

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
November 23, 2020

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
COMMITTEE ON LABOR AND CIVIL SERVICE

Virtual, City Hall
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania
Monday, November 23, 2020
1:01 p.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCILWOMAN CHERELLE L. PARKER - CHAIR
COUNCILMAN BRIAN O'NEILL - VICE
COUNCILMAN ALLAN DOMB
COUNCILWOMAN KATHERINE GILMORE RICHARDSON
COUNCILMAN DEREK S. GREEN
COUNCILWOMAN HELEN GYM

ALSO PRESENT:

COUNCILMAN BOBBY HENON

BILLS: 200380

1 - - -

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you. I
3 understand the state law currently requires that
4 the following announcement be made at the
5 beginning of every remote Public Hearing as
6 follows.

7 Due to the current public health
8 emergency, City Council committees are currently
9 meeting remotely. We are using Microsoft Teams
10 to make these remote hearings possible.
11 Instructions for how the public may view and
12 offer public testimony at public hearings of
13 Council committees are included in the Public
14 Hearing Notices that are published in the Daily
15 News, Inquirer and the Legal Intelligencier
16 prior to the hearings and can also be found on
17 Phlcouncil.com.

18 I now note that the hour has come.

19 Rachel, will you please call the roll to
20 take attendance. Members that are in
21 attendance, will you please indicate that you
22 are present when your name is called. Also,
23 please say a few brief words, Members, when
24 responding so that your image will be displayed
25 on the screen when you speak.

1 THE CLERK: Councilmember Allan Domb?

2 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Good afternoon,
3 Majority Leader. Good afternoon, Colleagues.
4 Hello, everybody.

5 THE CLERK: Councilmember Brian O'Neill?

6 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Good afternoon,
7 everyone.

8 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Hello, Brian.

9 THE CLERK: Councilmember Derek Green?

10 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Good afternoon.
11 Pleasure to be here for today's hearing. Look
12 forward -- looking forward to the conversation.

13 THE CLERK: Councilmember Helen Gym?

14 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Good afternoon, Madam
15 Chair. Good morning, Colleagues. And good
16 afternoon to the viewing public.

17 THE CLERK: Councilmember Katherine
18 Gilmore Richardson?

19 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Good
20 afternoon, Madam Chair and Colleagues.

21 Thank you so much.

22 THE CLERK: And Councilmember Bobby
23 Henon?

24 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you,
25 Chairperson Parker. I appreciate it. And thank

1 you for you all being here today.

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you. A
3 quorum of the Committee is present. And this
4 Hearing now is formally called to order.

5 This is the Public Hearing of the
6 Committee on Labor and Civil Service on Bill No.
7 200380.

8 Rachel, will you please read the title
9 of the bill?

10 THE CLERK: 200380: An Ordinance
11 amending Chapter 22-800, entitled "Purchase of
12 Credited Service," of Title 22 of The
13 Philadelphia Code, entitled "Public Employees
14 Retirement Code," to allow certain employees to
15 purchase credited service for prior military
16 service without the payment of certain interest
17 for a certain time period and to make technical
18 amendments, all under certain terms and
19 conditions.

20 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Before we begin to
21 hear testimony from the witnesses we have for
22 today, everyone who has been invited to the
23 Public Meeting to testify should be aware that
24 this Public Hearing is being recorded. Because
25 the hearing is public, participants and viewers

1 have no reasonable expectation of privacy. By
2 continuing to be in the meeting, you are
3 consenting to being recorded.

4 Additionally, prior to recognizing
5 Members for the questions or comments they have
6 for witnesses, I will note for the record at
7 this time, that we will use the Chat feature
8 available in Microsoft Teams to allow Members to
9 signify that they wish to be recognized. In
10 order to comply with the Sunshine Act, the Chat
11 feature must only be used for this purpose.

12 And before I ask Rachel to call the
13 first panel for Bill No. 200380, I would like to
14 acknowledge Councilman Henon for some opening
15 comments as the Bill's sponsor.

16 Councilman Henon.

17 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you, Majority
18 Leader Parker. And good afternoon, Chairperson
19 Parker and Members of the Labor and Civil
20 Service Committee. I do appreciate the time to
21 make a brief statement on Bill No. 200380.

22 I've spoken with Mr. Dubow and
23 Mr. Coughlin who you will hear testimony from
24 shortly at length. And I am aware of the
25 challenges associated with balancing the two

1 policy interests. One, enhancing benefits; and
2 two, increasing the Pension Fund systems funding
3 levels. Generally speaking, when we improve or
4 enhance benefits, we move further away from a
5 fully-funded pension system, you are aware --
6 well aware of. And I want to commend the
7 Pension Board and Mr. Dubow for their work and
8 their leadership with regards to funding our
9 pension system.

10 That said, allowing service members to
11 buy their years of service without interest
12 isn't a new concept. We offered this benefit in
13 1999. City -- only 107 City employees took
14 advantage of the opportunity at that time.

15 You will hear from Mr. Coughlin that it
16 is possible that offering this opportunity now
17 may encourage and spark an interest of early
18 retirement dates and/or a member of our Fire
19 Department and other City departments to retire
20 as a result of transferring assets from our
21 Differed Income Fund to our Pension Fund, which
22 will move our Pension Fund closer to 100 percent
23 funded.

24 Secondly, I want to address something
25 that you will hear in Mr. Dubow's testimony. He

1 states that he believes that the benefits for
2 representing employees should be bargaining for.
3 And in most cases, I agree. Steadfast -- I am a
4 steadfast advocate for preserving the sanctity
5 of collective bargaining process. And wherever
6 possible, I believe represented workers should
7 organize and use the power of the bargaining
8 progress -- process to accomplish their goals.

9 But I, also, believe that there are
10 certain benefits that we should offer regardless
11 of whether or not they are bargained. Military
12 service has historically been honored and
13 recognized and rewarded in the past. City
14 workers who serve and have served their country
15 in the military, made incredible sacrifices that
16 made it possible for us to sit here today
17 talking about their pension benefits. Allowing
18 them to buy their time interest free is just a
19 small token and appreciation of their service.

20 Although, I am not asking this Committee
21 to amend or move this Bill out of Committee
22 today, I am asking that the Administration and
23 the Pension Board, especially the Firefighters
24 and Mr. Coughlin here today, to evaluate the
25 legislation in detail and consider other ways to

1 support service members and the Fire Department
2 and across our City workforce.

3 So, Madam Chair, I thank you for your
4 time. And I thank you for this opportunity.

5 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you,
6 Councilman Henon for your comments.

