

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

Room 400, City Hall
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania
Wednesday, October 18, 2023
10:20 a.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCIL PRESIDENT DARRELL L. CLARKE
COUNCILWOMAN KENDRA BROOKS
COUNCILMAN MICHAEL DRISCOLL
COUNCILWOMAN JAMIE GAUTHIER
COUNCILWOMAN KATHERINE GILMORE RICHARDSON
COUNCILMAN JIM HARRITY
COUNCILMAN CURTIS JONES, JR.
COUNCILWOMAN QUETCY LOZADA
COUNCILMAN BRIAN J. O'NEILL
COUNCILMAN ANTHONY PHILLIPS
COUNCILMAN MARK SQUILLA
COUNCILWOMAN SHARON VAUGHN

BILL 200253 - An ordinance amending Section
20-303 of The Philadelphia Code, entitled
"Salaries of Specified Officers," to establish
salaries based on an Annual Compensation Plan,
under certain terms and conditions.

- - -

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

3 Thank you very much, and good morning.

4 Before we begin the public hearing, I
5 want to make the following announcement:

6 Due to the continuing threat to
7 public health from COVID-19 and its
8 variants, City Council committees are
9 currently meeting remotely. We are using
10 Microsoft Teams to make these remote
11 hearings possible. Instructions for how
12 the public may view and offer public
13 testimony at public hearings of Council
14 committees are included in the public
15 hearing notices that are published in the
16 Daily News, Inquirer, and Legal
17 Intelligencer prior to the hearing, and
18 can also be found on PHLCouncil.com.

19 I now note that the hour has
20 come.

21 Mr. Christmas, will you please
22 call the roll to take attendance, and
23 members that are in attendance, please
24 indicate that you are present when your
25 name is called.

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 Mr. Christmas.
3 THE CLERK: Council Lady Bass.
4 (No response.)
5 THE CLERK: Council Lady
6 Brooks.
7 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: Present.
8 THE CLERK: Councilman
9 Driscoll.
10 COUNCILMAN DRISCOLL: Present.
11 THE CLERK: Council Lady
12 Gauthier.
13 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:
14 Present.
15 THE CLERK: Council Lady
16 Gilmore Richardson.
17 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Good
18 morning, Council President. Good
19 morning, colleagues. I am present.
20 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good
21 morning.
22 THE CLERK: Councilman Harrity.
23 COUNCILMAN HARRITY: I am
24 present and accounted for.
25 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 morning.
3 THE CLERK: Councilman Johnson.
4 (No response.)
5 THE CLERK: Councilman Jones.
6 COUNCILMAN JONES: Good
7 morning, Mr. President, colleagues. Go
8 Phillies.
9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good
10 morning.
11 THE CLERK: Council Lady
12 Lozada.
13 COUNCILWOMAN LOZADA: Good
14 morning, everyone. I'm present.
15 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good
16 morning.
17 THE CLERK: Councilman O'Neill.
18 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Good
19 morning, everyone.
20 THE CLERK: Councilman
21 Phillips.
22 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good
23 morning.
24 (No response.)
25 THE CLERK: Councilman Squilla.

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Good
3 morning, Council President and
4 colleagues. Present.

5 THE CLERK: Councilman Thomas.
6 (No response.)

7 THE CLERK: Council Lady
8 Vaughn.

9 COUNCILWOMAN VAUGHN: Good
10 morning, everyone. Happy Wednesday.

11 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good
12 morning.

13 THE CLERK: Council President
14 Clarke.

15 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: And
16 good morning to all.

17 Thank you. We've established a
18 quorum of the Committee. The hearing is
19 now called to order. This is the public
20 hearing of the Committee of the Whole
21 regarding Bill No. 200253.

22 Mr. Christmas, will you please
23 read the title of the bill.

24 (No response.)

25 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARK:

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 Mr. Christmas.

3 THE CLERK: Oh, yes, sir. I'm
4 here.

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
6 Please read the title of the bill.

7 THE CLERK: Bill No. 200253,
8 amending Section 20-303 of The
9 Philadelphia Code, entitled "Salaries of
10 Specified Officers," to establish
11 salaries based on an Annual Compensation
12 Plan, under certain terms and conditions.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
14 Thank you very much.

