

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

Room 400, City Hall
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania
Wednesday, April 24, 2013
11:00 a.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCIL PRESIDENT DARRELL L. CLARKE
COUNCILWOMAN CINDY BASS
COUNCILMAN CURTIS JONES, JR., CHAIR
COUNCILMAN JAMES KENNEY
COUNCILMAN DENNIS O'BRIEN
COUNCILMAN BRIAN O'NEILL
COUNCILMAN DAVID OH
COUNCILMAN MARK SQUILLA

BILL NOS. 120338, 120339, 120651, 130141, 130142,
130150, 130163, 130178, 130179, 130180, 130181,
130182, 130182, 130183, 130254

RESOLUTION NO. 130190,

1 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

2 Thank you. This is the public hearing
3 of the Committee of the Whole regarding
4 Bills Nos. 120338, 120339, 120651,
5 130141, 130142, 130150, 130163, 130178,
6 130179; 130180, 130181, 130182, 130183,
7 130254 and Resolution Number 130190.

8 Mr. Decker, would you
9 please read the titles of the bills and
10 resolution.

11 MR. DECKER: Bill Number
12 120338 entitled an ordinance of the
13 amending Section 19-1307 of the
14 Philadelphia code, entitled, "Deferrals
15 of Real Estate Tax," by further
16 providing for certain deferrals of
17 payment of a certain portion of Real
18 Estate Taxes due the City of
19 Philadelphia or the Philadelphia School
20 District.

21 And Bill No. 120339
22 entitled an ordinance amending Title 19
23 of the Philadelphia code by adding a
24 new Chapter 19-2900A, entitled "Special

1 Real Estate Tax Provisions For Low
2 Income Taxpayers," providing for
3 credits against real estate tax for
4 certain low income taxpayers.

5 And Bill No. 120651
6 entitled an ordinance amending Chapter
7 19-1300 of the Philadelphia Code,
8 entitled "Real Estate Taxes," by
9 reducing the amount of real estate
10 taxes to be exempted for certain
11 improvements to, or construction of,
12 certain residential, commercial,
13 industrial, or other business
14 properties, and by reducing the
15 duration of such exemptions.

16 And Bill No. 130141
17 entitled an ordinance amending Chapter
18 19-2900 of the Philadelphia Code,
19 entitled, "Senior Citizen Special Tax
20 Provisions," by providing for those
21 circumstances where a participant in
22 the tax freeze program authorized by
23 that Chapter would owe less taxes as a
24 result of a reduction in the tax rate

1 or the assessed value of the taxpayers'
2 property but for his or her prior
3 enrollment in the program.

4 And Bill No. 130142,
5 entitled an ordinance phasing over a
6 period of years the effects of the
7 actual value initiative and authorizing
8 real estate taxes for the City of
9 Philadelphia and the School District of
10 Philadelphia for Fiscal Year 2014 and
11 thereafter by amending Chapter 19-1300
12 of the Philadelphia Code entitled "Real
13 Estate Taxes," providing for a tax and
14 tax rate on real property; and by
15 amending Chapter 19-1800 of the
16 Philadelphia Code, entitled, "School
17 Tax Authorization," to further
18 authorize the Board of Education of the
19 School District of Philadelphia to
20 impose a tax on real estate within the
21 City of Philadelphia and providing for
22 a tax rate.

23 And Bill No. 130150
24 entitled an ordinance authorizing real

1 estate taxes for the City of
2 Philadelphia and the School District of
3 Philadelphia at a combined rate of
4 1 percent for Fiscal Year 2014 and
5 thereafter by amending Chapter 19-1300
6 of the Philadelphia Code entitled "Real
7 Estate Taxes," to provide for a tax and
8 tax rate on real property, and by
9 amending Chapter 19-1800 of the
10 Philadelphia Code, entitled "School Tax
11 Authorization," to further authorize
12 the Board of Education of the School
13 District of Philadelphia to impose a
14 tax and tax rate on real estate within
15 the City of Philadelphia and providing
16 for a tax rate.

17 And Bill No. 130163
18 entitled an ordinance amending Title 19
19 of the Philadelphia Code entitled
20 "Finance Taxes and the Collections," by
21 amending Chapter 19-1300 of the
22 Philadelphia Code, entitled "Real
23 Estate Taxes," by providing for certain
24 deferrals of payment of a certain

1 portion of real estate taxes due the
2 City of Philadelphia or the
3 Philadelphia School District for
4 owner-occupied properties that are the
5 owner's primary residence, with a
6 limitation of five years.

7 And Bill No. 130178,
8 entitled an ordinance to adopt the
9 Capital Program for six Fiscal Years
10 2014-2019 inclusive.

11 And Bill No. 130179
12 entitled an ordinance to adopt a Fiscal
13 2014 Capital Budget.

14 And Bill No. 130180
15 entitled an ordinance adopting the
16 operating budget for Fiscal Year 2014.

17 And Bill No. 130181
18 entitled an ordinance amending Chapters
19 19-1300 and 19-1800 of the Philadelphia
20 Code entitled, respectively, "Real
21 Estate Taxes" and "School Tax
22 Authorization," by establishing a tax
23 rate for City real estate tax and the
24 authorizing and establishing a tax rate

1 for School District real estate tax.
2 And by revising the homestead
3 exclusion.

4 And Bill No. 130182
5 entitled an ordinance amending Chapter
6 19-1800 of the Philadelphia Code
7 entitled "School Tax Authorization," by
8 amending Section 19-1806 entitled
9 "Authorization of a Realty Use and
10 Occupancy Tax," to further authorize
11 the tax and to set the rate for such
12 tax.

13 And Bill No. 130183
14 entitled an ordinance amending Chapter
15 19-1500 of the Philadelphia Code
16 entitled "Wage and Net Profits Tax," by
17 revising certain tax rates.

18 And Bill No. 130254,
19 entitled an ordinance phasing over a
20 period of years the effects of the
21 changes in real property assessments
22 determined by the actual value
23 initiative and authorizing real estate
24 taxes for the City of Philadelphia and

1 the School District of Philadelphia for
2 Fiscal Year 2014 and thereafter by
3 amending Chapter 19-1300 of the
4 Philadelphia Code, entitled "Real
5 Estate Taxes," providing for a tax and
6 tax rate on real property; and by
7 amending the Chapter 19-1800 of the
8 Philadelphia Code entitled "School Tax
9 Authorization," to further authorize
10 the Board of Education of the School
11 District of Philadelphia to impose a
12 tax on real estate within the City of
13 Philadelphia and providing for a tax
14 rate.

15 And Resolution Number
16 130190 entitled a resolution providing
17 for the approval by the Council of City
18 of Philadelphia of a Revised Five-Year
19 Financial Plan for the City of
20 Philadelphia and covering Fiscal Years
21 2014 through 2018, and incorporating
22 proposed changes with respect to Fiscal
23 Year 2013, which is to be submitted by
24 the Mayor to the Pennsylvania

1 Intergovernmental Cooperation Authority
2 pursuant to the Intergovernmental
3 Cooperation Agreement, authorized by an
4 ordinance of this Council approved by
5 the Mayor on January 3rd, 1992,
6 Bill No. 1563-A, by and between the
7 City and the Authority.

8 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
9 Thank you, Mr. Decker.

10 Now I'd like to call the
11 Fire Department for its testimony.

12 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Good
13 morning, Council President Clarke and
14 members of the Council.

15 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
16 Good morning.

17 COMMISSIONER AYERS: For
18 the record, I'm Fire Commissioner Lloyd
19 Ayers. With me is David Beatrice,
20 Deputy Commissioner For Administrative
21 Services, and members of my executive
22 team and staff. It is our pleasure to
23 testify before this committee.

24 I have submitted our

1 testimony for your review, but I would
2 like to take a few minutes to highlight
3 some pieces of that testimony.

4 For Fiscal Year 2014, we
5 are requesting a total operating budget
6 of \$219,152,358. That funding level
7 not only maintains the current staffing
8 and service levels, but it also
9 includes an additional \$4,731,000
10 investment in Class 300 and 400
11 emergency safety and rescue equipment
12 items as follows: \$4 million to
13 purchase self-contained breathing
14 apparatus, SCBA, and that is phase 1 of
15 the payment; \$560,000 to purchase 35
16 new Jaws of Life Emergency Rescue Tool
17 System; \$100,000 increase in the price
18 of medical oxygen; \$71,000 for the
19 replacement of air bottles.

20 We ended the year in 2012
21 with the lowest number of recorded fire
22 fatalities in the City's history at 25.
23 That is a 22 percent reduction from the
24 previous year's 32 recorded fire

1 fatalities. Our prevention and
2 education activities are working.

3 Citizens are using their
4 early-warning systems and getting out
5 of their burning homes quicker.

6 The Department also
7 celebrated the re-opening of Engine
8 Company No. 38 at its new location.
9 Engine 38 is a brand-new,
10 state-of-the-art fire station facility.

11 In January 2013, the
12 Department graduated a double class of
13 the new firefighters. They are now
14 working in the fire stations and on
15 medic units throughout the City.

16 The Department plans on
17 hiring another 160 firefighters, fire
18 cadets, in June of 2013.

19 The Department responded to
20 231,520 calls for emergency medical
21 services with 75 percent of those calls
22 leading to transportation to a
23 hospital.

24 To increase EMS oversight

1 and provide additional direct support,
2 the Department is currently in the
3 process of hiring its first deputy
4 commissioner for emergency medical
5 services.

6 On December 3rd, 2012, the
7 Department hired 21 fire service
8 paramedics. In July 2013, the
9 Department plans on hiring a class of
10 approximately 24 fire service cadets.

11 The Department has worked
12 hard to recruit the best to our force
13 and among the various ranks.

14 The racial/gender breakdown
15 for the current 22,135 uniformed
16 employees is 28 percent
17 African-American; 65 percent Caucasian;
18 6 percent Hispanic; and 1 percent
19 other, the Asian and Indian groups.
20 That is further broken down as 93
21 percent male and 7 percent female.

22 The racial/gender breakdown
23 of the Department's eight exempt and
24 two confidential executive level

1 positions is 60 percent
2 African-American; 40 percent Caucasian;
3 70 percent male; and 30 percent female.

4 The Fire Department is
5 committed to supporting the Nutter
6 Administration's goal of 25 percent
7 minority, women, and disabled-owned
8 businesses participation in City
9 contracting.

10 As I mentioned in my
11 testimony last year, the participation
12 rate in our largest professional
13 service contract is now 19.6 percent.
14 For many years, the participation rate
15 in that contract for emergency medical
16 transport billing services was 15
17 percent. The contract is valued at
18 \$3.4 million per year. The contract is
19 required to meet the Philadelphia 21st
20 Century Minimum Wage and Benefit
21 Standard.

22 The Department's overall
23 participation rate for Fiscal Year '12
24 was 14.81 percent.

1 The Department's
2 participation goal for Fiscal Year '14
3 is 15 percent.

4 I would like to take this
5 opportunity to thank this Council for
6 its continued support of the members of
7 the Department, especially in these
8 very tragic and sad past few weeks when
9 we lost one of our most respected
10 members, Battalion Chief Michael
11 R. Goodwin, Sr. I speak not only for
12 myself but for all the members in
13 saying that your support and prayers
14 are much appreciated.

15 This concludes my
16 testimony, and I would now be glad to
17 answer any questions.

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
19 Thank you, Commissioner.

20 Couple questions to start:
21 On Page 54 of your five-year plan, you
22 talk about industry standards and EMS
23 response times are required to be
24 within nine minutes 90 percent of the

1 time. However, in FY12, your response
2 times occurred within nine minutes only
3 68 percent, which is a decrease from
4 FY08 when it was 74 percent. And
5 currently through the second quarter,
6 in FY13, response times occurring
7 within nine minutes is down to 66
8 percent.

9 What is the strategy to get
10 closer to industry standards? And the
11 hiring of these additional cadets, will
12 that enhance your opportunity to get to
13 where we need to be with respect to
14 response time?

15 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.
16 They will only be a part of the
17 solution that we've been seeking and
18 implementing.

19 One of the ways we plan on
20 getting those times down is to fully
21 implement our priority dispatch system
22 that we've been trying to put into
23 place for some years now. We have
24 finally contracted for that. And

1 currently, it is being put into --
2 being implemented.

3 We're looking at all of the
4 specs and everything so we can go
5 forward with a system that's going to
6 allow us to call out some of the calls
7 that are non-emergent calls.

8 As you know, and I've
9 testified before, 80 percent -- nearly
10 80 percent of the calls are
11 non-emergent calls and can be handled
12 in a different way. And in that way,
13 we can get the right resource to the
14 right call at the right time.

15 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
16 Okay. So by virtue of having -- talk
17 me through exactly how this system
18 works in terms of separating the
19 non-emergency versus emergency. And
20 the assumption is, you know, you get
21 the little bumps and bruises, you get
22 the call --

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS:
24 Absolutely.

1 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

2 -- and you try to respond in the same
3 time frame as you do if somebody has a
4 heart attack. And so you're saying
5 this will give you the ability to
6 separate that based on the call?

7 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.
8 Our past history is that we run on each
9 and every call in the same fashion.

10 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
11 Okay.

12 COMMISSIONER AYERS: That's
13 been our history. What we're moving to
14 is a system where we will be able to --
15 that emergency call that comes in,
16 we'll be able to monitor that call.
17 We'll have fire communication
18 specialists that will be able to assess
19 that call, go through a process where
20 they can have that level properly
21 identified.

22 So if we get a call for a
23 person with a stroke or a heart attack,
24 that person is going to get that

1 paramedic or medic unit moving right
2 away.

3 If we get a person that
4 calls in that they fell down, they have
5 a bad pain in their arm, we assess
6 that. One of the things that we would
7 do is we would be able to say, which we
8 don't now, is, okay, you should be
9 getting a medic unit within 15 minutes.
10 These are the things that you should do
11 while you're waiting for that medic
12 unit to arrive.

13 So we'll be able to work
14 those types of calls through our entire
15 system. And at some point in the
16 future, we look to find other ways to
17 have maybe private ambulances come in
18 and take some of those calls.

19 We're also looking at
20 possibly having our citizens use their
21 own transportation to take those calls,
22 or taxi vouchers. And we're looking at
23 a nursing system that you actually have
24 a nurse intervene, make the assessment,

1 and then says whether they go to the
2 hospital or whether they can wait for
3 that ambulance for a longer period of
4 time.

5 So that's basically how it
6 works.

7 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
8 So in terms of the industry standards,
9 the industry standards are determined
10 by all calls, I'm assuming, or is it
11 just determined by emergency calls?

12 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Now,
13 the industry standard is when a
14 paramedic is on location, that stops
15 the clock, so to speak. Right now, we
16 do that on all calls. So right now you
17 have non-emergent calls that's looking
18 at that number. That's also a part of
19 that number. Where you have that
20 larger response time, that 66 percent,
21 that's more than nine minutes. So all
22 of that is tied in now.

23 At some point in the future
24 we'll be able to separate those out and

1 actually calculate what that time was
2 for a paramedic unit to get to the
3 emergency call to stop the clock. And
4 we'll be able to separate all of those
5 out.

6 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

7 All right. So my question is, in
8 industry standards, my assumption is
9 that that's for the country. So in
10 other municipalities where those
11 industry standards apply, are you
12 saying that that only applies to
13 emergency calls?

14 I'm just trying to get a
15 sense of where does the industry
16 standard get 90 percent. So if you're
17 saying you're going to eliminate the
18 non-emergency calls, and thereby you
19 will be able to enhance your response
20 time, because you're only reporting
21 those emergency calls, is that
22 allowable under the industry standard
23 guidelines? Because people are still
24 responding, but you're responding

1 later.

2 If you would have said,
3 well, I'm going to take this part of my
4 response time out of the equation --
5 it's like a baseball team. They say,
6 if everybody strikes out, we're not
7 going to use strikeouts for your
8 batting average; we're only going to
9 use your base hits for your batting
10 average. Then, obviously, you'll have
11 a pretty high batting average. But
12 that's not allowed.

13 Is that the way it works?
14 I'm trying to get an understanding --

15 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
16 the goal is to, at some point, have a
17 system where you can respond within
18 four or five minutes to each and every
19 call.

20 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
21 Every call?

22 COMMISSIONER AYERS: That's
23 the goal.

24 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

1 All right. That's my point. I mean --

2 COMMISSIONER AYERS: But
3 when the system is taxed, as our system
4 is taxed now, one of the things that we
5 can do is the non-emergent calls, we
6 can separate those out and send the
7 proper response to that call. That
8 call may be a -- probably it's going to
9 be a BLS, a basic life support call
10 where it's non-emergency, not
11 life-threatening. They're not bleeding
12 out. There's no stroke. There's no
13 heart attack, you know, those types of
14 things.

15 Or a trauma, say, like, an
16 auto accident, or like the other day
17 where someone went over into the river,
18 those types of things, those are
19 still -- we're looking to keep those
20 calls where we want to, four- to
21 five-minute calls.

22 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
23 Okay. Well, keeping it along those
24 lines, Page 3 of your testimony, you

1 talk about responding to 231,000 calls,
2 and that's a lot of calls, obviously,
3 where 75 percent of those calls are
4 resulting in transport to the hospital.

5 So I'm assuming that that
6 falls within the emergency calls? Or
7 maybe not. It may be based on -- so
8 would you apply the same strategy to
9 enhance your response time to this in
10 terms of determining how many people
11 get taken to the hospital?

12 COMMISSIONER AYERS: When
13 we apply that system?

14 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
15 Yes.

16 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Some
17 people may not be transported to the
18 hospital by the Philadelphia Fire
19 Department. They may go by a taxi
20 voucher. They may go by a special
21 vehicle that we may set up to come and
22 gather folks that need to get to the
23 hospital, to get medication, things
24 like that. But they are clearly,

1 clearly non-emergent, that they can
2 take the time to travel to the hospital
3 and get what they need.

4 Or after we expand the
5 system and put the system into full
6 implementation, it might be to a
7 community health center or some
8 situation like that.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
10 So that's potentially lower than the
11 231,000 number?

12 COMMISSIONER AYERS:
13 Absolutely. The goal is to send the
14 right response to the right call at the
15 right time.

16 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
17 I got you. Okay.
18 One last question on this
19 round: You have DROP, as all
20 departments do, and I know Councilman
21 Jones has talked about succession plans
22 as it relates to DROP.

23 What succession plan do you
24 have for the Fire Department to deal

1 with the vacancies created by DROP?
2 And in addition, what is the plan to
3 fill vacancies of fire lieutenants and
4 fire captains? Because a lot of the
5 upper echelon, the upper ranks within
6 all departments, tend to be the
7 individuals on DROP. Do you have a
8 plan for filling vacancies generally
9 for DROP?

10 And similarly, do you have
11 a plan for dealing with the hierarchy
12 within the police, the officers -- I'm
13 sorry -- within the Fire Department?
14 The officers within the Department.

15 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes,
16 sir. At the firefighter level, or the
17 entry level, what we've done is we've
18 looked at the DROP and the vacancies,
19 and where we were able, we created a
20 list. We have a current list that's
21 being utilized right now. We hired a
22 double class off of that list. Our
23 normal class is about 80 firefighter
24 recruits.

1 So we pull those men and
2 women in. We train them. And then we
3 get them into the field. We doubled
4 that so that we could catch up with the
5 attrition that's happening because of
6 the DROP.

7 This next class that's
8 going in in June will be a second
9 double class that we have going into
10 the Philadelphia Fire Department. And
11 that will continue to catch up with the
12 numbers that are dropping. And it will
13 help to ease the overtime and all of
14 those things.

15 After that, we will be
16 planning another class in Fiscal Year
17 '14 to probably, at that point, catch
18 up with the number of DROP and the
19 attrited. So at that level we're on
20 point.

21 With the officers, we have
22 a testing process where we can fill
23 those vacancies. And what we've done
24 is, we've filled vacancies so far in

1 this fiscal year. We have a test in
2 process for lieutenants and captains.
3 We have a current list for battalion
4 chiefs and deputy chiefs, and we will
5 be able to fill all of those vacancies
6 as we move forward.

7 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
8 Okay.

9 COMMISSIONER AYERS: So we
10 don't have any problems with vacancy as
11 far as hierarchy is concerned.

12 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
13 Okay. Thank you.

14 The Chair recognizes
15 Councilman O'Brien.

16 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Thank
17 you, Mr. President.

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
19 You're welcome.

20 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN:
21 Commissioner, thank you for coming here
22 today.

23 I, at previous hearings,
24 requested information in October at a

1 hearing; in late November at a hearing;
2 two meetings with the Administration in
3 December; another meeting with the
4 Administration in March; and a letter
5 to the Mayor. I finally got one
6 response, and I would like to drill
7 down on the same topics that I inquired
8 about on those dates specific to
9 training.

10 I'm looking at some
11 training information which represents
12 perhaps 376,924 hours as it relates to
13 fire contact hours, CPR training, EMT
14 training, and paramedic continuation
15 education.

16 Can you tell me -- and
17 that's very impressive, but can you
18 tell me what your training budget is,
19 what the total number of your training
20 budget is in dollars?

21 COMMISSIONER AYERS: To
22 zero down to the exact training budget,
23 that's a challenge. We attempted that.
24 We look to be able to do that in the

1 future, to actually look at what that
2 actual training budget is.

3 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: I'm
4 just having, honestly, difficulty in
5 reconciling that you're able to give me
6 the specific number of hours, but you
7 don't have a specific training
8 designation in the budget so that that
9 information is not available.

10 COMMISSIONER AYERS: A lot
11 of training that you're looking at is
12 done on duty. So some of that training
13 cost is included in the cost of a
14 salary.

15 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Let me
16 ask you another question: In the
17 response that I got I was told due to
18 other training priorities, officer
19 development training has not been done
20 for lieutenants and captains since
21 2007.

22 An officer's ability to
23 lead and manage his crew effectively in
24 today's fire department environment,

1 especially one in which there are a
2 large number of transfers, can be a
3 constant struggle. Isn't this training
4 needed now more than ever?

5 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.

6 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Well,
7 can you tell me what the other training
8 priorities are that trump this
9 training? What are they?

10 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
11 there are not training priorities that
12 trump the training. The training that
13 was done was done in a different
14 manner. The officers are sent training
15 information, and they're expected to
16 follow the training, do some of the
17 training that is in the package that
18 they're sent.

19 And also, they have other
20 opportunities to train with their
21 officers where they are, their
22 captains, their respective captains,
23 and their battalion chiefs.

24 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: I'll

1 go back to that again. I'm really
2 having trouble understanding the
3 response that I got because it says, I
4 was told due to other training
5 priorities, officer development
6 training has not been done for
7 lieutenants and captains.

8 Why are deputy and
9 battalion chiefs not included in that
10 information? Are they being trained?
11 Is there a separate budget for that?
12 Can you explain? I'm trying -- when I
13 go into a room, I try to ascertain
14 who's in the room and who isn't in the
15 room.