7 Rachel, will you, please, call the first
8 panel we have to testify this afternoon on Bill
9 No. 200380.

10 THE CLERK: Rob Dubow and Brian
11 Coughlin.

12 (Panel appears via video.)

13 MR. DUBOW: Good afternoon. Which one
14 of us would you prefer go first?

15 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: One second. We
16 have a new dog. And we have to get him outside.
17 So this is -- this is what happens virtually.
18 We are training him with the bathroom,
19 Councilman Domb.

20 One second, please.

21 Okay. Do I see -- are both of you on
22 now? Rob, I see you.

23 MR. COUGHLIN: Yes, Councilwoman. I'm
24 on, too. Brian Coughlin here.

25 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay, Brian.

1 Thank you so much. Good afternoon.

2 Rob, if you can just open. And then,
3 Brian, if you can follow Rob, that would be
4 great.

5 MR. DUBOW: Okay. Good afternoon, Chair
6 Parker and Members of the Committee. I'm Rob
7 Dubow. I serve as Finance Director. And I am
8 here to testify against Bill No. 200380.

9 The Bill would allow employees of the
10 Fire Department to purchase prior military
11 service to count towards their pension
12 calculation without paying the interest that's
13 normally required to make such a purchase. For
14 reasons I will explain in testimony, the
15 Administration opposes the Bill.

16 As you know, working with Unions,
17 Pension Board, Council, State Legislature, the
18 Administration has crafted a plan, would take
19 the pension from its current status at slightly
20 under 50 percent funded to over 80 percent
21 funded within the next decade. The plans
22 required shared sacrifice and contributions from
23 Union members who will see higher contributions,
24 and for new non-uniformed employees in a
25 structured benefits plan.

1 It's also required more from other
2 taxpayers as the City contribution has
3 increased, including through dedicating a
4 portion of sales tax revenues. The Pension
5 Board has also played a key role by improving
6 investment returns while cutting the costs of
7 those investments by millions of dollars. In
8 addition, the Board has lowered the risk of the
9 fund investments by doing things like
10 eliminating hedge funds from its holdings.

11 All that shared work has led to slow but
12 steady increases in the Pension Fund's funded
13 percent and a sustainable path to increased
14 funding that the Pew Foundation said made the
15 City's pension system much more likely than
16 other City's pension systems to continue to
17 increase its funded percent regardless of market
18 conditions. That hard work and the progress
19 it's created lead us to oppose any steps that we
20 think would move the Pension Fund in a different
21 direction by enhancing benefits.

22 This Bill would take a step in the wrong
23 direction for the Pension Fund because it would
24 mean the fund would be giving up the interest
25 that it typically receives when employees buy

1 back military time. The Administration also
2 believes the changes in benefits for represented
3 employees would be more appropriately addressed
4 through the Collective Bargaining process.

5 Finally, we believe that before any
6 action is taken on the Bill, an actuarial
7 analysis should be performed and its potential
8 cost to the Pension Fund.

9 And I should also add that I have talked
10 to the sponsor and to Mr. Coughlin. And we have
11 all agreed that we should continue to work to
12 see whether there are ways to get at the intent
13 at the Bill if it's not this exact formation.

14 So, thank you for the consideration and
15 the opportunity to testify. And I'm happy to
16 answer any questions you may have.

17 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you, Rob,
18 for your testimony.

19 Brian, are you there?

20 MR. COUGHLIN: Yes, Councilwoman, I am.

21 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay. Thank you.
22 I can see you now, Brian. It's different. I am
23 hearing your voice and we talking, but I
24 couldn't see you.

25 MR. COUGHLIN: There you go.

1 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: So, Brian, state
2 your name for the record. And please, proceed
3 with your testimony.

4 MR. COUGHLIN: Okay. Thank you. And
5 thank you, Rob.

6 My name is Brian Coughlin. I'm an
7 elected employee representative to the Board of
8 Pensions and Retirement. I've been, you know,
9 proudly serving in that role for the past six
10 years. Like Rob mentioned, since my time
11 started there, we have worked tirelessly
12 together with the other trustees, with the Chair
13 to reduce the costs, which were pretty
14 significant when I got there, that we were
15 paying.

16 We improved and stabilized the
17 investment performance. That is absolutely
18 true. And we have increased the funding level,
19 both from contributions -- increased
20 contributions from the City and the employees.
21 We were hit in our last contract with an
22 increase in our contribution with no increase in
23 benefit. I want to make that clear.

24 I believe as trustees of the plan, we
25 are entrusted and actually expected by all City

1 employees and taxpayers alike to constantly seek
2 ways to improve the performance and lower the
3 overall cost to the taxpayers. I don't think
4 anyone on this call would disagree with that.

5 I am presenting today to request that
6 eligible employees be given an opportunity to
7 purchase their prior military service without
8 interest. I can summarize over the next few
9 minutes why I believe this makes sense and how
10 it actually reduces the cost to the City in the
11 long term.

12 The one key point that I disagree with
13 Mr. Dubow, there is an assumption made that this
14 will cost the pension system, this will hurt the
15 funding level. And there's an assumption made
16 that this is a cost, not a benefit. We have
17 never had an actuary look at that. I think
18 that's the key here, is that there are ways to
19 get things done. I am going to explain that.

20 But I really disagree that we assume
21 this is a cost. I don't like that. I think we
22 have to assume that this is a different way of
23 looking at things.

24 You know, in the past, the City has
25 offered tax amnesty. And it's worked pretty

1 well, right? We have gotten revenue streams in
2 the door by thinking differently. So, that's
3 what I'm asking for today is that we actually
4 look at this rather than just assume that it's a
5 cost.

6 So, I am going to take a quick step to
7 explain pension. I think pension can be a very
8 confusing topic for a lot of people. So, I just
9 want to take a couple minutes to explain that.

10 The normal cost of the pension plan to
11 the City is actually very low when you compare
12 it to what they are actually paying. The normal
13 cost for 2021 is projected to be just over a
14 hundred million dollars, where the amortized
15 payment is over 600 million. That's the City
16 paying for previous underfunding many, many
17 years ago. And to Mr. Dubow's credit, he has
18 addressed it nicely in recent years. But the
19 bulk of the payment is for amortization, not for
20 the normal cost of pension.

21 So that being said, the goal is to get
22 the fund to 100 percent funded as fast as
23 possible. When you have a 100 percent funded
24 pension fund, your amortization cost is zero.
25 So, you are truly paying the normal cost year by

1 year. Which in some of the slides I showed you,
2 the cost drops from 700 million a year down to
3 about 100 million. It's a significant savings
4 when you get to the 100 percent funded.

