

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

Room 400, City Hall
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania
Wednesday, May 22, 2013
1:50 p.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCIL PRESIDENT DARRELL L. CLARKE
COUNCILWOMAN CINDY BASS
COUNCILWOMAN JANNIE BLACKWELL
COUNCILMAN W. WILSON GOODE, JR.
COUNCILMAN BILL GREEN
COUNCILMAN WILLIAM K. GREENLEE
COUNCILMAN BOBBY HENON
COUNCILMAN KENYATTA JOHNSON
COUNCILMAN CURTIS JONES, JR.
COUNCILMAN DENNIS O'BRIEN
COUNCILMAN DAVID OH
COUNCILMAN BRIAN J. O'NEILL
COUNCILWOMAN MARIA D. QUINONES-SANCHEZ
COUNCILWOMAN BLONDELL REYNOLDS BROWN
COUNCILMAN MARK SQUILLA

BILLS 120338, 120339, 120651, 130141, 130142,
130150, 130163, 130178, 130179, 130180,
130181, 130182, 130183, 130254, and 130308
RESOLUTION 130190

- - -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good afternoon, folks. Sorry for the delay.

This is a continuation of the public hearing of the Committee of the Whole regarding Bills No. 120338, 120339, 120651, 130141, 130142, 130150, 130163, 130178, 130179, 130180, 130181, 130182, 130183, 130254, 130308, and Resolution 130190. Today, today we will be hearing testimony on Bills No. 130308, 130141. All of the other bills that I just read into the record will be recessed until May 28, 2013 at 10:00 a.m.

Is that clear? Thank you. I hope everybody understands that, because I'm not sure I do.

Ms. Lewis, please read the titles of the bills and resolution that will be heard today, which will be 130141 and 130308.

MS. LEWIS: Bill No. 130141, amending Chapter 19-2900 of The Philadelphia Code, entitled "Senior Citizen Special Tax Provisions," by

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 providing for those circumstances where a
3 participant in the tax freeze program
4 authorized by that Chapter would owe less
5 taxes as a result of a reduction in the
6 tax rate or the assessed value of the
7 taxpayer's property but for his or her
8 prior enrollment in the program; all
9 under certain terms and conditions; and

10 Bill No. 130308, amending
11 Section 19-1303 of The Philadelphia Code,
12 entitled "Discounts and Additions to
13 Tax," by tolling additions, interest and
14 penalties when the assessed value of the
15 property is under appeal; limiting what
16 the Department can bill for tax years
17 under appeal; and requiring for the tax
18 year under appeal payment of an amount at
19 least equal to the prior year's tax; all
20 under certain terms and conditions.

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

22 Thank you.

23 For the record, there will be
24 an amendment offered for Bill No. 130308.

25 Councilman, the amendment has

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.

2 been circulated? Councilman Squilla?

3 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Yes, I

4 believe it to be circulated.

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

6 Thank you, Councilman.

7 At this time, we will hear from

8 the Administration on Bill No. 130308.

9 (Witnesses approached witness
10 table.)

11 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good
12 afternoon.

13 MR. DUBOW: Good afternoon.

14 Good afternoon, Council President Clarke
15 and members of the Committee. My name is
16 Rob Dubow. I'm the Finance Director for
17 the City of Philadelphia. With me today
18 is Rebecca Rhynhart, Budget Director, and
19 I'm here to testify in opposition to Bill
20 No. 130308, which proposes changes to the
21 manner in which property tax payments are
22 made when an assessment is under appeal.

23 Under the proposed legislation,
24 taxpayers who appeal their assessment
25 would be required to pay an amount equal

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 to their tax liability from the prior
3 year and would not have to pay any
4 interest or penalties on the amount of
5 the tax that's under appeal. Under
6 current law, taxpayers have to pay
7 interest and penalties if they lose their
8 appeal and have not paid the full amount
9 of their tax.

10 We're concerned the legislation
11 would encourage appeals because it
12 removes the consequence for filing an
13 appeal with no merit. It provides an
14 incentive to appeal even if a taxpayer
15 believes that there is little chance that
16 an appeal will be successful, because
17 that taxpayer will not have to pay any
18 increase until the appeal process is
19 over. In essence, to be clear, we
20 believe every property owner who has a
21 legitimate basis for an appeal should
22 appeal. We do not, however, want to
23 encourage property owners who don't have
24 a legitimate basis for appeal to file
25 appeals. That could serve to

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 dramatically increase the number of
3 appeals the BRT hears and could mean it
4 would take longer for the Board to get to
5 the appeals that have merit.

6 Encouraging people to appeal
7 regardless of whether their appeal has
8 merit could also have a negative impact
9 on the City's and the School District's
10 cash flow if even a fraction of those
11 with increases appealed their
12 assessments.

13 In considering the bill, we
14 verified that the current practice in
15 Philadelphia is consistent with practices
16 in other jurisdictions. We asked half a
17 dozen other large jurisdictions,
18 including New York, LA, Chicago, Boston,
19 Baltimore, and Nassau County about their
20 practices. In all cases, even after a
21 full reassessment in Nassau County, the
22 property tax bill is considered valid
23 until proven otherwise through an appeals
24 process and taxpayers are required to pay
25 their full tax bill. If taxpayers do not

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 pay their full amount and they lose their
3 appeal, they are required to pay interest
4 and penalties on that amount.

5 For the reasons discussed in
6 this testimony, we request that this bill
7 not be voted out of Committee.

8 That concludes my testimony,
9 and we'd be happy to answer any questions
10 you may have.

11 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
12 Thank you very much, Mr. Dubow.

13 The Chair recognizes Councilman
14 Greenlee.

15 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank
16 you, Mr. President.

17 Good afternoon. Mr. Dubow, I
18 understand where you're coming from, but
19 I guess I'm just thinking that this year
20 is different. There's a lot of people
21 who are going to get a significant
22 increase no matter what we do, and I
23 guess when you talk about you don't want
24 people filing ones that aren't
25 legitimate, isn't the other way of

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 looking at that, we don't want to
3 discourage people from filing? And I
4 think knowing that there's going to be a
5 lot of appeals, it just seems to me that
6 people -- this time we don't want to do
7 anything to try to tell people they
8 shouldn't try to appeal. Maybe it's not
9 something we should keep forever, but
10 this year just seems like it's a unique
11 year, in my opinion.

12 MR. DUBOW: And I don't think
13 we're trying to discourage legitimate
14 appeals, because I think if people think
15 they're going to win, there isn't penalty
16 or interest.

17 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: But you
18 really don't know that, you know. I
19 mean, because we don't even know at this
20 point in time when they appeal, you don't
21 know where the Board is going to be
22 coming from on these things. So, I mean,
23 I keep saying it's unique. It's a unique
24 year.

25 MR. DUBOW: Yeah, but you do

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 know if your assessment is accurate. If
3 it's already accurate, we don't want
4 those people to appeal. That's really
5 what our concern is about.

6 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: And isn't
7 it going to take -- I know you're
8 concerned about the time if this is
9 passed, but realistically, isn't it going
10 to be a longer period of time this year,
11 because don't you think there will be
12 more appeals this time?

13 MR. DUBOW: I think there will.
14 We've given additional resources to the
15 BRT, and if they think they need more
16 resources, we would do that too. But it
17 probably will be a longer process, which
18 also then goes back to the cash flow
19 impact on both the City and the School
20 District if there are more appeals that
21 don't really have merit.

22 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: But I
23 guess you're just assuming -- I mean, do
24 you have any guess, have you done any
25 study, you think how many more would be

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 filed that you're not calling legitimate?
3 And we might not agree what is legitimate
4 or not.

5 MR. DUBOW: Right. And
6 obviously --

7 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Under
8 your thinking, what would be --

9 MR. DUBOW: Obviously there's
10 no way to put an exact number on that,
11 but let's say through relief measures
12 there may be 30 percent of homeowners
13 that are going to have increases. Out of
14 570,000, that's going to be like 160,000
15 properties. If 10 percent of those
16 appeal who wouldn't have appealed before
17 because they didn't think there was
18 merit, that's 16,000 properties. That's
19 a lot.

20 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: I'll just
21 end with this, Mr. President.

22 It kind of goes back to what I
23 was saying earlier to the OPA. I think
24 it would have been in the interest of the
25 City to try to deal with the reviews as

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 quickly as possible.

3 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

4 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Try to
5 get an idea about where this was going.
6 I think the problem is going to be by
7 waiting so long to give out any answer on
8 the reviews, I think you're forcing more
9 people to appeal. But maybe if a lot of
10 those reviews come back, we would hope,
11 because at least I see, a number of them
12 that are blatantly wrong, if they had
13 come back early, that might have
14 discouraged some people from, to use the
15 word, from filing legitimate appeals.

16 MR. DUBOW: I think their
17 intention is to get back to people in
18 advance of when they would have to appeal
19 to the BRT so that people will know. And
20 typically most of the appeals do come in
21 really close to October 1st. So their
22 goal is to get back to people well before
23 then, and that should remove some of
24 the -- a lot of what we call the
25 legitimate appeals, because if they're

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.

2 wrong, we want to change them.

3 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: I just
4 think the earlier would have been the
5 better. I think it would have just set a
6 better tone out there. But it is what it
7 is.

8 Thank you, Mr. President.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
10 Thank you, Councilman.

11 The Chair recognizes Councilman
12 Squilla.

13 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you,
14 Mr. President.

