It's
10 with great honor that I present to the
11 Mayor, City Council and our great
12 citizens of Philadelphia a snapshot of
13 the added pre- and post-educated
14 benefits of this powerful legislation.

15 The timing could not be
16 greater as February is CTE month. This
17 legislation has the ability to impact
18 CTE students on social and economic
19 platforms and has powerful leverage for
20 parents looking for the best
21 educational option for their students.

22 This legislation mirrors
23 articulation agreements which where
24 students receive college credits for
25 completion of CTE programs of study.

1 SOAR, Students Occupationally and
2 Academically Ready, these agreements
3 vary across the state, but impact CTE
4 students in a positive value-added
5 method, reminding students how valuable
6 industry and 21st century skills are to
7 the individual and to our society.

8 Students in CTE programs
9 across the City understand the value of
10 the industry-level training in skills
11 they learn. Students over three years
12 in a program commitment, having the
13 opportunity to receive bonus points
14 adding to a civil service exam score
15 will encourage CTE students to stay in
16 Philadelphia after high school and
17 build our workforce capacity.

18 It has been my experience
19 over my teaching career under the CTE
20 umbrella that Philadelphia students
21 overall need an opportunity to
22 demonstrate their greatness and
23 passion. With these opportunities, our
24 students grow socially and
25 academically. CTE programs build

1 skilled leaders that are college and
2 career ready.

3 We as educators understand
4 that the educated students have
5 choices. This legislation brings an
6 additional opportunity to earn a
7 life-sustaining wage to our educated
8 students, opening doors and career
9 options and growth within our City of
10 Brotherly Love and Sisterly Affection.

11 The School District of
12 Philadelphia currently has 5,314 CTE
13 students enrolled and 113 programs of
14 study covering all national 16 career
15 clusters. Our CTE students receive
16 over 180 hours of training. The data
17 reveals that CTE students graduate on
18 time ready for college and career.

19 Career and technical
20 education programs provide
21 industry-driven, real-world experience
22 for all participants. Below is a list
23 of sampling from West Philadelphia High
24 School, which I am not going to read.
25 I'm going to let my student give you

1 the rest of the information.

2 I have one data point I'd
3 like to share with you. The U.S.
4 Department of Education states eight
5 years after their expected graduation
6 date, students who focus on career
7 technical education courses while in
8 high school had higher median annual
9 earnings than other students who did
10 not focus on CTE. Please allow this
11 legislation to be the spring board of
12 our future CTE workforce and our
13 commitment to these students educated
14 in the City of Philadelphia. Thank
15 you.

16 MS. JOHNS: Hi. My name is
17 Naderia Johns and I am a current senior
18 at West Philadelphia High School, AP
19 student and Speed Girl, yes, I am an
20 athlete too. I've been in the school's
21 computer system networking program
22 since 10th grade. After being in this
23 program for three years, I recognized
24 the invaluable skills and opportunities
25 that I have gained due to this program.

1 For this reason, I feel
2 compelled to inform you of the many
3 aspects of CTE programs that make it
4 worthwhile for students at West and
5 hope that you will seek just an
6 equitable legislation for our future
7 workforce and students completing CTE
8 programs across the City.

9 Listed below are examples of
10 skills and opportunities that I have
11 gained since being a part of the career
12 technical education program. In this
13 program, I gained leadership skills by
14 being the project manager of
15 Chromebooks battery replacement, I was
16 able to teach other students how to
17 replace batteries and use different
18 tools. We have a class called the
19 MakerSpace and in this class, we are
20 able to participate in different stem
21 activities.

22 CTE provides a social
23 economical boost for students. It
24 would build a skilled workforce of the
25 City of Philadelphia. I was able to

1 observe students from my school
2 competing in competitions against
3 students from all over in the stem
4 industry at the Skills U.S.A.
5 conference in Hershey, Pa.

6 In 11th grade, we had a
7 project called Genius Hour, where we
8 had a choice to do something on a
9 career interest or something we learned
10 in class. Mine was on cyber security.
11 I actually took an online class on this
12 because of my interest of being an FBI
13 agent.

14 In my CTE program, we are
15 able to earn up to 13 college credits
16 as completed and we leave with an
17 industry certification. And also, I am
18 currently interning at Drexel
19 University with Dr. Kareem Edwards and
20 the CSEA STEM lab.

21 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Listen,
22 we want to thank each of you for your
23 testimony here today. And I want to
24 really thank you Marie Wilkins Walker
25 for putting those data points on the

1 record. If you saw me glance over at
2 Councilwoman Katherine Gilmore
3 Richardson, I was saying, yes, she's
4 getting those actual numbers that we
5 need on the record.

6 Naderia, we're extremely
7 proud of you. And, Jose, you mentioned
8 CAPP. You know you can't say CAPP
9 without thinking of Walt McGill, may he
10 rest in peace, who helped to lay the
11 foundation, but just really proud of
12 your story and that you pressed on, and
13 thank each of you for your testimony.

14 Any questions or comments?
15 Councilwoman Gilmore Richardson?

16 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE
17 RICHARDSON: I just want to say thank
18 you so much for being here and to
19 Mr. Jacobs and to all of you,
20 particularly the young people for being
21 here, you make the difference. Thank
22 you for being a part of these programs
23 and for being in our city. We know
24 that you have bright futures ahead of
25 you.

1 Quickly I have a question
2 regarding the career tracking for CTE
3 programs in the District. Do we know
4 how many students typically stay in the
5 City of Philadelphia after graduation
6 and how many are employed by the City
7 of Philadelphia? Do we do any type of
8 career tracking for that 5,314
9 students?

10 MS. WILKINS WALKER: I would
11 say yes, we do career tracking. We
12 have follow-up after senior year. I
13 did look at a PowerPoint yesterday, but
14 it wasn't specific. And I'm sure we
15 can get those data points to you for
16 that number. It's somewhere around 71
17 percent were employed and I want to say
18 maybe 34 percent in their career
19 pathway was the last data I saw from
20 last year.

21 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE

22 RICHARDSON: Thank you.

23 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Chair
24 recognizes Councilman O'Neill.

25 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Thank

1 you, Madam Chair. I may preface my
2 question to Mr. Jacobs involving the
3 School District with an explanation
4 from Mr. Zaccagni about the preferences
5 for police and fire. If I could get --
6 because I know there aren't a lot of
7 them, but there's one that involves the
8 public school system and there's one on
9 the police side that doesn't involve
10 legacy or veterans, the Explorer
11 program.

12 Could you go on the record
13 with what they are before I talk to the
14 School District about that?

15 MR. JACOBS: As far as giving
16 preference points to police and fire?

17 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Yes.
18 There are preferences besides legacy
19 and they're a much lower number, but
20 they are more in line with a lot of the
21 low single digit numbers.

22 Mr. Zaccagni, could you put those on
23 the record?

24 MR. ZACCAGNI: Michael
25 Zaccagni, Office of Human Resources. I

1 think you're referring to the Police
2 Code Debt Explorer program. I actually
3 don't have those numbers, but we
4 certainly can get them to you.

5 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: No, no,
6 not the numbers. Explain the program,
7 how much it gets. And there is
8 another --

9 MR. ZACCAGNI: Again, I don't
10 remember what the preference is for
11 that program.

12 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: --
13 preference. Okay.

14 MR. ZACCAGNI: So that's a
15 program that the Police Department
16 works specifically with I believe
17 students to make that transition, but I
18 don't have that information readily
19 available.

20 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Okay.
21 All right. Maybe before the end of the
22 hearing we can get it. I think it's 3
23 points but I'm not positive. I know
24 it's not 10 or 5. And can you explain
25 the preference on the fire test that is

1 beyond what the legacy and veterans
2 are? I know one is the paramedic
3 certification and another one is the
4 Randolph program, but I want to hear a
5 little more about those numbers.

6 MR. ZACCAGNI: Councilperson,
7 can I check to get that --

8 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: By the
9 way, I'm asking this to the Chair while
10 I'm asking -- I know you're waiting for
11 somebody to come up. Is there going to
12 be any testimony today about -- I know
13 the last police class was very small
14 and very nondiverse, but I've been told
15 that they were trying for diversity.

16 One of the reasons the class
17 was so small was they couldn't get it
18 no matter how hard they tried. There's
19 other issues involved that have nothing
20 to do with the ability of getting young
21 people to apply in today's environment,
22 which is not exactly pro-police out
23 there in a lot of neighborhoods and
24 communities. But I don't think there's
25 anybody here from the Police Department

1 that could give us that and the -- I've
2 been told loud and clear that
3 everything was done possible and that's
4 why we have a tiny class, not a small
5 class. It's tiny.

6 But I'd like to get as much
7 on the record here as possible since
8 the bill is going to be -- the
9 implementation bill is going to be
10 later in front of Law and Government,
11 but we're voting for that bill as well
12 without knowing what it is.

13 MR. ZACCAGNI: We'll try to
14 get that information. Actually to the
15 police, there were a significant number
16 of candidates but as we went through
17 sort of the selection and review
18 process, a number -- an amazing number
19 has fallen through. We actually do
20 have a meeting scheduled to talk about
21 those specific issues. I don't have
22 that specific information now.

23 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Okay. I
24 wish they could have been here today
25 because it is, I think, a significant

1 part of the discussion around this, but
2 thank you.

3 Mr. Jacobs, the Randolph
4 program with the fire, there is I
5 believe 3 points, I may be wrong. But
6 there's a 3-point preference for that
7 program. It's been around a while.
8 It's not in a Charter provision but it
9 could be added as part of the
10 implementation of this bill and
11 codified that way, but it's been
12 operational for a while.

13 I thought when I first heard
14 about the Randolph program several
15 years ago that it was kind of being
16 tested in Randolph but it was not only
17 going to be in Randolph because of
18 geography and how large the City is and
19 all that. Is there any -- can you
20 explain that, that it's still in one
21 school? Is there a reason? Is it
22 money? Is it interest?

23 MR. JACOBS: We will have our
24 Executive Director explain it.

25 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Okay.

1 That's fine.

2 MS. ARMSTRONG: Hello.

3 Michelle Armstrong, Executive Director
4 of Career and Technical Education for
5 the School District of Philadelphia.

6 In regards to your question about the
7 EMT program that we can currently have
8 at Randolph, there are conversations
9 every year about whether or not we
10 should expand, where we can expand.

11 There are -- but I want to
12 talk about why it's at Randolph. As
13 you may know, all of our schools are
14 city-wide admit programs, right.

15 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Right.

16 MS. ARMSTRONG: Randolph is a
17 program that any young person from
18 anywhere in the School District of
19 Philadelphia can go --

20 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: I
21 understand.

22 MS. ARMSTRONG: -- so it's
23 not necessarily limited to that area.
24 Conversations regarding expanding
25 takes -- we have to take a lot of

1 things into consideration. We are
2 having those conversations, but we have
3 to take into consideration what schools
4 have space, what is the cost of
5 renovating these programs, what's the
6 cost of the program and it's also an
7 existing partnership with us and the
8 Fire Department, so it's a conversation
9 and decision that can't be made
10 unilaterally. It has to be made in
11 partnership with the Fire Department.

12 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Right.
13 How long has the Randolph program been
14 in existence?

15 MS. ARMSTRONG: Over about 10
16 years. I would argue maybe a little
17 bit more than 10 years, but yes, about
18 10 years.

19 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: It seems
20 to me like if it were going to be
21 expanded, it would have happened
22 already. But that's a long -- kind of
23 the word testing period, that's a long
24 time that for whatever reasons, and I'm
25 not questioning any of them, between

1 budget, facilities and everything else.

2 But it does limit even though
3 it's city-wide, somebody that's going
4 to have to travel an hour-and-a-half
5 each way versus 15 minutes to a half
6 hour each way, it does enter into
7 decisions. But I appreciate the
8 information. That's all I really want,
9 because what I'm really getting at from
10 Mr. Jacobs or anyone else is, has there
11 been any discussion at the School
12 District to develop a program in
13 conjunction with the Police Department
14 that would mirror what we've been doing
15 for 10 years with the Fire EMT, whether
16 it's based on the Explorer program and
17 would be a significant incentive.

18 On the fire test, 3 points is
19 gold, platinum. You can imagine
20 because everyone's lumped around 100 on
21 the test, so those that have preference
22 it's really meaningful. If there was 1
23 point, it's extremely meaningful. But
24 has there been any discussion about
25 having that same program developed with

1 the Police Department. Same kind of
2 program meaning something as analogous
3 as you can possibly make it, to mirror
4 it and have a CTE program that would
5 identify with that. I don't know, but
6 it's something I'd like to at least
7 discuss or have on the record today.
8 Have there been discussions? If there
9 hasn't been, what have been the
10 obstacles, that kind of thing?

11 MS. ARMSTRONG: We've had
12 discussions. We've looked at the
13 feasibility of actually having a
14 successful program, including finding a
15 qualified teacher. As you know,
16 someone stated that we have regulations
17 regarding what a teacher could be so
18 there's been conversations about that.

19 We haven't moved forward in
20 the past, but every year we try to
21 align an open and expand programs to
22 align to the workforce needs of the
23 City and we're open to engaging in that
24 conversation now in the future. And
25 you've testified and shared that there

1 is a need for young people to enter or
2 access to the Police Department, and we
3 are willing to engage in that
4 conversation.

5 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Okay.
6 Thank you.

7 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
8 you, Councilman O'Neill. We will just
9 ask for your patience. Please don't
10 leave because we have more comments and
11 questions. It has come to my attention
12 that certain members of this Committee
13 need to leave on Council business, so I
14 will briefly recess the public hearing
15 and go into a public meeting to allow
16 those members to leave their votes for
17 the record before they depart.

18 We will now recess the public
19 hearing and go into a public meeting
20 and the Chair recognizes Councilmember
21 Green.

22 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you,
23 Madam Chair. Unfortunately, I need to
24 leave this Committee hearing on Council
25 business outside of the City Hall

1 chambers and wish to be recorded as
2 voting aye on any motion and report
3 Bill No. 200006 from this Committee
4 favorably with a rules suspension so
5 this bill can have first reading at our
6 next session of Council.

7 I also want to vote aye on
8 the motion and report Resolution No.
9 200040 from this Committee with a
10 favorable recommendation. Thank you,
11 Madam Chair.

12 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
13 you. So noted, Councilman Green. We
14 will now return to the public hearing
15 and continue to taking testimony, and
16 the Chair recognizes Councilwoman Maria
17 Quinones-Sanchez.

18 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-
19 SANCHEZ: Thank you. I wanted to ask
20 our person from HR to come back up, our
21 interim Director Mike to come back up
22 to just to have a conversation. I
23 think this is such a worthy
24 conversation. I apologize for not
25 being a part of the conversation as it

1 relates to CTE in particular. But
2 before we go in there, I know that in
3 my new role as Chair of Education, we
4 are going to continue to have these
5 conversations.

6 I have to remind my
7 colleagues that over the course of the
8 last 10 years when Corbett slashed a
9 lot of this money, our money for CTE is
10 funded at the state level. And so, it
11 is unfair for us to expect the School
12 District when it's juggling this, and
13 again, it's real personal to me as a
14 graduate of a CTE program and, again,
15 having experienced when we had a lot of
16 money and the ability to get kids
17 trained and onsite and job sites, and
18 we're going to get there, and I welcome
19 that conversation definitely in this
20 budget and as we move forward.

21 But my Council colleague
22 brings up some issues that are a
23 continuing conversation around our
24 testing methodology how we exclude
25 people from this process, right. The

1 Fire Department is very different. We
2 have the Fire Explorers. That list
3 gets exhausted every single time,
4 right. And I think for the next year
5 or two that's going to get exhausted.

6 As it relates to the Police
7 Department, I think it's important in
8 this conversation and for all of us to
9 understand how many people get excluded
10 that don't even get ranked, right. And
11 so, I'm asking you what is the
12 percentage of folks who apply, who get
13 excluded, who don't even make it to the
14 list and then how many people will any
15 preference point Philadelphians,
16 whatever, could any preference help,
17 right, so that we can get to that point
18 of diversity?

19 MR. ZACCAGNI: So of the
20 multi-hurdle, they go through some
21 reading examinations, they'll go
22 through a physical test, from the
23 standpoint I think they run a mile and
24 a half, so there's all these different
25 points where people fall by the

1 wayside. So --

2 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-

3 SANCHEZ: And do you think all those
4 testing methodologies are fair to
5 Philadelphians and people of color who
6 come from these neighborhoods?

7 MR. ZACCAGNI: So I believe
8 some of those are required by the
9 state, so I would have to check and see
10 which ones were. So what the Police
11 Department does -- now, I don't know
12 whether the specific test they use for
13 reading is actually required by the
14 state or whether it's not.