5 So to understand how do we fund our
6 pension system, well, there are three sources of
7 income. There is the employee contributions.
8 That's what we as employees pay out of each
9 paycheck. There are the employer, which is the
10 City's cost. I just spoke about that. And in a
11 properly funded pension fund, the biggest source
12 should be your investment return.

13 Our current budgeted rate of return is
14 7.55 percent. So, you can see where if we were
15 fully funded, that investment return would be
16 providing significantly more income to the fund
17 than the employer or the employees. So, we
18 should be working towards getting to 100 percent
19 funded as fast as we can.

20 So, the point of this is quite simple.
21 Right now Nationwide is a third-party
22 administrator that we hired to manage our
23 deferred comp, our 457 Plan. They do a great
24 job. And currently, the assets under management
25 that are all of -- the employees own these

1 assets. A hundred percent is just about
2 \$3 billion. That's about half of what we have
3 in our Pension Fund. So, there is a significant
4 amount of assets in deferred comp.

5 The goal of my -- my ask today, why
6 wouldn't we want to transfer those assets across
7 the floor to the Pension Fund? Why are we
8 letting a private contractor -- and that's their
9 job. There is no fault of theirs, but they make
10 money on that \$3 billion. Why, when we are 50
11 percent underfunded, wouldn't we look at ways to
12 transfer that money across the floor into our
13 Pension Fund? And therefore, we can make the
14 7.55 percent. We can reduce the City's overall
15 normal cost going forward. And there is other
16 ways we are going to save money. And I will get
17 to that in just a minute.

18 So in the end, that's the ask here.
19 Because you can pay for this military buyback
20 with deferred comp assets. It's considered a
21 rollover. There is no taxable event for the
22 employee. So, we assume most employees in this
23 day and age who have healthy deferred comp
24 accounts, are going to transfer the money from
25 Nationwide to the City of Philadelphia Pension

1 Fund. So that -- that's, you know, that's where
2 I consider this a big win.

3 Mr. Dubow talked about this or -- I'm
4 sorry, I think Councilman Henon. We've done
5 this before in 1999. Only 107 City employees
6 took advantage of this. Now back in 1999,
7 deferred comp was a very new concept. The
8 account balances were just low. So, I think
9 that was a big deterrent. You really had to
10 reach into your own pocket, which is a tough
11 thing for City employees to do. We don't make a
12 lot of money, right? Now with the deferred comp
13 assets being where they are, I think we would
14 see an increase usage if we were to offer a
15 benefit like this in some form.

16 I, also, believe strongly -- and this is
17 where I think -- and I will stress "I think."
18 This is where I want to take an actuary and took
19 a good, hard look. I have to believe the City's
20 finances are very strange right now as is most
21 of the country and probably the world for
22 obvious reasons, right? And that is going to
23 lead to some tough decisions not too far down
24 the road. And I don't want to get into that
25 today, but it's going to be tough.

1 If we can motivate employees through a
2 plan like this to possibly retire early and
3 cover some of our losses to attrition, I think
4 that would make more sense. And I certainly
5 think that as City Council representatives, you
6 would maybe want to do that versus layoffs,
7 furloughs, other things we have done in the past
8 to make up for budget shortfalls.

9 So, any newly hired employee today
10 City-wide gets hired under, for pension reasons,
11 under what we call Plan 16 which came about in
12 2016. They are much higher contribution rates.
13 For the Fire Department specifically, a new
14 employee pays 8 and a half percent contribution
15 rate under Plan 16. Anyone hired before that,
16 which is the bulk of our people we think would
17 take advantage of this, our older employees,
18 they are either paying 6 percent or
19 6.84 percent. That is over 2 percent less
20 towards their pension. That's a pretty big
21 savings if we can get the lesser contributing
22 employees off the payroll and replace them with
23 higher contributing employees.

24 So of course, newly hired employees earn
25 significantly less pay. We have longevity pay

1 in the Fire Department. And approximately every
2 five years, we get a bump in pay. Well, a
3 30-year employee is going to make a heck of a
4 lot more than a brand new employee even if they
5 are at the exact same rank. So, there is
6 certainly a cost savings to be looked at there.

7 Newly hired employees because of
8 contract changes over the years, they earn
9 significantly less lead balances. And by that,
10 I mean, their sick and their vacation time is
11 significantly less every month than what we are
12 paying some of the older employees. That will
13 provide pretty significant savings if we can
14 replace those employees. And we have to assume
15 that new employees, the average age would be
16 lower than the employees that would retire.

17 And there are a plethora of health plan
18 studies out there that show that once an
19 employee reaches the age of 55, they become very
20 expensive for our health plan, which is
21 self-funded by the City of Philadelphia. So,
22 direct savings by getting rid of those older
23 employees, more tenured employees and replacing
24 them with new employees.

25 You know, so in summary, I believe we

1 need to explore this concept to better determine
2 the potential costs and benefits to the
3 employees, the Pension Fund and the taxpayers.
4 In a time when the City finances, as I
5 mentioned, are most certainly under strain, I
6 strongly believe this could prove to be a cost
7 effective matter to motivate longer term
8 employees to consider retirement at an earlier
9 age and allow the City to recognize cost savings
10 for many, many years to come.

11 Thank you for your time. And I am
12 certainly open to any questions.

13 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you so much,
14 Rob and Brian, for your testimony.

15 Are there any questions from Members of
16 the Committee?

17 Councilman Henon.

18 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you,
19 Chairperson Parker. It's more of just a kind of
20 quick, you know, overall on the testimony that
21 we just heard.

22 Mr. Dubow, I think there are some
23 interesting points. One, I noted you're
24 protecting as -- as fiduciary responsibility our
25 Pension Fund. And we are, you know, on our way.

1 And we have done much, much better over -- over
2 the years that, you know, we are now than we
3 have over the years. Some interesting points
4 that were made, early retirement, all right,
5 reducing the cost of our fund and benefits as
6 opposed to layoffs or furloughs. I think that's
7 interesting. And these are some of the
8 takeaways which I hope that -- that you and
9 Mr. Coughlin can get together and discuss.

10 An actuary-ist. I don't believe that
11 that has been -- steps have been taken in the
12 past for that. And you know, when -- because
13 the conversation is now real. And you know,
14 other things that you can take a look at that as
15 the Bill is introduced, you know, the window of
16 opportunity is twelve months. It doesn't have
17 to be that long. Just like any amnesty programs
18 and the years of service, the buyback is ten
19 years. That, also, is and should be on the
20 table for conversation.

