

1

2

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
CAPITAL PROGRAM & BUDGET HEARINGS
BEFORE THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

3

4

- - -

Room 400, City Hall
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania
Tuesday, April 13, 1999
10:35 a.m.

6

- - -

7

8

9

Bill No. 990026 - Amending Chapter 19-1800 of The
Philadelphia Code entitled "School Tax

Authorization". . .

Bill No. 990027 - Amending Chapter 19-1800 of The
Philadelphia Code entitled "School Tax

Authorization". . .

Bill No. 990028 - Amending Chapter 19-1800 of The
Philadelphia Code entitled "School Tax

Authorization". . .

14

PRESENT: COUNCIL PRESIDENT ANNA C. VERNA, Chair
COUNCILWOMAN AUGUSTA CLARK
COUNCILWOMAN JANNIE BLACKWELL
COUNCILMAN DAVID COHEN
COUNCILMAN RICHARD MARIANO
COUNCILMAN JAMES F. KENNEY
COUNCILWOMAN DONNA REED-MILLER
COUNCILMAN MICHAEL A. NUTTER
COUNCILMAN ANGEL ORTIZ
COUNCILMAN FRANK DICICCO
COUNCILMAN FRANK RIZZO

20

CHARLES MCPHERSON,
Chief Financial Officer

21

22

- - -

23

VINCENT VARALLO ASSOCIATES, INC.
Registered Professional Reporters
Eleven Penn Center, Suite 600
Philadelphia, PA 19103
(215) 561-2220

24

25

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 I N D E X

3 Page

4

5 David Hornbeck, Superintendent. 3045
6 School District of Philadelphia

7 Francis Garner, Bus Driver. 3122
8 School District of Philadelphia

9 John Lombardi, Director of Transportation 3140
10 School District of Philadelphia

11 Oscar Rosario, Bus Driver 3142
12 School District of Philadelphia

13 Peggy Mims, Private Citizen 3151

14 Thomas Doyle, President, Local 1201 3157

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 P R O C E E D I N G S

3 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Good

4 morning. This is the continued public hearing of
5 the Committee of the Whole regarding Bill No.'s
6 990026, 990027, and 990028.

7 Good morning.

8 DR. HORNBECK: Good morning, Madam
9 President.

10 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Mr. Hornbeck,
11 what procedures have you put into place regarding
12 the textbook shortage? Can you just elaborate on
13 that since you heard what we heard from many of
14 our constituents?

15 Secondly, what procedure will you be
16 putting into place to regard this complaint?

17 DR. HORNBECK: Well, we'll be doing two
18 different basic things. One has to do with the
19 way in which the system works with books, and that
20 will be a much tighter set of system-wide
21 policies. As I testified when I was here before,
22 basically, it's been a school-by-school set of
23 policies. And while that has resulted in our
24 reducing the number of -- percentage of schools
25 without books from 60-some-odd percent to

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 18 percent, it still is 18 percent not there, and
3 I think we need system-wide policies of that kind.

4 The other factor are the kids
5 themselves, and we will be establishing a new set
6 of accountability procedures with respect to kids,
7 which will involve things like payment for the
8 books, the withholding of grades if they're not
9 paid, the possibility of not participating in
10 extracurricular activities.

11 As I said in my testimony the last
12 time, a task force has been convened in the office
13 of the chief of staff. We expect recommendations
14 by the end of April or the first week in May, and
15 in May, we'll take those recommendations to the
16 Board of Education for adoption so that they are
17 in place and operative, and everybody's informed
18 of them as we go into the summer.

19 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Very well. I
20 would like to say that we want to be informed that
21 you're monitoring the process as well as the
22 status of the books in the schools, and you will
23 keep us informed on that?

24 DR. HORNBECK: Absolutely.

25 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: We have

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 established a Teacher Recruitment Committee and
3 also a Transportation Committee. I have assigned
4 Councilmembers to the committees.

5 DR. HORNBECK: Right.

6 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: And I am
7 asking that you please work very closely with both
8 committees, particularly the Transportation
9 Committee regarding the bus aides and attendants
10 and also the token issues.

11 I can't believe -- you know, I have
12 receiving letters. I'm not going to read this
13 letter, but this is just a sampling that I will
14 share with you of the type of letters that we are
15 getting, and I will not read it for the record.

16 (Above-cited letter given to Dr.
17 Hornbeck.)

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: At this point
19 in time, the Chair recognizes Councilman Nutter.

20 DR. HORNBECK: Excuse me, Madam
21 President, if I may, just for clarification.

22 When we were at Council last and then
23 in a telephone conversation that we had, it had
24 been my understanding that you expected us to
25 convene these two committees, and you gave me four

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 Councilmembers each, and I've asked our Director
3 of H.R. and the Greater Philadelphia First to
4 convene the Recruitment Committee, and the Greater
5 Philadelphia --

6 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Actually,
7 that meeting has been scheduled.

8 DR. Hornbeck: I'm just trying to make
9 sure we've only got one committee going.

10 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: No, we have
11 two separate committees.

12 DR. Hornbeck: I mean, one committee on
13 each subject.

14 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Yes. We have
15 the Teacher Recruitment Committee.

16 DR. Hornbeck: Right.

17 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: And then we
18 have the Transportation Committee.

19 DR. Hornbeck: And is your expectation
20 that we will convene those?

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Yes.

22 DR. Hornbeck: Okay, I just wanted to
23 make sure.

24 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Yes, by all
25 means.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 DR. HORNBECK: I just wanted to make
3 sure I understood. Thank you, ma'am.

4 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERA: Mm-hmm.
5 Councilman Nutter.

6 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: Thank you, Madam
7 Chair.

8 This is probably in the same area, and
9 I'm tangentially aware of the committees to which
10 the Chair makes reference. But specifically, Dr.
11 Hornbeck, I did want to get a sense of where we
12 are with this, I think, legitimate looming crisis
13 on the recruitment of teachers. You articulated,
14 I think, during the regular the -- at start maybe
15 of the budget hearing process, in one of the
16 various documents, there was essentially three
17 ideas for trying to deal with our recruitment
18 problem. Off the top of my head, I believe one
19 was residency, one was pay, and the other may have
20 been the ability to decide where that person is
21 going to go, and there were some contractual
22 issues that revolve around that particular issue.

23 I think you probably have a sense that
24 on the one hand, many, if not most and possibly
25 all, members are concerned about this particular

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 issue, although there's varying levels of support
3 or lack thereof on doing anything for the moment
4 on the residency issue. I think there is, though,
5 a tremendous amount of concern and interest in
6 trying to address the other two issues first; and
7 if those attempts fail, then people may be
8 interested in revisiting the residency issue.

9 Can you tell me, though, for the moment
10 what the plan is for the moment what the plan is
11 going forward knowing what your landscape is
12 like? What are we going to do about the
13 recruitment problem, current vacancies, and then
14 what you anticipate at least by way of your
15 testimony an even larger problem going into
16 September?

17 Let me lastly say that between the last
18 time you were here and today, there was at least
19 one story, I believe, in The Inquirer which seemed
20 to indicate that this is not, in fact, just a
21 Philadelphia problem, and that it is going on you
22 all across the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, and
23 certainly the counties and school districts around
24 us are facing the exact same problem.

25 But what are we going to do?

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 DR. HORNBECK: With respect to the
3 three issues that you raised, let me start there.
4 Those are not ideas for addressing it; those
5 really were the three top reasons that people gave
6 for declining employment with us.

7 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: Right.

8 DR. HORNBECK: They do give rise to
9 ideas about how to address it.

10 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: Right.

11 DR. HORNBECK: In the case of --
12 setting residency aside for the moment, with
13 respect to the other two, they basically cannot be
14 addressed in a -- on an across-the-board way until
15 August of 2000 because both of them have major
16 implications for the contract. We can't change
17 compensation, for example, without agreement with
18 the Federation; although I suspect if we offered
19 more money today, they might agree to an amendment
20 of the contract, but I don't have more money.

21 With respect to the placements --

22 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: Let's stay on that
23 topic for a second.

24 DR. HORNBECK: Right.

25 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: Has there been any

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 discussion with the PFT, for example? And I
3 understand you try to not spend money that you
4 don't have, although sometimes you might find
5 yourself in that situation anyway. But on the
6 teacher recruitment issue, has there been any
7 discussion -- formal, informal -- about what it
8 would take to provide a financial incentive to
9 increase -- I guess this is a starting-pay issue
10 comparing us to other places -- and broach that
11 subject? And then has anyone said anything to us
12 about what it would take to get that piece done?

13 DR. HORNBECK: We have had
14 conversations in different ways with the
15 Philadelphia Federation of Teachers about the
16 future of new teachers on -- at a variety of
17 entrance points. We have not had that
18 conversation in the context of simply trying to
19 provide an extra \$3500 for starting salaries,
20 which would be the amount of money that would make
21 us on par with the surrounding areas.

22 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: Right.

23 DR. HORNBECK: And we really haven't
24 done that for two reasons. One is we don't have
25 the money to do it; we're already operating in a

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 deficit way. We have had some conversation about
3 bonuses, which is a kind of different way of
4 approaching it. And I am not anxious to go very
5 far down the compensation route in a single-bullet
6 kind of way as opposed to addressing the
7 compensation issues across the board.

8 That doesn't leave us without ways of
9 approaching the issues, however. And on lots of
10 other fronts, we have continued to take aggressive
11 action, ranging from somewhat more opening, it
12 appears, I hope, to maybe keeping that retirement
13 window open, and in Harrisburg, which probably can
14 save us 300 vacancies all by itself. And except
15 for the higher level of expenditure for an
16 experienced teacher, not cost any money to the
17 more aggressive issues taken as well.

18 But the Recruitment Committee, as the
19 President has suggested, I think actually has a
20 meeting scheduled now, and we envision not only
21 the four Councilpeople and our H.R. people, but
22 two or three senior H.R. people from corporations
23 to be a part of that. And I hope that out of
24 that, as we talked last time, there will emerge a
25 consensus of initiatives that will cross a number

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 of these lines and come with a fully balanced
3 program. And I don't see that needing to take a
4 real long time to come up with those things.

5 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: Well, I understand
6 that. Lastly on this, the compensation/bonus
7 issue, which you characterize as either a contract
8 issue or a single-bullet approach.

9 Aren't you, though, at the end of the
10 day, given the immediacy of the problem, forced
11 almost to deal with it more as a single bullet,
12 because the problem is now, as opposed to the more
13 comprehensive way in a full compensation package,
14 which you can only address almost a year and a
15 half from now?

16 DR. HORNBECK: It is an issue that is
17 alive and on the table.

18 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: Okay.

19 DR. HORNBECK: Even as we speak.

20 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: Okay. The second
21 part of this -- or I guess the last issue that
22 came up from your surveys back had to do with
23 placement, I believe. And I think I cut you off
24 as you were getting ready to go into that area.

25 DR. HORNBECK: That is largely a

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 seniority issue. And I see no opportunity to deal
3 with it outside of the boundaries of the contract
4 prior to August of 2000. The history of that
5 issue tells me that.

6 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: I understand.

7 Lastly, just to go back for one second,
8 you said you didn't particularly feel that you
9 were in a position to talk about bonus or
10 compensation issues because of lack of dollars.
11 If there were dollars available for such a
12 program, would you pursue it?

13 DR. HORNBECK: Yes.

14 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: Okay, thank you.
15 Don't elaborate on that answer.

16 DR. HORNBECK: Well, it --

17 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: No, I said don't
18 elaborate on the last one -- "yes" is fine.

19 DR. HORNBECK: Okay.

20 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: Just leave it at
21 "yes." The more you explain, the more trouble we
22 have.

23 Thank you. Thank you, Madam Chair.

24 DR. HORNBECK: Thank you.

25 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: The Chair

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 recognizes Councilwoman Blackwell.

3 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank you,
4 Madam President.

5 Certainly, I am glad to hear about
6 information on the committees. I'm particularly
7 interested in serving on the Transportation
8 Committee, as we've spent a lot of time and energy
9 over the last -- oh, I don't know -- year and a
10 half on this issue and have done some work with
11 regard to research across the country on this
12 issue. So I would really, really like to work on
13 this Transportation Committee.

14 And I would also note that I am glad
15 that the in paper today, the issue of
16 transportation is front and center: "Help,
17 Drivers Cry" on Page 6 of the Philadelphia Daily
18 News. So that is also good news so that we do
19 have it as a major issue today.

20 In that regard, let me ask one
21 question, and then I'll ask one question on
22 another subject until the committee meets. These
23 bus referral forms, it seems to me,
24 Superintendent, that's one of the major issues
25 with regard to this, these bus referral forms and

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 what happens. I know your response has been if
3 it's only 10 schools, there must be problems there
4 with those drivers, but it seems to me that
5 there's something else -- that there's something
6 else happening here. And so I wanted to ask about
7 the forms.

8 And also, we have information about
9 students that are written up many, many times.
10 What happens in this regard with the students who
11 continue to be disruptive on buses?

12 Those two questions only.

13 DR. HORNBECK: Well, let me say first
14 of all that I've never suggested that in the
15 problem areas that it's only the drivers that may
16 have a problem. Indeed, I think that there have
17 been instances -- in fact, I know there have been
18 instances -- in which the school's response --

19 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: "Schools" is
20 what you said.

21 DR. HORNBECK: -- is inadequate.
22 Sometimes it's the driver, sometimes it's the
23 principal, sometimes it's the assistant
24 principal. You know, it's a variety of ways. And
25 what we do is to try to respond to wherever the

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 problem seems to be.

3 With respect to youngsters that are
4 sort of repeaters in a sense, they are dealt with
5 in the same disciplinary process that we would
6 deal with disruptive behavior in any school
7 setting. In some instances, it simply in effect
8 means being called to the office, and some of us
9 had the experience of that being quite enough to
10 deal with our behavior, or a telephone call to a
11 parent.