15 I know that it's a reading
16 test that's well-known within that
17 community and so forth. My wife is a
18 reading specialist, I actually asked
19 her about that. So what we're going to
20 actually look at though, because the
21 last class I just realized was
22 extremely tiny from that standpoint, so
23 we're going to get together to sort of
24 look at what that funnel looks like.

25 And we're looking at those

1 funnels for a number of different
2 positions, how people drop off after
3 various points within the process;
4 because one of the challenges we have
5 as we're using testing methodologies is
6 that there's implicit bias and a lot of
7 these standardized tests is one of the
8 reasons that colleges went away from
9 the SATs. So we acknowledge that. We
10 know that.

11 The challenge for us is how
12 do we put together a selection process
13 that is fair to everybody and still has
14 the rigorous competition component that
15 the Charter requires. I've been in
16 education a long time and I understand
17 the challenges with that.

18 So one of the things that
19 we're starting to do now is trying to
20 test some other ways of doing it and
21 looking at different types of skills
22 tests so that we can better. But from
23 this standpoint, again when I started
24 off we are not opposed to the goal of
25 really reaching out and creating these

1 partnerships with schools.

2 I think that's an
3 unbelievably important aspect,
4 especially with the way education
5 requirements are going to change over
6 the next 10 years. Companies are
7 dropping requirements for degree
8 requirements. You're going to see a
9 major change in the education
10 environment just within the nation, so
11 we've got to be prepared for that.

12 And one of the ways is really
13 looking at those programs that develop
14 these specific types of skills so we
15 can use within the City of
16 Philadelphia.

17 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-
18 SANCHEZ: I appreciate that because it
19 has been a challenge. Again, as
20 someone who never tested well, now we
21 have fancy terms, implicit bias and all
22 of those things. The fact is that not
23 all things are equal, right, and in the
24 world as we try to design and level out
25 the playing field, I don't want the

1 good to be the enemy of the perfect.

2 The fact of the matter is I'm
3 glad that we're talking about this
4 testing bias because I'm under the
5 belief that there's a certain level of
6 reading, math and some other skills
7 that people need and from that point
8 on, it should be more random than it
9 is, because we've created a system
10 where -- and again, I have supported
11 the veteran preferences, the legacy
12 preference, all of those things because
13 anything that helps us promote
14 Philadelphians in the kind of diversity
15 that we want, but I also understand as
16 someone who has advocated
17 unsuccessfully in getting the human
18 services components to really look at
19 language, particularly with first
20 responders because this is now about
21 safety. You don't want to be in a fire
22 and someone's speaking Spanish or
23 Chinese and people don't know.

24 For police, I think it's a
25 safety issue across the board and that

1 the institutions have resistance to
2 that, right, because certain people
3 want to acknowledge skills or
4 categorize skills in their definition.

5 And so, I think it's
6 important that we have a broader
7 conversation because I think what we've
8 learned from the previous
9 administration who added the two years
10 college, did a bunch of stuff, so now
11 what is the goal, what is the spirit of
12 the goal?

13 Everybody wants
14 highly-qualified, committed folks to
15 come into the system. But to have a
16 notion that the system is fair when we
17 know it isn't, we need to acknowledge
18 that and then we need to acknowledge
19 how do we work through those tension
20 points as we reach this broader
21 audience.

22 But the numbers speak for
23 themselves. How many people get
24 excluded speaks for itself. The lack
25 of diversity in the classes and within

1 those four speak for itself. We can
2 argue all we want. The numbers are the
3 numbers. And who has access and who
4 doesn't is very, very clear and we
5 should be all be committed to work and
6 make that better, right. It's not
7 about excluding a group. It's about
8 leveling out the playing field when all
9 things are not equal.

10 MR. ZACCAGNI: I can't agree
11 with you more. It's one of the things
12 that we're pressing more within our
13 agency to look at the data, and
14 sometimes it's a challenge. At times
15 you get data out of our systems. But
16 that's one of the things that we're
17 looking at clearly, how does that
18 funnel where people sort of fall out of
19 the process, is there anything we can
20 do different to sort of effect that.
21 We're working closely with the Office
22 of Diversity and Inclusion, Nolans
23 Group, so it is something that I know
24 is at the top of the Administration,
25 but it's also very important for us as

1 an office.

2 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-

3 SANCHEZ: And I remind folks that
4 testing companies make a whole lot of
5 money. Testing is a big business all
6 across the board and we're trying to
7 get Philadelphians who are committed,
8 who have identified a coursework where
9 they want to be in public service, and
10 I take the public service part of this,
11 particularly for first responders very,
12 very serious.

13 The folks who I know who are
14 my friends, I'm running out of a fire,
15 they're running into a fire, total
16 respect for that. But we can get to a
17 better place and we have to acknowledge
18 that we have not done the job we could,
19 so I appreciate it and I look forward
20 to that conversation.

21 MR. ZACCAGNI: Thank you.

22 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-

23 SANCHEZ: Thank you.

24 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Mike,
25 we just want you to stay there just for

1 a second. I want to just lend my voice
2 to this and say, one, thank you, thank
3 the Administration and Mayor Kenney,
4 number one, for your being very
5 transparent and acknowledging publicly
6 on the record that we as a city, we've
7 already had on our radar screen that we
8 needed to review cross-reference and
9 really figure out how and why issues
10 relative to diversity and inclusion
11 across City government, what are we
12 doing wrong. And I appreciate you just
13 acknowledging that process on the
14 record.

15 In addition to that, if we
16 went back to the notes of testimony
17 from our last budget session, all of
18 these questions regarding police and
19 fire relative to the testing and the
20 numbers, and the police, they talked
21 about difficulty in recruiting,
22 particularly in minority communities.
23 They talked about going to John Jay,
24 the HBCU tour that they did, working
25 hard so we know that the Police

1 Department has taken some very specific
2 steps to address this issue and we
3 can't say enough about Fire.

4 But what I want the public to
5 know, and when we were going through
6 the hearing, this became very
7 frustrating, because it's our job to
8 raise these questions, no one in the
9 City of Philadelphia should leave from
10 watching at home or out of this room
11 and thinking that each and every member
12 of this body does not wholeheartedly
13 support the men and women who put their
14 lives on the line for us on a daily
15 basis, that we don't wholeheartedly
16 support Fire, just all of the work that
17 they do as first responders, addressing
18 the gun violence, protecting us. They
19 risk their lives and we respect that
20 and we all have records that we've
21 supported them and will go to war over
22 them, particularly Councilwoman, my
23 captain and don't mess with them
24 because we're going to fight for them
25 in every district it is, right, but

1 that doesn't mean we don't ask these
2 questions right now.

3 So I just wanted to say thank
4 you and thank the Administration for
5 your willingness to partner and work
6 with Council in order to address these
7 issues.

8 MR. ZACCAGNI: I appreciate
9 that.

10 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Chair
11 recognizes Councilman O'Neill.

12 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Thank
13 you, Madam Chair. I would like to
14 thank Councilwoman Sanchez. She
15 annunciated a lot of things and
16 elicited some testimony that is
17 extremely good and I agree with you on
18 that. When you're producing some of
19 the requested information with
20 exclusion, demographics, the exclusion,
21 make sure you include the reasons
22 because it will help many of us with
23 that.

24 And you mentioned trying to
25 improve the test and I know it comes up

1 in budget hearings, it comes up in
2 other discussions. One thing I'm a big
3 believer in is that there's somebody
4 out there that's doing it right and it
5 may actually be a lot more than one in
6 this case. But you don't have to go
7 to -- I mean, we just hired a new
8 police commissioner from many people is
9 a large city, but not compared to New
10 York or Philadelphia or Chicago or LA,
11 but that might be a good place to
12 start. In Portland, they're about as
13 progressive as you come in the country.

14 But places that are not
15 having this problem, Portland may be a
16 bad example because I don't know what
17 their citizen demographic is, but
18 certainly with Chicago, LA, Atlanta,
19 different cities like that, Dallas, we
20 know that there's a significant
21 minority component, so maybe we can
22 look at what's already been done, maybe
23 it's been working for a long time that
24 we don't have to keep studying to get
25 there.

1 And then the last thing is
2 that the new commissioner coming in,
3 probably new brass as we call them.
4 Maybe they can jump in early on this
5 and when their learning curve is going
6 on; because if we've been working on
7 this for years, it's obviously not
8 producing it.

9 But I have one technical
10 question and I didn't think of it
11 earlier. Is there a preference in the
12 police and fire test, and I think it's
13 in that 3 point range of EMT at
14 Randolph that is for bilingual?

15 MR. ZACCAGNI: Yes, I believe
16 it's 3 points.

17 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: It's 3
18 points?

19 MR. ZACCAGNI: Yes.

20 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: So in
21 Fire particularly, because I don't get
22 as much on the lumping of everybody at
23 the top of the fire test where you can
24 make the class if you have a preference
25 and if you get 100, you probably stand

1 a very small chance of getting in, but
2 I just wanted to get that on the record
3 because obviously, that is pretty tough
4 if somebody doesn't understand somebody
5 else, and we could have avoided that.

6 Okay. Thank you.

7 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
8 you. Are there any other questions for
9 any members of the panel?

10 (No response.)

11 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Hearing
12 none, thank you all so very much for
13 your testimony. Now, let me just ask
14 is there anyone else who is present who
15 is interested in testifying on this
16 bill? If so, please feel free to come
17 up.

18 (Panel approached
19 Witness Table.)

20 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: While
21 our next panel is coming up,
22 Councilman, I just want to agree with
23 you wholeheartedly on the idea of
24 Commissioner Outlaw and her fresh eyes
25 coming to the City of Philadelphia. I

1 think we're all really excited about
2 it. Because as you noted while we've
3 been working on some of these issues
4 for many, many years, it will be great
5 to view the issue through the lens of
6 someone who's worked in other places
7 with knowledge of those best practices
8 that you referenced that you could find
9 in other locales similarly situated as
10 Philadelphia, so I agree with you
11 wholeheartedly.

12 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: It will
13 be also be interesting for us, even if
14 it has to be done privately, to see in
15 those 30-something interviews that were
16 done before they reduced the finalist,
17 this had to be a question, what good
18 stuff came out of the people that
19 didn't get chosen but provided --
20 because you got to be taking notes on
21 what's working in Boston or what's
22 working in Chicago or some other city
23 or cities and that maybe we're just not
24 doing or could be doing fairly quick
25 and easy even. Okay. Thank you.

1 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER:

2 Gentlemen, feel free to state your name
3 for the record and proceed with your
4 testimony.

5 MR. GINDER: Madam

6 Chairperson, Councilmembers, good
7 morning. My name is George Ginder.

8 I'm a proud veteran and a graduate of a
9 technical program. I'm also a member
10 of the Philadelphia Veterans Advisory
11 Commission.

12 In speaking for myself and
13 for the Veterans Advisory Commission,
14 we are opposed to this question being
15 placed on the ballot in April. Having
16 only learned of this program in the
17 last 24 hours, I contacted a number of
18 veterans, including my fellow
19 commissioners and no one is in favor of
20 this question as it reads.

21 The Preference program was
22 designed to recognize preference and
23 give preference to veterans who have
24 served their country, to firefighters
25 and police officers, the families of

1 firefighters and police officers who
2 have been killed in action. This
3 program is especially identified for
4 veterans, firefighters and police
5 officers. Now, there's an amendment
6 being proposed to add someone from a
7 technical program.

8 Councilmembers, there may be
9 a need to recognize people who are
10 graduating from such a program and
11 other programs, but I don't believe and
12 my fellow commissioners don't believe
13 that it should be attached to the
14 amendment where it says here preference
15 is given preference to entrance on a
16 test. My fellow commissioners don't
17 believe in it and I don't believe in it
18 as it is worded right now. Thank you.

19 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
20 you. Anyone with any further comments?

21 (No response.)

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Listen,
23 I just want to thank you all so very
24 much for your testimony. Any questions
25 or comments? Feel free to state your

1 name for the record and then proceed
2 with your testimony.

3 MR. ARAGONCILLO: Thank you,
4 Madam Chair. My name is Carlo
5 Aragoncillo, Director of Veterans
6 Affairs for the City of Philadelphia.
7 I do agree there needs to be a solution
8 to develop a pipeline from education to
9 skilled workforce, bridge the skilled
10 gaps for vacant jobs and also upscale
11 our youth to set them up for success.

12 But I also wanted to remind
13 Philadelphians, the City of
14 Philadelphia was the nation's first
15 capital, the birthplace of three of the
16 five branches, the Army, Navy and
17 Marine Corp. And the reason why I say
18 that is as a military community,
19 military community to date is the most
20 diverse workforce to include male and
21 female, people of color, LGBTQ, from
22 all walks of life, all backgrounds.

23 You have to consider they
24 have years of experience with skills,
25 not just by trade, but also in

1 leadership positions, in combat roles
2 and support roles where lives are at
3 stake. And after exiting the military,
4 they also come away with certifications
5 in education as well.

6 The City of Philadelphia in
7 an effort to do the right thing
8 established the Veterans Advisory
9 Commission in an advisory role in 1957.
10 They only just recently in 2019
11 formally established the Office of
12 Veterans Affairs for the City of
13 Philadelphia.

14 So the reality is there is
15 work to be done out there to support
16 veterans and their families. As of
17 2018, the last five-year estimates from
18 American Community Survey based on the
19 Census Bureau list that we have on or
20 around 59,000 veterans that live in
21 Philadelphia County, but that's not
22 considering the family members and
23 dependents as well which equal to about
24 120,000 to 130,000 people in
25 Philadelphia.

1 In addition to Councilman
2 Oh's tax credit that he introduced back
3 in 2012, the only official policy that
4 exists affecting veterans in that
5 10-point preference within civil
6 service. Veterans are an
7 underrepresented population. As of
8 2017, only 1.8 percent of the 30,000
9 workforce is comprised of veterans.

10 Every year 200,000 service
11 members exit the military coming into
12 the City of Philadelphia and other
13 major metropolitan areas. My challenge
14 to City Council and actually the City
15 of Philadelphia is, is the City of
16 Philadelphia ready and able to support
17 even 1 percent of those veterans, 2,000
18 people coming into the City of
19 Philadelphia. The answer is no, but
20 we're getting ready and we're posturing
21 to make it a ready city.

22 Nineteen years ago, we
23 started the Afghanistan and Iraq war.
24 So as of 2020, we're still fighting
25 these endless wars in Iraq and

1 Afghanistan. We say that we support
2 our troops. The reality is we haven't
3 done enough. The only existing
4 initiative is the veterans hiring
5 initiative through the Civil Service
6 10-point preference.

7 My office, the Office of
8 Veterans Affairs, works with the Office
9 of Human Resources and also Workforce
10 Development, also reaches out to PA
11 Department Military of Veteran Affairs,
12 working with the governor's office,
13 also the Pentagon, DOD, DOL and the VA.
14 We're working to increase visibility of
15 existing hiring initiatives to backfill
16 necessary positions to build up,
17 support and protect our city by
18 honoring and hiring our veterans and
19 their families, and this is best
20 supported by preserving the existing
21 veterans preference.

22 So I ask you in designing and
23 implementing the CTE preference, should
24 that take effect, please also consider
25 the veterans and their families and

1 they reintegrate back in our
2 communities. Thank you.

3 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
4 you so much. Chair recognizes
5 Councilwoman Gilmore Richardson.

6 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE
7 RICHARDSON: Thank you, Madam Chair.
8 First, I want to say thank you so much
9 for your service, your commitment to
10 our country and your service to the
11 people that we serve. As a daughter of
12 an army veteran and I now have my
13 legislative aide Shawn, I just want to
14 recognize you, who served three tours
15 in Afghanistan and Iraq in 2003 and
16 '04, 2004 through 2006 and 2008 and
17 2009. And he was a person who actually
18 drafted this legislation, so I also
19 want to thank you for your service.

20 I do agree also as a member
21 of Zeta Phi Beta Sorority Inc. where we
22 partner with Women's Veterans ROCK and
23 just gave them a \$25,000 donation that
24 we have to continue to do all that we
25 can for our veterans, not only in the

1 City of Philadelphia but across our
2 country.

3 We need to ensure that we're
4 doing all we can to connect you with
5 employment opportunities both in the
6 public sector and the private sector,
7 but I also do think we need to do more
8 for young people in our career and
9 technical education programs as well,
10 and that will be addressed in the other
11 Committee hearing.