16 Can you amplify that answer
17 for me?

18 COMMISSIONER AYERS: The
19 training that you're speaking about for
20 the captains and lieutenants has not
21 been done. That is contact training at
22 the Philadelphia Fire Academy. And
23 there has not been dollars to get that
24 done.

1 We currently have a grant
2 in, and hopefully we're going to get
3 that grant, to train the lieutenants
4 and the captains. And we're also
5 looking at other training for the
6 battalion chiefs and for the deputy
7 chiefs.

8 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: I'll
9 roll two questions into this, because
10 you've already hit one of my follow-up
11 questions: Are you telling me and this
12 Council that unless you're successful
13 in that grant, we're going to continue
14 to not have training for captains and
15 lieutenants, again, since 2007? And
16 can you tell me when you say there's
17 other training available, what is the
18 self-directed learning atmosphere, and
19 is that what we're limited to?

20 COMMISSIONER AYERS: No,
21 it's not what we're limited to.

22 We're currently putting
23 together a training program for our
24 firefighters and our officers which

1 will be broadcast into the stations on
2 channel 970 which we just acquired.
3 That's through our Comcast.

4 And there's a schedule
5 that's being developed, and it will
6 deal with training for all of the
7 officers and the firefighters as well.

8 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: I'm
9 just really perplexed that you really
10 want me to believe that we've not found
11 any time in the last six years to do
12 this kind of training. And I'll
13 roll -- in the interest of time, I'll
14 try to roll some questions together
15 here: Is there an officer development
16 class for the new officers being held?
17 And how important is officer
18 development training to this
19 department?

20 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Would
21 you repeat the last half, please?

22 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: How
23 important is officer development
24 training to this department? If you

1 haven't had training in six years, does
2 that demonstrate that there's a
3 priority? And further, are there any,
4 right now --

5 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Are
6 you giving me another question? Or are
7 you going to let me answer the first
8 one?

9 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Well,
10 you're going to anticipate some of my
11 other questions, so I'm just trying to
12 help move things along.

13 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I'll
14 just ask for the second one.

15 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Okay.
16 I'll do it again.

17 I find it difficult to
18 believe that we have not found any time
19 to train in the last six years. I'm
20 asking you specifically, given that
21 record, since 2007, how can you
22 demonstrate to me that officer
23 development training is important? And
24 specifically, are there any training

1 development classes for new officers
2 being held now?

3 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Okay.

4 The one --

5 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: That
6 was one big question with different
7 components.

8 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I got
9 you.

10 One, the first answer to
11 that is, it's important. It's
12 important enough to know that you don't
13 have dollars to get it formally at the
14 academy right now. So we've put in a
15 grant for the training to be done. So
16 that is important.

17 The other thing is that the
18 other training that we have we're
19 scheduling and putting together now for
20 those officers. So it is very
21 important.

22 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: But
23 you go to the grant -- are you telling
24 me that because -- I'm going to ask

1 this another way: Because you haven't
2 had a grant in the last six or seven
3 years, that's why you're not doing
4 training? And if you're not successful
5 in this grant, we're not going to see
6 any more training?

7 Is training dependent on
8 the success of this grant? Because in
9 my response it says, we will be
10 notified, if you're successful on that
11 grant, to these specific questions.

12 So I'm asking you: Is that
13 the response? If we get a grant, we're
14 going to do training?

15 COMMISSIONER AYERS: No.
16 We're going to do training, and the
17 training is being scheduled now so that
18 we can have a training for all --
19 including the firefighters, officers,
20 captains, lieutenants, battalion
21 chiefs, and deputy chiefs.

22 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN:
23 Mr. President, has the bell rung? Am I
24 out of time?

1 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

2 Yes.

3 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Okay.

4 I do have a very important question
5 that I will follow up with on the next
6 round.

7 Thank you, Council
8 President.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
10 Thank you.

11 The Chair recognizes
12 Councilman Kenney.

13 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank
14 you, Mr. President.

15 I want to stay on the area
16 of training and promotion for the
17 moment.

18 In your view, how important
19 is a field fire captain in the
20 organizational chain of command?

21 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I beg
22 your pardon?

23 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: How
24 important is a field fire captain in

1 the organizational chain of command?

2 COMMISSIONER AYERS:

3 They're important.

4 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Can you
5 elaborate?

6 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.

7 The field captain has -- he or she has
8 a company. They monitor. They
9 organize. They support that company,
10 those lieutenants that they have under
11 their command and the firefighters that
12 they have under their command. They
13 educate, teach, and mentor the
14 lieutenants.

15 It's very important.

16 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Are all
17 fire captains trained to the level of
18 field fire captain? Is everyone at the
19 rank of fire captain trained to be a
20 field fire captain?

21 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.

22 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: So
23 there's no difference between an
24 administrative fire captain and a field

1 fire captain? Everyone is trained
2 exactly the same?

3 COMMISSIONER AYERS: There
4 may be some field fire captains or
5 administrative fire captains that may
6 not have as much experience as some of
7 the field captains, but they're
8 captains.

9 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Okay.
10 And how long does it take to train a
11 field captain to obtain proficiency as
12 an acting battalion chief?

13 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
14 think it varies, but we do have a
15 specific program where the captain is
16 taken through all of the things that he
17 or she would need to know to fill in
18 for a battalion chief.

19 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: And
20 these successive questions are going to
21 kind of put together an argument that
22 captains are probably one of the most
23 important parts of the department.
24 However, everyone is important:

1 Firefighters, lieutenants, captains,
2 battalion chiefs --

3 COMMISSIONER AYERS:

4 Exactly.

5 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: --
6 commissioner.

7 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.

8 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: But the
9 captain seems to be a kind of the
10 lynchpin of what gets done on the
11 ground; is that pretty fair?

12 COMMISSIONER AYERS: The
13 officers are. The captain is on one
14 shift. They take care of what they
15 have to do. They're all important.
16 The captains have more responsibility
17 as related to administrative issues and
18 coordinating training and things like
19 that.

20 So they're important, yes.
21 They have a specific job.

22 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Can you
23 tell me how many field captains must be
24 on duty to restore the chief cars and

1 acting battalion chief during an
2 extra-alarm fire?

3 COMMISSIONER AYERS: How
4 many field captains have to be
5 available to restore the battalion
6 chief cars on an extra-alarm fire?

7 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Yes.

8 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
9 it depends on the level of alarm. And
10 it depends on how many chiefs are on
11 service. And it depends on how many
12 battalions get backfilled.

13 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: So I
14 guess what I'm getting at is --

15 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It's
16 situational.

17 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Okay.
18 I guess what I'm getting to is, who is
19 going to train newly promoted field
20 officers considering that institutional
21 knowledge is going to be lost during
22 DROP?

23 We're going to have a bit
24 of a void of institutional leadership

1 in this department as DROP proceeds.
2 Who trains those folks in the field --
3 lieutenants, captains -- new
4 lieutenants and new captains?

5 COMMISSIONER AYERS: The
6 chiefs have been trained. And it's not
7 like there's just this silence or this
8 void of training because they don't go
9 to the fire academy.

10 There's even more training
11 that goes on in the field level knowing
12 that there's not any classes. More
13 mentoring, more one-on-one with
14 lieutenants, with captains, the chief
15 going around and making sure that they
16 follow up, do the things that they need
17 to do and learn the things that they
18 need to know.

19 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Was
20 there ever a situation where a new
21 lieutenant would be on duty without the
22 benefit of a captain or a captain's
23 knowledge, a field captain?

24 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Say

1 this again.

2 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Is
3 there ever a situation where a new
4 lieutenant, or any lieutenant, is in
5 service without the benefit of having a
6 captain available? Does the vacancy
7 issue effect the effectiveness of both
8 the lieutenant's job and the
9 firefighter's job if the captain's
10 position is vacant?

11 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Every
12 time we have a shift, whether A, B, C,
13 or D, there's an officer on duty, and
14 the captain may or may not be there
15 with them. That's always.

16 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Well,
17 who does that new lieutenant go to in
18 the event that they need some help?

19 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Their
20 chief.

21 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: And the
22 chief is always there?

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: The
24 chief is always there, yes.

1 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Are you
2 familiar with the Berkshire Report?

3 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I am.

4 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I just
5 wanted you to comment on Page 78's
6 quote that says, the management culture
7 in the department is reactive and does
8 not proactively use information to
9 address current needs and anticipate
10 future requirements.

11 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
12 disagree.

13 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Okay.
14 No elaboration?

15 COMMISSIONER AYERS: No.
16 It's wrong.

17 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: All
18 right.

19 Thank you, Mr. President.
20 I'll be back on some other issues, but
21 I want to give some other people a
22 chance.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
24 Thank you.

1 Chair recognizes
2 Councilman Jones.

3 MR. JONES: Thank you,
4 Mr. President.

5 Good morning.

6 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Good
7 morning, sir.

8 COUNCILMAN JONES: In a
9 slightly different direction but
10 following our president's initial
11 question about DROP, is there a
12 succession plan to fill some of the
13 spots, maybe not to the degree of
14 hierarchy based on the org chart that
15 you have, but just raw numbers that are
16 impacted by DROP? And if so, how is
17 that? Could you elaborate?

18 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.
19 In our organization there's a testing
20 system, and it's constantly in place.
21 Every two years we test for lieutenant
22 and captain. And also every two years
23 we test for battalion chief and deputy
24 chief. Those are the ranks where our

1 folks move up.

2 COUNCILMAN JONES: How many
3 vacancies in those two categories?

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS:
5 Currently, after the last promotion, I
6 think it may be about six or so at the
7 captain's level. Maybe twice as much
8 at the lieutenant level. We just had a
9 promotion with BCs and DCs.

10 We've had some retirement
11 from the DROP in the last few weeks.
12 We expect a few more. So I would say
13 maybe two or three at the DC. Maybe --
14 well, one or two at the DC and maybe
15 two or three at the BC.

16 COUNCILMAN JONES: By way
17 of certifications that make people
18 eligible for promotion, is it a
19 combination of experience and relevant
20 certifications? And if those
21 certifications are important, how do
22 firefighters get them?

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It
24 actually is a testing process. You go

1 in, you test at every level. It's at
2 lieutenant, captain, BC, and DC. There
3 aren't any specific certifications that
4 you have to have, but they are trained
5 in their training and preparation.
6 They go to levels of the firefighter 1
7 -- excuse me -- fire officer 1, 2, 3,
8 4, and 5 in their training.

9 COUNCILMAN JONES: My line
10 of questioning is: Is it equally true
11 that openings within the Philadelphia
12 Fire Department are sought after by
13 firefighters nationally?

14 COMMISSIONER AYERS: No.
15 No. That's all internal.

16 COUNCILMAN JONES: When you
17 have openings, people from around the
18 country region don't test for possible
19 hiring in your department?

20 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Only
21 at the firefighter level.

22 COUNCILMAN JONES: Well,
23 that's what I mean.

24 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.

1 COUNCILMAN JONES: So they
2 become more qualified based on
3 certifications that they can get to
4 make them point better and score
5 better?

6 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.
7 At the firefighter level, you can come
8 in with firefighter points, emergency
9 medical technician points, and
10 paramedic points.

11 COUNCILMAN JONES: And do
12 you have a recruitment unit within the
13 Fire Department?

14 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes,
15 sir.

16 COUNCILMAN JONES: How are
17 they funded?

18 COMMISSIONER AYERS:
19 They're funded by the City of
20 Philadelphia.

21 COUNCILMAN JONES: Well, I
22 would imagine. But how much are they
23 funded? And I have a reason for these
24 questions.

1 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It's
2 somewhere around \$300,000.

3 COUNCILMAN JONES: Because
4 I had an opportunity to tour one of our
5 vo-tech schools where you guys actually
6 administer training for EMS and things
7 like that. And it is important to me
8 that Philadelphia young people get an
9 opportunity, first and foremost, to
10 take advantage of these kinds of
11 opportunities.

12 And I want to make sure
13 that when we're doing these kinds of
14 training that there's a pathway -- and
15 I do this with all departments -- to
16 get at Philadelphia youth that go to
17 high school and live in Philadelphia to
18 be able to take advantage of these
19 opportunities first.

20 So that recruitment unit is
21 important to me, and I want to make
22 sure that they, A, are going into areas
23 to find our young people first versus
24 other folks -- and I want all qualified

1 firefighters, but if we have to
2 parachute them in from California
3 versus going to Dobbins or any of our
4 vo-tech schools, I think it's a further
5 reach than what we have to do, because
6 there are plenty of able-bodied young
7 people that want these opportunities.

8 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes,
9 sir. We have a twofold path there.
10 One, the recruitment team goes out into
11 the city and they recruit.

12 Then also in the school
13 system, the recruitment for the
14 Randolph Skills Center, and that goes
15 to counselors all over the City of
16 Philadelphia. And all over the
17 schools, the counselors get the
18 information and they encourage the
19 students to apply for the Randolph
20 Skills Center.

21 COUNCILMAN JONES: What I
22 would like to do, if you would provide
23 for this Council and Chair, is learn
24 how successful that unit is in

1 homegrown talent coming into the Fire
2 Department.

3 I would like to switch a
4 little bit and ask about your national
5 designation for emergency management
6 now. I think it's being shifted from
7 Harrisburg to Philadelphia. Can you
8 talk about that at all?

9 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.
10 That's the Pennsylvania Task Force One
11 Team. They are a part of Philadelphia
12 now. They did come from Harrisburg.
13 Harrisburg was the host city. And as
14 you know, Harrisburg found that they
15 couldn't support them anymore. And now
16 we have PA Task Force One housed here
17 in the City of Philadelphia. They're
18 at 6601 State Road, and they're doing
19 well.

20 COUNCILMAN JONES: Does
21 that mean additional responsibilities
22 for us and also additional resources
23 for us? Can you elaborate?

24 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes,

1 it does. We have additional resources
2 and responsibilities.

3 The responsibility is to
4 ensure that Pennsylvania Task Force One
5 is operational. And for the most part,
6 it's administrative. It's not a cost
7 to the City. Some areas may cost the
8 City in, say, some administrative
9 things, but very low. Everything is
10 reimbursed by the federal government
11 under that system.

12 The things that we have to
13 do is make sure that they have fluidity
14 in the funds that they need to respond,
15 the funds that they need to replenish
16 those things that they expended, say,
17 like, when they went up to Sandy and
18 supported Sandy.

19 But the other question on
20 the immediate resource that we have is
21 that if something happens here in the
22 City of Philadelphia, that resource is
23 to be deployed here in the City first.
24 If something happens in the State of

1 Pennsylvania, likewise, they'll be
2 deployed to the State of Pennsylvania
3 first.

4 And it's really good,
5 because we get a large, very expert
6 body of men and women employing
7 mitigation and technical expertise in a
8 shorter period of time.

9 COUNCILMAN JONES: And I'll
10 respond in the next round to some of
11 that.

12 Thank you, Mr. President.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
14 Thank you, Councilman.

15 The Chair recognizes
16 Councilwoman Bass.

17 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Thank
18 you, Mr. President.

19 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
20 You're welcome.

21 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Good
22 morning.

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Good
24 morning.

1 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: How are
2 you?

3 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Doing
4 fine.

5 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Just a
6 couple of questions for you.

7 I was trying to, from the
8 testimony and the notes that were
9 provided, get an idea of what the
10 percentage of turnover will be and has
11 been with the Fire Department for the
12 last five years and the next five years
13 going forward. I know you provided us
14 the next five years going forward, and
15 I don't know if you have the previous
16 information available.

17 But it would be helpful to
18 have an idea of what the turnover in
19 the department looks like, you know,
20 for the last, you know, five and going
21 forward, because the numbers say one
22 thing but the percentages say a whole
23 other thing in terms of what we can
24 expect to be happening in the Fire

1 Department.

2 So if you could get that
3 information to the Chair, that would be
4 great.

5 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
6 certainly will.

7 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: The
8 other question I have for you is, I was
9 just going through your testimony, and
10 I noticed that you mention an emergency
11 preparedness app that you have -- that
12 the Fire Department has developed.

13 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.

14 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Have
15 you been on the app?

16 COMMISSIONER AYERS:
17 Absolutely. It's on my iPhone right
18 now. It's on my Blackberry. It's on
19 my computer at home. And I expect
20 every citizen to do the same thing.

21 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Okay.
22 Have we promoted this app? Because I
23 didn't know about it until I saw the
24 testimony. That was the first I heard

1 about it. And then I downloaded it,
2 and I'll go into it.

3 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
4 we worked with the Westphal College of
5 Design, Art and Design, at Drexel
6 University. And what happened was, our
7 fire prevention division wanted to have
8 a way to inform the citizens, looking
9 at the new technology. So we partnered
10 with them. And Drexel -- we should be
11 very thankful. They put up a lot of
12 dollars. And we also had the Kal and
13 Lucille Rudman Foundation. They put up
14 some dollars as well to develop this
15 application.

16 And what this application
17 does is, it gives almost everything
18 that you can think about as far as fire
19 safety, as far as hazardous materials,
20 CPR, every area of emergency, response,
21 and knowledge that you should have,
22 smoke alarms, carbon monoxide alarms,
23 home sprinklers. You name it, it's on
24 there. A connection to the Red Cross.

1 And what it does is, it
2 puts in the palm of our citizens' hands
3 information that they can stop and
4 study. Like, when you're on SEPTA
5 going downtown to work, you can stop
6 and go over that and know how to keep
7 your family safe. So it's a very
8 important innovation for the City of
9 Philadelphia.

10 Since then, we've been
11 contacted at the national level, the
12 National Fallen Firefighters
13 Foundation. And right now, they'd like
14 to support this going nationwide so
15 that every citizen in the country will
16 have the same app and be able to study
17 that. So we're working with them right
18 now.

19 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Okay.
20 Well, everybody -- a lot of people use
21 apps now. A lot of people have smart
22 phones, and apps are the way to go. I
23 did take a look-see at it. I do think
24 there's a lot of information. Pretty

1 much on any topic that you're
2 particularly interested in, there's
3 information there.

4 I would just encourage that
5 it might need to be a little more
6 user-friendly and interactive in the
7 sense that it would draw folks in.
8 Because it doesn't matter how much
9 information you give if people aren't
10 interested in going to the app and
11 don't know about it. Like I said, I'm
12 a member of council, and I didn't know
13 about it until I read the testimony.

14 So it might be helpful if
15 we just try to figure out ways to make
16 sure that people, number one, know
17 about it; and number two, there's a way
18 to design it so that it's a little more
19 interactive or interesting to get
20 people engaged with this very important
21 information.

22 COMMISSIONER AYERS:
23 Absolutely. At the time we put those
24 monies together, we had just enough

1 money to do a short billboard campaign,
2 which we did, but we're looking for
3 other funds. And it's currently being
4 incorporated into our community risk
5 reduction program.

6 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: One
7 other question, and I was -- I attended
8 the recent funeral for the firefighter
9 who was killed. Very tragic
10 circumstance. Since I've been here,
11 that was the third funeral that I've
12 been to for a firefighter, which is
13 very disturbing.

14 And so when we talk about
15 trying to find ways to keep our
16 firefighters and our citizens safe, it
17 seems and appears to me that there
18 might be somewhat of a disconnect
19 between the Fire Department and maybe
20 other city departments in terms of who
21 is tracking these vacant properties,
22 are they imminently dangerous, are
23 people setting fires in them, is there
24 a connection, I guess is what my

1 question is, between yourself and the
2 appropriate departments, whether it be
3 L&I or other departments, to make sure
4 that we're -- we're tracking the
5 information and paying attention to
6 what's happening so that we can prevent
7 it in the future.

8 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes,
9 we work with L&I all the time. We're
10 working with L&I now. L&I is putting
11 together a new system which we are a
12 part of the speccing now as far as the
13 specifications for the system. So
14 we're engaged and having meetings on a
15 regular basis.

16 And also, L&I has given us
17 a database, a list of all of those
18 buildings, which we fed into as well to
19 make them aware of the buildings. And
20 we have them flagged in our
21 computer-aided dispatch. And anytime
22 we get a dispatch to that -- to a
23 location like that, it's flagged and
24 it's immediately given to the first

1 responders to know what that building
2 is: Imminently dangerous, vacant,
3 et cetera.

4 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Okay.
5 Very good. Thank you.

6 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
7 Thank you, Councilwoman.

8 The Chair recognizes
9 Councilman Squilla.

10 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank
11 you, Mr. President.

12 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
13 You're welcome.

14 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: I had
15 a couple questions, but I want to go
16 back on the vacancies for our highest
17 officers.

18 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Good
19 morning, sir.

20 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Good
21 morning.

22 You say it sounds like
23 there's upwards of 40 vacancies in the
24 officer positions? You said there was

1 six or seven captains, double that for
2 lieutenants, several chiefs, battalion
3 chiefs.

4 What is the actual number
5 of vacancies that we have?

6 COMMISSIONER AYERS: We'll
7 have it for you in a minute.

8 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Okay.
9 While you're looking that up, we have,
10 which is worrisome for us for public
11 safety -- and you just said previously
12 that you do have a list of people that
13 are already eligible to go into it.
14 What is the reason that we're not
15 filling these vacancies?

16 COMMISSIONER AYERS: We
17 filled the vacancies up to the last
18 day, the last date of the last
19 promotion. There have been subsequent
20 vacancies since then. There was only a
21 few left after that. Vacancies are
22 going to be filled.

23 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: When?

24 COMMISSIONER AYERS: As

1 soon as the testing process is done.

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA:

3 Testing? You have a list. What do you
4 need a testing process for? You have a
5 list of people --

6 COMMISSIONER AYERS: We
7 have a testing process that's in place,
8 and as soon as that testing process is
9 complete, we'll complete filling out
10 the rest of the vacancies or any more
11 vacancies that occur.

12 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Does
13 that make any sense to anybody here?

14 If you have close to -- I
15 don't know, he's going to come up with
16 a number -- of vacancies, and we have a
17 list of people to fill those vacancies,
18 when are you taking this test?

19 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I beg
20 your pardon?

21 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: When
22 is the test going to be given?

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Should
24 be -- in June should be the test.

1 People are studying for it now.

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So
3 you're going to wait for June to come
4 up with a new list, and then you're
5 going to try and fill these vacancies?

6 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Not
7 try. We will.

8 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Well,
9 why aren't we filling them now?

10 COMMISSIONER AYERS: We're
11 not filling them now because we have a
12 lot of folks that's in the process of
13 testing. We're at the point where the
14 list is a little stale, and we want a
15 fresh list.

16 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So
17 you're saying the people on this
18 current list you don't think should be
19 able to get these positions?

20 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I'm
21 not saying that. I'm saying, we have a
22 testing process, and we're going to
23 have a new list, and when that list is
24 published, we're going to finish

1 filling the vacancies.

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All
3 right. Well, that's very scary to us.
4 And I think most of the public knows we
5 have all of these vacancies -- and I
6 guess he's going to come up with a
7 number eventually. And we're going to
8 wait for a new test and -- how many
9 fire deaths have we had this year?

10 COMMISSIONER AYERS: 14.

11 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: 14
12 fire deaths.