12 But it can include being suspended from
13 your right to ride the bus and does include that.
14 And in certain instances, what happens is that
15 it's not just, "Well, your suspended from riding
16 the bus" necessarily, but it also may involve then
17 putting a youngster, as we tend to say, on a
18 token. And so you don't get to ride the yellow
19 bus but we're also not keeping you from attending
20 school, and we give you access then by -- if you
21 can't afford it -- by virtue of a token.

22 So it's a whole series of things that
23 we try to have be appropriate to whatever the
24 behavior was. It can include, in fact, referral
25 to the police department and arrests, you know, if

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 the kids are older and if it is some sort of an
3 incident that is serious -- not unlike the range
4 of disciplinary actions that are taken in the
5 schoolhouse itself for various kinds of behaviors.

6 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Have you seen
7 this form, "vicious violence inside school route
8 36"? There are three students named, and the form
9 says that some students received three-day
10 suspension, but they continued to misbehavior
11 behave, and they're afraid that somebody will get
12 hurt, and this also refers to a videotape that was
13 taken showing some of these students on 3/17/99, a
14 videotape.

15 DR. HORNBECK: No, it's not familiar to
16 me. I'll be glad -- as in any instance, I'll be
17 glad to specifically look into that. But, no, I
18 have not seen that.

19 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: All right. So
20 we would certainly appreciate it if you would get
21 back to the Chair, and then maybe this committee
22 can look at that.

23 And one other question on a separate
24 issue now.

25 DR. HORNBECK: Could we have a copy or

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 that?

3 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Yes.

4 DR. HORNBECK: Okay, great.

5 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Absolutely.

6 DR. HORNBECK: Thank you.

7 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Another issue,
8 the form we saw, the blue form about what we do in
9 health emergencies.

10 DR. HORNBECK: Right.

11 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Can we now say
12 -- I've been saying it anyway as I go across the
13 City that this is something that happened that
14 we're very glad happened. Was that form approved,
15 and will it be in schools by September?

16 DR. HORNBECK: It will be in all
17 schools by September.

18 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Okay, all
19 right.

20 Thank you, Madam President.

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERA: You're
22 welcome.

23 The Chair recognizes Councilman
24 Mariano.

25 COUNCILMAN MARIANO: Thank you, Madam

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 President.

3 Mr. Hornbeck, I have a son that's an
4 8th-grader that goes to AMY-5. Just through
5 personal experience, things that happened to us
6 this year but the books. Over the Easter
7 holidays, Vince didn't bring home his report card,
8 so I figured, He's got a bad report card and he's
9 hiding it from me.

10 So come Tuesday, when they go back to
11 school, I call the school, and the lady at the
12 front desk was forthright with all the
13 information, and I said, But Vince didn't get his
14 report card. Why didn't he? Why didn't he get
15 it? And she said, That's pretty easy. There's
16 one of two reasons -- either he didn't give it to
17 you or we're holding it because he didn't return a
18 book.

19 And sure enough, Vincent didn't return
20 a book, Martin Goes to Selma Alabama. Now, he
21 didn't realize that till he got there Monday.
22 Monday afternoon, he found it, then he had his
23 report card. And, you know, I thought he was
24 hiding it 'cause it may not have been that good,
25 but it was good, actually, and the lady was very

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 forthright at the desk.

3 So there's something that works in the
4 school. I don't know what the overall plan is,
5 but that was enough to get my attention.

6 DR. HORNBECK: Right.

7 COUNCILMAN MARIANO: And I'm busy with
8 some other things.

9 DR. HORNBECK: That's good news.

10 COUNCILMAN MARIANO: Point 2 is the
11 bus. Vince has been taking the bus all of 7th
12 grade, all of 8th grade. When the attendants were
13 on the bus, believe it or not, there was -- he was
14 a lot more serious in behavior on his and in what
15 happened on the bus. Now, he's an average
16 14-year-old, he's an 8th grader.

17 Since the attendants have been off the
18 bus, and he has Atlantic, so I don't think --
19 Atlantic is subbed out, and I don't think --
20 that's not members of your local?

21 DR. HORNBECK: Right.

22 COUNCILMAN MARIANO: And they start up
23 in the Northeast, way up at Fox Chase School.
24 Now, we've had several meetings with the parents.
25 I actually got some letters from two constituents

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 that Mr. Farlino (ph.) handled pretty well, where
3 parents aren't putting their children on the bus.

4 It seems now that the kids know what
5 buses had the cameras and what don't. Now, they
6 know that if they misbehave on bus 6745 -- I'm
7 just making up this number -- there's a black box
8 there. Well, nothing ever happens to them so,
9 therefore, in their mind, there's not a camera,
10 okay?

11 So if the bus driver doesn't report
12 them and if he does and there's nothing to
13 substantiate that request, now if they misbehave
14 on another number bus and they bring them in and
15 they say, Well, the kids are smart enough to
16 deduct that there's a camera on that bus, they
17 know what buses the camera's on. It took about a
18 month to two months to figure out what buses the
19 camera's on.

20 Vince doesn't take the bus anymore; he
21 gets tokens. One of his friends goes to Roman, he
22 gives him \$9, he gets the school bus tokens 'cause
23 they're not available, to my knowledge, at the
24 8th-grade level, and he does it himself -- much to
25 my wife's chagrin, she's nervous. I figure he's

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 got to learn it anyhow, so he might as well do it.
3 And it's better for him 'cause he's home on time
4 and he gets there faster and he can sleep late.

5 But they are a lot of people that can't
6 do that. From just personal experience, if we can
7 look at having the attendants back on these
8 buses. These kids are smart. Are they the most
9 well-behaved kids in the world? No, they're kids.
10 Are there some bad kids? Probably. I hate to say
11 that any kids are bad, but I hate to say they're
12 all good, including my son. I mean, things happen
13 when their peers are there and they're misbehaving
14 and they're trying to impress girls and whatever
15 happens among 7th- and 8th-graders.

16 It's just that that -- I could see the
17 difference. And I've met with the Atlantic
18 people, I met with the people from the School
19 Board, and they have one favorite bus driver who
20 happened to be an ex-policeman, and he even got in
21 a problem one time because he had to make a stop
22 and kids were throwing rocks at the bus and he had
23 to do something. Now, he's actually a police --
24 in fact, he might still be a policeman, I said
25 "ex," but he may still be a policeman, so they so

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 can't get him all the time.

3 I'm not sure what the answer is.

4 Obviously the kids are smart enough to know the
5 difference, and if we could have attendants of
6 every bus, if there's any way or any funding that
7 we can help with, I think it would be a good
8 thing, just to have another adult on that bus.

9 DR. HORNBECK: Well, one of the things
10 that I suspect -- and will bring it up if nobody
11 else does as a first step and you point this up --
12 is whether or not -- and I think maybe Councilman
13 DiCicco raised it the last time too -- is whether
14 we ought to really go ahead and consider spending
15 the \$450,000 that it would take to basically put
16 actual cameras with film on every bus, or at least
17 a heck of a lot larger ratio than it's --

18 COUNCILMAN MARIANO: My problem with
19 that is, eventually they're going to be smart
20 enough to figure out that there's something you
21 can buy at Radio Shack that neutralizes a
22 videotape. I'm sure Councilman Rizzo has one
23 'cause he's Inspector Gadget here. But there's
24 actually something with magnetic waves that you
25 can put up that erases the tape. It's only a

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 matter of time before somebody sees that.

3 I mean, there's nothing like a human
4 being. If we could put \$450,000 into cameras,
5 what's the difference? I don't know the
6 difference in the price but I'm sure to have
7 somebody working and to give their money back into
8 the tax base, 'cause that's what trying to do
9 here.

10 DR. HORNBECK: Well, the difference
11 with the cameras, like over four years, would be
12 \$15.5 million between four years' worth of savings
13 on attendants and a one-time expenditure.

14 COUNCILMAN MARIANO: But when you
15 figure that out, are you figuring into that what
16 we would get in City wage taxes back to that
17 attendant? Does that enter into your formula?

18 DR. HORNBECK: I'm looking at it in
19 this context, strictly in the context -- I guess
20 it would be 5 percent less than that, so it would
21 be something closer to \$14,250,000.

22 COUNCILMAN MARIANO: But mathematics
23 aside, I would say there's a human factor that has
24 to go that beside that cold 450 million minus the
25 5 percent. There's the money that that lady

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 spends in the grocery store that may be an
3 attendant. There's the money that that guy in the
4 grocery store makes because he's selling more
5 things. That might be another family that doesn't
6 move to New Jersey because everything's rosy in
7 New Jersey, we see the New Jersey education
8 commercials on TV every night.

9 DR. HORNBECK: There's nothing but
10 commercials on.

11 COUNCILMAN MARIANO: Yeah, well, I'm
12 sure everything's not rosy over there; they just
13 don't put their bad things on television.

14 DR. HORNBECK: Right.

15 COUNCILMAN MARIANO: But if you would
16 please figure the human factor into it. If it is
17 \$10 million, we could get it down, whatever it is,
18 you know?

19 DR. HORNBECK: This certainly will -- I
20 can't imagine it not being one of the issues that
21 will be considered by the Transportation
22 Committee. It is a -- that's a huge number,
23 though, of computers and reading specialists and
24 you, know all, kinds of things.

25 COUNCILMAN MARIANO: Right. Thank you.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: The Chair
3 recognizes Councilwoman Clark.

4 COUNCILWOMAN CLARK: I want to speak
5 about the textbook issue.

6 DR. HORNBECK: Textbook.

7 COUNCILWOMAN CLARK: What
8 accountability measures have been put in place?
9 So that principal's report, how they spend
10 textbook money. Did you understand that?

11 DR. HORNBECK: Yes. The accountability
12 measures are through the budget itself in the line
13 item related to books and other instructional
14 materials, I think, is what it's called. And so,
15 we track those expenditures in the same manner
16 that we track others, but that's the line item in
17 which that sets.

18 What has not been done yet, which is
19 the piece that -- this report to the board and
20 that I will report to Council on in a couple of
21 months is what, in effect, non-budget policies we
22 will use to track the textbook distribution and
23 collection and monitoring. But it will be a
24 system-wide way rather than an individual-school
25 way.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 COUNCILWOMAN CLARK: But Mr.
3 Superintendent, our problem is with individual
4 schools. Will each school have an inventory --
5 have a list of books that they purchased this year
6 so that they'll have purchased books, they'll have
7 distributed books, they'll have unexpended
8 dollars. Then if you read across the line, you
9 will see what each school did.

10 DR. HORNBECK: Yes.

11 COUNCILWOMAN CLARK: Do we have a
12 system like that so that on your desk, you can
13 tell which principals bought one book for each
14 child in each major subject?

15 DR. HORNBECK: On the budget front, in
16 terms of the whole school, we know how much
17 they've spent, and we have a mechanism for
18 tracking what they spent it on.

19 We do not presently have in place --
20 which is this other thing that we will have in
21 place by the summer -- a process by which we can
22 know in a routine fashion, on a system-wide basis
23 about, you know, Mrs. Jones' English class in Room
24 102. Historically, that's what's been left to the
25 school.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 COUNCILWOMAN CLARK: But that's what
3 has gotten us criticized.

4 DR. HORNBECK: That's why I'm saying
5 we're changing it.

6 COUNCILWOMAN CLARK: Okay.

7 DR. HORNBECK: I think that instead of
8 having what we've done historically, we need a
9 system-wide way of ensuring that each school
10 processes its books. And in my mind, there are
11 three parts to that: one is how do kids get the
12 books; the second is how do kids treat the books
13 during the year; and the third is how the school
14 gets the books back at the end of the year. And
15 there needs to be system-wide uniform processes
16 for that to happen so that next year, I would be
17 the position of saying, you know, this is the way
18 it happens.

19 COUNCILWOMAN CLARK: I think that if we
20 did the report, it would then permit us to see
21 which schools had not followed the practice, we
22 could see where we needed to help.

23 DR. HORNBECK: Correct.

24 COUNCILWOMAN CLARK: And to go in and
25 to intervene. I can remember Jeanette Brewer

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 saying to me year after year, We will solve the
3 school problem, and it just won't get solved and
4 stay solved.

5 It seems to me that a school-by school,
6 classroom-by classroom accounting of which
7 materials were acquired, which materials were
8 distributed, and which materials were returned
9 would give you a situation that would be fairly
10 clear on our instructional material distribution
11 system.

12 Now, if that system has holes in it,
13 you'll be able to see it and fix it without having
14 to tear the whole thing down.

15 DR. HORNBECK: Right.

16 COUNCILWOMAN CLARK: I'm anxious to see
17 this implementation. Will the report come to your
18 desk, will the system-wide report ultimately get
19 to you?

20 DR. HORNBECK: When will it get to me?

21 COUNCILWOMAN CLARK: I'm asking if it
22 will get to you.

23 DR. HORNBECK: Oh, yeah, absolutely.

24 As I said before, I'm really pleased that with
25 your leadership and ours and with Dr. Brewer's in

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 the beginning, that we've taken giant steps
3 forward. And I urge us all not to forget that
4 because there are lots more kids with books today
5 than three years ago, but we've still got 18 or 20
6 percent where we've not covered that yet.

7 And on top of that, as you suggest, we
8 don't know today classroom-by-classroom, and we
9 need to know that in order to go that last 18 to
10 20 percent. And that will be one that I will be
11 routinely informed about because I want to keep
12 improving this thing. I mean, I will give you a
13 report on Council on that.

14 COUNCILWOMAN CLARK: But you need to
15 get it early in the school year.

16 DR. HORNBECK: Absolutely.

17 COUNCILWOMAN CLARK: Like October, so
18 that we will then be able to fix it. You see, the
19 school year is essentially over.

20 DR. HORNBECK: I agree with you,
21 Councilwoman Clark. And I think of this a little
22 bit like I thought of that leveling process a few
23 years ago. As you know, when I came here, kids
24 didn't know who their teachers were, and teachers
25 didn't know who their kids were until November.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 And we've basically solved that problem, and kids
3 now, the leveling takes place in September.