21 So when we have a workforce that is
22 aging and has a lot of years of service,
23 something like this, at least the conversations
24 and the steps forward could entice and
25 incentivize people for retirement, which will

1 also take a strain off our Pension Fund.

2 So, I guess that's more of a statement.

3 But I would like to ask Rob Dubow if he had
4 anything to add to that? Or if he agrees that,
5 you know, those several issues that were just
6 raised will be something that he's willing to
7 take a look at?

8 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. I think that what
9 Mr. Coughlin and I agree on is that the next
10 step would be to have an actuarial report to
11 look at what the impact of the program would be.
12 And I think that would probably help frame the
13 discussion going forward.

14 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you,
15 Councilperson.

16 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you,
17 Councilmember Henon.

18 Chair recognizes Councilmember Domb.

19 Domb, you on mute.

20 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Okay.

21 Can you hear me now?

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Yes. We can hear
23 you, Councilmember.

24 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Thank you, Chairperson
25 Parker for this hearing today. And thank you

1 everyone who has joined in. Please, Chairperson
2 Parker, thank Max for those comments earlier for
3 me, okay?

4 I think this is a good discussion to
5 have. In fact, it's like really an extension of
6 this morning which I spent listening to you,
7 Chairperson Parker, and other panelist talk
8 about retirement savings and just how important
9 it is to teach people how to save for retirement
10 and keep themselves out of trouble in the future
11 so they have really economic benefits as they
12 get older.

13 But making sure we do right by our City
14 employees is also something we need to
15 consistently be on top of. They put a lot of
16 hours in working for the City, so I am grateful
17 for any new ideas we can review in this body to
18 help out our City employees. I do think,
19 though, when we raise opportunities like this
20 bill does in Council and as we talked about
21 earlier, we have to do some due diligence and
22 fully understand the complete financial and
23 operational impact our decision has on the
24 system overall.

25 So with that, as this conversation

1 continues after today, I hope we will make an
2 effort to review the fiscal impact analysis of
3 these types of ideas before any votes or bargain
4 discussions occur. And I hope we can make that
5 a feature of all these discussions regarding
6 pension-related bills into the future.

7 Thank you very much, Chairperson Parker.
8 Thank you.

9 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you,
10 Councilmember Domb.

11 Are there any other questions from the
12 Members of the Committee?

13 Seeing none, let me just note for the
14 record, to Rob and to Brian and to Councilmember
15 Henon, thank you for your leadership and just
16 helping to generate the discussion. I, also,
17 appreciate you all. I mean, Brian, even in your
18 comments Councilman Henon, it's always music to
19 my ears when we affirm -- and Councilmember
20 Domb -- when we affirm when the City finally
21 gets it right, you know? And that we are moving
22 in the right direction.

23 You know, with just under 50 percent and
24 trying to figure out how we get to 80 percent
25 funded within the next decade. You know,

1 Councilmember Henon, when I was in Harrisburg
2 and Councilmember Domb, people would have
3 thought that that was just unbelievable. It was
4 impossible. But we put a lot of those
5 safeguards in place. A lot of those new
6 sustainable revenue generating forces that we
7 can contribute to the Pension Fund, so that we
8 can move in a direction of solvency.

9 And let's not forget the work of the
10 Board. And oh, God, I'm forgetting -- Fran
11 Bielli and his team and Rob, and some people who
12 are no longer here -- Charde and it's Matt -- I
13 mean, Matt Stitt. It's just been a whole team
14 of people working with the Brians of the world
15 and all of the collective bargaining units from
16 all of our labor unions that have helped us get
17 there.

18 So, Councilman Henon, I thank you for
19 your leadership and bringing this issue to the
20 forefront; and, Councilmember Domb, for your
21 echoing of the importance of us, you know,
22 knowing a thousand and 1 percent the fiscal
23 impact that any decision making that we are
24 going to consider in the future relative to our
25 Pension Fund, that we take that into

1 consideration.

2 So, I want to thank you all. And,
3 Brian/Rob, I don't know if you said it, but this
4 is my first time hearing you, Brian. I'm going
5 to have to call you and have some conversations
6 about pensions because I like the fact that you
7 like pensions. And they are not usually --

8 MR. COUGHLIN: I like pensions.

9 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: -- a topic people
10 like to talk about.

11 MR. COUGHLIN: I enjoy working with this
12 Board, so thank you.

13 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: All right. Thank
14 you so much. Let me get back here. Oh, gosh.

15 Where are we?

16 If there are no more questions for this
17 panel, Rachel, can you please call the next
18 panel scheduled to testify.

19 THE CLERK: There is no other panel
20 scheduled to testify.

21 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay. Give us
22 just thirty seconds here. Got to get back
23 there.

24 Okay. If there are no other comments or
25 no one else here scheduled to testify on this

1 bill, and due to the fact that the sponsor of
2 the bill -- Councilman Henon, I just want to
3 note for the record, that due to the fact that
4 the sponsor of the bill has agreed to hold the
5 Bill No. 200380 in Committee, this is actually
6 going to conclude the business of the Labor and
7 Civil Service Committee for today.

8 The Public Hearing is recessed to the
9 call of the Chair. And we want to thank all of
10 our colleagues for being here so much. And to
11 Rob and Brian, thank you, as well.

12 MR. COUGHLIN: Thank you very much.

13 MR. DUBOW: Thank you.

14 (At this time, the Public Hearing
15 adjourned at 1:29 p.m.)
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

I, hereby certify that the proceedings and evidence noted are contained fully and accurately in the stenographic notes taken by me in the foregoing matter, and that this is a correct transcript of the same.

ANGELA M. KING, RPR,
Court Reporter, Notary Public

(The foregoing certification of this transcript does not apply to any reproduction of the same by any means, unless under the direct control and/or supervision of the certifying reporter.)