13 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.

14 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Which
15 is a lot.

16 COMMISSIONER AYERS: One is
17 a lot, sir.

18 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Right.
19 And we're waiting until June just to
20 take a test, and then we're going to
21 wait until after we go through. And
22 how long after that test is done will
23 we have a new list?

24 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Are

1 you drawing a correlation between the
2 fire deaths and the list?

3 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: I
4 didn't draw that correlation. If you
5 did, that's fine. If you think that's
6 what happens then --

7 COMMISSIONER AYERS: No. I
8 misunderstood what you said. I'm
9 sorry.

10 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So
11 when will the list be ready after the
12 June test?

13 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It
14 should be ready, I'm guessing, August.
15 Could be July.

16 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: July.
17 And the current list that you have
18 right now is stale because -- why is it
19 stale?

20 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
21 maybe that's not the correct word.
22 We've drawn off of that list to the
23 point where we needed a new list. And
24 there are currently firefighters --

1 excuse me -- lieutenants and
2 firefighters that are studying, and
3 they'll be promoted. There will be a
4 list created and they'll be promoted.

5 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All
6 right. Well, say we take a new test,
7 and in July or August we have a new
8 one, and we're going to go with 40 or
9 50 positions that are going to go
10 unfilled until July or August. And
11 then who deems that that list is not
12 stale? Or who decides, you know what,
13 we don't like this list either, we're
14 going to have another test? Whose
15 decision is that?

16 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It's a
17 management decision.

18 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Who's
19 the management?

20 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I beg
21 your pardon?

22 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Who is
23 the management? Is it a group of
24 people? Is it one person?

1 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It's
2 my decision.

3 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Your
4 decision?

5 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.

6 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So you
7 decided right now that the current list
8 of people aren't qualified or they're
9 stale or they've been on the list too
10 long to get that job. So you want new
11 people to take that test, and that
12 these people will be better qualified
13 to fill these vacant positions?

14 COMMISSIONER AYERS: This
15 happens age-old. This is not something
16 that's brand-new.

17 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: It
18 doesn't make it right because it's old.

19 COMMISSIONER AYERS:
20 Exactly. But it's something that works
21 for the Philadelphia Fire Department
22 where we hire off the top of the list
23 all the time. We get to a point where
24 there's a test in place, there are men

1 and women who are studying for the
2 positions that's going to become
3 available, they study, they perform,
4 and they are made.

5 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: It's
6 been the perception that if we have a
7 list, and after a certain number of
8 people we're not going to fill anymore,
9 we now have a whole bunch of vacancies
10 that are available, but you know
11 what --

12 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It's
13 not a whole bunch of vacancies.

14 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Well,
15 what's the number?

16 COMMISSIONER AYERS: We're
17 working on it now.

18 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: He has
19 it.

20 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Okay.
21 Three deputy chief, eight battalion
22 chief, seven captain, fourteen
23 lieutenant.

24 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All

1 right. So that's 32. 32 positions.

2 How long have they been vacant?

3 COMMISSIONER AYERS: These
4 are people that's DROPing in June, a
5 lot of them. So some of them aren't
6 vacant yet. We projected forward.

7 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All
8 right. How many are vacant now?

9 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Just a
10 minute.

11 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All
12 right. I'll continue after the next
13 question. When you find that out, we
14 can hear it, and then I'll come back.

15 Thank you.

16 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
17 Thank you, Councilman.

18 The Chair recognizes
19 Councilman O'Neill.

20 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Thank
21 you, Mr. President.

22 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
23 You're welcome.

24 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: The

1 Berkshire Report came up, and it was
2 somewhat negative, the question that
3 was asked.

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes,
5 sir.

6 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: And
7 your response was somewhat brief:
8 Denied, disagreed.

9 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes, I
10 disagreed with that.

11 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: While
12 you are management and I understand
13 that the buck-stops-here kind of thing,
14 there are at least two layers above
15 you, that I'm aware of: Managing
16 director and the Mayor?

17 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes,
18 sir.

19 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: And
20 there may be somebody in between those.

21 Who commissioned the
22 Berkshire Report?

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It was
24 commissioned by PICA.

1 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: By

2 PICA?

3 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes,

4 sir.

5 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: But

6 everybody was in agreement that the

7 report would be a good analysis to use;

8 the Administration was behind it, and I

9 think even the Union was behind it.

10 When something comes out

11 somewhat scathing, a statement like

12 that, does the managing director -- did

13 the manager director or anyone in

14 finance or in management above the

15 commissioner level call in and say, how

16 do you explain this? How do you

17 respond to this? And did that happen?

18 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.

19 Yes. We had --

20 Good morning.

21 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Good

22 morning.

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: The

24 other thing is that we had finance and

1 other people who looked at the
2 Berkshire Report and looked at the
3 numbers. We actually had them come in
4 and sit down and have a session and
5 talk about those numbers.

6 The things that -- when I
7 said I don't agree, it was to a
8 specific question that was asked. And
9 it was about whether or not we use data
10 for making decisions.

11 That's what I answered, not
12 to the whole Berkshire Report. It was
13 about do we use data to make decisions
14 in the Philadelphia Fire Department.

15 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL:
16 Specifically dealing with the questions
17 that we've been hearing from Councilmen
18 Squilla and Kenny and others --

19 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.

20 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: -- we
21 have data from our DROP analysis that
22 shows how many people are retiring.

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.

24 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: And

1 yet we have \$7 million or \$8 million in
2 overtime because we didn't have those
3 positions filled.

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.

5 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: And
6 you disagree that we should have -- you
7 don't think we should have filled those
8 positions based on the DROP analysis
9 information that told us that they were
10 going to occur? So spending overtime,
11 in your opinion, was better than
12 filling the positions?

13 COMMISSIONER AYERS: No.
14 Filling the positions --

15 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: I'm
16 trying to get a longer answer than, I
17 disagree.

18 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I've
19 got you. I've got you.

20 You're talking about
21 management positions or supervisory and
22 middle management positions? Or are we
23 talking about the firefighter positions
24 where the bulk of the overtime is paid?

1 All of those positions move
2 up on the firefighter ranks. So we are
3 in the process.

4 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: How do
5 you --

6 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
7 we are in the process of hiring classes
8 to fill the vacancies at the
9 firefighter level when they come in.

10 The process, if you'll take
11 a look -- and you can do the numbers if
12 you'd like -- the percentages that
13 you're talking about with the captains
14 and the lieutenants and those things
15 are a very small, small percentages of
16 that officer caught in each category.
17 So you're talking about very small
18 percentages.

19 And when we stop and we
20 look at hiring into those positions,
21 we're hiring into those positions.
22 There's going to be a backfill anyplace
23 in that area if -- there's going to be
24 an overtime or backfill in any of those

1 places.

2 For those seven captains
3 across all those platoons, it's very
4 small. It's not something that causes
5 this huge overtime piece.

6 The overtime is at the
7 firefighter hiring level. And that was
8 because we weren't able to hire for a
9 period when we were going through our
10 financial crisis. And when we were
11 able to hire, we immediately did double
12 classes to catch up. And we have
13 another one coming to catch up as well.
14 That's what's going to have the large
15 impingement on the overtime.

16 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: So
17 then you actually budgeted the extra
18 money for overtime that wasn't in the
19 budget? I thought the budget went
20 \$7,200,000 over for overtime?

21 COMMISSIONER AYERS: There
22 was a projection for the overtime. The
23 actual point where people leave or
24 where the attrited is at is something

1 that happens. Sometimes you can't
2 budget for each and every position
3 that's going to have to be backfilled,
4 because people leave at different times
5 as well.

6 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: I can
7 understand based on what you said.
8 Just follow this question: If there
9 was overtime because you couldn't hire
10 firefighters -- I'm just following your
11 reasoning -- why didn't you project the
12 \$7.2 million in overtime that occurred
13 over and above what was budgeted?

14 Seems to me, if you were on
15 top of the one, you'd be on top of the
16 other. And the criticism can come from
17 either side, but you can't have it both
18 ways: That you anticipated there
19 wouldn't be firefighters coming in, but
20 you didn't anticipate the overtime that
21 was going to be caused by that.

22 So how do you explain not
23 knowing \$7,200,000? That's not a small
24 percentage. That's a huge number. How

1 did you miss that if you understood
2 that it was going to happen?

3 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
4 there's other things that contribute to
5 that as well. It's a myriad of things.
6 There's injuries, sicknesses, long-term
7 sicks, all of those things.

8 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: So
9 this is in the normal range of being
10 over --

11 COMMISSIONER AYERS: No,
12 it's not. No, it's not. Because we
13 did have the classes and we did put in
14 -- and in doing the classes we have
15 other officers that come in, and they
16 will adjunct and things like that. But
17 for the most part, the classes that we
18 put in was a part of that projection.
19 It was definitely a part of that
20 projection.

21 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: How do
22 you miss it by \$7.2 if you projected
23 it?

24 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Okay.

1 Dave was talking about other little
2 small things that go into the overtime.
3 And a new protocol where we had to
4 extend training for another week for
5 the cadets, things like that that add
6 to the overtime.

7 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Can
8 you get us a list of those items
9 that --

10 COMMISSIONER AYERS: One
11 second.

12 Of the things that I was
13 told is that we were projecting the
14 class to be in sooner and out sooner.
15 So that impinged on the overtime as
16 well.

17 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: So you
18 actually made up for it in Class 100,
19 and it offset the overtime, because you
20 didn't spend the money in overtime; is
21 that correct?

22 MR. BEATRICE: Well,
23 overtime is part of Class 100.

24 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Well,

1 Class 100 is salaried. I don't
2 understand why there wouldn't be a
3 wash. If the class started later, so
4 you needed overtime, but then you
5 weren't spending money on the class
6 because it started later, why wouldn't
7 that -- so the overtime would've been
8 greater?

9 MR. BEATRICE: If the class
10 started sooner, they would get out
11 sooner, and it would have a bigger
12 effect on the overtime in this fiscal
13 year.

14 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: But
15 you saved money, because they didn't
16 get in sooner in the fiscal year --

17 MR. BEATRICE: But they
18 didn't get out. You need them in
19 sooner for when -- they only saved the
20 overtime for when they actually come
21 out to work.

22 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
23 Excuse me, sir. Just state your name
24 for the record. The stenographer

1 doesn't know your name.

2 MR. BEATRICE:

3 Dave Beatrice, Deputy Fire
4 Commissioner.

5 MS. RHYNHART: Good
6 morning. Rebecca Rhynhart, Budget
7 Director.

8 The overtime is 50 percent
9 more expensive than regular time for
10 employees. So overtime in the Fire
11 Department's budget is much more
12 expensive than regular time, or
13 straight time.

14 So when the classes -- and
15 hiring over 300 new firefighters is a
16 significant endeavor for the Fire
17 Department, and for the City in
18 general. And that delay of a few
19 months in the classes coming in means
20 that there's more overtime, which is 50
21 percent more and a delay in getting
22 those new classes onboard.

23 We should be seeing,
24 though -- we reduced the overtime in

1 Fire's budget in Fiscal '14. So we
2 should see that overtime come down as
3 those classes come onboard. And that
4 is an expectation that we are going to
5 be holding the Fire Department to.

6 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: So if
7 we missed the calculation on when the
8 classes were going to start, which we
9 obviously did -- we thought they were
10 going to start sooner when we did the
11 budget --

12 MS. RHYNHART: Uh-huh.

13 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: --
14 we're still off by \$3.6 million if we
15 had \$7.2 million caused by overtime
16 since that's twice -- 50 percent more.
17 It's actually more than that. 50
18 percent means we're off about \$5
19 million, roughly, to get to \$7.2. 50
20 percent of \$5 million, roughly \$2.5
21 million, you're up in that ballpark.

22 Nobody is explaining the \$5
23 million, let alone the \$7.2 million.
24 That's a large number to miss by when

1 the question that Councilman Kenny
2 asked about the Berkshire Report was
3 using data to manage better.

4 And all I want to know is,
5 was management -- I mean, I know you
6 don't speak for the Managing Director
7 or the Mayor, but was management, as
8 far as you're concerned, satisfied with
9 the analysis of the management's
10 analysis of what they were getting in
11 the DROP data and how they handled it?

12 MS. RHYNHART: I would like
13 to just step back a minute to address
14 your question, which is the Fire
15 Department Class 100 spend is about
16 \$157 million. So I just wanted to give
17 perspective in the overage that we're
18 talking about, which is significant, \$5
19 million.

20 There are many steps to
21 hiring at the City, and the City is
22 working on speeding that up. It
23 involves the H.R. Department, getting
24 the lists established, taking the

1 tests, offering the test, scoring the
2 test, getting the list established to
3 be able to give the list to the Fire
4 Department to hire off of.

5 And this, as you probably
6 recall, has been a delay. There was a
7 new test established to be more
8 racially sensitive. This has been a
9 long process.

10 So the City overall has
11 been a few months behind and has given
12 a list -- gave a list of over -- I
13 think 5,000 people took the test,
14 right?

15 MR. BEATRICE: Yes.

16 MS. RHYNHART: So I think
17 to hire almost 300 firefighters in one
18 year is a significant endeavor. And so
19 to be a few months off is not something
20 that is a good thing in any respect.
21 And I would like to see that schedule
22 tighten up in the future. I wouldn't
23 want to see that again.

24 But at the same time, it's

1 complicated. It's one of the reasons
2 that we're putting money into the MDO's
3 budget for more people to work in H.R.
4 to speed up the tests City-wide. And
5 it's also a reason that we put money in
6 H.R.'s budget to speed up the police
7 testing, because this is something we
8 don't want to see.

9 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Okay.

10 Thank you.

11 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

12 Thank you, Councilman.

13 The Chair recognizes
14 Councilman Oh.

15 COUNCILMAN OH: Thank you
16 very much, Mr. President.

17 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

18 You're welcome, sir.

19 COUNCILMAN OH: Good
20 morning, Commissioner.

21 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Good
22 morning, Councilman.

23 COUNCILMAN OH: Your budget
24 request is similar to prior years'

1 budget requests.

2 Could you tell me, are
3 these budget requests pretty similar in
4 nature going back to 2008?

5 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Pretty
6 similar, yes.

7 COUNCILMAN OH: Could you
8 tell me, when were the brown-outs
9 instituted?

10 COMMISSIONER AYERS:
11 Brown-outs started in 2010, I believe.

12 COUNCILMAN OH: 2010.

13 COMMISSIONER AYERS:
14 August.

15 COUNCILMAN OH: And this
16 budget, is this the original budget
17 request that you made to the
18 Administration?

19 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It's
20 not the original budget request.

21 COUNCILMAN OH: Was the
22 original budget request, did it contain
23 requests for more money?

24 COMMISSIONER AYERS: More

1 money for some things, yes.

2 COUNCILMAN OH: How much
3 more money?

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I'd
5 have to get back to you on that.

6 COUNCILMAN OH: Would you,
7 please?

8 COMMISSIONER AYERS:
9 Certainly.

10 COUNCILMAN OH: At this
11 point in time, do you believe that the
12 brown-outs should continue?

13 COMMISSIONER AYERS: If I
14 could have the brown-outs discontinued,
15 I would discontinue them. Right now,
16 the brown-outs, the study that we have
17 looking at them, they're contributing
18 to the budget. And the safety of the
19 citizens have not been diminished.

20 COUNCILMAN OH: Okay. So
21 the brown-outs are something you would
22 rather do without; but at this time in
23 point, one of the considerations is
24 that the brown-outs, which is a

1 cost-saving measure, which I do not
2 believe is your call, but you have been
3 told is effectively helping the
4 Administration to put funds that would
5 have gone into the Fire Department into
6 other projects?

7 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It
8 goes back to the general fund, yes.

9 COUNCILMAN OH: Yes. So
10 the question of the fact that the
11 brown-outs and taking money out of the
12 Fire Department that would have gone to
13 the Fire Department, not affecting
14 public safety, that being both the
15 citizens and the lives and well-being
16 of the firefighters themselves, how do
17 you define that in light of your
18 statement that even one death is a
19 serious matter?

20 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
21 one of the things that we've done over
22 the years is to partner with the
23 community. And to get the community to
24 respond to education, the technical

1 aspects of what would keep them safe --
2 the smoke alarms, carbon monoxide
3 alarms -- and take on different
4 behaviors, which is a home-escape plan,
5 testing smoke alarms and doing things
6 in their homes that's going to keep
7 them safe.

8 If they have an issue where
9 there's a breakdown in their home and
10 there's a fire, that they would know
11 how to get out. And you may have some
12 property loss, but you won't have a
13 life loss. And they've been responding
14 to that.

15 And all of the areas where
16 we have lesser resources, when we study
17 those areas, we have seen a steady
18 decline in fires. We've seen a steady
19 decline in injuries, a steady decline
20 in fire deaths. So I believe that
21 they're responding to that in a good
22 way.

23 One of the things that
24 we're looking forward to doing is using

1 technology to move forward and to look
2 at what the proper footprint would be
3 for all of our engines and our ladders
4 and our medic units and to move forward
5 towards 2035 and implement that plan so
6 that we can have the proper
7 distribution of those engines and
8 ladders.

9 And just based on what I'm
10 looking at and what our preliminary
11 look is, we probably, in some areas
12 where we replaced those companies,
13 would actually have less companies in
14 the City able to do the job that's
15 required to keep the citizens safe.
16 But right now, I don't have that
17 technology.

18 COUNCILMAN OH:

19 Mr. President, can I follow up with a
20 couple questions?

21 I'll take that as a yes.

22 Thanks.

23 So, Commissioner, our job
24 is to look at where the dollars are

1 being best spent, despite, and even in
2 opposition, to what the Administration
3 thinks.

4 So being that even though
5 there has been, you know, significant
6 efforts and improvements, as you've
7 described, still we have firefighter
8 deaths, and still we have 14 dead this
9 year.

10 And it would seem to me
11 that you are not saying that the money
12 would not be well spent if it were
13 placed in the hands of the Fire
14 Department, because I find ourselves in
15 the odd position that we could normally
16 punish a department, if we can say
17 that, by cutting their funding. And in
18 this case we're trying to put money
19 into the Fire Department and being met
20 with resistance that it would be spent
21 toward the purposes that its given.
22 Not by you, but it's generally been
23 presented that way.

24 So I think we're coming up

1 with some alternative methods of trying
2 to put money in certain places, but we
3 are limited in how we may be able to do
4 that.

5 I do appreciate your
6 testimony.

7 Thank you, Mr. President.

8 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

9 Thank you.

10 The Chair recognizes
11 Councilman O'Brien.

12 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Thank
13 you, Mr. President.

14 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
15 You're welcome, sir.

16 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Again,
17 I would just like to reassert the
18 timeline of my request for information:
19 October 11th, 2012 at a hearing;
20 November 2012 at a hearing and two
21 meetings with the Administration; a
22 December 14th meeting with the
23 Administration; a March 14th letter to
24 the Mayor.

1 Six requests, six months.

2 I'm going to try and be serious.

3 The responses that I have
4 so far, just to summarize, are that we
5 don't -- we can't get an amount that's
6 spent on training, but it is an
7 expectation that a delineation of that
8 data from our accounting system can
9 happen sometime in the future.

10 Also, when I asked specific
11 questions about the training that has
12 not been done for lieutenants and
13 captains since 2007, I'm told that
14 there's a self-directing learning
15 atmosphere, which is virtually
16 videotapes and online training.

17 When I asked about whether
18 there are monies in the budget, I'm
19 hearing from other questions that
20 overtime is being appropriated but not
21 for training. There's money for
22 overtime but not for training. We're
23 not filling slots. And I don't believe
24 I got a specific answer to the question

1 that, are we going to have training if
2 we're not successful in the grant.

3 Moving on, I would like to
4 ask another specific question. I've
5 requested training logs and I was told,
6 this information was presented to the
7 Grand Jury and, therefore, the
8 Philadelphia Fire Department is not
9 releasing this information until their
10 findings had been otherwise determined.

11 When were the training logs
12 presented to the Grand Jury,
13 Commissioner?

14 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I'm
15 sorry. I was speaking with my deputy
16 to try to help to answer that. Would
17 you repeat that?

18 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: To
19 answer what?

20 COMMISSIONER AYERS: What
21 was your last question?

22 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: I will
23 read a statement that represents part
24 of my requests over the

1 six-requests-six-months period, and it
2 refers specifically to the request for
3 the training logs.

4 The response was, this
5 information was presented to the Grand
6 Jury and, therefore, the Philadelphia
7 Fire Department is not releasing this
8 information until their findings had
9 been otherwise determined.

10 When were the training logs
11 presented to the Grand Jury,
12 Commissioner?

13 COMMISSIONER AYERS: When
14 were they presented to the Grand Jury?

15 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: When
16 were they presented to the Grand Jury?
17 What was the date?

18 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
19 don't have the exact date. It's been
20 some time now.

21 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Was it
22 before October?

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I'm
24 not certain.

1 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Okay.

2 If it was not before October, why
3 wasn't that information sent to me?
4 Who instructed you not to share this
5 information and release these training
6 logs with anyone because of the Grand
7 Jury?

8 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
9 don't recall. I do know that if the
10 Grand Jury does have the information,
11 that I'm not allowed to disseminate
12 that.

13 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Who
14 told you that you're not allowed to
15 disseminate that information?

16 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I'm
17 not sure of the exact person, but it
18 was the Administration when I
19 questioned them.

20 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Okay.
21 Was the original log sent over there,
22 or was a copy of the log sent over
23 there?

24 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I'm

1 not certain.

2 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: If it
3 were a copy then there should be, under
4 public information, that information
5 should be available.

6 The question is, if this
7 information is difficult to come by:
8 What is in a training log? What kind
9 of information goes into a training
10 log? What kind of information goes
11 into these training logs? And why
12 would they be interested? And why
13 isn't it available to us?

14 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
15 what goes into the training log is what
16 it says. It's a log of all the
17 training that's done --

18 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Can
19 you be more specific? Because I'm
20 really having trouble understanding why
21 I can't get that information.

22 COMMISSIONER AYERS:
23 Specifically, training that an
24 individual does is logged and the type

1 of training, the date of the training,
2 it's logged. And so that's any
3 training.

4 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: I'm
5 really trying to find out, since
6 October when I made that request, what
7 is so difficult about that information?
8 What other training information did you
9 share with the Grand Jury? Perhaps if
10 you can give us a list of that
11 training. Because I'm getting some
12 information and not --

13 What information did they
14 request? You can say that you can't
15 share it, but can you give me a list of
16 what they requested?

17 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I'll
18 have to get back to you, and I'll let
19 you know what they requested and what
20 we provided.

21 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Okay.
22 Six requests, six months, I'm not
23 optimistic.

24 Are you aware that under

1 the rules for Grand Jury only the judge
2 can prohibit you from releasing that
3 information?

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS: If
5 that's true, I am not.

6 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: So if
7 -- well, that is the case. So if a
8 judge hasn't specifically prohibited
9 you from furnishing that information to
10 this legislative body, you're saying
11 it's the Administration that's saying
12 that.