4 Similarly, it's just crazy for -- even
5 if it's only 18 percent of the kids not to have
6 their books at the start of the school for 18
7 percent. So we need to find a satisfactory, final
8 -- I mean, we'll always have a handful of places
9 where a kid on a given day doesn't have a book,
10 but it ought to be down on, you know, the 1 or 2
11 or 3 or 4 percent level, not, you know, at 18
12 percent.

13 COUNCILWOMAN CLARK: And that would be
14 the kids' fault not the system's fault.

15 DR. HORNBECK: Well, that's true. And
16 quite frankly, in a lots of instances, it is. But
17 need to figure out ways to help the kid meet his
18 only responsibility in this thing too, which is
19 one of the reasons we will be doing the things
20 like Councilman Mariano said, making uniform
21 things like you don't get your report card if
22 don't get book back, and then we escalate it from
23 there.

24 I agree with you.

25 COUNCILWOMAN CLARK: But if you didn't

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 have a book and there's no book to bring back,
3 this kid's not going to do well if he didn't have
4 a book. So let's commit to him and to the public
5 that every child who attends will have a book in
6 every major subject not later than September.

7 DR. HORNBECK: I agree with you.

8 COUNCILWOMAN CLARK: And then we will
9 see which schools have failed, we will see which
10 classrooms and which schools have failed, and that
11 will be the place where we will put our emphasis
12 to correct the problem.

13 DR. HORNBECK: We shall do that; we are
14 doing that.

15 COUNCILWOMAN CLARK: I'm all out of
16 voice. Thank you.

17 DR. HORNBECK: Thank you. I hope that
18 gets better; that sounds awful.

19 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: And I would
20 certainly hope the report which would be
21 forthcoming would be much better than the one that
22 we received in the last month when we were told
23 that there were sufficient books in certain
24 schools, and then we were told by parents that
25 that was very, very inaccurate.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 The Chair recognizes Councilman Kenney.

3 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank you, Madam
4 Chair.

5 Considering the famous debates that
6 Councilmember Clark and myself have had over the
7 last seven years, I will resist on the opportunity
8 to pick on her today.

9 (Laughter.)

10 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: 'Cause I know she's
11 defenseless today. I'm fighting it a little bit
12 myself so I can understand.

13 A lot of the issues, Dr. Hornbeck, that
14 we discuss in this room relating to the School
15 District seem to revolve around basic issues,
16 basic issues of books. And now we have the basic
17 issue of safety on a bus.

18 When I read the story that I read in
19 the paper today by Kevin Haney about -- not the
20 main story, about which I have very much concern,
21 but the story down at the bottom that gives
22 examples of what exactly is happening on our
23 buses.

24 One young man actually grabbed the
25 steering wheel of the bus, jumped out the

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 emergency door, exposed his backside, urinated on
3 the bus, and shouted obscenities. He's been
4 written up time and time again, according to the
5 bus driver, and the most severe punishment that
6 that young man received was a week off the bus.

7 It would seem to me that that young man
8 needed to have some police contact -- not
9 necessarily to have him arrested or to have him
10 locked up, but to get him into a loop or a system
11 where a judge or a social worker or a psychiatrist
12 apparently would be able to make a determination
13 of what that young person needs before he's riding
14 on a bus to Curran Fromhold, because it seems as
15 if that's where he may be going at 20 or 21 or 22
16 years of age.

17 And I'll go a little further in the
18 story, where a young woman who rides the bus every
19 day from Juniata Park to Rush Middle School, and
20 it makes me sad that she's quoted as saying,
21 "They'll be fighting on the bus, jumping over
22 seats, and I get a headache every day." Her
23 attitude about going to school and doing well once
24 she gets there must be severely impacted, severely
25 impacted by what she goes through every day on

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 that bus, and that young woman should never have
3 to go through that, and I know you agree with me
4 on that.

5 A Meehan student hung out the bus
6 window so far that his hands almost touched the
7 tires. Now, we may save \$3 million on these bus
8 attendants, but what do you think we would be
9 paying if that young man's hands got caught in the
10 wheel of that bus and was killed? We would be
11 paying millions of dollars in a wrongful death
12 suit because of the lack of security and safety on
13 these. And the bus drivers says that basically,
14 no one wants to run the Meehan route; the Meehan
15 route is pretty -- apparently, a pretty infamous
16 route.

17 The last thing that's mentioned in the
18 story is that a driver of one of the Northeast
19 routes had to be transferred after an unruly
20 student's parent sent a threatening letter that
21 said, in the letter, "Don't make me F you up," the
22 letter warned. Was that person referred, or was
23 that incident referred to the Police Department
24 for the threat, the terroristic threats that were
25 made by that parent, for that parent to be

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 arrested by the Police Department? Because, from
3 my perspective, if you put that kind of threat in
4 writing, I think you deserve to be arrested.

5 The question is, how many problem
6 routes do we have? Now, I doubt every route is
7 problem so how many problem routes do we have?
8 How many routes do we have in total?

9 DR. HORNBECK: John, how many routes
10 are there?

11 There are 155 de-seg. routes.

12 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Do we have an idea
13 as to how many routes out of that 155 are problem
14 routes?

15 DR. HORNBECK: In '97 and '98, out of
16 the routes, there were 14 that were -- that
17 accounted for 77 percent of the behavioral
18 referrals. So, in effect, 14 during '97-'98, and
19 12 during '98-'99.

20 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Why are there not
21 bus attendants on at least those 14 routes?

22 DR. HORNBECK: Primarily because, at
23 this point, we don't see a connection between the
24 presence or absence of bus attendants and those
25 incidents.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 We had -- if we go back further, we
3 also had routes that accounted for 70, 75, 80
4 percent. So it does not appear that the variable
5 in these matters is the bus attendant. The
6 variable -- it goes back to the question, I think,
7 that Councilwoman Blackwell asked. Sometimes it's
8 the treatment of the kids. It may well be, I
9 don't know the real facts, I only know the Daily
10 News facts around those particular incidents.

11 But it may well be that an assistant
12 principal, for discipline, didn't respond
13 correctly, or they let people go too long, but
14 it's not -- there's no cause-effect relationship
15 that we determined between those things.

16 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Let me disagree.
17 If we stipulate for the sake of argument that at
18 least one or two of these issues in the story are,
19 in fact, accurate, would not a bus attendant have
20 been useful in keeping a young person from
21 grabbing a steering wheel or from hanging out a
22 window or from jumping out the emergency door?
23 Maybe not from urinating in the aisle, because I
24 don't know to what extent the attendant is
25 expected to do certain duties.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 But would there not have been a safer
3 condition for that poor bus driver trying to
4 negotiate and navigate streets with 20, 30
5 children in his care or her care, without having
6 another adult there to physically be able to
7 restrain people who are acting out in this
8 aberrant manner?

9 DR. HORNBECK: Well, I think it's got
10 to be the case that if there were another adult in
11 some of those instances, that the events might
12 well have ceased earlier than it did. Drivers
13 are, for example, when incidents take place like
14 some of those, they're instructed to stop the bus,
15 and they deal with 'em, and so the kid gets back
16 in from the window or the kid -- whatever.

17 One of the other things that I looked
18 at, because the issue of safety was raised with
19 respect to the buses themselves, was what's been
20 the safety record over the last several years?
21 And the fact is that in '95-'96, the last year
22 that we had attendants on all of those routes, we
23 had 156 accidents; the next year, when we had
24 partial removal of attendants, we had 122; the
25 next year, we had 117; and this year, we've had

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 only 38.

3 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: So I guess the bus
4 attendants were causing the accidents.

5 DR. HORNBECK: Well, no -- what I'm --
6 I wouldn't draw that conclusion. It doesn't seem
7 quite right to me that --

8 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Well, it sounds
9 like you're moving toward that conclusion.

10 DR. HORNBECK: No, what I'm moving
11 toward is the fact that all of the connections
12 that some people are making between bus attendants
13 and great tragedies and accidents and incidents is
14 a connection that simply doesn't hold up.

15 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Well, I would argue
16 -- again, stipulating to the accuracy of this
17 story, and I see no reason why this young lady
18 from Juniata Park would lie about what her
19 experiences are every more than.

20 For me, it is a basic requirement of
21 any business -- whether it's SEPTA, whether it's
22 the school system, whether it's any business -- to
23 make their customers and clientele safe. And not
24 only safe bus accidents, but safe from degradation
25 and safe from sexual exposure and safe from foul,

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 obscene language, and safe from all those issues.

3 DR. HORNBECK: Right.

4 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Because, you know,
5 it's not just the bus crashing into a car that's
6 the danger; it's what these children are exposed
7 to and experiencing every single day; and more
8 importantly, what their parents have to make a
9 decision to do about that, and that is perhaps
10 leave the system or leave this city.

11 And I go back to SEPTA's issue. A
12 number of years ago, SEPTA had a horrendous
13 reputation for unsafe subways, unsafe buses -- and
14 it's not perfect yet, but they made a concerted
15 effort to change that image. And from what I
16 understand from your testimony, you're not
17 necessarily aware of a lot of what's going on on
18 these buses because as a result of a question
19 where Councilwoman Blackwell talked about a tape
20 that was available, I mean, should not this not be
21 a primary issue on the agenda of the
22 Superintendent of the School Board as to what's
23 going on on these buses every day?

24 DR. HORNBECK: Absolutely, but not an
25 individual case that somebody brings up on a piece

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 of paper at a time when I have no foreknowledge of
3 that particular one.

4 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: And I respect
5 that. I just go back, I guess -- and this is a
6 comment. The things that we raise in here, the
7 things that we argue about, that we discuss, in my
8 mind, are some of the absolute basic issues
9 relative to running a school system or relative to
10 running any business.

11 DR. HORNBECK: Right.

12 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: And if we can't
13 deal with them, then I don't know -- you know, at
14 the top end, we're spending money on training
15 teachers to give the SAT-9 test, or we're hiring
16 post-secondary readiness coordinators. We're
17 doing lots of things on the Cadillac end. But on
18 the basic end, down at the bottom, we seem to be
19 ignoring some of the basic issues.

20 DR. HORNBECK: Well, I respectfully
21 course, of course, disagree with you about that,
22 and I tend to think something that is basic that
23 we have not spent much time talking about in the
24 School District is the 103,000 kids in the 145
25 schools read better and do math better and do

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 science better.

3 And I tend to think that the primary
4 obligation of a school district is to have kids
5 read and do math better and do science better, and
6 you can't get more basic than that, in my
7 judgment. And we've done a heck of a good job. I
8 would put us up against any school district in
9 American on that front, and I wish we would spend
10 more time talking about reading, writing, and
11 arithmetic and the record of teachers and kids and
12 parents principals on that front.

13 The one thing that will keep people in
14 this city, which is something -- an objective that
15 both you and I share, is a perception and the
16 reality that the schools are doing better with
17 their kids. And the proof is in the pudding in
18 the final example. Now, we can dance around the
19 edges of things, but in the final analysis, basic
20 is reading, and that is where my focus is.

21 But I do think that it's important, as
22 we are able to, to track both the incidents and
23 the accidents, and I was happy to see the
24 accidents going down at a time when we have
25 diverted \$4 million a year into things that I

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 think have not affected the basic safety of
3 children but has enhanced the opportunity of
4 schools to teach kids to read, by shifting money
5 from what in effect is administration to
6 instruction.

7 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Well, we could --
8 and I'm not going to do this today because I
9 promised that we were going to vote these bills
10 out of committee and I was not going to get into
11 this continuing argument, but we will disagree on
12 the way in which we judge the improvement of our
13 school system, because I think it's generally
14 based on a standardized test that, it could be
15 argued either way, really doesn't judge much.

16 I like to make judgments on kids going
17 to college, kids getting work, how long people
18 stay in the system, and how they perform. I think
19 the emphasis on this particular SAT-9 test, I
20 think, is misguided, and I do believe that we are
21 spending an awful lot of money and an awful lot of
22 effort to convince both teachers and the public at
23 large that this is somehow the be-all and end-all
24 of judgments when it comes to the performance of
25 our schools. And I will respectfully disagree

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 with you that I don't think that that's
3 necessarily the way to go.

4 But, again, the frustration that I have
5 is that other than voting these particular three
6 bills up or down -- which I'll never vote them
7 down, that would be irresponsible, so the only
8 option we have is to have these kinds of
9 discussions from time to time. And whether
10 they're any good or not remains to be seen.

11 DR. HORNBECK: I really wish that
12 somehow -- and I don't know how to do it that -- I
13 don't think we look just at the SAT-9. For
14 example, in the first accountability cycle, we
15 increased the percentage of high school kids
16 graduating on time by 4 percent. That's a
17 10 percent increase. That means that they're
18 ready to go to work and go to college.

19 We went and looked at the State test,
20 same trend lines. We went and appointed a
21 national panel of experts. All the people that
22 have these questions, we keep doing everything
23 they say to go do, and each one of them comes out
24 saying not only is it appropriate but it's in a
25 national leadership role. And I don't know what

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 to do other than to respond to everybody's
3 concerns in that way.

4 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I understand.
5 Thank you, Madam Chair.

6 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: The Chair
7 recognizes Councilman Rizzo.

8 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: Superintendent, you
9 mentioned about basics -- reading, writing, and
10 arithmetic. When I first got here to City Council
11 over three years ago the first time in this room
12 with the School District, we were discussing
13 books; the second year, we were discussing books;
14 and again, this year, we're discussing books.

15 With all due respect, if we can't fix
16 that problem and we're still discussing it -- you
17 just referred to your concern of reading, writing
18 and arithmetic. We really -- it's tough to even
19 discuss some of these other subjects and have
20 these discussions. Hopefully, this will be the
21 last time for a long time that we will ever have
22 to discuss the subjects of the very most basic
23 requirements in a school system.

24 My question: Part of the problem that
25 I see is the way things are packaged and

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 presented. Could you please describe to me how
3 the School District of Philadelphia communicated
4 to the parents, the teachers, the drivers of our
5 school buses, when you pulled the attendants from
6 the buses.