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
November 23, 2020

Page 1

A	agrees 22:4	attendance	Bill's 5:15	certainly	collective 7:5	contract	3:1,5,9,13
absolutely	alike 13:1	2:20,21	billion 16:2	18:4 19:6	11:4 25:15	12:21 19:8	3:17,22
12:17	Allan 1:11	attrition 18:3	16:10	20:5,12	come 2:18	contractor	22:17,18,23
accomplish	3:1	available 5:8	bills 1:18	certification	20:10	16:8	24:10,14,19
7:8	allow 4:14	average	24:6	28:13	commend 6:6	contribute	25:1,2,20
account 17:8	5:8 9:9	19:15	Board 6:7	certify 28:3	comments	25:7	Councilper...
accounts	20:9	aware 4:23	7:23 9:17	certifying	5:5,15 8:6	contributing	22:15
16:24	allowing 6:10	5:24 6:5,6	10:5,8 12:7	28:19	23:2 24:18	18:21,23	Councilwo...
accurately	7:17	B	25:10 26:12	Chair 1:10	26:24	contribution	1:10,11,12
28:4	amend 7:21	back 11:1	Bobby 1:15	3:15,20 8:3	Committee	10:2 12:22	2:2 3:8,14
acknowledge	amending	17:6 26:14	3:22	9:5 12:12	1:2 4:3,6	18:12,14	3:19 4:2,20
5:14	4:11	26:22	body 23:17	22:18 27:9	5:20 7:20	contributions	8:5,15,23
Act 5:10	amendments	balances 17:8	brand 19:4	Chairperson	7:21 9:6	9:22,23	8:25 11:17
action 11:6	4:18	19:9	Brian 1:10	3:25 5:18	20:16 24:12	12:19,20	11:20,21
actuarial	amnesty	balancing	3:5,8 8:10	20:19 22:24	27:5,7	15:7	12:1 20:13
11:6 22:10	13:25 21:17	5:25	8:24,25 9:3	23:1,7 24:7	committees	control 28:17	22:16,22
actuary	amortization	bargain 24:3	11:19,22	challenges	2:8,13	conversation	24:9 26:9
13:17 17:18	14:19,24	bargained	12:1,6	5:25	comp 15:23	3:12 21:13	26:13,21
actuary-ist	amortized	7:11	20:14 24:14	changes 11:2	16:4,20,23	21:20 23:25	count 9:11
21:10	14:14	bargaining	24:17 26:4	19:8	17:7,12	conversatio...	country 7:14
add 11:9 22:4	amount 16:4	7:2,5,7 11:4	27:11	Chapter 4:11	compare	21:23 26:5	17:21
addition 10:8	analysis 11:7	25:15	Brian/Rob	Charde 25:12	14:11	correct 28:6	couple 14:9
Additionally	24:2	bathroom	26:3	Chat 5:7,10	complete	cost 11:8 13:3	course 18:24
5:4	and/or 6:18	8:18	Brians 25:14	CHERELLE	23:22	13:10,14,16	Court 28:11
address 6:24	28:18	beginning 2:5	brief 2:23	1:10	comply 5:10	13:21 14:5	cover 18:3
addressed	ANGELA	believe 7:6,9	5:21	City 1:1,5 2:8	concept 6:12	14:10,13,20	crafted 9:18
11:3 14:18	28:11	11:5 12:24	bringing	6:13,13,19	17:7 20:1	14:24,25	created 10:19
adjourned	announcem...	13:9 17:16	25:19	7:13 8:2	conclude	15:2,10	credit 14:17
27:15	2:4	17:19 19:25	budget 18:8	10:2 12:20	27:6	16:15 19:6	credited 4:12
Administra...	answer 11:16	20:6 21:10	budgeted	12:25 13:10	conditions	20:6,9 21:5	4:15
7:22 9:15	appears 8:12	believes 7:1	15:13	13:24 14:11	4:19 10:18	costs 10:6	current 2:7
9:18 11:1	apply 28:15	11:2	bulk 14:19	14:15 16:25	confusing	12:13 20:2	9:19 15:13
administra...	appreciate	benefit 6:12	18:16	17:5,11	14:8	Coughlin	currently 2:3
15:22	3:25 5:20	12:23 13:16	bump 19:2	18:5 19:21	consenting	5:23 6:15	2:8 15:24
advantage	24:17	17:15	business 27:6	20:4,9	5:3	7:24 8:11	cutting 10:6
6:14 17:6	appreciation	benefits 6:1,4	buy 6:11 7:18	23:13,16,18	consider 7:25	8:23,24	D
18:17	7:19	7:1,10,17	10:25	24:20	17:2 20:8	11:10,20,25	Daily 2:14
advocate 7:4	appropriat...	9:25 10:21	buyback	City's 10:15	25:24	12:4,6 21:9	dates 6:18
affirm 24:19	11:3	11:2 20:2	16:19 21:18	10:16 15:10	considerati...	22:9 26:8	day 16:23
24:20	approxima...	21:5 23:11	C	16:14 17:19	11:14 26:1	26:11 27:12	decade 9:21
afternoon 3:2	19:1	better 20:1	calculation	City-wide	considered	Council 1:1	24:25
3:3,6,10,14	asking 7:20	21:1	9:12	18:10	16:20	2:8,13 9:17	decision
3:16,20	7:22 14:3	Bielli 25:11	call 2:19 5:12	Civil 1:2 4:6	consistently	18:5 23:20	23:23 25:23
5:18 8:8,13	assets 6:20	big 17:2,9	8:7 13:4	5:19 27:7	23:15	Councilman	decisions
9:1,5	15:24 16:1	18:20	biggest 15:11	clear 12:23	constantly	1:10,11,12	17:23
age 16:23	16:4,6,20	bill 4:6,9 5:13	18:11 26:5	CLERK 3:1	13:1	1:15 3:2,6	dedicating
19:15,19	17:13	5:21 7:21	26:17 27:9	3:5,9,13,17	contained	3:10,24	10:3
20:9	associated	8:8 9:8,9,15	called 2:22	3:22 4:10	28:4	5:14,16,17	deferred
aging 21:22	5:25	10:22 11:6	4:4	8:10 26:19	continue	8:6,19 17:4	15:23 16:4
ago 14:17	assume 13:20	11:13 21:15	cases 7:3	closer 6:22	10:16 11:11	20:17,18	16:20,23
agree 7:3	13:22 14:4	23:20 27:1	certain 4:14	Code 4:13,14	continues	22:14,20,24	17:7,12
22:9	16:22 19:14	27:2,4,5	4:16,17,18	colleagues	24:1	24:18 25:18	Department
agreed 11:11	assumption		7:10	3:3,15,20	continuing	27:2	6:19 8:1
27:4	13:13,15			27:10	5:2	Councilme...	