13 So I'm requesting that
14 information again. The Administration
15 does not control the Grand Jury
16 process. Only a judge can do that.

17 And more specifically, if
18 you submitted an original, I can
19 understand why that would be embargoed
20 from the Grand Jury. We don't know
21 whether the originals were sent over or
22 copies were sent over. And I'm really
23 curious about what those logs were.

24 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Your

1 request is noted.

2 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN:

3 Getting back to another specific issue,
4 if you give me a second here, I'm just
5 looking down at this request: The
6 Philadelphia Fire Department generally
7 trains personnel on straight time or
8 while they're on duty by either sending
9 the entire company to the fire academy
10 when necessary or by performing a
11 station battalion training exercise out
12 in the field as an on-the-road training
13 program. Field officers, deputy and
14 battalion chiefs, captains, and
15 lieutenants are also encouraged to run
16 various training exercises at the
17 stations regarding specific needs.
18 Example: High rise building training
19 in Center City stations. That is Class
20 100 dollars.

21 Can you tell me, other than
22 Class 100 dollars, what training
23 dollars are being expended for the
24 Philadelphia Fire Department?

1 COMMISSIONER AYERS: That's
2 something we would have to compile.

3 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: Okay.
4 I will --

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
6 Councilman?

7 COUNCILMAN O'BRIEN: I'm
8 not going to take Councilman Squilla's
9 time. I'm just going to agree with
10 Councilman Squilla and just ask a
11 question and you can use his time to
12 follow up on it.

13 The list is stale. Is
14 stale a legal definition? We want to
15 pick from a fresh list. In other
16 words, fresh and stale, are they legal
17 terms in Civil Service?

18 COMMISSIONER AYERS: No, I
19 don't believe so. And I said I thought
20 that was the wrong term.

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
22 Thank you, Councilman.

23 The Chair recognizes
24 Councilman Kenney.

1 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Thank
2 you, Mr. President.

3 Just going back to
4 Councilman Squilla's line of
5 questioning, the captain's list expires
6 on the 24th or 25th of May; is that
7 right?

8 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I'm
9 not sure.

10 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Do you
11 know when it expires?

12 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
13 thought it expired. I believe it's
14 expired.

15 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: I don't
16 believe it has.

17 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I'll
18 get that information, but I believe
19 it's expired.

20 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: The
21 question is: How many captain
22 vacancies are there?

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
24 believe seven projected into June.

1 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: How
2 many people on the list remaining, if
3 the list is alive, which I think it is?

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
5 can't tell you. It's a lot. It's more
6 than 50.

7 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Okay.
8 So what is it about the work that these
9 folks that are on the current list did
10 to study and to prepare and to perform
11 on the test and to get on the list that
12 should be ignored? Because we have
13 vacancies, and you decided you just
14 want to wait for a new list. Is there
15 a written promotion policy in the
16 department?

17 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I beg
18 your pardon?

19 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Is
20 there a written promotional policy in
21 the department that we can read? Is
22 there something in writing? The police
23 department has one.

24 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I

1 don't believe we have a written policy
2 related to what your question is.

3 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Well,
4 shouldn't we have written policies
5 related to Civil Service? Isn't what
6 Civil Service is about is the
7 dependability that you study and test
8 and go on the list, and if the vacancy
9 is there, as the police commissioner
10 described their process, then you get
11 promoted? Why do we need to wait for
12 the next list when we have one that's
13 valid and we have openings?

14 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
15 we on -- at the time of --

16 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: And why
17 should there be --

18 COMMISSIONER AYERS: At the
19 time of promotion, we promoted and we
20 filled the slots that was available for
21 the captains.

22 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: So the
23 six or seven new spots became magically
24 available? You didn't know that then?

1 Why didn't you just go as far down the
2 list as you --

3 COMMISSIONER AYERS: That's
4 projected through June. Some of those
5 aren't available now.

6 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Do you
7 have acting positions?

8 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Acting
9 positions?

10 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: There's
11 acting battalion chiefs, aren't there?

12 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes,
13 but it's not an acting position.
14 There'll be an officer or captain
15 that's put into that slot.

16 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: So you
17 mean to tell me that considering the
18 fact that these folks who are going to
19 leave in DROP, they're all on the job
20 every day? They're not burning time or
21 they're not on vacation? They're just
22 in the station every day between now
23 and June?

24 I mean, I would suspect

1 that the captains who are in DROP are
2 getting ready to burn up some of their
3 unused vacation time or personal time
4 and wouldn't be on the job until June
5 and there would be openings.

6 You're telling me --

7 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
8 couldn't tell you that. I mean, that's
9 supposition on your part. I don't
10 know.

11 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Well,
12 it just seems the normal course of
13 things. And rather than wait until
14 July or August or maybe even September,
15 because we know we've had difficulty
16 getting the fire classes in sooner than
17 we projected, why not just promote
18 those folks on this list?

19 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
20 believe the list is expired. And
21 also --

22 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: If the
23 list didn't expire until May 24th, why
24 wouldn't we promote the people off that

1 list?

2 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
3 for one, because there's hundreds of
4 firefighters. There's hundreds of
5 lieutenants that's been studying for a
6 long time preparing themselves to take
7 the test.

8 And many of those who's on
9 this list right now who understands
10 that and didn't make it high up in the
11 list, they'll take the test over. Some
12 of them that really want to get
13 promoted, they'll take the test again.

14 That always happens.
15 That's normal in the Fire Department.
16 It's not not normal. This is age-old.

17 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: It's
18 not normal in the Civil Service. And
19 if you don't have a written policy, why
20 should it be at any Commissioner's
21 discretion in any department to be able
22 to make that decision when you don't
23 have a written policy and you're
24 supposed to be following Civil Service

1 regulations which says you test and you
2 get on a list?

3 And the list, if it still
4 exists and there's an opening, as the
5 police department does, you should be
6 taken from that list. Why are we
7 different? Why is the Fire Department
8 different? Do you want to get back to
9 me?

10 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yeah,
11 I'll get back to you.

12 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Okay.
13 All right.

14 Let me move to brown-outs
15 for a second. Is there any regulations
16 or directives relative to a ladder
17 truck that arrives upon a fire scene
18 without an engine company? What are
19 they supposed to do? Do they have
20 water?

21 COMMISSIONER AYERS: No.
22 Ladders don't carry water, sir.

23 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Okay.
24 So if they're first on the scene, and

1 the house is involved and there may be
2 people inside, what do they do between
3 that time and the time the engine
4 company arrives because it has to come
5 from a further distance?

6 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
7 that's always historically been
8 situational. That officer will take --
9 they'll do the assessment and take
10 whatever is necessary for them to
11 support people in peril.

12 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: But in
13 the past, didn't the engine company and
14 ladder company leave from the same
15 house?

16 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It
17 depends. Not all the time.

18 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: But I'm
19 talking about historically. There's an
20 engine company and a ladder company.

21 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Right.

22 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: And an
23 alarm goes off, and they all -- both
24 units drive to the fire scene.

1 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Not
2 all the time. It depends on where the
3 ladder is.

4 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: When
5 the ladder company gets there, and they
6 have no water, and there's people
7 trapped, and they need to start
8 extricating people, what do they do
9 until the engine company gets there?

10 COMMISSIONER AYERS: What
11 they do is that that officer makes
12 decision on what's necessary in how to
13 take care of those folks until the
14 engine company arrives.

15 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Water
16 is necessary.

17 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
18 understand that water is necessary.

19 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: The
20 engine company doesn't have any water.

21 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Okay.

22 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Do they
23 go on the roof? Do they ventilate?
24 What are they supposed to be doing

1 without the water? And how often does
2 that happen?

3 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Not
4 very often.

5 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: And do
6 firefighters sometimes get injured as a
7 result of that? No?

8 COMMISSIONER AYERS: When a
9 ladder company arrives at a scene and
10 they are first to arrive?

11 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Yes.

12 COMMISSIONER AYERS: On the
13 average, it's less than 53 seconds to
14 58 seconds, and then the engine company
15 arrives. That's what the data says.

16 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Have we
17 had firefighters from a ladder company
18 that were injured trying to rescue
19 civilians without the presence of an
20 engine company? Has that ever
21 happened? Recently?

22 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It's
23 not reported to me that that happened.

24 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Well,

1 didn't that person get transferred for
2 being burnt?

3 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I beg
4 your pardon?

5 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Didn't
6 that person experience a transfer as a
7 result of that injury occurring to
8 them?

9 COMMISSIONER AYERS: You'll
10 have to give me that information and
11 I'll get back to you and I'll let you
12 know.

13 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: And are
14 firefighters generally transferred as a
15 result of being injured on a fire
16 scene?

17 COMMISSIONER AYERS: No.

18 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: That's
19 not a normal course of policy?

20 COMMISSIONER AYERS: That's
21 not normal.

22 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Okay.
23 Are firefighters sometimes transferred
24 involuntarily as a result of being

1 burned or injured on a fire call?

2 COMMISSIONER AYERS: No,
3 not for injuries. When firefighters
4 are burned and we go through a process
5 and they're burned, burned in their
6 face, in their face, we stop and we'll
7 go through a regular process, and we
8 look at it. And if it was found they
9 were not wearing their self-contained
10 breathing apparatus, they didn't have
11 all the personal protective equipment
12 as we want them to do and we order them
13 to do, then in some situations, they
14 may be transferred, yes.

15 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Well,
16 isn't training simply enough? Why do
17 they need to be punished in addition to
18 being burned and trained?

19 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
20 it's not every situation that that
21 happens. Sometimes it is training.

22 COUNCILMAN KENNEY: Okay.
23 Thank you.

24 Thank you, Mr. President.

1 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

2 Thank you, Councilman.

3 The Chair recognizes

4 Councilman Squilla.

5 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank
6 you, Mr. President.

7 Thank you, guys.

8 You stated previously that
9 when the test was taken, there's a lag
10 between the time the test was taken in
11 July and when you start filling the
12 positions.

13 When was the last time the
14 test was taken?

15 COMMISSIONER AYERS: About
16 two years ago.

17 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: About
18 two years. Was it in July? Do you
19 know if it was --

20 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
21 can't recall.

22 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: You
23 can't recall. Okay. And what was the
24 timeline between the time -- do you

1 remember the timeline between when the
2 test was taken and when they started
3 filling positions after that?

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
5 don't remember the timeline.

6 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: You
7 don't remember. Is it true that after
8 they take the exam and you get the
9 results, it's about how long?

10 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
11 the human resources has been a lot
12 better now. They've been pretty good
13 with turnaround times. So the time has
14 been small lately. So sometimes it's a
15 month. Sometimes a little more.

16 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And
17 you get the results of the test and
18 people get their scores?

19 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It
20 depends on -- yeah, they get --

21 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And
22 what happens after they get the scores?

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: After
24 they get their scores we usually

1 promote.

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: You
3 don't do an oral exam?

4 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Oh,
5 okay. I got you. You're talking about
6 the process within the test?

7 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Right.

8 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Not at
9 the completion of the test?

10 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Right.

11 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It's
12 two processes. There's a written exam
13 and after the written exam, then
14 there's an oral, that's correct.

15 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And
16 the oral exam, is that done internally,
17 or is it done from the outside?

18 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It's
19 done from the outside.

20 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And
21 depending on how many people take that
22 test, do they all take the oral exam,
23 all the ones that pass?

24 COMMISSIONER AYERS: There

1 is a process. There's a cutoff. It's
2 a human resource activity. But I know
3 that there is a process, and there is a
4 cutoff.

5 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All
6 right.

7 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Not
8 everyone passes the written.

9 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Not
10 everyone passes?

11 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Right.

12 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And
13 once the oral exam -- so that may take
14 another month?

15 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It
16 hasn't taken very long. It may take a
17 month.

18 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: It may
19 take a month?

20 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It
21 possibly could take a month, yeah.

22 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA:
23 Because I'm sure there's several -- I
24 mean hundreds, I would imagine, that

1 pass the test or take the test.

2 COMMISSIONER AYERS: There
3 always is.

4 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Right.
5 So I'm just trying to get back to the
6 question, which is, we're talking about
7 maybe September before you would
8 honestly have people available for
9 these open spots?

10 COMMISSIONER AYERS: That's
11 a good possibility.

12 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So
13 we're still going to continue another
14 four months before any of these
15 vacancies are filled?

16 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It's
17 not that many vacancies.

18 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Well,
19 32. It's 32 vacancies. That's not a
20 lot for our leading officers? How many
21 total officers are there?

22 COMMISSIONER AYERS: About
23 300 captains. We'll get you the exact
24 number. But on the captains and the

1 lieutenants, you're talking about 600
2 or 700, I guess, 600 or so. Captains,
3 around 300, something like that.

4 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So 32
5 out of that number is not a lot for
6 what you're saying to fill?

7 COMMISSIONER AYERS: No.
8 In our management of the Philadelphia
9 Fire Department for a very long time,
10 that is not a lot of vacancies. We do
11 very well.

12 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All
13 right. You made a statement about
14 brown-outs. If you had your way, and
15 I'm not putting words in your mouth,
16 but you said you would consider
17 eliminating them.

18 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
19 didn't say I would consider eliminating
20 them. The question was what would I do
21 if I had the money. Yeah, I would. If
22 the money was there, if the
23 Administration put the money in there
24 to eliminate the brown-outs, of course

1 I would.

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All
3 right. So if Council were to come up
4 with extra funding for the Fire
5 Department, what would it cost to
6 eliminate the brown-outs?

7 COMMISSIONER AYERS: About
8 \$3.8 million.

9 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: \$3.8
10 million?

11 COMMISSIONER AYERS: A
12 year, right.

13 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: \$3.8
14 million. So if Council came up with
15 \$3.8 million, that would be something
16 that would eliminate brown-outs in the
17 City of Philadelphia.

18 COMMISSIONER AYERS: If
19 Council came up with \$3.8 million, and
20 I was allowed to eliminate the
21 brown-outs, of course.

22 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: If you
23 were allowed to. So somebody would
24 tell you whether you could do that or

1 not?

2 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Well,
3 management is handling the money in the
4 general fund. I don't act like I have
5 that authority.

6 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Okay.
7 But if that money so happened to come
8 out of the sky and you had it, you
9 would strongly consider it?

10 COMMISSIONER AYERS: If
11 management gave me the money to
12 eliminate brown-outs, I would eliminate
13 brown-outs.

14 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So
15 they would have to tell you to
16 eliminate, is what you're saying?

17 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Of
18 course.

19 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And
20 we've talked about the 14 deaths this
21 year. Does that seem high? What was
22 our death total last year?

23 COMMISSIONER AYERS: 14.

24 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: 14 for

1 the whole year last year?

2 COMMISSIONER AYERS: No.

3 Excuse me. For the whole year, it was
4 25. We had 14 fire deaths last year at
5 this very same time.

6 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So the
7 same amount of fire deaths?

8 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Same
9 amount.

10 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And we
11 all know that one is too many.

12 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes,
13 sir.

14 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: In
15 light of what happened in Boston and
16 seeing the possibilities, wouldn't that
17 be more of a reason for us to make sure
18 that we have all hands on deck at all
19 times in every location? Would that be
20 an incentive to say that, you know,
21 maybe some of the engine companies that
22 we closed we could reconsider reopening
23 or eliminating the brown-outs? Or is
24 that something that would also be made

1 by the Administration?

2 COMMISSIONER AYERS:

3 Looking at what happened in Boston we
4 would want -- all hands are on deck at
5 all times. Whoever is deployed in this
6 department, day or night, we're
7 on-hand. A situation like Boston, who
8 wants to see it? But we would respond
9 to it, and we would be effective.

10 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: I'm
11 sure. We have great members and great
12 firefighters out there.

13 COMMISSIONER AYERS:
14 Absolutely.

15 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And
16 they would respond. But some places
17 are browned-out and we don't have some
18 locations that are active at that time.
19 So that's a cause of the worry among
20 the public.

21 I mean, we hear it as
22 Council members. We go to the
23 meetings. We're raising taxes. And
24 we're in AVI. And, you know, people

1 are upset about the things going on.
2 Some areas are paying more taxes now
3 than they did before, and their fire
4 station may be closed. Their services
5 may be limited.

6 So this is a major issue
7 for us. So we're trying to find ways
8 to eliminate that. If we're asking
9 them to do a little bit more then maybe
10 we have to do a little bit more. And
11 all we're asking is, if that money was
12 available -- what you're saying now is
13 the Administration -- if we gave the
14 Fire Department \$3 million, and the
15 Administration said, you know what,
16 we're not going to tell you what to do
17 with that, but you have this extra
18 money, as long as we know you're
19 willing to eliminate brown-outs, I
20 think that we would be okay with that.
21 Is that a correct assumption?

22 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.
23 If the Administration gave me the money
24 to eliminate the brown-outs, if it was

1 available, I would get rid of
2 brown-outs, of course.

3 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All
4 right. Thank you.

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
6 Thank you, Councilman.

7 Councilman Jones.

8 COUNCILMAN JONES: Thank
9 you, Mr. Chair.

10 My questions aren't as
11 exciting nor intense, but I think
12 relevant nonetheless.

13 By way of EMS ambulance
14 response, a couple of years ago, and
15 last year in particular, we asked about
16 reimbursements. And I wanted to get a
17 sense of, and particularly if we're
18 looking for \$3.8 million to stop
19 brown-outs, how are we doing by way of
20 collecting on some of those outstanding
21 receivables?

22 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Okay.
23 One of the things, we had a new vendor
24 that came in and took over the account.

1 And they were a little slow getting up
2 to speed, but our last reports were
3 that they were actually starting to
4 collect at the rate that we expected.
5 So we expect that the next fiscal year
6 will be better.

7 As far as those
8 collectibles, say, past dues, they're
9 setting up a system to go back to those
10 people who received the service. And
11 those that can afford to pay, they're
12 going to put a system in place so that
13 they can make those payments.

14 COUNCILMAN JONES: What do
15 you mean when you say new vendor?

16 COMMISSIONER AYERS: We had
17 a new vendor that came in to do our
18 billing, Intermedix. We had ACS
19 before. There was a transition period.
20 Intermedix started their official
21 collection, I believe, last February.
22 And now they've got a year, and it
23 looks like they're starting to come on
24 point.

1 COUNCILMAN JONES: What is
2 our target revenue amount?

3 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Around
4 \$35 million a year.

5 COUNCILMAN JONES: So if we
6 achieve that, is it safe to say
7 brown-outs will be over?

8 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
9 think that money is collected and it
10 goes into the general fund.

11 COUNCILMAN JONES: So if
12 we, like in other departments where we
13 find them to be a little more
14 efficient, a little more effective, a
15 little more able to collect, if we were
16 to do a bill or something like that
17 that allowed a portion of that to go
18 back to the use of the department of
19 origin, would you be supportive of
20 that?

21 COMMISSIONER AYERS:
22 Absolutely.

23 COUNCILMAN JONES: I sense
24 some legislation brewing there among my

1 colleagues.

2 So okay. So \$35 million is
3 the projected amount. \$3.8 million is
4 the brown-out solution. And if we do
5 something that allows for dedicated
6 savings to go back to the respective
7 departments, that that might be a
8 solution to some of the problems that
9 we face within the Department, I'll
10 take that.

11 Thank you, Mr. Chair.

12 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

13 Thank you, Councilman.

14 Chair recognizes Councilman
15 Oh.

16 COUNCILMAN OH: Thank you
17 very much, Mr. President.

18 Commissioner, on the issue
19 of morale, which is so important in the
20 type of work that you're involved with,
21 there has been a not limited feeling, a
22 general feeling among many -- I'm not
23 saying all, but many of the
24 firefighters that there's some type of

1 assault upon them as a result of
2 personal animosity from the Mayor.

3 Is that something that you
4 or your senior staff is aware of in
5 terms of that type of an idea?

6 COMMISSIONER AYERS:
7 Absolutely. We're always aware of the
8 different things that flow through the
9 department.

10 As far as what that means
11 or what it translates into as far as
12 morale, one of the things we try to do
13 is keep our firefighters, our
14 paramedics, our men and women focused
15 on what the mission and the vision is.
16 And it's a good mission. And they get
17 out and they take care of the citizens.

18 And you'll hear it a lot.
19 When the bell rings, a lot of those
20 things go away. Sometimes when the
21 bell rings, people still do feel some,
22 I guess, animosities or feel as they
23 lose sight of what the mission is and
24 what the vision is. And sometimes we

1 even get situations where a
2 disciplinary situation may even arise
3 out of that.

4 But what we try to do is
5 explain that, that whole morale piece.
6 That person or man or that woman, that
7 supervisor, they have an obligation to
8 keep the folks motivated and keep them
9 pointed on mission. When somebody's
10 auntie is laying down on the floor in
11 the kitchen, that they should stay
12 focused on that and give their best
13 professionalism, resources, and skills
14 to give that person another shot at
15 life.

16 Likewise, with a fire, that
17 they go in and that they are careful
18 and keep their mind on safety, keep
19 their mind on the mission, making sure
20 that they do all of the best practices,
21 procedures, so that everyone goes home
22 safely.

23 So it's a tough thing to
24 do. Those are things that happen.

1 One of the other things
2 that we point out is, you know, people
3 are still working, and that's a good
4 thing. We haven't had the hardest hit
5 from the departments across the country
6 that I've talked to who have had to lay
7 off people and things like that. They
8 look and say, stay the course, keep
9 doing. You didn't have to lose
10 anybody. Keep building. The economy
11 is going to turn around.

12 So we try to keep a
13 positive outlook. And, you know, you
14 can't blame everybody for everything.
15 You just have to stay the course.

16 COUNCILMAN OH: I
17 understand. It's definitely a
18 challenging thing for you and for your
19 senior staff and for your supervisors
20 if that is a pervasive feeling.

21 Could I ask you in terms of
22 what the general, kind of,
23 understanding is, being the fire
24 commissioner, you, and the Mayor in

1 terms of the ability to the exercise
2 your duty and your judgments?

3 I will quote Sun Tzu who
4 says, even the king does not command
5 the general when he is at the head of
6 his troops.

7 To what extent do you have
8 that kind of relationship with the
9 Mayor?

10 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I keep
11 the Mayor informed on what the
12 operation is, how we're doing in
13 certain areas, places where we have
14 needs, and I let him know. And he
15 exudes the confidence in me to continue
16 to do the things that's going to get
17 the fires down, that's going to keep
18 the citizens safe, to help me with the
19 EMS situation so that we can move
20 forward and enhance that. So it's a
21 good relationship.

22 COUNCILMAN OH: Okay. I'll
23 end by saying that I believe the Mayor
24 has great confidence in you, and I

1 believe that given the opportunity to
2 receive funds and spend it on behalf of
3 your troops that you will do a great
4 job with that and to exercise your
5 duties.

6 Thank you.

7 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Thank
8 you, sir.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
10 Thank you, Councilman.

11 The Chair recognizes
12 Councilman O'Neill.

13 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Thank
14 you.