7 DR. HORNBECK: This was three years
8 ago, and I -- we can go back and look at what was
9 done. I done -- can't tell you -- no, I can't
10 tell you the answer. It would be in a memo of
11 three years ago.

12 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: We're talking about
13 today.

14 DR. HORNBECK: We didn't inform them
15 today; we informed them -- started taking
16 attendants off three years ago.

17 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: And there was no
18 communication to --

19 DR. HORNBECK: That's not what I said.

20 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: Well, I think that's
21 something you should know. If you're going to
22 take bus attendants from school buses, something
23 that important, and you're not familiar with how
24 that process occurred? I mean, I think I'd
25 remember.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 DR. HORNBECK: We made a decision three
3 years ago because the evidence was that it did not
4 -- and the evidence since then has demonstrated
5 that it doesn't -- affect the accident rate and it
6 doesn't affect materially the incident rate, and
7 it permits us to put millions more into books and
8 computers and reading teachers and those things.
9 We made the decision, an administrative decision
10 we make all the time.

11 Now, what precisely we said in a
12 memorandum to parents, I just don't know.

13 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: Was that approved by
14 the Board, that decision?

15 DR. HORNBECK: Of course. You wouldn't
16 make a decision to --

17 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: That's what I'm
18 asking you.

19 DR. HORNBECK: Yeah, sure.

20 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: Well, you said you
21 didn't recollect how --

22 DR. HORNBECK: No, no, you asked --

23 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: I asked how the
24 process -- how the decision was made.

25 DR. HORNBECK: Oh, I thought you asked

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 how it was communicated to parents.

3 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: I did; I asked both
4 -- how it was made and how it was communicated.

5 DR. HORNBECK: I don't remember
6 precisely how it was communicated to parents, but
7 the decision to take the attendants off was a
8 decision that the Board participated in.

9 Let me go back again where to it came
10 from. There has legitimately been a concern in
11 this Council and otherwise about how much money we
12 spend in the classroom and on instruction and how
13 much we spend on other things. And so one of the
14 first things that I did when I came was to ask the
15 Greater Philadelphia First Committee to identify
16 areas of savings that we could take in
17 non-instructional areas so that we could shift
18 that money over. And one of those recommendations
19 had to do with attendants.

20 And so we were, you know, in a sense,
21 skeptical -- for all the reasons that these
22 questions get raised, and that's why we went to do
23 what's frequently done in industry and, in effect,
24 benchmark our practice against other big cities,
25 against what other people do, what's the impact of

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 it. And what we discovered, much to our surprise,
3 was that we were the only school system that was
4 using attendants on non-special education routes.

5 And so we started down that path, with
6 the result that we have, but the Board was a part
7 of taking those several decisions related to all
8 of the cost savings, including attendants.

9 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: You just referenced
10 the Philadelphia First study of the non-
11 instructional areas.

12 DR. HORNBECK: Right.

13 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: Why wasn't it ever
14 done in the instructional area?

15 DR. HORNBECK: Well, banks are great at
16 non-instructional things; they're not real good at
17 reading, and so the first focus was on giving us
18 advice on how to improve our corporate practices.

19 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: So you wouldn't --
20 you don't have any confidence in Philadelphia
21 First's ability to review the educational arm of
22 the --

23 DR. HORNBECK: On how to teach
24 reading? No.

25 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: I yield to

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 Councilman Kenney.

3 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Councilman
4 Kenney.

5 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I think it's
6 absolutely absurd to expect that Dick Smoot (ph.)
7 is going to go into that school and do an audit
8 about instructional issues, but they do have the
9 ability to hire a firm of consultants, of experts
10 to do the instructional audit. That's, I guess --
11 I'm hoping that that's the question.

12 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: That's the question.

13 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: If we have so much
14 faith in the Greater Philadelphia First to do a
15 good job in exposing waste in the non-
16 instructional area, why don't we have the same
17 amount of faith in them to hire some national
18 experts, some academic think tank to come in and
19 look at the instructional areas at the same time?
20 Why did we avoid that particular area?

21 DR. HORNBECK: Well, primarily because,
22 as I just said -- I don't know how to say it more
23 clearly -- I don't have confidence particularly in
24 Greater Philadelphia First to even know who to
25 hire in the process. And I'm struck that -- this

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 is an issue that, in fact, we've been discussing.

3 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: We've discussed it
4 before.

5 DR. HORNBECK: One of the reasons we
6 focussed there is because that was the area of
7 scrutiny and interest, those were the questions,
8 and they were the areas of question until it was
9 revealed that that's not the way that we solve the
10 financial problem. Now people want to go find
11 some other area in that --

12 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Well, if
13 everything's being conducted appropriately and
14 you're doing your best and you're confident that
15 anybody who would look you -- just said in the
16 last round of question that anybody who wanted to
17 look at this would say that things are going well.

18 Why not allow -- I mean, I'm sure
19 there's got to be some Harvard-based, some
20 organization somewhere that we could at least
21 agree on that you have confidence in, that would
22 look at this whole entire instructional issue and
23 could maybe come up with some savings there.

24 DR. HORNBECK: Well, I don't object to
25 that, Councilman. It sounds a little bit like the

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 national panel that I think you and others were
3 enthusiastic about on the testing front. They've
4 now said that our testing process is not only
5 satisfactory but terrific, but you still have
6 questions about it. I don't mind Greater
7 Philadelphia First coming in and doing this.

8 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I'll go back to
9 relinquish --

10 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: Superintendent, I
11 would hope that the Greater Philadelphia First
12 organization would take a look at that process,
13 would be the school administration, to be able to
14 -- first of all, it amazes me -- I appreciate
15 Philadelphia First looking at the non-educational,
16 but you have a lot of professional people there.
17 And I know that it's always good to have someone
18 in with a fresh point of view, but you would hope
19 that if there's problems within the educational
20 process that you've identify those. And I know
21 that they're difficult to solve.

22 But I'd like to get back to my question
23 about the school bus attendants. Three years ago,
24 the decision was made. At the time, did you
25 communicate to anyone that you were achieving zero

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 attendants on these buses? In other words, three
3 years ago, was there ever a communication that
4 your goal was to have no attendants at all?

5 DR. HORNBECK: (Confers with staff.)

6 The communication from Central Office
7 went to the principals on that, telling them each
8 successive year what was going to happen in the
9 year subsequent. And that was the communication.

10 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: Clearly, it said to
11 zero?

12 DR. HORNBECK: Not in the first year.

13 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: No, eventually.

14 DR. HORNBECK: Yeah.

15 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: Was there a
16 three-year plan?

17 DR. HORNBECK: There was a three-year
18 plan that was adopted in the initial instance that
19 if it worked out in the first year and in the
20 second year, that we would keep going down that
21 line, and that's where we've gotten to as we
22 looked to September.

23 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: And the only people
24 that were in the loop on that discussions were the
25 principals, and that really never got out to

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 parents' groups? Or the first to surface it was a
3 media report publicly, when it went to the point
4 that it did this year?

5 DR. HORNBECK: I just don't remember
6 back three years. I'm sorry, Councilman.

7 COUNCILMAN RIZZO: Okay, if you don't
8 remember, you don't remember. But to me, this is,
9 obviously, one of the more controversial things
10 that has occurred in recent months, and I would
11 think that that would be something that we would
12 have recollection on. But since you don't, you
13 don't.

14 I thank you very much, Madam President.

15 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: You're
16 welcome.

17 The Chair recognizes Councilwoman
18 Miller.

19 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Thank you, Madam
20 Chair.

21 Dr. Hornbeck, I have a couple questions
22 too around instructional materials, and I also
23 have an opinion that I'd just like to express
24 regarding school safety and the bus attendants.

25 When the principals reported that they

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 had books or instructional materials, I'd like to
3 know as a part of the report that you'll be
4 submitting, whether those are old materials or new
5 materials. 'Cause that's key.

6 And, you know, I have a daughter in
7 public school, and a couple times when people said
8 they didn't have books, I talked to her about
9 books and talked to her teachers, and yes, they
10 did have books, but they were old books. They had
11 not ordered books in maybe ten years or what not.

12 So I'd like to know, of the materials
13 that they have, are they up to date or are they
14 old?

15 And is it a problem getting books?
16 'Cause when I read the report, a lot of the
17 schools reported that the books had been on order,
18 they had been ordered. What is the average length
19 of time it takes from an order to actually
20 securing the books?

21 DR. HORNBECK: Well, you know, there's
22 not a -- there's not a -- I mean, there's
23 obviously an average because all you do is add it
24 up and divide it. But there is not a normal time
25 -- let me put it that way -- that you can say

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 across the board.

3 What I've discovered as we've gotten
4 deeper and deeper in this is that weeks -- and in
5 some instances, even months -- can pass and that
6 we are not given priority. I mean, I said to
7 staff, you know, if I go to Borders and order a
8 book, they can have it to me the next day if they
9 can get it from another store, or I can have it
10 within ten days if they've got to order it.

11 But states, for example, like Florida
12 and Texas and California end up with priority on
13 shipping from textbook publishers because they are
14 what are referred to as "textbook adoption
15 states," and so they buy them, in effect, for the
16 whole state. They, in fact, determine the context
17 of textbooks because they can control so much of
18 the marketplace.

19 And one of the things that I've asked
20 this task force that I've been referring to to do
21 is to have conversations with some of these
22 publishers about the shipping schedule. Because
23 while we may not be Texas or California or
24 Florida, we're something bigger than a bread box
25 too, and we ought to be in position to have those

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 kinds of shipments take place in a more orderly
3 fashion so that people ought to be able to either
4 expect books within whatever -- two weeks, three
5 weeks, a month -- or to know when it is going be
6 and then be able to have our policies for ordering
7 books back it up so that we, in fact, have books
8 available in a timely fashion.

9 The last thing on this point that
10 speaks to timeliness is also another issue that
11 the task force will be looking, and that is how
12 many more books than you absolutely need should
13 you order of each group. Should you do a
14 5 percent overage or a 10 percent overage? So
15 that if a kid does, legitimately or
16 illegitimately, lose his book, he's not
17 necessarily without a book for some long period of
18 time, until some textbook publisher provides it to
19 him.

20 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Okay. What is
21 the average life of the textbook -- not in terms
22 of children's ability, whether they turn them back
23 in or keep them in good conditions, but just in
24 terms of the content, the curriculum content and
25 the use in the classroom?

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 DR. HORNBECK: Well, it will be
3 different for different subject areas. I mean,
4 English literature, in one sense, lasts forever
5 because the biggest bulk of it is classic. In an
6 algebra book, again, algebra is algebra is
7 algebra.

8 In a science book, you would have more
9 knowledge developing. And in things like 4th
10 grade science kits, where you actually have
11 consumables in there, it would be a year-to-year
12 kind of thing.

13 So it depends on the subject matter and
14 on the grade level as to the life expectancy.

15 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Okay. Is there a
16 set time limit that the School Board would
17 actually use an old book or a old version or a
18 five- or ten-year-old version of a book? Is there
19 a period of time where teachers or staff are
20 instructed not to use particular books, that they
21 should have ordered the newer version of that
22 book?

23 DR. HORNBECK: Well, it used to be the
24 case that teachers, schools kept books forever.

25 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Forever.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 DR. HORNBECK: Because there wasn't
3 serious allocation of book money. But with,
4 again, Council's leadership and our own over these
5 last four years, that's changed significantly. So
6 with an increase in the allocation for books,
7 that's much less a problem.

8 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Okay. Who
9 monitors -- I know you -- this is in regards to
10 accountability. I know that you're having a new
11 system put in place, but if I was the classroom
12 teacher or a principal and my school needed books,
13 who else would know that besides that principal?
14 Would the cluster leader know that? Right now, in
15 the old policy.

16 DR. HORNBECK: If there were a problem
17 with it, the cluster leader might know. Or if,
18 for some reason, something gave rise to a shortage
19 in money, the cluster leader might know.

20 But if it were a routine kind of thing,
21 the principal would be the moving party in that.

22 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: 'Cause in reading
23 your report, there was one high school in
24 particular, I think, that did not have books in at
25 least four of the major subject areas, and I just

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 wondered to myself, How could that happen? I

3 mean, it --

4 DR. HORNBECK: Well, it really arises
5 out of this historic policy of each school, in a
6 sense, setting its own policy and that's what --

7 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Right. And it
8 was for grades from 9 through 12, so it was almost
9 like, Well, nobody has any books.

10 DR. HORNBECK: Yeah, that's a piece of
11 it, it's an example of a reason that we need the
12 system-wide policy that we were referring to
13 earlier.

14 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Okay. So all
15 those individuals that reported that they did not
16 have books, do they have them now, do you know?

17 DR. HORNBECK: I don't think all of
18 them do at this point. But in every instance,
19 there's action that's been taken to solve the
20 problem.

21 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Okay. I just now
22 want to move the to area of school safety. You
23 know, the instructional and learning outcomes are
24 what parents want for children. School safety, of
25 course, is a number-one issue in Philadelphia

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 public schools and in all schools. Parents want
3 to know that when their children leave their house
4 in the morning, that they're going to travel to
5 school safe. And, you know, communities help by
6 putting together safe corridors, and the Police
7 Department helps by having crossing guards and
8 other police personnel.

9 And once child gets on a school bus --
10 my daughter rode a school bus for eight years --
11 half of the time with an attendant, and toward the
12 end, without an attendant. Her principal --
13 Mr. Crumley (ph.), you remember him from Fitler?
14 He was like a sergeant in the army and he thought
15 his children were his platoon but Crumley felt
16 that his kids did not need bus attendants. But
17 when the new principal came, she decided to do bus
18 attendants.