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
November 23, 2020

Page 2

9:10 18:13 19:1 departments 6:19 Derek 1:12 3:9 detail 7:25 determine 20:1 deterrent 17:9 Differed 6:21 different 10:20 11:22 13:22 differently 14:2 diligence 23:21 direct 19:22 28:17 direction 10:21,23 24:22 25:8 Director 9:7 disagree 13:4 13:12,20 discuss 21:9 discussion 22:13 23:4 24:16 discussions 24:4,5 displayed 2:24 dog 8:16 doing 10:9 dollars 10:7 14:14 Domb 1:11 3:1,2 8:19 22:18,19,20 22:24 24:10 24:20 25:2 25:20 door 14:2 drops 15:2 Dubow 5:22 6:7 8:10,13 9:5,7 13:13 17:3 20:22 22:3,8 27:13 Dubow's 6:25	14:17 due 2:7 23:21 27:1,3 E E 28:1 earlier 20:8 23:2,21 early 6:17 18:2 21:4 earn 18:24 19:8 ears 24:19 echoing 25:21 economic 23:11 effective 20:7 effort 24:2 either 18:18 elected 12:7 eligible 13:6 eliminating 10:10 emergency 2:8 employee 12:7 15:7 16:22 18:9 18:14 19:3 19:4,19 employees 4:13,14 6:13 7:2 9:9,24 10:25 11:3 12:20 13:1 13:6 15:8 15:17,25 16:22 17:5 17:11 18:1 18:17,22,23 18:24 19:7 19:12,14,15 19:16,23,23 19:24 20:3 20:8 23:14 23:18 employer 15:9,17 encourage 6:17 enhance 6:4 enhancing	6:1 10:21 enjoy 26:11 entice 21:24 entitled 4:11 4:13 entrusted 12:25 especially 7:23 evaluate 7:24 event 16:21 everybody 3:4 evidence 28:4 exact 11:13 19:5 expectation 5:1 expected 12:25 expensive 19:20 explain 9:14 13:19 14:7 14:9 explore 20:1 extension 23:5 F F 28:1 fact 23:5 26:6 27:1,3 far 17:23 fast 14:22 15:19 fault 16:9 feature 5:7 5:11 24:5 fiduciary 20:24 figure 24:24 finally 11:5 24:20 Finance 9:7 finances 17:20 20:4 financial 23:22 Fire 6:18 8:1 9:10 18:13 19:1 Firefighters 7:23	first 5:13 8:7 8:14 26:4 fiscal 24:2 25:22 five 19:2 floor 16:7,12 follow 9:3 following 2:4 follows 2:6 forces 25:6 forefront 25:20 foregoing 28:5,13 forget 25:9 forgetting 25:10 form 17:15 formally 4:4 formation 11:13 forward 3:12 3:12 16:15 21:24 22:13 found 2:16 Foundation 10:14 frame 22:12 Fran 25:10 free 7:18 fully 15:15 23:22 28:4 fully-funded 6:5 fund 6:2,21 6:21,22 10:9,20,23 10:24 11:8 14:22,24 15:5,11,16 16:3,7,13 17:1 20:3 20:25 21:5 22:1 25:7 25:25 Fund's 10:12 funded 6:23 9:20,21 10:12,17 14:22,23 15:4,11,15 15:19 24:25 funding 6:2,8 10:14 12:18	13:15 funds 10:10 furloughs 18:7 21:6 further 6:4 future 23:10 24:6 25:24 G Generally 6:3 generate 24:16 generating 25:6 getting 15:18 19:22 Gilmore 1:11 3:18 Give 26:21 given 13:6 giving 10:24 go 8:14 11:25 goal 14:21 16:5 goals 7:8 God 25:10 going 13:19 14:6 16:15 16:16,24 17:22,25 19:3 22:13 25:24 26:4 27:6 good 3:2,3,6 3:10,14,15 3:15,19 5:18 8:13 9:1,5 17:19 23:4 gosh 26:14 gotten 14:1 grateful 23:16 great 9:4 15:23 Green 1:12 3:9,10 guess 22:2 Gym 1:12 3:13,14 H half 16:2 18:14	Hall 1:5 happens 8:17 happy 11:15 hard 10:18 17:19 Harrisburg 25:1 health 2:7 19:17,20 healthy 16:23 hear 4:21 5:23 6:15 6:25 22:21 22:22 heard 20:21 hearing 2:5 2:14 3:11 4:4,5,24,25 11:23 22:25 26:4 27:8 27:14 hearings 2:10 2:12,16 heck 19:3 hedge 10:10 Helen 1:12 3:13 Hello 3:4,8 help 22:12 23:18 helped 25:16 helping 24:16 Henon 1:15 3:23,24 5:14,16,17 8:6 17:4 20:17,18 22:14,17 24:15,18 25:1,18 27:2 higher 9:23 18:12,23 hired 15:22 18:9,10,15 18:24 19:7 historically 7:12 hit 12:21 hold 27:4 holdings 10:10 honored 7:12 hope 21:8	24:1,4 hour 2:18 hours 23:16 hundred 14:14 16:1 hurt 13:14 I ideas 23:17 24:3 image 2:24 impact 22:11 23:23 24:2 25:23 importance 25:21 important 23:8 impossible 25:4 improve 6:3 13:2 improved 12:16 improving 10:5 incentivize 21:25 included 2:13 including 10:3 income 6:21 15:7,16 increase 10:17 12:22 12:22 17:14 increased 10:3,13 12:18,19 increases 10:12 increasing 6:2 incredible 7:15 indicate 2:21 Inquirer 2:15 Instructions 2:11 Intelligencier 2:15 intent 11:12 interest 4:16 6:11,17	7:18 9:12 10:24 13:8 interesting 20:23 21:3 21:7 interests 6:1 introduced 21:15 investment 10:6 12:17 15:12,15 investments 10:7,9 invited 4:22 issue 25:19 issues 22:5 J job 15:24 16:9 joined 23:1 K Katherine 1:11 3:17 keep 23:10 key 10:5 13:12,18 kind 20:19 KING 28:11 know 9:16 12:8 13:24 17:1 19:25 20:20,25 21:2,12,13 21:15 22:5 24:21,23,25 25:21 26:3 knowing 25:22 L L 1:10 labor 1:2 4:6 5:19 25:16 27:6 law 2:3 layoffs 18:6 21:6 lead 10:19 17:23 19:9 Leader 3:3 5:18 leadership
--	---	--	--	---	---	---	---