15 And good morning this time.
16 Good afternoon.

17 COMMISSIONER AYERS: I
18 understand.

19 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: I
20 wanted to focus on the DROP analysis,
21 forgetting the question and answer and
22 expanded discussion we had.

23 I believe the DROP analysis
24 is more important in the Fire

1 Department than any other department,
2 even though it's a management tool
3 across the board and should be used
4 because it makes for a better system
5 and better management, better employee
6 morale.

7 But the Fire Department is
8 so much based on precision teamwork and
9 all of this training that's been talked
10 about that we stopped having the actual
11 classes a while back, and that was
12 budget related?

13 COMMISSIONER AYERS: It
14 was.

15 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Seems
16 to me that it's more critical in the
17 Fire Department even than in any other
18 department because of what's at stake
19 and how well the Department at its best
20 runs a fire scene and maximizes
21 potential, both to protect the
22 firefighters and the citizenry.

23 But if you put together the
24 enormous predictions -- I mean, we know

1 the numbers. In Fire more than any
2 other one it's more important when we
3 see these big numbers coming up with
4 DROP retirements, more than we've seen
5 before, but we have the ability more
6 than we ever did to prepare for them
7 because, let's face it, many people
8 were in DROP because they thought it
9 was going to end.

10 COMMISSIONER AYERS:

11 Exactly.

12 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: And
13 the sad part is, in the different
14 departments and the different pension
15 plans, we learned last year that the
16 one that actually saves the City money
17 having DROP because of the behavior
18 changes among firefighters is the Fire
19 Department. So they're the ones that
20 should have never had to worry about
21 it, they did, and now we have these
22 huge numbers.

23 But it's an opportunity to
24 do things differently, to do things

1 different than the traditional way
2 we've done them because it is so
3 important when you lose all of this
4 leadership, all of this institutional
5 knowledge, you're doing it without
6 training classes, because you don't
7 have them. I mean, it's -- I'm not
8 going to argue that we should --

9 COMMISSIONER AYERS: You're
10 talking about the officer development?

11 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL:
12 Officers, officer development.

13 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Okay.

14 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL:
15 Because all of the firefighters are
16 looking up to the officers. The
17 younger officers are looking up to the
18 older officers -- the more experienced
19 ones, not necessarily their age.

20 What you talked about in
21 terms of, well, everybody on that list
22 knows that they're not going to get
23 promoted after a certain point, we're
24 going to go to the next list. They're

1 studying for it now if they're smart --
2 I mean, if they're being wise, they're
3 studying. It seems like this is the
4 time to reconsider that because of the
5 enormous impact of all the retirements,
6 and the lead time that is precious if
7 you can get people in those ranks of
8 officer that otherwise will wait up to
9 six months, then as you said, they're
10 getting their training on the job.
11 They're getting it from -- in an
12 informal way, I think you stated.

13 And it kind of reminds me
14 how Council President used the baseball
15 analogy because it's springtime. But
16 it would be like, not having a hitting
17 coach, not having a hitting instructor,
18 budget reasons, whatever, not having
19 spring training maybe, but we're going
20 to rely on people just to do it
21 informally.

22 And in baseball, you know,
23 if somebody strikes out, it's no big
24 deal. And at the fire scene it is an

1 enormous deal, both for the safety of
2 the firefighters and --

3 And I just think there's
4 some things you can't control. You
5 might not be able to control whether
6 you have a fire development class. But
7 filling positions, because that
8 statement from Berkshire, you gave a
9 very detailed analysis, Ms. Rhyhart
10 came up and supplemented it further and
11 explained it. And there was a whole
12 lot that went into it that didn't get
13 put into the Berkshire. Whether
14 somebody agrees with you or not, your
15 positions are very clear and detailed
16 on why you disagree with that.

17 However, I believe the
18 statement, this is from Berkshire, the
19 management culture in the Department is
20 reactive and does not proactively --

21 I forget the -- reactive is
22 a negative term, but proactive is a
23 positive term if you are proactive.

24 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Unless

1 it's used in a negative way, sir.

2 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Yes.

3 Well, this says, does not proactively.

4 But proactive is a positive
5 verb itself.

6 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Yes.

7 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: -- use
8 information to address current needs
9 and anticipate future requirements.

10 Just focus on those words
11 and that simple sentence. We're in a
12 different situation than we've ever
13 been in in the Fire Department with the
14 number of retirees, the loss of
15 leadership, bringing so many recruits
16 in in a short period of time because we
17 have had a lag in hiring.

18 I would just implore you to
19 go back, Ms. Rynhart, the managing
20 director, and take another look at this
21 May 24th deadline, that unless you
22 think someone on that list really isn't
23 qualified.

24 And maybe we have to change

1 Civil Service if that's the way we've
2 been doing it, but right now the lead
3 time you can get to get those officers
4 in that we know are going to be needed,
5 that we know can get that acting,
6 training, or whatever it is that
7 different kinds of leadership, informal
8 training situations that happen, when
9 you get to a fire scene people are
10 talking about mistakes -- and we had a
11 big one last year and people were all
12 over the map.

13 But there's a pretty
14 straight line of opinion that maybe we
15 could have done a little bit better.
16 And if that happens in the future, and
17 we could have averted it through this
18 kind of decision-making -- that is
19 getting more promotions in early,
20 seeing that they're coming, they're
21 coming in big numbers, the retirement,
22 using the DROP analysis -- I understand
23 your explanation of why Berkshire was
24 wrong going backwards. I understand

1 it. I don't know enough to agree with
2 it or not, but I understand it. I
3 understand Ms. Rhynhart.

4 But going forward, we
5 actually have the information, and we
6 should be using it to the benefit of
7 the Fire Department. I think we've got
8 to take a fresh look at it. And if you
9 could do that, I'd really appreciate
10 it.

11 You have a little less than
12 a month to look at that. But I would
13 hope you could get back to us that you
14 looked at it, you decided to do it, we
15 spoke to the Mayor and managing
16 director, we're sticking with what we
17 have, but we've reconsidered it.

18 At least give me, if not
19 us, that courtesy. Because I think
20 we're in different times right now.
21 And we might not be in these times two
22 years from now or the next list. But
23 right now, all we have is the present.

24 Thank you.

1 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Thank
2 you, sir.

3 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
4 Thank you, Councilman.

5 If there are no other
6 questions by members of Council,
7 gentlemen, I want to thank you very
8 much for your testimony.

9 COMMISSIONER AYERS: Thank
10 you, Council President.

11 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
12 Thank you.

13 At this time, I would like
14 to recess the Committee of the Whole
15 until Monday, April 29th at 10:00 a.m.

16 We had originally scheduled
17 three callbacks, but those issues have
18 been resolved by different means. So
19 there will be no callbacks today.

20 Thank you very much.

21 (Committee of the Whole was
22 concluded at 12:24 p.m.)

23

24

A				
ability 17:5 29:22 132:1 135:5	Administration 28:2,4 72:8 86:18 88:4 91:2 92:21,23 96:18 99:11,14 119:23 123:1 124:13,15 124:23	3:6,17 4:11,15 5:5,9,18,21 6:18 7:5,8,14 8:3,7	93:20	76:24
able 17:14,16,18 18:7,13 19:24 20:4,19 25:19 27:5 28:24 29:5 49:18 57:16 64:19 76:8,11 84:3 90:14 92:3 107:21 127:15 138:5	Administrative's 13:6	amount 3:9 93:5 122:7,9 127:2 128:3	approval 8:17 approved 9:4 approximately 12:10	attrition 26:5 August 66:14 67:7,10 86:14 106:14
able-bodied 50:6	adopt 6:8,12	amplify 31:16	apps 57:21,22	auntie 130:10
Absolutely 16:24 24:13 55:17 58:23 123:14 127:22 129:7	adopting 6:15	analogy 137:15	April 1:6 142:15	authority 9:1,7 121:5
academy 31:22 35:14 42:9 100:9	advantage 49:10 49:18	analysis 72:7 73:21 74:8 83:9 83:10 133:20,23 138:9 140:22	area 37:15 56:20 75:23	Authorization 4:17 5:11 6:22 7:7,9 8:9
accident 22:16	afternoon 133:16	animosities 129:22	argue 136:8	authorize 4:18 5:11 7:10 8:9
account 125:24	age 136:19	animosity 129:2	argument 39:21	authorized 3:22 9:3
accounting 93:8	age-old 68:15 107:16	answer 14:17 31:16 34:7 35:10 74:16 93:24 94:16,19 133:21	arm 18:5	authorizing 4:7 4:24 6:24 7:23
achieve 127:6	ago 114:16 125:14	answered 73:11	arrive 18:12 111:10	auto 22:16
acquired 33:2	agree 73:7 101:9 141:1	anticipate 34:10 44:9 77:20 139:9	arrives 108:17 109:4 110:14 111:9,15	available 29:9 32:17 41:5 43:6 54:16 69:3,10 97:5,13 104:20 104:24 105:5 118:8 124:12 125:1
ACS 126:18	agreement 9:3 72:6	anticipated 77:18	Art 56:5	average 21:8,10 21:11 111:13
act 121:4	agrees 138:14	anybody 63:13 131:10	ascertain 31:13	averted 140:17
acting 39:12 41:1 105:7,8,11,13 140:5	air 10:19	anymore 51:15 69:8	Asian 12:19	AVI 123:24
active 123:18	alarm 41:9 109:23	anyplace 75:22	asked 71:3 73:8 83:2 93:10,17 125:15	aware 60:19 71:15 98:24 129:4,7
activities 11:2	alarms 56:22,22 89:2,3,5	anytime 60:21	asking 34:20 36:12 124:8,11	Ayers 9:12,17,19 15:15 16:23 17:7,12 19:12 21:15,22 22:2 23:12,16 24:12 25:15 27:9 28:21 29:10 30:5,10 31:18 32:20 33:20 34:5,13 35:3,8 36:15 37:21 38:2,6,21 39:3 39:13 40:3,7,12 41:3,8,15 42:5 42:24 43:11,19
activity 117:2	alive 103:3	app 55:11,15,22 57:16 58:10	assault 129:1	
actual 4:7 7:22 29:2 62:4 76:23 134:10	allow 16:6	apparatus 10:14 113:10	assess 17:18 18:5	
add 79:5	allowable 20:22	appears 59:17	assessed 4:1	
adding 2:23	allowed 21:12 96:11,14 120:20 120:23 127:17	application 56:15 56:16	assessment 18:24 109:9	
addition 25:2 113:17	allows 128:5	applies 20:12	assessments 7:21	
additional 10:9 12:1 15:11 51:21,22 52:1	alternative 92:1	apply 20:11 23:8 23:13 50:19	assuming 19:10 23:5	
address 44:9 83:13 139:8	ambulance 19:3 125:13	appreciate 92:5 141:9	assumption 16:20 20:8 124:21	
adjunct 78:16	ambulances 18:17	appreciated 14:14	atmosphere 32:18 93:15	
administer 49:6	amending 2:13,22	appropriate 60:2	attack 17:4,23 22:13	
		appropriated	attempted 28:23	
			attended 59:7	
			attention 60:5	
			attrited 26:19	

43:23 44:3,11 44:15 45:6,18 46:4,23 47:14 47:20,24 48:6 48:14,18 49:1 50:8 51:9,24 53:23 54:3 55:5 55:13,16 56:3 58:22 60:8 61:18 62:6,16 62:24 63:6,19 63:23 64:6,10 64:20 65:10,13 65:16,24 66:7 66:13,20 67:16 67:20 68:1,5,14 68:19 69:12,16 69:20 70:3,9 71:4,9,17,23 72:3,18,23 73:19,23 74:4 74:13,18 75:6 76:21 78:3,11 78:24 79:10 85:21 86:5,10 86:13,19,24 87:4,8,13 88:7 88:20 94:14,20 95:13,18,23 96:8,16,24 97:14,22 98:17 99:4,24 101:1 101:18 102:8,12 102:17,23 103:4 103:17,24 104:14,18 105:3 105:8,12 106:7 106:19 107:2 108:10,21 109:6 109:16,21 110:1 110:10,17,21 111:3,8,12,22 112:3,9,17,20 113:2,19 114:15 114:20 115:4,10 115:19,23 116:4 116:8,11,18,24	117:7,11,15,20 118:2,10,16,22 119:7,18 120:7 120:11,18 121:2 121:10,17,23 122:2,8,12 123:2,13 124:22 125:22 126:16 127:3,8,21 129:6 132:10 133:7,17 134:13 135:10 136:9,13 138:24 139:6 142:1,9 a.m 1:6 142:15 B B 43:12 back 31:1 44:20 61:16 70:14 83:13 86:4 87:5 88:8 98:18 100:3 102:3 108:8,11 112:11 118:5 126:9 127:18 128:6 134:11 139:19 141:13 backfill 75:22,24 backfilled 41:12 77:3 backwards 140:24 bad 18:5 ballpark 82:21 base 21:9 baseball 21:5 137:14,22 based 17:6 23:7 45:14 48:2 74:8 77:7 90:9 134:8 basic 22:9 basically 19:5 basis 60:15 Bass 1:11 53:16 53:17,21 54:1,5 55:7,14,21	57:19 59:6 61:4 battalion 14:10 27:3 30:23 31:9 32:6 36:20 39:12,18 40:2 41:1,5 45:23 62:2 69:21 100:11,14 105:11 battalions 41:12 batting 21:8,9,11 BC 46:15 47:2 BCs 46:9 Beatrice 9:19 79:22 80:9,17 81:2,3 84:15 beg 37:21 63:19 67:20 103:17 112:3 behalf 133:2 behavior 135:17 behaviors 89:4 believe 33:10 34:18 86:11 87:11 88:2 89:20 93:23 101:19 102:13 102:16,18,24 104:1 106:20 126:21 132:23 133:1,23 138:17 bell 36:23 129:19 129:21 benefit 13:20 42:22 43:5 141:6 Berkshire 44:2 71:1,22 73:2,12 83:2 138:8,13 138:18 140:23 best 12:12 91:1 130:12,20 134:19 better 48:4,5 68:12 74:11 83:3 115:12 126:6 134:4,5,5	140:15 big 35:6 135:3 137:23 140:11 140:21 bigger 80:11 bill 1:17 2:11,21 3:5,16 4:4,23 5:17 6:7,11,14 6:17 7:4,13,18 9:6 127:16 billboard 59:1 billing 13:16 126:18 bills 2:4,9 bit 41:23 51:4 124:9,10 140:15 Blackberry 55:18 blame 131:14 bleeding 22:11 BLS 22:9 board 4:18 5:12 8:10 134:3 body 53:6 99:10 Boston 122:15 123:3,7 bottles 10:19 brand-new 11:9 68:16 breakdown 12:14 12:22 89:9 breathing 10:13 113:10 brewing 127:24 BRIAN 1:13 brief 71:7 bringing 139:15 broadcast 33:1 broken 12:20 browned-out 123:17 brown-out 128:4 brown-outs 86:8 86:11 87:12,14 87:16,21,24 88:11 108:14 119:14,24 120:6 120:16,21	121:12,13 122:23 124:19 124:24 125:2,19 127:7 bruises 16:21 buck-stops-here 71:13 budget 6:13,16 10:5 28:18,20 28:22 29:2,8 31:11 76:19,19 77:2 81:6,11 82:1,11 85:3,6 85:23 86:1,3,16 86:16,20,22 87:18 93:18 134:12 137:18 budgeted 76:17 77:13 building 61:1 100:18 131:10 buildings 60:18 60:19 bulk 74:24 bumps 16:21 bunch 69:9,13 burn 106:2 burned 113:1,4,5 113:5,18 burning 11:5 105:20 burnt 112:2 business 3:13 businesses 13:8 C C 43:12 cadets 11:18 12:10 15:11 79:5 calculate 20:1 calculation 82:7 California 50:2 call 9:10 16:6,14 16:22 17:6,9,15 17:16,19,22 20:3 21:19,21
---	--	--	--	--

22:7,8,9 24:14 72:15 88:2 113:1 callbacks 142:17 142:19 calls 11:20,21 16:6,7,10,11 18:4,14,18,21 19:10,11,16,17 20:13,18,21 22:5,20,21 23:1 23:2,3,6 campaign 59:1 Capital 6:9,13 captain 37:19,24 38:7,18,19,20 38:24 39:1,11 39:15 40:9,13 42:22,23 43:6 43:14 45:22 47:2 69:22 102:21 105:14 captains 25:4 27:2 29:20 30:22,22 31:7 31:20 32:4,14 36:20 38:17 39:4,5,7,8,22 40:1,16,23 41:4 42:3,4,14 62:1 75:13 76:2 93:13 100:14 104:21 106:1 118:23,24 119:2 captain's 42:22 43:9 46:7 102:5 carbon 56:22 89:2 care 40:14 110:13 129:17 careful 130:17 carry 108:22 cars 40:24 41:6 case 91:18 99:7 catch 26:4,11,17 76:12,13 categories 46:3 category 75:16	Caucasian 12:17 13:2 caught 75:16 cause 123:19 caused 77:21 82:15 causes 76:4 celebrated 11:7 center 24:7 50:14 50:20 100:19 Century 13:20 certain 2:16,17 3:4,10,12 5:23 5:24 7:17 69:7 92:2 95:24 97:1 132:13 136:23 certainly 55:6 87:9 certifications 46:17,20,21 47:3 48:3 cetera 61:3 chain 37:20 38:1 Chair 1:12 27:14 37:11 45:1 50:23 53:15 55:3 61:8 70:18 85:13 92:10 101:23 114:3 125:9 128:11,14 133:11 challenge 28:23 challenging 131:18 chance 44:22 change 139:24 changes 7:21 8:22 135:18 channel 33:2 Chapter 2:24 3:6 3:17,23 4:11,15 5:5,9,21 7:5,14 8:3,7 Chapters 6:18 chart 45:14 chief 14:10 39:12 39:18 40:24	41:1,6 42:14 43:20,22,24 45:23,24 69:21 69:22 chiefs 27:4,4 30:23 31:9 32:6 32:7 36:21,21 40:2 41:10 42:6 62:2,3 100:14 105:11 CINDY 1:11 circumstance 59:10 circumstances 3:21 citizen 3:19 55:20 57:15 citizenry 134:22 citizens 11:3 18:20 56:8 57:2 59:16 87:19 88:15 90:15 129:17 132:18 city 1:1,5 2:18 4:8 4:21 5:1,15 6:2 6:23 7:24 8:12 8:17,19 9:7 11:15 13:8 48:19 50:11,15 51:13,17 52:7,8 52:22,23 57:8 59:20 81:17 83:21,21 84:10 90:14 100:19 120:17 135:16 City's 10:22 City-wide 85:4 Civil 101:17 104:5,6 107:18 107:24 140:1 civilians 111:19 Clarke 1:11 2:1 9:8,13,15 14:18 16:15 17:1,10 19:7 20:6 21:20 21:24 22:22 23:14 24:9,16	27:7,12,18 37:1 37:9 44:23 53:13,19 61:6 61:12 70:16,22 80:22 85:11,17 92:8,14 101:5 101:21 114:1 125:5 128:12 133:9 142:3,11 class 10:10 11:12 12:9 25:22,23 26:7,9,16 33:16 79:14,18,23 80:1,3,5,9 83:15 100:19,22 138:6 classes 35:1 42:12 75:7 76:12 78:13,14,17 81:14,19,22 82:3,8 106:16 134:11 136:6 clear 138:15 clearly 23:24 24:1 clock 19:15 20:3 close 63:14 closed 122:22 124:4 closer 15:10 coach 137:17 code 2:14,23 3:7 3:18 4:12,16 5:6 5:10,19,22 6:20 7:6,15 8:4,8 colleagues 128:1 collect 126:4 127:15 collected 127:9 collectibles 126:8 collecting 125:20 collection 126:21 Collections 5:20 College 56:4 combination 46:19 combined 5:3 Comcast 33:3 come 18:17 23:21	48:7 51:12 63:15 64:3 65:6 70:14 73:3 75:9 77:16 78:15 80:20 82:2,3 97:7 109:4 120:3 121:7 126:23 comes 17:15 72:10 coming 27:21 51:1 76:13 77:19 81:19 91:24 135:3 140:20,21 command 37:20 38:1,11,12 132:4 comment 44:5 commercial 3:12 commissioned 71:21,24 commissioner 9:12,17,18,20 12:4 14:19 15:15 16:23 17:7,12 19:12 21:15,22 22:2 23:12,16 24:12 25:15 27:9,21 28:21 29:10 30:5,10 31:18 32:20 33:20 34:5,13 35:3,8 36:15 37:21 38:2,6,21 39:3 39:13 40:3,6,7 40:12 41:3,8,15 42:5,24 43:11 43:19,23 44:3 44:11,15 45:6 45:18 46:4,23 47:14,20,24 48:6,14,18 49:1 50:8 51:9,24 53:23 54:3 55:5 55:13,16 56:3
---	---	---	---	---