19 So doesn't the bus attendant stay at
20 the school and provide assistance inside the
21 school during the day?

22 DR. HORNBECK: That was the case in
23 many, many instances when there were bus
24 attendants, yes.

25 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Well, I'm not

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 really that up to date on how much -- on what type
3 of personnel you have in the schools anymore. I
4 know there was a time when some schools lost
5 classroom aides and stuff like that. It would
6 seem to me that having a bus attendant fill in,
7 help out during the day in a particular school
8 would be very helpful and very useful to that
9 particular school. I don't know if a school like
10 Fitler where the total school is de-seg., there
11 are very few children in the school that walk to
12 school.

13 But I would support -- I would support
14 and I would say that it's money well spent when it
15 deals with children's safety. And I would support
16 the call to ask the School District to reexamine
17 its decision and keep the bus attendants on the
18 schools.

19 I want to ask you, though, what happens
20 to children that need to be disciplinary,
21 particularly if they go to one of the de-seg.
22 programs more than an hour or so away? Are those
23 children at some point just told that they are no
24 longer allowed to ride the bus? And if that
25 happens and if their school is an hour and a half

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 away, what happens; do they transfer back to the
3 neighborhood school or just what?

4 DR. HORNBECK: That certainly could be
5 a sort of a bottom-line, final solution. But
6 before you would get there, a step short of that
7 would be being suspended from the yellow bus but
8 being given a token for riding SEPTA.

9 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Mm-hmm. Well, I
10 don't know that the tokens help. I mean, some of
11 the behavior that's in this article is just
12 outrageous, and I don't even know whether a bus
13 attendant would help in some of these cases 'cause
14 to me, they're very extreme.

15 But I believe that school safety is an
16 issue. I have found the attendant very helpful.
17 I've talked to the them if I went to visit my
18 daughter's school, and I think most parents would
19 support the call to keep the bus attendants on the
20 bus.

21 I don't have any more questions right
22 now, Madam President.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Thank you.

24 The Chair recognizes Councilman Cohen.

25 COUNCILMAN COHEN: Thank you, Madam

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 safety. Parents are worried when the kids go on
3 buses and they hear reports or see stories like
4 this. I think it's unrealistic to expect in a
5 long bus ride that kids are all going to be
6 well-behaved because we really want the attention
7 of the drive on the road, not on how the kids are
8 behaving.

9 I just wish I could feel that the whole
10 School District really took this seriously and
11 felt that maybe in theory, we ought not to have
12 attendants. You know, maybe kids ought to all be
13 so well-behaved and so responsible that there
14 would be no need for them, but it seems to me that
15 as a parent, parents legitimately are very
16 concerned about the safety of their kids on the
17 way to school, on the way back.

18 I got a letter very recently from a
19 neighbor, two long pages, a very eloquent letter
20 of a neighbor who's a grandparent of a child at
21 Roosevelt Middle School in Mt. Airy, talking about
22 the question of safety in the school building.
23 There have been a number of incidents there. I've
24 begun inquiries there. I'm told that the school
25 principal was told, Well, if you want an

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 additional attendant in the schools, then the
3 principal's going to have to divert money from
4 other purposes in the budget. And that seems to
5 me not a good approach.

6 I just think that on the very little
7 unglamorous issues, on the nuts-and-bolts issues,
8 there's got to be much more of a hand-on
9 approach. I think the concept of driving buses
10 without attendants is not a good concept -- even
11 if every other city in the country did it. I
12 don't find that as a measure of success because
13 we're dealing with Philadelphia's problems.
14 Philadelphia crime and safety are very important
15 issues, and I think they've got to be dealt with
16 as thoroughly as the instructional issues and the
17 ability of kids to do math and read and so forth.

18 So I'd like to urge you to really
19 personally get involved and not just have staff do
20 it. For example, I sent a letter to you about two
21 weeks ago about parent involvement in schools,
22 because in meeting with people, they tell me some
23 of these charter schools I discussed with them
24 about them, and I find that the main point that
25 comes through when I talk to parents about the

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 importance of charter school is the involvement of
3 parents. And I know parents that send their kids
4 to charter schools are usually parents who are
5 already very much interested in school problems,
6 so it's natural that there's that deep
7 involvement.

8 But I sent you a letter suggesting a
9 much deeper involvement, and I get back what
10 obviously was intended not to look like one, but
11 it was a form letter outlining four general things
12 in which the School District takes great pride and
13 certain advances in so-called parent involvement.
14 But I was talking about real parents' involvement.
15 I was talking about -- you know, people write
16 whose kids go to the school, getting involved in
17 issues not just in sales of candy or raising money
18 for curtains. I'm troubled by the fact that there
19 are parents that believe that all they're wanted
20 for in the public schools, as far as involvement
21 is concerned, is to raise money, but to stay far
22 away from basic issues. In the charter schools,
23 they seem to involve parents in basic issues.

24 And I would just hope that you and
25 others at the top level get down to the nuts and

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 bolts. You know, it's great that you're working
3 in the upper areas. I'm delighted by what appears
4 to be the educational progress, but I think we've
5 got to be able to have a situation in which the
6 parents are comfortable with their kids' safety
7 going and coming and in the school system.

8 And if, say, at Roosevelt School, there
9 seems to be some problems, I don't think the
10 burden ought to be just on the principal to take
11 money away from something else. I think the
12 School District ought to look at the whole thing.
13 Maybe one solution is to give that school an extra
14 attendant in the hallways. I don't know what the
15 precise problem is and I'm not trying to
16 substitute for the ultimate judgment of the School
17 District.

18 But I would feel better if I felt that
19 the top -- let's call it the "top brass" in the
20 School District were really involved in the very
21 basic things that parents worry about. From the
22 moment the kid leaves the house that morning,
23 they're worried about school safety. I'm sure
24 Councilwoman Miller was worried about the safety
25 of, you know, her daughter when the bus attendants

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 were removed.

3 I think at the current time, it would
4 be very important to do everything we could to
5 make people feel much more comfortable, the
6 parents. And I think you do it in the safety
7 issues by not appearing to want to get rid of the
8 attendants but seeing that every bus -- I think
9 every bus probably ought to have an attendant.

10 And if there's a financial problem, I
11 think I ought to be presented frankly so we could
12 deal with that, and I don't think the answer would
13 lie in taking away from instructional to provide
14 bus attendants, but maybe it means that the 15
15 million that the City adds to the regular budget
16 appropriation, maybe that should be 20 million.
17 I've never understood where that 15 million came
18 from. I assume it's some magical number that some
19 brains unidentified, you know, discovered that
20 15 million what was needed, because we've never
21 discussed it in City Council. I've personally
22 been afraid to raise the issue for fear we might
23 lose it, but I don't know where that 15 million
24 comes from. I think maybe the figure out to be
25 20, 25, 30 million if it's going to deal with the

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 kinds of issues we're raising.

3 So I would hope on out of all of these
4 issues, like I think there's a common thread
5 between Councilman Kenney and you, and I don't
6 know why you ought to be quarreling. I think he
7 ought to recognize of the School District, and I
8 think you ought to recognize the issues he raises
9 as being issues that a lot of parents are being
10 concerned about.

11 Now, just having said that, they're
12 comment; they're really not questions. The one
13 question I have is about the magnet school at the
14 Northeast High School. I was there, did not
15 participate in the discussion but listened
16 intently. I'm interested in general and
17 interested as a 1931 graduate of Northeast High
18 School, when it was at Eighth and Lehigh. I may
19 be the oldest living graduate of Northeast High
20 School who will admit to having gone to Northeast
21 High School, I don't know.

22 But can that matter be resolved? I was
23 delighted that Councilman Nutter seems to be fully
24 informed about that. He's cochairman of some
25 committee.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 But I think it would be so good for the
3 public school system to not have not have parents
4 like those I viewed that night at Northeast High
5 School feeling that what they've worked for so
6 hard and for so long is being threatened by the
7 School District.

8 DR. HORNBECK: It's very much my hope
9 that in the foreseeable future, that through
10 good-faith conversations among a lot of people
11 that, in fact, we will find a resolution to the
12 set of issues that have been raised at Northeast
13 that respond to what are a number of legitimate
14 interests that superficially appear to be in
15 conflict with each other, but I don't think are.

16 I think that the program is a really
17 fine program. There has been from time to time
18 some suggestion that while the changes in School
19 District policy were in part in response to kids
20 that have been excluded from participation, those
21 comments, quite frankly, do not pertain, for
22 example, around issues of race to Northeast High
23 School. Mr. Matterazza (ph.), the principal, the
24 parents, they've all worked very hard to have a
25 very diverse program there.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 So that I think a lot of people are
3 operating in good faith, and I think that we have
4 a very high degree of likelihood that we'll be
5 able to come to a satisfactory conclusion on that
6 because nobody wants that program to maintain its
7 high standards more than I.

8 COUNCILMAN COHEN: Very good. And I
9 just urge time. I think it would be good to put
10 that problem to rest as quickly as possible.

11 DR. HORNBECK: I agree.

12 COUNCILMAN COHEN: Thank you, Madam
13 Chair.

14 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: You're
15 welcome.

16 The Chair recognizes Councilman Nutter.

17 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: Thank you, Madam
18 Chair. I will be brief.

19 Dr. Hornbeck, to go back to some of the
20 earlier discussion. While I, at the time,
21 disagreed with the recommendation and the decision
22 to remove the bus attendants from the buses, that
23 was a decision that is within the discretion of
24 the School District. You made the decision, you
25 thought you made it for the right reason, and

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 you've come to explain that there's no data that
3 indicates that one way or the other it seems to
4 impair the safety of the children. That's your
5 view, that was your judgment at the time. We have
6 a difference of opinion about that, but we differ
7 on a number of things and we agree on a number of
8 things.

9 Is it also true, though, that that
10 decision was at least in part influenced by the
11 recommendations of the, I guess, the GPF group
12 that made a wide variety of recommendations for
13 how to save money in the school system. That was
14 one you took, there may be others that you didn't
15 take, and so you find yourself, I guess, in a
16 situation of trying to respond to one group's
17 good-faith recommendations on how to save money
18 for a district that is in a fairly serious fiscal
19 crisis balanced with some public safety issues and
20 some analysis that it may or may not make a
21 difference.

22 If there's a body on the bus and then
23 you've tried to, I guess, kind of be somewhere in
24 the middle by putting cameras on some and the
25 appearance of a camera on the others. I think

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 Councilman DiCicco has taken you down the path
3 about putting more cameras on buses. And maybe
4 that is something that you should continue to
5 pursue.

6 Having said all of that, aren't there
7 other recommendations that you received either
8 from GPF or other outside groups to save money
9 that you have rejected? For instance, didn't
10 someone recommend that you stop providing either
11 nursing services or some health-care services
12 because we would get volunteer contributions from
13 either hospitals or something along those lines?

14 DR. HORNBECK: Yes. There was a
15 recommendation in an overview that we could reduce
16 our cost by \$70 million over the next 5 years for
17 student health services by, in effect, looking to
18 providers to give us those services free, is the
19 way I think of it.

20 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: And you essentially
21 rejected that because you didn't think it was
22 plausible, and you didn't want to jeopardize the
23 health and safety of the students.

24 DR. HORNBECK: That's correct.

25 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: Now, three years

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 ago, when the bus attendant decision was made, I
3 believe my recollection is that that was disclosed
4 publicly, and it may have here through the budget
5 process. Is that accurate or inaccurate?

6 DR. HORNBECK: That's correct. We
7 informed the principals, the budget process itself
8 -- in fact, I think, in City Council hearings at
9 the time, we had that discussion. We've had that
10 discussion each year here.

11 It was also a part of the discussions
12 that I and leaders of GPF had with editorial
13 boards at newspapers. I mean, it was a widely
14 known phenomenon in that sense.

15 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: So it's not
16 something that's now come out of the clear blue
17 sky, three years later.

18 DR. HORNBECK: No. And when I was
19 saying while ago that I couldn't remember the
20 communication, the only thing that I can't
21 remember is what the exact wording was of some
22 memorandum that may have gone to parent
23 themselves, but it was very widely known and
24 debated because there are these legitimate
25 questions that are raised.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: Right.

3 DR. HORNBECK: And we've tried to
4 pursue those. But yes, in many, many forums, it's
5 been a major issue.

6 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: It may be helpful
7 if you could provide to the Chair, if you would go
8 back to when this idea originated, if you have
9 copies either of your testimony back from that
10 time. I'd be interested to know what the
11 discussion was here in the chamber, what members
12 would have heard or not heard back at that time.
13 Because, I mean, just if somebody tells you
14 something three years ago, you can't act like
15 you're hearing it for the first time three years
16 later.

17 The last thing is. . . on the issue of
18 GPF and what they've done or not done, have you
19 asked them to take a look at the non-instructional
20 areas, or did they offer -- I'm sorry.

21 DR. HORNBECK: Instructional.

22 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: Did you ask them to
23 look at the instructional areas, or did they
24 express an interest in only looking at the
25 non-instructional areas? And if they did ask to

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 look at the instructional areas, what did you do
3 about it? And if they only expressed an interest
4 in looking at the non-instructional, why was
5 that?

6 DR. HORNBECK: In the initial instance
7 four years ago when I first came, the only area
8 that they were interested in or that I asked them
9 about pursuing -- the prototype that the Mayor had
10 used as he came into -- I mean, I took it directly
11 from that -- were the non-instructional
12 activities, not the substantive things; in the
13 same way that the Mayor didn't ask experts on
14 policing to come and do policing or garbage
15 collection on garbage collection or social
16 services, but did effectively ask in effect,
17 corporate-practice-wise. I did the same thing.

18 In the last year -- now, in the last
19 six months, there has been some conversation as we
20 have in effect now, at the end of three years,
21 saved more money than they originally suggested
22 that we could save. And as we have begun to take
23 steps to change the culture, the way of thinking
24 at the School District to one of stewardship, we
25 have had a discussion with the Management and

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 Productivity Task Force around the issue of what
3 would it mean if we looked at the instructional
4 practices? Is there a perspective that GPF might
5 bring to that, either themselves or through, as
6 Councilman Kenney suggested, hiring somebody that
7 would be useful.