12 That's not today. That will
13 be scheduled at a later time so I would
14 like you to come back, and we can have
15 subsequent and further conversation in
16 between now and that hearing so we can
17 adequately take in your comments and
18 concerns and ensure that we are looking
19 to address them as we move forward with
20 the legislation, but thank you so much
21 for being here. And from the bottom of
22 my heart, thank you for your service.

23 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Chair
24 recognizes Councilman O'Neill.

25 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Yeah, I

1 thank you for you coming, for your
2 testimony and for your service, all
3 three of you. And I want to just state
4 while I stated earlier in the hearing,
5 I'm in agreement with the intent of the
6 bill. It is the vagueness of it'll
7 happen later what really is on the
8 ballot, which is that implementation
9 bill. In addition to the general
10 language here, I have to know more
11 about it and I'm going to be voting
12 against it today.

13 If something changes in the
14 next week, I will vote for it on final
15 passage. If nothing changes and the
16 strongest thing that I'm against is the
17 10 and the legacy, that it not -- it be
18 in the 2 to 3 range, which many of our
19 other preferences are whatever we come
20 up with.

21 But I do agree with you that
22 because it's fast-tracked, there is not
23 enough -- I think the next eight days
24 should be enough time to put some
25 parameters around even if they're not

1 as specific as everyone would like, and
2 that won't happen until the hearing on
3 Labor and Civil Service, that there's
4 some confidence next Thursday that
5 certain things like the Veterans and
6 Legacy will not be joined by the
7 intent -- the people that this bill is
8 intended to help. Thank you.

9 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
10 you, Councilman O'Neill. Let me also
11 just conclude by also saying a special
12 thank you --

13 MR. BOYLE: May I speak,
14 ma'am?

15 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Oh,
16 sure. And that was it, we wanted all
17 of you to speak before we began asking
18 questions. Feel free to proceed with
19 your testimony. Just state your name
20 for the record.

21 MR. BOYLE: Good afternoon,
22 Madam Chair, members of Council. I'm
23 Anthony F. Boyle. I am a retired Air
24 Force veteran. I am also a member of
25 your Veterans Advisory Commission, and

1 it is from that position that I speak
2 today. I'm also a member of the
3 Philadelphia Police Department. So I
4 have more than one interest in this
5 legislation. And I want to speak of
6 the significance of a permanent
7 preference being made through this
8 legislation.

9 Preferences are something
10 that should be extremely exceptional in
11 any process. None of us like
12 preferences, whether it be competitive
13 activities or in just general efforts
14 to get ahead or to get a job, that
15 everyone should have the same
16 opportunity, the same standing from the
17 start. And, therefore, if we do
18 identify particular groups for
19 preference, it needs to be exceptional.

20 It needs to be the
21 exceptional veterans community or it
22 needs to be the exceptional group of
23 children whose parents have lost their
24 lives in service to this City. That's
25 a preference group that no one ever

1 wants to be in, so it should be the
2 rarest of groups to get a preference
3 over someone else.

4 We don't like people butting
5 in lines at the grocery. We don't like
6 people getting ahead of other people
7 who are also in a particular line, so
8 it's something that shouldn't be looked
9 upon with any kind of cavalier,
10 although very, very genuinely
11 good-natured reason to do it.

12 We could argue groups,
13 including as Councilman Oh said, people
14 with disabilities, et cetera, that have
15 legitimate and sometimes heart-breaking
16 stories but still should compete on a
17 regular level just like everyone else.
18 And it's the message that this bill
19 sends as well that I question.

20 The CTE program is wonderful,
21 but what's the message to other people
22 who graduate from just a regular high
23 school or how about the folks who may
24 have had much greater difficulty in
25 life and in education that got their

1 GED through tremendous effort who do
2 not qualify for a particular
3 preference.

4 And yet we've heard today in
5 testimony that a lot of the CTE
6 students just by that education have a
7 leg-up over other graduates just from
8 the regular high schools. So to put
9 them ahead, it could be argued putting
10 them ahead of people with just regular
11 general Philadelphia high school
12 education, that they're already on a
13 much better path for success than just
14 the regular high school graduates, and
15 that's not a message that I think we
16 should be sending.

17 And the question also is when
18 does it stop. And I think that we have
19 also proven with the more minor
20 preferences that we get to, the
21 Explorers or to the Randolph program or
22 to other folks, that it can be done
23 where there is a need to be filled and,
24 therefore, maybe a temporary preference
25 be given for a particular workset, that

1 it can be done and it can be done
2 without the Charter change and without
3 the question on the ballot, et cetera,
4 we're doing it now.

5 And so, I oppose this
6 question being put to the electorate
7 for two reasons. First of all, I don't
8 think that the CTE group should be a
9 permanent preference group like the
10 exceptional groups that are already
11 permanently preferred such as veterans,
12 such as the survivor children of the
13 City.

14 And the other is that this
15 process, this question I believe and I
16 agree with Councilman O'Neill, it is a
17 premature exercise. It's vote on it
18 first and then we'll let you know how
19 it's going to be run or what it is
20 you're voting on, but just vote on the
21 idea first and then we'll tell you the
22 specifics. I don't think that's how
23 it's supposed to work.

24 If you want the electorate to
25 vote on this particular preference,

1 tell them what preference they're
2 voting on. Tell them what the
3 mechanics of it are, not just the
4 general idea, and then down the road it
5 can be structured however the future
6 turns out to be.

7 There's been I think too much
8 of a rush to get this on the ballot
9 when I think of a more debated and more
10 considered preference, if any, can be
11 ironed out through the legislative body
12 and then the election in November or
13 it's only a matter of months. It can
14 be a much more deliberative process and
15 question than this rush that we see
16 now, and I thank you very much.

17 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
18 you so very much. Chair recognizes
19 Councilwoman Gilmore Richardson.

20 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE
21 RICHARDSON: Thank you, Madam Chair.
22 And thank you for your testimony and
23 for all the points that you gave. I
24 just want to say for the record that it
25 is my commitment as the sponsor of this

1 legislation to work with all
2 stakeholders, including all of you, to
3 talk about the tenets of the other bill
4 that will be heard in Labor and Civil
5 Service. Thank you so much.

6 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
7 you. And I too, let me just note for
8 the record, I'm very fortunate in life
9 to have been raised by my grandparents
10 and my grandfather was a disabled Navy
11 veteran. I want to say to each of you,
12 we appreciate the work that you do in
13 our great city on behalf of one of my
14 valuable constituencies who has not
15 received the attention and/or support
16 that it needs.

17 And I would argue from
18 federal government, from state
19 government to local government there
20 are avenues and programs that should be
21 supported in a much more robust manner.
22 And I know I can speak for my
23 colleagues here and say that here in
24 Council we look forward to continuing
25 to advocate with our veterans community

1 at all levels and all branches of
2 government and we appreciate the
3 comments that you've made here today,
4 and because we know of her work and the
5 very meticulous nature that she employs
6 when working through the legislative
7 process, that Bill No. 200007 is going
8 to be referred to the Committee or it's
9 been referred to the Committee on Labor
10 and Civil Service and as the Chair of
11 that Committee working in conjunction
12 with the sponsor, please know that as
13 soon as a date is identified in draft
14 language, we know the sponsor will make
15 sure that information is forwarded to
16 each of you to share with your
17 constituencies and as we just go
18 through this process and have all
19 confidence that she will manage it as
20 efficiently and effectively as possible
21 and inclusive, because that's the way
22 she has always worked, so I just want
23 to thank you for your testimony. And I
24 think you had a comment that you wanted
25 to make, sir.

1 MR. GINDER: Yes, ma'am. I
2 just wanted to add that neither the
3 Veterans Affairs Office or the
4 Philadelphia Veterans Advisory
5 Commission was alerted to this.
6 Nothing was discussed with us. We
7 didn't know about it until personally
8 myself 24 hours ago. I would think as
9 a resource for Council, we should have
10 been alerted about this program. Thank
11 you.

12 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Well,
13 let me just note for the record, again
14 you are here, you are here today, you
15 have let your voices be heard.
16 Councilwoman Gilmore Richardson, the
17 bill chief's sponsor, has publicly
18 noted on the record that she will do
19 what she does and that is to work with
20 all stakeholders that have a nickel in
21 this quarter and make sure that your
22 voice is heard as this process moves
23 forward. So I want to thank each of
24 you for being here. Thank you so very
25 much.

1 Is there anyone else here to
2 testify on Bill No. 200006 and
3 Resolution 200040?

4 (No response.)

5 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: There
6 being none here to testify on the bill
7 or resolution before this Committee,
8 this concludes the public hearing. We
9 will now go into the public meeting to
10 consider the action to be taken on
11 what's being heard today. The Chair
12 recognizes Councilmember Sanchez for a
13 motion on Bill No. 200006.

14 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-
15 SANCHEZ: Thank you, Madam Chair. I
16 move that Bill No. 200006 be reported
17 out of this Committee with a favorable
18 recommendation and further move that
19 the rules of Council be suspended to
20 permit first reading of this bill at
21 the next session.

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: It's
23 been moved and properly seconded that
24 Bill No. 200006 be reported from this
25 Committee with a favorable

1 recommendation and further move that
2 the rules of Council be suspended to
3 permit first reading of this bill at
4 the next session of Council. All those
5 in favor of the motion will signify by
6 saying aye.

7 (Aye.)

8 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Those
9 opposed?

10 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Nay.

11 COUNCILMAN OH: Nay.

12 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Two
13 nays, O'Neill and Oh. And I just want
14 to note for the record and as a
15 reminder for the public, that
16 Councilmembers Helen Gym, Cindy Bass,
17 Derek Green have left their votes in
18 favor prior to having to leave.

19 The ayes have it and the
20 motions carries. Bill No. 200006 will
21 be reported from this Committee with a
22 favorable recommendation with the
23 request that the rules of Council be
24 suspended to permit first reading at
25 the next session of Council.

1 The Chair recognizes
2 Councilmember Quinones-Sanchez for a
3 motion on Resolution No. 200040.

4 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-
5 SANCHEZ: Thank you, Madam Chair. I
6 move that Resolution No. 200040 be
7 reported from this Committee with a
8 favorable recommendation.

9 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: It has
10 been moved and properly seconded that
11 Resolution No. 200040 be reported from
12 this Committee with a favorable
13 recommendation. All those in favor of
14 the motion will signify by saying aye.

15 (Aye.)

16 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Those
17 opposed?

18 COUNCILMAN OH: Nay.

19 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Nay.

20 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Two
21 nays, O'Neill and Oh. And I also want
22 to note for the record that
23 Councilmembers Helen Gym, Cindy Bass
24 and Derek Green left their votes in
25 favor of the resolution. The ayes have

1 it and the motion carries. Resolution
2 No. 200040 will be reported from this
3 Committee with a favorable
4 recommendation.

5 This concludes the business
6 of the Committee on Law and Government.
7 We want to thank each and every one of
8 you for your attendance today and we
9 look forward to working with you in the
10 future. Thank you.

11 (Committee on Law and
12 Government concluded at 12:15 p.m.)
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

I, hereby certify that the
proceedings and evidence noted are contained
fully and accurately in the stenographic
notes taken by me in the foregoing matter,
and this is a correct transcript of the
same.

Court Reporter - Notary Public

(The foregoing certification of
this transcript does not apply to any
reproduction of the same by any means,
unless under the direct control and/or
supervision of the certifying reporter.)

Committee on Law and Government
February 5, 2020

Page 1

A							
a.m 1:6	addition	43:14	73:10	application	area 83:23	audience	113:8
ability 9:2	19:12	agencies	87:15	41:25	areas 36:5	13:3 68:9	118:3
10:16 11:8	45:21	30:14,18	allowed	63:14	109:13	95:21	119:8
19:9 70:17	98:15	agency 96:13	18:19 64:4	applied 45:17	argue 4:22	authorizing	baring 52:9
80:20	109:1	agent 75:13	64:7	66:4	84:16 96:2	26:8	based 19:22
89:16	113:9	ages 43:7	allowing 9:5	apply 5:7	116:12	automotive	20:19
able 8:20	additional	agile 30:21	14:23 63:5	40:21 42:9	120:17	34:5,14	85:16
10:25	24:13	ago 3:4 28:11	allows 62:7	45:14,19	argued 117:9	available	108:18
20:25	37:13 72:6	39:22	alumni 63:5	64:25 66:1	Armstrong	58:21	basis 99:15
29:13	address 6:19	40:12	amazing	80:21	83:2,3,16	66:25	Bass 1:14
30:20 32:7	99:2 100:6	82:15	81:18	90:12	83:22	79:19	15:18
40:21	112:19	109:22	amazingly	127:20	84:15	avenues	31:12,13
46:21,25	addressed	122:8	61:24	appointed	86:11	120:20	32:9 35:4
55:23	112:10	agree 96:10	amended	2:21	army 107:16	average 45:9	35:11
63:19	addresses	100:17	7:18	appreciate	111:12	45:11,18	36:13,21
74:16,20,25	46:17	103:22	amendment	13:4 38:11	arrangeme...	avoided	37:9 69:6,7
75:15	addressing	104:10	7:8 25:22	58:4 62:15	26:9	103:5	69:22
109:16	99:17	107:7	26:12,19	68:3 70:2	articulation	awarded	124:16
absolutely	adds 24:8	111:20	106:5,14	85:7 93:18	70:23	48:13	125:23
22:2	adequately	113:21	America	97:19	asked 24:19	awareness	batteries
academically	112:17	118:16	10:14	98:12	91:18	59:5	74:17
71:2,25	administra...	agreement	American	100:8	asking 45:9	aye 68:19,25	battery 74:15
access 87:2	95:9 96:24	113:5	108:18	120:12	80:9,10	69:10,15	began 114:17
96:3	98:3 100:4	agreements	amount	121:2	90:11	88:2,7	behalf 120:13
accurately	admit 83:14	70:23 71:2	24:16	appreciated	114:17	124:6,7	belief 94:5
127:4	adult 64:8	ahead 76:24	Amtrak	57:25 68:6	aspect 93:3	125:14,15	believe 16:24
acknowledge	advance	115:14	63:21	apprentice	aspects 74:3	ayes 124:19	31:3 41:22
7:24 15:17	10:23	116:6	66:16,20	34:14	associated	125:25	46:20
92:9 95:3	advantage	117:9,10	analogous	65:11,15	3:16 5:22		48:19,22
95:17,18	56:4	aide 41:1	86:2	apprentices...	Association	B	49:8,10,18
97:17	advertised	111:13	and/or 8:25	36:7 51:23	8:4	back 13:8	50:5 59:12
acknowled...	4:3	Air 114:23	39:12	51:24 52:1	assume 55:20	25:5 45:13	64:11
98:5,13	advisory	alerted 122:5	51:11,12	52:2	55:24	47:1 56:15	79:16 82:5
acquire	105:10,13	122:10	52:21	approached	assuming	60:2,12	91:7
30:23	108:8,9	Ali 40:3,8,9	120:15	26:25	36:23	64:22	102:15
action 106:2	114:25	42:2 43:1	127:22	47:22	assuring	88:20,21	106:11,12
123:10	122:4	43:20 44:2	announce	58:12	59:14	98:16	106:17,17
activities	advocate	44:11,21	34:14	103:18	athlete 73:20	109:2	118:15
74:21	120:25	align 12:13	annual 73:8	appropriate	Atlanta	111:1	believer
115:13	advocated	28:15	annunciated	22:12 26:8	101:18	112:14	101:3
activity 4:16	94:16	31:20,25	100:15	approved	attached	backfill	believing
actual 17:16	Affairs 107:6	33:13,14	answer	26:3	106:13	110:15	68:10
76:4	108:12	34:23	109:19	approxima...	attainable	backgrounds	beloved
add 12:4 13:2	110:8,11	35:16 52:8	answers	47:18	63:22	107:22	10:18
36:15 53:7	122:3	86:21,22	45:12	April 3:12,21	attempted	bad 101:16	benefit 3:1
106:6	Affection	aligned 28:2	Anthony	4:3,9,11	64:14	ballot 3:6,7	30:5,6
122:2	72:10	28:14	114:23	65:1	attendance	3:11,12,13	33:16
added 41:13	Afghanistan	34:15	anybody	105:15	2:17 126:8	3:18,21 4:3	58:25
70:13 82:9	109:23	51:19	80:25	April's 4:23	attention	4:9,11,14	benefits
95:9	110:1	aligning	AP 73:18	5:14	67:13	4:23,24 5:1	70:14
adding 24:9	111:15	52:19,19	apathy 8:16	Aragoncillo	87:11	5:3,14,23	best 16:12
71:14	afternoon	aligns 34:2	apnea 64:19	107:3,5	120:15	18:17 26:7	55:19
	114:21	allies 61:18	apologize	Aramark	attracting	48:18 54:7	70:20
	age 29:6	allow 67:18	88:24	52:1	59:17	105:15	104:7

