

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
COMMITTEE ON STREETS AND SERVICES

Room 400, City Hall
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania
Thursday, May 2, 2019
1:23 p.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCILMAN MARK SQUILLA, CHAIR
COUNCILWOMAN CINDY BASS
COUNCILMAN WILLIAM K. GREENLEE
COUNCILMAN BOBBY HENON
COUNCILMAN KENYATTA JOHNSON
COUNCILMAN DAVID OH
COUNCILWOMAN CHERELLE L. PARKER
COUNCILWOMAN MARIA D. QUINONES-SANCHEZ

BILLS 160844, 180950, 181009, 181046, 190085,
190103, 190104, 190105, 190121, 190184,
190209, 190210, and 190255

- - -

Committee on Streets and Services
May 2, 2019

Page 2

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Good
3 afternoon, everyone, and thank you for
4 coming. We are now starting our
5 Committee on Streets and Services.

6 We have a quorum here. To my
7 left, Councilman Johnson, Councilman
8 Greenlee. To my right, Councilman Oh and
9 Councilwoman Sanchez.

10 The hearing has now started.

11 Mr. McMonagle, please read the
12 title of the first bill.

13 THE CLERK: Bill No. 160844, an
14 ordinance repealing an ordinance approved
15 the eleventh day of January, A.D. 1950,
16 by declaring the intention of the City of
17 Philadelphia to organize and authorizing
18 the organization of a Parking Authority
19 under the Act of June 5th, 1947; all
20 under certain terms and conditions.

21 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Is there
22 anybody testifying on this bill?

23 THE CLERK: Rochelle
24 Nichols-Soloman and Steve.

25 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Before we

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 start with testimony, I'd like to
3 recognize Councilman Oh.

4 COUNCILMAN OH: Thank you very
5 much, Chairman Squilla.

6 This ultimately comes down to a
7 bill to take back control of on-street
8 parking.

9 (Applause.)

10 COUNCILMAN OH: However, the
11 issue of control means that we're in the
12 driver's seat, as we should be. It may
13 be that we end up securing a contract, a
14 negotiated contract, with the Parking
15 Authority. Those type of things come up.

16 My purpose is just to lay out
17 and address the legal memorandums that
18 have been provided to me from the Law
19 Department and to refute them, which is
20 what I'm going to do now. So I'll ask
21 you to bear with me. I want to go
22 through them carefully. If you wait to
23 the end, all the legal arguments, at
24 least on my part, will be addressed. I
25 am trying to do this in layman terms so

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 they're easy to understand, and I
3 certainly can go through that at another
4 level.

5 So we have a slide
6 presentation. You have a PowerPoint in
7 front of you. So if I may begin, I will
8 start.

9 Bill No. 160844 is lawful and
10 returns control of administering the
11 on-street parking system and other
12 functions to the citizens of
13 Philadelphia. This bill does not
14 dissolve the Philadelphia Parking
15 Authority. The bill provides
16 Philadelphians the opportunity to take
17 back control of a critical municipal
18 function and its revenues.

19 The City has the legal
20 authority: The City has the legal
21 authority to take back the functions of
22 administering the on-street parking
23 system and other functions from the
24 Philadelphia Parking Authority. The
25 Administrations, in this case the past

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 Mayor's Administration and the current
3 Mayor's Administration, reliance on the
4 Supreme Court decision in City of
5 Philadelphia versus Schweiker and various
6 statutes enacted by the Pennsylvania
7 General Assembly after 2001 is misplaced.

8 The Pennsylvania Constitution,
9 Article III, Section 32 prohibits the
10 General Assembly from enacting local laws
11 or special legislation regulating the
12 affairs of counties, cities, et cetera.
13 What that means is the Pennsylvania
14 Constitution forbids the General Assembly
15 from making laws that are local and
16 special, because counties and cities are
17 separate independent branches of
18 government or entities of government.

19 In City of Philadelphia versus
20 Schweiker, the City abandoned its claim
21 under Article III, Section 32; therefore,
22 they were never considered.

23 Article III, Section 32, local
24 control: The ability of counties and
25 municipalities to make their own

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 decisions is very important in
3 Pennsylvania. To protect local control,
4 the Pennsylvania Constitution, Article
5 III, Section 32 prohibits the General
6 Assembly from passing any local or
7 special law that regulates the affairs of
8 counties, cities. The General Assembly
9 would violate the Pennsylvania
10 Constitution if it legislated that the
11 Philadelphia Parking Authority perform
12 the City's functions and prevented
13 Philadelphia from altering its
14 relationship with the Parking Authority
15 without the Parking Authority's consent
16 absent a bona fide state interest.

17 The takeover, Act 22 of 2001:
18 The Pennsylvania Constitution requires
19 that the General Assembly enact general
20 laws, not local or special, which serve
21 the public interest. In 2001,
22 Pennsylvania Speaker of the House met
23 with the Mayor of Philadelphia. The
24 Mayor ignored the Speaker. The Speaker
25 responded with legislation; that is, Act

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 22, that the Governor, rather than the
3 Mayor, appoint the Board members of the
4 Philadelphia Parking Authority. As a
5 result, the leadership of the
6 Philadelphia Parking Authority changed
7 and no longer responded to the Mayor of
8 Philadelphia.

9 Act 22 also required the PPA,
10 Parking Authority, to transfer up to \$45
11 million of its retained earnings to
12 Philadelphia School District, with
13 similar annual transfers. There was no
14 City parking issue or problem that
15 precipitated this change.

16 And I'll just add the reason is
17 because the state could not seize the
18 Parking Authority, it had to say that the
19 reason it was seizing the Parking
20 Authority was to fund the schools and,
21 therefore, it wasn't a little bit of
22 money. It was a lot of money. It was
23 \$45 million per year. That is what they
24 claimed.

25 The City of Philadelphia files

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 in court. Consistent with newly enacted
3 amendments, the Governor appointed six
4 new members, two recommended by the
5 Speaker, two from the Senate President
6 Pro Tempore, and two from the Governor to
7 the existing five-member Board. So there
8 were five from the Mayor. Now there were
9 six from the Governor.

10 The City filed in Common Pleas
11 Court challenging the validity of the
12 amendments. The City also sought
13 injunctive relief to prevent the new
14 members from being sworn in.

15 Common Pleas Court lacked
16 jurisdiction and transferred the case to
17 Commonwealth Court. Commonwealth Court
18 lacked jurisdiction and dismissed the
19 case.

20 The City then sought emergency
21 stay and exercise of King's Bench powers
22 with the Pennsylvania Supreme Court. The
23 Pennsylvania Supreme Court denied the
24 City's request for relief regarding
25 seating of newly constituted Board

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 members, but stayed further
3 implementation of challenged amendments.
4 Pennsylvania Supreme Court returned the
5 matter to the Commonwealth Court and
6 lifted the stay.

7 The City filed an amended
8 complaint before the Commonwealth Court
9 with seven arguments. First, amendments
10 impermissibly and unconstitutionally
11 infringe upon City's Home Rule Charter
12 and corresponding ordinances.

13 Second, amendments violate a
14 legislative pledge not to alter or limit
15 any rights of PPA until all bonds have
16 been fully met and discharged.

17 Third, City relied on such
18 pledge in dealing with Parking Authority.

19 Fourth, singling out PPA
20 constitutes special legislation without
21 substantial valid or rational basis.

22 Fifth, the special or local
23 amendments were passed without the
24 constitutionally required published
25 notice.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 Sixth, amendments
3 unconstitutionally delegate municipal
4 functions to a special commission.

5 Seventh, amendments were passed
6 on a bill which violated Pennsylvania
7 Constitution's single subject rule.

8 In response to the City's
9 amended complaint, the state and the
10 Parking Authority filed preliminary
11 objections. A full panel of the
12 Commonwealth Court granted their
13 preliminary objections and dismissed the
14 City's complaint. The City then appealed
15 to the Pennsylvania Supreme Court.

16 The Pennsylvania Supreme Court
17 affirmed the order of the Commonwealth
18 Court dismissing the case.

19 The Pennsylvania Supreme Court
20 found that the City raised constitutional
21 challenges, including Article III,
22 Section 32 to Act 22 in its amended
23 complaint, but failed to state these
24 issues in its list of questions presented
25 on appeal, did not discuss them in the

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 body of the brief, did not include them
3 in its prayer for relief. Therefore, the
4 Supreme Court found that the City
5 abandoned these claims.

6 City of Philadelphia versus
7 Schweiker is not on point. The legal
8 memorandum provided by the Law Department
9 to City Council on January 25th, 2017
10 regarding the legal authority of Bill
11 160844 relies heavily on City of
12 Philadelphia versus Schweiker where the
13 Pennsylvania Supreme Court affirmed the
14 Commonwealth Court's dismissal of the
15 City's case.

16 In City of Philadelphia versus
17 Schweiker, the Pennsylvania Supreme Court
18 found that the City had abandoned its
19 claims under Article III, Section 32. As
20 a result, the Pennsylvania Supreme Court
21 never considered the issues of
22 constitutionally prohibited legislation
23 by the General Assembly, which interfered
24 with Philadelphia's county and city
25 functions.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 Since the decision in City of
3 Philadelphia versus Schweiker, the
4 General Assembly has enacted various laws
5 regarding on-street parking and other
6 municipal functions empowering the
7 Parking Authority and possibly
8 restricting the City of Philadelphia.

9 The City of Philadelphia has not
10 challenged the constitutionality of these
11 laws under Article III, Section 32.

12 Parking Authority is not
13 accountable to the City of Philadelphia.
14 It has a direct relationship with the
15 General Assembly. Through the General
16 Assembly, the Parking Authority obtained
17 additional duties within our city and
18 generates funds which are not known to
19 City officials. These funds are
20 collected by the Parking Authority and
21 placed in non-City accounts and used
22 outside the City.

23 Act 9 of 2004: After Mayor
24 Street expressed the City's intent not to
25 extend its contract with the Parking

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 Authority, Act of February 10, 2004
3 called Act 9 unilaterally extended the
4 Parking Authority's administration of the
5 City's on-street parking for an
6 additional ten years after the 1994
7 agreement between the City and the
8 Parking Authority expired.

9 There was a contract, an
10 agreement between the City and the
11 Parking Authority for ten years from 1994
12 to 2004 just before it was going to
13 expire and Mayor Street said he would not
14 renew it. The Pennsylvania General
15 Assembly simply enacted a law extending
16 it upon the City for another ten years.

17 Annual transfers from the
18 Parking Authority to the City of 25
19 million, net of on-street parking revenue
20 and excess to the School District, was
21 the new formula. So after it collected
22 its money, 25 million would go to the
23 City and anything above that would go to
24 the School District. So they changed
25 their formula of 45 million per year.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 This provision expired on March 31st,
3 2014.

4 The Law Department's memorandum
5 advises that the City cannot release its
6 agreement without PPA's consent. The
7 relevant portion that they cite is -- or
8 states, The Authority and the City, by
9 mutual consent, may modify the system of
10 on-street parking regulation to the
11 extent permitted by law.

12 City of Philadelphia versus
13 Rendell: In response to Act 9, City
14 filed a complaint in City of Philadelphia
15 versus Rendell, which challenged the new
16 statutory amendment as once again
17 interfering with the City's Home Rule
18 powers.

19 Commonwealth Court sustained
20 Commonwealth and PPA's preliminary
21 objections and again dismissed the City's
22 case. Commonwealth Court stated the
23 issue had already been decided by the
24 Pennsylvania Supreme Court in City of
25 Philadelphia versus Schweiker.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 However, in Footnote 23, Judge
3 Leavitt stated, Act 9 extended the
4 contract. Act 9 did not divest the City
5 Council of its ability to legislate on
6 the subject of on-street parking that
7 does not involve the proprietary aspects
8 of on-street parking. The dissent reads,
9 Act 9 to give the Authority a legislative
10 veto on the language that, quote, the
11 Authority and the City, by mutual
12 consent, may modify the system of
13 on-street parking regulation to the
14 extent permitted by applicable law, end
15 quote.

16 The Parking Authority law makes
17 it clear that on-street parking
18 regulation involves the act of
19 administration, supervision, and
20 enforcement, not legislative acts. In
21 any case, the Authority has not attempted
22 to veto an act of City Council. The mere
23 possibility of that event does not give
24 rise to a cause of action. Stated
25 otherwise, the claim is not right for our

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 review because it is not presented here.
3 City Council, in other words, has never
4 legislated on the issue of on-street
5 parking.

6 So now we have the July 2012
7 statute. Also known as the July 2012
8 statute, provides that from March 31st,
9 2014 when Act 9's provisions extending
10 the 1994 agreement between the City and
11 the Parking Authority expires, the
12 Parking Authority shall enforce and
13 administer all on-street parking
14 regulation in Philadelphia; i.e.,
15 indefinitely. At that point in time, the
16 General Assembly didn't even bother to
17 extend the contract forcibly. It just
18 simply legislated that from this point
19 forward, the Parking Authority would
20 administer the City's function of
21 administering on-street parking.

22 Unlike Act 9, the July 2012
23 statute does not extend the cooperation
24 agreement. The General Assembly simply
25 legislated the City function to the

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 Parking Authority. The 2012 statute does
3 not prohibit unilateral action by the
4 City regarding its on-street parking and
5 other functions. Such a prohibition
6 would be unconstitutional absent a state
7 interest.

8 What is the state interest that
9 originally was claimed in court, in the
10 Supreme Court, by the Commonwealth, by
11 the Parking Authority that was funding
12 our schools? So we go back to funding
13 our schools. In the City of Philadelphia
14 versus Schweiker, the Commonwealth and
15 Parking Authority claimed that the
16 state's interest in enacting Act 22,
17 which took control of the Philadelphia
18 Parking Authority from the City, was to
19 provide adequate funds to the
20 Philadelphia School District. In 2001,
21 the state took control of Philadelphia's
22 financially challenged School District.
23 The School District is not a department
24 of the City. When the School District
25 was challenged, the City did not want to

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 come up with the money. The state would
3 then have the responsibility of funding
4 the school. It is not something that the
5 City governs.

6 Since 2001, the Parking
7 Authority has grown significantly, and
8 dramatically increased its revenues.
9 However, its costs have also grown
10 dramatically, and additional revenue
11 generation authorized by the General
12 Assembly is not provided to the City or
13 the School District. In fact, the
14 Parking Authority has never come close to
15 giving the maximum 45 million annually to
16 the Philadelphia School District as
17 provided in Act 22. From Fiscal Year
18 2002 to Fiscal Year 2017, that would have
19 been \$720 million. In reality, over the
20 16 years, the Parking Authority has only
21 given \$89.6 million to the School
22 District.

23 Failure to fund our schools:
24 Money promised to the School District has
25 not been delivered. City Council held

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 hearings regarding the Parking
3 Authority's failure to provide funds to
4 the School District of Philadelphia.
5 Public officials have expressed the
6 opinion that the Parking Authority
7 appears to provide as little funds as
8 possible to the School District of
9 Philadelphia.

10 The state has not adequately
11 funded the School District of
12 Philadelphia. As a result, the City has
13 raised property taxes significantly,
14 increased the school's percentage of use
15 and occupancy tax, and implemented a
16 state-authorized cigarette tax. This has
17 not provided nearly the funds needed.

18 On July 1st, 2018, the School
19 District of Philadelphia was returned to
20 local control, removing, removing any
21 reason for the Parking Authority to be
22 under the control of the state and for
23 the Parking Authority to administer the
24 City's on-street parking functions.

25 The Parking Authority is

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 expected to provide a paltry 14.5 million
3 to the School District of Philadelphia in
4 Fiscal Year 2019. This small sum is the
5 largest contribution to the School
6 District of Philadelphia from the Parking
7 Authority since it first began funding
8 the School District in 2008.

9 Bill 160844 is lawful and
10 needed. Article III, Section 32
11 prohibits the General Assembly from
12 enacting local or special laws. The July
13 2012 statute would be unconstitutional if
14 it prohibits the City of Philadelphia
15 from regulating its own on-street parking
16 and related functions. The articulated
17 state interest in providing adequate
18 funds to the School District of
19 Philadelphia has not happened, and there
20 is no indication that it will.

21 Bill 160844 lawfully returns
22 City's on-street parking functions and
23 all related revenue to the City of
24 Philadelphia, as required by the
25 Pennsylvania Constitution in Article III,

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 Section 32.

3 After I made this presentation,
4 we tabled the hearing so that the Law
5 Department could respond, and they did
6 respond. They responded with a
7 memorandum that is incorrect and
8 misleading.

9 On April 3rd, 2017, the Law
10 Department responded to Councilman Oh's
11 presentation claiming that Article IX,
12 Section 13(b) of the Constitution of
13 Pennsylvania creates an exception,
14 allowing the state to create special laws
15 for cities of the first class. This is
16 not true.

17 Article IX, Section 13(b) is
18 limited to the specific circumstances
19 regarding the time in 1854 when numerous
20 separate and distinct municipalities were
21 consolidated into the City and County of
22 Philadelphia. County offices were
23 consolidated as well. The sole purpose
24 of Article IX, Section 13(b) is to
25 subject the City of Philadelphia's county

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 functions to the state's authority in
3 light of the fact that Philadelphia is
4 both a city and a county. This allows
5 the Commonwealth to pass general
6 legislation involving all county
7 functions throughout the Commonwealth,
8 not to create an exception for
9 Philadelphia County functions.

10 Let me just explain that prior
11 to this consolidation, the County of
12 Philadelphia was just like Bucks County
13 or Delaware County. There was a county
14 and there were a lot of little cities in
15 it, which now we understand as different
16 neighborhoods of Philadelphia. They had
17 their own police force. Some of them
18 didn't have a police force. They had
19 their own fire department. Some of them
20 didn't. There were the anti-Catholic
21 riots. There were fires. So what
22 happened is, the State Legislature took
23 all these little cities in the County of
24 Philadelphia and consolidated them into a
25 single city and county. There was no

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 other entity like it in Pennsylvania.
3 Hence, the City and County of
4 Philadelphia. But they wanted to still
5 be able to legislate county functions in
6 Harrisburg, so this one exception,
7 Article IX, Section 13(b), is so that in
8 the City and County of Philadelphia, the
9 county offices and county functions
10 respond to the laws created in Harrisburg
11 solely for county duties.

12 It was never the purpose of the
13 Home Rule Charter and the consolidation
14 amendment to deprive Philadelphia of its
15 constitutional rights to perform its
16 municipal functions. Article III,
17 Section 32, which prohibits the General
18 Assembly from making special and local
19 laws, was adopted in 1875. That's 21
20 years after Article IX, Section 13(b).
21 So Article IX does not rule over Article
22 III. Article III was enacted after
23 Article IX. Therefore, Article IX,
24 Section 13(b) is not an exception to
25 Article III, Section 32.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 Finally, I would like to say
3 that I did not have much trouble
4 discovering Article III, Section 32,
5 because in all of the cases, in all of
6 the appeals, the Supreme Court, the
7 Commonwealth Court, they all kept
8 pointing the City to Article III, Section
9 32 that the City waived, abandoned,
10 failed to claim. So the court pointed
11 out to the City in numerous ways, you
12 should be under Article III, Section 32.
13 The City never made that claim.

14 So we have the legal ability
15 with this bill, if we pass it out of
16 Committee, to then take back control of
17 on-street parking, which is a large
18 fee-generating entity in our city. It is
19 a regulatory function. What is important
20 about this is simply this: The state
21 never had an interest, does not have an
22 interest in regulating on-street parking.
23 It's not a state function. It's a city
24 function. No other city, township in
25 Pennsylvania has had their parking

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 administration seized. It's just asphalt
3 and a curb. That's all it is. You put
4 your car there. You pay a fee. That
5 money goes to the City. That cannot be
6 seized by the state.

7 Thank you.

8 (Applause.)

9 COUNCILWOMAN SANCHEZ: I will
10 assume the responsibility until the Chair
11 is back.

12 The Chair recognizes Councilman
13 Greenlee for a comment.

14 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Very
15 briefly, Madam Chair. Thank you.

16 Obviously the sponsor of this
17 bill did a lot of work on this. I am not
18 a lawyer and I'm not here to defend
19 anything with the Parking Authority,
20 including school funding, but what I do
21 know, we have three opinions from our
22 lawyers, the City Solicitor, who
23 obviously disagrees with the sponsor of
24 the bill and believes that this bill
25 would not be legal. And in my opinion,

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 if we pass something that the Law
3 Department clearly says we cannot do, all
4 we're doing is misleading the public, in
5 my humble opinion. And that's how I will
6 be voting.