8 And we frankly haven't come to a
9 conclusion, acknowledging at the same time that it
10 is not as though the instructional practice is not
11 under a very high degree of scrutiny through the
12 several-million-dollar evaluation process that has
13 been set up at the University of Pennsylvania by a
14 group called CPRE there. It's the Consortium of
15 "something, something, something" -- I don't
16 remember.

17 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: I know, read about
18 it in the paper.

19 So you're not opposed to them looking
20 at it.

21 DR. HORNBECK: No.

22 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: It didn't start out
23 that way. It started one way, and if they want to
24 or if somebody else wants to, you'd be pleased to
25 have them, but it just didn't happen so far, but

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 you're under discussions about it.

3 DR. HORNBECK: That's correct.

4 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: Okay.

5 DR. HORNBECK: We have been -- I don't
6 think there's been any school district in the
7 history of the world that has been more open than
8 we have in the last four years. I mean, we've got
9 33 audits done, we got CPRE evaluating us, we've
10 got Columbia University evaluating us. I mean --

11 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: Okay. That's all I
12 want to know. Thank you.

13 Thank you, Madam Chair.

14 DR. HORNBECK: Thank you.

15 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Thank you.

16 At this point in time, I would ask all
17 Councilmembers who are listening to the testimony
18 to please come to the chamber.

19 I believe we have -- are there any
20 other questions from members of the committee?

21 (No further questions at this time.)

22 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Thank you
23 very much, Mr. Hornbeck.

24 DR. HORNBECK: Thank you, Madam
25 President.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Francis

3 Garner.

4 (Francis Garner comes forward.)

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Do we have
6 anyone else to testify after Mr. Garner?

7 (Oscar Rosario raises hand.)

8 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: If you'll
9 please approach the table, the witness table.

10 Good morning. Please identify yourself
11 for the record and proceed with your testimony.

12 MR. GARNER: Yes, good morning.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Please take a
14 seat.

15 MR. GARNER: Thank you. Good morning,
16 Madam President. My name is a Francis Garner.
17 That's G-A-R-N-E-R. I'm a bus driver with the
18 School District of Philadelphia. I work out of
19 the Passyunk Avenue garage.

20 May I stand for a moment, please?

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Certainly.

22 MR. GARNER: I would like everyone here
23 to, please, take a look. I've been 22 years with
24 the --

25 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Excuse me,

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 you're going to have to use the microphone only
3 because the stenographer cannot hear you. You can
4 stand to make your presentation and hold the
5 microphone -- that's entirely up to you.

6 MR. GARNER: Thank you.

7 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Mm-hmm.

8 MR. GARNER: I just wanted you to take
9 a look. This is the way I drive my school bus
10 every day, and I catch hell. Okay?

11 (Mr. Garner is dressed professionally
12 in a school bus driver's uniform.)

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Why is that?

14 MR. GARNER: Because of some of the
15 children on your de-seg. and on your so-called
16 special ed. runs.

17 When I first started two years ago, I
18 had a special -- excuse me, I had a de-seg. run in
19 the Northeast. This sheet here is a list -- this
20 is from the School District -- of the procedures
21 we have to go through before we can do certain
22 things with the children. It's 16 steps here that
23 we have to go through with children before we can
24 actually do certain things with the children,
25 disciplinary action with these children.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Do you mind
3 if we make photostatic copies of that so that
4 every member will have it?

5 MR. GARNER: Yes, ma'am.

6 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Thank you.
7 Please proceed.

8 MR. GARNER: Yes, ma'am. I'm here and
9 I'm crying for help for bus attendants and aides.
10 Without using any names, in January of this year,
11 on one of our buses out of the Passyunk yard, the
12 children graffitied the inside of the bus, pulled
13 the window down, sat outside the window, wrote
14 along the side of the bus -- this was while the
15 operator is operating the bus. They tore up three
16 to four seats down to the metal frame. All this
17 was done while the driver was riding this bus.
18 There was no bus attendant or no aide on board.

19 Another incident. One of my coworkers
20 was fired. He was accused of verbal sexual
21 harassment of some middle-school girls. Their
22 word against his. Again, no bus aide, no bus
23 attendant. If one of those would have been on
24 board, it's my opinion that they would have said
25 no, this didn't happen. I don't believe it

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 happened. I wasn't there, see, and this is the
3 problem -- it's their word against his.

4 Even with some of the de-seg. -- excuse
5 me, some of the special ed. runs, there are times
6 when there is not a bus attendant or aide on
7 board. The garage will still send you out that
8 way. It happened to me. I have students that
9 will bang their heads. I have students that are
10 subject to fits, seizures. And sometimes we are
11 sent out this way. I am telling you that bus
12 attendants are needed on these buses.

13 I also have papers here where I have
14 been attacked. I have copies here. Where I have
15 been attacked on the bus, causing me to bring the
16 bus to an abrupt stop. Again, this is not
17 hearsay; this is official.

18 I've been lied on. And this is
19 something I want Mr. Hornbeck and everybody here
20 to understand. If a student -- be it male or
21 female -- makes an accusation against a driver,
22 that driver is now under the microscope. He or
23 she is subject to disciplinary action solely on the
24 words of these students. Here we go again. If
25 you have a bus attendant or aide on the bus, they

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 can say yea or nay to what this student is saying.

3 Earlier Mr. Hornbeck had said that he
4 received information late. It is my opinion --
5 these are pink slips, what we call "pink slips,"
6 the bus referrals for misbehavior on the bus. If
7 the principals and the other school staff would do
8 their jobs and forward these things, to Mr.
9 Hornbeck, he would know about it. Too much stuff
10 is kept in-house, as I call it. They want to keep
11 it undercover as if everything is going along
12 smoothly, and it's not so.

13 There's a lot that goes on that needs
14 to be known about I do not know why principals
15 just -- they just want to keep things -- I don't
16 if it makes them look bad because they have a
17 number of disruptive students coming out of their
18 school, but it is a very serious matter.

19 Yesterday, I had a student -- now, this
20 happened yesterday, although it happened in
21 school, but we as drivers get the spill-over. A
22 student stabbed another with scissors, pulled the
23 young lady's pants down, and I have it right here.
24 It's not my say-so, it's the actual suspension
25 note from the school. I think copies were made,

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 but this is the actual suspension note. And the
3 student hit the teacher.

4 Again, these are spill-overs. A lot of
5 this, I'm sure, does not get back to Mr. Hornbeck,
6 but this is something that goes on and on. And
7 almost every driver in the School District can
8 give you some insight, some incident that has
9 happened with him or her. I'm telling you, the
10 aides are really needed.

11 And again, I was lied on. I think you
12 have a copy of that. A student lied on me about
13 having -- I think there's a copy on your desks.
14 The student lied on me about turning in a doctor's
15 slip. The student was supposed to be back in
16 school -- not be back in school unless he had his
17 doctor's slip. When the student boarded my bus, I
18 was told I had take this student to school even
19 though he didn't have a note. When the student
20 arrived at school, they asked him where the note
21 was. He said, "I gave it to Mr. Garner."

22 That afternoon when I returned to
23 school, the school was up and down my back -- why
24 did I not give this note to the proper
25 authorities. I said, "What note?" Come to find

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 out the student had lied. Even his grandmother
3 had lied 'cause they all said that this note was
4 supposed to have been available.

5 Again, we are like stepchildren, we
6 drivers. I'm telling you, this is not a joke. I
7 don't know how much more I can strongly say this
8 to make it clear. And what scares me so badly is
9 that anything a student says -- and especially
10 when they tell it to their parent and they bring
11 it to the school -- is going to be followed
12 through. Now I'm accused, and my reputation is
13 ruined. Even if it's clear that once it hits the
14 paper, then the retraction is going to be a
15 half-inch big. And it's just a mess.

16 I have one more thing to say, then I
17 will --

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Excuse me
19 before you go any further, Mr. Garner.

20 MR. GARNER: Yes.

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: You spoke
22 about the incident that occurred yesterday.

23 MR. GARNER: Yes, ma'am.

24 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: And I am just
25 reading the report. You mean to tell me a child

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 gets one day of suspension for stabbing another
3 child with a scissor and pulling a girl's pants
4 down?

5 MR. GARNER: Yes, ma'am. And that's
6 official, that's from the school. That's nothing
7 I made up. That was my copy of --

8 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Well,
9 wouldn't this child have to go before the School
10 Board? Or what action is normally taken?

11 MR. GARNER: Well, I don't -- I'm not
12 sure.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: It's
14 just. . .

15 MR. GARNER: But as you see there,
16 Madam President --

17 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: I wouldn't
18 want anybody to think that a child just receives
19 one day's suspension for doing something like
20 that. I would think that that child would have to
21 have some kind of action taken against him.

22 MR. GARNER: Well, the child is just --

23 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: Excuse me, Madam
24 Chair. I guess we've heard an assumption or a
25 belief that the fact that there are, in fact,

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 alleged scissors involved here, I believe that

3 would be --

4 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: It's a

5 weapon.

6 COUNCILMAN NUTTER: -- classified as a

7 weapon and subject to Act 26. I think that's the

8 correct terminology, which is a disciplinary

9 procedure.

10 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: I wouldn't

11 want anybody to think that for something like

12 this, the child receives just one day's

13 suspension.

14 Miss Ingram, can we get a report from

15 -- oh, I'm sorry, Dr. Hornbeck, I didn't see you

16 there. Can we get a report on what happens in

17 this case, please.

18 DR. HORNBECK: Councilman Nutter is

19 correct, it is Act 26. And when there's a weapon

20 in the school, it is --

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: So it's not

22 just one day's suspension?

23 DR. HORNBECK: No, no.

24 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: That's what I

25 wanted to bring to the floor. I didn't want

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 anybody to think that it's a one-day suspension.

3 DR. HORNBECK: I'm glad you cleared
4 that up.

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Thank you.

6 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Madam
7 President?

8 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Yes, the
9 Chair recognizes Councilwoman Blackwell.

10 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank you. In
11 an incident like this, Mr. Garner also says that
12 he thinks that the student also hit a teacher.

13 In an incident where there's a severe
14 problem with school violence at the school, does
15 not the parent come? Does that kid automatically
16 get the bus? Or what happens, does a child just
17 go on like business as usual on a bus, with a lot
18 of other students? That's a serious issue.

19 MR. GARNER: If I may. According to
20 the suspension notice, the child was suspended
21 today. This incident happened yesterday. He is
22 suspended today. According to the notice, he is
23 to come to school Wednesday with his parent.

24 What's going to happen after that, we
25 don't know. And I don't know if it's going to

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 continue after that or what but right --

3 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: So if the
4 child is suspended, then they serve out the rest
5 of the school day, go back home on the bus, and
6 then bring the parent to school the next day.
7 Well, do they say anything to you? Do you know
8 that that child is suspended?

9 MR. GARNER: Yes, that's why I had a
10 copy. They gave me a copy because I just cannot
11 tell a child, "You cannot board my bus" without
12 authorization from the school, that's what that
13 letter was for. And so I had a copy of the letter
14 letting me know that that child was not to ride on
15 my bus today. I had to take him home yesterday,
16 but he was not to ride today. He's to come to
17 school tomorrow with his parent.

18 Now, what's going to happen after that
19 if he's suspended any longer, I will then be
20 issued another note telling me that it's been
21 extended.

22 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: On the day of
23 the occurrence, the day the child had the scissors
24 and all this happened, did the child go home with
25 you on the bus?

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 MR. GARNER: Yes, ma'am, that
3 afternoon.

4 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Did you know
5 then -- did they give you a note or did they let
6 you know somehow that that child had had a problem
7 that day? Because it seems to me, that could be a
8 bus incident report because the child is angry
9 because of something that happened at school.

10 MR. GARNER: Well, yes, and you're
11 exactly right. We do get a lot of spill-over,
12 you're exactly right.

13 But yes, yesterday afternoon, his
14 teacher came out, gave me a note to make sure I --
15 they wouldn't give it to him and made sure they
16 gave it to me so I could get it to parent. And
17 she gave me a copy. She said this is because he's
18 suspended, and he's not allowed back on your bus
19 until he is brought to school and this has been
20 resolved.

21 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: In your
22 experience, do you have problems with students
23 like this who are angry because of whatever
24 happened at school and get on the school bus that
25 afternoon and then have outbreaks?

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 MR. GARNER: It has happened, yes.

3 Without a doubt, it has happened. And sometimes
4 things come from home, where they get on a bus
5 angry from things that come from home. And they
6 figure they can't act out against the parent, so
7 they act out on the school bus.

8 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: I'm concerned
9 also, Madam President, about an individual. It's
10 obvious that Mr. Garner is a fine, upstanding
11 person who's committed to his job, and it takes
12 courage to come and speak out when people are
13 around you.

14 But I'm concerned about a person's
15 reputation if they are, in fact, blamed and
16 there's no witness. It seems to me that that's
17 another reason. It seems to me that this whole
18 issue of bus attendants, in the final analysis,
19 may be worth the investment for all of the
20 problems that we have, with all of the reputations
21 at stake, with all of the incidents violent
22 crimes.

23 My goodness, when we had hearings on
24 school violence back in the early '80s -- I don't
25 even remember when we had our first hearings -- we

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 weren't even talking about buses at that point.
3 Now here we're trying to deal with them in schools
4 and in school yards and in neighborhoods, and so
5 the activity has gone to the buses because we've
6 removed the attendants. And it seems to me that
7 we can't be a part of solving a problem if we
8 create another one.

9 And certainly, I would hope that
10 Council would look at it and that the
11 Superintendent would certainly give us, if he
12 hasn't given us, the figures involved. And that
13 we need to consider having bus attendants on buses
14 so that we protect children and certainly the bus
15 drivers. I have even heard of incidents where bus
16 drivers have pulled over, and they've had
17 incidents where -- there was an incident on the
18 news a few months ago, and people thought maybe
19 the bus driver had lost his mind. And I
20 understand there was so much going on on the bus
21 that he could not prove without a witness and that
22 that was the reason for a problem.