Committee on Law and Government
February 5, 2020

Page 2

110:19	107:15	95:20	10:21	127:23	32:18,23	citizens 11:13	civil 5:6,18
Beta 111:21	bit 24:22	broadly-wo...	16:15 17:6	cetera 116:14	93:5,9	70:12	6:1 7:11,19
better 4:19	31:15 33:8	5:23	18:20 24:9	118:3	118:2	city 1:1,4 2:5	8:11 14:24
12:13,15	39:19 40:4	Brotherly	26:1,16	Chair 1:10	changes	3:18 4:13	18:18
14:5 28:14	43:8 48:17	72:10	35:14 44:3	9:10,12	113:13,15	5:7 6:17,20	19:20 20:8
38:23 41:7	84:17	budget 85:1	48:25 55:9	12:21,23	charge 64:6	7:9 8:15,22	23:22 24:3
53:14	Blackwell	89:20	56:16 59:5	13:1 15:14	charged	9:9 15:10	25:24
92:22 96:6	66:10	98:17	60:17,20	15:16 18:3	48:11	16:15	26:14
97:17	Bloomsburg	101:1	71:19 72:2	18:8 21:10	56:14	19:17,20	33:12
117:13	64:16	build 28:13	72:8,14,18	21:11,14	Charles 65:3	25:21 26:4	34:17,21,24
beyond 80:1	board 33:2	29:14 30:2	72:19 73:6	23:9,13	66:9	33:2 35:17	35:15
bias 92:6	46:8 47:8	30:4 32:2	74:11 75:9	31:11,14	Charter 7:17	35:21,25	41:25 42:7
93:21 94:4	48:11 52:4	60:2 71:17	77:2,8,11	38:12,13,17	25:23	36:3,19	45:9,14,17
big 33:3	54:2,3 57:1	71:25	77:18 83:4	50:15	26:13 31:4	38:23 39:1	45:19
56:23 97:5	73:11	74:24	112:8	53:19	31:16,18	42:22 44:1	71:14
101:2	94:25 97:6	110:16	careers 11:1	54:25 55:2	32:18,23	44:2 46:6	109:5
bilingual	body 18:11	building	51:24 60:5	55:6 67:23	82:8 92:15	47:5,6	110:5
20:10	99:12	25:14 31:1	60:10	68:1,16	118:2	48:13 49:3	114:3
102:14	119:11	bunch 95:10	Carlo 107:4	69:5,8,20	check 80:7	49:6 50:5	120:4
bill 1:18 2:7,8	bonus 71:13	Bureau	carpentry	77:23 78:1	91:9	50:22	121:10
5:22 6:2,3	boost 74:23	108:19	11:22	80:9 87:20	CHERELLE	52:16	Clancy 47:21
6:4,5,9 7:3	bore 29:1	business	carries	87:23	1:10	57:24	47:25 48:6
7:5,7 8:9	born 59:9	62:20	124:20	88:11,16	Chicago	59:14,16	48:9 51:7
13:5 15:12	Boston	67:15	126:1	89:3	101:10,18	60:2 61:11	51:14
15:24	104:21	68:18 69:9	case 57:5	100:10,13	104:22	62:19	52:23
16:12 18:1	bottom	87:13,25	101:6	107:4	chief's	65:20 66:3	53:22 54:1
18:25 21:9	112:21	97:5 126:5	cast 25:4	111:4,7	122:17	66:24	54:14,18,23
23:21	Boulevard	butting 116:4	categorize	112:23	children	70:11 71:9	56:13 57:7
24:25	1:5	buy 60:21	95:4	114:22	16:18	72:9 73:14	57:12,18
25:17,19	Boyle 114:13		cavalier	119:18,21	17:21 21:4	74:8,25	58:3 66:12
32:21	114:21,23		116:9	121:10	24:4 56:7	76:23 77:5	clarify 41:21
36:23	branches	C	Census	123:11,15	115:23	77:6 82:18	42:2
37:12 45:7	107:16	C 127:1,1	108:19	125:1,5	118:12	86:23	class 14:4
63:17	121:1	47:15 58:7	century 71:6	Chairperson	Chinese	87:25	46:1 49:22
66:21 67:2	brass 102:3	102:3	CEO 48:9	105:6	94:23	93:15 98:6	63:8 74:18
68:20	breaking	called 2:3	certain 35:25	Chairwoman	choice 75:8	98:11 99:9	74:19
69:11 81:8	62:13	8:16 51:16	43:16	6:23 53:22	choices 72:5	101:9	75:10,11
81:9,11	Brian 1:14	65:10	67:14	challenge	choose 58:19	103:25	80:13,16
82:10 88:3	18:4	74:18 75:7	87:12 94:5	29:21	chose 63:9	104:22	81:4,5
88:5	bridge 107:9	calling 17:18	95:2 114:5	49:25	chosen	107:6,13	91:21
103:16	bridges 59:22	Candi 27:21	certainly	92:11	104:19	108:6,12	102:24
113:6,9	briefly 47:19	33:24	30:4 37:6	93:19	Chromebo...	109:12,14	classes 95:25
114:7	67:16	candidates	79:4	96:14	74:15	109:14,15	classroom
116:18	87:14	81:16	101:18	109:13	chute 23:8	109:18,21	41:13
120:3	bright 76:24	capacity	certificate	challenges	Cigna 10:11	110:17	clear 21:17
121:7	bring 12:7	19:18	10:24	28:8 29:18	Cindy 1:14	112:1	43:8 81:2
122:17	68:5	71:17	certification	92:4,17	15:18	115:24	96:4
123:2,6,13	bringing 13:5	capital	75:17 80:3	chambers	124:16	118:13	clearly 8:14
123:16,20	13:7 68:11	107:15	127:19	88:1	125:23	120:13	22:16
123:24	brings 72:5	CAPP 65:10	certifications	chance 49:21	cited 36:12	City's 9:4	33:14
124:3,20	89:22	76:8,8	62:3 108:4	53:16	cities 101:19	48:10	96:17
bills 3:17	broad 21:19	captain 99:23	certified 14:1	103:1	104:23	60:14	Clerk 25:16
4:20	64:2	career 5:5	certify 127:2	change 30:22	citizen 59:8	city-wide	25:19
birthplace	broader 95:6	7:12,20	certifying	31:5,17,18	101:17	83:14 85:3	26:22,24

Committee on Law and Government
February 5, 2020

Page 3

47:15,21	coming 8:10	8:11 18:15	35:19 36:1	36:22	9:7 12:3,12	1:11,12,13	16:5 18:2
58:7,9	23:7 28:16	19:9 23:23	36:9 56:5	60:23 65:7	15:13 18:9	1:14 2:17	21:11 23:9
closely 34:15	31:21 32:1	27:24	115:12	connection	19:23 21:8	15:18,20,21	23:10,12
96:21	33:15 39:8	44:24 52:6	complete	39:15	23:21	18:4,5,7	24:21
clusters	58:16	67:14	42:5 63:19	65:13	24:13	21:12,13	26:21 27:2
72:15	102:2	68:21 69:2	completed	connections	28:11 53:6	22:1 50:15	27:23 28:9
code 46:15,17	103:21,25	69:12,17	42:24	61:10	68:5 84:8	53:20,21	31:11,12,13
47:8 79:2	109:11,18	87:12,24	75:16	63:24	86:24 87:4	54:12,15,21	32:9 33:22
codified	113:1	88:3,9	completing	consider	88:22,24,25	55:17 57:3	35:4,8,11
82:11	comment	112:11	74:7	43:11	89:19,23	57:10	36:13,21
colleague 6:9	33:5 57:9	121:8,9,11	completion	107:23	90:8 95:7	77:24,25	37:9 38:13
20:18	121:24	123:7,17,25	42:11	110:24	97:20	78:17 79:5	38:14,16
21:15	commentary	124:21	70:25	123:10	112:15	79:12,20	39:9 40:6
24:19	18:10	125:7,12	component	considerati...	conversatio...	80:8 81:23	41:19
55:12,15	comments	126:3,6,11	41:14	14:24	9:18 11:6	82:25	42:19
89:21	13:2 44:23	communica...	92:14	25:18 84:1	12:13 19:1	83:15,20	43:18,23
colleagues	76:14	8:8	101:21	84:3	19:25	84:12,19	44:9,19,22
6:24 23:15	87:10	communities	components	considered	20:20 83:8	87:5,8,22	45:2 47:3
89:7	106:20,25	80:24	94:18	5:4 119:10	83:24 84:2	88:13	47:14,24
120:23	112:17	98:22	comprehen...	considering	86:18 89:5	100:11,12	48:7 50:12
college 10:5	121:3	111:2	32:19 33:1	4:25 5:21	copies 27:10	102:17,20	50:16,18
10:22 17:8	Commission	community	comprised	108:22	27:13	103:22	51:8 52:13
49:17 50:2	19:21 20:8	17:8 53:25	109:9	constant 8:7	58:16	104:12	53:17,19
53:25 54:3	105:11,13	54:3 57:6	computer	constituenc...	Corbett 89:8	109:1	54:24 55:2
57:6 70:24	108:9	91:17	73:21	12:7	Corp 107:17	112:24,25	55:3,5,14
72:1,18	114:25	107:18,19	concentrati...	120:14	Corporate	114:10	57:13,17
75:15	122:5	108:18	49:16	121:17	10:14	116:13	58:6,14
95:10	commission...	115:21	concern	construction	corporations	118:16	63:2 66:10
colleges 92:8	101:8	120:25	35:22	51:19	52:3	124:10,11	67:6,25
color 45:24	102:2	companies	concerned	65:11	correct 127:6	125:18,19	69:4,6,7,19
46:2 91:5	103:24	52:18	5:25 59:8	constructs	cost 84:4,6	Councilme...	69:20,21
107:21	commission...	63:20 93:6	concerns	5:25	Council 1:1	2:19 9:16	75:21 76:2
combat 108:1	3:19 4:13	97:4	32:22	contacted	2:5 3:3,5	20:18	76:15,16
Comcast 52:3	105:19	companion	112:18	105:17	3:23 4:7,21	67:23	77:21,23
come 10:13	106:12,16	8:8	conclude	contained	6:17 16:11	69:21	87:7 88:12
10:16 25:5	commit 64:9	company	114:11	127:3	16:24 26:4	87:20	88:16,18
40:3 41:3	commitment	52:19	concluded	continue 8:17	30:12 34:1	123:12	91:2 93:17
45:8,13,22	7:25 21:24	61:23	126:12	20:3,20	40:9 57:20	125:2	97:2,22,24
46:8 48:16	23:16	compared	concludes	22:22	63:21	Councilme...	99:22
67:13	50:21	101:9	123:8	30:17	67:15	63:2,4	100:10,14
80:11	71:12	compelled	126:5	43:20	68:18,23	105:6	103:7,11,20
87:11	73:13	74:2	conference	69:23	69:9,14	106:8	105:1
88:20,21	111:9	compete	75:5	88:15 89:4	70:11	124:16	106:19,22
91:6 95:15	119:25	62:18	confidence	111:24	87:13,24	125:23	111:3,5,6
101:13	commitments	116:16	114:4	continued	88:6 89:21	Councilper...	112:23
103:16	24:24	competency	121:19	23:20	100:6	80:6	114:9,15
108:4	25:13	29:17	confident	continuing	109:14	Councilwo...	119:17,19
112:14	committed	competing	20:17	38:21	114:22	1:10,11,12	119:20
113:19	95:14 96:5	75:2	conjunction	42:12	120:24	1:13,14 2:2	120:6
comes 38:2	97:7	competition	85:13	89:23	122:9	6:9,13,21	122:12,16
100:25	committee	92:14	121:11	120:24	123:19	9:11,12,13	123:5,14,22
101:1	1:2 2:15,16	competitions	connect	control	124:2,4,23	9:14 11:3	124:8,12
comfort	2:22 4:1,15	75:2	112:4	127:22	124:25	12:22,23,25	125:4,9,16
24:15	6:6 7:3,6	competitive	connecting	conversation	Councilman	15:15,18	125:20

Committee on Law and Government
February 5, 2020

Page 4

country	49:13,16,20	77:15,19	46:3 71:22	36:16	68:8	94:14	earnings 73:9
59:17	51:10,17	96:13,15	depart 67:20	38:22	disabilities	95:25	easy 104:25
101:13	57:4 61:2	date 6:7 26:5	87:17	39:25	54:17	96:22	economic
105:24	61:25 63:6	73:6	department	40:10 41:3	116:14	98:10	70:18
111:10	63:9,16	107:19	4:19 11:7	48:3,11	disabled	DOD 110:13	economical
112:2	64:8 68:8	121:13	20:1,2	50:22	120:10	doing 8:9,23	74:23
County	70:8,16,18	daughter	28:23,24	57:22	disadvantage	11:18 12:2	economy
108:21	70:25 71:3	111:11	31:24	59:17 61:6	56:5 57:5	12:16 33:9	52:9
couple 28:18	71:8,15,19	David 1:13	32:13	110:10	disadvanta...	42:12 51:1	educated
48:24	71:25	15:19	35:23,24	devil 54:10	55:22	64:10	59:15 72:4
course 68:14	72:12,15,17	day 3:3 9:4	36:8 39:16	diagnosed	disadvanta...	65:17	72:7 73:13
89:7	73:10,12	58:5	40:12,19,24	64:18	55:25	85:14	education 5:5
courses 49:14	74:3,7,22	days 113:23	41:4,9,17	died 16:19	disagree	92:20	7:13,21
73:7	75:14 77:2	deal 22:16	43:6 44:15	17:19	55:11	98:12	18:20
coursework	86:4 89:1,9	debated	60:5 73:4	45:16 56:8	discriminate	101:4	24:10 26:2
97:8	89:14	119:9	79:15	difference	43:14	104:24,24	26:17
Court 127:12	110:23	debt 50:3	80:25 84:8	30:9,10	discuss 86:7	112:4	55:10
coverage	116:20	79:2	84:11	31:3 33:3	discussed	118:4	59:13
32:25	117:5	decades 13:9	85:13 86:1	76:21	122:6	DOL 110:13	72:20 73:4
covered	118:8	decide 9:6	87:2 90:1,7	differences	discussion	donation	73:7 74:12
32:20	CTEs 28:16	27:6,7,12	91:11 99:1	31:16	82:1 85:11	111:23	83:4 89:3
covering	33:13	decided	110:11	different	85:24	door 15:5	92:16 93:4
72:14	curiosity	10:22	115:3	9:21 12:8	discussions	doors 14:23	93:9 107:8
create 9:21	63:13	64:20,25	departments	16:3 30:18	22:9 86:8	72:8	108:5
created 11:20	current	decision 84:9	35:20,25	31:22	86:12	double 22:15	112:9
94:9	43:24	decisions	36:11,19	33:18	101:2	downtown	116:25
creates 28:24	45:23	85:7	44:5	39:19	disease 8:15	10:16	117:6,12
creating	73:17	deem 55:21	dependents	74:17,20	8:16	Dr 75:19	educational
92:25	currently	deeply 68:4	108:23	90:1,24	disinvestme...	draft 121:13	70:21
credit 109:2	19:11 39:1	defend 17:13	Derek 1:11	92:1,21	13:10	drafted	educator
credit-ready	42:21	definitely	2:18	96:20	district 7:14	111:18	59:8 61:5
10:12	72:12	52:10	124:17	101:19	7:22 10:9	Drexel 75:18	educators
credits 70:24	75:18 83:7	89:19	125:24	differently	24:11 26:3	drop 49:14	14:9 15:8
75:15	curriculum	definition	deserve 15:6	10:17	26:18	64:20 92:2	72:3
crime 17:9,19	41:12	95:4	15:8	difficult	29:11 30:7	dropping	Edwards
60:18	curve 102:5	degree 64:15	design 53:1,6	17:22	30:17	93:7	75:19
cross-refer...	customers	93:7	93:24	29:21	49:19 59:6	due 4:24 6:14	effect 30:22
98:8	50:1 53:13	degrees 56:2	designed	difficulty	63:21 64:2	61:9 73:25	96:20
crucial 59:16	cut 43:10	deliberation	34:13	98:21	65:5 66:18	duty 16:19	110:24
crushing 50:4	cyber 75:10	21:9	39:21	116:24	68:8 70:9	17:20 21:5	effectively
CSEA 75:20	cycle 62:14	deliberative	40:11	digit 78:21	72:11 77:3	24:7 45:17	121:20
CTE 10:1,7		119:14	105:22	digits 22:14	78:3,14	56:8	efficiently
10:19,20,24	D	delivery 15:9	designing	22:15	83:5,18		121:20
12:13	D 1:12	demand	110:22	diligence	85:12	E	effort 14:7,8
13:18,24	D.C 8:3,3	56:21 60:8	desire 16:11	6:14	89:12	E 63:8 127:1	68:12
14:15	23:19	62:9	details 54:11	direct 42:16	99:25	earlier 21:16	108:7
29:12 30:5	63:21	democracy	develop	127:22	diverse 9:3	29:19 30:8	117:1
31:22	daily 99:14	16:2	85:12	directly 38:6	107:20	32:10,22	efforts
34:15,25	Dallas 101:19	demographic	93:13	42:15	diversify	54:6	115:13
35:17	data 43:2,10	46:4,6	107:8	Director	62:17	102:11	eight 44:3,8
36:25 39:8	43:22 45:6	101:17	developed	82:24 83:3	diversity	113:4	73:4
39:12	45:22	demograph...	85:25	88:21	37:18,21	early 102:4	113:23
45:19	72:16 73:2	100:20	development	107:5	80:15	earn 60:16	either 12:10
48:22	75:25	demonstrate	9:9,20	Directors	90:18	72:6 75:15	40:15