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
November 23, 2020

Page 3

6:8 24:15 25:19 led 10:11 Legal 2:15 legislation 7:25 Legislature 9:17 length 5:24 lesser 18:21 let's 25:9 letting 16:8 level 12:18 13:15 levels 6:3 listening 23:6 long 13:11 21:17 longer 20:7 25:12 longevity 18:25 look 3:11 13:17 14:4 16:11 17:19 21:14 22:7 22:11 looked 19:6 looking 3:12 13:23 losses 18:3 lot 14:8 17:12 19:4 21:22 23:15 25:4 25:5 low 14:11 17:8 lower 13:2 19:16 lowered 10:8	Matt 25:12 25:13 matter 20:7 28:6 Max 23:2 mean 10:24 19:10 24:17 25:13 means 28:16 meeting 2:9 4:23 5:2 member 6:18 members 2:20,23 5:5 5:8,19 6:10 8:1 9:6,23 20:15 24:12 mentioned 12:10 20:5 Microsoft 2:9 5:8 military 4:15 7:11,15 9:10 11:1 13:7 16:19 million 14:14 14:15 15:2 15:3 millions 10:7 minute 16:17 minutes 13:9 14:9 Monday 1:6 money 16:10 16:12,16,24 17:12 month 19:11 months 21:16 morning 3:15 23:6 motivate 18:1 20:7 move 6:4,22 7:21 10:20 25:8 moving 24:21 music 24:18 mute 22:19	15:21 16:25 need 20:1 23:14 never 13:17 new 6:12 8:16 9:24 17:7 18:13 19:4,15,24 23:17 25:5 newly 18:9 18:24 19:7 News 2:15 nicely 14:18 non-unifor... 9:24 normal 14:10 14:12,20,25 16:15 normally 9:13 Notary 28:11 note 2:18 5:6 24:13 27:3 noted 20:23 28:4 notes 28:5 Notices 2:14 November 1:6	20:12 opening 5:14 operational 23:23 opportunities 23:19 opportunity 6:14,16 8:4 11:15 13:6 21:16 oppose 10:19 opposed 21:6 opposes 9:15 order 4:4 5:10 Ordinance 4:10 organize 7:7 outside 8:16 overall 13:3 16:14 20:20 23:24	14:15,19 payroll 18:22 pays 18:14 Pennsylvania 1:5 pension 6:2,5 6:7,9,21,22 7:17,23 9:11,17,19 10:4,12,15 10:16,20,23 11:8 13:14 14:7,7,10 14:20,24 15:6,11 16:3,7,13 16:25 18:10 18:20 20:3 20:25 22:1 25:7,25 pension-rel... 24:6 pensions 12:8 26:6,7,8 people 14:8 18:16 21:25 23:9 25:2 25:11,14 26:9 percent 6:22 9:20,20 10:13,17 14:22,23 15:4,14,18 16:1,11,14 18:14,18,19 18:19 24:23 24:24 25:22 performance 12:17 13:2 performed 11:7 period 4:17 Pew 10:14 Philadelphia 1:1,5 4:13 16:25 19:21 Phlcouncil.... 2:17 place 25:5 plan 9:18,25 12:24 14:10 15:23 18:2 18:11,15	19:17,20 plans 9:21 played 10:5 please 2:19 2:21,23 4:8 8:7,20 12:2 23:1 26:17 Pleasure 3:11 plethora 19:17 pocket 17:10 point 13:12 15:20 points 20:23 21:3 policy 6:1 portion 10:4 possible 2:10 6:16 7:6,16 14:23 possibly 18:2 potential 11:7 20:2 power 7:7 prefer 8:14 present 1:9 1:14 2:22 4:3 presenting 13:5 preserving 7:4 pretty 12:13 13:25 18:20 19:13 previous 14:16 prior 2:16 4:15 5:4 9:10 13:7 privacy 5:1 private 16:8 probably 17:21 22:12 proceed 12:2 proceedings 28:3 process 7:5,8 11:4 program 22:11 programs 21:17 progress 7:8	10:18 projected 14:13 properly 15:11 protecting 20:24 proudly 12:9 prove 20:6 provide 19:13 providing 15:16 public 2:5,7 2:11,12,12 2:13 3:16 4:5,13,23 4:24,25 27:8,14 28:11 published 2:14 purchase 4:11,15 9:10,13 13:7 purpose 5:11 put 23:15 25:4	read 4:8 real 21:13 really 13:20 17:9 23:5 23:11 reasonable 5:1 reasons 9:14 17:22 18:10 receives 10:25 recessed 27:8 recognize 20:9 recognized 5:9 7:13 recognizes 22:18 recognizing 5:4 record 5:6 12:2 24:14 27:3 recorded 4:24 5:3 reduce 12:13 16:14 reduces 13:10 reducing 21:5 regarding 24:5 regardless 7:10 10:17 regards 6:8 relative 25:24 remote 2:5 2:10 remotely 2:9 replace 18:22 19:14 replacing 19:23 report 22:10 reporter 28:11,19 representat... 12:7 representat... 18:5 represented 7:6 11:2 representing
M 28:11 Madam 3:14 3:20 8:3 Majority 3:3 5:17 making 23:13 25:23 manage 15:22 management 15:24 market 10:17	N 28:1 name 2:22 12:2,6 Nationwide	O 28:1 O'Neill 1:10 3:5,6 obvious 17:22 occur 24:4 offer 2:12 7:10 17:14 offered 6:12 13:25 offering 6:16 oh 25:10 26:14 okay 8:21,25 9:5 11:21 12:4 22:20 23:3 26:21 26:24 older 18:17 19:12,22 23:12 once 19:18 open 9:2	P p.m 1:6 27:15 panel 5:13 8:8,12 26:17,18,19 panelist 23:7 Parker 1:10 2:2 3:8,25 4:2,20 5:18 5:19 8:5,15 8:25 9:6 11:17,21 12:1 20:13 20:19 22:16 22:22,25 23:2,7 24:7 24:9 26:9 26:13,21 participants 4:25 path 10:13 pay 15:8 16:19 18:25 18:25 19:2 paycheck 15:9 paying 9:12 12:15 14:12 14:16,25 18:18 19:12 payment 4:16	period 4:17 Pew 10:14 Philadelphia 1:1,5 4:13 16:25 19:21 Phlcouncil.... 2:17 place 25:5 plan 9:18,25 12:24 14:10 15:23 18:2 18:11,15	Q questions 5:5 11:16 20:12 20:15 24:11 26:16 quick 14:6 20:20 quite 15:20 quorum 4:3	R 28:1 Rachel 2:19 4:8 5:12 8:7 26:17 raise 23:19 raised 22:6 rank 19:5 rate 15:13 18:15 rates 18:12 reach 17:10 reaches 19:19	