23 So I would really, really certainly ask
24 that we have all the figures concerned with what
25 bus attendants cost and what it would cost to have

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 them replaced. And I think the School Board ought
3 to consider the option. It may not be worth -- it
4 may not be worth the alternative of not having bus
5 attendants and school violence and putting people
6 in jeopardy and all of these myriad cases you may
7 have with bus attendants who are working and
8 children on buses. It may be less expensive to
9 just have the attendants back.

10 So I would certainly hope that the
11 Superintendent would provide this information to
12 the President, just how much it costs, and give us
13 some options that you would like to explore so
14 that we may make some obviously intelligent
15 decisions.

16 It's obvious that something is very,
17 very wrong here, and we would like to be a part of
18 the solution -- certainly not a part of this
19 ongoing problem.

20 Thank you, Madam President.

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Thank you.

22 The Chair recognizes Councilwoman
23 Miller.

24 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Mr. Garner, I
25 think you reported that your school bus is for

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 special education?

3 MR. GARNER: Yes, ma'am.

4 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Well, don't you
5 have an attendant? I thought that --

6 MR. GARNER: Yes, ma'am.

7 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: You do have an
8 attendant?

9 MR. GARNER: Yes, ma'am.

10 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Okay.

11 MR. GARNER: But there are times where
12 if she is out sick, I don't get a replacement.
13 And like I said, I have one child who likes to
14 bang his head, and she sits besides him every day.
15 There's another child that's subject to having
16 seizures. And this is not only me; this is with
17 the whole system, it's with the whole system.

18 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: I understand.
19 Was the attendant on your bus yesterday when this
20 kid acted out?

21 MR. GARNER: Yes.

22 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Okay.

23 MR. GARNER: But now don't let me
24 mislead you; this incident happened in school.

25 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Okay.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 MR. GARNER: But we get the spill-over
3 from that. I still have to take this angry child
4 home, and he sits right behind me.

5 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: All right, I
6 understand. I mean, I told you, my daughter rode
7 the bus for eight years, so I know all the pluses
8 and minuses and whatnot.

9 MR. GARNER: There's something I would
10 like to ask Mr. Hornbeck.

11 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: I don't know
12 that we're going to allow that.

13 MR. GARNER: Okay. Thank you. I
14 withdraw.

15 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Mm-hmm.

16 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Madam
17 President?

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Yes?

19 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Could we find
20 out from the Superintendent if there is a policy
21 or what they do about sub bus attendants on
22 de-seg. and on special ed. buses? There must be a
23 simple answer to that question. Don't they have
24 substitutes?

25 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: And, again, I

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 hate to prolong this, but I still would like to
3 know the difference between an attendant and an
4 aide. I know we asked that question before; I
5 just don't recall the answer. And is THERE a
6 difference in salary?

7 DR. HORNBECK: The answer to the
8 substitute question is that a substitute with a
9 special education student who has an attendant in
10 his IEP is required. I don't doubt -- it's the
11 same way that a teacher in every classroom is
12 required, and sometimes we can't find a substitute
13 and, therefore, the question becomes, shall the
14 kid go to school or not go to school?

15 So I'm not doubting that there are
16 instances in which a child rides the bus without a
17 required aide, but the policy is and the
18 requirement is and the practice is most of the
19 time, there is a substitute aide on the bus.

20 I honestly don't know the difference
21 between an attendant and an aide myself. I tend
22 to associate the word "attendant" with a person
23 who's on the bus and an "aide" with a person who
24 works in the school, but I don't know that that's
25 accurate.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: I think we
3 have an answer.

4 (John Lombardi comes forward.)

5 DR. HORNBECK: This is Mr. Lombardi.

6 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Mr. Lombardi.

7 MR. LOMBARDI: Good morning.

8 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Good morning,
9 Mr. Lombardi.

10 MR. LOMBARDI: The bus attendant is a
11 five-hour employee who makes the same hourly rate
12 as a School Aide I, which is the aides that are
13 being referred to this morning -- they're
14 seven-hour employees. So the difference between
15 the two employees is essentially that one is a
16 five-hour and one is a seven-hour employee.

17 They work at the school the difference
18 from the time on the bus route versus the five
19 hours. So if the bus route is a three-hour bus
20 route, an hour and a half each way, then they'll
21 work two hours a day in the school. For a school
22 aide, if it's a three-route, they'll work four
23 hours a day in the school.

24 So that's essentially the difference in
25 between the two. They perform the same functions

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 on the bus, and they're at the principal's
3 discretion in the school.

4 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Madam
5 President, I didn't hear him. He said the
6 off-time, they work in the school.

7 MR. LOMBARDI: The time that they're
8 not riding the bus, Councilwoman, then they're
9 working in the school. If they're a seven-hour
10 employee and they're work three hours on the bus,
11 then they're required to work four hours per day
12 in the school.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: It's the
14 aide.

15 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: And that's the
16 aide?

17 MR. LOMBARDI: That's an aide.

18 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: But a bus
19 attendant is a seven-hour-a-day --

20 MR. LOMBARDI: No, the bus attendant is
21 a five-hour employee; the school aide is a
22 seven-hour employee.

23 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Oh, just the
24 opposite.

25 MR. LOMBARDI: Right.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: And they serve
3 as like an NTA function in the school?

4 MR. LOMBARDI: I'm not sure. The
5 principal has them doing a myriad of things in the
6 school.

7 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Okay, thank
8 you.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Thank you
10 very much.

11 Are there any other questions of Mr.
12 Garner? Or, Mr. Garner, are you complete with
13 your testimony?

14 MR. GARNER: Yes, I am. I think I
15 would like to, for the last couple of minutes,
16 turn this over to Mr. Rosario. He's a driver,
17 also.

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Thank you.
19 Mr. Rosario?

20 MR. ROSARIO: Good afternoon.

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Good
22 afternoon.

23 MR. ROSARIO: My name is Oscar Rosario,
24 O-S-C-A-R, R-O-S-A-R-I-O. I work -- I also work
25 for the Passyunk garage, School District of

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 Philadelphia, bus number 336, route 36-37.

3 When I read the articulate that they're
4 going to eliminate the bus attendants, all this
5 going to do is to increase the violence and the
6 misbehavior on the school buses. For instance,
7 look at my bus, 336, they call it "the blue
8 horizon bus." You know what the blue horizon IS
9 right, Councilwoman? Well, they fight -- they
10 fight every day, every day.

11 You see this? (Holding up stack of
12 papers.) I got about 100, 150 write-ups, you
13 know? I need these back, okay?

14 The principal -- the principal has
15 copies of these reports. And everybody knows
16 about what's taking place in my bus. There are
17 videotapes, I give them to the management of
18 Passyunk garage, but nobody gives a damn about the
19 children, no one, because I don't get no
20 responses.

21 I don't have a bus attendant. I asked
22 for a bus attendant; they say, oh, no, that cost
23 too much money. What, \$3 million? But management
24 just got a goddamn raise, they just got a 4
25 percent raise. And they say they don't have the

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 money? Come on now, let's be real.

3 See, I am upset because I do carry
4 childrens (ph.) in my bus, and they going to hold
5 me responsible? I put my bus to the side about
6 four times on a daily basis.

7 So one time, I even called the cops
8 because I have riots in my bus. So they say,
9 Okay, we give me a camera -- a camera? You know
10 what the kids do to the camera? And excuse the
11 expression, they go like this, you know, I mean,
12 they stick the middle finger to the camera.

13 The \$3 million that they're going to
14 save to eliminate the bus attendants? Come on,
15 Mr. Hornbeck. Mr. Hornbeck, don't be a part of
16 the problem; be a part of the solution.

17 I'm finished.

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Now, I am
19 looking at what you've submitted to us, and I see
20 that this one student was written up at least 13
21 times?

22 MR. ROSARIO: Yes, ma'am.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: And you mean
24 to tell me that after 13 write-ups, you don't know
25 what action has been taken?

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 MR. ROSARIO: They never give you any
3 feedback.

4 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Well, do you
5 know if any action was taken at all?

6 MR. ROSARIO: Sometimes.

7 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Do you ask
8 the --

9 MR. ROSARIO: Yes.

10 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Who do you
11 give these to, the principal?

12 MR. ROSARIO: Yes.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Do you ever
14 ask the principal what happened?

15 MR. ROSARIO: I do. By the way, the
16 school is Jenks.

17 Yes, I go there and I say what
18 happened, when can I get my slips? 'cause I'm
19 supposed to get a copy or a response to those
20 copies. Sometimes when I see them missing from my
21 bus, 'cause sometime I see them, they are not
22 coming. I say, What happened to little Johnny?
23 They say, Well, he's been suspended. That's how I
24 find out because the kid tell me himself.

25 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: The Chair

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 recognizes Councilwoman Blackwell.

3 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank you,
4 Madam President.

5 Can't we have a system that allows for
6 bus attendants on buses, Superintendent Hornbeck,
7 that traditionally show they've had violence?
8 Can't we at least do that much? Maybe in some
9 schools where there's none, abide by this rule,
10 but in instances where there has been violence.
11 Mr. Rosario says he experiences this every day.

12 MR. ROSARIO: Almost every day.

13 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: It would seem
14 to me that if this is happening three or four
15 times a week that this would be a perfect
16 candidate for a bus attendant.

17 Could you respond to that,
18 Superintendent?

19 DR. HORNBECK: These are the type of
20 issues that are constantly under review. And,
21 clearly, if there is an instance -- and I want to
22 know where this kid was this year with 13
23 write-ups.

24 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Well, there's
25 more than just one; this one has twelve. I see

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 that there are a number of them that certainly
3 have more than four or five write-ups. This one
4 has fifteen, if you please.

5 DR. HORNBECK: If it's 15, 37, 10,
6 whatever it is, I would like to see them.

7 And I do think, again, that there
8 clearly needs to be something done about children
9 like that. I guess the only -- the only debate is
10 the issue of the attendant, and I don't think
11 there's any evidence that attendants are what
12 makes the difference. And I think that there are
13 clearly lots of places with as many kids, as many
14 drivers, etc., where you don't have that.

15 But that there should be a situation
16 that does not result in a kid with 15 or 20 or
17 even 6 incidents of that kind is absolutely clear.

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERA: I believe
19 that one of the youngsters -- Councilwoman, that
20 top one that you have?

21 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Yes.

22 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERA: I believe
23 that that youngster had three suspensions.

24 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: It would seem
25 to me, Madam President, that this might be a good

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 way to secure counseling for a kid. If a kid's
3 fighting on a bus every other day or 12 times,
4 then this child has a problem, and this is one way
5 to --

6 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: And got
7 suspended three times.

8 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Absolutely.
9 So somebody ought to take out the time to just
10 find out what's wrong and what kind of help we can
11 try to secure for these children.

12 DR. HORNBECK: Certainly, we should pay
13 attention to that. It suggests that we don't do
14 that; in fact, it's not uncommon at all for part
15 of the disciplinary process to be counseling.
16 And, unfortunately, with all the kids, they don't
17 end up "cured" in a sense. And certainly, this
18 remains a series of issues that I expect will be a
19 part of the topic of discussion for the
20 Transportation Committee.

21 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: I would
22 request, Madam President, that we receive at least
23 a response to what happens in these cases and from
24 the viewpoint of the bus attendant as well as the
25 student in his or her development, what we're

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 doing about that.

3 If you would get that the to President
4 and she would let us know.

5 DR. HORNBECK: If you wouldn't mind,
6 Madam President, collecting these several things,
7 having staff do that and get them to me, I'll be
8 glad to respond as we did in the past. Thank you.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Don't you
10 have staff here taking notes? Do you have staff
11 here taking notes of what we would like?

12 DR. HORNBECK: Well, I have no idea who
13 these -- we don't know who they are.

14 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Oh, the
15 slips. Well, we don't have the slips either
16 because I think the bus driver said he wants them
17 back.

18 DR. HORNBECK: Councilwoman Blackwell
19 has them there.

20 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: But she has
21 to give them back to the bus driver.

22 DR. HORNBECK: Well, if somebody will
23 tell us who we're talking about, we'll be glad to
24 respond.

25 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: I think the

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 bus driver could certainly share that with you.

3 DR. HORNBECK: That will be fine.

4 MR. ROSARIO: I will make copies and
5 send them to you.

6 COUNCILMAN MARIANO: Maybe he could
7 make a copy before he leaves, Mr. Rosario.

8 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Does anybody
9 else have any questions or comments of Mr.
10 Rosario?

11 COUNCILMAN DICICCO: Actually, my
12 question is going to be for Dr. Hornbeck.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Councilman
14 DiCicco.

15 COUNCILMAN DICICCO: Mr. Hornbeck, is
16 the School District ever sued by any of the
17 students or the parents of the students for
18 incidents that occur on these buses? Does anyone
19 know that?

20 DR. HORNBECK: I'm not aware of any.

21 COUNCILMAN DICICCO: No? You don't
22 know or you just --

23 DR. HORNBECK: There certainly has not
24 been one in the last four years in which it was a
25 suit of any sort of serious proportion. There

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 might have been some nuisance suit, but there was
3 never one where a judgment was found against us or
4 anything like that.

5 COUNCILMAN DICICCO: Okay, so I don't
6 have any further questions. I just was curious if
7 we were paying any awards to people who were suing
8 for whatever.

9 Okay, thank you. No further questions.

10 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Thank you.
11 Any other further questions or
12 comments?

13 (No further questions.)

14 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Thank you.

15 I believe we have a grandmother in the
16 audience who would like to testify. I believe her
17 name is Peggy Mims. Please approach the witness
18 table, Ms. Mims.

19 (Ms. Mims comes forward.)

20 MS. MIMS: Good afternoon.

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Good
22 afternoon. Please identify yourself for the
23 record.

24 MS. MIMS: Yes, good afternoon. My
25 name is Peggy Mims. I am in public relations with

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 the organization GAPS, "Grands As Parents." Also,
3 I'm a community representative for all new
4 beginning Head Starts, and I share a vice
5 presidency with Julia Dansey (ph.) on Grand
6 Central, which is a grandparent resource
7 organization.