7 Thank you, Madam Chair.

8 COUNCILWOMAN SANCHEZ: As we
9 continue, we're going to let the
10 witnesses at the witness table testify,
11 because they will be testifying on this
12 bill.

13 Proceed. Your name for the
14 record.

15 MS. NICHOLS-SOLOMAN: Thank
16 you. I'm Rochelle Nichols-Soloman and
17 I'm a member of Pay Up PPA. Thank you,
18 Councilman David Oh and the Streets and
19 Services Committee for the opportunity to
20 testify on Bill No. 160844.

21 Pay Up PPA is a grassroots
22 coalition comprised of progressive,
23 labor, faith, and pro-public education
24 organizations. It is our goal to secure
25 a dedicated, annual, and reoccurring

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 revenue stream from the Philadelphia
3 Parking Authority to the Philadelphia
4 School District of at least 25 million in
5 revenue. In addition, we are asking for
6 accountability and transparency of the
7 Philadelphia Parking Authority. Our call
8 for this is informed by our experiences
9 over the last year.

10 Pay Up PPA formed in the wake
11 of the sexual harassment at the Parking
12 Authority and the ensuing audit from the
13 Pennsylvania Department of the Auditor
14 General. For the last year and a half,
15 our coalition has attended every Board
16 meeting and spoke in the public comment
17 section, agitating to create a public
18 dialogue about how the agency can be more
19 responsive to the needs of Philadelphians
20 and the revenue challenges faced by the
21 Philadelphia School District.

22 Originally when the
23 Commonwealth took control, as has been
24 stated in the PowerPoint, over the
25 Parking Authority, it came with a promise

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 of 45 million in revenue for the School
3 District. This year, and through our
4 organizing efforts, the Parking Authority
5 funded the District at the highest level
6 on record at 14.4 million. While we
7 recognize this, as it's already been
8 said, it is still well short of our 25
9 million demand and woefully short of the
10 original 45 million funding promises that
11 were part of the justification of the
12 state control.

13 In addition, our coalition is
14 seeking far more transparency and
15 accountability from the Parking
16 Authority. Through our attendance at
17 Board meetings, we have seen the
18 leadership increase its use of executive
19 session to discuss personnel and legal
20 matters. We have been told that the
21 public comment section is not a place for
22 dialogue with the community. This has
23 led us to ask members of City Council and
24 the Parking Authority directly to hold a
25 public hearing so we can have a

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 constructive conversation about the
3 future of the Parking Authority. This
4 public agency has a reputation for not
5 being transparent. The State Auditor
6 Eugene DePasquale's report highlighted
7 the absentee culture surrounding
8 decisions of the Board and its
9 leadership. This culture forces Pay Up
10 PPA to resort to right-to-know requests
11 for routine information regarding
12 organizational structure, consulting
13 contracts, and official communication.

14 We have also seen many calls
15 for reform at the Parking Authority.
16 After the recent discovery of FBI
17 wiretaps of the Parking Authority's
18 longstanding Board member, the
19 Philadelphia Inquirer advocated a return
20 to local control. We of Pay Up PPA say
21 now is the time to have this public
22 conversation.

23 (Applause.)

24 MS. NICHOLS-SOLOMAN:

25 Furthermore, we support Parking Authority

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 Board member Andrew Stutzman's call at
3 the April 23rd, 2019 public meeting for
4 term limits of Board members. We welcome
5 this new interest. While the Board
6 committed to holding a vote on the
7 recommended changes, it was not without
8 pushback about timing and schedule.

9 Pay Up PPA applauds the
10 intentions of Councilman David Oh's bill
11 regarding local control of the Parking
12 Authority. Our goal is a more
13 accountable Parking Authority worthy of
14 the public trust. We are open to all
15 conversations on the best way to achieve
16 that. We are committed to working with
17 members of City Council, the
18 Administration, state officials, and
19 leadership of the Parking Authority to
20 achieve this.

21 Thank you for this opportunity
22 to testify today, and we would encourage
23 and welcome hearings surrounding the
24 City's relationship with the Authority.

25 Thank you.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 (Applause.)

3 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Please
4 proceed, Steve.

5 MR. HUNTINGTON: Good
6 afternoon. My name is Steve Huntington.
7 I'm speaking on behalf of the Crosstown
8 Coalition. We have given to the panel
9 our remarks. Rather than repeat them,
10 I'd like to give a little background.

11 Councilman Oh's office reached
12 out to us on April 22nd. That happened
13 to be the night of a monthly Crosstown
14 Board meeting. We, therefore, read the
15 bill, presented it to our Board, and
16 looking at the bill alone, without any
17 other context, such as been provided by
18 Councilman Oh, we reached two
19 conclusions.

20 The first conclusion was that
21 we strongly support the objective of
22 returning control of the Parking
23 Authority back to the City.

24 (Applause.)

25 MR. HUNTINGTON: But having

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 read the bill, which if you read it on
3 its face, merely -- I shouldn't say
4 merely -- transfers the functions of
5 parking enforcement from the Parking
6 Authority to the Streets Department. So
7 without this background, we were
8 concerned and felt we couldn't take a
9 position on this bill without further
10 information.

11 Specifically, we were concerned
12 about the mechanics of the transition.
13 The Parking Authority's 2017 report shows
14 it has 944 employees and revenues of 274
15 million. So we were concerned that this
16 bill, which on its face could in theory
17 create a situation where on Friday the
18 Parking Authority would be issuing
19 tickets and having full control of
20 parking enforcement on the City's streets
21 and then on Monday, if the bill went into
22 effect, the Streets Department would have
23 to assume those functions.

24 So it was our suggestion that
25 before the bill be enacted, that a study

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 be considered as to how to efficiently
3 make this transition.

4 In speaking with Councilman Oh,
5 I've learned that his suggestion is that
6 the bill be passed, basically held in
7 abeyance pending negotiations as to how
8 to effect the transition of moving
9 enforcement functions back to the Streets
10 Department.

11 Thank you.

12 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Okay.

13 Thank you for your testimony.

14 Is there anybody else here
15 to --

16 MR. BUSSIE: Can I testify?

17 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: --
18 testify?

19 MR. BUSSIE: Yeah. Can I
20 testify?

21 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Everybody
22 is allowed to testify.

23 (Witness approached witness
24 table.)

25 MR. BUSSIE: Thank you. Thank

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 you. Thank you. Thank you. Thank you.
3 My name is Emmanuel Bussie, for the
4 record.

5 I would like to testify on Bill
6 No. 160844. I'm going to keep my
7 comments extremely brief.

8 This is absolutely bullshit
9 that we're not taking back this
10 on-street -- this is absolutely bull crap
11 that we're not taking back -- that we're
12 not fighting to take back on-street
13 parking. There are some fights that you
14 have to fight irregardless of
15 consequence. Imma say that again. Even
16 if the Law Department disagrees that the
17 City has the right to control its
18 on-street parking, there are some fights
19 that we elect our elected officials to
20 fight for regardless of consequence.

21 You guys know that you guys
22 battle the Law Department and pass laws
23 all the time that the Law Department
24 doesn't recommend that you pass.

25 This, as evidenced by the

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 state, is a bill and a law that we should
3 be fighting irregardless of consequences.
4 Bring the bill to the floor so we can
5 have an appropriate discussion.

6 Where is the Parking Authority?
7 Where is the Chairman? Where is the Law
8 Department? Bring the bill to the floor
9 so we can have a full discussion so we
10 can have all the information and we can
11 discover whether or not this is a good
12 motion or not.

13 Imma say it and I'm just going
14 to leave it at this: You guys all know
15 that we've been fighting for control of
16 on-street parking forever. You guys
17 absolutely know that the control of our
18 City functions and the control of our
19 City revenues and assets such as the
20 Parking Authority should be controlled by
21 you, by City Council and the City of
22 Philadelphia.

23 It's absolutely bull crap that
24 we're going to have to delay it again.
25 And anybody that doesn't want to pass

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 this bill to bring back on-street control
3 of our parking functions to the City of
4 Philadelphia is BS'ing the citizens of
5 Philadelphia. We elect you guys to stand
6 up for us.

7 There is not one
8 constituency -- you can go in your own
9 neighborhoods. You won't find one
10 constituency saying, no, I don't want you
11 to fight for on-street parking. No,
12 since the Law Department said you can't
13 do it, I don't want you to fight for
14 that. There is no constituency for that.

15 We elect our elected officials
16 to stand the heck up for us, and we want
17 you to fight like hell to take back
18 control of on-street parking.

19 I thank you guys very much.

20 (Applause.)

21 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.

22 One second. It will be a
23 one-minute delay.

24 (Pause.)

25 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: I'm sorry.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 We are now going into a public -- that
3 will temporarily end our hearing and
4 we'll go into a public meeting.

5 I just want to say -- and I
6 apologize I had to step out for a few
7 minutes. We were just talking to our
8 counsel, who called me. And like I said,
9 I had all intentions to moving this
10 forward and moving forward with this vote
11 in positive, but after speaking to our
12 City Solicitor, he informed us that it
13 would put the City in grave danger of a
14 lawsuit from the state and some other
15 issues and, therefore, before we vote,
16 I'm just going to let you know that I
17 will be changing my mind to vote against
18 this statute -- against this legislation
19 as presented until we meet again with our
20 current Solicitor and do not want to put
21 us in any jeopardy.

22 Councilman Oh.

23 COUNCILMAN OH: Yes. Thank
24 you. So the Solicitor and the Law
25 Department have had this -- we tabled

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 this in February 2017. They have had
3 this, they have had this, and they have
4 had this. And they had the opportunity
5 to respond. They had the opportunity to
6 testify. They did not come here. If
7 they were here, I would have many
8 opportunities to break out the caselaw
9 and break it down for them in public, on
10 television, in every which way.

11 Their not being here, the issue
12 is that nothing will happen because we're
13 just voting it out of Committee. We
14 haven't even put it on the floor, so
15 nothing is at jeopardy. We move it from
16 this stage to the next stage.

17 I think it is a delay tactic
18 and, quite frankly, if we were to vote it
19 favorably in Council, which I have said
20 that I would hold the bill after it is --
21 if it gets a favorable vote, so that we
22 could talk with the Parking Authority and
23 try to see if we can come to an
24 agreement. What we really should have is
25 a contract. We should have a contract.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 It's our streets. It's our revenues. We
3 should contract with the Parking
4 Authority.

5 (Applause.)

6 COUNCILMAN OH: So I think that
7 the Law Department now calling in the
8 middle of a hearing instead of coming
9 publicly forward and testifying, it's a
10 private phone call, Mr. Chairman. It's
11 not anything anybody here heard. They
12 don't want to come down here and say
13 things publicly. I would say that why
14 don't we vote this out of Committee and
15 then there will be no problem with the
16 state, because we haven't taken it to the
17 floor. And by the way, if we did take it
18 to a vote, it's not a lawsuit by the
19 state. It's basically an injunction.
20 They would file to say that we don't have
21 the right. It doesn't interfere with any
22 function. It doesn't jeopardize any
23 money. All it does basically is allows
24 the court to look at this, if it gets
25 that far.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you,
3 Councilman. And I do want to say that we
4 do -- I think everybody here in the City
5 of Philadelphia wants to have on-street
6 parking back in City control, and how we
7 could do that, whether it's through a
8 contract or whether it's through
9 legislation, is something that we need
10 look at and I, like I said, came in full
11 conscience to do that and unfortunately
12 changed my mind.

13 I think we still need to
14 look -- and I will work with Councilman
15 Oh. Just as my vote, I will work with
16 Councilman Oh and the Parking Authority
17 to try to come up with something during
18 this process. This bill is not dead. It
19 stays alive in the Committee here. So
20 it's either we could hold it in Committee
21 or we could make a motion to move it out.

22 COUNCILMAN OH: I make a motion
23 to move it out.

24 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: We are in
25 a meeting. We are in a meeting and Bill

Committee on Streets and Services
May 2, 2019

Page 41

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 No. 160844 has been moved.

3 Is there a second?

4 COUNCILWOMAN SANCHEZ: Second.

5 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All in

6 favor?

7 (Aye.)

8 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All

9 opposed?

10 (No.)

11 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: We have a

12 draw on this at this time. The bill

13 stays in Committee. This is not the end

14 of it. We will now continue this

15 conversation and we will meet with the

16 Parking Authority and with the Solicitor

17 and everybody else who needs to do that

18 and I --

19 (Mr. Bussie talking without

20 microphone.)

21 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Listen,

22 listen --

23 (Mr. Bussie talking without

24 microphone.)

25 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: There is a

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 consequence if you move it out of
3 Committee because --

4 (Mr. Bussie talking without
5 microphone.)

6 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: I'll talk
7 to you after the hearing. I'll talk to
8 you after the meeting.

9 All right. We need to move on,
10 continue to go back into a public hearing
11 to hear our bills on Streets and
12 Services. So I would like to go back
13 into a public meeting, and for the
14 record, we have Councilman Oh, Councilman
15 Greenlee, Councilman Johnson,
16 Councilwoman Bass, and myself here
17 present for a public hearing.

18 Mr. McMonagle, please read the
19 title of the next bill.

20 THE CLERK: Bill No. 190121, an
21 ordinance authorizing the revision of
22 lines and grades on a portion of City
23 Plan No. 194 by striking from the City
24 Plan the southerly ten feet wide portion
25 of Berks Street from Howard Street to

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 Hope Street in order to conform more
3 closely with existing conditions, under
4 certain terms and conditions.

5 (Witnesses approached witness
6 table.)

7 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.

8 Either one could choose to
9 start and then proceed with your -- state
10 your name for the record and proceed with
11 your testimony.

12 MR. MORELLI: Good afternoon,
13 Councilman Squilla and members of the
14 Committee. My name is Frank Morelli,
15 Survey Bureau Manager for the Department
16 of Streets, and I would like to offer the
17 following testimony on Bill 190121.

18 This is not an Administration
19 ordinance, but an ordinance requested by
20 Mr. Hercules Grigos of Obermayer,
21 Rebmann, Maxwell and Hippell representing
22 Hope LLC.

23 The purpose of this proposed
24 ordinance is to authorize the striking
25 from the City Plan of the southerly ten

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 foot wide portion of Berks Street from
3 Howard Street to Hope Street. This
4 portion of Berks Street is not legally
5 open and has long been occupied by a
6 portion of the existing building sited on
7 the abutting property. This action will
8 revise the lines of Berks Street to
9 conform to the existing conditions.

10 The Department of Streets
11 supports this ordinance and recommends
12 favorable action to your Committee.

13 I will be happy to answer any
14 questions.

15 MS. CHIU: Good afternoon,
16 Chairman Squilla and members of Streets
17 and Services Committee. I'm Sarah Chiu,
18 City Planner with the Philadelphia City
19 Planning Commission. I'm here to testify
20 on Bill No. 190121 introduced by
21 Councilmember Sanchez on February 21st,
22 2019.

23 Bill No. 190121 will strike and
24 vacate from City Plan a ten feet wide
25 portion of Berks Street from Howard

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 Street to Hope Street. This action is to
3 have Berks Street's houseline and
4 curblane on City Plan to match its
5 existing conditions, which had existed
6 since 1870's. There will be no immediate
7 improvement to the property.

8 The City Planning Commission at
9 its meeting on March 19th, 2019
10 recommended Bill No. 190121 for approval.

11 This concludes my testimony. I
12 appreciate the opportunity to testify
13 before you today and would be pleased to
14 answer any questions you may have.

15 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.

16 Is there anyone else here to
17 testify on Bill No. -- are there any
18 questions?

19 (No response.)

20 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing
21 none, is there anyone else here to
22 testify on Bill No. 190121?

23 (No response.)

24 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing
25 none, thank you.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 Mr. McMonagle, please read the
3 title of the next bill.

4 THE CLERK: Bill No. 190210, an
5 ordinance authorizing Fox Television
6 Stations LLC, to install, own and
7 maintain planters at 330 Market Street,
8 Philadelphia, PA 19106, all under certain
9 terms and conditions.

10 (Witness approached witness
11 table.)

12 MR. RENFRO: Good morning -- or
13 good afternoon at this point, Chairman
14 Squilla and members of the Streets and
15 Services Committee. My name is
16 Christopher Renfro and I'm an Engineering
17 Supervisor with the Department of Streets
18 here to offer testimony on Bill No.
19 190210.

20 This bill authorizes Fox
21 Television Stations LLC as the owner to
22 install, own and maintain planters at 330
23 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19106,
24 all under certain terms and conditions.

25 Planters located on the South

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 Market Street footway along the property
3 frontage of 330 Market Street, as shown
4 on the plans, to be approved by the
5 Department of Streets, placed a minimum 1
6 foot 6 inches south of the South Market
7 Street curb and spaced a minimum 5 feet 0
8 inches clear of all other street
9 furniture. A minimum 9 foot 6 inches of
10 clear, passable sidewalk space is to
11 remain after installation.

12 The Department of Streets is
13 not opposed to this proposed sidewalk
14 cafe encroachment as the 9 foot 6 inches
15 of clear, passable sidewalk space to
16 remain after installation meets the
17 required Complete Streets walking zone
18 minimum width.

19 Thank you for your time. This
20 concludes my testimony. I'm pleased to
21 answer any questions that you may have.

22 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.

23 Are there any questions?

24 (No response.)

25 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 none, anyone else here to testify on Bill
3 No. 190210?

4 (No response.)

5 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing
6 none, thank you.

7 Mr. McMonagle, please read the
8 title of the next bill.

9 THE CLERK: Bill No. 190085, an
10 ordinance granting permission to a
11 licensed tour vehicle operator to
12 operate, on the west sidewalk of South
13 Independence Mall West (formerly Sixth
14 Street) between Ranstead and Chestnut
15 Streets, all under certain terms and
16 conditions.

17 (Witness approached witness
18 table.)

19 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.
20 Please proceed.

21 MS. DUCKETT: Good afternoon,
22 Mr. Chairman and members of the
23 Committee. Thank you for the opportunity
24 to appear before you today. My name is
25 Kisha Duckett, District Traffic Engineer

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 for the Department of Streets. I am here
3 today to offer testimony on Bill No.
4 190085, which was sponsored by Councilman
5 Squilla. This bill grants permission to
6 a licensed tour vehicle operator to
7 operate on the west sidewalk of South
8 Independence Mall West before Ranstead
9 and Chestnut Streets.

10 The Department of Streets has
11 no objections to this bill.

12 Thank you for the opportunity
13 to appear before you today.

14 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Please
15 proceed.

16 MR. RENFRO: The only thing I
17 would like to add to that is that this
18 bill authorizes a vehicle tour operator,
19 who is already duly licensed pursuant to
20 Section 9-407 of The Philadelphia Code.
21 This tour operator, located on the west
22 sidewalk of South Independence Mall West,
23 between Ranstead and Chestnut Street, the
24 location formerly operated by the Ride
25 the Ducks sightseeing tours, to use and

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 maintain an existing ticket booth kiosk
3 with utility connections, all under
4 certain terms and conditions.

5 The Department of Streets is
6 not opposed to this ordinance.

7 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.

8 Are there any questions?

9 (No response.)

10 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing
11 none, is there anyone else here to
12 testify on Bill No. 190085, as amended?

13 (No response.)

14 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing
15 none, Mr. McMonagle, please read the
16 title of the next bill.

17 THE CLERK: Bill No. 181046, an
18 ordinance revising parking regulations
19 for South Street, from 21st Street to
20 27th Street.

21 MS. DUCKETT: Good afternoon,
22 Mr. Chairman and members of the
23 Committee. Thank you for the opportunity
24 to appear today. My name is Kisha
25 Duckett, District Traffic Engineer for

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 the Department of Streets. I'm here
3 today to offer testimony on Bill No.
4 181046, which was introduced by
5 Councilman Johnson.

6 The Department of Streets has
7 no objection to this bill that
8 establishes a "no stopping any time
9 tow-away zone" parking regulation on
10 South Street from 21st to 27th Street,
11 south side only.

12 Thank you for the opportunity
13 to appear before you today.

14 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.

15 Are there any questions?

16 (No response.)

17 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing
18 none, is there anyone else here to
19 testify on Bill 181046?

20 (No response.)

21 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.

22 Mr. McMonagle, please read the
23 title of the next bill.

24 THE CLERK: Bill No. 190209, an
25 ordinance amending Section 9-205 of The

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 Philadelphia Code, entitled "Sidewalk
3 Sales," by prohibiting vending on City
4 Avenue between Haverford Avenue and 77th
5 Street, all under certain terms and
6 conditions.