Committee on Law and Government
February 5, 2020

Page 5

41:15 elected 16:2 election 4:18 26:5,10 119:12 elections 3:8 electorate 118:6,24 electors 7:9 9:6 12:19 25:21 26:20 electrical 11:22 59:23 64:15 electrician 65:15 Electricians 65:1,9,25 66:8 electricity 63:14 elevate 11:17 elicited 100:16 eligible 34:19 42:7 embarking 48:23 emphasize 28:1 employed 77:6,17 employee 66:17 employees 42:21 46:16,19 employer 41:18 44:3 52:25 employers 42:3 53:5 53:12 employment 32:15 40:23 41:24 42:3 42:18 44:15,17 50:3 51:10 67:4 112:5 employs	121:5 EMT 83:7 85:15 102:13 encourage 71:15 endless 109:25 enemy 94:1 energies 56:17 enforce 4:20 engage 50:7 87:3 engaged 60:25 engaging 86:23 engineer 64:16 engineering 41:1 enhanced 41:12 enrolled 72:13 ensure 24:15 52:18 112:3,18 enter 85:6 87:1 entities 19:1 entrance 106:15 entry- 34:24 entry-level 35:9,14 36:1 environment 59:23 80:21 93:10 envision 31:17 envisioned 3:7 equal 49:17 93:23 96:9 108:23 equitable 74:6 erode 17:3 especially 6:25 13:2	93:4 106:3 established 36:20 61:10 108:8,11 establishing 4:18 estimates 108:17 et 116:14 118:3 everybody 23:1 92:13 95:13 102:22 everyone's 85:20 evidence 127:3 exactly 80:22 exam 71:14 examinations 7:12,19 25:25 26:15 90:21 example 17:4 29:4 31:23 33:20 34:1 36:12 37:2 62:20,22,25 101:16 examples 74:9 exams 18:18 62:4 excel 61:24 excellent 51:1 exceptional 115:10,19 115:21,22 118:10 excited 104:1 excitedly 48:17 exclude 89:24 excluded 90:9,13 95:24 excluding 9:1 96:7 exclusion 100:20,20 excuse 29:5	Executive 82:24 83:3 exercise 118:17 exhausted 90:3,5 exist 15:2 32:14 existence 15:4 84:14 existing 84:7 110:3,15,20 exists 109:4 exit 109:11 exiting 108:3 expand 33:10 35:2 83:10 83:10 86:21 expanded 84:21 expanding 83:24 expansion 10:20 expect 89:11 expected 73:5 experience 57:21 71:18 72:21 107:24 experienced 89:15 expert 48:3 50:14,15 expertise 57:8 explain 16:7 79:6,24 82:20,24 explanation 78:3 Explorer 78:10 79:2 85:16 Explorers 90:2 117:21 extra 23:4 extraordin... 14:3 extremely 76:6 85:23	91:22 100:17 115:10 eyes 103:24 F F 1:5 114:23 127:1 facilities 85:1 fact 17:12 29:22 61:1 93:22 94:2 fair 91:4 92:13 95:16 fairly 104:24 fall 90:25 96:18 fallen 81:19 families 15:9 105:25 108:16 110:19,25 family 61:14 61:15 108:22 fancy 93:21 fantastic 68:7 far 78:15 fascinated 65:17 fast-forward 65:14 fast-tracked 113:22 father 66:15 favor 17:25 53:23 54:16 55:20,25 56:10 105:19 124:5,18 125:13,25 favorable 69:2,17 88:10 123:17,25 124:22 125:8,12 126:3 favorably 68:21 69:12 88:4	FBI 75:12 feasibility 86:13 February 1:6 3:20,24 70:16 federal 48:12 53:8 120:18 federally 14:1 feel 20:17 38:8 48:4 58:18 59:1 74:1 103:16 105:2 106:25 114:18 fellow 6:24 105:18 106:12,16 felony 17:10 female 107:21 field 16:9 17:11 40:24 62:2 93:25 96:8 fields 60:6 62:9,17 fight 60:18 61:16 99:24 fighting 17:18,18 109:24 figure 35:1 98:9 fill 36:4 filled 117:23 filling 37:1 final 113:14 finalist 104:16 financial 64:21 find 61:16,18 104:8 finding 86:14 fine 83:1 finishing 25:10 fire 20:2	21:22 45:25 78:5 78:16 79:25 82:4 84:8,11 85:15,18 90:1,2 94:21 97:14,15 98:19 99:3 99:16 102:12,21 102:23 firefighters 8:5 16:20 20:23 23:19 24:6 105:24 106:1,4 fires 17:18 firing 64:6 first 3:3,5 9:6 11:15 15:16 22:10,17 23:2 26:22 27:24 38:18 50:19 51:17 52:24 58:23 63:3 65:21 68:22 69:13 82:13 88:5 94:19 97:11 99:17 107:14 111:8 118:7,18,21 123:20 124:3,24 firsthand 61:7 fiscal 44:13 five 41:23 63:20 107:16 five-year 108:17 fix 60:6 Fixing 26:5	Fleet 34:2 focus 56:17 73:6,10 folks 11:18 11:23 38:2 90:12 95:14 97:3 97:13 116:23 117:22 follow 62:24 follow-up 77:12 following 45:23 FOP 20:21 23:19 Force 114:24 forecast 52:15 foregoing 127:5,19 form 26:6 formally 108:11 forth 32:7 91:17 fortunate 120:8 forward 8:9 9:18 12:11 13:6 14:22 15:12 21:7 24:18 35:3 38:20 86:19 89:20 97:19 112:19 120:24 122:23 126:9 forwarded 121:15 foundation 76:11 founded 59:21 four 96:1 fourth-year 65:15 Franklin 64:23 Fraternal 8:5
--	---	--	---	---	--	---	--

Committee on Law and Government
February 5, 2020

Page 6

free 48:5 58:18 59:1 103:16 105:2 106:25 114:18 freedoms 17:13 fresh 103:24 freshman 10:2 friends 10:21 61:15 97:14 front 81:10 fruit 29:1 frustrating 99:7 fulfill 9:4 16:14 fulfilling 10:25 full 21:3 full-time 41:24 44:14,17 fully 20:17 127:4 funded 89:10 funds 48:13 funnel 91:24 96:18 funnels 92:1 further 10:23 12:4 31:15 33:6 106:20 112:15 123:18 124:1 future 28:22 31:23 39:14,17,18 39:21 40:5 40:11 44:12 56:22 73:12 74:6 86:24 119:5 126:10 Future's 39:20 futures 76:24	G gained 73:25 74:11,13 gainful 67:4 gap 9:19 gaps 107:10 GED 117:1 general 22:3 22:4 39:2 47:6 113:9 115:13 117:11 119:4 generally 28:17 56:10 Genius 75:7 Gentlemen 105:2 genuinely 116:10 geo 46:24 geography 82:18 George 105:7 getting 46:13 54:8 56:15 65:20 76:4 80:20 85:9 94:17 103:1 109:20 116:6 Gilmore 1:13 2:21 6:10 6:21 9:16 20:19 23:10,12 38:14,16 39:9 40:6 41:19 42:19 43:18,23 44:9,19 50:16,18 51:8 52:13 53:17 54:24 55:3 55:5 76:2 76:15,16 77:21 111:5,6 119:19,20	122:16 Ginder 105:5 105:7 122:1 Girl 73:19 Girl's 10:2 give 2:24 14:17 46:9 49:21 55:9 66:5 68:7 72:25 81:1 105:23 given 14:10 17:13 22:13 34:20 57:4 61:8 106:15 117:25 giving 14:11 17:3,21 48:19 53:23 54:16,21 56:3,10 60:19 62:6 62:17 65:19,22 78:15 glad 94:3 glance 76:1 go 10:10,22 23:3 25:2 29:22 38:7 47:1,20 49:2 53:3 60:20 61:25 67:11,17,22 78:12 83:19 87:15,19 89:2 90:20 90:21 99:21 101:6 121:17 123:9 goal 30:10 92:24 95:11,12 goals 28:2,9 goes 60:9 going 5:15	18:8 22:8 23:6 27:6 27:15 32:6 32:24 46:21 47:18 55:19 60:12 63:18 72:24,25 80:11 81:8 81:9 82:17 84:20 85:3 89:4,18 90:5 91:19 91:23 93:5 93:8 98:23 99:5,24 102:5 113:11 118:19 121:7 gold 85:19 good 2:2 5:12 18:9 21:18 23:1,7 27:3 27:17,20,22 33:25 35:5 40:8 47:4 47:25 48:6 52:23 59:3 63:1 64:12 66:23 70:6 94:1 100:17 101:11 104:17 105:6 114:21 good-natur... 116:11 government 1:2 2:5 4:1 8:22 11:14 11:17 12:15 18:14 81:10 98:11 120:18,19 120:19 121:2 126:6,12 governor's	110:12 grade 10:5 34:7 73:22 75:6 graded 62:4 grads 45:19 graduate 7:20 10:1 17:6,8 18:19 24:9 26:1,16 34:13 41:15 42:6 59:10 63:7 72:17 89:14 105:8 116:22 graduated 42:23 66:25 graduates 5:4 7:12 36:25 51:18 53:24 56:2 57:6 61:2 117:7,14 graduating 106:10 graduation 10:24 42:6 42:17 61:3 73:5 77:5 grandchild... 24:5 grandfather 120:10 grandpare... 120:9 great 8:23 12:16 49:4 49:8 50:9 58:4 62:13 70:10,11 104:4 120:13 greater 70:16 116:24 greatness 71:22 Green 1:11 2:18 6:24 18:5,7 22:2	87:21,22 88:13 124:17 125:24 grocery 116:5 group 15:1 17:4 56:1 63:15 96:7 96:23 115:22,25 118:8,9 groups 15:3 115:18 116:2,12 118:10 grow 71:24 growth 72:9 guarantee 41:23 guaranteed 42:4 gun 99:18 Gym 1:11 12:24,25 67:24,25 69:21 124:16 125:23	HBCU 98:24 head 39:6 healthcare 51:22,23 hear 2:6 8:13 20:12 54:5 80:4 heard 2:13 6:6 7:2 25:6 32:10 82:13 117:4 120:4 122:15,22 123:11 hearing 2:3,4 2:6 3:1,16 7:7 8:11 21:8 22:21 23:24 25:2 25:5 38:20 45:7 47:19 55:8 57:17 67:17,22 68:17 69:9 69:23 79:22 87:14,19,24 88:14 99:6 103:11 112:11,16 113:4 114:2 123:8 hearings 4:1 101:1 heart 14:11 112:22 heart-brea... 116:15 held 2:11 14:2 Helen 1:11 124:16 125:23 Hello 83:2 help 42:8 53:10,14 55:16,23 56:11 61:19 66:10 67:2 90:16 100:22	114:8 helped 76:10 helper 29:8 35:9,13 helpful 47:9 helping 51:17 62:16 helps 94:13 Herring 66:16 Hershey 75:5 hesitant 53:12 Hi 73:16 high 5:8 10:2 22:15 28:17 34:7 49:15 59:11 60:7 60:11,17,22 62:9 63:10 63:12,19 64:14 65:19 71:16 72:23 73:8 73:18 116:22 117:8,11,14 higher 61:3 73:8 highlighting 11:3 highly 56:19 highly-qual... 95:14 hire 9:2 35:25 53:13 61:13 hired 101:7 hires 29:7 38:6 hiring 54:22 64:6 110:4 110:15,18 holistic 36:17 holistically 34:24 home 7:17 25:23 26:13 99:10 homicides
--	---	--	---	---	--	--	---

Committee on Law and Government
February 5, 2020

Page 7

5:9	28:19 97:8	110:14	intent 113:5	104:5	63:6 76:7	83:13 86:5	lead 6:16 9:8
honest 57:9	106:3	increasing	114:7	issues 46:14	Joynes 50:25	86:15 89:2	62:22
honor 19:4	121:13	9:2	interest 75:9	46:16	Jr 58:10 63:7	91:11,15	leaders 72:1
19:10,19	identify	incredibly	75:12	80:19	juggling	92:10	leadership
20:3,25	33:23	4:17	82:22	81:21	89:12	94:23	74:13
48:1 50:23	58:24 86:5	independen...	115:4	89:22 98:9	Jules 63:7	95:17	108:1
57:19	115:18	15:25	interested	100:7	Julio 65:5	96:23	leading 13:23
70:10	imagine	indicated	103:15	104:3	66:9	97:13	learn 67:3
honored	85:19	24:12	interesting	it'll 113:6	jump 102:4	98:25 99:5	71:11
19:11 21:3	impact 37:11	individual	104:13	J	junior 10:9	100:25	learned 75:9
honoring	37:15	65:8 71:7	interim 88:21	Jacobs 58:9	K	101:16,20	95:8
110:18	70:17 71:3	individuals	intern 66:19	59:3,4 63:4	Kareem	113:10	105:16
hope 74:5	implement...	40:17,21	International	76:19 78:2	75:19	118:18	learning
hoping 53:3	81:9 82:10	41:7,14	8:4	78:15 82:3	Katherine	120:22	63:13
horrible 8:14	113:8	42:4,6	interning	82:23	1:13 2:20	121:4,12,14	102:5
Hospital	implementi...	43:12	75:18	85:10	6:10 20:18	122:7	leave 25:3
51:25	110:23	44:13,16	internships	jail 9:24	76:2	knowing 22:4	45:4 67:15
hour 75:7	implicit 92:6	52:22	63:20,22	Jay 98:23	keep 9:22	81:12	67:18
85:6	93:21	53:15	interviews	Jenean 27:18	60:24	knowledge	68:17 69:8
hour-and-a...	important	56:19	104:15	33:8,18	101:24	104:7	75:16
85:4	4:17 6:16	industry 62:3	introduced	35:6	keeps 62:9	known 65:24	87:10,13,16
hours 34:8	12:18,20	62:5 71:6	3:6 7:4	job 8:24 38:2	Kennedy 1:5	66:2	87:24 99:9
62:1 72:16	19:2,3 30:3	75:4,17	109:2	41:13	Kenney 98:3	L	124:18
105:17	37:10 54:8	industry-dr...	invaluable	52:20	kids 62:21	LA 101:10,18	leaves 61:21
122:8	65:22 66:5	72:21	73:24	55:24 61:5	89:16	lab 75:20	leaving 25:12
housed 36:7	90:7 93:3	industry-le...	invested	64:11	killed 24:7	labor 4:19	Lebleta
housekeepi...	95:6 96:25	71:10	60:15	65:21	106:2	8:11 23:22	27:17,18
24:23	improve	inform 74:2	62:16	89:17	kind 55:20	24:3 52:15	33:8 35:5,6
houses 59:21	100:25	information	investigator	97:18 99:7	82:15	60:5 66:23	35:13
60:21	improves	37:13 46:9	40:25	115:14	84:22 86:1	114:3	left 2:17,20
HR 88:20	62:10	46:22 55:1	investing	jobs 5:7,12	86:10	120:4	3:10 8:18
huge 50:3	incentive	73:1 79:18	48:12	16:13	94:14	121:9	69:24
51:19	50:8 85:17	81:14,22	investment	29:16	116:9	lack 37:20	124:17
huh 50:11	incentives	85:8	13:21	45:10,15,17	knew 10:17	95:24	125:24
human 11:7	53:7,9	100:19	investments	45:20	know 3:2	lacking 59:24	leg-up 41:25
27:16,18,21	incentivize	121:15	52:7 56:18	49:22	11:5,10	60:1	117:7
28:13	23:2	infrastruct...	57:2	51:18	12:19	lamp 11:20	legacies
33:25 35:6	incentivizing	59:18	involve 78:9	56:12 66:3	16:10 18:8	11:25	45:15
78:25	21:20	initiative	involved 32:5	107:10	22:1,9	land 66:22	legacy 78:10
94:17	include	44:7 110:4	40:2 61:5	John 1:5	23:15	language	78:18 80:1
110:9	100:21	110:5	80:19	98:23	24:14 27:8	33:15	94:11
Hunting	107:20	initiatives	involves 78:7	Johns 58:11	29:2 32:12	94:19	113:17
10:18	including 8:1	28:23	involving	73:16,17	33:5 36:4	113:10	114:6
hurry 21:15	8:2 23:18	51:11	78:2	joined 15:19	38:5 46:10	121:14	legislation
I	86:14	110:15	Iraq 109:23	114:6	46:11 47:6	82:18	3:22 5:21
IBW 65:16	105:18	institutions	109:25	Jonathan	49:5,15	101:9	8:2 9:5
idea 21:18	116:13	95:1	111:15	58:9 59:4	51:12 57:7	large 52:3	18:13,21
23:1,5	inclusion	instructor	ironed	63:3	59:20 64:8	82:18	19:8 20:5
32:18	96:22	70:8	119:11	Jones 27:20	65:18	lastly 8:12	20:12 24:1
103:23	98:10	Intelligent	issue 5:13	27:21	66:24 76:8	Law 1:2 2:5	24:2 55:8
118:21	inclusive	15:24	6:17 13:5,7	33:20,24,25	76:23 77:3	3:25 18:14	70:14,17,22
119:4	121:21	intend 9:7	37:17	66:12	78:6 79:23	81:10	72:5 73:11
identified	increase 57:5	intended	59:14	Jose 58:10	80:2,10,12	126:6,11	74:6
		114:8	94:25 99:2			lay 76:10	111:18