15 Before we begin to hear
16 testimony from the witnesses we have
17 today, everyone who has been invited to
18 the meeting to testify should be aware
19 that this public hearing is being
20 recorded. Because the hearing is public,
21 participants and viewers have no
22 reasonable expectation of privacy, so by
23 continuing to be in the meeting, you are
24 consenting to being recorded.

25 Additionally, prior to

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 recognizing members for questions or
3 comments they may have, I'll note for the
4 record at this time we will be using the
5 Chat feature available in Microsoft Teams
6 to allow members to signify that they
7 wish to be recognized. In order to
8 comply with the Sunshine Act, the Chat
9 feature must only be used for that
10 particular purpose.

11 Mr. Christmas, will you please
12 call the first witness to testify today.

13 Excuse me. Before you do that,
14 somebody needs to mute themself. We're
15 hearing some background discussions.
16 Thank you.

17 COUNCILMAN PHILLIPS: Council
18 President, I just wanted to note for the
19 record I'm present. I had a technical
20 difficulty.

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
22 Thank you.

23 COUNCILMAN PHILLIPS:
24 Councilmember Phillips.

25 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 Thank you.

3 THE CLERK: Our first witness
4 is Ms. Stephanie Tipton, Chief
5 Administrative Officer.

6 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good
7 morning.

8 MS. TIPTON: Good morning.
9 Good morning, Council President Clarke,
10 Chair of the Committee of the Whole,
11 Committee Vice Chair Councilmember Jones,
12 and the other members of the Committee of
13 the Whole. My name is Stephanie Tipton.
14 I am the Chief Administrative Officer for
15 the City of Philadelphia. I'm here to
16 testify in support of Bill No. 200253.

17 This bill proposes amending
18 Section 20-303 of The Philadelphia Code,
19 entitled "Salaries of Specified
20 Officers," to establish salaries based on
21 an Annual Compensation Plan, under
22 certain terms and conditions.

23 I'll now summarize the key
24 provisions of the bill.

25 Bill No. 200253 seeks to

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 utilize an annual specified officer's
3 compensation plan to establish equitable,
4 competitive salaries for City officers.
5 The bill proposes a data-driven approach
6 to create transparent salary ceilings for
7 these positions.

8 The current ordinance only
9 allows for cost of living adjustments to
10 salaries of the positions identified in
11 the ordinance and sets caps on those
12 salaries. This method fails to take into
13 account any emergent changes in the labor
14 market and, in turn, can limit the City's
15 ability to compete effectively in the
16 marketplace since these adjustments can
17 be out of alignment with industry
18 standards for these critical positions.

19 Conversely, the Annual
20 Compensation Plan proposed by the bill
21 specifically outlines the reasons for the
22 salary change, considers various market
23 variables, and creates transparency
24 around what our City leaders are being
25 paid and why.

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 The Annual Compensation Plan's
3 data-driven approach also aims to ensure
4 that City leaders, in particular women
5 and people of color, are compensated
6 equitably and competitively compared with
7 other peer cities across the country.
8 Establishing these benchmarks can help
9 the City retain top talent in its
10 leadership positions.

11 Bill No. 200253 also seeks to
12 correct a technical issue found in The
13 Philadelphia Code. Currently, to
14 increase an officer's salary above the
15 cap, departments must also change an
16 officer's title. This causes confusion
17 and logistical challenges when trying to
18 record on officer salaries accurately and
19 responsibly.

20 Finally, the changes outlined
21 in the bill will work in concert with the
22 comprehensive compensation review
23 currently underway by the Administration
24 of our benchmark positions across City
25 government. Together with the changes

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 proposed by the bill, the City will be
3 taking a holistic review of salaries in
4 all levels of the organization.

5 We have also offered two
6 amendments to the original bill. The
7 first adds newly created positions to the
8 list of officers, and the second is a
9 technical change that addresses how the
10 cost of living language in the current
11 ordinance would work under the newly
12 proposed framework.

13 I believe this bill will
14 improve the City's ability to attract and
15 retain top talent, and I respectfully
16 request that the rules of Council be
17 suspended to permit first reading of this
18 bill at the next session of Council.