7 (Witness approached witness
8 table.)

9 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.
10 Just state your name for the
11 record and proceed with your testimony.

12 MS. BALDWIN: Good afternoon,
13 Chairman Squilla and members of the
14 Committee on Streets and Services. My
15 name is Elizabeth Baldwin and I am the
16 Chief Code Official for the Department of
17 Licenses and Inspections. Today I am
18 here to provide testimony on Bill No.
19 190209, which, if enacted, will amend
20 Section 9-205 of The Philadelphia Code,
21 entitled "Sidewalk Sales."

22 This bill would prohibit
23 vending on City Avenue between Haverford
24 and 77th Street. The Department has no
25 objection to this bill and is prepared to

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 enforce.

3 Thank you for the opportunity
4 to provide testimony, and I'm happy to
5 answer any questions.

6 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you
7 for your testimony.

8 Any questions?

9 (No response.)

10 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing
11 none, is there anyone else here to
12 testify on Bill No. 190209?

13 (No response.)

14 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing
15 none, Mr. McMonagle, please read the
16 title of the next bill.

17 THE CLERK: Bill No. 190255, an
18 ordinance amending Section 9-205 of The
19 Philadelphia Code, relating to Sidewalk
20 Sales, by adding new provisions
21 prohibiting sidewalk sales in the Tenth
22 Councilmanic District and making other
23 conforming amendments, all under certain
24 terms and conditions.

25 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thanks.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 Betsy, please proceed.

3 MS. BALDWIN: Good afternoon,
4 Chairman Squilla and members of the
5 Committee on Streets and Services. My
6 name is Elizabeth Baldwin and I am the
7 Chief Code Official for the Department of
8 Licenses and Inspections. Today I am
9 here to provide testimony on Bill No.
10 190255 introduced by Councilman O'Neill,
11 which, if enacted, will amend Section
12 9-205 of The Philadelphia Code, entitled
13 "Sidewalk Sales."

14 This bill would prohibit
15 vending in the Tenth Councilmanic
16 District. The Department has no
17 objection to this bill and is prepared to
18 enforce its provisions shall it become
19 law.

20 Thank you for the opportunity
21 to provide the testimony, and I will be
22 happy to respond to any questions.

23 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.

24 Any questions?

25 (No response.)

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing
3 none, is there anyone else here to
4 testify on Bill No. 190255?

5 (No response.)

6 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you
7 for your testimony.

8 MS. BALDWIN: Thank you.

9 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA:
10 Mr. McMonagle, please read the title of
11 the next bill.

12 THE CLERK: Bill No. 181009, an
13 ordinance establishing no truck parking
14 and tow-away regulations on both sides of
15 Decatur Road from Red Lion Road to Comly
16 Road.

17 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Kisha,
18 please proceed.

19 MS. DUCKETT: Good afternoon,
20 Mr. Chairman and members of the
21 Committee. Thank you for the opportunity
22 to appear before you today. My name is
23 Kisha Duckett, District Traffic Engineer
24 for the Department of Streets. I'm here
25 today to offer testimony on Bill No.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 181009.

3 The regulation was posted on
4 January 18th, 2019 as a trial. To date,
5 we have not received any complaints or
6 concerns from citizens. As such, the
7 Department of Streets has no objections
8 to this bill.

9 Thank you for the opportunity
10 to appear before you today.

11 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you
12 for your testimony.

13 Any questions?

14 (No response.)

15 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing
16 none, is there anybody else here to
17 testify on Bill 181009?

18 (No response.)

19 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing
20 none, thank you.

21 Mr. McMonagle, please read the
22 title of the next bill.

23 THE CLERK: Bill No. 190103, an
24 ordinance establishing no truck parking
25 and tow-away regulations on both sides of

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 McNulty Road from Southampton Road to
3 Townsend Road.

4 MS. DUCKETT: Good afternoon.
5 My name is Kisha Duckett, District
6 Traffic Engineer for the Department of
7 Streets. I'm here today to offer
8 testimony on Bill 190103, which was
9 introduced by Councilman O'Neill.

10 The regulation was posted on
11 February 14th, 2019 as a trial. Since
12 that time, we have not received any
13 complaints or concerns from citizens. As
14 such, the Department of Streets has no
15 objection to this bill.

16 Thank you for the opportunity
17 to appear before you today.

18 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.

19 Any questions?

20 (No response.)

21 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing
22 none, anybody else here to testify on
23 Bill No. 190103?

24 (No response.)

25 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 none, Mr. McMonagle, please read the
3 title of the next bill.

4 THE CLERK: Bill No. 190104, an
5 ordinance establishing no truck parking
6 and tow-away regulations on Townsend
7 Road.

8 MS. DUCKETT: Good afternoon.
9 My name is Kisha Duckett, District
10 Traffic Engineer for the Department of
11 Streets. I am here today to offer
12 testimony on Bill No. 190104, which was
13 introduced by Councilman O'Neill.

14 This regulation was posted on
15 February 26th, 2019 as a trial. Since
16 that time, we have not received any
17 complaints or concerns from citizens. As
18 such, the Department has no objection to
19 this bill.

20 Thank you for the opportunity
21 to appear before you today.

22 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.
23 Any questions?
24 (No response.)

25 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 none, is there anyone else here to

3 testify on Bill No. 190104?

4 (No response.)

5 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing

6 none, Mr. McMonagle, please read the

7 title of the next bill.

8 THE CLERK: Bill No. 180950, an

9 ordinance amending Section 12-905 of The

10 Philadelphia Code, entitled "Permits for

11 Curb Loading Zones," to exempt businesses

12 on streets with designated bicycle lanes

13 from any fee for designation of a curb

14 loading zone, all under certain terms and

15 conditions.

16 (Witness approached witness

17 table.)

18 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.

19 Chris, you want to start with

20 your testimony.

21 DR. PUCHALSKY: Good morning,

22 Chairman Squilla and members of the

23 Streets and Services Committee. Thank

24 you for the opportunity to appear before

25 you today. My name is Christopher

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 Puchalsky, Director of Policy and
3 Strategic Initiatives at OTIS. I am here
4 today to offer testimony on Bill No.
5 180950.

6 Providing a high-quality bike
7 network is a strategic objective for OTIS
8 as listed in CONNECT: Philadelphia's
9 Strategic Transportation Plan. OTIS has
10 no objections to this bill. There will,
11 however, be revenue implications for both
12 the City and the School District. The
13 financial impact of these entities should
14 be monitored and revisited, perhaps with
15 a sunset provision.

16 I'd be happy to answer any
17 questions you have at this time.

18 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you
19 for your testimony.

20 Any questions?

21 (No response.)

22 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing
23 none, is there anyone else here to
24 testify on Bill 180950?

25 (No response.)

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing
3 none, Mr. McMonagle, please read the
4 title of the next bill.

5 THE CLERK: Bill No. 190105, an
6 ordinance establishing parking
7 regulations in the vicinity -- I'm sorry.

8 Bill No. 190105, an ordinance
9 establishing parking regulations in the
10 vicinity of: Ritner Street and South
11 12th Street; Camac Street and Moore
12 Street; South 11th Street and Tasker
13 Street; South 12th Street and Tasker
14 Street; Morris Street and South 9th
15 Street; Morris Street and South 6th
16 Street; Morris Street and South 11th
17 Street.

18 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.

19 There is, for the record,
20 nobody here to testify on this, but
21 supported by the Parking Authority and
22 submitted in writing for the record for
23 the Parking Authority with no opposition.

24 Anybody else here to testify on
25 Bill No. 190105?

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 (No response.)

3 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing
4 none, thank you.

5 Mr. McMonagle, please read the
6 title of the last bill.

7 THE CLERK: And Bill No.
8 190184, an ordinance adding a new Chapter
9 12-3400 of The Philadelphia Code,
10 entitled "Use of an Automated Speed
11 Enforcement System to Improve Safety on
12 Roosevelt Boulevard," to provide for the
13 use of automated cameras to determine
14 speeding violations on Roosevelt
15 Boulevard and to establish a system of
16 enforcement and administration; and
17 amending Section 12-2405 of The
18 Philadelphia Code, entitled "Removal and
19 Immobilization of Parked Vehicles;
20 Notice," to include among the violations
21 subject to boot and tow enforcement
22 delinquent violation notices under such
23 new Chapter 12-3400; all under certain
24 terms and conditions.

25 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 Before you start with your
3 testimony, I'd like to acknowledge
4 Councilwoman Parker.

5 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
6 you, Chairman Squilla and members of the
7 Streets and Services Committee. I just
8 wanted to start by thanking for the
9 record this bill's co-sponsors, which are
10 Council President Clarke, along with
11 Councilmember Bass and Councilmember
12 Maria Quinones-Sanchez.

13 Mr. Chairman, I just wanted to
14 briefly state that this bill simply
15 authorizes the installation of speed
16 cameras along Roosevelt Boulevard between
17 9th Street and the Philadelphia County
18 Line, which covers 11.75 miles. It's
19 part of the City and Mayor Kenney's
20 commitment to Vision Zero, which is a
21 strategy to reduce traffic-related deaths
22 to zero by 2030.

23 And also, Mr. Chairman, just
24 wanted to say a special thank you to
25 Dr. Puchalsky, my former colleague and

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 State Representative John Taylor, Corinne
3 O'Connor, Randy LoBasso -- if I just
4 screwed that up, charge it to my head and
5 not my heart -- and to Latanya Byrd, and
6 Jason Duckworth. Thank you all so very
7 much for being here to voice your
8 perspective relative to this legislation.

9 And, Mr. Chairman, thank you
10 for your time.

11 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you,
12 Councilwoman.

13 You want to proceed. State
14 your name for the record and then proceed
15 with your testimony.

16 DR. PUCHALSKY: Good afternoon,
17 Committee Chair Squilla and members of
18 the Council Streets and Services
19 Committee. I'm Christopher Puchalsky,
20 Director of Policy and Strategic
21 Initiatives at the Office of
22 Transportation, Infrastructure, and
23 Sustainability, known as OTIS. I'm
24 joined here today by Kasim Ali, Chief
25 Traffic Engineer for the City of

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 Philadelphia in the Streets Department.

3 I'm here to testify in support
4 of Bill No. 190184 introduced by
5 Councilmember Parker -- thank you --
6 which would add a new chapter to The
7 Philadelphia Code, Chapter 12-3400,
8 entitled "Use of an Automated Speed
9 Enforcement System to Improve Safety on
10 Roosevelt Boulevard." The bill would
11 enable the use of automated speed cameras
12 on Roosevelt Boulevard, which includes
13 six Council districts, by establishing a
14 system of enforcement and administration
15 to improve the safety of all people
16 traveling along and across the corridor.

17 We are very appreciative of the
18 Councilmembers from the six Council
19 offices - Clarke, Quinones-Sanchez, Bass,
20 Parker, Henon, and O'Neill, whose
21 districts include Roosevelt Boulevard -
22 for their partnership in this bill, and
23 thank you especially to Councilwoman
24 Parker for your leadership and
25 sponsoring. Your feedback and insightful

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 input shaped this legislation as a very
3 important safety program.

4 Every year in Philadelphia
5 there are over 10,000 reportable crashes.
6 These crashes result in around 100 lives
7 lost in Philadelphia streets every year
8 and nearly 250 people more are injured
9 severely. This is why Mayor Jim Kenney
10 adopted Vision Zero by executive order,
11 with one clear goal: Eliminate traffic
12 deaths on Philadelphia streets by 2030.

13 How do we get to zero? Speed
14 management. As humans, we are vulnerable
15 to speed. The higher speeds involved in
16 a crash, the more likely someone is to be
17 killed or seriously injured. And in a
18 city with people living, working, and
19 going to school by using our streets,
20 deadly rates of speeds are simply not
21 acceptable.

22 Vision Zero provides a
23 comprehensive framework to manage speeds
24 and end traffic deaths on our city
25 streets by focusing on equitable

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 implementation of engineering,
3 enforcement, education, and evaluation.

4 Roosevelt Boulevard is a Vision
5 Zero priority. If we are to reach our
6 goal of zero traffic deaths in
7 Philadelphia, we must bring meaningful
8 change to Roosevelt Boulevard. But let's
9 ground ourselves on what's happening
10 today along the 12 miles of the
11 Boulevard.

12 Between 2013 and 2017, there
13 were over 2,500 reportable crashes.
14 These crashes killed 62 people and
15 severely injured 77 more. Eighty-three
16 percent of these crashes were driver to
17 driver, and 65 percent were the result of
18 speeding and aggressive driving.

19 Enough is enough. That's why
20 the City is currently working on a
21 federally funded TIGER planning grant to
22 bring change to the Boulevard. This
23 program kicked off in 2016 with a
24 multi-year, multi-agency effort called
25 the "Roosevelt Boulevard Route for

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 Change" Program. We will need to bring
3 the E's of traffic safety - equitable
4 engineering, enforcement, education, and
5 evaluation - to reduce traffic deaths to
6 zero on Roosevelt Boulevard.

7 The planning phase of the Route
8 for Change Program is in its final year.
9 Over the past three years, we have been
10 working with communities along the
11 Boulevard to develop recommendations for
12 the 2025 engineering solutions and a 2040
13 vision to create a safe, reliable, and
14 accessible Roosevelt Boulevard for today
15 and for tomorrow.

16 While we know engineering
17 solutions are needed, it is not a
18 panacea. We need to bring enforcement
19 and education to bear on Roosevelt
20 Boulevard too.

21 On October 19th, 2018, Mayor
22 Jim Kenney joined Pennsylvania Secretary
23 of Transportation Leslie Richards to
24 announce Governor Wolf's signing of
25 historic legislation to allow a five-year

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 automated speed enforcement pilot along
3 Roosevelt Boulevard.

4 Today we are taking the next
5 important step by joining our leaders in
6 City Council to support safety on
7 Roosevelt Boulevard with Bill No. 190184.

8 According to the Insurance
9 Institute for Highway Safety, as of April
10 2019, 15 states and 140 municipalities
11 across the United States have implemented
12 automated speed enforcement devices in
13 school zones and along injury networks.
14 In the automated speed enforcement
15 program's first four years in New York
16 measured a 63 percent reduction in
17 speeding and a 55 percent reduction in
18 fatal crashes at fixed speed camera
19 locations.

20 Automated speed enforcement
21 saves lives. The use of automated speed
22 enforcement is also common in Europe and
23 Australia. A systematic review of speed
24 camera effectiveness reported a 14 to 65
25 percent reduction in driver speeding more

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 than 10 miles above the posted speed
3 limit and a 11 to 44 percent reduction in
4 crashes involving fatalities and serious
5 injuries near camera sites.

6 The automated speed enforcement
7 pilot program on Roosevelt Boulevard will
8 be accompanied by strong educational
9 messages as well as a generous 60-day
10 driver warning period, ensuring the pilot
11 is fair, balanced, and transparent. We
12 look forward to continuing our work with
13 the Philadelphia Parking Authority as
14 program administrators and the
15 Pennsylvania Department of Transportation
16 on effective program communication,
17 sharing the message that this pilot
18 program is not about issuing tickets, but
19 about changing behavior to preserve human
20 life.

21 Thank you for the opportunity
22 to testify and provide information to
23 support our position on automated speed
24 enforcement on Roosevelt Boulevard. It
25 is an effective way to increase safety by

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 changing driver behavior in a simple
3 lifesaving way, by managing driver
4 speeds. We share the common concerns
5 that when 13 percent of the City's
6 traffic deaths occur on just 12 miles of
7 Roosevelt Boulevard, more effective tools
8 are needed to manage driver speeds and
9 save lives.

10 Thank you, and Mr. Ali and I
11 are happy to answer questions at this
12 time.

13 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you
14 for your thorough testimony. And Vision
15 Zero is a big deal, and looking forward
16 to continuing working towards that goal.
17 Safe streets are important for everyone,
18 no matter what mode of transportation or
19 pedestrian that you are. So thank you so
20 much.

21 Are there any questions?

22 (No response.)

23 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing
24 none, I know we have some other folks to
25 testify. Whoever is testifying, can you

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 raise your hand.

3 All right. Come on up.

4 (Witnesses approached witness
5 table.)

6 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Is there
7 anybody else to testify after these
8 three?

9 (No response.)

10 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Okay.
11 Great.

12 Randy, if you want to start,
13 and we'll work our way across. Just
14 state your name for the record and then
15 proceed with your testimony.

16 MR. LoBASSO: My name is Randy
17 LoBasso with the Bicycle Coalition of
18 Greater Philadelphia.

19 The Bicycle Coalition of
20 Greater Philadelphia and the broader
21 Vision Zero Alliance, which is a group
22 consisting of 30 organizations, including
23 AAA, AARP, the Clean Air Council, private
24 citizens, and civic associations, support
25 the introduction of an automated

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 enforcement pilot along Roosevelt
3 Boulevard and thank Councilwoman Parker,
4 Mayor Jim Kenney, and the Office of
5 Transportation, Infrastructure, and
6 Sustainability, and former State
7 Representative John Taylor for their
8 unique leadership on this issue.

9 Automated enforcement,
10 including red light cameras and speed
11 cameras, is a large part of
12 Philadelphia's Vision Zero Action Plan,
13 and for good reason. These tools have
14 been shown to reduce crashes involving
15 all modes of traffic wherever they've
16 been installed and put to use. Automated
17 enforcement also reduces potential
18 negative interactions between police and
19 citizens.

20 This is especially important
21 for Roosevelt Boulevard. Often called
22 the Boulevard of Death, Roosevelt
23 Boulevard regularly takes more lives of
24 Philadelphians than any other street in
25 the City of Philadelphia. A lot of that

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 has to do with how it's been designed
3 compared to how it's used today, and the
4 City's Route for Change Program will
5 hopefully help fix those design problems
6 in the future.

7 Right now, however, we know
8 that the vast majority of deaths and
9 serious injuries along the Boulevard are
10 happening because of high speeds.

11 Although the Boulevard makes up
12 just 0.6 percent of Philadelphia's
13 streets, it's generally about 6 percent
14 of all reported crashes and 13 percent of
15 all traffic fatalities. In 2018,
16 Roosevelt Boulevard actually accounted
17 for 20 percent of all traffic fatalities,
18 double what it's generally been over the
19 last decade. For whatever reasons,
20 Roosevelt Boulevard is actually getting
21 worse.

22 And that's why the Vision Zero
23 Alliance has been working for two years
24 to get this bill passed, first in the
25 Pennsylvania Legislature and now in City

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 Council.

3 People have often asked me why
4 the Bicycle Coalition of Greater
5 Philadelphia would be so involved in this
6 effort, and I assure you it's not because
7 we think people should ride their
8 bicycles along the 40- to
9 80-mile-per-hour traffic along the road.
10 Rather, it's because of our much larger
11 push for Vision Zero in Philadelphia.

12 Bicyclists are not going to be
13 safe until pedestrians are safe and
14 drivers are safe too. That's why we've
15 worked to mark the location of every
16 single pedestrian fatality in every
17 single Philadelphia neighborhood over the
18 last two years, the same way our group
19 has done with ghost bikes you often see
20 around town.

21 We know this legislation, if
22 made into law, will help keep bicyclists,
23 pedestrians, and drivers safer. We know
24 this because everywhere it's been tried,
25 it's worked.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 The Institute for Highway
3 Safety has studied this for many years
4 and conducted a deep study of automated
5 enforcement in Montgomery County,
6 Maryland. There, cameras have reduced by
7 59 percent the likelihood of a driver
8 exceeding the speed limit by more than 10
9 miles an hour compared with similar roads
10 in two nearby Virginia counties without
11 cameras. The camera program there also
12 reduced the likelihood of fatal or
13 serious injury by 39 percent on
14 residential roads and 19 percent overall.

15 Around the country, we've seen
16 similar statistics. Chicago saw a 31
17 percent decline in speeding vehicles
18 after the implementation of automated
19 enforcement. Washington, DC actually
20 reported a 70 percent reduction in
21 fatalities after these were implemented
22 there. And there's been a 53 percent
23 reduction in fatalities since Portland
24 introduced the program, Portland, Oregon,
25 that is.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 Moreover, around the country,
3 few people are being cited more than
4 once. There was a 60 to 80 percent
5 reduction in violators within six months
6 of camera deployments in DC, and in
7 Seattle 90 percent of offenders never
8 received a second violation.