Committee on Law and Government
February 5, 2020

Page 8

112:20	108:19	97:19	18:8 21:10	Marie 58:10	2:16,16 4:6	110:11	89:20
115:5,8	Listed 74:9	101:22	21:14	70:7 75:24	6:25 13:3	Mills 64:23	112:19
120:1	Listen 75:21	120:24	23:13	Marine	18:11	minds 56:25	123:16,18
legislative	106:22	126:9	31:14	107:17	19:25	Mine 75:10	124:1
111:13	lists 29:23	looked 86:12	38:12,17	MARK 1:12	20:21	minor 117:19	125:6
119:11	35:18,19	116:8	54:25 55:6	market 52:15	24:25 25:3	minority	moved 86:19
121:6	36:1	looking 11:4	68:1,16	Mastbaum	25:8,11	98:22	123:23
legitimate	little 31:15	16:14	69:8 78:1	10:3 11:20	27:23	101:21	125:10
116:15	33:8 39:19	21:19 22:9	87:23	63:8,25	44:24	minutes 85:5	moves 122:22
lend 98:1	40:2,4	29:20,24	88:11	65:6,7	61:14,14	mirror 85:14	multi-hurdle
lens 104:5	48:17	30:24	100:13	matched	64:1 67:14	86:3	90:20
level 16:8	53:12	31:20	105:5	13:13	67:18	mirrors	multi-step
17:11	67:10 80:5	34:23,25	107:4	material 10:5	69:24	70:22	9:7
19:10 21:3	84:16	36:17 39:6	111:7	math 94:6	87:12,16	mitigate	multiple
24:16	live 60:14	49:3 52:10	114:22	matter 80:18	103:9	53:10	19:24 66:4
34:25	108:20	52:15	119:21	94:2	108:22	Model 44:3	municipal
56:11	lives 17:15	70:20	123:15	119:13	109:11	modify 30:22	17:16
89:10	99:14,19	91:25	125:5	127:5	114:22	moments	myriad 6:19
93:24 94:5	108:2	92:21	maintain	maximizing	men 19:16	20:6	
116:17	115:24	93:13	20:3,25	56:24	99:13	moms 56:2	N
leveling 96:8	living 60:17	96:17	maintaining	Mayor 3:23	mention	Monday 4:4	N 127:1
levels 121:1	load 50:3	112:18	59:18	70:11 98:3	32:10	4:15	Naderia
leverage	loaded 54:5	looks 91:24	maintenance	McGill 76:9	mentioned	money 60:16	58:11
70:19	local 20:22	lost 115:23	29:9 34:5	mean 100:1	76:7	82:22 89:9	73:17 76:6
Lewis 65:3	62:10	lot 29:2 38:4	36:10	101:7	100:24	89:9,16	name 8:6
66:9	65:16	51:21 78:6	40:25	meaning	merge 13:16	97:5	27:4 48:4
LGBTQ	120:19	78:20	major 93:9	45:16 86:2	mess 99:23	month 70:16	59:4 63:6
107:21	locales 104:9	80:23	109:13	meaningful	message	months 41:23	65:2 70:3,7
life 13:8	lofty 13:13	83:25 89:9	MakerSpace	13:17	116:18,21	119:13	73:16
62:11	long 13:24	89:15 92:6	74:19	14:21	117:15	Morales	105:2,7
68:11	28:11	97:4	making 57:1	85:22,23	method 71:5	58:10 63:1	107:1,4
107:22	84:13,22,23	100:15	male 37:22	means 3:22	methodolo...	63:7	114:19
116:25	92:16	101:5	107:20	127:21	91:4 92:5	morning 2:3	nation 17:16
120:8	101:23	117:5	mall 64:24	mechanics	methodology	22:23	93:10
life-sustaini...	longer 19:13	loud 81:2	man 65:2	119:3	89:24	23:18 27:3	nation's
72:7	longstanding	love 30:11,12	manage	median 73:8	meticulous	27:17,20,22	107:14
lighting 12:2	24:24	49:6,7	121:19	meet 31:7	121:5	34:1 35:5	national
limit 22:6	25:13	72:10	manageable	41:8 52:25	metropolitan	40:8 47:25	59:13
85:2	37:20	lovely 28:10	4:12	meeting 25:2	109:13	48:7 59:3	72:14
limited 8:3	look 8:9 9:18	low 22:14,15	managed	46:12	Michael	63:1 70:7	nature 4:24
56:6 83:23	11:16	78:21	39:24	47:20	27:15	105:7	121:5
line 16:19	12:11	lower 78:19	Management	67:17,22	78:24	motion 68:19	Navy 107:16
17:19 21:5	15:12 21:7	lumped 85:20	34:2	81:20	Michelle 83:3	68:25	120:10
24:7 32:6	28:12,21	lumping	manager	87:15,19	middle 49:22	69:11,15	Nay 124:10
45:16	30:20	102:22	74:14	123:9	Mike 26:24	88:2,8	124:11
55:11 56:8	33:12 37:6	luxury 3:15	managing	meetings	88:21	123:13	125:18,19
78:20	37:6 38:20		43:4	38:19	97:24	124:5	nays 124:13
99:14	38:22	M	manner	member	Mike's 33:21	125:3,14	125:21
116:7	49:22	ma'am	120:21	99:11	mild 64:19	126:1	necessarily
lines 116:5	53:11	114:14	map 46:15	105:9	mile 90:23	motions	43:13
list 32:6	77:13	122:1	mapping	111:20	military	124:20	83:23
34:19	91:20,24	Madam 6:22	46:17,25	114:24	107:18,19	move 24:18	necessary
72:22 90:2	94:18	9:10 12:21	Maria 1:12	115:2	108:3	35:3 41:16	12:3
90:14	96:13	13:1 15:13	88:16	members	109:11	42:11,15	110:16

Committee on Law and Government
February 5, 2020

Page 9

need 4:23 5:10 6:18 8:13 10:18 19:19 24:14 29:17 31:4 53:16 59:24 62:18 67:11,15 68:17 69:8 71:21 76:5 87:1,13,23 94:7 95:17 95:18 106:9 112:3,7 117:23 needed 98:8 needs 5:13 9:4 15:10 16:15 30:22 41:8 86:22 107:7 115:19,20 115:22 120:16 negotiation 19:6 neighborho... 59:10 neighborho... 80:23 91:6 neither 122:2 networking 73:21 never 61:20 65:24 66:7 93:20 new 20:17 21:15 46:1 89:3 101:7 101:9 102:2,3 nickel 122:20 night 23:18 Nineteen 109:22 Nolans 96:22 nondiverse 80:14 normal 34:9 North 64:2	Nos 2:8,10 Notary 127:12 note 24:22 45:5 47:17 67:9 120:7 122:13 124:14 125:22 noted 55:15 88:13 104:2 122:18 127:3 notes 98:16 104:20 127:5 notice 26:9 notion 95:16 November 119:12 number 4:8 4:12 28:25 37:3,5 39:5 46:18 77:16 78:19 81:15,18,18 92:1 98:4 105:17 numbers 38:10 76:4 78:21 79:3 79:6 80:5 95:22 96:2 96:3 98:20 numerous 61:6 62:3 O O 127:1 O'Neill 1:14 18:4 21:12 21:13 77:24,25 78:17 79:5 79:12,20 80:8 81:23 82:25 83:15,20 84:12,19 87:5,8 100:11,12 102:17,20	104:12 112:24,25 114:10 118:16 124:10,13 125:19,21 observe 75:1 obstacles 86:10 obstructive 64:19 obviously 102:7 103:3 Occupation... 71:1 occupations 60:8,12 offered 10:15 offering 66:2 office 11:21 27:16,18,21 33:21,25 34:2 35:6 36:15 39:24 40:9 41:2 50:24 64:18 78:25 96:21 97:1 108:11 110:7,7,8 110:12 122:3 officer 19:18 officers 16:20 19:13 21:4 24:6 26:8 105:25 106:1,5 official 68:18 109:3 offline 46:12 Oh 1:13 15:19,20,21 50:15 53:20,21 54:12,15,21 55:17 57:3 57:10 114:15 116:13 124:11,13 125:18,21	Oh's 109:2 Okay 35:4 36:13 37:9 40:7 54:12 79:13,20 81:23 82:25 87:5 103:6 104:25 on-the-job 40:18 42:13 53:9 once 41:14 one-offs 35:23 ones 22:10 30:18 91:10 ongoing 50:21 online 42:12 75:11 onsite 89:17 open 8:25 12:14 14:23 35:18 36:1 36:8 37:2 38:25 39:6 39:10 40:20 42:14 45:10 86:21,23 open-minded 17:23 opening 2:25 15:4 72:8 operational 82:12 opinion 31:3 opinions 16:3 opportunities 10:15 11:13 12:14 16:14 28:3 28:25 32:14,16 34:25 40:13,20 43:17 52:20 60:16 61:9	61:17 62:8 64:4 66:6 66:22 71:23 73:24 74:10 112:5 opportunity 10:6,10,13 12:19 14:12,18 16:9 31:7 34:20 40:15 43:11 48:8 49:7 50:9 50:10 60:3 60:19 62:18,23 65:23 66:19 71:13,21 72:6 115:16 oppose 118:5 opposed 92:24 105:14 124:9 125:17 option 49:8 58:21 65:23 66:1 70:21 options 48:21 50:5 66:6 72:9 order 2:4 3:20 8:5 29:17 67:2 100:6 Ordinance 25:20 organization 56:14 organizatio... 20:24 23:17 Outlaw 103:24 outside 24:24 25:13 87:25 outstanding	13:22 overall 46:5 71:21 overseeing 65:22 overwhelm... 14:5 P p.m 126:12 Pa 75:5 110:10 package 7:4 Padiilla 65:5 Padilla 66:9 panel 26:22 26:25 47:15 57:15 58:8 58:12 68:2 69:25 103:9,18,21 paramedic 80:2 paramedics 21:23 parameters 113:25 parents 45:16 70:20 115:23 Park 10:18 Parker 1:10 2:2 6:23 9:11 12:22 15:15 18:2 21:11 23:9 24:21 26:21 27:2 31:11 33:22 38:13 44:22 45:2 47:3,14,24 50:12 53:19 55:2 55:14 57:13,17 58:6,14 67:6 69:4 69:19 75:21 77:23 87:7	88:12 97:24 100:10 103:7,11,20 105:1 106:19,22 111:3 112:23 114:9,15 119:17 120:6 122:12 123:5,22 124:8,12 125:9,16,20 part 6:18 12:18 16:11 45:25 49:24 53:5 74:11 76:22 82:1 82:9 88:25 97:10 participants 72:22 participate 74:20 participation 41:22 particular 13:12 89:1 115:18 116:7 117:2,25 118:25 particularly 37:17 40:14 57:22 76:20 94:19 97:11 98:22 99:22 102:21 partner 30:12,13 100:5 111:22 partnered 30:14 partnership 41:4 43:5	84:7,11 partnerships 35:2 51:4 52:12 93:1 passage 113:15 passed 3:22 4:14,21 36:24 61:8 passion 71:23 path 117:13 pathway 44:4 48:25 77:19 pathways 49:7 51:10 56:16 patience 70:1 87:9 patient 67:12 Patrick 47:21 48:8 peace 76:10 PECO 63:21 Penn 51:16 51:16,20 PennAssist 66:11 Pennsylvania 1:5 Pentagon 110:13 people 5:11 11:14,19,24 13:11 14:4 14:8,20,21 15:5 23:3 32:6 42:20 42:24 43:6 43:8,16 45:24,25 46:2,2 47:2 48:14,20 49:2,5 50:7 52:20 53:3 56:12,15 64:5 68:14 76:20 80:21 87:1 89:25 90:9 90:14,25 91:5 92:2 94:7,23 95:2,23
--	--	--	--	--	--	---	---