15 Mr. Dubow, we spoke about this
16 before. And when somebody appeals
17 because they believe their assessment is
18 wrong, they have the ability to go to the
19 BRT. And then what happens in the case
20 you have a mortgage. The BRT did not
21 hear your assessment yet. The City sends
22 the bill out to the mortgage company.
23 The mortgage company pays the bill and
24 then they notify the constituent or the
25 resident that your tax bill was \$4,000

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 more than last year; therefore, you have
3 to pay this year's bill, you have to come
4 up and then you'll have a double payment.

5 Some of these people, we might
6 be forcing people to be delinquent on
7 their mortgage because of a wrong
8 assessment. So this in a way enables
9 them if they do have an appeal that would
10 be successful, that bill would never go
11 out. The only bill that would go out is
12 the bill from the previous year, so the
13 City still will be getting the money, and
14 the bill that would not go out will be
15 the bill that may be a wrong assessment.

16 Now, if BRT doesn't get a
17 chance to hear this appeal in a timely
18 manner, well, that's not the resident's
19 fault, so they shouldn't have to pay the
20 money. If we're talking about fairness
21 and accuracy, which is the goal of AVI,
22 do you think it's fair for somebody to
23 pay a tax bill on an assessment that
24 isn't correct?

25 MR. DUBOW: No, and if they win

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 their appeal, they get a refund. But if
3 part of the goal here is to get through
4 the appeal process as quickly as
5 possible, I think we would want to
6 eliminate the incentive for people who
7 don't have a reason to appeal to appeal,
8 because this legislation will increase
9 the number of appeals.

10 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Well, we
11 didn't have legislation for the reviews.
12 How many first-level reviews were there?

13 MR. DUBOW: I think there were
14 close to 50,000.

15 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Fifty
16 thousand. So there's 50,000 people who
17 believe maybe their assessment wasn't
18 correct. Now, that's a small number from
19 the assessed values.

20 MR. DUBOW: Right.

21 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: There's
22 still many people out there that probably
23 may appeal to the BRT that didn't appeal
24 to --

25 MR. DUBOW: Could be.

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: -- OPA.

3 MR. DUBOW: As Councilman
4 Greenlee said, one of the things we hope
5 happens through the first-level review
6 process is to the extent that there were
7 mistakes, that they're corrected and
8 people get new assessments and then don't
9 have to appeal to the BRT.

10 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Exactly.
11 So all those people will not appeal. So
12 you fix the problem for a multitude of
13 people. So now instead of having 50,000
14 appeals, hopefully we have 10,000 appeals
15 or 5,000 appeals that people who still
16 believe that their assessment is not
17 correct for whatever reason.

18 Now, do you think --

19 MR. DUBOW: And those are the
20 people we want to appeal, people who
21 really think they're not correct. We
22 don't want to provide an incentive for
23 people who don't think the bill is
24 incorrect to appeal. That's really our
25 concern.

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: But you
3 want them to pay the bill. You want them
4 to pay the full freight of that assessed
5 value that may be wrong.

6 MR. DUBOW: Just like they do
7 now and just like they do in every other
8 jurisdiction we talked to.

9 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: But this
10 is a different type of year. This is a
11 different city. We did a full city
12 reassessment. We know that there's
13 issues with -- well, we believe there's
14 issues with the assessment as far as the
15 accuracy of them. So for this year, I
16 would believe that we would want to make
17 sure we protect our residents from
18 inflated bills that aren't accurate. And
19 to have them pay that anyway and say you
20 get a credit, your appeal might not be
21 heard for two years and you're going to
22 get a credit for your future years, they
23 might not be able to pay that. So are we
24 going to then start to say, All right,
25 their taxes were due, they did not pay

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 what they owed, now we're going to start
3 putting their houses up for Sheriff Sale
4 on something that was a wrong assessment?
5 I don't think that's fair and I don't
6 think that's the responsible way to
7 protect our residents.

8 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. Again, part
9 of the reason we did the first-level
10 review is so that we could get to some
11 problems earlier, and part of the reason
12 that we are concerned about this bill is
13 we don't want to inflate the number of
14 appeals, because that will slow down the
15 process.

16 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So you
17 think as soon as this bill passes, the
18 whole city is going to appeal?

19 MR. DUBOW: I don't think the
20 whole city, but as I said to Councilman
21 Greenlee, if 10 percent of people who
22 have increases and who apply and don't
23 really need to, that's still 15,000
24 appeals. That's a lot of appeals.

25 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Where do

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.

2 you get that number from?

3 MR. DUBOW: I was looking at if
4 30 percent of properties have increases
5 out of 579,000, that's about 170,000. If
6 10 percent of those appealed and didn't
7 really need to, that's 17,000.

8 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Seventeen
9 thousand.

10 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. So that's a
11 big number.

12 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: We already
13 have 50,000 that appealed for a review.
14 So, I mean, obviously we know there's
15 legitimate appeals out there.

16 MR. DUBOW: That's right.

17 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And just
18 because there may be a few people that
19 get caught in the web or try to buy the
20 system for whatever reason means that the
21 other people should be discarded and have
22 to pay.

23 MR. DUBOW: I don't think they
24 should be discarded. I think that we
25 should follow the procedures that we have

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 and that other cities have.

3 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Well, we
4 don't seem to follow the procedures what
5 other cities have with collecting taxes.

6 MR. DUBOW: We actually do. I
7 mean, our rate is actually from what we
8 think consistent with cities with similar
9 demographics, that 91 percent, 91 and a
10 half percent is fairly consistent.

11 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: That's
12 fairly consistent with other cities?

13 MR. DUBOW: Mm-hmm.

14 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Well, I'll
15 come back.

16 Thank you.

17 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
18 Thank you, Councilman.

19 The Chair recognizes
20 Councilwoman Brown.

21 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Thank you,
22 Mr. President.

23 Good morning -- or afternoon.

24 MR. DUBOW: Good afternoon.

25 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: I want to

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 echo the concerns raised by Councilman
3 Squilla. Given the unprecedented nature
4 of AVI and given what many agree has been
5 an unpopular rollout and execution of AVI
6 and given the testimony that was put on
7 the record by the Office of Property
8 Assessment, that it could conceivably
9 take us three years to get this right,
10 what responsibility or role should
11 government have towards doing exactly
12 what Councilman Squilla has suggested
13 and, that is, provide protections for
14 citizens while government seeks to get it
15 right?

16 MR. DUBOW: I think that's a
17 big reason why we added the first-level
18 reviews, which are a new process that
19 didn't happen before. So people have an
20 ability to actually go to the Office of
21 Property Assessment, talk to their
22 assessor, say, Here's why we think that
23 doesn't make sense and get a change in
24 their assessment. That's a change,
25 something we've never offered before. We

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 also -- whatever resources the BRT asks
3 for, we gave them to make sure that they
4 can handle appeals as quickly as
5 possible.

6 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Point of
7 information to the sponsor of the bill.
8 Is this not the one year, Councilman
9 Squilla?

10 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Say that
11 again.

12 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: The intent
13 of this bill, is it not -- is it only for
14 one year?

15 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Yes. With
16 the amendment added, this would be just
17 for 2014.

18 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: So given
19 that short window, which will ultimately
20 be a short window, the Administration
21 still is of the view that -- and you can
22 complete the sentence.

23 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. We're still
24 worried. I mean, there's a cash flow
25 issue with this for both us and the

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.

2 School District that's a concern too.

3 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay.

4 Thank you, Mr. President.

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

6 Thank you, Councilwoman.

7 The Chair recognizes Councilman
8 Jones.

9 COUNCILMAN JONES:

10 Mr. President, I've been to seven AVI
11 forums. Talk about cash flow concerns
12 and issues, a lot of the people who are
13 getting assessment hikes have those same
14 day-to-day issues in their household
15 budgets, that for some of them these
16 increases are stark and dramatic.

17 I understand that we have cash
18 flow issues, and we're dealing with a lot
19 of those cash flow issues in some of the
20 revenue measures that we are actually
21 considering. I think this time
22 Councilman Squilla's bill allows us to
23 err on the side of the taxpayer and give
24 them the benefit of the doubt. When
25 people pay their taxes and there's a

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 miscalculation on behalf of the City and
3 they are owed more, the interest and
4 penalty applies. When the mistake is on
5 the part of the City and the consumer is
6 owed money, all they get is a credit.

7 So on this bill, I think it's
8 important that in light of all of AVI, in
9 light of all of this, that we give them
10 the benefit of the doubt.

11 The other issue for me is the
12 fact that right now when people appeal,
13 the thing that they get is an
14 acknowledgment just that we've got your
15 appeal, not a decision, not a timeframe
16 for a decision, but take a number, you're
17 going to be in this line at some point
18 considered for that. And in those kinds
19 of cases for this one year, which is an
20 outlier as opposed to the norm, I think
21 we would have to give the benefit of the
22 doubt to the consumers in this particular
23 year for AVI. And I don't -- I
24 understand, but it's outweighed by if we
25 make mistakes on behalf of the taxpayer,

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 they don't get justice, if you would.
3 And that's a comment. No need to
4 respond.

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
6 Thank you.

7 COUNCILMAN JONES: Thank you,
8 Mr. President.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
10 Thank you.

11 The Chair recognizes Councilman
12 Green.

13 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you,
14 Mr. President.

15 Good afternoon.

16 MR. DUBOW: Good afternoon.

17 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Is there an
18 estimate of -- the way I understand the
19 bill, it would be a one-year exemption.
20 It would be the taxpayer would have to
21 pay in order to get this benefit the
22 taxes that they owed the previous year.