9 Lastly, from a social justice
10 standpoint, the Bicycle Coalition
11 supports the implementation of automated
12 enforcement over police enforcement. We
13 all watch the news here and we all know
14 how some police can profile drivers. We
15 know how those interactions can go
16 downhill shortly after that police stop
17 begins.

18 Automated enforcement gets rid
19 of that interaction altogether, and it
20 has the ability to change behavior, which
21 is badly needed on Philadelphia's
22 Boulevard of Death.

23 Thanks for taking my testimony,
24 and I am free to answer any questions you
25 have after everyone has finished

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 speaking.

3 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.
4 Just state your name and then
5 proceed with your testimony.

6 MR. DUCKWORTH: My name is
7 Jason Duckworth. I'm a resident of
8 Philadelphia at 2120 Race Street. I also
9 serve as President of the Delaware Valley
10 Smart Growth Alliance. The Delaware
11 Valley Smart Growth Alliance is a
12 progressive group that favors progressive
13 land use and transportation policies, and
14 we are actively involved with the Vision
15 Zero Alliance.

16 I'm here to testify strongly in
17 favor of the ordinance before you. I've
18 been involved going back to when Senator
19 Mike Stack had originally proposed
20 legislation for speed cameras on
21 Roosevelt Boulevard, which was more than
22 four years ago. This has been a very,
23 very long effort in Harrisburg, and we're
24 delighted to be at this moment where the
25 technology will actually begin to be

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 implemented on Roosevelt Boulevard.

3 I want to just stress a couple
4 things. First is, the scientific
5 evidence behind the efficacy of this
6 technology is beyond dispute. Randy
7 LoBasso mentioned research by the
8 Insurance Institute for Highway Safety.
9 Cities throughout the United States and
10 throughout the globe have successfully
11 implemented this technology. So we
12 should be fully confident that there are
13 safety benefits from what we are
14 proceeding to do.

15 I am in favor of the
16 legislation. I do want to stress three
17 things, additional things, that I think
18 should be considered perhaps before final
19 passage of this ordinance.

20 The first is that the fines for
21 violating speed cameras should be in the
22 spirit of behavior change, not
23 punishment. We are trying to get
24 motorists to change their behavior which
25 has now become normalized. There is a

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 culture of aggressive driving in this
3 city, and when we turn on these cameras
4 and the tickets are issued, it will be a
5 dramatic change from what is the norm
6 today on the Boulevard where people can
7 flout the law without consequence.

8 Therefore, though I am a cyclist in this
9 city and I walk to work, I want us to
10 take a longer view and not be quite as
11 harsh as we may feel compelled to be when
12 we are outraged by the egregious driving
13 of speeding motorists.

14 For example, we have in the
15 current draft of the bill, there's a
16 60-day warning period where somebody who
17 violates the ordinance will simply be
18 given a warning notice. In the City of
19 Chicago, their technology works where the
20 first violation even beyond 60 days does
21 not result in a citation. It results in
22 a warning notice. I think that's
23 something that we should consider as
24 well.

25 Secondly, \$100 is the lowest

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 level of fine in the current ordinance.
3 I would argue that a \$50 fine, which is
4 the fine that is now in place in New York
5 City and Washington, DC, may be more
6 appropriate. \$100 is a very steep fine
7 for people of lesser means. I also think
8 that the message of behavior change is
9 adequately delivered by a \$50 fine.

10 Secondly, I would just like to
11 stress that we need to have a robust
12 communication strategy around this
13 technology. There are people who are
14 actively against automated enforcement
15 technologies, and the narrative that is
16 peddled by these folks is that automated
17 enforcement is about revenue generation.
18 I hope that the City and/or the PPA has a
19 strong communications plan in place so
20 that the safety benefits are what are
21 touted and are first and foremost in
22 citizens' minds.

23 Finally, I would just like to
24 say that we need to make sure that we are
25 collecting data on this pilot program.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 We need baseline data around how
3 motorists currently drive on the
4 Boulevard, and we need to carefully
5 measure the reductions in speeding and
6 the reductions in crashes on the
7 Boulevard after its implementation. Only
8 with careful research will we be able to
9 demonstrate the safety benefits.

10 In conclusion, I just want to
11 thank the Councilwoman who is sponsoring
12 this ordinance. I think this is a great
13 day for Philadelphia.

14 Thank you for hearing my
15 testimony.

16 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you
17 for your testimony.

18 Please state your name for the
19 record and proceed, and then we'll go to
20 one more person testifying.

21 MS. BYRD: Hello. My name is
22 Latanya Byrd and I am here today -- I'm
23 happy to be here today. It was a long
24 journey to get here to have you guys
25 listen to why we really need to have the

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 speed cameras on the Roosevelt Boulevard.

3 I am the aunt of four precious

4 souls who lost their lives on the

5 Roosevelt Boulevard on July 16th, 2013.

6 I lost my niece Samara Banks. She was my

7 first niece in the family. We lost her

8 three sons, Saamir, Saadeem, and Saasean.

9 Samara was a young mother who

10 cherished her kids. She loved working

11 with children. Samara's spirit was like,

12 you know, when you seen her, you just --

13 it was like you just had a breath of

14 fresh air. She always was a pleasant

15 person. She was just full of life, you

16 know. She wasn't a person just sat home

17 and watched her kids, you know. She

18 always had activities and things planned

19 for her whole family.

20 We just celebrated my mom's

21 birthday on April 29th and my mom just

22 turned 69, and we were all talking about

23 the 60th birthday party that Samara had

24 gotten all of her cousins to get together

25 and throw for her. So when we were

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 there, she was like, you know, I thought
3 I was going to celebrate my 70th
4 birthday. And we said, no. We said,
5 every day is precious. Every day.

6 We lost -- my mom lost two
7 generations that night, and she just
8 wanted to know why. Our family always
9 wanted to know why, and I always told
10 them that they didn't die in vain. And
11 all of these other people on the
12 Roosevelt Boulevard did not die in vain.

13 We all listen to the news. I
14 know you all were doing this this weekend
15 and this week. There's been a lot more.
16 I think two more people died. Probably
17 more than that. And it's not just on the
18 Roosevelt Boulevard. So this is a good
19 start for Philadelphia.

20 Over the past two years, I've
21 traveled to Harrisburg with the Bicycle
22 Coalition of Greater Philadelphia, the
23 Philadelphia Vision Zero Alliance to meet
24 constituents on both sides of the aisle,
25 telling my story, asking for better

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 safety measures along the Roosevelt
3 Boulevard.

4 I wrote letters. I made phone
5 calls in support of a bill that would
6 legalize speed cameras along this
7 Roosevelt Boulevard. And when I wrote
8 those letters, believe me -- you know, I
9 know nowadays everybody likes to type and
10 everything is technology, but I took my
11 time, found some pretty paper, and
12 handwrote every single letter. And I put
13 this picture in there so that they can
14 see the family that we lost, because
15 these are real people, not just a name, a
16 number, you know. They're real. And my
17 nephew today, he lost his mother and his
18 three brothers. He's seen everything.
19 He hasn't talked about it yet to none of
20 us. The therapists, they say that he's
21 progressing, but it's hard for him. It's
22 hard for him to even come and visit when
23 we have family functions. His mother is
24 gone and his three brothers are gone.

25 My travels during that time was

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 well worth it. The law to put speed
3 cameras along the Boulevard was passed
4 last year, a testament to both the work
5 of ordinary citizens like me. We can
6 accomplish things with hard work,
7 dedication, and working together. The
8 bill was passed to prevent more people
9 from dying. The main word there is
10 "more," you know. I've lost my family
11 already. I don't want to see any other
12 family go through what my family has gone
13 through. And, yes, it's six years later,
14 but it's so hard, every holiday.
15 Mother's Day is coming up. That's going
16 to be a hard day for all of us, you know.

17 I'm the oldest of five sisters,
18 so we're all moms, you know. We look
19 around and we see somebody missing, you
20 know, they're missing, and it hurts.

21 During the Vision Zero
22 conference last year, I heard stories
23 from other families around the country
24 who lost their loved ones to deaths,
25 crash -- well, it's crash fatalities on

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 different roads, and it was really hard
3 for all of us to sit there and tell our
4 stories, but we thought about it and I
5 looked around, I said -- I was just
6 looking at everyone and I said, you know
7 what, I don't think I ever would have
8 crossed your paths. It just didn't seem
9 like it. But there we were sitting at a
10 table together, and that's when we
11 decided that it doesn't matter how old
12 you are. Life is short. You know, we
13 need to do something today. We don't
14 know why our families, our loved ones,
15 were taken, but there's something we can
16 do to help everyone else.

17 So Families for Safe Streets of
18 Greater Philadelphia, we decided to form
19 a chapter here, and it's new. We're just
20 starting. It seems a little bit
21 overwhelming when I hear the news and I
22 hear about how many people are dying from
23 all these other crashes in the City, and
24 I'm just thanking -- and it's really
25 hard, and I really -- this is from my

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 heart. When I hear it, I just -- you
3 know, I get choked, and I just don't know
4 what to do. I'm like how do we reach all
5 of these people? How? How do we do
6 that?

7 We want our group to provide
8 solace to these loved ones, and we want
9 the opportunity to work together for
10 better outcomes.

11 Vision Zero, it's like vision.
12 We want you guys to vision zero deaths in
13 our immediate future.

14 Our goal is to support and
15 advocate for legislation for safer
16 streets for pedestrians, cyclists, and
17 drivers. On behalf of Families for Safe
18 Streets of Greater Philadelphia, I am
19 here today asking you to continue
20 providing the citizens of Philadelphia as
21 a whole more tools to keep our
22 pedestrians, cyclists, and drivers safe
23 going forward.

24 And I just wanted to say one
25 thing. My nephew -- he's Samara's

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 youngest brother. I lost my sister.
3 They lost their mom years ago, and Samara
4 took over. So for them, it's like they
5 lost a second mom. And he put something
6 up today, and it's really -- he put
7 something up on Instagram today, and it's
8 just something to think about. It may
9 sound crazy to some people, but he said
10 what if we all are in heaven today and
11 when we die, we go to earth? Think about
12 it. All the decisions we make today, how
13 do they affect all of us?

14 Thank you.

15 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you
16 so much for your heartfelt testimony.

17 Councilwoman Bass.

18 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: I just
19 wanted to thank you also for your
20 testimony and for being here today. And
21 I remember hearing the story about your
22 niece and your nephews and the move that,
23 as you said, two generations gone just
24 like that. And so I just really wanted
25 to extend my condolences.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 I'm hopeful that the City of
3 Philadelphia will do more for traffic
4 safety. I've been at lights where the
5 light goes from red to green and it's
6 within like a millisecond and people are
7 already beeping, hurry up, hurry up,
8 hurry up. We drive too fast in this
9 town. We drive too recklessly in this
10 town.

11 I've been hit twice, once by
12 someone who was probably not paying
13 attention behind the wheel, just slid
14 into the back of my car on a rainy day,
15 and someone who was intoxicated, drove
16 into me and really could have killed me
17 and my daughter in the car.

18 So I just say all that to say
19 that I feel your pain. I don't know your
20 pain, but I feel your pain, and whatever
21 we can do to make our city streets safer,
22 we have to do it, as much traffic calming
23 as we can do, bike lanes, things that
24 will slow people down. There is no
25 hurry.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 Whenever someone rides by me in
3 a hurry, I say, oh, they must be an
4 emergency room doctor rushing to the
5 hospital to save somebody's life. That
6 must be the emergency, because otherwise
7 there's no reason for the reckless
8 driving that you see in the City of
9 Philadelphia.

10 So I just really wanted to
11 express that, and condolences again to
12 you and your family.

13 MS. BYRD: Thank you.

14 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you
15 all for your testimony.

16 I know we have one more special
17 guest here to testify, honor to recognize
18 State Representative Taylor and welcome
19 him to the City Council Chambers.

20 State Representative, state
21 your name for the record and then proceed
22 with your testimony. Welcome.

23 REPRESENTATIVE TAYLOR: My name
24 is John J. Taylor, private citizen
25 actually. Good afternoon, Mr. Chairman.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 I hope you're having a good day. I see
3 this is just one of many procedures
4 you're going through. But also to
5 members of the Committee - Councilwoman
6 Bass, Councilman Oh, Councilman Greenlee,
7 and the prime sponsor of this legislation
8 and my former colleague, Councilwoman
9 Parker.

10 Any time we consider any
11 legislation, whether it's the state or
12 the Philly level, the local level, we ask
13 ourselves why do we need it, and the
14 prior testimony and from folks with us,
15 Latanya or Jason or everybody behind me
16 and Sarah that we spent so many hours and
17 days with over the past four years,
18 they're the types of stories that lead us
19 to the conclusion that we need speed
20 cameras in the City of Philadelphia.

21 I provided written testimony
22 that I'm not necessarily going to follow,
23 as well as a bill analysis to a bill that
24 we passed that can be broader than what
25 you want to do, but it's the parameters

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 within which you need to pass this. But
3 I'm certainly here in support of
4 Ordinance 190184.

5 September 16th, 2016 we used
6 your wonderful Chambers here in a House
7 Transportation Committee and heard
8 testimony from the citizens of
9 Philadelphia. We heard statistical
10 analysis from Captain Healy, Councilman
11 Taubenberger, which really lay out the
12 need. You don't have to go far when you
13 hear the number of crashes that occurred
14 over the past ten years on Roosevelt
15 Boulevard, but one that stands with me
16 pretty vividly is that Roosevelt
17 Boulevard from 9th Street to Bucks County
18 comprises less than one percent of all
19 the roadways in Philadelphia, yet it
20 accounts for almost just short of 20
21 percent of all the fatalities. We're not
22 talking about crashes or rear-end
23 collisions. We're talking about
24 fatalities.

25 Sort of personal to me in some

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 respects, my wife and I live about 300
3 yards from Roosevelt Boulevard. We hear
4 the police sirens. We hear the fire
5 engines. We hear the media helicopters
6 hovering above fatal accident scenes, and
7 it's something that has to stop. And I
8 think that finally this ordinance is the
9 way to do it.

10 This is not a new concept, from
11 our point of view. So as Councilmembers,
12 you can rest assured that this idea has
13 been fully vetted. This started as early
14 back as 2007 with then-Representative
15 George Kenney. It continued with Senator
16 Stack years ago, and I picked this up in
17 the term before last. So it's had
18 various numbers of the bills. It was
19 finally passed as Senate Bill 172. We
20 incorporated the speed camera on
21 Roosevelt Boulevard concept into work
22 zone safety.

23 But, again, you can hear all
24 the statistics, but when you hear
25 Latanya, it's hard to hear that story and

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.
2 still remember that speed was the only
3 reason, certainly recklessness as a
4 result of the speed, but that was the
5 reason that that family was killed. And
6 if we can try to prevent that, I think we
7 should.

8 And I guess any good advocate
9 for any legislation would also talk about
10 the criticism of the bill, and they are
11 twofold. One is that this is big
12 brother, this is government overseeing
13 things that they shouldn't be overseeing.
14 And if we can defeat that argument in the
15 Pennsylvania Legislature, we should be
16 able to defeat that argument in the City
17 Council Chambers.

18 I had to hear from members that
19 always talked about freedom and liberty
20 and being free from cameras, whether it
21 be speed or red light, and my argument
22 is, when they come to Philadelphia as
23 well as all Philadelphia residents, I
24 want them to be free from the fear of
25 dying on our roads.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 The other is -- you're going to
3 hear this as you proceed with this, that
4 this is just a revenue-generating bill.
5 The revenue, as you know, does not come
6 to City Council. It goes into the
7 statewide fund. And it's my hope, and
8 I'm sure everybody that testified and I'm
9 sure you agree, that it's our hope that
10 the net revenue of this process is zero
11 and, that is, that people will comply,
12 people will slow down, there won't be
13 tickets.

14 I can assure you that the first
15 couple months of this people will be
16 agitated, but I can speak personally, I'm
17 on that Boulevard all the time. I need
18 to slow down. Everyone needs to slow
19 down and become less distracted. But I
20 think that at the end of the day, the
21 passage of this legislation does one
22 simple thing, and that's saves lives. I
23 urge you to pass this and be another
24 positive step for safety in Philadelphia.

25 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: John,
3 thank you so much for your testimony,
4 taking the time to come here, and it
5 really speaks greatly to your mission as
6 an elected official that now that you're
7 a private citizen, you're still out there
8 trying to help people. So we really
9 appreciate that, and it's a model that we
10 should all hopefully follow when we're
11 done. But thank you for your testimony.

12 Any questions?

13 Councilman Greenlee.

14 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Mr.
15 Chairman, I just hope I can go to
16 Mr. Taylor and ask for tips on how to be
17 a good private citizen after this year
18 since I won't be here. I'll be one of
19 those.

20 REPRESENTATIVE TAYLOR: Well,
21 you'll notice, Councilman, that your
22 blood pressure will drastically drop,
23 you're a much happier person, and you can
24 pay a little more attention to your
25 private life than you have been.

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank
3 you.

4 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you
5 so much. Thank you.

6 Is there anybody else here to
7 testify on Bill 190184?

8 (No response.)

9 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seeing
10 none, that would end our session, our
11 hearing. We will go into a public
12 meeting.

13 I'd like to recognize
14 Councilman Greenlee.

15 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank
16 you, Mr. Chairman. First, I move the
17 adoption of the amendment that's been
18 distributed to Bill No. 190085.

19 (Duly seconded.)

20 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: The
21 amendment to Bill No. 190085 has been
22 moved and seconded.

23 All in favor?

24 (Aye.)

25 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Any

Committee on Streets and Services
May 2, 2019

Page 99

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 opposed?

3 (No response.)

4 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: The ayes
5 have it. The amendment has passed.

6 Councilman Greenlee.

7 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank
8 you, Mr. Chairman. I move that the
9 following bills be reported out of this
10 Committee with a favorable recommendation
11 and that the rules of Council be
12 suspended to allow for their first
13 reading at our next session of Council:
14 Bill Nos. 190105, 190121, 190210, 190085
15 as amended, 181046, 190209, 190255,
16 181009, 190103, 190104, 180950, and
17 190184.

18 (Duly seconded.)

19 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All bills
20 moved and seconded.

21 All in favor?

22 (Aye.)

23 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Any
24 opposed?

25 (No response.)

Committee on Streets and Services
May 2, 2019

Page 100

1 5/2/19 - STREETS - BILL 160844, ETC.

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: The ayes
3 have it. All bills read into the record,
4 with Bill No. 190085 as amended, with a
5 suspension of the rules to be read at our
6 next session of Council.

7 That will end our meeting.

8 Thank you so much. Have a
9 great day.

10 (Committee on Streets and
11 Services concluded at 2:58 p.m.)

12 - - -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the
proceedings, evidence and objections are
contained fully and accurately in the
stenographic notes taken by me upon the
foregoing matter, and that this is a true and
correct transcript of same.

MICHELE L. MURPHY
RPR-Notary Public

(The foregoing certification of this
transcript does not apply to any reproduction
of the same by any means, unless under the
direct control and/or supervision of the
certifying reporter.)