Committee on Law and Government
February 5, 2020

Page 10

96:18	7:15,17,22	39:17,18,20	78:16	79:23	105:21,22	principals	121:7,18
101:8	8:15 9:10	39:21	79:23 82:5	possibility	105:23	13:22	122:22
104:18	19:17 24:5	40:10	85:18	19:7	106:14,15	14:10,16	produce
106:9	24:11	44:11 60:4	90:25 92:3	possible	109:5	15:7	10:25
107:21	25:22,23	62:17	95:20	46:13	110:6,21,23	prior 38:20	producing
108:24	26:3,13,18	physical	102:16,18	48:22 50:6	115:7,19,25	124:18	100:18
109:18	26:20 28:4	54:17	119:23	81:3,7	116:2	priority 60:7	102:8
111:11	29:10	90:22	police 8:6	121:20	117:3,24	60:11	program
112:8	31:24 33:2	piece 18:13	16:20	possibly 86:3	118:9,25	privacy	7:21 10:1,7
114:7	37:1,19	18:21 20:4	19:13,18	post-educat...	119:1,10	46:14,16	18:21
116:4,6,6	38:1,23	pipeline 9:21	20:1 21:22	70:13	preferences	private 11:11	24:10 26:2
116:13,21	39:2 40:14	9:23 42:16	24:6 45:24	posturing	17:3 22:20	41:17	26:17 32:4
117:10	42:22 44:1	107:8	46:1 78:5,9	109:20	56:11 78:4	44:18 51:6	33:15 34:5
percent 29:7	46:15,18	place 49:4	78:16 79:1	potential	78:18	51:12 52:5	34:12,15
29:9,11	47:5,7	97:17	79:15	3:11 4:2,8	94:11	52:11,17	38:6 39:12
52:4 77:17	48:10,14	101:11	80:13,25	potentially	113:19	56:25	39:14,17,20
77:18	49:4,20	placed	81:15	4:10	115:9,12	112:6	40:2,5 41:6
109:8,17	50:23 51:5	105:15	85:13 86:1	poverty	117:20	privately	41:21,22
percentage	52:16	placement	87:2 90:6	60:15	preferred	104:14	42:10,23,24
45:23	57:25 59:6	43:22	91:10	62:14	118:11	privilege	43:4 44:12
90:12	59:9,11,20	places 101:14	94:24	powerful	premature	57:19	51:16 53:1
perfect 94:1	62:19 64:1	104:6	98:18,20,25	70:14,19	118:17	privileges	63:9 65:10
period 84:23	64:9,13,22	platforms	101:8	PowerPoint	prep 49:18	15:2	65:12
permanent	65:4 66:13	70:19	102:12	77:13	prepared	pro-police	66:11,14,25
4:19 40:23	66:18 67:5	platinum	105:25	practices	41:8 45:8	80:22	68:10
42:17	70:9,12	85:19	106:1,4	104:7	45:22 46:8	probably	71:12
44:14,17	71:16,20	playing 16:8	115:3	pre- 70:13	93:11	66:4,7	73:21,23,25
115:6	72:12,23	17:11	policy 109:3	preface 78:1	Preparing	102:3,25	74:12,13
118:9	73:14,18	93:25 96:8	political 4:16	preference	59:14	problem	75:14
permanently	74:25 77:5	please 26:22	population	5:6,19 6:1	prescribing	37:20	78:11 79:2
118:11	77:7 83:5	27:4 47:15	109:7	7:11,18	26:6	101:15	79:6,11,15
permit 68:22	83:19	48:3 58:7	populations	16:17,21,23	presence 2:15	problems	80:4 82:4,7
69:13	93:16 99:9	67:11 70:3	43:16	17:14	15:17 18:3	6:19	82:14 83:7
123:20	101:10	73:10 87:9	Portland	18:18,22	present 1:9	procedural	83:17 84:6
124:3,24	103:25	103:16	101:12,15	19:20 20:4	66:19	67:10	84:13
person 16:1	104:10	110:24	posed 54:7	20:7,10,15	70:10	proceed 27:5	85:12,16,25
61:21	105:10	121:12	position	20:16	103:14	48:5 59:1	86:2,4,14
83:17	107:6,14	pleasure	34:17	24:17	preserving	70:4 105:3	89:14
88:20	108:6,13,21	65:16	41:16	25:24	110:20	107:1	105:9,16,21
111:17	108:25	point 24:16	42:16	26:14	President	114:18	106:3,7,10
person's 17:4	109:12,15	30:3 33:21	66:23	29:25	2:22 48:9	proceedings	116:20
personal 68:4	109:16,19	35:8 52:9	115:1	53:24 54:9	pressed 76:12	127:3	117:21
89:13	112:1	54:25	positions	54:16,22	pressing	process 11:9	122:10
personally	115:3	55:15,19	8:19,21,25	55:9,21	96:12	12:9 19:7	programmi...
49:5 122:7	117:11	73:2 85:23	29:8,20,22	56:4,6 57:4	pretty 23:7	24:18 42:1	44:6 49:20
persons	122:4	90:15,17	33:12,18	63:16	29:22	67:10	programs
54:17	Philadelphi...	94:7	36:22,24	64:12	37:21	81:18	7:13 13:18
55:21 56:1	17:6 46:4,7	102:13	38:25 39:7	65:20	50:11	89:25 92:3	13:24
perspective	Philadelphi...	points 17:5,5	39:11	78:16	103:3	92:12	14:13
19:15 21:1	62:12	17:5,7,21	40:22,24	79:10,13,25	previous 95:8	96:19	28:14,19
47:10 68:4	90:15 91:5	45:6 53:24	42:8,9 92:2	82:6 85:21	primarily	98:13	29:12 30:2
Phi 111:21	94:14 97:7	71:13	108:1	90:15,16	43:15	115:11	30:4,21
Philadelphia	107:13	75:25	110:16	94:12	primary	118:15	31:2,22,25
1:1,5 7:10	Philly 39:13	77:15	positive 71:4	102:11,24	21:16	119:14	32:15 33:4

Committee on Law and Government
February 5, 2020

Page 11

33:10 34:3	protection	122:17	84:25	10:19	reason 23:4	69:3,18	86:17
34:23 35:1	4:20	pull 43:2,9,21	questions 3:6	reach 95:20	74:1 82:21	88:10	98:18
35:16,18	proud 9:25	purpose 2:6	3:7,11,14	reaches	107:17	123:18	regardless
36:6 39:8	76:7,11	26:6	3:18 4:3,9	110:10	116:11	124:1,22	16:24
43:14,25	105:8	put 11:22	4:11,14,23	reaching	reasons	125:8,13	regards 83:6
44:4,8	proudly	17:15	31:8,9	37:16	64:21	126:4	regular
48:23	11:19	64:12 65:9	43:21	92:25	80:16	record 3:18	116:17,22
51:11	proven	66:10	44:23	read 25:16	84:24 92:8	5:16 6:13	117:8,10,14
55:10	117:19	78:22	57:14	58:19	100:21	23:14 27:4	regulation
70:25 71:8	provide 7:10	92:12	76:14	72:24	118:7	33:23	31:1
71:25	7:18 11:12	99:13	87:11	readily 79:18	Rebuilding	41:21 45:5	regulations
72:13,20	25:24	113:24	98:18 99:8	reading	14:15	47:17 48:4	86:16
74:3,8	29:16	117:8	100:2	68:23	receive 62:2	55:7 58:2	reintegrate
76:22 77:3	37:14,14	118:6	103:8	69:14 88:5	70:24	58:24 61:1	111:1
83:14 84:5	40:13	putting 14:7	106:24	90:21	71:13	67:9,19	relate 39:7,11
86:21	72:20	14:8 66:13	114:18	91:13,15,18	72:15	70:4 76:1,5	related 60:6
93:13	provided	75:25	quick 50:11	94:6	received	78:12,23	relates 89:1
106:11	19:5 20:9	117:9	50:11 51:4	123:20	40:18	81:7 86:7	90:6
112:9	20:13		104:24	124:3,24	120:15	87:17 98:6	relative 43:9
120:20	104:19	Q	quickly 38:24	reads 105:20	receiving	98:14	51:4,6
progressive	provides	qualified 7:9	64:17 77:1	ready 9:3	49:20	103:2	52:14 55:8
101:13	74:22	7:20 9:5	QUINONES-	11:24 31:8	recess 25:1	105:3	98:10,19
project 37:25	providing	14:1 18:19	9:14 88:18	71:2 72:2	47:19	107:1	relevance
51:20	25:20	24:9 25:21	91:2 93:17	72:18	67:16,21	114:20	62:6
74:14 75:7	26:14,18	25:25	97:2,22	109:16,20	87:14,18	119:24	relevant 53:4
projects	60:2,13	26:15	123:14	109:21	recognition	120:8	56:20
14:17	62:23	59:15 62:9	125:4	real 13:16,20	12:6	122:13,18	remain 15:3
promise	provision	62:21	Quinones-S...	13:21	recognize	124:14	remained
13:14	82:8	86:15	1:12 2:19	14:20,23	2:14 15:20	125:22	60:11
14:18,19,21	public 2:4 3:2	qualify 34:16	9:13 88:17	89:13	105:22	recorded	remaining
15:6,8	7:1 13:7,10	117:2	125:2	real-world	106:9	68:19,24	3:13
68:12	17:17 25:1	qualifying	quorum 2:15	72:21	111:14	69:10 88:1	remarks 2:25
promote	25:2,5,8	33:17		reality	recognized	records	15:20 18:6
11:18	26:9 29:8	quality 62:11	R	108:14	12:9 73:23	99:20	remediation
94:13	35:19 36:9	quarter	R 127:1	110:2	recognizes	recruit 43:15	59:24
properly	37:25	122:21	radar 98:7	realized	9:12 12:23	recruiting	remember
57:2	40:25	question 5:1	raise 99:8	64:17	18:3,5	98:21	79:10
123:23	47:19,20	5:3,24 7:16	raised 59:9	91:21	21:12	redesigned	remind 5:20
125:10	59:11 61:4	18:15,16	120:9	really 28:20	23:10	41:6	58:15 89:6
proponent	67:16,17,21	26:7 28:6	Randolph	30:1 31:20	31:12	reduced	97:3
56:24	67:22	32:11 35:7	34:4 80:4	31:25 32:5	38:14	104:16	107:12
proposed	68:17 69:9	48:19 51:4	82:3,14,16	47:4 48:25	50:16	referenced	reminder
106:6	69:22 78:8	52:24 54:5	82:17 83:8	49:11 51:1	53:20 55:3	104:8	124:15
proposing	87:14,15,18	54:7,7 77:1	83:12,16	51:1 53:10	67:23 69:6	referred 7:5	reminding
9:17 26:12	87:19	78:2 83:6	84:13	54:8 56:17	77:24	23:22	71:5
Proprietary	88:14 97:9	102:10	102:14	62:19 68:6	87:20	121:8,9	renovating
65:11	97:10 99:4	104:17	117:21	75:24	88:16	referring	84:5
protect 19:3	112:6	105:14,20	random 94:8	76:11 85:8	100:11	79:1	replace 74:17
19:16	123:8,9	116:19	range 102:13	85:9,22	111:4	reflect 38:1	replacement
110:17	124:15	117:17	113:18	92:25	112:24	regarding	74:15
protected	127:12	118:3,6,15	ranked 90:10	93:12	119:18	2:25 4:16	report 68:25
21:6	public-min...	119:15	rarest 116:2	94:18 98:9	123:12	5:18 8:8	69:11,15
protecting	15:25	questioning	rate 61:3	104:1	125:1	21:9 77:2	88:2,8
99:18	publicly 98:5	55:12	re-alignment	113:7	recommen...	83:24	reported

Committee on Law and Government
February 5, 2020

Page 12

123:16,24	respectfully	111:5,7	running	71:16	48:1,2	114:3	72:10
124:21	55:11	119:19,21	97:14,15	72:11,24	49:25 91:9	115:24	site 38:3
125:7,11	responders	122:16	rush 119:8,15	73:8,18	93:8	120:5	sites 14:14
126:2	22:17	ridiculous		75:1 78:3,8	104:14	121:10	89:17
reporter	94:20	37:23	S	78:14	119:15	services	situated
127:12,23	97:11	right 2:18	S 1:11	82:21 83:5	seek 74:5	94:18	104:9
reproduction	99:17	22:6,25	sacrifice	83:18	seeking 16:13	session 68:23	sizes 14:5
127:21	response 45:1	27:9 37:2,5	16:22	85:11	seen 13:20	69:14 88:6	skill 67:3
request 2:11	57:16	38:7 45:13	safety 59:18	89:11	14:15	98:17	skilled 8:20
20:14	103:10	49:23	94:21,25	116:23	60:20 61:7	123:21	9:3 35:10
124:23	106:21	53:11	sampling	117:11,14	61:13	124:4,25	35:15 36:2
requested	123:4	56:21	72:23	school's	selection	sessions 3:5	36:5 39:12
100:19	responsibili...	64:13 67:4	Sanchez 9:15	73:20	81:17	set 107:11	66:23 72:1
required 91:8	8:22	79:21	88:19 91:3	schools 7:14	92:12	setting 56:5	74:24
91:13	rest 31:6	83:14,15	93:18 97:3	9:23 13:8	sending	64:18	107:9,9
requirements	63:25 73:1	84:12	97:23	13:11,23	117:16	share 7:2	skills 9:19
42:5 93:5,7	76:10	89:25 90:4	100:14	14:14 17:7	sends 116:19	64:5 73:3	12:8 41:11
93:8	results 8:18	90:10,17	123:12,15	23:4 28:17	senior 10:11	121:16	59:25 71:6
requires	resurgence	93:23 95:2	125:5	37:1 38:7	73:17	shared 86:25	71:10
92:15	13:20	96:6 99:25	Sanitation	83:13 84:3	77:12	Shawn	73:24
research 6:15	retail 64:24	100:2	39:15	93:1 117:8	sense 37:11	111:13	74:10,13
residential	retired 19:14	101:4	SATs 92:9	scope 37:11	sensitive 4:24	shift 25:10	75:4 92:21
63:11	65:3	106:18	saw 76:1	score 71:14	separate 6:3	shine 64:7	93:14 94:6
residents	114:23	108:7	77:19	scores 49:17	serious 9:8	shining 62:20	95:3,4
40:14 47:5	retiree 65:8	rightful	saying 11:4	screen 98:7	97:12	shortage 60:8	107:24
resistance	return 69:22	20:25	11:17 76:3	seamless	servants	shout 68:7	slain 21:5
95:1	88:14	rigorous 14:3	114:11	29:14 32:2	17:17	show 11:18	slashed 89:8
resolution	returning	62:1 92:14	124:6	32:8	serve 19:17	11:24	sleep 64:19
2:8,10 5:22	11:13	rising 5:9	125:14	seamlessly	111:11	49:12 61:2	small 80:13
7:5 25:17	reveals 72:17	risk 17:15	says 12:15	42:15	served 17:10	showing	80:17 81:4
26:4,11,12	review 81:17	53:11	106:14	seated 58:22	105:24	62:21	103:1
69:1,16	98:8	99:19	scheduled	second 47:15	111:14	shows 29:6	smaller 14:4
88:8 123:3	rewarding	road 119:4	3:25 23:24	98:1	service 5:6,19	side 78:9	snapshot
123:7	64:11	roads 59:21	25:7 27:11	seconded	6:1 7:11,19	signed 3:23	47:4 70:12
125:3,6,11	rhetoric	robust 10:6	81:20	123:23	8:12 14:25	significance	SOAR 71:1
125:25	13:13	35:3 41:13	112:13	125:10	17:14,20	115:6	social 70:18
126:1	Richardson	120:21	school 7:14	Secondly	18:18 19:4	significant	74:22
resolutions	1:13 2:21	ROCK	7:22 10:9	22:13 24:1	19:21 20:8	81:15,25	socially 71:24
1:18 3:17	6:10,22	111:22	24:11 26:2	sector 11:12	21:1 23:23	85:17	society 71:7
resource 62:7	9:17 20:19	role 89:3	26:17 28:4	41:17	24:3 25:25	101:20	soft 41:11
122:9	23:11,13	108:9	29:10 30:7	44:18 51:6	26:15	signify 124:5	solution 6:18
resources	38:15,17	roles 108:1,2	30:16 34:4	51:13,22	33:12	125:14	107:7
11:7,8	39:10 40:7	room 1:4	34:7,10,11	52:5,11,17	34:17,21,24	similar 28:20	somebody
27:16,19,21	41:20	64:5 99:10	40:16	56:25	35:15	32:15	80:11 85:3
28:13	42:20	Rule 7:17	48:21	112:6,6	41:25 42:7	66:22	101:3
33:25 35:7	43:19,24	11:10	49:15 59:6	secure 50:2	45:10,14,17	similarly	103:4,4
78:25	44:10,20	25:23	59:11	security	45:19	104:9	someone's
110:9	50:17,19	26:13	60:18,22,25	59:13,19	71:14 97:9	simply 7:8	94:22
respect 15:23	51:9 52:14	rules 68:22	61:4 63:6	75:10	97:10	sincere 16:10	somewhat
16:23,25	53:18	69:13 88:4	63:10,12,19	see 10:16	109:6,10	single 14:12	41:7 54:4
17:20	54:25 55:4	123:19	64:1,14	17:25	110:5	22:14 56:1	son 19:2
18:10	55:6 76:3	124:2,23	65:4,19	22:24 25:9	111:9,10,19	78:21 90:3	soon 121:13
97:16	76:15,17	run 90:23	66:3,18	25:11 28:3	112:22	sir 121:25	sophomore
99:19	77:22	118:19	68:8 70:9	36:22,24	113:2	Sisterly	65:18