23 MR. DUBOW: That's right.

24 COUNCILMAN GREEN: So given
25 that, I can't remember, some 80 percent

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 of property owners are going to have a
3 \$400 or less increase, or whatever that
4 statistic is that's not on the top of my
5 head, is there an estimate of, given how
6 many first-level appeals have been filed
7 with OPA and the differentials, is there
8 an estimate of what the potential cash
9 flow problem is? I mean, is it millions,
10 tens of millions?

11 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. And in the
12 example I've been giving, if 10 percent
13 of people applied, I think it's like a
14 \$10 to \$12 million problem.

15 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Ten to \$12
16 million. And what's the fund balance
17 estimated for next year?

18 MR. DUBOW: This is both on the
19 City side and the School District side.
20 So for the City side, it's about 80
21 million. For the schools, they're trying
22 to close a \$304 million gap.

23 COUNCILMAN GREEN: So is it 10
24 to 12 million on the School District side
25 or is that --

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.

2 MR. DUBOW: Total.

3 COUNCILMAN GREEN: So on the
4 School District side, that's a \$5 million
5 cash flow problem?

6 MR. DUBOW: A little more,
7 yeah.

8 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay. And
9 is commercial included in this bill?

10 MR. DUBOW: I think everybody
11 is included, yeah.

12 COUNCILMAN GREEN: What would
13 the estimate be if you excluded
14 commercial properties and industrial
15 properties?

16 MR. DUBOW: Commercial and
17 industrial I think is about 100,000,
18 right? So it would probably take it down
19 by a million or two. They're not a big
20 part of the number I was doing.

21 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay. And I
22 guess a lot of their taxes are going
23 down, at least with respect to the bigger
24 properties.

25 MR. DUBOW: Right. So they

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 probably wouldn't be appealing.

3 COUNCILMAN GREEN: I'm just
4 trying to think out loud here. So we
5 don't really have a cash flow problem on
6 the City side because we have a fund
7 balance of \$80 million, so --

8 MR. DUBOW: The fund balance
9 and cash flow can be really different.
10 So there are times of the year where even
11 with an \$80 million fund balance your
12 cash is relatively tight.

13 COUNCILMAN GREEN: I fully
14 expect that you may have to put it in a
15 TRAN or something like that. With
16 respect to the District, do they do TRAN
17 borrowings --

18 MR. DUBOW: They do.

19 COUNCILMAN GREEN: -- like we
20 do to smooth out their cash flows?

21 MR. DUBOW: They do.

22 COUNCILMAN GREEN: So in
23 theory, both the District and the City
24 could add what they know will be the
25 ultimate revenue as a result of this

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 one-year shift to their TRAN so that they
3 don't have cash flow issues?

4 MR. DUBOW: Assuming -- well,
5 there are two things there. One,
6 assuming that all the appeals are done by
7 the end of the year, because then the
8 District could still have a cash flow
9 problem at the end of the year, and then
10 there's some additional cost for that,
11 but yes.

12 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you.
13 Thank you, Mr. President.

14 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
15 Thank you, Councilman.

16 The Chair recognizes Councilman
17 Squilla again.

18 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Yes. What
19 was the money set aside for appeals for
20 this year?

21 MS. RHYNHART: We set it aside
22 in terms of assessed value, but it's
23 usually about 20 million, a little under
24 that, total City and School District.

25 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: I think

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 it's closer to 30 million.

3 MS. RHYNHART: I'm sorry.
4 You're talking about Fiscal '14? For
5 Fiscal '14, we increased it by 50 percent
6 for Fiscal '14 with AVI going into
7 effect, so it would be about 30 million.

8 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: About \$30
9 million?

10 MS. RHYNHART: That's right.

11 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: We already
12 have that money in the budget. So you're
13 saying \$12 million may be an estimate of
14 you may not get on time, but you already
15 have \$30 million built in to the budget
16 that's already going to be there for this
17 money.

18 MR. DUBOW: Right, and our
19 concern is not with people who have
20 legitimate appeals who are already going
21 to appeal. It's the appeals that we
22 don't think would have merit.

23 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: But you're
24 going to get that money. So if they
25 don't have merit and they lose, you get

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 the money. You already have \$30 million
3 built in. You already have enough money
4 to cover the cost of maybe \$12 million
5 that you're saying --

6 MR. DUBOW: Thirty million
7 built in for appeals that we think that
8 are legitimate, so that we would lose.
9 We're talking about ones where we think
10 we'll win. So it's a different category.

11 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All right.
12 So if you think they're going to win and
13 lose, what would the number be? So 30
14 million --

15 MR. DUBOW: I'm not sure I
16 understand your question.

17 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: You're
18 saying you built in \$30 million for the
19 people that the City is going to lose
20 with.

21 MR. DUBOW: Right.

22 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So the
23 City is going to lose \$30 million in
24 appeals.

25 MR. DUBOW: Mm-hmm.

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So that's
3 built into the budget. So during that
4 process, when these people are going
5 through their appeals, the money is
6 accounted for.

7 MR. DUBOW: For people who are
8 successful in their appeals. We're
9 talking about people who would not be
10 successful.

11 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Well, if
12 they're not successful, then they pay.

13 MR. DUBOW: They do, but they
14 pay later. That's the cash flow issue.
15 They're not paying in February or March.

16 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: But also
17 the money that you have already accounted
18 for, the \$30 million that's in the
19 budget, is not going to go out, because
20 those appeals may not be heard for a
21 year. You're already holding this money
22 for losses. So that money is there.
23 Whether they win it or lose it or pay it
24 later is not going to make a difference,
25 because you already have it budgeted.

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.

2 MS. RHYNHART: I mean, as Rob
3 said, we have the loss budgeted. The
4 Administration's concern on this bill is
5 that it will provide incentive for anyone
6 and everyone to appeal their tax bill,
7 because it's an interest-free loan. If
8 you appeal, you don't have to pay any
9 increase in your tax and you don't have
10 to pay the penalties too on that. So it
11 would encourage people that otherwise
12 would not appeal, that don't perhaps feel
13 that they would win, to appeal, because
14 it's an interest-free loan. It would be
15 the smart thing financially for a
16 household to do.

17 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Well,
18 maybe in your view, it's a smart
19 financial move. Most of the people and
20 we know throughout the City of
21 Philadelphia haven't even applied for a
22 homestead that they're eligible for, and
23 that's a smart thing to do too. So we
24 know that this is not going to reach
25 everybody. This is going to protect

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 those people who aren't the savvy people
3 that are going to go out there and try to
4 manipulate the system. This is going to
5 protect the poor and the seniors that are
6 there that know that if they have to come
7 up with this, they want to appeal because
8 they feel that this number is wrong.
9 Now, when they have to pay, if they can't
10 come up with a payment, then they still
11 have the same timeframe to pay it that
12 they did previously, 30 days from the
13 appeal date -- from the settlement of the
14 appeal. So they have to come up with the
15 money at that time.

16 MR. DUBOW: It's not the same
17 as before. Before they paid by the tax
18 due date, not --

19 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: March
20 31st, but they still have to pay their
21 previous tax bill by then. So the
22 difference isn't the whole thing. It's
23 not the whole amount. So if their bill
24 went up -- say they paid \$800 --

25 MR. DUBOW: When I gave you

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 this, I was not assuming the full amount.
3 I was assuming a difference of a couple
4 hundred dollars between what they paid
5 and what they appeal.

6 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: You think
7 if a person's tax went up \$200, he's just
8 going to appeal it so he don't have to
9 pay the 200 extra dollars for --

10 MR. DUBOW: He wouldn't have to
11 pay anything.

12 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: No. He
13 has to pay his bill from the previous
14 year.

15 MR. DUBOW: Right, so he
16 doesn't have to pay his \$200. That's
17 right.

18 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So is
19 somebody going to do that? Go through
20 all that trial and go up to BRT and -- I
21 mean, I think you're overreacting to it,
22 and I just think that we already have the
23 money budgeted for appeals, and that
24 money will be there to cover the cost of
25 the City and that it will not affect

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 their balance in any way moving forward.
3 And that's my opinion.

4 MR. DUBOW: I understand, but,
5 again, we have money in the budget to
6 cover appeals that we think are based on
7 people appealing when they think they
8 will win, not a heightened level of
9 appeals for people who might not think
10 they'll win. That's our concern.

11 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Is there
12 anybody else asking questions?

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: If
14 you have an additional question.

15 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Yeah, one
16 last question.

17 During the process of the
18 appeal, the residents who had to pay
19 their bill -- and I'm not talking about a
20 \$200 difference, because I really don't
21 believe that if somebody's taxes went up
22 \$200 that they're going to go out there
23 and spend all this time appealing to the
24 BRT. But if it's a \$3,000, \$4,000,
25 \$2,000 increase in their taxes, your

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.

2 opinion is that they should have to pay
3 that whole amount by March 31st?

4 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

5 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All right.

6 Thank you, Mr. President.

7 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

8 Thank you, Councilman.

9 The Chair recognizes Councilman
10 O'Neill.

11 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Thank you,
12 Mr. President.

13 Mr. Dubow, how many appeals do
14 you estimate are going to be filed next
15 year, in your best ability? Not the
16 frivolous ones; just the real appeals.
17 I'm kidding about the frivolous ones. I
18 think that \$200, people aren't going to
19 go to that trouble. They're not going to
20 go to that trouble -- there may be
21 appeals that are frivolous for somebody
22 who has a big, big increase and they just
23 can't see their way through and the only
24 thing they can do right now is file an
25 appeal, but I do not think the smaller

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 amounts are going to do it, even if they
3 think they have a legitimate gripe.
4 People just don't tend to go through all
5 this for a small amount. In fact, my
6 experience from people who have filed the
7 first-level reviews have mostly been
8 confusion issues, and when they found out
9 the actual number they're due, it's not a
10 second bathroom or a smaller lot or
11 something like that. It's just they
12 didn't understand it, and they're very
13 happy if they're just in the range of
14 what they think their house is worth and
15 not so much whether it's a big or a small
16 increase, but it's not really large, that
17 it's close to what they were paying.