Committee on Streets and Services
May 2, 2019

Page 1

A	action 15:24 17:3 44:7 44:12 45:2 73:12 actively 78:14 81:14 activities 83:18 acts 15:20 add 7:16 49:17 65:6 adding 53:20 62:8 addition 27:5 28:13 additional 12:17 13:6 18:10 79:17 address 3:17 addressed 3:24 adequate 17:19 20:17 adequately 19:10 81:9 administer 16:13,20 19:23 administeri... 4:10,22 16:21 administrat... 5:2,3 13:4 15:19 25:2 30:18 43:18 62:16 65:14 Administra... 4:25 administrat... 70:14 adopted 23:19 66:10 adoption 98:17 advises 14:5 88:15 95:8 advocated 29:19 affairs 5:12 6:7 affect 89:13 affirmed	10:17 11:13 afternoon 2:3 31:6 43:12 44:15 46:13 48:21 50:21 52:12 54:3 55:19 57:4 58:8 64:16 91:25 agency 27:18 29:4 aggressive 67:18 80:2 agitated 96:16 agitating 27:17 ago 78:22 89:3 94:16 agree 96:9 agreement 13:7,10 14:6 16:10 16:24 38:24 air 72:23 83:14 aisle 84:24 Ali 64:24 71:10 alive 40:19 Alliance 72:21 74:23 78:10,11,15 84:23 allow 68:25 99:12 allowed 33:22 allowing 21:14 allows 22:4 39:23 alter 9:14 altering 6:13 altogether 77:19 amend 52:19 54:11 amended 9:7 10:9,22 50:12 99:15 100:4 amending 51:25 53:18	59:9 62:17 amendment 14:16 23:14 98:17,21 99:5 amendments 8:3,12 9:3,9 9:13,23 10:2,5 53:23 analysis 92:23 93:10 and/or 81:18 101:23 Andrew 30:2 announce 68:24 annual 7:13 13:17 26:25 annually 18:15 answer 44:13 45:14 47:21 53:5 60:16 71:11 77:24 anti-Catholic 22:20 anybody 2:22 33:14 35:25 39:11 56:16 57:22 61:24 72:7 98:6 apologize 37:6 appeal 10:25 appealed 10:14 appeals 24:6 appear 48:24 49:13 50:24 51:13 55:22 56:10 57:17 58:21 59:24 appears 19:7 applauds 30:9 Applause 3:9 25:8 29:23 31:2,24 36:20 39:5 applicable 15:14 apply 101:21	appoint 7:3 appointed 8:3 appreciate 45:12 97:9 appreciative 65:17 approached 33:23 43:5 46:10 48:17 52:7 59:16 72:4 appropriate 35:5 81:6 approval 45:10 approved 2:14 47:4 April 21:9 30:3 31:12 69:9 83:21 argue 81:3 argument 95:14,16,21 arguments 3:23 9:9 Article 5:9,21 5:23 6:4 10:21 11:19 12:11 20:10 20:25 21:11 21:17,24 23:7,16,20 23:21,21,22 23:23,23,25 24:4,8,12 articulated 20:16 asked 75:3 asking 27:5 84:25 88:19 aspects 15:7 asphalt 25:2 Assembly 5:7 5:10,14 6:6 6:8,19 11:23 12:4 12:15,16 13:15 16:16 16:24 18:12 20:11 23:18 assets 35:19 associations 72:24	assume 25:10 32:23 assure 75:6 96:14 assured 94:12 attempted 15:21 attendance 28:16 attended 27:15 attention 90:13 97:24 audit 27:12 Auditor 27:13 29:5 aunt 83:3 Australia 69:23 authority 2:18 3:15 4:15,20,21 4:24 6:11 6:14 7:4,6 7:10,18,20 9:18 10:10 11:10 12:7 12:12,16,20 13:2,8,11 13:18 14:8 15:9,11,16 15:21 16:11 16:12,19 17:2,11,15 17:18 18:7 18:14,20 19:6,21,23 19:25 20:7 22:2 25:19 27:3,7,12 27:25 28:4 28:16,24 29:3,15,25 30:12,13,19 30:24 31:23 32:6,18 35:6,20 38:22 39:4 40:16 41:16 61:21,23 70:13 Authority's 6:15 13:4	19:3 29:17 32:13 authorize 43:24 authorized 18:11 authorizes 46:20 49:18 63:15 authorizing 2:17 42:21 46:5 automated 62:10,13 65:8,11 69:2,12,14 69:20,21 70:6,23 72:25 73:9 73:16 76:4 76:18 77:11 77:18 81:14 81:16 Avenue 52:4 52:4,23 Aye 41:7 98:24 99:22 ayes 99:4 100:2	42:16 63:11 65:19 89:17 89:18 92:6 battle 34:22 bear 3:21 68:19 beeping 90:7 began 20:7 begins 77:17 behalf 31:7 88:17 behavior 70:19 71:2 77:20 79:22 79:24 81:8 believe 85:8 believes 25:24 Bench 8:21 benefits 79:13 81:20 82:9 Berks 42:25 44:2,4,8,25 45:3 best 30:15 Betsy 54:2 better 84:25 88:10 beyond 79:6 80:20 bicycle 59:12 72:17,19 75:4 77:10 84:21 bicycles 75:8 bicyclists 75:12,22 big 71:15 95:11 bike 60:6 90:23 bikes 75:19 bill 2:1,12,13 2:22 3:1,7 4:1,9,13,15 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 10:6 11:1 11:10 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1
B	back 3:7 4:17 4:21 17:12 24:16 25:11 31:23 33:9 34:9,11,12 36:2,17 40:6 42:10 42:12 78:18 90:14 94:14 background 31:10 32:7 badly 77:21 balanced 70:11 Baldwin 52:12,15 54:3,6 55:8 Banks 83:6 baseline 82:2 basically 33:6 39:19,23 basis 9:21 Bass 1:10						

Committee on Streets and Services
May 2, 2019

Page 2

19:1 20:1,9 20:21 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1,15 25:1,17,24 25:24 26:1 26:12,20 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 30:10 31:1 31:15,16 32:1,2,9,16 32:21,25 33:1,6 34:1 34:5 35:1,2 35:4,8 36:1 36:2 37:1 38:1,20 39:1 40:1 40:18,25 41:1,12 42:1,19,20 43:1,17 44:1,20,23 45:1,10,17 45:22 46:1 46:3,4,18 46:20 47:1 48:1,2,8,9 49:1,3,5,11 49:18 50:1 50:12,16,17 51:1,3,7,19 51:23,24 52:1,18,22 52:25 53:1 53:12,16,17 54:1,9,14 54:17 55:1 55:4,11,12 55:25 56:1 56:8,17,22 56:23 57:1 57:8,15,23 58:1,3,4,12 58:19 59:1 59:3,7,8 60:1,4,10 60:24 61:1 61:4,5,8,25 62:1,6,7 63:1,14 64:1 65:1,4	65:10,22 66:1 67:1 68:1 69:1,7 70:1 71:1 72:1 73:1 74:1,24 75:1 76:1 77:1 78:1 79:1 80:1 80:15 81:1 82:1 83:1 84:1 85:1,5 86:1,8 87:1 88:1 89:1 90:1 91:1 92:1,23,23 93:1 94:1 94:19 95:1 95:10 96:1 96:4 97:1 98:1,7,18 98:21 99:1 99:14 100:1 100:4 bill's 63:9 bills 1:16 42:11 94:18 99:9,19 100:3 birthday 83:21,23 84:4 bit 7:21 87:20 blood 97:22 Board 7:3 8:7 8:25 27:15 28:17 29:8 29:18 30:2 30:4,5 31:14,15 BOBBY 1:11 body 11:2 bona 6:16 bonds 9:15 boot 62:21 booth 50:2 bother 16:16 Boulevard 62:12,15 63:16 65:10 65:12,21 67:4,8,11 67:22,25	68:6,11,14 68:20 69:3 69:7 70:7 70:24 71:7 73:3,21,22 73:23 74:9 74:11,16,20 77:22 78:21 79:2 80:6 82:4,7 83:2 83:5 84:12 84:18 85:3 85:7 86:3 93:15,17 94:3,21 96:17 branches 5:17 break 38:8,9 breath 83:13 brief 11:2 34:7 briefly 25:15 63:14 bring 35:4,8 36:2 67:7 67:22 68:2 68:18 broaden 72:20 92:24 brother 89:2 95:12 brothers 85:18,24 BS'ing 36:4 Bucks 22:12 93:17 building 44:6 bull 34:10 35:23 bullshit 34:8 Bureau 43:15 businesses 59:11 Bussie 33:16 33:19,25 34:3 41:19 41:23 42:4 Byrd 64:5 82:21,22 91:13 C cafe 47:14	call 27:7 30:2 39:10 called 13:3 37:8 67:24 73:21 calling 39:7 calls 29:14 85:5 calming 90:22 Camac 61:11 camera 69:18 69:24 70:5 76:11 77:6 94:20 cameras 62:13 63:16 65:11 73:10 73:11 76:6 76:11 78:20 79:21 80:3 83:2 85:6 86:3 92:20 95:20 Captain 93:10 car 25:4 90:14,17 careful 82:8 carefully 3:22 82:4 case 4:25 8:16,19 10:18 11:15 14:22 15:21 caselaw 38:8 cases 24:5 cause 15:24 celebrate 84:3 celebrated 83:20 certain 2:20 43:4 46:8 46:24 48:15 50:4 52:5 53:23 59:14 62:23 certainly 4:3 93:3 95:3 CERTIFIC... 101:2 certification	101:20 CERTIFY 101:3 certifying 101:24 cetera 5:12 Chair 1:10 25:10,12,15 26:7 64:17 Chairman 3:5 35:7 39:10 44:16 46:13 48:22 50:22 52:13 54:4 55:20 59:22 63:6 63:13,23 64:9 91:25 96:25 97:15 98:16 99:8 challenged 9:3 12:10 14:15 17:22 17:25 challenges 10:21 27:20 challenging 8:11 Chambers 91:19 93:6 95:17 change 7:15 67:8,22 68:2,8 74:4 77:20 79:22 79:24 80:5 81:8 changed 7:6 13:24 40:12 changes 30:7 changing 37:17 70:19 71:2 chapter 62:8 62:23 65:6 65:7 87:19 charge 64:4 Charter 9:11 23:13 CHERELLE 1:13 cherished 83:10	Chestnut 48:14 49:9 49:23 Chicago 76:16 80:19 Chief 52:16 54:7 64:24 children 83:11 Chiu 44:15 44:17 choked 88:3 choose 43:8 Chris 59:19 Christopher 46:16 59:25 64:19 cigarette 19:16 CINDY 1:10 circumstan... 21:18 citation 80:21 cite 14:7 cited 77:3 cities 5:12,16 6:8 21:15 22:14,23 79:9 citizen 91:24 97:7,17 citizens 4:12 36:4 56:6 57:13 58:17 72:24 73:19 86:5 88:20 93:8 citizens' 81:22 city 1:2,6 2:16 4:19 4:20 5:4,19 5:20 7:14 7:25 8:10 8:12,20 9:7 9:17 10:14 10:20 11:4 11:6,9,11 11:16,18,24 12:2,8,9,13 12:17,19,22 13:7,10,16 13:18,23	14:5,8,12 14:13,14,24 15:4,11,22 16:3,10,25 17:4,13,18 17:24,25 18:5,12,25 19:12 20:14 20:23 21:21 21:25 22:4 22:25 23:3 23:8 24:8,9 24:11,13,18 24:23,24 25:5,22 28:23 30:17 31:23 34:17 35:18,19,21 35:21 36:3 37:12,13 40:4,6 42:22,23 43:25 44:18 44:18,24 45:4,8 52:3 52:23 60:12 63:19 64:25 66:18,24 67:20 69:6 73:25 74:25 80:3,9,18 81:5,18 87:23 90:2 90:21 91:8 91:19 92:20 95:16 96:6 City's 6:12 8:24 9:11 10:8,14 11:15 12:24 13:5 14:17 14:21 16:20 19:24 20:22 30:24 32:20 71:5 74:4 civic 72:24 claim 5:20 15:25 24:10 24:13 claimed 7:24 17:9,15 claiming 21:11	claims 11:5 11:19 Clarke 63:10 65:19 class 21:15 Clean 72:23 clear 15:17 47:8,10,15 66:11 clearly 26:3 CLERK 2:13 2:23 42:20 46:4 48:9 50:17 51:24 53:17 55:12 56:23 58:4 59:8 61:5 62:7 close 18:14 closely 43:3 co-sponsors 63:9 coalition 26:22 27:15 28:13 31:8 72:17,19 75:4 77:10 84:22 Code 49:20 52:2,16,20 53:19 54:7 54:12 59:10 62:9,18 65:7 colleague 63:25 92:8 collected 12:20 13:21 collecting 81:25 collisions 93:23 come 3:15 18:2,14 38:6,23 39:12 40:17 72:3 85:22 95:22 96:5 97:4 comes 3:6 coming 2:4 39:8 86:15 Comly 55:15
---	---	---	---	---	---	--	---

Committee on Streets and Services
May 2, 2019

Page 3

comment 25:13 27:16 28:21	14:14 complaints 56:5 57:13 58:17	40:11 consent 6:15 14:6,9 15:12	continued 94:15 continuing 70:12 71:16	99:13 100:6 Councilman 1:10,11,11 1:12,12 2:2	53:22 54:15 Councilme... 44:21 63:11 63:11 65:5	66:6 67:13 67:14,16 69:18 70:4	deadly 66:20 deal 71:15 dealing 9:18
comments 34:7	Complete 47:17	consequence 34:15,20 42:2 80:7	contract 3:13 3:14 12:25 13:9 15:4	2:7,7,8,21 2:25 3:3,4 3:10 21:10	Councilme... 65:18 94:11 Councilwo... 1:10,13,13	73:14 74:14 82:6 87:23 93:13,22	Death 73:22 77:22 deaths 63:21
commission 10:4 44:19 45:8	comply 96:11 comprehen... 66:23	consequences 35:3 consider 80:23 92:10	16:17 38:25 38:25 39:3 40:8	25:12,14 26:18 30:10 31:3,11,18	2:9 25:9 26:8 41:4 42:16 63:4	93:13,22 crazy 89:9 create 21:14 22:8 27:17	66:12,24 67:6 68:5 71:6 74:8
commitment 63:20	comprised 26:22	considered 5:22 11:21 33:2 79:18	contracts 29:13 contribution 20:5	33:4,12,17 33:21 36:21 36:25 37:22	63:5 64:12 65:23 73:3 82:11 89:17	32:17 68:13 created 23:10 creates 21:13	86:24 88:12 decade 74:19 Decatur
committed 30:6,16	comprises 93:18	Consistent 8:2 consisting 72:22	control 3:7,11 4:10,17 5:24 6:3	37:23 39:6 40:2,3,14 40:16,22,24	89:18 92:5 92:8 counsel 37:8	critical 4:17 criticism 95:10 crossed 87:8	55:15 decided 14:23 87:11,18 decision 5:4
Committee 1:3 2:5 24:16 26:19	concept 94:10 94:21 concerned 32:8,11,15	consolidated 21:21,23 22:24 consolidation 22:11 23:13	17:17,21 19:20,22 24:16 27:23	41:5,8,11 41:21,25 42:6,14,14	counties 5:12 5:16,24 6:8 76:10	crossed 87:8 Crosstown 31:7,13 culture 29:7,9	12:2 decisions 6:2 29:8 89:12
43:14 44:12 44:17 46:15 48:23 50:23	concerns 56:6 57:13 58:17 71:4 concluded 100:11	consolidation 22:11 23:13 constituency 36:8,10,14	28:12 29:20 30:11 31:22 32:19 34:17	42:15 43:7 43:13 45:15 45:20,24	country 76:15 77:2 86:23 county 11:24	80:2 curb 25:3 47:7 59:11 59:13	declaring 2:16 decline 76:17
52:14 54:5 55:21 59:23 63:7 64:17	concludes 45:11 47:20 conclusion 31:20 82:10	constituents 84:24 constituted 8:25	35:15,17,18 36:2,18 40:6 101:23	47:22,25 48:5,19 49:4,14	curbline 45:4 current 5:2 37:20 80:15	declared 26:25 dedication 86:7	dedicated 26:25 dedication 86:7
93:7 99:10 100:10	92:19 conclusions 31:19	constituted 8:25 constitutes 9:20	controlled 35:20 conversation 29:2,22	50:7,10,14 51:5,14,17 51:21 52:9	21:21,22,25 22:4,6,9,11 22:12,13,13	curbline 45:4 current 5:2 37:20 80:15	deep 76:4 defeat 95:14
common 8:10 8:15 69:22 71:4	conditions 2:20 43:3,4 44:9 45:5	constitutes 9:20 Constitution 5:8,14 6:4	conversations 30:15 cooperation 16:23	53:6,10,14 53:25 54:10 54:23 55:2	22:23,25 23:3,5,8,9,9 23:11 63:17	81:2 currently 67:20 82:3	95:16 defend 25:18
Commonwe... 8:17,17 9:5 9:8 10:12	46:9,24 48:16 50:4 52:6 53:24	Constitution 6:10,18 20:25 21:12	cooperation 16:23 Corinne 64:2	55:6,9,17 56:11,15,19 57:9,18,21	23:11 63:17 76:5 93:17 couple 79:3	cyclist 80:8 cyclists 88:16 88:22	Delaware 22:13 78:9 78:10
10:17 11:14 14:19,20,22 17:10,14	52:6 53:24 59:15 62:24 condolences 89:25 91:11	Constitutio... 10:7 constitutional 10:20 23:15	correct 101:8 correspondi... 9:12	57:25 58:13 58:22,25 59:5,18	court 5:4 8:2 8:11,15,17 8:17,22,23	delay 35:24 36:23 38:17 delegate 10:3	delighted 78:24 delinquent 62:22
22:5,7 24:7 27:23	conducted 76:4 conference 86:22	constitution... 12:10 constitution... 9:24 11:22	corridor 65:16 costs 18:9	60:18,22 61:2,18 62:3,25	10:12,15,16 10:18,19 11:4,13,17	danger 37:13 data 81:25 82:2	delivered 18:25 81:9 demand 28:9
communica... 29:13 70:16 81:12	confered 76:4 conference 86:22	constitution... 12:10 constitution... 9:24 11:22	corridor 65:16 costs 18:9	64:11 71:13 71:23 72:6 72:10 78:3	11:20 14:19 14:22,24 17:9,10	date 56:4 daughter 90:17 David 1:12	delivered 18:25 81:9 demand 28:9
communica... 81:19	confident 79:12 conform 43:2	constructive 29:2 consulting 29:12	Council 1:2 11:9 15:5 15:22 16:3	72:10 78:3 82:16 89:15 91:14 92:6	14:22,24 17:9,10 24:6,7,10	days 80:20 92:17 DC 76:19	demonstrate 82:9 denied 8:23
communities 68:10	conforming 44:9 conforming 53:23	contained 101:5 context 31:17	cooperation 16:23 Corinne 64:2	92:6 93:10 97:2,13,14 97:21 98:2	24:6,7,10 39:24 Court's 11:14	dead 40:18 82:13 84:5 84:5 86:15	department 3:19 11:8 17:23 21:5
community 28:22	conforming 44:9 conforming 53:23	contained 101:5 context 31:17	cooperation 16:23 Corinne 64:2	98:4,9,14 98:15,20,25 99:4,6,7,19	covers 63:18 crap 34:10 35:23	dead 40:18 82:13 84:5 84:5 86:15	denied 8:23 department 3:19 11:8
compared 74:3 76:9	CONNECT 60:8 connections 50:3	continue 26:9 41:14 42:10 88:19	cooperation 16:23 Corinne 64:2	99:23 100:2 Councilma... 96:6 99:11	crash 66:16 86:25,25 crashes 66:5	dead 40:18 82:13 84:5 84:5 86:15	denied 8:23 department 3:19 11:8
compelled 80:11	conscience 50:3					dead 40:18 82:13 84:5 84:5 86:15	denied 8:23 department 3:19 11:8
complaint 9:8 10:9,14,23						dead 40:18 82:13 84:5 84:5 86:15	denied 8:23 department 3:19 11:8