58:22 60:8 61:18 62:6,16 62:24 63:6,19 63:23 64:6,10 64:20 65:10,13 65:16,24 66:7 66:13,20 67:16 67:20 68:1,5,14 68:19 69:12,16 69:20 70:3,9 71:4,9,17,23 72:3,15,18,23 73:19,23 74:4 74:13,18 75:6 76:21 78:3,11 78:24 79:10 81:4 85:20,21 86:5,10,13,19 86:24 87:4,8,13 88:7,20 90:23 94:13,14,20 95:12,13,18,23 96:8,16,24 97:14,22 98:17 99:4,24 101:1 101:18 102:8,12 102:17,23 103:4 103:17,24 104:9 104:14,18 105:3 105:8,12 106:7 106:19 107:2 108:10,21 109:6 109:16,21 110:1 110:10,17,21 111:3,8,12,22 112:3,9,17,20 113:2,19 114:15 114:20 115:4,10 115:19,23 116:4 116:8,11,18,24 117:7,11,15,20 118:2,10,16,22 119:7,18 120:7 120:11,18 121:2 121:10,17,23 122:2,8,12 123:2,13 124:22	125:22 126:16 127:3,8,21 128:18 129:6 131:24 132:10 133:7,17 134:13 135:10 136:9,13 138:24 139:6 142:1,9 Commissioner's 107:20 committed 13:5 committee 1:2 2:3 9:23 142:14,21 communication 17:17 community 24:7 59:4 88:23,23 companies 90:12 90:13 122:21 company 11:8 38:8,9 100:9 108:18 109:4,13 109:14,20,20 110:5,9,14,20 111:9,14,17,20 compile 101:2 complete 63:9,9 completion 116:9 complicated 85:1 components 35:7 computer 55:19 computer-aided 60:21 concerned 27:11 83:8 concluded 142:22 concludes 14:15 confidence 132:15,24 confidential 12:24 connection 56:24 59:24 consider 119:16 119:19 121:9 considerations 87:23	considering 41:20 105:17 constant 30:3 constantly 45:20 construction 3:11 contact 28:13 31:21 contacted 57:11 contain 86:22 continuation 28:14 continue 26:11 32:13 70:12 87:12 118:13 132:15 continued 14:6 contract 13:13,15 13:17,18 contracted 15:24 contracting 13:9 contribute 78:4 contributing 87:17 control 99:15 138:4,5 Cooperation 9:1 9:3 coordinating 40:18 copies 99:22 copy 96:22 97:3 correct 66:21 79:21 116:14 124:21 correlation 66:1,4 cost 29:13,13 52:6 52:7 120:5 cost-saving 88:1 council 1:1,11 2:1 8:17 9:4,8,13,14 9:15 14:5,18 16:15 17:1,10 19:7 20:6 21:20 21:24 22:22 23:14 24:9,16 27:7,12,18 32:12 37:1,7,9	44:23 50:23 53:13,19 58:12 61:6,12 70:16 70:22 80:22 85:11,17 92:8 92:14 101:5,21 114:1 120:3,14 120:19 123:22 125:5 128:12 133:9 137:14 142:3,6,10,11 Councilman 1:12 1:12,13,13,14 1:14 24:20 27:15,16,20 29:3,15 30:6,24 32:8 33:8,22 34:9,15 35:5,22 36:22 37:3,12 37:13,23 38:4 38:16,22 39:9 39:19 40:5,8,22 41:7,13,17 42:19 43:2,16 43:21 44:1,4,13 44:17 45:2,8 46:2,16 47:9,16 47:22 48:1,11 48:16,21 49:3 50:21 51:20 53:9,14 61:9,10 61:14,20 62:8 62:23 63:2,12 63:21 64:2,8,16 65:2,11,14,18 66:3,10,16 67:5 67:18,22 68:3,6 68:17 69:5,14 69:18,24 70:7 70:11,17,19,20 70:24 71:6,11 71:19 72:1,5,21 73:15,20,24 74:5,15 75:4 76:16 77:6 78:8 78:21 79:7,17 79:24 80:14	82:6,13 83:1 85:9,12,14,15 85:19,22,23 86:7,12,15,21 87:2,6,10,20 88:9 90:18 92:11,12,16 94:18,22 95:15 95:21 96:1,13 96:20 97:2,18 98:4,21 99:6 100:2 101:3,6,7 101:8,10,22,24 102:1,4,10,15 102:20 103:1,7 103:19 104:3,16 104:22 105:6,10 105:16 106:11 106:22 107:17 108:12,23 109:12,18,22 110:4,15,19,22 111:5,11,16,24 112:5,13,18,22 113:15,22 114:2 114:4,5,17,22 115:6,16,21 116:2,7,10,15 116:20 117:5,9 117:12,18,22 118:4,12,18 119:4,12 120:2 120:9,13,22 121:6,14,19,24 122:6,10,14 123:10,15 125:3 125:6,7,8 126:14 127:1,5 127:11,23 128:13,14,16 131:16 132:22 133:10,12,13,19 134:15 135:12 136:11,14 139:2 139:7 142:4 Councilmen 73:17
---	---	--	---	--

Councilwoman 1:11 53:16,17 53:21 54:1,5 55:7,14,21 57:19 59:6 61:4 61:7 counselors 50:15 50:17 country 20:9 47:18 57:15 131:5 couple 14:20 54:6 61:15 90:20 125:14 course 106:12 112:19 119:24 120:21 121:18 125:2 131:8,15 courtesy 141:19 covering 8:20 CPR 28:13 56:20 created 25:1,19 67:4 credits 3:3 crew 29:23 crisis 76:10 critical 134:16 criticism 77:16 Cross 56:24 culture 44:6 138:19 curious 99:23 current 10:7 12:15 25:20 27:3 44:9 64:18 66:17 68:7 103:9 139:8 currently 12:2 15:5 16:1 32:1 32:22 46:5 59:3 66:24 CURTIS 1:12 cutoff 117:1,4 cutting 91:17	dangerous 59:22 61:2 DARRELL 1:11 data 73:9,13,21 83:3,11 93:8 111:15 database 60:17 date 62:18 95:17 95:19 98:1 dates 28:8 Dave 79:1 81:3 David 1:14 9:19 day 22:16 62:18 105:20,22 123:6 DC 46:13,14 47:2 DCs 46:9 dead 91:8 deadline 139:21 deal 24:24 33:6 137:24 138:1 dealing 25:11 73:16 death 88:18 121:22 deaths 65:9,12 66:2 89:20 91:8 121:20 122:4,7 December 12:6 28:3 92:22 decided 68:7 103:13 141:14 decides 67:12 decision 67:15,17 68:2,4 107:22 110:12 decisions 73:10 73:13 decision-making 140:18 deck 122:18 123:4 Decker 2:8,11 9:9 decline 89:18,19 89:19 decrease 15:3 dedicated 128:5 deems 67:11 deferrals 2:14,16	5:24 define 88:17 definitely 78:19 131:17 definition 101:14 degree 45:13 delay 81:18,21 84:6 delineation 93:7 demonstrate 34:2 34:22 Denied 71:8 DENNIS 1:13 department 9:11 11:6,12,16,19 12:2,7,9,11 13:4 14:7 23:19 24:24 25:13,14 26:10 29:24 33:19,24 39:23 42:1 44:7 47:12 47:19 48:13 51:2 54:11,19 55:1,12 59:19 68:21 73:14 81:17 82:5 83:15,23 84:4 88:5,12,13 91:14,16,19 94:8 95:7 100:6 100:24 103:16 103:21,23 107:15,21 108:5 108:7 119:9 120:5 123:6 124:14 127:18 128:9 129:9 134:1,1,7,17,18 134:19 135:19 138:19 139:13 141:7 departments 24:20 25:6 49:15 59:20 60:2,3 127:12 128:7 131:5 135:14	Department's 12:23 13:22 14:1 81:11 dependability 104:7 dependent 36:7 depending 116:21 depends 41:9,10 41:11 109:17 110:2 115:20 deployed 52:23 53:2 123:5 deputy 9:20 12:3 27:4 31:8 32:6 36:21 45:23 69:21 81:3 94:15 100:13 described 91:7 104:10 design 56:5,5 58:18 designation 29:8 51:5 despite 91:1 detailed 138:9,15 determined 7:22 19:9,11 94:10 95:9 determining 23:10 develop 56:14 developed 33:5 55:12 development 29:19 31:5 33:15,18,23 34:23 35:1 136:10,12 138:6 difference 38:23 different 16:12 30:13 35:6 45:9 77:4 89:3 108:7 108:8 129:8 135:13,14 136:1 139:12 140:7 141:20 142:18 differently 135:24	difficult 34:17 97:7 98:7 difficulty 29:4 106:15 diminished 87:19 direct 12:1 direction 45:9 directives 108:16 director 71:16 72:12,13 81:7 83:6 139:20 141:16 disabled-owned 13:7 disagree 44:12 74:6,17 138:16 disagreed 71:8,10 disciplinary 130:2 disconnect 59:18 discontinue 87:15 discontinued 87:14 discretion 107:21 discussion 133:22 dispatch 15:21 60:21,22 disseminate 96:11 96:15 distance 109:5 distribution 90:7 District 2:20 4:9 4:19 5:2,13 6:3 7:1 8:1,11 disturbing 59:13 division 56:7 Dobbins 50:3 doing 36:3 49:13 51:18 54:3 78:14 89:5,24 110:24 125:19 131:9 132:12 136:5 140:2 dollars 28:20 31:23 35:13 56:12,14 90:24 100:20,22,23
--	---	---	---	--

D**D** 43:13

double 11:12 25:22 26:9 62:1 76:11 doubled 26:3 downloaded 56:1 downtown 57:5 draw 58:7 66:4 drawing 66:1 drawn 66:22 Drexel 56:5,10 drill 28:6 drive 109:24 DROP 24:19,22 25:1,7,9,18 26:6 26:18 41:22 42:1 45:11,16 46:11 73:21 74:8 83:11 105:19 106:1 133:20,23 135:4 135:8,17 140:22 DROPIng 70:4 dropping 26:12 due 2:18 6:1 29:17 31:4 dues 126:8 duration 3:15 duties 133:5 duty 29:12 40:24 42:21 43:13 100:8 132:2	88:3 effectiveness 43:7 effects 4:6 7:20 efficient 127:14 efforts 91:6 eight 12:23 69:21 either 67:13 77:17 100:8 elaborate 38:5 45:17 51:23 elaboration 44:14 eligible 46:18 62:13 eliminate 20:17 119:24 120:6,16 120:20 121:12 121:12,16 124:8 124:19,24 eliminating 119:17,19 122:23 embargoed 99:19 emergency 10:11 10:16 11:20 12:4 13:15 16:19 17:15 19:11 20:3,13 20:21 23:6 48:8 51:5 55:10 56:20 employee 134:5 employees 12:16 81:10 employing 53:6 EMS 11:24 14:22 49:6 125:13 132:19 EMT 28:13 encourage 50:18 58:4 encouraged 100:15 endeavor 81:16 84:18 ended 10:20 engaged 58:20 60:14	engine 11:7,9 108:18 109:3,13 109:20 110:9,14 110:20 111:14 111:20 122:21 engines 90:3,7 enhance 15:12 20:19 23:9 132:20 enormous 134:24 137:5 138:1 enrollment 4:3 ensure 52:4 entire 18:14 100:9 entitled 2:12,14 2:22,24 3:6,8,17 3:19 4:5,12,16 4:24 5:6,10,18 5:19,22 6:8,12 6:15,18,20 7:5,7 7:8,14,16,19 8:4 8:8,16 entry 25:17 environment 29:24 equally 47:10 equation 21:4 equipment 10:11 113:11 especially 14:7 30:1 established 83:24 84:2,7 establishing 6:22 6:24 estate 2:15,18 3:1 3:3,8,9 4:8,13 4:20 5:1,7,14,23 6:1,21,23 7:1,23 8:5,12 et 61:3 event 43:18 eventually 65:7 everybody 21:6 57:20 72:6 131:14 136:21 exact 28:22 95:19	96:17 118:23 exactly 16:17 39:2 40:4 68:20 135:11 exam 115:8 116:3 116:12,13,16,22 117:13 Example 100:18 exciting 125:11 exclusion 7:3 excuse 47:7 67:1 80:23 122:3 executive 9:21 12:24 exempt 12:23 exempted 3:10 exemptions 3:15 exercise 100:11 132:1 133:4 exercises 100:16 exists 108:4 expand 24:4 expanded 133:22 expect 46:12 54:24 55:19 126:5 expectation 82:4 93:7 expected 30:15 126:4 expended 52:16 100:23 expensive 81:9,12 experience 39:6 46:19 112:6 experienced 136:18 expert 53:5 expertise 53:7 expire 106:23 expired 102:13,14 102:19 106:20 expires 102:5,11 explain 31:12 72:16 77:22 130:5 explained 138:11	explaining 82:22 explanation 140:23 extend 79:4 extent 132:7 extra 76:17 120:4 124:17 extra-alarm 41:2 41:6 extricating 110:8 exudes 132:15
F				
				face 113:6,6 128:9 135:7 facility 11:10 fact 88:10 105:18 fair 40:11 Fallen 57:12 falls 23:6 familiar 44:2 family 57:7 far 26:24 27:11 56:18,19 60:12 83:8 93:4 105:1 126:7 129:10,11 fashion 17:9 fatalities 10:22 11:1 February 126:21 fed 60:18 federal 52:10 feel 129:21,22 feeling 128:21,22 131:20 fell 18:4 female 12:21 13:3 field 26:3 37:19 37:24 38:7,18 38:20,24 39:4,7 39:11 40:23 41:4,19 42:2,11 42:23 100:12,13 figure 58:15 fill 25:3 26:22 27:5 39:17 45:12 63:17

64:5 68:13 69:8 75:8 119:6 filled 26:24 62:17 62:22 74:3,7 104:20 118:15 filling 25:8 62:15 63:9 64:9,11 65:1 74:12,14 93:23 114:11 115:3 138:7 finally 15:24 28:5 finance 5:20 72:14,24 financial 8:19 76:10 find 18:16 34:17 49:23 59:15 70:13 91:14 98:5 124:7 127:13 findings 94:10 95:8 fine 54:4 66:5 finish 64:24 fire 9:11,18 10:21 10:24 11:10,14 11:17 12:7,10 13:4 17:17 23:18 24:24 25:3,4,13 26:10 28:13 29:24 31:22 37:19,24 38:17,18,19,20 38:24 39:1,4,5 41:2,6 42:9 47:7 47:12 48:13 51:1 54:11,24 55:12 56:7,18 59:19 65:9,12 66:2 68:21 73:14 81:3,10 81:16 82:5 83:14 84:3 88:5 88:12,13 89:10 89:20 91:13,19 94:8 95:7 100:6 100:9,24 106:16	107:15 108:7,17 109:24 112:15 113:1 119:9 120:4 122:4,7 124:3,14 130:16 131:23 133:24 134:7,17,20 135:1,18 137:24 138:6 139:13 140:9 141:7 firefighter 25:16 25:23 47:6,21 48:7,8 59:8,12 74:23 75:2,9 76:7 91:7 firefighters 11:13 11:17 32:24 33:7 36:19 38:11 40:1 46:22 47:13 50:1 57:12 59:16 66:24 67:2 77:10,19 81:15 84:17 88:16 107:4 111:6,17 112:14 112:23 113:3 123:12 128:24 129:13 134:22 135:18 136:15 138:2 firefighter's 43:9 fires 59:23 89:18 132:17 Fire's 82:1 first 12:3 34:7 35:10 49:9,19 49:23 52:23 53:3 55:24 60:24 108:24 111:10 fiscal 4:10 5:4 6:9 6:12,16 8:2,20 8:22 10:4 13:23 14:2 26:16 27:1 80:12,16 82:1 126:5	five 6:6 21:18 54:12,12,14,20 five-minute 22:21 five-year 8:18 14:21 flagged 60:20,23 floor 130:10 flow 129:8 fluidity 52:13 focus 133:20 139:10 focused 129:14 130:12 folks 23:22 42:2 46:1 49:24 58:7 64:12 103:9 105:18 106:18 110:13 130:8 follow 30:16 37:5 42:16 77:8 90:19 101:12 following 45:10 77:10 107:24 follows 10:12 follow-up 32:10 footprint 90:2 force 12:12 51:10 51:16 52:4 foremost 49:9 forget 138:21 forgetting 133:21 formally 35:13 forward 16:5 27:6 54:13,14,21 70:6 89:24 90:1 90:4 132:20 141:4 found 33:10 34:18 51:14 113:8 Foundation 56:13 57:13 four 21:18 22:20 118:14 fourteen 69:22 frame 17:3 freeze 3:22 fresh 64:15	101:15,16 141:8 full 24:5 fully 15:20 fund 88:8 121:4 127:10 funded 48:17,19 48:23 funding 10:6 91:17 120:4 funds 52:14,15 59:3 88:4 133:2 funeral 59:8,11 furnishing 99:9 further 2:15 4:17 5:11 7:10 8:9 12:20 34:3 50:4 109:5 138:10 future 18:16 19:23 29:1 44:10 60:7 84:22 93:9 139:9 140:16 FY08 15:4 FY12 15:1 FY13 15:6	112:10 130:12 130:14 141:18 given 34:20 60:16 60:24 63:22 84:11 91:21 133:1 gives 56:17 giving 34:6 glad 14:16 go 16:4 17:19 19:1 23:19,20 31:1,13 35:23 42:8 43:17 46:24 47:6 49:16 56:2 57:6 57:22 61:15 62:13 65:21 67:8,9 79:2 104:8 105:1 110:23 113:4,7 123:22 126:9 127:17 128:6 129:20 130:17 136:24 139:19 goal 13:6 14:2 21:16,23 24:13 goes 42:11 50:10 50:14 88:8 97:9 97:10,15 109:23 127:10 130:21 going 16:5 17:24 20:17 21:3,7,8 22:8 26:8,9 32:2 32:13 34:7,10 35:24 36:5,14 36:16 39:20 41:19,21,23 42:15 49:22 50:3 54:13,14 54:20 55:9 57:5 57:14 58:10 62:22 63:15,22 64:3,5,22,24 65:6,7,20 67:8,9 67:14 69:2,8 74:10 75:22,23 76:9,14 77:3,21
---	--	---	---	--

78:2 82:4,8,10 86:4 89:6 93:2 94:1 101:8,9 102:3 105:18 118:13 124:1,16 126:12 131:11 132:16,17 135:9 136:8,22,24 137:19 140:4,24 141:4 good 9:12,16 45:5 45:6 53:4,21,23 61:5,18,20 72:7 72:20,21 81:5 84:20 85:19,21 89:21 115:12 118:11 129:16 131:3 132:21 133:15,16 Goodwin 14:11 government 52:10 graduated 11:12 Grand 94:7,12 95:5,11,14,16 96:6,10 98:9 99:1,15,20 grant 32:1,3,13 35:15,23 36:2,5 36:8,11,13 94:2 great 55:4 123:11 123:11 132:24 133:3 greater 80:8 ground 40:11 group 67:23 groups 12:19 guess 41:14,18 59:24 65:6 119:2 129:22 guessing 66:14 guidelines 20:23 guys 49:5 114:7	handled 16:11 83:11 handling 121:3 hands 57:2 91:13 122:18 123:4 happen 72:17 78:2 93:9 111:2 130:24 140:8 happened 56:6 111:21,23 121:7 122:15 123:3 happening 26:5 54:24 60:6 happens 52:21,24 66:6 68:15 77:1 107:14 113:21 115:22 140:16 hard 12:12 hardest 131:4 Harrisburg 51:7 51:12,13,14 hazardous 56:19 head 132:5 health 24:7 hear 70:14 123:21 129:18 heard 55:24 hearing 2:2 28:1 28:1 73:17 92:19,20 93:19 hearings 27:23 heart 17:4,23 22:13 held 33:16 35:2 help 26:13 34:12 43:18 94:16 132:18 helpful 54:17 58:14 helping 88:3 hierarchy 25:11 27:11 45:14 high 21:11 49:17 100:18 107:10 121:21 highest 61:16 highlight 10:2	hire 68:22 76:8,11 77:9 84:4,17 hired 12:7 25:21 hiring 11:17 12:3 12:9 15:11 47:19 75:7,20 75:21 76:7 81:15 83:21 139:17 Hispanic 12:18 historically 109:7 109:19 history 10:22 17:8 17:13 hit 32:10 131:4 hits 21:9 hitting 137:16,17 holding 82:5 home 55:19 56:23 89:9 130:21 homegrown 51:1 homes 11:5 89:6 homestead 7:2 home-escape 89:4 honestly 29:4 118:8 hope 141:13 hopefully 32:2 hospital 11:23 19:2 23:4,11,18 23:23 24:2 host 51:13 hours 28:12,13 29:6 house 109:1,15 housed 51:16 huge 76:5 77:24 135:22 human 115:11 117:2 hundreds 107:3,4 117:24 H.R 83:23 85:3,6	identified 17:21 ignored 103:12 imagine 48:22 117:24 immediate 52:20 immediately 60:24 76:11 imminently 59:22 61:2 impact 137:5 impacted 45:16 impinged 79:15 impingement 76:15 implement 15:21 90:5 implementation 24:6 implemented 16:2 implementing 15:18 implore 139:18 important 33:17 33:23 34:23 35:11,12,16,21 37:4,18,24 38:3 38:15 39:23,24 40:15,20 46:21 49:7,21 57:8 58:20 128:19 133:24 135:2 136:3 impose 4:20 5:13 8:11 impressive 28:17 improvements 3:11 91:6 incentive 122:20 included 29:13 31:9 includes 10:9 including 36:19 inclusive 6:10 income 3:2,4 incorporated 59:4	incorporating 8:21 increase 10:17 11:24 Indian 12:19 individual 97:24 individuals 25:7 industrial 3:13 industry 14:22 15:10 19:8,9,13 20:8,11,15,22 inform 56:8 informal 137:12 140:7 informally 137:21 information 27:24 28:11 29:9 30:15 31:10 44:8 50:18 54:16 55:3 57:3,24 58:3,9,21 60:5 74:9 92:18 94:6 94:9 95:5,8 96:3 96:5,10,15 97:4 97:4,7,9,10,21 98:7,8,12,13 99:3,9,14 102:18 112:10 139:8 141:5 informed 132:11 initial 45:10 initiative 4:7 7:23 injured 111:6,18 112:15 113:1 injuries 78:6 89:19 113:3 injury 112:7 innovation 57:8 inquired 28:7 inside 109:2 instituted 86:9 institutional 41:20,24 136:4 instructed 96:4 instructor 137:17 intense 125:11
--	---	---	--	---