18 But I just have a few
19 questions. What is your estimate of the
20 number of appeals for '14?

21 MR. DUBOW: So we did it --

22 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Assuming
23 this bill doesn't cause a problem, which
24 I don't think it will.

25 MR. DUBOW: We did it by dollar

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 amount rather than number. So we assumed
3 about \$30 million in appeal losses.

4 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Do you
5 know how many appeals were filed in the
6 current year?

7 MR. DUBOW: I think it was a
8 couple thousand.

9 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: And you
10 think it's going to be higher next year?

11 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. I mean, for
12 the first-level reviews, we got 50,000,
13 so we think there --

14 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Again, a
15 lot of it is people asking questions.
16 It's not -- and just the general
17 questions about how the process is, why
18 their assessed value went from a very low
19 number to a very high number even though
20 they find out their taxes were lowered.

21 MR. DUBOW: Right. A lot of
22 them didn't involve real assessments.

23 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: If there
24 were 2,000 -- and we don't have a number
25 today, but you said a couple thousand in

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 the current year -- would you think it
3 would be doubled next year under AVI,
4 tripled, 10 percent higher?

5 MR. DUBOW: I think the number
6 of assessments will go up significantly.

7 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Appeals?

8 MR. DUBOW: Appeals. Sorry.
9 The dollar value might go up as much --

10 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: But I'm
11 not driving this question at the dollar
12 value. I'm driving at the number of
13 cases that are going to have to be heard,
14 because we were talking about delay.

15 MR. DUBOW: We had 50,000 that
16 went to the first-level review. Let's
17 say half of those get resolved through
18 first-level review. You could still have
19 10,000 to 15,000 appeals.

20 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: So you
21 could have easily, in your opinion, a 500
22 percent increase, from 2,000 to 10,000,
23 say, without getting into 15 or anything.
24 But 500 is a pretty high increase.

25 BRT is still independent of the

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.

2 Administration.

3 MR. DUBOW: They are.

4 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: So if the
5 Administration thinks things are moving a
6 little slowly over there, there's nothing
7 we can do about it, except say, We think
8 it's moving a little slowly, can you move
9 it faster.

10 MR. DUBOW: Right, and it kind
11 of depends why. If they say --

12 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: But I
13 don't mean the why, but you still can't
14 even if you -- whether you agree or
15 disagree with them for the reason, we
16 have no control over it.

17 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. The one
18 thing I was going to say is if the reason
19 they're moving slowly is they say they
20 don't have enough resources, we can help
21 with the resources.

22 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Okay. Now
23 you're getting to where I'm trying to go
24 with this. Do you have a plan -- first
25 of all, their salaries were all lowered,

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.

2 correct?

3 MR. DUBOW: Their salaries were
4 lowered.

5 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: And a
6 couple of them were lowered by quite a
7 bit, but others were lowered
8 substantially, like 75 to 15.

9 MR. DUBOW: They went per diem,
10 but then they went to court and I think
11 they won at the last round, and I
12 actually don't know exactly --

13 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: So are
14 they back at their old salaries?

15 MR. DUBOW: They are back at
16 annual salaries. I'm not sure whether
17 they're their old salaries, but they
18 are -- I think they're all at salaries
19 now as opposed to --

20 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: But are
21 they still substantially below what they
22 used to make?

23 MR. DUBOW: They're still below
24 what they used to make.

25 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Because

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 the salaries in that legislation, even
3 for the secretary and the chair were 45
4 and 50 instead of 70.

5 MR. DUBOW: Yeah.

6 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Given all
7 that, you can't control them, they've got
8 much lower salaries, going to be 500
9 percent to even more cases coming before
10 them, you have this concern, which is
11 legitimate with or without Councilman
12 Squilla's bill before us, that there's
13 going to be a backlog possibly of cases
14 that are going to take longer than usual,
15 because at 2,000 they can get done in the
16 current year, I would think. They don't
17 usually run into the second year.

18 Do you have a plan to
19 incentivize them, whether taking them
20 back to their old salaries or some other
21 higher salary, even if it's just for the
22 period of this heavy increase, or have
23 you met with them about staffing or the
24 whole issue of what incentives are for an
25 independent body? One would be their own

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 pay and the other would be having enough
3 people on the ground to do the work in
4 there.

5 MR. DUBOW: We had
6 conversations --

7 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Because
8 we're in the budget now and I'd hate to
9 be voting for a budget next the week and
10 find out that a month from now that we
11 missed the incentives that we had to do
12 seeing this problem coming down the road
13 so quickly right after July 1st.

14 MR. DUBOW: We had
15 conversations with them about the
16 resources they would need. They made a
17 request, and we gave them the full
18 request. They actually -- their
19 Executive Director testified to that
20 during their hearing. If at some point
21 they say, You know what, that really
22 wasn't the right level of resources, we
23 need more, we would provide that too.

24 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Then I
25 have another question, because you were

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.

2 guessing 500, I mean, 10,000, 15,000.

3 MR. DUBOW: And it is just a
4 guess.

5 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Right, but
6 when they came to you asking for more
7 resources, did they have a guess? And
8 they're the hearing body, the adjudicated
9 body that's going to be hearing it.

10 MS. RHYNHART: I think they did
11 have a guess. I don't remember offhand
12 what it was, but --

13 MR. DUBOW: We can get that.

14 MS. RHYNHART: -- we can get
15 that.

16 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Because
17 I'm just trying to see -- and was there
18 any discussion on salaries that --

19 MR. DUBOW: In that request?
20 No.

21 MS. RHYNHART: In the budget
22 request? No.

23 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: No, no.
24 Have they talked to you about the fact
25 that a couple of them are making

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 considerably less than before and the
3 other five are making a whole lot less
4 than before, and they have this glut of
5 cases coming up that -- they can move at
6 their own pace that they've normally been
7 doing or they can move at some
8 accelerated pace that they haven't had to
9 do in the past, and I'd rather see us
10 having those discussions now rather than
11 later. I mean, two years from now we may
12 be back to where we were last year, but
13 during this period, if we get anywhere
14 near your estimates of cases, 2,000 a
15 year, if you get 10,000 to 15,000, we're
16 talking about four or five years waiting
17 for people to get hearings at least on
18 the current case.

19 MR. DUBOW: Right, and I think
20 what they were -- and you, I guess, had
21 that conversation. I think they were
22 requiring resources to make sure it
23 didn't take that long, that they wanted
24 to be able to handle them quickly.

25 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: But I

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 would ask between now and next Wednesday
3 if the Council President would be
4 included in discussions with the BRT that
5 encompass both their needs based on these
6 kind of numbers of cases and also their
7 own internal discussions about their
8 workload versus their substantially
9 lowered payment to themselves, because if
10 one is going to be a problem, we should
11 know about it now, not later, and be able
12 to deal with it.

13 Thank you.

14 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

15 Thank you, Councilman.

16 Mr. Dubow, do you have any
17 testimony? I think we pretty much talked
18 through the senior freeze program.

19 MR. DUBOW: I think we're
20 supportive of that legislation.

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: You
22 guys are supportive of that, so we won't
23 bother with that. Okay.

24 There are no other questions,
25 no other witnesses. Thank you very much.

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.

2 MR. DUBOW: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: At
4 this time, we would like to have a very
5 brief callback with my good friend from
6 Public Property. Commissioner, I promise
7 it will be real brief.

8 (Witnesses approached witness
9 table.)

10 MS. COLLINS-GREENWALD: Good
11 afternoon. Bridget Collins-Greenwald,
12 Commissioner of Public Property.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good
14 afternoon. Real briefly, my favorite
15 subject, municipal marketing. First, I
16 want to thank you and the City Solicitor
17 for agreeing to get engaged on a very
18 detailed matter.

19 The last time I talked to you
20 you referenced a process, and I believe I
21 had asked for something in writing
22 indicating what that process was, with a
23 timeline attached. Did I get that?

24 MS. COLLINS-GREENWALD: You did
25 not get that. What we did do was, we

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 held one meeting and we asked -- we were
3 asked to hold biweekly meetings by the
4 City Solicitor. She arranged for us to
5 have biweekly meetings with all the
6 people involved in this process. So us,
7 Public Property, the Treasurer's Office,
8 Parks and Rec, Law, MDO. So what we've
9 done, we convened those meetings, and
10 actually a member of your staff, Will, is
11 actually serving on them. We have a
12 meeting this Friday, and what we intend
13 to do after that meeting was come to you
14 with, Here's where we're at, here's the
15 timeline, hopefully get you exactly what
16 you need. So that meeting is Friday. So
17 this meeting -- this callback came before
18 this meeting -- that meeting.

19 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: In
20 my periphery I'm looking at the lady to
21 your right and she was shaking her head.
22 Was that no, that it's not going to
23 happen or you're just thinking about
24 something else?

25 MS. WINKLER: I don't believe

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 that from -- with respect to the work
3 that the Treasurer's Office has to do for
4 this, that we are going to know by Friday
5 what a concrete timeline would be and
6 we're not going to be in a position. I'm
7 happy to get into detail with you to
8 explain where we are and what we are able
9 to tell you what we're doing, but we have
10 a lot of issues to evaluate, and
11 notwithstanding the fact that we're
12 treating this with a high degree of
13 priority and have tasked my senior --

14 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: What
15 was that last part about priority?