Committee on Law and Government
February 5, 2020

Page 13

111:21	spoke 32:21	state 6:12	73:19	successful	survivor	22:11	27:11
sorry 33:24	spoken 23:17	21:14 27:4	students	29:18	118:12	tax 109:2	47:16
36:15	sponsor 6:8	48:4,12	11:21	86:14	suspended	teach 74:16	50:10 58:8
42:13	13:5 15:11	53:9 55:7	14:16 28:3	suffer 8:14	123:19	teacher 86:15	58:16
sort 25:9	15:24	70:3 71:3	28:5,15,25	summarize	124:2,24	86:17	123:2,6
39:23	16:12	89:10 91:9	30:5,6	27:7,12	suspension	teachers 14:9	testifying
49:22 52:9	18:12,25	91:14	31:21 32:1	58:18	68:22	15:7 62:5	25:11
81:17	19:24 22:5	105:2	32:3 34:6	summary	69:13 88:4	teaching	103:15
91:23	22:5 32:21	106:25	34:16,18,20	31:5 64:7	sustainable	71:19	testimony 2:7
96:18,20	37:15	113:3	39:8 49:9	summer 34:6	61:20	team 68:13	20:5,13
soul 14:11	119:25	114:19	49:11,13,16	34:9	system 28:5	tech 47:2	25:7 27:5,8
space 9:20	121:12,14	120:18	49:18,19	supervision	50:4 73:21	technical 5:5	28:20 31:6
11:4 16:16	122:17	stated 86:16	59:25	127:23	78:8 94:9	7:13,21	32:11
84:4	sponsors 2:12	113:4	60:20 61:4	support	95:15,16	16:16 17:7	38:19 45:4
Spanish	spring 73:11	statements	61:7,11,12	19:15	systems	18:20	47:11 48:5
94:22	Squilla 1:12	54:6	61:19,22,24	24:20	59:22,23	24:10 26:1	50:20
speak 63:5	2:19	states 7:16	61:25 62:8	48:18	96:15	26:16	58:17,19
95:22 96:1	stabilized	73:4	62:12 64:9	68:20		41:10	59:2 67:8
114:13,17	36:6	stats 49:12	65:19,23	99:13,16	T	55:10 62:1	68:3 69:23
115:1,5	stable 5:12	stay 71:15	66:5,21	108:2,15	T 127:1,1	72:19 73:7	70:5 75:23
120:22	staff 63:24,25	77:4 97:25	67:2 70:18	109:16	table 12:8	74:12 83:4	76:13
speaking	stake 108:3	stem 74:20	70:21,24	110:1,17	27:1 47:23	102:9	80:12
59:7 94:22	stakeholders	75:3,20	71:1,4,5,8	120:15	58:13	105:9	88:15
105:12	7:25 62:16	stenographer	71:11,15,20	supported	103:19	106:7	98:16
speaks 95:24	120:2	58:25	71:24 72:4	94:10	take 8:21	112:9	100:16
special 4:6	122:20	stenographic	72:8,13,15	99:21	20:5 24:3	tell 11:23	103:13
16:21 26:5	stand 102:25	127:4	72:17 73:6	110:20	43:21	43:2 50:14	105:4
26:10	standardized	step 9:6	73:9,13	120:21	49:13 62:4	118:21	106:24
114:11	92:7	65:21	74:4,7,16	supporting	83:25 84:3	119:1,2	107:2
specialist	standards	steps 14:22	74:23 75:1	68:10	97:10	Temple 51:25	113:2
59:5 91:18	14:3	99:2	75:3 77:4,9	supportive	110:24	temporary	114:19
specialized	standing 52:6	Steve 66:16	79:17	13:19	112:17	117:24	117:5
12:7	115:16	stop 117:18	117:6	supposed	taken 17:17	tenets 120:3	119:22
specific 22:12	standpoint	store 64:24	study 70:25	118:23	99:1	tension 95:19	121:23
32:12 42:5	28:12	stories	72:14	sure 2:24	123:10	tenure 57:22	testing 11:9
42:7 43:2	33:17	116:16	studying	10:4 19:19	127:5	terms 37:14	84:23
43:10	36:18 37:8	story 76:12	101:24	20:2 21:1	takes 83:25	37:15	89:24 91:4
77:14	41:10,11	Street 64:3	stuff 30:19	25:6 32:24	talent 62:10	54:19,20	92:5 94:4
81:21,22	46:24	Streets 28:22	95:10	33:13	talk 10:8	93:21	97:4,5
91:12	90:23	35:24	104:18	43:19 48:6	31:14 33:8	test 49:16	98:19
93:14 99:1	91:22	39:22	submission	51:7 52:7	39:16 40:4	79:25	tests 22:12
114:1	92:23	40:12,19,23	25:20	54:14	46:5 47:1	85:18,21	92:7,22
specifically	start 34:6	41:4,9,16	26:19	56:18 57:1	48:17 51:9	90:22	thank 4:6
34:3 40:13	62:13	43:5 44:15	submitted	57:12	78:13	91:12,16	6:14,15,22
44:7 79:16	101:12	strengthened	58:17	58:21,23	81:20	92:20	6:25 9:10
specifics 5:18	115:17	41:5	submitting	77:14	83:12	100:25	9:11,15,16
54:9	started 28:22	strong 19:15	7:8	100:21	120:3	102:12,23	11:2 12:20
118:22	92:23	strongest	subsequent	114:16	talked 11:10	106:16	12:22,25
specify 6:5	109:23	113:16	112:15	121:15	46:11	tested 82:16	15:11,13,15
spectrum	starting	strongly 28:1	suburbs	122:21	98:20,23	93:20	15:21 18:1
21:20	13:15	structured	61:11	surprised	talking 9:22	testified	18:2,7,12
46:24	65:18	119:5	success 59:16	61:23	10:19	86:25	21:10,13
Speed 73:19	92:19	student 29:15	107:11	Survey	60:10 94:3	testify 5:17	23:8,13
spirit 95:11	starts 58:23	72:25	117:13	108:18	targeted	26:23	24:20,21

Committee on Law and Government
February 5, 2020

Page 14

27:13,25	thanks 69:20	82:13	126:8	transcript	124:12	61:14 65:1	111:12
31:6,13	theory 63:13	three 4:10	today's 2:25	127:6,20	125:20	65:9,25	114:24
36:12	thing 66:5	60:21	7:7 20:4	transferred	two-and-a-...	66:8	120:11
38:12,12,17	86:10	64:20	80:21	10:3	3:4	unions 8:1	veterans
38:18	101:2	71:11	told 80:14	transition	two-year	61:13	16:18 19:4
41:20	102:1	73:23	81:2	32:8 34:21	56:2	unique 13:25	19:10 21:2
44:10,20	108:7	107:15	tomorrow	40:22	type 41:24	unit 11:22	24:8 45:14
45:3 47:10	113:16	111:14	22:23	48:15	77:7	University	56:7 78:10
47:12 48:7	things 8:17	113:3	tool 5:10	79:17	types 29:21	51:15,25	80:1
50:9,19	10:17 11:5	Thursday	53:14	transitioned	30:2 92:21	64:16	105:10,13
51:2 52:14	11:9,12	114:4	toolbox 5:11	44:14,16	93:14	75:19	105:18,23
53:18,21	12:16	tightening	tools 74:18	transitioning	typically 77:4	unlimited	106:4
54:12	13:16	22:24	top 39:5	48:20	U	22:7	107:5
55:12,14,17	33:11 84:1	time 3:15 5:7	96:24	transitions	U.S 73:3	unsuccessf...	108:8,12,16
57:10,18	92:18	13:12,24	102:23	29:14 32:3	U.S.A 75:4	94:17	108:20
58:3,5,6	93:22,23	17:10	total 42:25	transparency	umbrella	upscale	109:4,6,9
59:2 62:25	94:12 96:9	23:25	43:25	47:10 54:2	71:20	107:10	109:17
63:3 67:5,7	96:11,16	52:10	97:15	transparent	un 5:8	use 5:10	110:4,8,18
67:25 68:2	100:15	60:15	totally 37:24	98:5	unable 50:2	56:24	110:21,25
68:9,15,16	114:5	72:18	tough 103:3	travel 85:4	unacceptable	74:17	111:22,25
69:4,7,20	think 17:2	84:24 90:3	tour 98:24	treatment	37:24	91:12	114:5,25
69:25	21:18,18,22	92:16	tours 111:14	59:22	unbelievably	93:15	115:21
73:14	22:11,25	101:23	track 28:22	tremendous	93:3	usually 61:18	118:11
75:22,24	23:1 28:2	112:13	31:23	117:1	uncle 19:12	61:23	120:25
76:13,17,21	29:6 30:1	113:24	39:17,19,21	tried 80:18	under 19:12	utilize 53:14	122:3,4
77:22,25	32:17	time-sensiti...	40:5,11	troops 110:2	underempl...	V	Vice-chair
82:2 87:6,7	37:10	5:2	41:15 43:7	true 22:2	52:21	VA 110:13	1:11 6:23
87:22	39:14 48:2	times 16:4	44:12	truly 21:2	underempl...	vacancies	victim 17:9
88:10,12,19	49:1,1,3,24	96:14	tracking 77:2	Trustees 54:4	5:9	36:3 37:3	view 104:5
97:21,23	53:2,5 54:4	timing 70:15	77:8,11	try 17:23	underrepre...	vacancy 37:5	viewpoints
98:2,2	54:8,10	tiny 81:4,5	tracks 10:21	32:2 33:13	109:7	42:14	7:2
100:3,4,12	57:8 65:19	91:22	trade 36:5	55:18	understand	vacant	violence
100:14	65:21 79:1	title 25:16	107:25	81:13	28:7,8	107:10	99:18
103:6,7,12	79:22	34:17	trades 29:8	86:20	53:15 71:9	visibility	110:14
104:25	80:24	today 2:13	29:20 35:9	93:24	72:3 83:21	vagueness	visit 50:24
106:18,19	81:25	4:25 5:4,21	35:10,13,15	trying 33:10	90:9 92:16	22:1 113:6	visited 14:12
106:23	88:23 90:4	7:2 13:4,16	36:2 37:16	36:4 80:15	94:15	valuable 71:5	14:13 16:4
107:3	90:7,23	14:6,19,20	37:18,21	92:19 97:6	103:4	120:14	voice 98:1
111:2,3,7,8	91:3 93:2	18:9,16	38:8 39:12	100:24	understand...	value 71:9	122:22
111:19	94:24 95:5	25:18	traditional	turn 11:25	18:13,24	value-added	voices 7:1
112:20,22	95:7	27:11	61:4	turning 12:2	19:6,22	71:4	122:15
113:1	102:10,12	32:22	trained 56:19	turns 119:6	20:9,11	various 18:11	vote 16:25
114:8,9,12	104:1	48:16 59:7	89:17	two 3:5,25	56:9	19:1 20:24	25:12
119:16,17	112:7	65:14	trainee 29:9	4:14 5:3	unemployed	31:22	63:16 67:1
119:21,22	113:23	75:23	36:10 41:1	11:11	52:21	36:11 92:3	88:7
120:5,6	117:15,18	80:12	41:1	13:16	unfair 89:11	vary 71:3	113:14
121:23	118:8,22	81:24 86:7	training	19:13	unfilled 8:19	versus 43:11	118:17,20
122:10,23	119:7,9	112:12	22:13,18,19	30:15	Unfortunat...	85:5	118:25
122:24	121:24	113:12	40:18	36:11 43:3	87:23	veteran 19:3	voted 26:7
123:15	122:8	115:2	41:10	44:13	uniform	20:24 59:7	voters 4:13
125:5	thinking 76:9	117:4	42:13 53:1	49:13	22:17	59:12	20:14
126:7,10	99:11	121:3	53:3,10	60:21	unilaterally	94:11	votes 25:4
thankful 31:9	third 58:8	122:14	62:2 71:10	69:24 90:5	84:10	105:8	67:19
65:2	thought	123:11	72:16	95:9 118:7	union 23:16	110:11	

Committee on Law and Government
February 5, 2020

Page 15

87:16	83:11 85:8	82:11 85:5	weeks 3:4,15	116:20	86:22	90:4	46:20
124:17	88:7 93:25	85:6 93:4	8:10	word 84:23	107:9,20	109:10	47:12 78:4
125:24	94:15,21	121:21	welcome	worded	109:9	years 4:22	78:22,24,25
voting 16:5	95:3 96:2	ways 92:20	44:21	106:18	110:9	19:5 39:22	79:9,14
17:25	97:9,25	93:12	89:18	words 6:11	working	40:11 43:3	80:6 81:13
21:25 23:5	98:1 99:4	wayside 91:1	welding	work 5:19	14:16	44:13	90:19 91:7
66:20	103:22	we'll 10:8	11:21	6:2 9:19	30:16 34:8	48:24 53:2	96:10
68:19,25	106:23	20:5,12	well-educat...	10:8,10,13	34:10,22	57:21	97:21
69:10	111:8,13,19	81:13	49:11	14:14 23:7	36:18	60:21 61:6	100:8
81:11 88:2	113:3	118:18,21	well-known	30:1,17,19	40:16	63:10,12	102:15,19
113:11	115:5	we're 11:18	91:16	34:4 38:4	51:15 52:2	64:20 65:6	Zakiyyah
118:20	118:24	12:1,16	went 10:2,21	38:21	64:23,24	71:11 73:5	40:1,3,9
119:2	119:24	14:6,8 18:8	64:22	46:23	66:16	73:23	Zeta 111:21
	120:11	22:8 27:6	81:16 92:8	48:21 49:2	96:21	82:15	zip 46:15,17
	121:22	28:2 29:24	98:16	49:5 50:7	98:24	84:16,17,18	47:8
W	122:23	30:24 31:8	weren't 66:8	50:24,25	101:23	85:15 89:8	
wage 60:17	124:13	31:19 32:7	West 72:23	51:12,21	102:6	93:6 95:9	0
72:7	125:21	33:9,10	73:18 74:4	52:17 53:4	104:3,21,22	102:7	04 111:16
wait 3:15	126:7	34:22 36:4	White 37:22	54:10	110:12,14	104:4	
5:13 22:24		60:10 76:6	who've 21:5	56:16	121:6,11	107:24	1
waiting 80:10	wanted 13:1	81:11	wholeheart...	57:23	126:9	109:22	1 9:4 85:22
Walker 58:10	16:7 23:14	86:23	99:12,15	60:24	works 29:9	yesterday	109:17
70:6,8	33:5 38:24	89:18	103:23	63:23	36:9 37:25	77:13	1,080 62:1
75:24	39:13 43:7	91:19,23,25	104:11	64:10,13,17	40:25	York 101:10	1.8 109:8
77:10	51:3 58:1	92:5,19	wife 91:17	67:3 68:13	48:10 51:5	young 5:11	10 17:4,21
walks 107:22	58:20	94:3 96:12	Wilkins	95:19 96:5	60:4 66:13	11:14,19,24	21:18
Walt 76:9	88:19	96:16,21	58:10 70:6	99:16	79:16	13:11 14:4	39:22
want 2:14,23	100:3	97:6 99:24	70:7 75:24	100:5	110:8	14:7,20,21	79:24
3:2 4:5	103:2	104:1,23	77:10	108:15	workset	15:5 23:3	84:15,17,18
5:20 6:8,12	107:12	109:20,20	willing 24:13	118:23	117:25	42:20,24	85:15 89:8
6:13,15,24	114:16	109:24	24:17 87:3	120:1,12	world 93:24	43:6,8,16	93:6
7:23 8:12	121:24	110:14	willingness	121:4	worthwhile	48:20 49:2	113:17
9:16 11:2	122:2	112:3	100:5	122:19	74:4	50:6 52:20	10-point 56:3
14:6 15:22	wants 15:16	118:4	wiring 63:11	worked 4:7	worthy 88:23	64:8 68:14	109:5
16:22	22:5 28:10	we've 11:6,10	wish 68:18	13:6,8 65:4	wouldn't	76:20	110:6
18:12	95:13	20:9 21:20	69:10	65:6 104:6	66:15	80:20	10:15 1:6
21:14,17	116:1	25:6 36:12	81:24 88:1	121:22	wrong 82:5	83:17 87:1	100 85:20
24:22 25:7	war 99:21	41:5,6,12	Witness 27:1	worker 4:20	98:12	112:8	102:25
25:15 27:8	109:23	43:4 46:11	47:22,23	workers 47:7		youth 5:8	10th 73:22
27:24,25	wars 109:25	51:14	58:13	workforce	X	40:15	11:20 47:18
28:2,21	wasn't 10:4	60:20	103:19	8:20 9:3,9	X 46:18	43:11 52:6	113 72:13
29:13 30:4	53:4 77:14	85:14	witnesses	9:19 36:16		52:7 60:1	11th 10:5
30:20 31:2	watching	86:11,12	26:23	38:22	Y	60:14	34:7 75:6
33:1 35:8	25:8 99:10	93:11 94:9	44:25	39:24	Yeah 112:25	61:17	12:15 126:12
45:2,12	water 28:24	95:7 98:6	47:16	40:10 41:2	year 10:2,10	62:17,24	120,000
46:3,5	31:24	99:20	57:15 58:8	46:7 48:3	10:11	107:11	108:24
47:17,24	35:23	102:6	women 19:16	48:11	21:17 34:7		13 3:5 75:15
49:2 50:19	59:22	104:2	30:15	50:21	34:10	Z	130,000
57:18	way 13:17	117:4	99:13	56:20	45:10,15,18	Zaccagni	108:24
58:15,18,22	14:23	wean 4:8	Women's	57:21	45:20 60:9	26:24	1400 1:5
67:6 68:2,6	21:19	Wednesday	111:22	59:15	64:10	27:14,16,22	15 85:5
69:25	46:14	1:6 4:4	wonderful	71:17	65:18	31:19 33:7	16 72:14
75:22,23	60:18,24	week 4:2 34:8	13:22 16:1	73:12 74:7	77:12,20	36:14 37:4	1682 59:21
76:17	62:13	113:14	68:3	74:24	83:9 86:20	39:3,18	180 72:16
77:17 80:4	64:12 80:9						