H

half 33:21
Hall 1:5

I

idea 54:9,18
129:5

interactive 58:6 58:19 interest 33:13 interested 58:2,10 97:12 interesting 58:19 Intergovernme... 9:1,2 Intermedix 126:18,20 internal 47:15 internally 116:16 intervene 18:24 investment 10:10 involuntarily 112:24 involved 109:1 128:20 involves 83:23 iPhone 55:17 issue 43:7 89:8 100:3 124:6 128:18 issues 40:17 44:20 142:17 items 10:12 79:8	July 12:8 66:15 66:16 67:7,10 106:14 114:11 114:18 June 11:18 26:8 63:24 64:3 65:19 66:12 70:4 102:24 105:4,23 106:4 Jury 94:7,12 95:6 95:11,14,16 96:7,10 98:9 99:1,15,20	97:10 131:22 132:8 137:13 140:18 kinds 49:10,13 140:7 king 132:4 kitchen 130:11 know 16:8,20 22:13 24:20 35:12 39:17 42:18 51:14 54:13,15,19,20 55:23 57:6 58:11,12,16 61:1 63:15 67:12 69:10 81:1 83:4,5 89:10 91:5 96:9 98:19 99:20 102:11 104:24 106:10,15 112:12 114:19 117:2 122:11,20 123:24 124:15 124:18 131:2,13 132:14 134:24 137:22 140:4,5 141:1 knowing 42:11 77:23 knowledge 41:21 42:23 56:21 136:5 knows 65:4 136:22	largest 13:12 late 28:1 lately 115:14 lay 131:6 layers 71:14 laying 130:10 lead 29:23 137:6 140:2 leadership 41:24 136:4 139:15 140:7 leading 11:22 118:20 learn 42:17 50:23 learned 135:15 learning 32:18 93:14 leave 76:23 77:4 105:19 109:14 left 62:21 legal 101:14,16 legislation 127:24 legislative 99:10 lesser 89:16 letter 28:4 92:23 let's 135:7 level 10:6 12:24 17:20 25:16,17 26:19 38:17 41:9 42:11 46:7 46:8 47:1,21 48:7 57:11 72:15 75:9 76:7 levels 10:8 47:6 lieutenant 42:21 43:4,4,17 45:21 46:8 47:2 69:23 lieutenants 25:3 27:2 29:20 31:7 31:20 32:3,15 36:20 38:10,14 40:1 42:3,4,14 62:2 67:1 75:14 93:12 100:15 107:5 119:1 lieutenant's 43:8 life 10:16 22:9	89:13 130:15 life-threatening 22:11 light 88:17 122:15 likewise 53:1 130:16 limitation 6:6 limited 32:19,21 92:3 124:5 128:21 line 47:9 102:4 140:14 lines 22:24 list 25:20,20,22 27:3 60:17 62:12 63:3,5,17 64:4,14,15,18 64:23,23 65:23 66:2,11,17,22 66:23 67:4,11 67:13 68:7,9,22 69:7 79:8 84:2,3 84:12,12 98:10 98:15 101:13,15 102:5 103:2,3,9 103:11,14 104:8 104:12 105:2 106:18,20,23 107:1,9,11 108:2,3,6 136:21,24 139:22 141:22 lists 83:24 little 16:21 51:4 58:5,18 64:14 79:1 115:15 124:9,10 126:1 127:13,14,15 140:15 141:11 live 49:17 lives 88:15 Lloyd 9:18 location 11:8 19:14 60:23 122:19 locations 123:18 log 96:21,22 97:8
J	K	L		
JAMES 1:12 January 9:5 11:11 Jaws 10:16 job 40:21 43:8,9 68:10 90:14,23 105:19 106:4 133:4 137:10 Jones 1:12 24:21 45:2,3,8 46:2,16 47:9,16,22 48:1 48:11,16,21 49:3 50:21 51:20 53:9 125:7,8 126:14 127:1,5,11,23 JR 1:12 judge 99:1,8,16 judgments 132:2	Kal 56:12 keep 22:19 57:6 59:15 89:1,6 90:15 129:13 130:8,8,18,18 131:8,10,12 132:10,17 keeping 22:23 Kenney 1:12 37:12,13,23 38:4,16,22 39:9 39:19 40:5,8,22 41:7,13,17 42:19 43:2,16 43:21 44:1,4,13 44:17 101:24 102:1,10,15,20 103:1,7,19 104:3,16,22 105:6,10,16 106:11,22 107:17 108:12 108:23 109:12 109:18,22 110:4 110:15,19,22 111:5,11,16,24 112:5,13,18,22 113:15,22 Kenny 73:18 83:1 killed 59:9 kind 33:12 39:21 40:9 71:13 97:8	97:10 131:22 132:8 137:13 140:18 kinds 49:10,13 140:7 king 132:4 kitchen 130:11 know 16:8,20 22:13 24:20 35:12 39:17 42:18 51:14 54:13,15,19,20 55:23 57:6 58:11,12,16 61:1 63:15 67:12 69:10 81:1 83:4,5 89:10 91:5 96:9 98:19 99:20 102:11 104:24 106:10,15 112:12 114:19 117:2 122:11,20 123:24 124:15 124:18 131:2,13 132:14 134:24 137:22 140:4,5 141:1 knowing 42:11 77:23 knowledge 41:21 42:23 56:21 136:5 knows 65:4 136:22	largest 13:12 late 28:1 lately 115:14 lay 131:6 layers 71:14 laying 130:10 lead 29:23 137:6 140:2 leadership 41:24 136:4 139:15 140:7 leading 11:22 118:20 learn 42:17 50:23 learned 135:15 learning 32:18 93:14 leave 76:23 77:4 105:19 109:14 left 62:21 legal 101:14,16 legislation 127:24 legislative 99:10 lesser 89:16 letter 28:4 92:23 let's 135:7 level 10:6 12:24 17:20 25:16,17 26:19 38:17 41:9 42:11 46:7 46:8 47:1,21 48:7 57:11 72:15 75:9 76:7 levels 10:8 47:6 lieutenant 42:21 43:4,4,17 45:21 46:8 47:2 69:23 lieutenants 25:3 27:2 29:20 31:7 31:20 32:3,15 36:20 38:10,14 40:1 42:3,4,14 62:2 67:1 75:14 93:12 100:15 107:5 119:1 lieutenant's 43:8 life 10:16 22:9	89:13 130:15 life-threatening 22:11 light 88:17 122:15 likewise 53:1 130:16 limitation 6:6 limited 32:19,21 92:3 124:5 128:21 line 47:9 102:4 140:14 lines 22:24 list 25:20,20,22 27:3 60:17 62:12 63:3,5,17 64:4,14,15,18 64:23,23 65:23 66:2,11,17,22 66:23 67:4,11 67:13 68:7,9,22 69:7 79:8 84:2,3 84:12,12 98:10 98:15 101:13,15 102:5 103:2,3,9 103:11,14 104:8 104:12 105:2 106:18,20,23 107:1,9,11 108:2,3,6 136:21,24 139:22 141:22 lists 83:24 little 16:21 51:4 58:5,18 64:14 79:1 115:15 124:9,10 126:1 127:13,14,15 140:15 141:11 live 49:17 lives 88:15 Lloyd 9:18 location 11:8 19:14 60:23 122:19 locations 123:18 log 96:21,22 97:8

97:10,15,16 logged 97:24 98:2 logs 94:5,11 95:3 95:10 96:6 97:11 99:23 long 39:10 65:22 68:10 70:2 84:9 107:6 115:9 117:16 119:9 124:18 longer 19:3 74:16 long-term 78:6 look 18:16 28:24 29:1 75:11,20 90:1,11,24 113:8 131:8 139:20 141:8,12 looked 25:18 73:1 73:2 141:14 looking 16:3 18:19,22 19:17 22:19 28:10 29:11 32:5 56:8 59:2 62:9 87:17 89:24 90:10 100:5 123:3 125:18 136:16 136:17 looks 54:19 126:23 look-see 57:23 lose 129:23 131:9 136:3 loss 89:12,13 139:14 lost 14:9 41:21 lot 23:2 25:4 29:10 56:11 57:20,21,24 64:12 65:15,17 70:5 103:5 115:11 118:20 119:5,10 129:18 129:19 138:12 low 3:1,4 52:9 lower 24:10 lowest 10:21	Lucille 56:13 lynchpin 40:10 L&I 60:3,9,10,10 60:16 M magically 104:23 maintains 10:7 major 124:6 making 42:15 73:10 130:19 male 12:21 13:3 man 130:6 manage 29:23 83:3 management 44:6 51:5 67:17,19 67:23 71:12 72:14 74:21,22 83:5,7 119:8 121:3,11 134:2 134:5 138:19 management's 83:9 manager 72:13 managing 71:15 72:12 83:6 139:19 141:15 manner 30:14 map 140:12 March 28:4 92:23 MARK 1:14 materials 56:19 matter 58:8 88:19 maximizes 134:20 Mayor 8:24 9:5 28:5 71:16 83:7 92:24 129:2 131:24 132:9,11 132:23 141:15 MDO's 85:2 mean 22:1 47:23 51:21 83:5 105:17,24 106:8 117:24 123:21 126:15 134:24 136:7 137:2	means 81:19 82:18 129:10 142:18 measure 88:1 medic 11:15 18:1 18:9,11 90:4 medical 10:18 11:20 12:4 13:15 48:9 medication 23:23 meet 13:19 meeting 28:3 92:22 meetings 28:2 60:14 92:21 123:23 member 58:12 members 9:14,21 14:6,10,12 123:11,22 142:6 men 26:1 53:6 68:24 129:14 mention 55:10 mentioned 13:10 mentor 38:13 mentoring 42:13 met 91:19 methods 92:1 Michael 14:10 middle 74:22 million 10:12 13:18 74:1,1 77:12 82:14,15 82:19,20,21,23 82:23 83:16,19 120:8,10,14,15 120:19 124:14 125:18 127:4 128:2,3 mind 130:18,19 Minimum 13:20 minority 13:7 minute 62:7 70:10 83:13 minutes 10:2 14:24 15:2,7 18:9 19:21	21:18 missed 82:7 mission 129:15,16 129:23 130:9,19 mistakes 140:10 misunderstood 66:8 mitigation 53:7 moment 37:17 Monday 142:15 money 59:1 76:18 79:20 80:5,15 85:2,5 86:23 87:1,3 88:11 91:11,18 92:2 93:21 119:21,22 119:23 121:3,7 121:11 124:11 124:18,23 127:9 135:16 monies 58:24 93:18 monitor 17:16 38:8 monoxide 56:22 89:2 month 115:15 117:14,17,19,21 141:12 months 81:19 84:11,19 93:1 98:22 118:14 137:9 morale 128:19 129:12 130:5 134:6 morning 9:13,16 45:5,7 53:22,24 61:19,21 72:20 72:22 81:6 85:20,22 133:15 motivated 130:8 mouth 119:15 move 27:6 34:12 46:1 75:1 90:1,4 108:14 132:19 moving 17:13	18:1 94:3 municipalities 20:10 myriad 78:5 N name 56:23 80:23 81:1 national 51:4 57:11,12 nationally 47:13 nationwide 57:14 nature 86:4 nearly 16:9 necessarily 136:19 necessary 100:10 109:10 110:12 110:16,18 need 15:13 23:22 24:3 39:17 42:16,18 43:18 52:14,15 58:5 63:4 80:18 104:11 110:7 113:17 needed 30:4 66:23 80:4 140:4 needs 44:9 100:17 132:14 139:8 negative 71:2 138:22 139:1 Net 7:16 never 135:20 new 2:24 10:16 11:8,13 33:16 35:1 42:3,4,20 43:3,17 56:9 60:11 64:4,23 65:8,23 66:23 67:6,7 68:10 79:3 81:15,22 84:7 103:14 104:23 125:23 126:15,17 newly 41:19 night 123:6
--	---	--	--	--

nine 14:24 15:2,7 19:21 non-emergency 16:19 20:18 22:10 non-emergent 16:7,11 19:17 22:5 24:1 normal 25:23 78:9 106:12 107:15,16,18 112:19,21 normally 91:15 Nos 1:17 2:4 noted 100:1 notes 54:8 noticed 55:10 notified 36:10 November 28:1 92:20 number 2:7,11 8:15 10:21 19:18,19 24:11 26:18 28:19 29:6 30:2 58:16 58:17 62:4 63:16 65:7 69:7 69:15 77:24 82:24 118:24 119:5 139:14 numbers 26:12 45:15 54:21 73:3,5 75:11 135:1,3,22 140:21 nurse 18:24 nursing 18:23 Nutter 13:5	77:12 occurring 15:6 112:7 October 27:24 92:19 95:22 96:2 98:6 odd 91:15 offering 84:1 officer 29:18 31:5 33:15,17,23 34:22 43:13 47:7 61:24 75:16 105:14 109:8 110:11 136:10,12 137:8 officers 25:12,14 26:21 30:14,21 32:24 33:7,16 35:1,20 36:19 40:13 41:20 61:17 78:15 100:13 118:20 118:21 136:12 136:16,17,18 140:3 officer's 29:22 official 126:20 offset 79:19 Oh 1:14 85:14,15 85:19,23 86:7 86:12,15,21 87:2,6,10,20 88:9 90:18 116:4 128:15,16 131:16 132:22 okay 16:16 17:11 18:8 22:23 24:17 27:8,13 34:15 35:3 37:3 39:9 41:17 44:13 55:21 57:19 61:4 62:8 69:20 78:24 85:9 87:20 96:1 96:20 98:21 101:3 103:7 108:12,23	110:21 112:22 113:22 114:23 116:5 121:6 124:20 125:22 128:2 132:22 136:13 old 68:18 older 136:18 onboard 81:22 82:3 once 117:13 ones 116:23 135:19 136:19 one-on-one 42:13 online 93:16 on-hand 123:7 on-the-road 100:12 open 118:9 opening 108:4 openings 47:11,17 104:13 106:5 operating 6:16 10:5 operation 132:12 operational 52:5 opinion 74:11 140:14 opportunities 30:20 49:11,19 50:7 opportunity 14:5 15:12 49:4,9 133:1 135:23 opposition 91:2 optimistic 98:23 oral 116:3,14,16 116:22 117:13 order 113:12 ordinance 2:12,22 3:6,17 4:5,24 5:18 6:8,12,15 6:18 7:5,14,19 9:4 org 45:14 organization 45:19	organizational 37:20 38:1 organize 38:9 origin 127:19 original 86:16,20 86:22 96:21 99:18 originally 142:16 originals 99:21 outlook 131:13 outside 116:17,19 outstanding 125:20 overage 83:17 overall 13:22 84:10 oversight 11:24 overtime 26:13 74:2,10,24 75:24 76:5,6,15 76:18,20,22 77:9,12,20 79:2 79:6,15,19,20 79:23 80:4,7,12 80:20 81:8,10 81:20,24 82:2 82:15 93:20,22 owe 3:23 owner's 6:5 owner-occupied 6:4 oxygen 10:18 O'Brien 1:13 27:15,16,20 29:3,15 30:6,24 32:8 33:8,22 34:9,15 35:5,22 36:22 37:3 92:11,12,16 94:18,22 95:15 95:21 96:1,13 96:20 97:2,18 98:4,21 99:6 100:2 101:3,7 O'Neill 1:13 70:19,20,24 71:6,11,19 72:1	72:5,21 73:15 73:20,24 74:5 74:15 75:4 76:16 77:6 78:8 78:21 79:7,17 79:24 80:14 82:6,13 85:9 133:12,13,19 134:15 135:12 136:11,14 139:2 139:7
P				
PA 51:16 package 30:17 Page 14:21 22:24 44:5 paid 74:24 pain 18:5 palm 57:2 parachute 50:2 paramedic 18:1 19:14 20:2 28:14 48:10 paramedics 12:8 129:14 pardon 37:22 63:20 67:21 103:18 112:4 part 15:16 19:18 21:3 51:11 52:5 60:12 78:17,18 78:19 79:23 94:23 106:9 135:13 participant 3:21 participation 13:8,11,14,23 14:2 particular 125:15 particularly 58:2 125:17 partner 88:22 partnered 56:9 parts 39:23 pass 116:23 118:1 passes 117:8,10				

path 50:9 pathway 49:14 pay 126:11 paying 60:5 124:2 payment 2:17 5:24 10:15 payments 126:13 Pennsylvania 1:5 8:24 51:10 52:4 53:1,2 pension 135:14 people 20:23 23:10,17 44:21 46:17 47:17 49:8,23 50:7 57:20,21 58:9 58:16,20 59:23 62:12 63:5,17 64:1,17 67:24 68:8,11,12 69:8 70:4 73:1,22 76:23 77:4 84:13 85:3 103:2 106:24 109:2,11 110:6 110:8 115:18 116:21 118:8 123:24 126:10 129:21 131:2,7 135:7 137:7,20 140:9,11 percent 5:4 10:23 11:21 12:16,17 12:18,18,21,21 13:1,2,3,3,6,13 13:17,24 14:3 14:24 15:3,4,8 16:9,10 19:20 20:16 23:3 81:8 81:21 82:16,18 82:20 percentage 54:10 77:24 percentages 54:22 75:12,15 75:18 perception 69:6	perform 69:3 103:10 performing 100:10 peril 109:11 period 4:6 7:20 19:3 53:8 76:9 95:1 126:19 139:16 perplexed 33:9 person 17:23,24 18:3 67:24 96:17 112:1,6 130:6,14 personal 106:3 113:11 129:2 personnel 100:7 perspective 83:17 pervasive 131:20 phase 10:14 phasing 4:5 7:19 Philadelphia 1:1 1:5 2:14,19,19 2:23 3:7,18 4:9 4:10,12,16,19 4:21 5:2,3,6,10 5:13,15,19,22 6:2,3,19 7:6,15 7:24 8:1,4,8,11 8:13,18,20 13:19 23:18 26:10 31:22 47:11 48:20 49:8,16,17 50:16 51:7,11 51:17 52:22 57:9 68:21 73:14 94:8 95:6 100:6,24 119:8 120:17 phones 57:22 PICA 71:24 72:2 pick 101:15 piece 76:5 130:5 pieces 10:3 place 15:23 45:20 63:7 68:24	126:12 placed 91:13 places 76:1 92:2 123:16 132:13 plan 8:19 14:21 15:19 24:23 25:2,8,11 45:12 89:4 90:5 planning 26:16 plans 11:16 12:9 24:21 135:15 platoons 76:3 please 2:9 33:21 87:7 pleasure 9:22 plenty 50:6 point 18:15 19:23 21:16 22:1 26:17,20 48:4 64:13 66:23 68:23 76:23 87:11,23 126:24 131:2 136:23 pointed 130:9 points 48:8,9,10 police 25:12 85:6 103:22 104:9 108:5 policies 104:4 policy 103:15,20 104:1 107:19,23 112:19 portion 2:17 6:1 127:17 position 43:10 77:2 91:15 105:13 positions 13:1 61:24 64:19 67:9 68:13 69:2 70:1 74:3,8,12 74:14,21,22,23 75:1,20,21 105:7,9 114:12 115:3 138:7,15 positive 131:13 138:23 139:4	possibilities 122:16 possibility 118:11 possible 47:18 possibly 18:20 117:21 potential 134:21 potentially 24:10 practices 130:20 prayers 14:13 precious 137:6 precision 134:8 predictions 134:24 preliminary 90:10 preparation 47:5 prepare 103:10 135:6 preparedness 55:11 preparing 107:6 presence 111:19 present 1:10 141:23 presented 91:23 94:6,12 95:5,11 95:14,16 President 1:11 2:1 9:8,13,15 14:18 16:15 17:1,10 19:7 20:6 21:20,24 22:22 23:14 24:9,16 27:7,12 27:17,18 36:23 37:1,8,9,14 44:19,23 45:4 53:12,13,18,19 61:6,11,12 70:16,21,22 80:22 85:11,16 85:17 90:19 92:7,8,13,14 101:5,21 102:2 113:24 114:1,6 125:5 128:12,17	133:9 137:14 142:3,10,11 president's 45:10 pretty 21:11 40:11 57:24 86:3,5 115:12 140:13 prevent 60:6 prevention 11:1 56:7 previous 10:24 27:23 54:15 previously 62:11 114:8 price 10:17 primary 6:5 prior 4:2 85:24 priorities 29:18 30:8,11 31:5 priority 15:21 34:3 private 18:17 proactive 138:22 138:23 139:4 proactively 44:8 138:20 139:3 probably 22:8 26:17 39:22 84:5 90:11 problems 27:10 128:8 procedures 130:21 proceeds 42:1 process 12:3 17:19 26:22 27:2 46:24 63:1 63:4,7,8 64:12 64:22 75:3,7,10 84:9 99:16 104:10 113:4,7 116:6 117:1,3 processes 116:12 professional 13:12 professionalism 130:13
--	--	---	---	---

proficiency 39:11	5:15,23 8:5,13	102:5	99:22 107:12	regarding 2:3
Profits 7:16	8:16	questions 14:17	139:22 141:9	100:17
program 3:22 4:3	Provisions 3:1,20	14:20 32:9,11	Realty 7:9	region 47:18
6:9 32:23 39:15	public 2:2 62:10	33:14 34:11	reason 48:23	regular 60:15
59:5 100:13	65:4 88:14 97:4	36:11 39:20	62:14 85:5	81:9,12 113:7
prohibit 99:2	123:20	48:24 54:6	122:17	regulations 108:1
prohibited 99:8	published 64:24	61:15 73:16	reasoning 77:11	108:15
project 77:11	pull 26:1	90:20 93:11,19	reasons 85:1	reimbursed 52:10
projected 70:6	punish 91:16	125:10 142:6	137:18	reimbursements
78:22 102:24	punished 113:17	quicker 11:5	reassert 92:17	125:16
105:4 106:17	purchase 10:13	quote 44:6 132:3	Rebecca 81:6	related 40:17
128:3	10:15		recall 84:6 96:9	104:2,5 134:12
projecting 79:13	purposes 91:21	R	114:21,23	relates 24:22
projection 76:22	pursuant 9:2	R 14:11	receivables	28:12
78:18,20	put 15:22 16:1	racially 84:8	125:21	relationship
projects 88:6	24:5 35:14	racial/gender	receive 133:2	132:8,21
promote 106:17	39:21 56:11,13	12:14,22	received 126:10	relative 108:16
106:24 116:1	58:23 78:13,18	raising 123:23	recess 142:14	release 96:5
promoted 41:19	85:5 88:4 91:18	Randolph 50:14	recognizes 27:14	releasing 94:9
55:22 67:3,4	92:2 105:15	50:19	37:11 45:1	95:7 99:2
104:11,19	119:23 126:12	range 78:9	53:15 61:8	relevant 46:19
107:13 136:23	134:23 138:13	rank 38:19	70:18 85:13	125:12
promotion 37:16	puts 57:2	ranks 12:13 25:5	92:10 101:23	rely 137:20
46:5,9,18 62:19	putting 32:22	45:24 75:2	114:3 128:14	remaining 103:2
103:15 104:19	35:19 60:10	137:7	133:11	remember 115:1
promotional	85:2 119:15	rate 3:24 4:14,22	reconciling 29:5	115:5,7
103:20	p.m 142:22	5:3,8,14,16 6:23	reconsider 122:22	reminds 137:13
promotions		6:24 7:11 8:6,14	137:4	reopening 122:22
140:19	Q	13:12,14,23	reconsidered	repeat 33:21
proper 22:7 90:2	qualified 48:2	126:4	141:17	94:17
90:6	49:24 68:8,12	rates 7:17	record 9:18 34:21	replaced 90:12
properly 17:20	139:23	raw 45:15	80:24	replacement
properties 3:14	quarter 15:5	reach 50:5	recorded 10:21	10:19
6:4 59:21	question 20:7	reactive 44:7	10:24	replenish 52:15
property 4:2,14	24:18 29:16	138:20,21	recruit 12:12	report 44:2 71:1
5:8 7:21 8:6	34:6 35:6 37:4	read 2:9 58:13	50:11	71:22 72:7 73:2
89:12	45:11 52:19	94:23 103:21	recruitment	73:12 83:2
proposed 8:22	55:8 59:7 60:1	ready 66:11,14	48:12 49:20	reported 111:23
protect 134:21	70:13 71:2 73:8	106:2	50:10,13	reporting 20:20
protective 113:11	77:8 83:1,14	real 2:15,17 3:1,3	recruits 25:24	reports 126:2
protocol 79:3	88:10 93:24	3:8,9 4:8,12,14	139:15	represents 28:11
provide 5:7 12:1	94:4,21 97:6	4:20,24 5:6,8,14	Red 56:24	94:23
50:22	101:11 102:21	5:22 6:1,20,23	reduced 81:24	request 85:24
provided 54:9,13	104:2 118:6	7:1,21,23 8:4,6	reducing 3:9,14	86:17,20,22
98:20	119:20 133:21	8:12	reduction 3:24	92:18 95:2 98:6
providing 2:16	questioned 96:19	really 31:1 33:9,9	10:23 59:5	98:14 100:1,5
3:2,20 4:13,21	questioning 47:10	53:4 97:20 98:5	refers 95:2	requested 27:24