16 MS. WINKLER: It's a high
17 priority among a number of high-priority
18 projects we have.

19 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: It
20 is a high priority?

21 MS. WINKLER: In our office.
22 We are spending a lot of time on it.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: I
24 thought you said you had higher
25 priorities. I was going to say, Oh, boy,

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.

2 here we go.

3 MS. WINKLER: Well, we do have
4 four bond issues we're working on this
5 summer also. We have one person in our
6 office full time assigned to work on bond
7 issues, which is part of a large number
8 of different things we're working on.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: This
10 is my problem, and I'm probably going to
11 keep bringing you guys back until we're
12 out of here on the 20th. This is
13 something that we've been talking about
14 for a year and a half now, and all it
15 requires is a simple request for
16 proposals. I've seen probably close to a
17 hundred RFPs go out of this government
18 within that timeframe, and why we can't
19 get something as simple as this out on
20 the street, particularly when, as
21 evidenced by the conversations from the
22 providers where they actually do the work
23 that you're currently saying is going to
24 now take you into September, because I'm
25 understanding there's this task force, I

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 mean is the most ridiculous thing I've
3 ever seen. So, again, I'm going to say
4 it again. This is a case where somebody
5 says that they're going to do something,
6 but they don't do anything because they
7 really don't want to do it. Right? I
8 don't know if it's because it's not their
9 idea or anything else, but I'm going to
10 keep saying it until I see some
11 substantive process that establishes a
12 way for us to get revenue to the City of
13 Philadelphia.

14 I sat in an editorial board
15 yesterday, talking to the editorial board
16 about schools, and somehow they were
17 under the belief -- and this is based on
18 an editorial that they wrote in the
19 Sunday paper -- that the City Council
20 hasn't stepped to the plate about
21 providing revenue to the School District,
22 simply because we weren't standing at
23 some podium somewhere at a press
24 conference. And I reminded them that
25 City Council had a bill introduced last

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 year, I believe it was in February, and
3 the proceeds of the municipal marketing
4 program would have gone directly to the
5 School District. But guess what? Got no
6 feedback from the Administration. So
7 here we are a year and a half later and
8 now being told that there's a task force
9 being formed that's going to have further
10 conversation about something that could
11 have been done a year ago. This is like
12 stunning.

13 So I'm going to say it again.
14 This seems to be a case where people
15 don't want to do something because it's
16 not their idea. So what I'm going to ask
17 you to do, because I'm telling you I'm
18 calling you back next week -- you
19 hopefully will have a letter at a
20 minimum, and I'm going to keep calling
21 you guys back. And I know you love
22 coming over here, so that might not be a
23 big issue to you to keep coming back.
24 And I know it's not your problem. I know
25 it's not your issue.

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.

2 So hopefully by next week you
3 will have a letter referencing a
4 timeframe. And I hear what the
5 Treasurer's Office is saying over there,
6 but in all due respect, if you can't get
7 something done in a year and a half, then
8 maybe we need to have new people over
9 there working on something.

10 MS. WINKLER: Would you like me
11 to walk through what it is we need to do?

12 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: All
13 I asked for the last time you were here
14 was for a letter, and I was told that
15 that letter was going to be forthcoming,
16 and I did not get the letter yet. So I'm
17 just simply asking for what you said you
18 were going to get us.

19 MS. COLLINS-GREENWALD: We'll
20 make sure we get you something after
21 Friday. After that meeting on Friday,
22 we'll outline the process.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
24 Thank you. Thank you for your testimony.

25 There are no other witnesses,

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 no other questions on the bills. This
3 concludes our public hearing. We will
4 now go into our public meeting.

5 The Chair recognizes Councilman
6 O'Neill for a motion on Bill No. 130141.

7 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Thank you,
8 Mr. President. I move that Bill No.
9 130141 be reported from this Committee
10 with a favorable recommendation and
11 further move that the rules of Council be
12 suspended to permit first reading of this
13 bill at the next session of Council.

14 (Duly seconded.)

15 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: It's
16 been moved and properly seconded.

17 All those in favor?

18 (Aye.)

19 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

20 Those opposed?

21 (No response.)

22 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: The
23 ayes have it. Bill No. 130141 is
24 reported out of Committee with a
25 favorable recommendation and will be read

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 at our next session of Council.

3 The Chair recognizes Councilman
4 Squilla for a motion on Bill No. 130308
5 on the amendment.

6 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you,
7 Mr. President. I move that the amendment
8 to Bill No. 130308 be adopted.

9 (Duly seconded.)

10 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: It's
11 been moved and properly seconded.

12 All those in favor?

13 (Aye.)

14 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
15 Those opposed?

16 (No response.)

17 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: The
18 ayes have it.

19 Councilman Squilla.

20 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you,
21 Mr. President. I move that Bill No.
22 130308, as amended, be reported out of
23 this Committee with a favorable
24 recommendation and further move that the
25 rules of Council be suspended to permit

1 5/22/13 - WHOLE - BILL 130141, etc.
2 the first reading of this bill at the
3 next session of Council.

4 (Duly seconded.)

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: It's
6 been moved and properly seconded.

7 All in favor?

8 (Aye.)

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
10 Those opposed?

11 (No response.)

12 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: The
13 ayes have it. Bill No. 130308 is
14 reported out of Committee with a
15 favorable recommendation, as amended, and
16 will be read at the next session of
17 Council.

18 Thank you all very much. This
19 concludes the public meeting.

20 For the record, the Committee
21 will stand in recess until Tuesday, May
22 28th, 2013 at 10:00 a.m. in City Hall.

23 (Committee of the Whole
24 concluded at 2:40 p.m.)

25 - - -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the
proceedings, evidence and objections are
contained fully and accurately in the
stenographic notes taken by me upon the
foregoing matter, and that this is a true and
correct transcript of same.

MICHELE L. MURPHY
RPR-Notary Public

(The foregoing certification of this
transcript does not apply to any reproduction
of the same by any means, unless under the
direct control and/or supervision of the
certifying reporter.)

A ability 12:18 20:20 36:15 able 16:23 45:24 46:11 49:8 accelerated 45:8 accounted 31:6 31:17 accuracy 13:21 16:15 accurate 9:2,3 16:18 accurately 57:5 acknowledgment 23:14 actual 37:9 add 27:24 added 20:17 21:16 additional 9:14 28:10 35:14 additions 3:12,13 adjudicated 44:8 Administration 4:8 21:20 40:2,5 52:6 Administration's 32:4 adopted 55:8 advance 11:18 affect 34:25 afternoon 2:3 4:12,13,14 7:17 19:23,24 24:15 24:16 47:11,14 ago 52:11 agree 10:3 20:4 40:14 agreeing 47:17 allows 22:22 amended 55:22 56:15 amending 2:23 3:10 amendment 3:24 3:25 21:16 55:5 55:7	amount 3:18 4:25 5:4,8 7:2,4 33:23 34:2 36:3 37:5 38:2 amounts 37:2 and/or 57:22 annual 41:16 answer 7:9 11:7 anybody 35:12 anyway 16:19 appeal 3:15,17,18 4:22,24 5:5,8,13 5:14,16,18,21 5:22,24 6:6,7 7:3 8:8,20 9:4 10:16 11:9,18 13:9,17 14:2,4,7 14:7,23,23 15:9 15:11,20,24 16:20 17:18 23:12,15 29:21 32:6,8,12,13 33:7,13,14 34:5 34:8 35:18 36:25 38:3 appealed 6:11 10:16 18:6,13 appealing 27:2 35:7,23 appeals 5:11,25 6:3,5,23 8:5,14 9:12,20 11:15 11:20,25 12:16 14:9 15:14,14 15:15 17:14,24 17:24 18:15 21:4 25:6 28:6 28:19 29:20,21 30:7,24 31:5,8 31:20 34:23 35:6,9 36:13,16 36:21 37:20 38:5 39:7,8,19 applied 25:13 32:21 applies 23:4 apply 17:22 57:20	approached 4:9 47:8 arranged 48:4 aside 28:19,21 asked 6:16 47:21 48:2,3 53:13 asking 35:12 38:15 44:6 53:17 asks 21:2 assessed 3:6,14 14:19 16:4 28:22 38:18 assessment 4:22 4:24 9:2 12:17 12:21 13:8,15 13:23 14:17 15:16 16:14 17:4 20:8,21,24 22:13 assessments 6:12 15:8 38:22 39:6 assessor 20:22 assigned 50:6 assumed 38:2 assuming 9:23 28:4,6 34:2,3 37:22 attached 47:23 authorized 3:4 AVI 13:21 20:4,5 22:10 23:8,23 29:6 39:3 Aye 54:18 55:13 56:8 ayes 54:23 55:18 56:13 a.m 2:14 56:22 <tr> <td colspan="2" data-bbox="721 1549 980 1591">B</td><td data-bbox="721 1549 980 1885"> back 9:18 10:22 11:10,13,17,22 19:15 41:14,15 42:20 45:12 50:11 52:18,21 52:23 backlog 42:13 </td></tr>	B		back 9:18 10:22 11:10,13,17,22 19:15 41:14,15 42:20 45:12 50:11 52:18,21 52:23 backlog 42:13
B		back 9:18 10:22 11:10,13,17,22 19:15 41:14,15 42:20 45:12 50:11 52:18,21 52:23 backlog 42:13			