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
November 23, 2020

Page 4

7:2 reproduction 28:15 request 13:5 required 9:13 9:22 10:1 requires 2:3 responding 2:24 responsibili... 20:24 result 6:20 retire 6:19 18:2 19:16 retirement 4:14 6:18 12:8 20:8 21:4,25 23:8,9 return 15:12 15:13,15 returns 10:6 revenue 14:1 25:6 revenues 10:4 review 23:17 24:2 rewarded 7:13 Richardson 1:11 3:18 3:19 rid 19:22 right 14:1 15:21 17:12 17:20,22 21:4 23:13 24:21,22 26:13 risk 10:8 road 17:24 Rob 8:10,22 9:2,3,6 11:17 12:5 12:10 20:14 22:3 24:14 25:11 27:11 role 10:5 12:9 roll 2:19 rollover 16:21 RPR 28:11	S S 1:12 sacrifice 9:22 sacrifices 7:15 safeguards 25:5 sales 10:4 sanctity 7:4 save 16:16 23:9 savings 15:3 18:21 19:6 19:13,22 20:9 23:8 scheduled 26:18,20,25 screen 2:25 second 8:15 8:20 Secondly 6:24 seconds 26:22 see 8:21,22 9:23 11:12 11:22,24 15:14 17:14 Seeing 24:13 seek 13:1 self-funded 19:21 sense 13:9 18:4 serve 7:14 9:7 served 7:14 service 1:2 4:6,12,15 4:16 5:20 6:10,11 7:12,19 8:1 9:11 13:7 21:18,22 27:7 serving 12:9 shared 9:22 10:11 shortfalls 18:8 shortly 5:24 show 19:18 showed 15:1 sick 19:10	significant 12:14 15:3 16:3 19:13 significantly 15:16 18:25 19:9,11 signify 5:9 simple 15:20 sit 7:16 six 12:9 slides 15:1 slightly 9:19 slow 10:11 small 7:19 solvency 25:8 sorry 17:4 source 15:11 sources 15:6 spark 6:17 speak 2:25 speaking 6:3 specifically 18:13 spent 23:6 spoke 15:10 spoken 5:22 sponsor 5:15 11:10 27:1 27:4 stabilized 12:16 started 12:11 state 2:3 9:17 12:1 statement 5:21 22:2 states 7:1 status 9:19 steadfast 7:3 7:4 steady 10:12 stenographic 28:5 step 10:22 14:6 22:10 steps 10:19 21:11,24 Stitt 25:13 strain 20:5 22:1 strange 17:20 streams 14:1 stress 17:17 strongly	17:16 20:6 structured 9:25 studies 19:18 summarize 13:8 summary 19:25 Sunshine 5:10 supervision 28:18 support 8:1 sure 23:13 sustainable 10:13 25:6 system 6:5,9 10:15 13:14 15:6 23:24 systems 6:2 10:16 T T 28:1,1 table 21:20 take 2:20 9:18 10:22 14:6,9 17:18 18:17 21:14 22:1 22:7 25:25 takeaways 21:8 taken 11:6 21:11 28:5 talk 23:7 26:10 talked 11:9 17:3 23:20 talking 7:17 11:23 tax 10:4 13:25 taxable 16:21 taxpayers 10:2 13:1,3 20:3 teach 23:9 team 25:11 25:13 Teams 2:9 5:8 technical 4:17	ten 21:18 tenured 19:23 term 13:11 20:7 terms 4:18 testify 4:23 8:8 9:8 11:15 26:18 26:20,25 testimony 2:12 4:21 5:23 6:25 9:14 11:18 12:3 20:14 20:20 thank 2:2 3:21,24,25 4:2 5:17 8:3,4,5 9:1 11:14,17,21 12:4,5 20:11,13,18 22:14,16,24 22:25 23:2 24:7,8,9,15 25:18 26:2 26:12,13 27:9,11,12 27:13 theirs 16:9 thing 17:11 things 10:9 13:19,23 18:7 21:14 think 10:20 13:3,17,21 14:7 17:4,8 17:13,17,17 18:3,5,16 20:22 21:6 22:8,12 23:4,18 thinking 14:2 third-party 15:21 thirty 26:22 thought 25:3 thousand 25:22 three 15:6 time 4:17 5:7 5:20 6:14 7:18 8:4	11:1 12:10 19:10 20:4 20:11 26:4 27:14 tirelessly 12:11 title 4:8,12 today 4:1,22 7:16,22,24 13:5 14:3 16:5 17:25 18:9 22:25 24:1 27:7 today's 3:11 token 7:19 top 23:15 topic 14:8 26:9 tough 17:10 17:23,25 training 8:18 transcript 28:6,14 transfer 16:6 16:12,24 transferring 6:20 trouble 23:10 true 12:18 truly 14:25 trustees 12:12,24 trying 24:24 twelve 21:16 two 5:25 6:2 types 24:3 typically 10:25 U unbelievable 25:3 underfunded 16:11 underfundi... 14:16 understand 2:3 15:5 23:22 Union 9:23 unions 9:16 25:16 units 25:15 usage 17:14	use 5:7 7:7 usually 26:7 V vacation 19:10 versus 18:6 VICE 1:10 video 8:12 view 2:11 viewers 4:25 viewing 3:16 Virtual 1:5 virtually 8:17 voice 11:23 votes 24:3 W want 6:6,24 12:23 14:9 16:6 17:18 17:24 18:6 26:2 27:2,9 way 13:22 20:25 ways 7:25 11:12 13:2 13:18 16:11 16:16 We've 17:4 willing 22:6 win 17:2 window 21:15 wish 5:9 witnesses 4:21 5:6 words 2:23 work 6:7 10:11,18 11:11 25:9 worked 12:11 13:25 workers 7:6 7:14 workforce 8:2 21:21 working 9:16 15:18 23:16 25:14 26:11 world 17:21 25:14 wouldn't 16:6,11	wrong 10:22 X Y Yeah 22:8 year 14:25 15:1,2 years 6:11 12:10 14:17 14:18 19:2 19:8 20:10 21:2,3,18 21:19,22 Z zero 14:24 0 1 1 25:22 1:01 1:6 1:29 27:15 100 6:22 14:22,23 15:3,4,18 107 6:13 17:5 16 18:11,15 1999 6:13 17:5,6 2 2 18:19 200380 1:18 4:7,10 5:13 5:21 8:9 9:8 27:5 2016 18:12 2020 1:6 2021 14:13 22 4:12 22-800 4:11 23 1:6 3 3 16:2,10 30-year 19:3 4 457 15:23 5 50 9:20 16:10
--	--	---	--	---	---	---	--

Committee on Labor and Civil Service
November 23, 2020

6 6 18:18 6.84 18:19 600 14:15							
7 7.55 15:14 16:14 700 15:2							
8 8 18:14 80 9:20 24:24							