Committee on Streets and Services
May 2, 2019

Page 4

34:22,23	discuss 10:25	90:8,9	egregious	48:25 50:25	28:18 66:10	fatalities 70:4	financially
35:8 36:12	28:19	driver 67:16	80:12	55:23 57:6	exempt 59:11	74:15,17	17:22
37:25 39:7	discussion	67:17 69:25	Eighty-three	58:10 64:25	exercise 8:21	76:21,23	find 36:9
43:15 44:10	35:5,9	70:10 71:2	67:15	engineering	existed 45:5	86:25 93:21	fine 81:2,3,4
46:17 47:5	dismissal	71:3,8 76:7	either 40:20	46:16 67:2	existing 8:7	93:24	81:6,9
47:12 49:2	11:14	driver's 3:12	43:8	68:4,12,16	43:3 44:6,9	fatality 75:16	fines 79:20
49:10 50:5	dismissed	drivers 75:14	elect 34:19	engines 94:5	45:5 50:2	favor 41:6	finished
51:2,6	8:18 10:13	75:23 77:14	36:5,15	ensuing 27:12	expected 20:2	78:17 79:15	77:25
52:16,24	14:21	88:17,22	elected 34:19	ensuring	experiences	98:23 99:21	fire 22:19
54:7,16	dismissing	driving 67:18	36:15 97:6	70:10	27:8	favorable	94:4
55:24 56:7	10:18	80:2,12	eleventh 2:15	entities 5:18	expire 13:13	38:21 44:12	fires 22:21
57:6,14	dispute 79:6	91:8	Eliminate	60:13	expired 13:8	99:10	first 2:12 9:9
58:10,18	dissent 15:8	drop 97:22	66:11	entitled 52:2	14:2	favorably	20:7 21:15
65:2 70:15	dissolve 4:14	drove 90:15	Elizabeth	52:21 54:12	expires 16:11	38:19	31:20 69:15
Department...	distinct 21:20	Duckett	52:15 54:6	59:10 62:10	explain 22:10	favors 78:12	74:24 79:4
14:4	distracted	48:21,25	emergency	62:18 65:8	express 91:11	FBI 29:16	79:20 80:20
DePasquale's	96:19	50:21,25	8:20 91:4,6	entity 23:2	expressed	fear 95:24	81:21 83:7
29:6	distributed	55:19,23	Emmanuel	24:18	12:24 19:5	February	96:14 98:16
deployments	98:18	57:4,5 58:8	34:3	equitable	extend 12:25	13:2 38:2	99:12
77:6	District 7:12	58:9	employees	66:25 68:3	16:17,23	44:21 57:11	Fiscal 18:17
deprive 23:14	13:20,24	Ducks 49:25	32:14	especially	89:25	58:15	18:18 20:4
design 74:5	17:20,22,23	Duckworth	empowering	65:23 73:20	extended	federally	five 8:8 86:17
designated	17:24 18:13	64:6 78:6,7	12:6	establish	13:3 15:3	67:21	five-member
59:12	18:16,22,24	duly 49:19	enable 65:11	62:15	extending	fee 25:4 59:13	8:7
designation	19:4,8,11	98:19 99:18	enact 6:19	establishes	13:15 16:9	fee-generati...	five-year
59:13	19:19 20:3	duties 12:17	enacted 5:6	51:8	extent 14:11	24:18	68:25
designed 74:2	20:6,8,18	23:11	8:2 12:4	establishing	15:14	feedback	fix 74:5
determine	27:4,21	dying 86:9	13:15 23:22	55:13 56:24	extremely	65:25	fixed 69:18
62:13	28:3,5	87:22 95:25	32:25 52:19	58:5 61:6,9	34:7	feel 80:11	floor 35:4,8
develop 68:11	48:25 50:25		54:11	65:13		90:19,20	38:14 39:17
devices 69:12	53:22 54:16	E	enacting 5:10	et 5:12	F	feet 42:24	flout 80:7
dialogue	55:23 57:5	E's 68:3	17:16 20:12	Eugene 29:6	face 32:3,16	44:24 47:7	focusing
27:18 28:22	58:9 60:12	early 94:13	encourage	Europe 69:22	faced 27:20	felt 32:8	66:25
die 84:10,12	districts	earnings 7:11	30:22	evaluation	fact 18:13	fide 6:16	folks 71:24
89:11	65:13,21	earth 89:11	encroachm...	67:3 68:5	22:3	Fifth 9:22	81:16 92:14
died 84:16	divest 15:4	easy 4:2	47:14	event 15:23	failed 10:23	fight 34:14,20	follow 92:22
different	doctor 91:4	education	enforce 16:12	everybody	24:10	36:11,13,17	97:10
22:15 87:2	doing 26:4	26:23 67:3	53:2 54:18	33:21 40:4	failure 18:23	fighting	following
direct 12:14	84:14	68:4,19	enforcement	41:17 85:9	19:3	34:12 35:3	43:17 99:9
101:23	double 74:18	educational	15:20 32:5	92:15 96:8	fair 70:11	35:15	foot 44:2 47:6
directly 28:24	downhill	70:8	32:20 33:9	evidence 79:5	faith 26:23	figh 34:13	47:9,14
Director 60:2	77:16	effect 32:22	62:11,16,21	101:4	families 86:23	34:18	Footnote 15:2
64:20	Dr 59:21	33:8	65:9,14	evidenced	87:14,17	file 39:20	footway 47:2
disagrees	63:25 64:16	effective	67:3 68:4	34:25	88:17	filed 8:10 9:7	forbids 5:14
25:23 34:16	draft 80:15	70:16,25	68:18 69:2	example	family 83:7	10:10 14:14	force 22:17
discharged	dramatic	71:7	69:12,14,20	80:14	83:19 84:8	files 7:25	22:18
9:16	80:5	effectiveness	69:22 70:6	exceeding	85:14,23	final 68:8	forces 29:9
discover	dramatically	69:24	70:24 73:2	76:8	86:10,12,12	79:18	forcibly 16:17
35:11	18:8,10	efficacy 79:5	73:9,17	exception	91:12 95:5	finally 24:2	foregoing
discovering	dramatically	efficiently	76:5,19	21:13 22:8	far 28:14	81:23 94:8	101:7,20
24:4	97:22	33:2	77:12,12,18	23:6,24	39:25 93:12	94:19	foremost
discovery	draw 41:12	effort 67:24	81:14,17	excess 13:20	fast 90:8	financial	81:21
29:16	drive 82:3	75:6 78:23	Engineer	executive	fatal 69:18	60:13	forever 35:16
		efforts 28:4			76:12 94:6		

Committee on Streets and Services
May 2, 2019

Page 5

form 87:18	36:3 85:23	37:4 42:10	75:4 84:22	harsh 80:11	historic 68:25	45:6 88:13	35:10 70:22
formed 27:10	fund 7:20	42:12 77:15	87:18 88:18	Haverford	hit 90:11	Immobiliza...	informed
former 63:25	18:23 96:7	82:19 86:12	greatly 97:5	52:4,23	hold 28:24	62:19	27:8 37:12
73:6 92:8	funded 19:11	89:11 93:12	green 90:5	head 64:4	38:20 40:20	impact 60:13	Infrastruct...
formerly	28:5 67:21	97:15 98:11	Greenlee 1:11	Healy 93:10	holding 30:6	impermissi...	64:22 73:5
48:13 49:24	funding	goal 26:24	2:8 25:13	hear 42:11	holiday 86:14	9:10	infringe 9:11
formula	17:11,12	30:12 66:11	25:14 42:15	87:21,22	home 9:11	implementa...	Initiatives
13:21,25	18:3 20:7	67:6 71:16	92:6 97:13	88:2 93:13	14:17 23:13	9:3 67:2	60:3 64:21
forward	25:20 28:10	88:14	97:14 98:2	94:3,4,5,23	83:16	76:18 77:11	injunction
16:19 37:10	funds 12:18	goes 25:5	98:14,15	94:24,25	honor 91:17	82:7	39:19
37:10 39:9	12:19 17:19	90:5 96:6	99:6,7	95:18 96:3	hope 43:2,22	implemented	injunctive
70:12 71:15	19:3,7,17	going 3:20	Grigos 43:20	heard 39:11	44:3 45:2	19:15 69:11	8:13
88:23	20:18	13:12 26:9	ground 67:9	86:22 93:7	81:18 92:2	76:21 79:2	injured 66:8
found 10:20	furniture	34:6 35:13	group 72:21	93:9	96:7,9	79:11	66:17 67:15
11:4,18	47:9	35:24 37:2	75:18 78:12	hearing 2:10	97:15	implications	injuries 70:5
85:11	further 9:2	37:16 66:19	88:7	21:4 28:25	hopeful 90:2	60:11	74:9
four 69:15	32:9	75:12 78:18	grown 18:7,9	37:3 39:8	hopefully	important	injury 69:13
78:22 83:3	Furthermore	84:3 86:15	Growth 78:10	42:7,10,17	74:5 97:10	6:2 24:19	76:13
92:17	29:25	88:23 92:4	78:11	82:14 89:21	hospital 91:5	66:3 69:5	input 66:2
Fourth 9:19	future 29:3	92:22 96:2	guess 95:8	98:11	hour 76:9	71:17 73:20	Inquirer
Fox 46:5,20	74:6 88:13	good 2:2 31:5	guest 91:17	hearings 19:2	hours 92:16	improve	29:19
framework		35:11 43:12	guys 34:21,21	30:23	House 6:22	62:11 65:9	insightful
66:23	G	44:15 46:12	35:14,16	heart 64:5	93:6	65:15	65:25
Frank 43:14	general 5:7	46:13 48:21	36:5,19	88:2	houeline	improvement	Inspections
frankly 38:18	5:10,14 6:5	50:21 52:12	82:24 88:12	heartfelt	45:3	45:7	52:17 54:8
free 77:24	6:8,19,19	54:3 55:19		89:16	hovering 94:6	inches 47:6,8	Instagram
95:20,24	11:23 12:4	57:4 58:8	H	heaven 89:10	Howard	47:9,14	89:7
freedom	12:15,15	59:21 64:16	half 27:14	heavily 11:11	42:25 44:3	include 11:2	install 46:6
95:19	13:14 16:16	73:13 84:18	Hall 1:6	heck 36:16	44:25	62:20 65:21	46:22
fresh 83:14	16:24 18:11	91:25 92:2	hand 72:2	held 18:25	human 70:19	includes	installation
Friday 32:17	20:11 22:5	95:8 97:17	handwrote	33:6	humans	65:12	47:11,16
front 4:7	23:17 27:14	gotten 83:24	85:12	helicopters	66:14	including	63:15
frontage 47:3	generally	government	happen 38:12	94:5	humble 26:5	10:21 25:20	installed
full 10:11	74:13,18	5:18,18	happened	hell 36:17	Huntington	72:22 73:10	73:16
32:19 35:9	generates	95:12	20:19 22:22	Hello 82:21	31:5,6,25	incorporated	Institute 69:9
40:10 83:15	12:18	Governor 7:2	31:12	help 74:5	hurry 90:7,7	94:20	76:2 79:8
fully 9:16	generation	8:3,6,9	happening	75:22 87:16	90:8,25	incorrect	Insurance
79:12 94:13	18:11 81:17	68:24	67:9 74:10	97:8	91:3	21:7	69:8 79:8
101:5	generations	governs 18:5	happier	Henon 1:11	hurts 86:20	increase	intent 12:24
function 4:18	84:7 89:23	grades 42:22	97:23	65:20		28:18 70:25	intention
16:20,25	generous	grant 67:21	happy 44:13	Hercules	I	increased	2:16
24:19,23,24	70:9	granted	53:4 54:22	43:20	i.e 16:14	18:8 19:14	intentions
39:22	George 94:15	10:12	60:16 71:11	high 74:10	idea 94:12	indefinitely	30:10 37:9
functions	getting 74:20	granting	82:23	high-quality	ignored 6:24	16:15	interaction
4:12,21,23	ghost 75:19	48:10	harassment	60:6	III 5:9,21,23	Independen...	77:19
6:12 10:4	give 15:9,23	grants 49:5	27:11	higher 66:15	6:5 10:21	48:13 49:8	interactions
11:25 12:6	31:10	grassroots	hard 85:21	highest 28:5	11:19 12:11	49:22	73:18 77:15
17:5 19:24	given 18:21	26:21	85:22 86:6	highlighted	20:10,25	independent	interest 6:16
20:16,22	31:8 80:18	grave 37:13	86:14,16	29:6	23:16,22,22	5:17	6:21 17:7,8
22:2,7,9	giving 18:15	great 72:11	87:2,25	Highway	23:25 24:4	indication	17:16 20:17
23:5,9,16	globe 79:10	82:12 100:9	94:25	69:9 76:2	24:8,12	20:20	24:21,22
32:4,23	go 3:21 4:3	Greater	Harrisburg	79:8	Imma 34:15	information	30:5
33:9 35:18	13:22,23	72:18,20	23:6,10	Hippell 43:21	35:13	29:11 32:10	interfere
	17:12 36:8		78:23 84:21		immediate		

Committee on Streets and Services
May 2, 2019

Page 6

39:21 interfered 11:23 interfering 14:17 intoxicated 90:15 introduced 44:20 51:4 54:10 57:9 58:13 65:4 76:24 introduction 72:25 involve 15:7 involved 66:15 75:5 78:14,18 involves 15:18 involving 22:6 70:4 73:14 irregardless 34:14 35:3 issue 3:11 7:14 14:23 16:4 38:11 73:8 issued 80:4 issues 10:24 11:21 37:15 issuing 32:18 70:18 IX 21:11,17 21:24 23:7 23:20,21,23 23:23	Johnson 1:12 2:7 42:15 51:5 joined 64:24 68:22 joining 69:5 journey 82:24 Judge 15:2 July 16:6,7 16:22 19:18 20:12 83:5 June 2:19 jurisdiction 8:16,18 justice 77:9 justification 28:11	86:20 87:6 87:12,14 88:3,3 90:19 91:16 96:5 known 12:18 16:7 64:23	leaders 69:5 leadership 7:5 28:18 29:9 30:19 65:24 73:8 learned 33:5 leave 35:14 Leavitt 15:3 led 28:23 left 2:7 legal 3:17,23 4:19,20 11:7,10 24:14 25:25 28:19 legalize 85:6 legally 44:4 legislate 15:5 23:5 legislated 6:10 16:4 16:18,25 legislation 5:11 6:25 9:20 11:22 22:6 37:18 40:9 64:8 66:2 68:25 75:21 78:20 79:16 88:15 92:7,11 95:9 96:21 legislative 9:14 15:9 15:20 Legislature 22:22 74:25 95:15 Leslie 68:23 lesser 81:7 let's 67:8 letter 85:12 letters 85:4,8 level 4:4 28:5 81:2 92:12 92:12 liberty 95:19 licensed 48:11 49:6 49:19 Licenses 52:17 54:8 life 70:20	83:15 87:12 91:5 97:25 lifesaving 71:3 lifted 9:6 light 22:3 73:10 90:5 95:21 lights 90:4 likelihood 76:7,12 likes 85:9 limit 9:14 70:3 76:8 limited 21:18 limits 30:4 Line 63:18 lines 42:22 44:8 Lion 55:15 list 10:24 listed 60:8 listen 41:21 41:22 82:25 84:13 little 7:21 19:7 22:14 22:23 31:10 87:20 97:24 live 94:2 lives 66:6 69:21 71:9 73:23 83:4 96:22 living 66:18 LLC 43:22 46:6,21 loading 59:11 59:14 LoBasso 64:3 72:16,17 79:7 local 5:10,15 5:23 6:3,6 6:20 9:22 19:20 20:12 23:18 29:20 30:11 92:12 located 46:25 49:21 location 49:24 75:15 locations	69:19 long 44:5 78:23 82:23 longer 7:7 80:10 longstanding 29:18 look 39:24 40:10,14 70:12 86:18 looked 87:5 looking 31:16 71:15 87:6 lost 66:7 83:4 83:6,7 84:6 84:6 85:14 85:17 86:10 86:24 89:2 89:3,5 lot 7:22 22:14 25:17 73:25 84:15 loved 83:10 86:24 87:14 88:8 lowest 80:25	46:23 47:2 47:3,6 Maryland 76:6 match 45:4 matter 9:5 71:18 87:11 101:7 matters 28:20 maximum 18:15 Maxwell 43:21 Mayor 6:23 6:24 7:3,7 8:8 12:23 13:13 63:19 66:9 68:21 73:4 Mayor's 5:2 5:3 McMonagle 2:11 42:18 46:2 48:7 50:15 51:22 53:15 55:10 56:21 58:2 59:6 61:3 62:5 McNulty 57:2 meaningful 67:7 means 3:11 5:13 81:7 101:22 measure 82:5 measured 69:16 measures 85:2 mechanics 32:12 media 94:5 meet 37:19 41:15 84:23 meeting 27:16 30:3 31:14 37:4 40:25,25 42:8,13 45:9 98:12 100:7	meetings 28:17 meets 47:16 member 26:17 29:18 30:2 members 7:3 8:4,14 9:2 28:23 30:4 30:17 43:13 44:16 46:14 48:22 50:22 52:13 54:4 55:20 59:22 63:6 64:17 92:5 95:18 memorand... 11:8 14:4 21:7 memorand... 3:17 mentioned 79:7 mere 15:22 merely 32:3,4 message 70:17 81:8 messages 70:9 met 6:22 9:16 MICHELE 101:14 microphone 41:20,24 42:5 middle 39:8 Mike 78:19 miles 63:18 67:10 70:2 71:6 76:9 million 7:11 7:23 13:19 13:22,25 18:15,19,21 20:2 27:4 28:2,6,9,10 32:15 millisecond 90:6 mind 37:17 40:12 minds 81:22 minimum
J 91:24 January 2:15 11:9 56:4 Jason 64:6 78:7 92:15 jeopardize 39:22 jeopardy 37:21 38:15 Jim 66:9 68:22 73:4 John 64:2 73:7 91:24 97:2	K K 1:11 Kasim 64:24 keep 34:6 75:22 88:21 Kenney 66:9 68:22 73:4 94:15 Kenney's 63:19 KENYATTA 1:12 kept 24:7 kicked 67:23 kids 83:10,17 killed 66:17 67:14 90:16 95:5 King's 8:21 kiosk 50:2 Kisha 48:25 50:24 55:17 55:23 57:5 58:9 know 25:21 34:21 35:14 35:17 37:16 68:16 71:24 74:7 75:21 75:23 77:13 77:15 83:12 83:16,17 84:2,8,9,14 85:8,9,16 86:10,16,18	L L 1:13 101:14 labor 26:23 lacked 8:15 8:18 land 78:13 lanes 59:12 90:23 language 15:10 large 24:17 73:11 larger 75:10 largest 20:5 Lastly 77:9 Latanya 64:5 82:22 92:15 94:25 law 3:18 6:7 11:8 13:15 14:4,11 15:14,16 21:4,9 26:2 34:16,22,23 35:2,7 36:12 37:24 39:7 54:19 75:22 80:7 86:2 lawful 4:9 20:9 lawfully 20:21 laws 5:10,15 6:20 12:4 12:11 20:12 21:14 23:10 23:19 34:22 lawsuit 37:14 39:18 lawyer 25:18 lawyers 25:22 lay 3:16 93:11 layman 3:25 lead 92:18	legislative 9:14 15:9 15:20 Legislature 22:22 74:25 95:15 Leslie 68:23 lesser 81:7 let's 67:8 letter 85:12 letters 85:4,8 level 4:4 28:5 81:2 92:12 92:12 liberty 95:19 licensed 48:11 49:6 49:19 Licenses 52:17 54:8 life 70:20	83:15 87:12 91:5 97:25 lifesaving 71:3 lifted 9:6 light 22:3 73:10 90:5 95:21 lights 90:4 likelihood 76:7,12 likes 85:9 limit 9:14 70:3 76:8 limited 21:18 limits 30:4 Line 63:18 lines 42:22 44:8 Lion 55:15 list 10:24 listed 60:8 listen 41:21 41:22 82:25 84:13 little 7:21 19:7 22:14 22:23 31:10 87:20 97:24 live 94:2 lives 66:6 69:21 71:9 73:23 83:4 96:22 living 66:18 LLC 43:22 46:6,21 loading 59:11 59:14 LoBasso 64:3 72:16,17 79:7 local 5:10,15 5:23 6:3,6 6:20 9:22 19:20 20:12 23:18 29:20 30:11 92:12 located 46:25 49:21 location 49:24 75:15 locations	69:19 long 44:5 78:23 82:23 longer 7:7 80:10 longstanding 29:18 look 39:24 40:10,14 70:12 86:18 looked 87:5 looking 31:16 71:15 87:6 lost 66:7 83:4 83:6,7 84:6 84:6 85:14 85:17 86:10 86:24 89:2 89:3,5 lot 7:22 22:14 25:17 73:25 84:15 loved 83:10 86:24 87:14 88:8 lowest 80:25	46:23 47:2 47:3,6 Maryland 76:6 match 45:4 matter 9:5 71:18 87:11 101:7 matters 28:20 maximum 18:15 Maxwell 43:21 Mayor 6:23 6:24 7:3,7 8:8 12:23 13:13 63:19 66:9 68:21 73:4 Mayor's 5:2 5:3 McMonagle 2:11 42:18 46:2 48:7 50:15 51:22 53:15 55:10 56:21 58:2 59:6 61:3 62:5 McNulty 57:2 meaningful 67:7 means 3:11 5:13 81:7 101:22 measure 82:5 measured 69:16 measures 85:2 mechanics 32:12 media 94:5 meet 37:19 41:15 84:23 meeting 27:16 30:3 31:14 37:4 40:25,25 42:8,13 45:9 98:12 100:7	meetings 28:17 meets 47:16 member 26:17 29:18 30:2 members 7:3 8:4,14 9:2 28:23 30:4 30:17 43:13 44:16 46:14 48:22 50:22 52:13 54:4 55:20 59:22 63:6 64:17 92:5 95:18 memorand... 11:8 14:4 21:7 memorand... 3:17 mentioned 79:7 mere 15:22 merely 32:3,4 message 70:17 81:8 messages 70:9 met 6:22 9:16 MICHELE 101:14 microphone 41:20,24 42:5 middle 39:8 Mike 78:19 miles 63:18 67:10 70:2 71:6 76:9 million 7:11 7:23 13:19 13:22,25 18:15,19,21 20:2 27:4 28:2,6,9,10 32:15 millisecond 90:6 mind 37:17 40:12 minds 81:22 minimum