 balance 25:16 27:7,8,11 35:2 **Baltimore** 6:19 **based** 35:6 46:5 51:17 **basis** 5:21,24 **BASS** 1:10 **bathroom** 37:10 **behalf** 23:2,25 **belief** 51:17 **believe** 4:4 5:20 12:17 14:17 15:16 16:13,16 35:21 47:20 48:25 52:2 **believes** 5:15 **benefit** 22:24 23:10,21 24:21 **best** 36:15 **better** 12:5,6 **big** 18:11 20:17 26:19 36:22,22 37:15 52:23 **bigger** 26:23 **bill** 1:12 2:22 3:1 3:10,16,24 4:1,8 4:19 5:1 6:1,13 6:22,25 7:1,6 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1,22,23 12:25 13:1,3,10 13:11,12,14,15 13:23 14:1 15:1 15:23 16:1,3 17:1,12,17 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1,7 21:13 22:1,22 23:1,7 24:1,19 25:1 26:1,9 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1,4,6 33:1,21,23 34:1 34:13 35:1,19 36:1 37:1,23 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1,12 43:1 44:1 45:1 | 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1 51:25 52:1 53:1 54:1,6,8,13,23 55:1,4,8,21 56:1 56:2,13 **bills** 1:19 2:6,11 2:12,19 16:18 54:2 **bit** 41:7 **biweekly** 48:3,5 **BLACKWELL** 1:11 **blatantly** 11:12 **BLONDELL** 1:16 **board** 6:4 8:21 51:14,15 **BOBBY** 1:13 **body** 42:25 44:8,9 **bond** 50:4,6 **borrowings** 27:17 **Boston** 6:18 **bother** 46:23 **boy** 49:25 **BRIAN** 1:15 **Bridget** 47:11 **brief** 47:5,7 **briefly** 47:14 **bringing** 50:11 **Brown** 1:16 19:20 19:21,25 21:6 21:12,18 22:3 **BRT** 6:3 9:15 11:19 12:19,20 13:16 14:23 15:9 21:2 34:20 35:24 39:25 46:4 **budget** 4:18 29:12 29:15 31:3,19 35:5 43:8,9 44:21 **budgeted** 31:25 32:3 34:23 **budgets** 22:15 **built** 29:15 30:3,7 |

35:20 different 7:20 16:10,11 27:9 30:10 50:8 differentials 25:7 direct 57:22 directly 52:4 Director 4:16,18 43:19 disagree 40:15 discarded 18:21 18:24 Discounts 3:12 discourage 8:3,13 discouraged 11:14 discussed 7:5 discussion 44:18 discussions 45:10 46:4,7 District 9:20 22:2 25:19,24 26:4 27:16,23 28:8 28:24 51:21 52:5 District's 6:9 doing 20:11 26:20 45:7 49:9 dollar 37:25 39:9 39:11 dollars 34:4,9 double 13:4 doubled 39:3 doubt 22:24 23:10 23:22 dozen 6:17 dramatic 22:16 dramatically 6:2 driving 39:11,12 Dubow 4:13,16 7:12,17 8:12,25 9:13 10:5,9 11:3 11:16 12:15 13:25 14:13,20 14:25 15:3,19 16:6 17:8,19 18:3,10,16,23	19:6,13,24 20:16 21:23 24:16,23 25:11 25:18 26:2,6,10 26:16,25 27:8 27:18,21 28:4 29:18 30:6,15 30:21,25 31:7 31:13 33:16,25 34:10,15 35:4 36:4,13 37:21 37:25 38:7,11 38:21 39:5,8,15 40:3,10,17 41:3 41:9,15,23 42:5 43:5,14 44:3,13 44:19 45:19 46:16,19 47:2 due 16:25 33:18 37:9 53:6 Duly 54:14 55:9 56:4	25:5,8 26:13 29:13 36:14 37:19 estimated 25:17 estimates 45:14 evaluate 49:10 everybody 2:16 26:10 32:25 evidence 57:4 evidenced 50:21 exact 10:10 exactly 15:10 20:11 41:12 48:15 example 25:12 excluded 26:13 execution 20:5 Executive 43:19 exemption 24:19 expect 27:14 experience 37:6 explain 49:8 extent 15:6 extra 34:9	36:14 37:6 38:5 filing 5:12 7:24 8:3 11:15 Finance 4:16 financial 32:19 financially 32:15 find 38:20 43:10 first 40:24 47:15 54:12 56:2 first-level 14:12 15:5 17:9 20:17 25:6 37:7 38:12 39:16,18 Fiscal 29:4,5,6 five 45:3,16 fix 15:12 flow 6:10 9:18 21:24 22:11,18 22:19 25:9 26:5 27:5,9 28:3,8 31:14 flows 27:20 folks 2:3 follow 18:25 19:4 force 50:25 52:8 forcing 11:8 13:6 foregoing 57:7,19 forever 8:9 formed 52:9 forthcoming 53:15 forums 22:11 forward 35:2 found 37:8 four 45:16 50:4 fraction 6:10 freeze 3:3 46:18 freight 16:4 Friday 48:12,16 49:4 53:21,21 friend 47:5 frivolous 36:16,17 36:21 full 5:8 6:21,25 7:2 16:4,11 34:2 43:17 50:6 fully 27:13 57:5	fund 25:16 27:6,8 27:11 further 52:9 54:11 55:24 future 16:22
G				
gap 25:22 general 38:16 getting 13:13 22:13 39:23 40:23 give 11:7 22:23 23:9,21 given 9:14 20:3,4 20:6 21:18 24:24 25:5 42:6 giving 25:12 glut 45:4 go 12:18 13:10,11 13:14 20:20 31:19 33:3 34:19,20 35:22 36:19,20 37:4 39:6,9 40:23 50:2,17 54:4 goal 11:22 13:21 14:3 goes 9:18 10:22 going 7:21 8:4,15 8:21 9:7,9 10:13 10:14 11:5,6 16:21,24 17:2 17:18 23:17 25:2 26:22 29:6 29:16,20,24 30:12,19,23 31:4,19,24 32:24,25 33:3,4 34:8,19 35:22 36:14,18,19 37:2 38:10 39:13 40:18 42:8,13,14 44:9 46:10 48:22 49:4,6,25 50:10 50:23 51:3,5,9				

52:9,13,16,20 53:15,18 good 2:2 4:11,13 4:14 7:17 19:23 19:24 24:15,16 47:5,10,13 GOODE 1:11 government 20:11,14 50:17 Green 1:12 24:12 24:13,17,24 25:15,23 26:3,8 26:12,21 27:3 27:13,19,22 28:12 Greenlee 1:12 7:14,15 8:17 9:6 9:22 10:7,20 11:4 12:3 15:4 17:21 gripe 37:3 ground 43:3 guess 7:19,23 9:23,24 26:22 44:4,7,11 45:20 52:5 guessing 44:2 guys 46:22 50:11 52:21	31:20 39:13 hearing 2:5,10 43:20 44:8,9 54:3 hearings 45:17 hears 6:3 heavy 42:22 heightened 35:8 held 48:2 help 40:20 HENON 1:13 high 38:19 39:24 49:12,16,20 higher 38:10 39:4 42:21 49:24 high-priority 49:17 hikes 22:13 hold 48:3 holding 31:21 homeowners 10:12 homestead 32:22 hope 2:16 11:10 15:4 hopefully 15:14 48:15 52:19 53:2 house 37:14 household 22:14 32:16 houses 17:3 hundred 34:4 50:17	including 6:18 incorrect 15:24 increase 5:18 6:2 7:22 14:8 25:3 32:9 35:25 36:22 37:16 39:22,24 42:22 increased 29:5 increases 6:11 10:13 17:22 18:4 22:16 independent 39:25 42:25 indicating 47:22 industrial 26:14 26:17 inflate 17:13 inflated 16:18 information 21:7 intend 48:12 intent 21:12 intention 11:17 interest 3:13 5:4,7 7:3 8:16 10:24 23:3 interest-free 32:7 32:14 internal 46:7 introduced 51:25 involve 38:22 involved 48:6 issue 21:25 23:11 31:14 42:24 52:23,25 issues 16:13,14 22:12,14,18,19 28:3 37:8 49:10 50:4,7	jurisdiction 16:8 jurisdictions 6:16 6:17 justice 24:2	line 23:17 little 5:15 26:6 28:23 40:6,8 loan 32:7,14 long 11:7 45:23 longer 6:4 9:10,17 42:14 looking 8:2 18:3 48:20 lose 5:7 7:2 29:25 30:8,13,19,23 31:23 loss 32:3 losses 31:22 38:3 lot 7:20 8:5 10:19 11:9,24 17:24 22:12,18 26:22 37:10 38:15,21 45:3 49:10,22 loud 27:4 love 52:21 low 38:18 lower 42:8 lowered 38:20 40:25 41:4,6,7 46:9	
H	I	J	K	M	
half 6:16 19:10 39:17 50:14 52:7 53:7 Hall 1:6 56:22 handle 21:4 45:24 happen 20:19 48:23 happens 12:19 15:5 happy 7:9 37:13 49:7 hate 43:8 head 25:5 48:21 hear 4:7 12:21 13:17 53:4 heard 2:20 16:21	idea 11:5 51:9 52:16 impact 6:8 9:19 important 23:8 incentive 5:14 14:6 15:22 32:5 incentives 42:24 43:11 incentivize 42:19 included 26:9,11 46:4	J 1:15 JANNIE 1:11 JOHNSON 1:13 Jones 1:14 22:8,9 24:7 JR 1:11,14 July 43:13	keep 8:9,23 50:11 51:10 52:20,23 KENYATTA 1:13 kidding 36:17 kind 10:22 40:10 46:6 kinds 23:18 know 8:18,18,19 8:21 9:2,7 11:19 16:12 18:14 27:24 32:20,24 33:6 38:5 41:12 43:21 46:11 49:4 51:8 52:21 52:24,24 knowing 8:4	LA 6:18 lady 48:20 large 6:17 37:16 50:7 law 5:6 48:8 legislation 4:23 5:10 14:8,11 42:2 46:20 legitimate 5:21,24 7:25 8:13 10:2,3 11:15,25 18:15 29:20 30:8 37:3 42:11 letter 52:19 53:3 53:14,15,16 let's 10:11 39:16 level 35:8 43:22 Lewis 2:18,22 liability 5:2 light 23:8,9 limiting 3:15	making 44:25 45:3 manipulate 33:4 manner 4:21 13:18 March 31:15 33:19 36:3 MARIA 1:16 MARK 1:17 marketing 47:15 52:3 matter 7:22 47:18 57:7 MDO 48:8 mean 6:3 8:19,22 9:23 18:14 19:7 21:24 25:9 32:2 34:21 38:11 40:13 44:2