19 Thank you for the opportunity
20 to testify today. This concludes my
21 testimony. I'm happy to answer any
22 questions from the Committee.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

24 Thank you very much, Ms. Tipton.

25 I had a couple of questions in

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 referencing your testimony. You talked
3 about a data-driven process in particular
4 when you reference women and people of
5 color. Explain that to me, the
6 correlation between those two statements
7 and --

8 MS. TIPTON: Sure.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: And
10 I guess because we've had conversations
11 over the years about actual
12 implementation of this.

13 MS. TIPTON: Sure. So
14 currently under the ordinance and as I
15 mentioned in my testimony, when we want
16 to or -- and the market necessitates us
17 to increase a particular officer's salary
18 above what the cap allows for the current
19 ordinance, we do have to -- we have to
20 appoint them into a different title and
21 then we also go about setting the salary.

22 The salaries themselves are not
23 always aligned across the board for like
24 positions. Sometimes there is variance
25 between, you know, certain commissioners

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 and certain levels of officers across
3 City government, and that can sometimes
4 inhibit our ability to transparently say
5 this is what we are offering and make
6 sure that there's equity and parity
7 across all of the commissioner roles.

8 What this plan would do is
9 establish a very transparent way in which
10 the salaries are set and also makes those
11 salaries public so people would know
12 ahead of time and know what those
13 salaries are. And obviously we do that
14 when we're doing the recruitment, but
15 this would just allow us to do this on a
16 regular basis to ensure there's equity
17 and parity across the commissioner
18 positions and the different officers
19 here.

20 So I think there's plenty of
21 research that shows that oftentimes
22 women, people of color tend to, because
23 there is lack of transparency, sometimes
24 their own salaries tend to sometimes get
25 paid less, and so we want to make sure

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 that that doesn't happen, and that's
3 really why we're doing this in this
4 fashion.

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

6 Okay. So under this process and when
7 there is a disagreement or basically a
8 concern that what's suggested in the bill
9 and the attempt to have an equitable
10 approach across the board, particularly
11 as it relates to women and people of
12 color, that we don't see, "we" the
13 general public or the Council, don't see
14 the implementation of that in actuality,
15 how does that get addressed since this
16 now gives the authority to the
17 Administration without Council's
18 authorization to increase caps on
19 salaries?

20 MS. TIPTON: Sure. So what
21 this would do is, if there is -- let's
22 just say the Personnel Director does the
23 compensation plan on an annual basis.
24 The Mayor says, you know, I think this
25 person should be paid differently than

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 what's here. That change would actually
3 have to go to Council, and Council would
4 have to be made aware of that. And so
5 there is a mechanism in the bill to allow
6 Council to have some insight if there's
7 something that's going to be outside of
8 the plan itself.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Let
10 me interrupt you one second. When you
11 say the change has to go to Council, what
12 does that mean? You guys e-mail us,
13 there's legislation?

14 MS. TIPTON: Yes. Sorry. I'm
15 just pulling up the -- we have to provide
16 notice to Council that we're doing that.

17 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: And
18 then if Council says we don't agree?

19 MS. TIPTON: I'm sure there
20 would be some kind of conversation around
21 that, but we do have to provide notice to
22 you that that's happening if something is
23 outside of what the compensation plan has
24 been set.

25 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: All

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 right. I'm not sure I understand what
3 that means, but I'm sure my colleagues
4 will -- actually I don't want to dominate
5 the questions, but I'm sure that there
6 will be follow-ups on that.

7 We are looking to do an
8 amendment of the sunset provision,
9 because at the end of the day -- and
10 first I want to thank you for working
11 with Council on providing opportunities
12 and incentives and benefits to the
13 general workforce, and I know you all,
14 the Administration, the next
15 Administration, will be addressing that
16 very shortly when municipal contracts
17 come up. I want to thank you for your
18 work on putting together the document.

19 In understanding that one of
20 the, I believe -- at least I can speak
21 for myself, the reason to support this is
22 the challenges we realize as a result of
23 trying to be competitive with the
24 external workforce. We're just getting
25 our butts kicked. I was talking with

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 some folks in Harrisburg the other day
3 and they were just telling me how they're
4 having challenges with the private sector
5 in particular.

6 So the conversation that this
7 should probably be a sunset on this
8 particular provision to see how it's
9 going over the next couple of years, and
10 assuming that things are okay, we can
11 continue -- well, they can. I won't be
12 here, but the Council and the new
13 Administration can continue along that
14 path.