Committee on Streets and Services
May 2, 2019

Page 7

minutes 37:7	moved 41:2	negative	85:9	19:5 30:18	30:21 38:4	80:12	29:3,15,17
misleading	98:22 99:20	73:18	number	34:19 36:15	38:5 45:12	outside 12:22	29:25 30:11
21:8 26:4	moving 33:8	negotiated	85:16 93:13	oh 1:12 2:8	48:23 49:12	overall 76:14	30:13,19
misplaced 5:7	37:9,10	3:14	numbers	3:3,4,10	50:23 51:12	overseeing	31:22 32:5
missing 86:19	multi-agency	negotiations	94:18	26:18 31:18	53:3 54:20	95:12,13	32:5,13,18
86:20	67:24	33:7	numerous	33:4 37:22	55:21 56:9	overwhelmi...	32:20 34:13
mission 97:5	multi-year	neighborho...	21:19 24:11	37:23 39:6	57:16 58:20	87:21	34:18 35:6
mode 71:18	67:24	75:17		40:15,16,22	59:24 70:21	owner 46:21	35:16,20
model 97:9	municipal	neighborho...	O	42:14 91:3	88:9		36:3,11,18
modes 73:15	4:17 10:3	22:16 36:9	O'Connor	92:6	opposed 41:9	P	38:22 39:3
modify 14:9	12:6 23:16	nephew 85:17	64:3	Oh's 21:10	47:13 50:6	p.m 1:7	40:6,16
15:12	municipalit...	88:25	O'Neill 54:10	30:10 31:11	99:2,24	100:11	41:16 50:18
mom 83:21	5:25 21:20	nephews	57:9 58:13	Okay 33:12	opposition	PA 46:8,23	51:9 55:13
84:6 89:3,5	69:10	89:22	65:20	72:10	61:23	pain 90:19,20	56:24 58:5
mom's 83:20	MURPHY	net 13:19	Obermayer	old 87:11	order 10:17	90:20	61:6,9,21
moment	101:14	96:10	43:20	oldest 86:17	43:2 66:10	paltry 20:2	61:23 70:13
78:24	mutual 14:9	network 60:7	objection	on-street 3:7	ordinance	panacea	part 3:24
moms 86:18	15:11	networks	51:7 52:25	4:11,22	2:14,14	68:18	28:11 63:19
Monday	N	69:13	54:17 57:15	12:5 13:5	42:21 43:19	panel 10:11	73:11
32:21		never 5:22	58:18	13:19 14:10	43:19,24	31:8	partnership
money 7:22	name 26:13	11:21 16:3	objections	15:6,8,13	44:11 46:5	paper 85:11	65:22
7:22 13:22	31:6 34:3	18:14 23:12	10:11,13	15:17 16:4	48:10 50:6	parameters	party 83:23
18:2,24	43:10,14	24:13,21	14:21 49:11	16:13,21	50:18 51:25	92:25	pass 22:5
25:5 39:23	46:15 48:24	77:7	56:7 60:10	17:4 19:24	53:18 55:13	Parked 62:19	24:15 26:2
monitored	50:24 52:10	new 8:4,13	101:4	20:15,22	56:24 58:5	Parker 1:13	34:22,24
60:14	52:15 54:6	13:21 14:15	objective	24:17,22	59:9 61:6,8	63:4,5 65:5	35:25 93:2
Montgomery	55:22 57:5	30:5 53:20	31:21 60:7	34:10,12,18	62:8 78:17	65:20,24	96:23
76:5	58:9 59:25	62:8,23	obtained	35:16 36:2	79:19 80:17	73:3 92:9	passable
monthly	64:14 72:14	65:6 69:15	12:16	36:11,18	81:2 82:12	parking 2:18	47:10,15
31:13	72:16 78:4	81:4 87:19	obviously	40:5	93:4 94:8	3:8,14 4:11	passage
months 77:5	78:6 82:18	94:10	25:16,23	once 14:16	ordinances	4:14,22,24	79:19 96:21
96:15	82:21 85:15	newly 8:2,25	occupancy	77:4 90:11	9:12	6:11,14,15	passed 9:23
Moore 61:11	91:21,23	news 77:13	19:15	one-minute	ordinary 86:5	7:4,6,10,14	10:5 33:6
Morelli 43:12	narrative	84:13 87:21	occupied 44:5	36:23	Oregon 76:24	7:18,19	74:24 86:3
43:14	81:15	Nichols-Sol...	occur 71:6	ones 86:24	organization	9:18 10:10	86:8 92:24
morning	near 70:5	2:24 26:15	occurred	87:14 88:8	2:18	12:5,7,12	94:19 99:5
46:12 59:21	nearby 76:10	26:16 29:24	93:13	open 30:14	organizatio...	12:16,20,25	passing 6:6
Morris 61:14	nearly 19:17	niece 83:6,7	October	44:5	29:12	13:4,5,8,11	paths 87:8
61:15,16	66:8	89:22	68:21	operate 48:12	organizations	13:18,19	Pause 36:24
mother 83:9	necessarily	night 31:13	offenders	49:7	26:24 72:22	14:10 15:6	pay 25:4
85:17,23	92:22	84:7	77:7	operated	organize 2:17	15:8,13,16	26:17,21
Mother's	need 40:9,13	non-City	offer 43:16	49:24	organizing	15:17 16:5	27:10 29:9
86:15	42:9 68:2	12:21	46:18 49:3	operator	28:4	16:11,12,13	29:20 30:9
motion 35:12	68:18 81:11	norm 80:5	51:3 55:25	48:11 49:6	original	16:19,21	97:24
40:21,22	81:24 82:2	normalized	57:7 58:11	49:18,21	28:10	17:2,4,11	paying 90:12
motorists	82:4,25	79:25	60:4	opinion 19:6	originally	17:15,18	peddled
79:24 80:13	87:13 92:13	Nos 99:14	office 31:11	25:25 26:5	17:9 27:22	18:6,14,20	81:16
82:3	92:19 93:2	notes 101:6	64:21 73:4	opinions	78:19	19:2,6,21	pedestrian
move 38:15	93:12 96:17	notice 9:25	offices 21:22	25:21	oTIS 60:3,7,9	19:23,24,25	71:19 75:16
40:21,23	needed 19:17	62:20 80:18	23:9 65:19	opportunities	64:23	20:6,15,22	pedestrians
42:2,9	20:10 68:17	80:22 97:21	official 29:13	38:8	outcomes	24:17,22,25	75:13,23
89:22 98:16	71:8 77:21	notices 62:22	52:16 54:7	opportunity	88:10	25:19 27:3	88:16,22
99:8	needs 27:19	nowadays	97:6	4:16 26:19	outraged	27:7,11,25	pending 33:7
	41:17 96:18		officials 12:19			28:4,15,24	

Committee on Streets and Services
May 2, 2019

Page 8

Pennsylvania 1:6 5:6,8,13 6:3,4,9,18 6:22 8:22 8:23 9:4 10:6,15,16 10:19 11:13 11:17,20 13:14 14:24 20:25 21:13 23:2 24:25 27:13 68:22 70:15 74:25 95:15 people 65:15 66:8,18 67:14 75:3 75:7 77:3 80:6 81:7 81:13 84:11 84:16 85:15 86:8 87:22 88:5 89:9 90:6,24 96:11,12,15 97:8 percent 67:16 67:17 69:16 69:17,25 70:3 71:5 74:12,13,14 74:17 76:7 76:13,14,17 76:20,22 77:4,7 93:18,21 percentage 19:14 perform 6:11 23:15 period 70:10 80:16 permission 48:10 49:5 Permits 59:10 permitted 14:11 15:14 person 82:20 83:15,16 97:23 personal 93:25	personally 96:16 personnel 28:19 perspective 64:8 phase 68:7 Philadelphia 1:2,6 2:17 4:13,14,24 5:5,19 6:11 6:13,23 7:4 7:6,8,12,25 11:6,12,16 12:3,8,9,13 14:12,14,25 16:14 17:13 17:17,20 18:16 19:4 19:9,12,19 20:3,6,14 20:19,24 21:22 22:3 22:9,12,16 22:24 23:4 23:8,14 27:2,3,7,21 29:19 35:22 36:4,5 40:5 44:18 46:8 46:23 49:20 52:2,20 53:19 54:12 59:10 62:9 62:18 63:17 65:2,7 66:4 66:7,12 67:7 70:13 72:18,20 73:25 75:5 75:11,17 78:8 82:13 84:19,22,23 87:18 88:18 88:20 90:3 91:9 92:20 93:9,19 95:22,23 96:24 Philadelphi... 11:24 17:21 21:25 60:8 73:12 74:12	77:21 Philadelphi... 4:16 27:19 73:24 Philly 92:12 phone 39:10 85:4 picked 94:16 picture 85:13 pilot 69:2 70:7,10,17 73:2 81:25 place 28:21 81:4,19 placed 12:21 47:5 plan 42:23,24 43:25 44:24 45:4 60:9 73:12 81:19 planned 83:18 Planner 44:18 planning 44:19 45:8 67:21 68:7 plans 47:4 planters 46:7 46:22,25 Pleas 8:10,15 pleasant 83:14 please 2:11 31:3 42:18 46:2 48:7 48:20 49:14 50:15 51:22 53:15 54:2 55:10,18 56:21 58:2 59:6 61:3 62:5 82:18 pleased 45:13 47:20 pledge 9:14 9:18 point 11:7 16:15,18 46:13 94:11 pointed 24:10 pointing 24:8 police 22:17	22:18 73:18 77:12,14,16 94:4 policies 78:13 Policy 60:2 64:20 portion 14:7 42:22,24 44:2,4,6,25 Portland 76:23,24 position 32:9 70:23 positive 37:11 96:24 possibility 15:23 possible 19:8 possibly 12:7 posted 56:3 57:10 58:14 70:2 potential 73:17 PowerPoint 4:6 27:24 powers 8:21 14:18 PPA 7:9 9:15 9:19 26:17 26:21 27:10 29:10,20 30:9 81:18 PPA's 14:6 14:20 prayer 11:3 precious 83:3 84:5 precipitated 7:15 preliminary 10:10,13 14:20 prepared 52:25 54:17 present 1:9 42:17 presentation 4:6 21:3,11 presented 10:24 16:2 31:15 37:19 preserve	70:19 President 8:5 63:10 78:9 pressure 97:22 pretty 85:11 93:16 prevent 8:13 86:8 95:6 prevented 6:12 prime 92:7 prior 22:10 92:14 priority 67:5 private 39:10 72:23 91:24 97:7,17,25 Pro 8:6 pro-public 26:23 probably 84:16 90:12 problem 7:14 39:15 problems 74:5 procedures 92:3 proceed 26:13 31:4 43:9,10 48:20 49:15 52:11 54:2 55:18 64:13 64:14 72:15 78:5 82:19 91:21 96:3 proceeding 79:14 proceedings 101:4 process 40:18 96:10 profile 77:14 program 66:3 67:23 68:2 68:8 70:7 70:14,16,18 74:4 76:11 76:24 81:25 program's 69:15	progressing 85:21 progressive 26:22 78:12 78:12 prohibit 17:3 52:22 54:14 prohibited 11:22 prohibiting 52:3 53:21 prohibition 17:5 prohibits 5:9 6:5 20:11 20:14 23:17 promise 27:25 promised 18:24 promises 28:10 property 19:13 44:7 45:7 47:2 proposed 43:23 47:13 78:19 proprietary 15:7 protect 6:3 provide 17:19 19:3,7 20:2 52:18 53:4 54:9,21 62:12 70:22 88:7 provided 3:18 11:8 18:12,17 19:17 31:17 92:21 provides 4:15 16:8 66:22 providing 20:17 60:6 88:20 provision 14:2 60:15 provisions 16:9 53:20 54:18 public 6:21	19:5 26:4 27:16,17 28:21,25 29:4,21 30:3,14 37:2,4 38:9 42:10,13,17 98:11 101:15 publicly 39:9 39:13 published 9:24 Puchalsky 59:21 60:2 63:25 64:16 64:19 punishment 79:23 purpose 3:16 21:23 23:12 43:23 pursuant 49:19 push 75:11 pushback 30:8 put 25:3 37:13,20 38:14 73:16 85:12 86:2 89:5,6 Q questions 10:24 44:14 45:14,18 47:21,23 50:8 51:15 53:5,8 54:22,24 56:13 57:19 58:23 60:17 60:20 71:11 71:21 77:24 97:12 Quinones-S... 1:13 63:12 65:19 quite 38:18 80:10 quorum 2:6 quote 15:10 15:15	R Race 78:8 rainy 90:14 raise 72:2 raised 10:20 19:13 Randy 64:3 72:12,16 79:6 Ranstead 48:14 49:8 49:23 rates 66:20 rational 9:21 reach 67:5 88:4 reached 31:11,18 read 2:11 31:14 32:2 32:2 42:18 46:2 48:7 50:15 51:22 53:15 55:10 56:21 58:2 59:6 61:3 62:5 100:3 100:5 reading 99:13 reads 15:8 real 85:15,16 reality 18:19 really 38:24 82:25 87:2 87:24,25 89:6,24 90:16 91:10 93:11 97:5 97:8 rear-end 93:22 reason 7:16 7:19 19:21 73:13 91:7 95:3,5 reasons 74:19 Rebmann 43:21 received 56:5 57:12 58:16 77:8 reckless 91:7 recklessly
--	---	---	---	---	--	---	---

Committee on Streets and Services
May 2, 2019

Page 9

90:9 recklessness 95:3 recognize 3:3 28:7 91:17 98:13 recognizes 25:12 recommend 34:24 recommend... 99:10 recommend... 68:11 recommend... 8:4 30:7 45:10 recommends 44:11 record 26:14 28:6 34:4 42:14 43:10 52:11 61:19 61:22 63:9 64:14 72:14 82:19 91:21 100:3 red 55:15 73:10 90:5 95:21 reduce 63:21 68:5 73:14 reduced 76:6 76:12 reduces 73:17 reduction 69:16,17,25 70:3 76:20 76:23 77:5 reductions 82:5,6 reform 29:15 refute 3:19 regarding 8:24 11:10 12:5 17:4 19:2 21:19 29:11 30:11 regardless 34:20 regularly 73:23 regulates 6:7	regulating 5:11 20:15 24:22 regulation 14:10 15:13 15:18 16:14 51:9 56:3 57:10 58:14 regulations 50:18 55:14 56:25 58:6 61:7,9 regulatory 24:19 related 20:16 20:23 relating 53:19 relationship 6:14 12:14 30:24 relative 64:8 release 14:5 relevant 14:7 reliable 68:13 reliance 5:3 relied 9:17 relief 8:13,24 11:3 relies 11:11 remain 47:11 47:16 remarks 31:9 remember 89:21 95:2 Removal 62:18 removing 19:20,20 Rendell 14:13 14:15 renew 13:14 Renfro 46:12 46:16 49:16 reoccurring 26:25 repealing 2:14 repeat 31:9 report 29:6 32:13 reportable 66:5 67:13	reported 69:24 74:14 76:20 99:9 reporter 101:24 Representa... 64:2 73:7 91:18,20,23 97:20 representing 43:21 reproduction 101:21 reputation 29:4 request 8:24 requested 43:19 requests 29:10 required 7:9 9:24 20:24 47:17 requires 6:18 research 79:7 82:8 resident 78:7 residential 76:14 residents 95:23 resort 29:10 respects 94:2 respond 21:5 21:6 23:10 38:5 54:22 responded 6:25 7:7 21:6,10 response 10:8 14:13 45:19 45:23 47:24 48:4 50:9 50:13 51:16 51:20 53:9 53:13 54:25 55:5 56:14 56:18 57:20 57:24 58:24 59:4 60:21 60:25 62:2 71:22 72:9 98:8 99:3	99:25 responsibility 18:3 25:10 responsive 27:19 rest 94:12 restricting 12:8 result 7:5 11:20 19:12 66:6 67:17 80:21 95:4 results 80:21 retained 7:11 return 29:19 returned 9:4 19:19 returning 31:22 returns 4:10 20:21 revenue 13:19 18:10 20:23 27:2 27:5,20 28:2 60:11 81:17 96:5 96:10 revenue-ge... 96:4 revenues 4:18 18:8 32:14 35:19 39:2 review 16:2 69:23 revise 44:8 revising 50:18 revision 42:21 revisited 60:14 Richards 68:23 rid 77:18 ride 49:24 75:7 rides 91:2 right 2:8 15:25 34:17 39:21 42:9 72:3 74:7 right-to-kn...	29:10 rights 9:15 23:15 riots 22:21 rise 15:24 Ritner 61:10 road 55:15,15 55:16 57:2 57:2,3 58:7 75:9 roads 76:9,14 87:2 95:25 roadways 93:19 robust 81:11 Rochelle 2:23 26:16 room 1:6 91:4 Roosevelt 62:12,14 63:16 65:10 65:12,21 67:4,8,25 68:6,14,19 69:3,7 70:7 70:24 71:7 73:2,21,22 74:16,20 78:21 79:2 83:2,5 84:12,18 85:2,7 93:14,16 94:3,21 Route 67:25 68:7 74:4 routine 29:11 RPR-Notary 101:15 rule 9:11 10:7 14:17 23:13 23:21 rules 99:11 100:5 rushing 91:4 S Saadeem 83:8 Saamir 83:8 Saasean 83:8 safe 68:13 71:17 75:13 75:13,14	87:17 88:17 88:22 safer 75:23 88:15 90:21 safety 62:11 65:9,15 66:3 68:3 69:6,9 70:25 76:3 79:8,13 81:20 82:9 85:2 90:4 94:22 96:24 sales 52:3,21 53:20,21 54:13 Samara 83:6 83:9,23 89:3 Samara's 83:11 88:25 Sanchez 2:9 25:9 26:8 41:4 44:21 Sarah 44:17 92:16 sat 83:16 save 71:9 91:5 saves 69:21 96:22 saw 76:16 saying 36:10 says 26:3 scenes 94:6 schedule 30:8 school 7:12 13:20,24 17:20,22,23 17:24 18:4 18:13,16,21 18:24 19:4 19:8,11,18 20:3,5,8,18 25:20 27:4 27:21 28:2 60:12 66:19 69:13 school's 19:14 schools 7:20 17:12,13 18:23 Schweiker	5:5,20 11:7 11:12,17 12:3 14:25 17:14 scientific 79:4 screwed 64:4 seat 3:12 seating 8:25 Seattle 77:7 second 9:13 36:22 41:3 41:4 77:8 89:5 seconded 98:19,22 99:18,20 Secondly 80:25 81:10 Secretary 68:22 section 5:9,21 5:23 6:5 10:22 11:19 12:11 20:10 21:2,12,17 21:24 23:7 23:17,20,24 23:25 24:4 24:8,12 27:17 28:21 49:20 51:25 52:20 53:18 54:11 59:9 62:17 secure 26:24 securing 3:13 see 38:23 75:19 85:14 86:11,19 91:8 92:2 Seeing 45:20 45:24 47:25 48:5 50:10 50:14 51:17 53:10,14 55:2 56:15 56:19 57:21 57:25 58:25 59:5 60:22 61:2 62:3 71:23 98:9 seeking 28:14 seen 28:17	29:14 76:15 83:12 85:18 seize 7:17 seized 25:2,6 seizing 7:19 Senate 8:5 94:19 Senator 78:18 94:15 separate 5:17 21:20 September 93:5 serious 70:4 74:9 76:13 seriously 66:17 serve 6:20 78:9 Services 1:3 2:5 26:19 42:12 44:17 46:15 52:14 54:5 59:23 63:7 64:18 100:11 session 28:19 98:10 99:13 100:6 seven 9:9 Seventh 10:5 severely 66:9 67:15 sexual 27:11 shaped 66:2 share 71:4 sharing 70:17 short 28:8,9 87:12 93:20 shortly 77:16 shown 47:3 73:14 shows 32:13 side 51:11 sides 55:14 56:25 84:24 sidewalk 47:10,13,15 48:12 49:7 49:22 52:2 52:21 53:19 53:21 54:13 sightseeing
--	--	---	---	--	---	---	---