45:11 51:2 means 18:20 57:21 measures 10:11 22:20 meeting 48:2,12 48:13,16,17,18 48:18 53:21 54:4 56:19 meetings 48:3,5,9 member 48:10 members 4:15 merit 5:13 6:5,8 9:21 10:18 29:22,25 met 42:23 MICHELE 57:14 million 25:14,16 25:21,22,24 26:4,19 27:7,11 28:23 29:2,7,9 29:13,15 30:2,4 30:6,14,18,23 31:18 38:3 millions 25:9,10 minimum 52:20 miscalculation 23:2 missed 43:11 mistake 23:4 mistakes 15:7 23:25 Mm-hmm 19:13 30:25 money 13:13,20 23:6 28:19 29:12,17,24 30:2,3 31:5,17 31:21,22 33:15 34:23,24 35:5 month 43:10 morning 19:23 mortgage 12:20 12:22,23 13:7 motion 54:6 55:4 move 32:19 40:8 45:5,7 54:8,11	55:7,21,24 moved 54:16 55:11 56:6 moving 35:2 40:5 40:8,19 multitude 15:12 municipal 47:15 52:3 MURPHY 57:14 N name 4:15 Nassau 6:19,21 nature 20:3 near 45:14 need 9:15 17:23 18:7 24:3 43:16 43:23 48:16 53:8,11 needs 46:5 negative 6:8 never 13:10 20:25 new 6:18 15:8 20:18 53:8 norm 23:20 normally 45:6 notes 57:6 notify 12:24 notwithstanding 49:11 number 6:2 10:10 11:11 14:9,18 17:13 18:2,11 23:16 26:20 30:13 33:8 37:9 37:20 38:2,19 38:19,24 39:5 39:12 49:17 50:7 numbers 46:6 O objections 57:4 obviously 10:6,9 18:14 October 11:21 offered 3:24 20:25	offhand 44:11 office 20:7,20 48:7 49:3,21 50:6 53:5 Oh 1:15 49:25 Okay 22:3 26:8 26:21 40:22 46:23 old 41:14,17 42:20 ones 7:24 30:9 36:16,17 one-year 24:19 28:2 OPA 10:23 15:2 25:7 opinion 8:11 35:3 36:2 39:21 opposed 23:20 41:19 54:20 55:15 56:10 opposition 4:19 order 24:21 outlier 23:20 outline 53:22 outweighed 23:24 overreacting 34:21 owe 3:4 owed 17:2 23:3,6 24:22 owner 5:20 owners 5:23 25:2 O'BRIEN 1:14 O'Neill 1:15 36:10,11 37:22 38:4,9,14,23 39:7,10,20 40:4 40:12,22 41:5 41:13,20,25 42:6 43:7,24 44:5,16,23 45:25 54:6,7 P pace 45:6,8 paid 5:8 33:17,24	34:4 paper 51:19 Parks 48:8 part 14:3 17:8,11 23:5 26:20 49:15 50:7 participant 3:3 particular 23:22 particularly 50:20 passed 9:9 passes 17:17 pay 4:25 5:3,6,17 6:24 7:2,3 13:3 13:19,23 16:3,4 16:19,23,25 18:22 22:25 24:21 31:12,14 31:23 32:8,10 33:9,11,20 34:9 34:11,13,16 35:18 36:2 43:2 paying 31:15 37:17 payment 3:18 13:4 33:10 46:9 payments 4:21 pays 12:23 penalties 3:14 5:4 5:7 7:4 32:10 penalty 8:15 23:4 Pennsylvania 1:6 people 6:6 7:20 7:24 8:3,6,7,14 9:4 11:9,14,17 11:19,22 13:5,6 14:6,16,22 15:8 15:11,13,15,20 15:20,23 17:21 18:18,21 20:19 22:12,25 23:12 25:13 29:19 30:19 31:4,7,9 32:11,19 33:2,2 35:7,9 36:18 37:4,6 38:15 43:3 45:17 48:6	52:14 53:8 percent 10:12,15 17:21 18:4,6 19:9,10 24:25 25:12 29:5 39:4 39:22 42:9 period 9:10 42:22 45:13 periphery 48:20 permit 54:12 55:25 person 50:5 person's 34:7 Philadelphia 1:2 1:6 2:24 3:11 4:17 6:15 32:21 51:13 plan 40:24 42:18 plate 51:20 please 2:18 podium 51:23 point 8:20 21:6 23:17 43:20 poor 33:5 position 49:6 possible 11:2 14:5 21:5 possibly 42:13 potential 25:8 practice 6:14 practices 6:15,20 PRESENT 1:9 President 1:10 2:2 3:21 4:5,11 4:14 7:11,16 10:21 12:8,9,14 19:17,22 22:4,5 22:10 24:5,8,9 24:14 28:13,14 35:13 36:6,7,12 46:3,14,21 47:3 47:13 48:19 49:14,19,23 50:9 53:12,23 54:8,15,19,22 55:7,10,14,17 55:21 56:5,9,12
---	---	--	--	--

press 51:23 pretty 39:24 46:17 previous 13:12 24:22 33:21 34:13 previously 33:12 prior 3:8,19 5:2 priorities 49:25 priority 49:13,15 49:17,20 probably 9:17 14:22 26:18 27:2 50:10,16 problem 11:6 15:12 25:9,14 26:5 27:5 28:9 37:23 43:12 46:10 50:10 52:24 problems 17:11 procedures 18:25 19:4 proceedings 57:4 proceeds 52:3 process 5:18 6:24 9:17 14:4 15:6 17:15 20:18 31:4 35:17 38:17 47:20,22 48:6 51:11 53:22 program 3:3,8 46:18 52:4 projects 49:18 promise 47:6 properly 54:16 55:11 56:6 properties 10:15 10:18 18:4 26:14,15,24 property 3:7,15 4:21 5:20,23 6:22 20:7,21 25:2 47:6,12 48:7 proposals 50:16	proposed 4:23 proposes 4:20 protect 16:17 17:7 32:25 33:5 protections 20:13 proven 6:23 provide 15:22 20:13 32:5 43:23 providers 50:22 provides 5:13 providing 3:2 51:21 Provisions 2:25 public 2:5 47:6,12 48:7 54:3,4 56:19 57:15 put 10:10 20:6 27:14 putting 17:3 p.m 1:7 56:24 Q question 30:16 35:14,16 39:11 43:25 questions 7:9 35:12 37:19 38:15,17 46:24 54:2 quickly 11:2 14:4 21:4 43:13 45:24 QUINONES-S... 1:16 quite 41:6 R raised 20:2 range 37:13 rate 3:6 19:7 reach 32:24 read 2:12,18 54:25 56:16 reading 54:12 56:2 real 36:16 38:22 47:7,14	realistically 9:9 really 8:18 9:4,21 11:21 15:21,24 17:23 18:7 27:5 27:9 35:20 37:16 43:21 51:7 reason 14:7 15:17 17:9,11 18:20 20:17 40:15,18 reasons 7:5 reassessment 6:21 16:12 Rebecca 4:18 Rec 48:8 recess 56:21 recessed 2:13 recognizes 7:13 12:11 19:19 22:7 24:11 28:16 36:9 54:5 55:3 recommendation 54:10,25 55:24 56:15 record 2:13 3:23 20:7 56:20 reduction 3:5 referenced 47:20 referencing 53:3 refund 14:2 regarding 2:6 regardless 6:7 relatively 27:12 relief 10:11 remember 24:25 44:11 reminded 51:24 remove 11:23 removes 5:12 reported 54:9,24 55:22 56:14 reporter 57:23 reproduction 57:20 request 7:6 43:17 43:18 44:19,22	50:15 required 4:25 6:24 7:3 requires 50:15 requiring 3:17 45:22 resident 12:25 residents 16:17 17:7 35:18 resident's 13:18 resolution 1:20 2:9,19 resolved 39:17 resources 9:14,16 21:2 40:20,21 43:16,22 44:7 45:22 respect 26:23 27:16 49:2 53:6 respond 24:4 response 54:21 55:16 56:11 responsibility 20:10 responsible 17:6 result 3:5 27:25 revenue 22:20 27:25 51:12,21 review 15:5 17:10 18:13 39:16,18 reviews 10:25 11:8,10 14:11 14:12 20:18 37:7 38:12 REYNOLDS 1:16 RFPs 50:17 Rhynhart 4:18 28:21 29:3,10 32:2 44:10,14 44:21 ridiculous 51:2 right 10:5 14:20 16:24 18:16 20:9,15 23:12 24:23 26:18,25 29:10,18 30:11	30:21 34:15,17 36:5,24 38:21 40:10 43:13,22 44:5 45:19 48:21 51:7 road 43:12 Rob 4:16 32:2 role 20:10 rollout 20:5 Room 1:6 round 41:11 RPR-Notary 57:15 rules 54:11 55:25 run 42:17 S salaries 40:25 41:3,14,16,17 41:18 42:2,8,20 44:18 salary 42:21 Sale 17:3 sat 51:14 savvy 33:2 saying 8:23 10:23 29:13 30:5,18 50:23 51:10 53:5 says 51:5 School 6:9 9:19 22:2 25:19,24 26:4 28:24 51:21 52:5 schools 25:21 51:16 second 37:10 42:17 seconded 54:14 54:16 55:9,11 56:4,6 secretary 42:3 Section 3:11 see 11:11 36:23 44:17 45:9 51:10 seeing 43:12
--	---	---	---	--