8 I have a grandson here. His name is
9 William Waddell (ph.). I am raising four
10 grandchildren, from 17 to 7.

11 William is constantly bothered on the
12 bus. Now, I'm not saying that sometimes William
13 does not do something; he does. But usually,
14 there's not an aide on the bus. One morning about
15 three or four weeks ago, the bus stopped in front
16 of my house and they couldn't leave for almost
17 eight minutes. There was a fight going on --
18 three boys jumping across the seats, kicking one
19 young man as bad as they could, as many times as
20 they could. He was sitting behind the bus
21 driver. The bus driver sat there, he asked them
22 to stop. The aide was being thrown around. I
23 have constantly reported this.

24 Yesterday he does his homework on the
25 way home to keep him busy. He dropped his pencil,

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 he leaned down to get his pencil. When he leaned
3 down, he said, Please do not kick me, I just want
4 to pick up my pencil. The boy kicked him in the
5 face. His face was swollen all night long. He's
6 on the way to the doctor today.

7 I have complained so many times about
8 an aide not being on the bus because it's so
9 dangerous. The children, some of them are very,
10 very vicious. Now, I know a lot of these children
11 have problems, but I cannot see how you do not
12 feel that you do not need some sort of an
13 attendant or someone on these buses.

14 These children can be down right
15 unruly, some of them are very, very mean, and it
16 stems over from what's going on at home and, as
17 the bus driver said, what's going on in school.
18 Some of the them, by the time they get on the
19 school bus in the morning, a lot of them have not
20 even had breakfast, and they don't make it to
21 breakfast in the schools because the bus has
22 different routes to pick up.

23 These children are unruly home. Some
24 of them have been home all night long without a
25 parent, and they bring this meanness to school.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 I'm sorry, he will be 10 in June.

3 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: And how old
4 are the other children on the bus?

5 MS. MIMS: I only have one other child
6 riding the bus, she's seven years old and she goes
7 to Pratt. He goes to Kenderton, at 15th and --

8 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Do they ride
9 the same bus?

10 MS. MIMS: No, they do not. She goes
11 to Pratt.

12 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: On William's
13 bus, what are the ages of the children on that
14 bus; do you know?

15 MS. MIMS: They range from different
16 ages. I think they range anywhere from 7 or 8, up
17 to 13 and 14 years old.

18 Now, the child that kicked him in the
19 face goes to a school by the name of Bethune. I
20 think he has it wrong, I'm going to get it checked
21 out, but I think he's saying it wrong.

22 But these children are all ages. Now,
23 I will tell you, William is in a special ed.,
24 okay? But William knows that he must sit down on
25 the bus, he knows this. And I've told the bus

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 driver and I also try to work with the bus
3 driver. If William does anything on the bus, I
4 want the bus driver to report it to me. And
5 William uses the time for different things that he
6 likes to do. He knows that he cannot be unruly on
7 the bus.

8 And like I said, you can never say what
9 your child won't do. But this downright
10 viciousness, it has to stop. The bus driver
11 cannot -- this particular bus driver, he's not
12 able to pull over, and I mean, these kids are
13 really going at it. They're jumping across the
14 seat. I mean, they had this boy, and they were
15 kicking him, you know, and it was awful. And they
16 just took the aide and was throwing her around,
17 you know.

18 So I have called continuously. I am --
19 I'm tired -- I've left two or three messages for
20 Mr. Lombardi; I never received a call back, you
21 know.

22 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Well, Mr.
23 Lombardi is in the audience.

24 MS. MIMS: Yes, I know.

25 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: I'm sure he'd

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 be more than happy to talk to you.

3 MS. MIMS: Okay, thank you.

4 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Are there any
5 questions or comments?

6 (No questions.)

7 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Thank you so
8 much for coming in to testify.

9 MS. MIMS: Thank you for letting me
10 speak.

11 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: And do see
12 Mr. Lombardi before you leave.

13 MS. MIMS: Thank you.

14 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Thank you.

15 Is there anyone else to testify?

16 (Man in audience raises hand.)

17 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Please come
18 forward to testify.

19 (Thomas Doyle comes forward.)

20 MR. DOYLE: Thank you, Madam
21 President. My name is Tom Doyle, I'm the
22 President, of Local 1201.

23 And I don't want to -- we've obviously
24 heard many horror stories today, and I don't want
25 to sit here and beat a dead horse but there's a

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 couple of things I feel I have to say, express.

3 First thing is in regards to the issue
4 yesterday, I just found out about that this
5 morning from Mr. Garner; we had no intention of
6 blindsiding the School District with that. We
7 don't expect them to perform miracles and have
8 something done within a matter of hours, as I'm
9 sure probably nobody on their side was aware of
10 that issue, but it's a reflection of what happens
11 on the buses every day, just as the case with this
12 young man right here.

13 I have provided every Councilmember
14 today with a couple of letters. One was Mr.
15 Rosario's letter, and the other one was a letter,
16 the results of an investigatory conference on
17 2/12/99.

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: I don't think
19 I have that.

20 MR. DOYLE: And I highlighted on that
21 letter -- I believe I gave the highlighted one to
22 everybody? Yes. One has got some black-outs on
23 it?

24 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Mm-hmm.

25 MR. DOYLE: And in the first paragraph,

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 it says, "The purpose of the conference was to
3 determine the reasons that 449 bus referral forms
4 had not been processed." That's 449 bus referral
5 forms at one school.

6 Those forms -- I attended this
7 hearing. Those forms were from November until
8 March. That's a five-month period, 449
9 incidents. And that's at one school. As I've
10 said repeatedly here to the District, we don't
11 know how many incidents are going on out there;
12 they're being squashed at the school level, at the
13 principal's level.

14 As I have stated before, when we do get
15 the information -- when the information does get
16 to the Transportation Department Office, the
17 Transportation Division, Mr. Lombardi's level,
18 they respond to it, they do react to it. Our
19 problem is, if they don't get it, nothing gets
20 done.

21 We believe that if you were to just
22 multiply -- now, as I said, the 449 incidents were
23 over a 5-month period, not the entire school year.
24 And so if you do that number by the amount of
25 schools in the system, it's over a 100,000

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 incidents. Granted, a lot of them are incidents
3 that are minor, but a lot of them are major, like
4 this young gentleman, again, back here, who was
5 assaulted, kicked in the face. This type of
6 behavior goes on everywhere, every day.

7 And I remind Council again, there's
8 1,000 school buses on the street every day,
9 1,000. We have more school buses than Pittsburgh
10 has in its public transportation system. Many of
11 these buses do not have attendants or school aides
12 on them, the majority of them.

13 This is no longer, as I've said in the
14 past, a monetary issue; it's a safety issue.
15 Children are being assaulted, aides are being
16 assaulted, attendants are being assaulted, drivers
17 are being assaulted, people are being injured. As
18 Councilman Kenney brought up earlier, God forbid
19 that kid was hanging out the window, touching the
20 tires, if he had fallen and fallen underneath of
21 those tires, there wouldn't be a discussion of
22 3 or \$4 million; there would be a \$100 million.

23 It has to stop. It has got to stop.
24 It's an issue that goes on and on and on. We ask
25 that the Administration somehow, some way get

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 these incident reports from the schools. If they
3 were to get every incident from every school, I
4 believe from the beginning of the school year,
5 they would be overwhelm, they would be stunned,
6 they would be shocked by the amount of incidents.

7 It's not, as the Board has put out in
8 their literature before, 477 incidents for the
9 entire school year for the entire School District
10 in '97-'98. I have 449 on that one letter from
11 one school, and there's 259 schools.

12 It is not an issue of money; it's
13 safety. I would guarantee you, the members of
14 Greater Philadelphia First, who are putting so
15 much pressure on the School District to cut the
16 lowest paid people in the School District, the bus
17 attendants, \$12,900 a year, I would bet my bottom
18 dollar that none of 'em ever rode a school bus.
19 I'd bet my bottom dollar. I would like to see
20 them ride a school bus now, put'em on that Mann
21 run that nobody wants to bid on that was mentioned
22 earlier. Put 'em on any of these routes in a
23 School District uniform and see if they change
24 their mind when they come back and say, This is
25 wrong, we have to change this, we have to fund

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 this somehow.

3 And \$3 million a drop in the proverbial
4 budget of a \$1.7 billion budget. Save the money,
5 if they have to save money, someplace else -- not
6 on the backs of people that make \$12,595 a year;
7 our school aides, \$13,000 a year -- that's if
8 they're at the top step, if they're at step 6. If
9 they're at the first step, it's \$10,000 a year for
10 an aide. If it's first step for an attendant,
11 it's \$11,000 a year, \$11,000 and 10,000 at the
12 first step.

13 And the turnover ratio for that job is
14 high. The School District's own statistics
15 indicate that the turnover ratio is between 8 and
16 10 percent a year -- we got that from one of their
17 bean-counters turn, a turnover ratio of 8 to 10
18 percent a year. So the majority of these people
19 are at the first and second step of the pay grade
20 -- \$10, \$11,000 for the type of work that they
21 do, for the situations that they're put in
22 everyday, to be subjected to assault, harassment,
23 threats from parents. The one letter was
24 discussed about the "F-U" from the parent, the
25 woman that gave -- and that's a letter which I

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 have copy of, which I gave yooz before. Okay, we
3 have another -- I could go on and on and on.

4 Another one that a woman showed up at
5 the bus with her boyfriend, Don't you write my son
6 up again, and this guy pulls the jacket aside and
7 he's got a pistol tucked down in the belt of his
8 pants. This is the kind of stuff that they have
9 to put up with. It's got to stop.

10 So we ask you, please do something
11 somehow. Put the pressure on, whether it's here
12 or at the School District, if you have any kind of
13 weight with GPF, to try and influence the people
14 over there Mr. Avery, Mr. Smoot, put pressure on
15 them to realize that this is not a monetary issue;
16 it's a safety issue.

17 Thank you.

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: Thank you.

19 Are there any questions or comments of
20 this witness?

21 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Yes. Are the bus
22 attendants covered by your union? It's my
23 understanding that there's a no-layoff clause?

24 MR. DOYLE: There's a clause in the
25 contract that says that the School District has to

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28
2 give us a one-year leeway -- if they're going to
3 eliminate jobs, we have a one-year period where
4 they're placed in the positions. After the
5 one-year period, the School District no longer has
6 responsibility for employing that person.

7 These positions that are being cut now
8 are not layoffs; they're doing it through
9 attrition. And those routes that they're doing it
10 through attrition, they don't disappear; they're
11 being contracted out, they're going to Atlantic
12 Express and all these other companies that pay
13 minimum wage, 5.15 an hour.

14 As I explained to you before at
15 previous hearings, the bus attendants that they
16 don't need on the buses -- or that they claim they
17 don't need -- they fund them for Atlantic Express
18 and the other contractors to the tune of millions
19 of dollars, and I presented that paperwork to you
20 the last time. They pay them \$20 out, \$20 back,
21 \$40 a day. They don't need (unintelligible), but
22 they need additional bus attendants for the
23 contractors. You can't have it both ways.

24 Our members, they -- a lot of them are
25 long-term employees, as you could see with Mr.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 Garner that was here dressed in his uniform,
3 wearing his hat, professional. And yet they come
4 and this is what they're subjected to every day.
5 They can't do anything with discipline. They
6 can't put their hand on the child, God forbid. It
7 would be termination immediately if you do
8 anything. They get punched in the face, hit,
9 whatever, and they have to take it and try and --
10 at the most, to try and restrain a child. And
11 even then they have problems.

12 Then we have disciplinary problems and
13 we have to go and represent them. As he said, the
14 word of the child will come over the employee
15 almost every time, and we have to go down and
16 fight for 'em. And it just -- I mean, it's one
17 thing after another after another after another.

18 And I just hope that somebody can give
19 us some help, 'cause as the newspaper drivers
20 said, drivers are crying for help, and we need it,
21 we absolutely need. It's a very dangerous
22 situation.

23 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Okay, thank you,
24 Mr. Doyle .

25 MR. DOYLE: Thank you.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST./990026, 27, 28

2 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Thank you.

3 Are there any other questions or

4 comments?

5 (No questions.)

6 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Thank you

7 very much.

8 MR. DOYLE: Thank you.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Is there
10 anyone else to testify on these bills?

11 (No response.)

12 COUNCIL PRESIDENT VERNA: Seeing none,
13 this will conclude public the hearing.

14 - - -

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST. - Pub. Hearing
2 out of committee with a favorable recommendation.

3 (Duly seconded.)

4 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: It has been
5 moved and properly seconded that Bill No. 990027
6 be reported out of committee with a favorable
7 recommendation.

8 All in favor will signify by saying
9 aye.

10 Those opposed?

11 The ayes have it, the motion carries.

12 The Chair recognizes Councilwoman
13 Miller regarding Bill No. 990028.

14 COUNCILWOMAN MILLER: Thank you, Madam
15 Chair.

16 I move that Bill No. 990028 be reported
17 out of this committee with a favorable
18 recommendation.

19 (Duly seconded.)

20 COUNCIL PRESIDENT Verna: It has been
21 moved and seconded that Bill No. 990028 be
22 reported out of committee with a favorable
23 recommendation.

24 All in favor will signify by saying
25 aye.

1 3/1/99 BUDGET/SCHOOL DIST. - Pub. Hearing

2 Those opposed?

3 The ayes have it, the motion is

4 carried.

5 This concludes our public meeting of

6 the three bills. Thank you.

7 (Adjourned at 12:47 p.m.)

8 - - -

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the foregoing
proceedings of the Council of the City of
Philadelphia of Tuesday, April 13, 1999, were
reported fully and accurately by me, and that this
is a correct transcript of same.

RE: COUNCIL COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

BILL NO.'S 990026, 990027, 990028

_____,
JOSEPHINE CARDILLO,
Registered Professional Reporter