Committee on Streets and Services
May 2, 2019

Page 10

significantly 18:7 19:13	Sort 93:25	speeds 66:15	100:2	76:16 94:24	5:1 6:1 7:1	84:1 85:1	supports 44:11 77:11
signing 68:24	sought 8:12	66:20,23	Stack 78:19	statute 16:7,8	8:1 9:1 10:1	86:1 87:1	Supreme 5:4
similar 7:13	8:20	71:4,8	94:16	16:23 17:2	11:1 12:1	87:17 88:1	8:22,23 9:4
76:9,16	souls 83:4	74:10	stage 38:16	20:13 37:18	13:1 14:1	88:16,18	10:15,16,19
simple 71:2	sound 89:9	spent 92:16	38:16	statutes 5:6	15:1 16:1	89:1 90:1	11:4,13,17
96:22	south 46:25	spirit 79:22	stand 36:5,16	statutory 14:16	17:1 18:1	90:21 91:1	11:20 14:24
simply 13:15	47:6,6	83:11	standpoint 77:10	stay 8:21 9:6	19:1 20:1	92:1 93:1	17:10 24:6
16:18,24	48:12 49:7	spoke 27:16	stands 93:15	stayed 9:2	21:1 22:1	94:1 95:1	sure 81:24
24:20 63:14	49:22 50:19	sponsor 25:16,23	start 3:2 4:8	stays 40:19	23:1 24:1	96:1 97:1	96:8,9
66:20 80:17	51:10,11	92:7	43:9 59:19	41:13	25:1 26:1	98:1 99:1	surrounding 29:7 30:23
single 10:7	61:10,12,13	sponsored 49:4	63:2,8	steep 81:6	26:18 27:1	100:1,10	Survey 43:15
22:25 75:16	61:14,15,16	sponsoring 65:25 82:11	72:12 84:19	stenographic 101:6	28:1 29:1	stress 79:3,16	suspended 99:12
75:17 85:12	Southampton 57:2	Squilla 1:10	started 2:10	step 37:6 69:5	30:1 31:1	81:11	suspension 100:5
singling 9:19	southerly 42:24 43:25	2:2,21,25	94:13	96:24	32:1,6,20	strike 44:23	Sustainabili... 64:23 73:6
sirens 94:4	space 47:10	3:5 31:3	starting 2:4	Steve 2:24	32:22 33:1	striking 42:23 43:24	sustained 14:19
sister 89:2	47:15	33:12,17,21	87:20	31:4,6	33:9 34:1	strong 70:8	sworn 8:14
sisters 86:17	spaced 47:7	36:21,25	state 6:16	stop 77:16	35:1 36:1	81:19	system 4:11
sit 87:3	speak 96:16	40:2,24	7:17 10:9	94:7	37:1 38:1	strongly 31:21 78:16	4:23 14:9
sited 44:6	Speaker 6:22	41:5,8,11	10:23 17:6	stopping 51:8	39:1,2 40:1	structure 29:12	15:12 62:11
sites 70:5	6:24,24 8:5	41:21,25	17:8,21	stories 86:22	41:1 42:1	studied 76:3	62:15 65:9
sitting 87:9	speaking 31:7	42:6 43:7	18:2 19:10	87:4 92:18	42:11 43:1	study 32:25	65:14
situation 32:17	33:4 37:11	43:13 44:16	19:22 20:17	story 84:25	43:16 44:1	76:4	systematic 69:23
six 8:3,9	78:2	45:15,20,24	21:14 22:22	89:21 94:25	44:10,16	Stutzman's 30:2	
65:13,18	speaks 97:5	46:14 47:22	24:20,23	strategic 60:3	45:1 46:1	subject 10:7	
77:5 86:13	special 5:11	47:25 48:5	25:6 28:12	60:7,9	46:14,17	15:6 21:25	
Sixth 10:2	5:16 6:7,20	48:19 49:5	29:5 30:18	64:20	47:1,5,12	62:21	
48:13	9:20,22	49:14 50:7	35:2 37:14	strategy 63:21 81:12	47:17 48:1	submitted 61:22	T
slid 90:13	10:4 20:12	50:10,14	39:16,19	stream 27:2	48:15 49:1	substantial 9:21	table 26:10
slide 4:5	21:14 23:18	51:14,17,21	43:9 52:10	street 12:24	49:2,9,10	successfully 79:10	33:24 43:6
slow 90:24	63:24 91:16	52:9,13	63:14 64:2	13:13 42:25	50:1,5 51:1	suggestion 32:24 33:5	46:11 48:18
96:12,18,18	specific 21:18	53:6,10,14	64:13 72:14	42:25 43:2	51:2,6 52:1	sum 20:4	52:8 59:17
small 20:4	Specifically 32:11	53:25 54:4	73:6 78:4	44:2,3,3,4,8	52:14 53:1	sunset 60:15	72:5 87:10
Smart 78:10	speed 62:10	54:23 55:2	82:18 91:18	44:25 45:2	54:1,5 55:1	supervision 15:19	tabled 21:4
78:11	63:15 65:8	55:6,9,17	91:20,20	45:2 46:7	55:24 56:1	101:23	37:25
social 77:9	65:11 66:13	56:11,15,19	92:11	46:23 47:2	56:7 57:1,7	Supervisor 46:17	tactic 38:17
solace 88:8	66:15 69:2	57:18,21,25	state's 17:16	47:3,7,8	57:14 58:1	support 29:25 31:21	take 3:7 4:16
sole 21:23	69:12,14,18	58:22,25	22:2	48:14 49:23	58:11 59:1	supervisor 65:3 69:6	4:21 24:16
solely 23:11	69:20,21,23	59:5,18,22	state-autho... 19:16	50:19,19,20	59:12,23	70:23 72:24	32:8 34:12
Solicitor 25:22 37:12	70:2,6,23	60:18,22	stated 14:22	51:10,10	60:1 61:1	85:5 88:14	36:17 39:17
37:20,24	73:10 76:8	61:2,18	15:3,24	52:5,24	62:1 63:1,7	93:3	80:10
41:16	78:20 79:21	62:3,25	27:24	61:10,11,11	64:1,18	supported 61:21	taken 39:16
solutions 68:12,17	83:2 85:6	63:6 64:11	states 14:8	61:12,12,13	65:1,2 66:1		87:15 101:6
somebody 80:16 86:19	86:2 92:19	64:17 71:13	69:10,11	61:13,14,14	66:7,12,19		takeover 6:17
somebody's 91:5	94:20 95:2	71:23 72:6	79:9	61:15,15,16	66:25 67:1		takes 73:23
sons 83:8	95:4,21	72:10 78:3	statewide 96:7	61:16,17	68:1 69:1		talk 38:22
sorry 36:25	speeding 62:14 67:18	82:16 89:15	Stations 46:6	63:17 73:24	70:1 71:1		42:6,7 95:9
61:7	69:17,25	91:14 97:2	46:21	78:8 93:17	71:17 72:1		talked 85:19
	76:17 80:13	98:4,9,20	statistical 93:9	Street's 45:3	73:1 74:1		95:19
	82:5	98:25 99:4	statistics	streets 1:3 2:1	74:13 75:1		talking 37:7
		99:19,23		2:5 3:1 4:1	76:1 77:1		41:19,23
					78:1 79:1		
					80:1 81:1		
					82:1 83:1		

Committee on Streets and Services
May 2, 2019

Page 11

42:4 83:22 93:22,23 Tasker 61:12 61:13 Taubenber... 93:11 tax 19:15,16 taxes 19:13 Taylor 64:2 73:7 91:18 91:23,24 97:16,20 technologies 81:15 technology 78:25 79:6 79:11 80:19 81:13 85:10 television 38:10 46:5 46:21 tell 87:3 telling 84:25 temporarily 37:3 Tempore 8:6 ten 13:6,11 13:16 42:24 43:25 44:24 93:14 Tenth 53:21 54:15 term 30:4 94:17 terms 2:20 3:25 43:4 46:9,24 48:15 50:4 52:5 53:24 59:14 62:24 testament 86:4 testified 96:8 testify 26:10 26:20 30:22 33:16,18,20 33:22 34:5 38:6 44:19 45:12,17,22 48:2 50:12 51:19 53:12 55:4 56:17 57:22 59:3	60:24 61:20 61:24 65:3 70:22 71:25 72:7 78:16 91:17 98:7 testifying 2:22 26:11 39:9 71:25 82:20 testimony 3:2 33:13 43:11 43:17 45:11 46:18 47:20 49:3 51:3 52:11,18 53:4,7 54:9 54:21 55:7 55:25 56:12 57:8 58:12 59:20 60:4 60:19 63:3 64:15 71:14 72:15 77:23 78:5 82:15 82:17 89:16 89:20 91:15 91:22 92:14 92:21 93:8 97:3,11 thank 2:3 3:4 25:7,15 26:7,15,17 30:21,25 33:11,13,25 33:25 34:2 34:2,2 36:19,21 37:23 40:2 43:7 45:15 45:25 47:19 47:22 48:6 48:19,23 49:12 50:7 50:23 51:12 51:14,21 52:9 53:3,6 54:20,23 55:6,8,21 56:9,11,20 57:16,18 58:20,22 59:18,23 60:18 61:18	62:4,25 63:5,24 64:6,9,11 65:5,23 70:21 71:10 71:13,19 73:3 78:3 82:11,14,16 89:14,15,19 91:13,14 96:25 97:3 97:11 98:2 98:4,5,15 99:7 100:8 thanking 63:8 87:24 Thanks 53:25 77:23 then-Repres... 94:14 theory 32:16 therapists 85:20 thing 49:16 88:25 96:22 things 3:15 39:13 79:4 79:17,17 83:18 86:6 90:23 95:13 think 38:17 39:6 40:4 40:13 75:7 79:17 80:22 81:7 82:12 84:16 87:7 89:8,11 94:8 95:6 96:20 Third 9:17 thorough 71:14 thought 84:2 87:4 three 25:21 68:9 72:8 79:16 83:8 85:18,24 throw 83:25 Thursday 1:7 ticket 50:2 tickets 32:19 70:18 80:4	96:13 TIGER 67:21 time 16:15 21:19 29:21 34:23 41:12 47:19 51:8 57:12 58:16 60:17 64:10 71:12 85:11 85:25 92:10 96:17 97:4 timing 30:8 tips 97:16 title 2:12 42:19 46:3 48:8 50:16 51:23 53:16 55:10 56:22 58:3 59:7 61:4 62:6 today 30:22 45:13 48:24 49:3,13 50:24 51:3 51:13 52:17 54:8 55:22 55:25 56:10 57:7,17 58:11,21 59:25 60:4 64:24 67:10 68:14 69:4 74:3 80:6 82:22,23 85:17 87:13 88:19 89:6 89:7,10,12 89:20 told 28:20 84:9 tomorrow 68:15 tools 71:7 73:13 88:21 tour 48:11 49:6,18,21 tours 49:25 touted 81:21 tow 62:21 tow-away 51:9 55:14 56:25 58:6 town 75:20	90:9,10 Townsend 57:3 58:6 township 24:24 traffic 48:25 50:25 55:23 57:6 58:10 64:25 66:11 66:24 67:6 68:3,5 71:6 73:15 74:15 74:17 75:9 90:3,22 traffic-relat... 63:21 transcript 101:8,21 transfer 7:10 transferred 8:16 transfers 7:13 13:17 32:4 transition 32:12 33:3 33:8 transparency 27:6 28:14 transparent 29:5 70:11 transportat... 60:9 64:22 68:23 70:15 71:18 73:5 78:13 93:7 traveled 84:21 traveling 65:16 travels 85:25 trial 56:4 57:11 58:15 tried 75:24 trouble 24:3 truck 55:13 56:24 58:5 true 21:16 101:7 trust 30:14 try 38:23 40:17 95:6 trying 3:25	79:23 97:8 turn 80:3 turned 83:22 twice 90:11 two 8:4,5,6 31:18 74:23 75:18 76:10 84:6,16,20 89:23 twofold 95:11 type 3:15 85:9 types 92:18 U ultimately 3:6 unconstitut... 17:6 20:13 unconstitut... 9:10 10:3 understand 4:2 22:15 unfortunat... 40:11 unilateral 17:3 unilaterally 13:3 unique 73:8 United 69:11 79:9 urge 96:23 use 19:14 28:18 49:25 62:10,13 65:8,11 69:21 73:16 78:13 utility 50:3 V vacate 44:24 vain 84:10,12 valid 9:21 validity 8:11 Valley 78:9 78:11 various 5:5 12:4 94:18 vast 74:8 vehicle 48:11 49:6,18 vehicles	62:19 76:17 vending 52:3 52:23 54:15 versus 5:5,19 11:6,12,16 12:3 14:12 14:15,25 17:14 veto 15:10,22 vetted 94:13 vicinity 61:7 61:10 view 80:10 94:11 violate 6:9 9:13 violated 10:6 violates 80:17 violating 79:21 violation 62:22 77:8 80:20 violations 62:14,20 violators 77:5 Virginia 76:10 vision 63:20 66:10,22 67:4 68:13 71:14 72:21 73:12 74:22 75:11 78:14 84:23 86:21 88:11,11,12 visit 85:22 vividly 93:16 voice 64:7 vote 30:6 37:10,15,17 38:18,21 39:14,18 40:15 voting 26:6 38:13 vulnerable 66:14 W wait 3:22 waived 24:9 wake 27:10 walk 80:9	walking 47:17 want 3:21 17:25 35:25 36:10,13,16 37:5,20 39:12 40:3 59:19 64:13 72:12 79:3 79:16 80:9 82:10 86:11 88:7,8,12 92:25 95:24 wanted 23:4 63:8,13,24 84:8,9 88:24 89:19 89:24 91:10 wants 40:5 warning 70:10 80:16 80:18,22 Washington 76:19 81:5 wasn't 7:21 83:16 watch 77:13 watched 83:17 way 30:15 38:10 39:17 70:25 71:3 72:13 75:18 94:9 ways 24:11 we'll 37:4 72:13 82:19 we're 3:11 26:4,9 34:9 34:11,11 35:24 38:12 78:23 86:18 87:19 93:21 93:23 97:10 we've 35:15 75:14 76:15 week 84:15 weekend 84:14 welcome 30:4 30:23 91:18 91:22 went 32:21
--	---	--	--	---	--	---	---

Committee on Streets and Services
May 2, 2019

Page 12

west 48:12,13 49:7,8,21 49:22 wheel 90:13 wide 42:24 44:2,24 width 47:18 wife 94:2 WILLIAM 1:11 wiretaps 29:17 witness 26:10 33:23,23 43:5 46:10 46:10 48:17 48:17 52:7 52:7 59:16 59:16 72:4 witnesses 26:10 43:5 72:4 woefully 28:9 Wolf's 68:24 wonderful 93:6 word 86:9 words 16:3 work 25:17 40:14,15 70:12 72:13 80:9 86:4,6 88:9 94:21 worked 75:15 75:25 working 30:16 66:18 67:20 68:10 71:16 74:23 83:10 86:7 works 80:19 worse 74:21 worth 86:2 worthy 30:13 writing 61:22 written 92:21 wrote 85:4,7 X Y yards 94:3 Yeah 33:19 year 7:23	13:25 18:17 18:18 20:4 27:9,14 28:3 66:4,7 68:8 86:4 86:22 97:17 years 13:6,11 13:16 18:20 23:20 68:9 69:15 74:23 75:18 76:3 78:22 84:20 86:13 89:3 92:17 93:14 94:16 York 69:15 81:4 young 83:9 youngest 89:2 Z zero 63:20,22 66:10,13,22 67:5,6 68:6 71:15 72:21 73:12 74:22 75:11 78:15 84:23 86:21 88:11,12 96:10 zone 47:17 51:9 59:14 94:22 zones 59:11 69:13 0 0 47:7 0.6 74:12 1 1 47:5 1:23 1:7 10 13:2 70:2 76:8 10,000 66:5 100 66:6 80:25 81:6 11 70:3 11.75 63:18 11th 61:12,16 12 67:10 71:6 12-2405 62:17	12-3400 62:9 62:23 65:7 12-905 59:9 12th 61:11,13 13 71:5 74:14 13(b) 21:12 21:17,24 23:7,20,24 14 69:24 14.4 28:6 14.5 20:2 140 69:10 14th 57:11 15 69:10 16 18:20 160844 1:16 2:1,13 3:1 4:1,9 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1,11 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1,9,21 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 26:20 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1,6 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1,2 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1 63:1 64:1 65:1 66:1 67:1 68:1 69:1 70:1 71:1 72:1 73:1	74:1 75:1 76:1 77:1 78:1 79:1 80:1 81:1 82:1 83:1 84:1 85:1 86:1 87:1 88:1 89:1 90:1 91:1 92:1 93:1 94:1 95:1 96:1 97:1 98:1 99:1 100:1 16th 83:5 93:5 172 94:19 180950 1:16 59:8 60:5 60:24 99:16 181009 1:16 55:12 56:2 56:17 99:16 181046 1:16 50:17 51:4 51:19 99:15 1854 21:19 1870's 45:6 1875 23:19 18th 56:4 19 76:14 190085 1:16 48:9 49:4 50:12 98:18 98:21 99:14 100:4 190103 1:17 56:23 57:8 57:23 99:16 190104 1:17 58:4,12 59:3 99:16 190105 1:17 61:5,8,25 99:14 190121 1:17 42:20 43:17 44:20,23 45:10,22 99:14 190184 1:17 62:8 65:4 69:7 93:4	98:7 99:17 190209 1:17 51:24 52:19 53:12 99:15 190210 1:17 46:4,19 48:3 99:14 190255 1:17 53:17 54:10 55:4 99:15 19106 46:8 46:23 194 42:23 1947 2:19 1950 2:15 1994 13:6,11 16:10 19th 45:9 68:21 1st 19:18 2 2 1:7 2,500 67:13 2:58 100:11 20 74:17 93:20 2001 5:7 6:17 6:21 17:20 18:6 2002 18:18 2004 12:23 13:2,12 2007 94:14 2008 20:8 2012 16:6,7 16:22 17:2 20:13 2013 67:12 83:5 2014 14:3 16:9 2016 67:23 93:5 2017 11:9 18:18 21:9 32:13 38:2 67:12 2018 19:18 68:21 74:15 2019 1:7 20:4 30:3 44:22 45:9 56:4 57:11 58:15	69:10 2025 68:12 2030 63:22 66:12 2040 68:12 21 23:19 2120 78:8 21st 44:21 50:19 51:10 22 6:17 7:2,9 10:22 17:16 18:17 22nd 31:12 23 15:2 23rd 30:3 25 13:18,22 27:4 28:8 250 66:8 25th 11:9 26th 58:15 274 32:14 27th 50:20 51:10 29th 83:21 3 30 72:22 300 94:2 31 76:16 31st 14:2 16:8 32 5:9,21,23 6:5 10:22 11:19 12:11 20:10 21:2 23:17,25 24:4,9,12 330 46:7,22 47:3 39 76:13 3rd 21:9 4 40- 75:8 400 1:6 44 70:3 45 7:10,23 13:25 18:15 28:2,10 5 5 47:7 5/2/19 2:1 3:1 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1	10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1 56:1 57:1 58:1 59:1 60:1 61:1 62:1 63:1 64:1 65:1 66:1 67:1 68:1 69:1 70:1 71:1 72:1 73:1 74:1 75:1 76:1 77:1 78:1 79:1 80:1 81:1 82:1 83:1 84:1 85:1 86:1 87:1 88:1 89:1 90:1 91:1 92:1 93:1 94:1 95:1 96:1 97:1 98:1 99:1 100:1 50 81:3,9 53 76:22 55 69:17 59 76:7 5th 2:19 6 6 47:6,9,14	74:13 60 77:4 80:20 60-day 70:9 80:16 60th 83:23 62 67:14 63 69:16 65 67:17 69:24 69 83:22 6th 61:15 7 70 76:20 70th 84:3 720 18:19 77 67:15 77th 52:4,24 8 80 77:4 80-mile-per... 75:9 89.6 18:21 9 9 12:23 13:3 14:13 15:3 15:4,9 16:22 47:9 47:14 9's 16:9 9-205 51:25 52:20 53:18 54:12 9-407 49:20 90 77:7 944 32:14 9th 61:14 63:17 93:17
--	--	---	---	---	---	---	---