94:5 98:16,19 requesting 10:5 99:13 requests 86:1,3 86:23 93:1 94:24 98:22 required 13:19 14:23 90:15 requirements 44:10 139:9 rescue 10:11,16 111:18 residence 6:5 residential 3:12 resistance 91:20 resolution 1:19 2:7,10 8:15,16 resolved 142:18 resource 16:13 52:20,22 117:2 resources 51:22 52:1 89:16 115:11 130:13 respect 8:22 15:13 84:20 respected 14:9 respective 30:22 128:6 respectively 6:20 respond 17:2 21:17 52:14 53:10 72:17 88:24 123:8,16 responded 11:19 responders 61:1 responding 20:24 20:24 23:1 89:13,21 response 14:23 15:1,6,14 19:20 20:19 21:4 22:7 23:9 24:14 28:6 29:17 31:3 36:9 36:13 56:20 71:7 95:4 125:14 responses 93:3	responsibilities 51:21 52:2 responsibility 40:16 52:3 rest 63:10 restore 40:24 41:5 result 3:24 111:7 112:7,15,24 129:1 resulting 23:4 results 115:9,17 retirees 139:14 retirement 46:10 140:21 retirements 135:4 137:5 retiring 73:22 revenue 127:2 review 10:1 Revised 8:18 revising 7:2,17 re-opening 11:7 Rhynhart 81:5,6 82:12 83:12 84:16 138:9 139:19 141:3 rid 125:1 right 16:13,14,14 18:1 19:15,16 20:7 22:1 24:14 24:14,15 25:21 34:4 35:14 44:18 55:17 57:13,17 65:3 65:18 66:18 67:6 68:7,18 70:1,8,12 84:14 87:15 90:16 102:7 107:9 108:13 109:21 116:7,10 117:6 117:11 118:4 119:13 120:3,12 125:4 140:2 141:20,23 rings 129:19,21 rise 100:18	risk 59:4 river 22:17 Road 51:18 roll 32:9 33:13,14 roof 110:23 room 1:5 31:13 31:14,15 roughly 82:19,20 round 24:19 37:6 53:10 Rudman 56:13 rules 99:1 run 17:8 100:15 rung 36:23 runs 134:20 S s 85:6 sad 14:8 135:13 safe 57:7 59:16 89:1,7 90:15 127:6 132:18 safely 130:22 safety 10:11 56:19 62:11 87:18 88:14 130:18 138:1 salaried 80:1 salary 29:14 Sandy 52:17,18 satisfied 83:8 saved 80:15,19 saves 135:16 savings 128:6 saw 55:23 saying 14:13 17:4 20:12,17 64:17 64:21,21 91:11 99:10,11 119:6 121:16 124:12 128:23 132:23 says 19:1 31:3 36:9 44:6 97:16 108:1 111:15 132:4 139:3 scary 65:3 scathing 72:11	SCBA 10:14 scene 108:17,24 109:24 111:9 112:16 134:20 137:24 140:9 schedule 33:4 84:21 scheduled 36:17 142:16 scheduling 35:19 school 2:19 4:9,16 4:19 5:2,10,12 6:3,21 7:1,7 8:1 8:8,10 49:17 50:12 schools 49:5 50:4 50:17 score 48:4 scores 115:18,22 115:24 scoring 84:1 second 15:5 26:8 34:14 79:11 100:4 108:15 seconds 111:13,14 Section 2:13 7:8 see 36:5 82:2 84:21,23 85:8 123:8 135:3 seeing 81:23 122:16 140:20 seeking 15:17 seen 89:17,18 135:4 self-contained 10:13 113:9 self-directed 32:18 self-directing 93:14 send 22:6 24:13 sending 100:8 senior 3:19 129:4 131:19 sense 20:15 58:7 63:13 125:17 127:23	sensitive 84:8 sent 30:14,18 96:3 96:21,22 99:21 99:22 sentence 139:11 separate 17:6 19:24 20:4 22:6 31:11 separating 16:18 SEPTA 57:4 September 106:14 118:7 serious 88:19 93:2 service 10:8 12:7 12:10 13:13 41:11 43:5 101:17 104:5,6 107:18,24 126:10 140:1 services 9:21 11:21 12:5 13:16 124:4 session 73:4 set 7:11 23:21 setting 59:23 126:9 seven 36:2 62:1 69:22 76:2 102:24 104:23 share 96:4 98:9 98:15 shift 40:14 43:12 shifted 51:6 short 59:1 139:16 shorter 53:8 shot 130:14 shows 73:22 sicknesses 78:6 sicks 78:7 side 77:17 sight 129:23 significant 81:16 83:18 84:18 91:5 silence 42:7 similar 85:24 86:3,6
---	---	--	---	--

similarly 25:10 simple 139:11 simply 113:16 sir 25:16 45:7 48:15 50:9 61:19 65:17 71:5,18 72:4 80:23 85:18 92:15 108:22 122:13 133:8 139:1 142:2 sit 73:4 situation 24:8 42:20 43:3 113:20 123:7 130:2 132:19 139:12 situational 41:16 109:8 situations 113:13 130:1 140:8 six 6:9 33:11 34:1 34:19 36:2 46:6 62:1 93:1,1 98:22,22 104:23 137:9 six-requests-six... 95:1 skills 50:14,20 130:13 sky 121:8 slightly 45:9 slot 105:15 slots 93:23 104:20 slow 126:1 small 75:15,15,17 76:4 77:23 79:2 115:14 smart 57:21 137:1 smoke 56:22 89:2 89:5 solution 15:17 128:4,8 somebody 17:3 71:20 120:23 137:23 138:14 somebody's 130:9	somewhat 59:18 71:2,7 72:11 soon 63:1,8 sooner 79:14,14 80:10,11,16,19 82:10 106:16 sorry 25:13 66:9 94:15 sought 47:12 sounds 61:22 speak 14:11 19:15 83:6 speaking 31:19 94:15 speccing 60:12 special 2:24 3:19 23:20 specialists 17:18 specific 28:8 29:6 29:7 36:11 39:15 40:21 47:3 73:8 93:10 93:24 94:4 97:19 100:3,17 specifically 34:20 34:24 73:16 95:2 97:23 99:8 99:17 specifications 60:13 specs 16:4 speed 85:4,6 126:2 speeding 83:22 spend 79:20 83:15 133:2 spending 74:10 80:5 spent 91:1,12,20 93:6 spoke 141:15 spots 45:13 104:23 118:9 spring 137:19 springtime 137:15 sprinklers 56:23	Squilla 1:14 61:9 61:10,14,20 62:8,23 63:2,12 63:21 64:2,8,16 65:2,11,14,18 66:3,10,16 67:5 67:18,22 68:3,6 68:17 69:5,14 69:18,24 70:7 70:11 73:18 101:10 114:4,5 114:17,22 115:6 115:16,21 116:2 116:7,10,15,20 117:5,9,12,18 117:22 118:4,12 118:18 119:4,12 120:2,9,13,22 121:6,14,19,24 122:6,10,14 123:10,15 125:3 Squilla's 101:8 102:4 Sr 14:11 staff 9:22 129:4 131:19 staffing 10:7 stake 134:18 stale 64:14 66:18 66:19 67:12 68:9 101:13,14 101:16 standard 13:21 19:13 20:16,22 standards 14:22 15:10 19:8,9 20:8,11 start 14:20 82:8 82:10 110:7 114:11 started 80:3,6,10 86:11 115:2 126:20 starting 126:3,23 state 51:18 52:24 53:2 80:23 stated 114:8	137:12 statement 72:11 88:18 94:23 119:13 138:8,18 state-of-the-art 11:10 station 11:10 100:11 105:22 124:4 stations 11:14 33:1 100:17,19 stay 37:15 130:11 131:8,15 steady 89:17,18 89:19 stenographer 80:24 step 83:13 steps 83:20 sticking 141:16 stop 20:3 57:3,5 75:19 113:6 125:18 stopped 134:10 stops 19:14 straight 81:13 100:7 140:14 strategy 15:9 23:8 strikeouts 21:7 strikes 21:6 137:23 stroke 17:23 22:12 strongly 121:9 struggle 30:3 students 50:19 study 57:4,16 69:3 87:16 89:16 103:10 104:7 studying 64:1 67:2 69:1 107:5 137:1,3 submitted 8:23 9:24 99:18 subsequent 62:19 success 36:8	successful 32:12 36:4,10 50:24 94:2 succession 24:21 24:23 45:12 successive 39:20 summarize 93:4 Sun 132:3 supervisor 130:7 supervisors 131:19 supervisory 74:21 supplemented 138:10 support 12:1 14:6 14:13 22:9 38:9 51:15 57:14 109:11 supported 52:18 supporting 13:5 supportive 127:19 supposed 107:24 108:19 110:24 supposition 106:9 sure 42:15 49:12 49:22 52:13 58:16 60:3 96:17 102:9 117:23 122:17 123:11 130:19 suspect 105:24 switch 51:3 system 10:17 15:21 16:5,17 17:14 18:15,23 21:17 22:3,3 23:13 24:5,5 45:20 50:13 52:11 60:11,13 93:8 126:9,12 134:4 systems 11:4 T take 10:2 14:4 18:18,21 21:3
---	---	--	--	---

24:2 39:10 40:14 49:10,18 57:23 65:20 67:6 68:11 75:10 89:3 90:21 101:8 107:6,11,13 109:8,9 110:13 115:8 116:21,22 117:13,16,19,21 118:1 128:10 129:17 139:20 141:8 taken 23:11 39:16 108:6 114:9,10 114:14 115:2 117:16 talent 51:1 talk 14:22 16:16 23:1 51:8 59:14 73:5 talked 24:21 121:20 131:6 134:9 136:20 talking 74:20,23 75:13,17 79:1 83:18 109:19 116:5 118:6 119:1 136:10 140:10 target 127:2 Task 51:10,16 52:4 tax 2:15 3:1,3,19 3:22,24 4:13,14 4:17,20,22 5:7,8 5:10,14,14,16 6:21,22,23,24 7:1,7,10,11,12 7:16,17 8:5,6,8 8:12,13 taxed 22:3,4 taxes 2:18 3:8,10 3:23 4:8,13 5:1 5:7,20,23 6:1,21 7:24 8:5 123:23 124:2	taxi 18:22 23:19 taxpayers 3:2,4 4:1 teach 38:13 team 9:22 21:5 50:10 51:11 teamwork 134:8 technical 53:7 88:24 technician 48:9 technology 56:9 90:1,17 tell 28:16,18 30:7 32:16 40:23 86:2,8 100:21 103:5 105:17 106:8 120:24 121:15 124:16 telling 32:11 35:23 106:6 tend 25:6 term 101:20 138:22,23 terms 16:18 19:8 23:10 54:23 59:20 101:17 129:5 131:21 132:1 136:21 test 27:1 45:21,23 47:1,18 63:18 63:22,24 65:8 65:20,22 66:12 67:6,14 68:11 68:24 84:1,2,7 84:13 103:11 104:7 107:7,11 107:13 108:1 114:9,10,14 115:2,17 116:6 116:9,22 118:1 118:1 testified 16:9 testify 9:23 testimony 9:11 10:1,3 13:11 14:16 22:24 54:8 55:9,24	58:13 92:6 142:8 testing 26:22 45:19 46:24 63:1,3,4,7,8 64:13,22 85:7 89:5 tests 84:1 85:4 thank 2:2 9:9 14:5,19 27:13 27:16,21 37:7 37:10,13 44:19 44:24 45:3 53:12,14,17 61:5,7,10 70:15 70:17,20 85:10 85:12,15 92:7,9 92:12 101:22 102:1 113:23,24 114:2,5,7 125:4 125:6,8 128:11 128:13,16 133:6 133:7,10,13 141:24 142:1,4 142:7,9,12,20 thankful 56:11 Thanks 90:22 they'd 57:13 thing 35:17 54:22 54:23 55:20 71:13 72:24 84:20 130:23 131:4,18 things 18:6,10 22:4,14,18 23:23 26:14 34:12 39:16 40:18 42:16,17 49:6 52:9,12,16 73:6 75:14 78:4 78:5,7,16 79:2,5 79:12 87:1 88:21 89:5,23 106:13 124:1 125:23 129:8,12 129:20 130:24 131:1,7 132:16	135:24,24 138:4 think 39:14 46:6 50:4 51:6 56:18 57:23 64:18 65:4 66:5 72:9 74:7 84:13,16 91:24 103:3 124:20 125:11 127:9 137:12 138:3 139:22 141:7,19 thinks 91:3 third 59:11 thought 76:19 82:9 101:19 102:13 135:8 three 46:13,15 69:21 142:17 tied 19:22 tighten 84:22 time 15:1,14 16:14 17:3 19:4 19:20 20:1,20 21:4 23:9 24:2 24:15 33:11,13 34:18 36:24 43:12 53:8 58:23 60:9 68:23 81:9,12 81:13 84:24 87:11,22 95:20 100:7 101:9,11 104:15,19 105:20 106:3,3 107:6 109:3,3 109:17 110:2 114:10,13,24 115:13 119:9 122:5 123:18 133:15 137:4,6 139:16 140:3 142:13 timeline 92:18 114:24 115:1,5 times 14:23 15:2 15:6,20 77:4 115:13 122:19	123:5 141:20,21 Title 2:22 5:18 titles 2:9 today 27:22 142:19 today's 29:24 told 29:17 31:4 74:9 79:13 88:3 93:13 94:5 96:14 tool 10:16 134:2 top 68:22 77:15 77:15 topic 58:1 topics 28:7 total 10:5 28:19 118:21 121:22 tough 130:23 tour 49:4 tracking 59:21 60:4 traditional 136:1 tragic 14:8 59:9 train 26:2 30:20 32:3 34:19 39:10 41:19 trained 31:10 38:17,19 39:1 42:6 47:4 113:18 training 28:9,11 28:13,14,18,19 28:22 29:2,7,11 29:12,18,19 30:3,7,9,11,12 30:12,14,16,17 31:4,6,19,21 32:5,14,17,23 33:6,12,18,24 34:1,23,24 35:15,18 36:4,6 36:7,14,16,17 36:18 37:16 40:18 42:8,10 47:5,8 49:6,14 79:4 93:6,11,16 93:21,22 94:1,5
---	--	--	---	---

94:11 95:3,10 96:5 97:8,9,11 97:15,17,23 98:1,1,3,8,11 100:11,12,16,18 100:22 113:16 113:21 134:9 136:6 137:10,19 140:6,8 trains 42:2 100:7 transfer 112:6 transferred 112:1 112:14,23 113:14 transfers 30:2 transition 126:19 translates 129:11 transport 13:16 23:4 transportation 11:22 18:21 transported 23:17 trapped 110:7 trauma 22:15 travel 24:2 troops 132:6 133:3 trouble 31:2 97:20 truck 108:17 true 47:10 99:5 115:7 trump 30:8,12 try 17:2 31:13 33:14 58:15 64:5,7 93:2 94:16 129:12 130:4 131:12 trying 15:22 20:14 21:14 31:12 34:11 54:7 59:15 74:16 91:18 92:1 98:5 111:18 118:5 124:7	turn 131:11 turnaround 115:13 turnover 54:10,18 twice 46:7 82:16 two 12:24 28:2 32:9 45:21,22 46:3,13,14,15 58:17 71:14 92:20 114:16,18 116:12 141:21 twofold 50:9 type 97:24 128:20 128:24 129:5 types 18:14 22:13 22:18 Tzu 132:3 U Uh-huh 82:12 understand 71:12 77:7 80:2 99:19 110:18 131:17 133:18 140:22 140:24 141:2,3 understanding 21:14 31:2 97:20 131:23 understands 107:9 understood 78:1 unfilled 67:10 uniformed 12:15 Union 72:9 unit 18:1,9,12 20:2 48:12 49:20 50:24 units 11:15 90:4 109:24 University 56:6 unused 106:3 upper 25:5,5 upset 124:1 upwards 61:23 use 7:9 18:20 21:7 21:9 44:8 57:20 72:7 73:9,13	101:11 127:18 139:7 user-friendly 58:6 usually 115:24 utilized 25:21 V vacancies 25:1,3 25:8,18 26:23 26:24 27:5 46:3 61:16,23 62:5 62:15,17,20,21 63:10,11,16,17 64:5 65:1,5 69:9 69:13 75:8 102:22 103:13 118:15,17,19 119:10 vacancy 27:10 43:6 104:8 vacant 43:10 59:21 61:2 68:13 70:2,6,8 vacation 105:21 106:3 valid 104:13 value 4:1,7 7:22 valued 13:17 varies 39:14 various 12:13 100:16 vehicle 23:21 vendor 125:23 126:15,17 ventilate 110:23 verb 139:5 versus 16:19 49:23 50:3 videotapes 93:16 view 37:18 virtually 93:15 virtue 16:16 vision 129:15,24 void 41:24 42:8 voucher 23:20 vouchers 18:22	vo-tech 49:5 50:4 W Wage 7:16 13:20 wait 19:2 64:3 65:8,21 103:14 104:11 106:13 137:8 waiting 18:11 65:19 want 22:20 33:10 37:15 44:21 49:12,21,24 50:7 61:15 64:14 68:10 83:4 84:23 85:8 101:14 103:14 107:12 108:8 113:12 123:4 142:7 wanted 44:5 56:7 83:16 125:16 133:20 wants 123:8 wash 80:3 wasn't 76:18 96:3 water 108:20,22 110:6,15,18,20 111:1 way 16:12,12 21:13 36:1 46:16 56:8 57:22 58:17 89:22 91:23 119:14 125:13 125:19 136:1 137:12 139:1 140:1 ways 15:19 18:16 58:15 59:15 77:18 124:7 wearing 113:9 Wednesday 1:6 week 79:4 weeks 14:8 46:11 welcome 27:19 53:20 61:13	70:23 85:18 92:15 well-being 88:15 went 22:17 52:17 76:19 138:12 weren't 76:8 80:5 Westphal 56:4 we'll 17:16,17 18:13 19:24 20:4 62:6 63:9 113:6 118:23 we're 16:3 17:13 18:19,22 21:6,8 22:19 26:19 32:2,4,13,19,21 32:22 35:18 36:5,13,16 41:23 49:13 57:17 59:2 60:4 60:4,9,14 62:14 64:10,13,22,24 65:7,19,20 67:8 67:13 69:8,16 75:21 82:14,18 83:17 85:2 89:24 91:18,24 93:22 94:2 118:6,13 123:6 123:23,24 124:7 124:8,11,16 125:17 129:7 132:12 136:23 137:19 139:11 141:16,20 we've 15:17,22 25:17,17 26:23 26:24 33:10 35:14 46:10 57:10 66:22 73:17 88:21 89:18 106:15 121:20 135:4 136:2 139:12 140:1 141:7,17 willing 124:19 wise 137:2 woman 130:6
---	---	--	---	--

women 13:7 26:2 53:6 69:1 129:14 word 66:21 words 101:16 119:15 139:10 work 18:13 57:5 60:9 80:21 85:3 103:8 128:20 worked 12:11 56:4 working 11:2,14 57:17 60:10 69:17 83:22 131:3 works 16:18 19:6 21:13 68:20 worrisome 62:10 worry 123:19 135:20 wouldn't 77:19 80:2,6 84:22 106:4,24 122:16 would've 80:7 writing 103:22 written 103:15,20 104:1,4 107:19 107:23 116:12 116:13 117:8 wrong 44:16 101:20 140:24	years 4:6 6:6,9 7:20 8:20 13:14 15:23 33:11 34:1,19 36:3 45:21,22 54:12 54:12,14 85:24 88:22 114:16,18 125:14 141:22 year's 10:24 young 49:8,23 50:6 younger 136:17 youth 49:16	83:15 100:20,22 11th 92:19 11:00 1:6 12 13:23 12:24 142:22 120338 1:17 2:4 2:12 120339 1:17 2:4 2:21 120651 1:17 2:4 3:5 130141 1:17 2:5 3:16 130142 1:17 2:5 4:4 130150 1:18 2:5 4:23 130163 1:18 2:5 5:17 130178 1:18 2:5 6:7 130179 1:18 2:6 6:11 130180 1:18 2:6 6:14 130181 1:18 2:6 6:17 130182 1:18,18 2:6 7:4 130183 1:18 2:6 7:13 130190 1:19 2:7 8:16 130254 1:18 2:7 7:18 14 14:2 26:17 65:10,11 82:1 91:8 121:20,23 121:24 122:4 14th 92:22,23 14.81 13:24 15 13:16 14:3 18:9 1563-A 9:6 160 11:17 19 2:22 5:18 19-1300 3:7 4:11	5:5,21 6:19 8:3 19-1307 2:13 19-1500 7:15 19-1800 4:15 5:9 6:19 7:6 8:7 19-1806 7:8 19-2900 3:18 19-2900A 2:24 19.6 13:13 1992 9:5	84:17 118:23 119:3 32 10:24 70:1,1 118:19,19 119:4 35 10:15 376,924 28:12 38 11:8,9
	Z		2	4
	zero 28:22		2 47:7 2007 29:21 32:15 34:21 93:13 2008 86:4 2010 86:11,12 2012 10:20 12:6 92:19,20 2013 1:6 8:23 11:11,18 12:8 2014 4:10 5:4 6:13,16 8:2,21 10:4 2014-2019 6:10 2018 8:21 2035 90:5 21 12:7 21st 13:19 22 10:23 22,135 12:15 231,000 23:1 24:11 231,520 11:20 24 1:6 12:10 24th 102:6 106:23 139:21 25 10:22 13:6 122:4 25th 102:6 28 12:16 29th 142:15	4 47:8 40 13:2 61:23 67:8 400 1:5 10:10
	\$			5
\$100,000 10:17 \$157 83:16 \$2.5 82:20 \$219,152,358 10:6 \$3 124:14 \$3.4 13:18 \$3.6 82:14 \$3.8 120:8,9,13,15 120:19 125:18 128:3 \$300,000 49:2 \$35 127:4 128:2 \$4 10:12 \$4,731,000 10:9 \$5 82:18,20,22 83:18 \$560,000 10:15 \$7 74:1 \$7,200,000 76:20 77:23 \$7.2 77:12 78:22 82:15,19,23 \$71,000 10:18 \$8 74:1				5 47:8 5,000 84:13 50 67:9 81:8,20 82:16,17,19 103:6 53 111:13 54 14:21 58 111:14
Y	1		3	6
yeah 108:10 115:20 117:21 119:21 year 4:10 5:4 6:16 8:2,23 10:4,20 13:11,18,23 14:2 26:16 27:1 65:9 80:13,16 84:18 91:9 120:12 121:21 121:22 122:1,1 122:3,4 125:15 126:5,22 127:4 135:15 140:11	1 5:4 10:14 12:18 47:6,7 10:00 142:15 100 79:18,23 80:1	15 13:16 14:3 18:9 1563-A 9:6 160 11:17 19 2:22 5:18 19-1300 3:7 4:11	3 22:24 47:7 3rd 9:5 12:6 30 13:3 300 10:10 81:15	6 12:18 60 13:1 600 119:1,2 65 12:17 66 15:7 19:20 6601 51:18 68 15:3
				7
				7 12:21 70 13:3 700 119:2 74 15:4 75 11:21 23:3 78's 44:5
				8
				80 16:9,10 25:23
				9
				90 14:24 20:16 93 12:20 970 33:2