seeks 20:14 seen 50:16 51:3 sends 12:21 senior 2:24 46:18 49:13 seniors 33:5 sense 20:23 sentence 21:22 September 50:24 serve 5:25 serving 48:11 session 54:13 55:2 56:3,16 set 12:5 28:19,21 settlement 33:13 seven 22:10 Seventeen 18:8 shaking 48:21 Sheriff 17:3 shift 28:2 short 21:19,20 side 22:23 25:19 25:19,20,24 26:4 27:6 significant 7:21 significantly 39:6 similar 19:8 simple 50:15,19 simply 51:22 53:17 slow 17:14 slowly 40:6,8,19 small 14:18 37:5 37:15 smaller 36:25 37:10 smart 32:15,18,23 smooth 27:20 Solicitor 47:16 48:4 somebody 12:16 13:22 34:19 36:21 51:4 somebody's 35:21 soon 17:17 sorry 2:3 29:3 39:8	Special 2:25 spend 35:23 spending 49:22 spoke 12:15 sponsor 21:7 Squilla 1:17 4:2,3 12:12,13 14:10 14:15,21 15:2 15:10 16:2,9 17:16,25 18:8 18:12,17 19:3 19:11,14 20:3 20:12 21:9,10 21:15 28:17,18 28:25 29:8,11 29:23 30:11,17 30:22 31:2,11 31:16 32:17 33:19 34:6,12 34:18 35:11,15 36:5 55:4,6,19 55:20 Squilla's 22:22 42:12 staff 48:10 staffing 42:23 stand 56:21 standing 51:22 stark 22:16 start 16:24 17:2 statistic 25:4 stenographic 57:6 stepped 51:20 street 50:20 study 9:25 stunning 52:12 subject 47:15 substantially 41:8 41:21 46:8 substantive 51:11 successful 5:16 13:10 31:8,10 31:12 suggested 20:12 summer 50:5 Sunday 51:19 supervision 57:22	supportive 46:20 46:22 sure 2:17 16:17 21:3 30:15 41:16 45:22 53:20 suspended 54:12 55:25 system 18:20 33:4 T table 4:10 47:9 take 6:4 9:7 20:9 23:16 26:18 42:14 45:23 50:24 taken 57:6 talk 7:23 20:21 22:11 talked 16:8 44:24 46:17 47:19 talking 13:20 29:4 30:9 31:9 35:19 39:14 45:16 50:13 51:15 task 50:25 52:8 tasked 49:13 tax 2:25 3:3,6,13 3:16,17,19 4:21 5:2,5,9 6:22,25 12:25 13:23 32:6,9 33:17,21 34:7 taxes 3:5 16:25 19:5 22:25 24:22 26:22 35:21,25 38:20 taxpayer 5:14,17 22:23 23:25 24:20 taxpayers 4:24 5:6 6:24,25 taxpayer's 3:7 tell 8:7 49:9 telling 52:17 Ten 25:15	tend 37:4 tens 25:10 terms 3:9,20 28:22 testified 43:19 testify 4:19 testimony 2:11 7:6,8 20:6 46:17 53:24 thank 2:15 3:22 4:6 7:12,15 12:8 12:10,13 19:16 19:18,21 22:4,6 24:6,7,10,13 28:12,13,15 36:6,8,11 46:13 46:15,25 47:2 47:16 53:24,24 54:7 55:6,20 56:18 theory 27:23 thing 23:13 32:15 32:23 33:22 36:24 40:18 51:2 things 8:22 15:4 28:5 40:5 50:8 think 8:4,12,14,14 9:11,13,15,25 10:17,23 11:6,8 11:16 12:4,5 13:22 14:5,13 15:18,21,23 17:5,6,17,19 18:23,24 19:8 20:16,22 22:21 23:7,20 25:13 26:10,17 27:4 28:25 29:22 30:7,9,12 34:6 34:21,22 35:6,7 35:9 36:18,25 37:3,14,24 38:7 38:10,13 39:2,5 40:7 41:10,18 42:16 44:10 45:19,21 46:17 46:19	thinking 7:19 10:8 48:23 thinks 40:5 Thirty 30:6 thought 49:24 thousand 14:16 18:9 38:8,25 three 20:9 tight 27:12 time 4:7 8:6,20 9:8,10,12 22:21 29:14 33:15 35:23 47:4,19 49:22 50:6 53:13 timeframe 23:15 33:11 50:18 53:4 timeline 47:23 48:15 49:5 timely 13:17 times 27:10 titles 2:19 today 2:10,10,20 4:17 38:25 told 52:8 53:14 tolling 3:13 tone 12:6 top 25:4 total 26:2 28:24 TRAN 27:15,16 28:2 transcript 57:8,20 Treasurer's 48:7 49:3 53:5 treating 49:12 trial 34:20 tripled 39:4 trouble 36:19,20 true 57:7 try 8:7,8 10:25 11:4 18:19 33:3 trying 8:13 25:21 27:4 40:23 44:17 Tuesday 56:21
---	--	---	--	---

two 16:21 26:19 28:5 45:11 type 16:10 typically 11:20	wanted 45:23 wasn't 14:17 43:22 way 7:25 10:10 13:8 17:6 24:18 35:2 36:23 51:12 web 18:19 Wednesday 1:7 46:2 week 43:9 52:18 53:2 went 33:24 34:7 35:21 38:18 39:16 41:9,10 weren't 51:22 we'll 30:10 53:19 53:22 we're 5:10 8:13 13:20 17:2 21:23 22:18 30:9 31:8 43:8 45:15 46:19 48:14 49:6,9,11 50:4,8,11 we've 9:14 20:25 23:14 48:8 50:13 WILLIAM 1:12 WILSON 1:11 win 8:15 13:25 30:10,12 31:23 32:13 35:8,10 window 21:19,20 WINKLER 48:25 49:16,21 50:3 53:10 witness 4:9 47:8 witnesses 4:9 46:25 47:8 53:25 won 41:11 word 11:15 work 43:3 49:2 50:6,22 working 50:4,8 53:9	workload 46:8 worried 21:24 worth 37:14 wouldn't 10:16 27:2 34:10 writing 47:21 wrong 11:12 12:2 12:18 13:7,15 16:5 17:4 33:8 wrote 51:18	\$4,000 12:25 35:24 \$400 25:3 \$5 26:4 \$80 27:7,11 \$800 33:24	130180 1:19 2:8 130181 1:20 2:8 130182 1:20 2:8 130183 1:20 2:9 130190 1:20 2:10 130254 1:20 2:9 130308 1:20 2:9 2:11,21 3:10,24 4:8,20 55:4,8,22 56:13 14 29:4,5,6 37:20 15 39:23 41:8 15,000 17:23 39:19 44:2 45:15 16,000 10:18 160,000 10:14 17,000 18:7 170,000 18:5 19-1303 3:11 19-2900 2:23
U	Y	1	1st 11:21 43:13 1:50 1:7 10 10:15 17:21 18:6 25:12,23 39:4 10,000 15:14 39:19,22 44:2 45:15 10:00 2:14 56:22 100,000 26:17 12 25:24 120338 1:19 2:6 120339 1:19 2:6 120651 1:19 2:7 130141 1:19 2:7 2:11,20,22 3:1 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1,6,9,23 55:1 56:1 130142 1:19 2:7 130150 1:19 2:7 130163 1:19 2:7 130178 1:19 2:8 130179 1:19 2:8	2 2,000 38:24 39:22 42:15 45:14 2:40 56:24 20 28:23 20th 50:12 200 34:9 2013 1:7 2:14 56:22 2014 21:17 22 1:7 28 2:14 28th 56:22
V	\$	3	4	5
valid 6:22 value 3:6,14 16:5 28:22 38:18 39:9,12 values 14:19 verified 6:14 versus 46:8 view 21:21 32:18 voted 7:7 voting 43:9	\$10 25:14 \$12 25:14,15 29:13 30:4 \$2,000 35:25 \$200 34:7,16 35:20,22 36:18 \$3,000 35:24 \$30 29:8,15 30:2 30:18,23 31:18 38:3 \$304 25:22	30 10:12 18:4 29:2,7 30:13 33:12 31st 33:20 36:3	400 1:6 45 42:3	5,000 15:15

5/22/13 3:1 4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1 32:1 33:1 34:1 35:1 36:1 37:1 38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1 44:1 45:1 46:1 47:1 48:1 49:1 50:1 51:1 52:1 53:1 54:1 55:1 56:1 50 29:5 42:4 50,000 14:14,16 15:13 18:13 38:12 39:15 500 39:21,24 42:8 44:2 570,000 10:14 579,000 18:5 7 70 42:4 75 41:8 8 80 24:25 25:20 9 91 19:9,9				
--	--	--	--	--