15 So I just want to give you a
16 heads up on that, that there will
17 probably be an interest in doing a sunset
18 provision to kind of look and see,
19 because we're actually changing the
20 nature of how this whole compensation
21 strategy is done for high-ranking
22 employees by removing Council out of some
23 aspects of that process.

24 So I just want to give you the
25 FYI on that.

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 MS. TIPTON: Okay.

3 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: All
4 right? Okay. I'll probably come back.

5 Are there any questions of this
6 witness by members of the Committee? I
7 think I saw a hand raised.

8 The Chair recognizes Councilman
9 Jones.

10 COUNCILMAN JONES: Thank you,
11 Mr. President.

12 In another life, I was one of
13 those administrators that probably could
14 have qualified to be under this relaxed
15 rules, but my ears perked up when you
16 said give notice and maybe there will be
17 a conversation.

18 Can we take a deeper dive into
19 what is notice, and when you say a
20 conversation, in cases where we might
21 disagree, what are the remedies for that
22 disagreement?

23 MS. TIPTON: Sorry. I'm just
24 pulling up the language of the actual
25 ordinance here just to make sure I'm

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 clear.

3 So what the ordinance would
4 allow for now is that if the Mayor
5 believes that the compensation plan does
6 not provide for a competitive salary,
7 they can revise the salary maximum, but
8 they must provide written notification
9 and justification to Council.

10 I don't want to speak on behalf
11 of future administrations, but I suspect
12 that we would, you know, work with
13 Council if there is a disagreement, as we
14 have in the past.

15 And I think in terms of setting
16 salaries for positions, we have tried,
17 especially over this Administration, to
18 do that in a way that is done fairly and
19 regularly where we're looking at the
20 salaries, and certainly if there's input
21 that can be provided from other parties,
22 we would be open to that and we would
23 have that discussion, but certainly we
24 have to provide justification to Council
25 as to why we may be going in a different

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 direction for a particular salary,
3 especially if it's going over the
4 maximum.

5 I think what this does is, it's
6 not necessarily relaxing the rules. I
7 think it just allows us to be a bit more
8 responsive to changes in the marketplace,
9 and it allows us to have a more
10 formalized process than what is currently
11 in place now.

12 COUNCILMAN JONES: So, again, I
13 understand the rationale. I understand
14 what the City is up against. President
15 Clarke and Katherine Gilmore Richardson
16 have been forward-thinking in how we
17 recruit and retain personnel, but going
18 forward, the question still begs itself
19 what happens if we disagree. And, you
20 know, my kids back in the day would say
21 to me, and justified, you know, that it's
22 time for their allowance to increase, but
23 at least I had some input to say yes or
24 no. And in this legislation will we have
25 the ability to disagree, and if we

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 disagree, who is the final arbiter of
3 that decision?

4 MS. TIPTON: I think, you know,
5 up until this point, the Mayor has
6 retained the ability to recruit their
7 team and also pay them the salaries that
8 are competitive for that position. I
9 don't necessarily see a reason to move in
10 a different direction than what is
11 established here to allow the Mayor the
12 ability to recruit the team that they
13 need around them to do the work that they
14 have to do, but certainly there is at
15 least a provision here that would allow
16 us to have that notification go to
17 Council so you are aware of it and we can
18 have the discussion, if necessary.

19 But ultimately it is the Mayor
20 that, you know, recruits and builds their
21 team. I wouldn't want to necessarily
22 take that ability away from future
23 administrations necessarily.

24 COUNCILMAN JONES: So this is
25 for all non-civil service at-will

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 employees?

3 MS. TIPTON: No. This is only
4 for specified officers. So there's
5 certain officers that are specified
6 currently in the Code and Charter. And
7 so presently those officer salaries, the
8 way it was established, is established
9 where there is a minimum and there is a
10 maximum that cannot be -- you know, you
11 can't go over that maximum for a
12 particular position, even with the cost
13 of living increases. And so as you might
14 imagine, those salaries are quite low. I
15 mean, for some commissioners the maximum
16 salary is \$100,000. And so, you know,
17 administrations, past and present, have
18 had to, in order to ensure that they're
19 recruiting the best folks possible, in
20 some cases we have to pay them more than
21 what that cap allows, and so they have to
22 be appointed into different positions so
23 we can pay them competitively and get the
24 team that we need, you know, to do the
25 work.

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 So that's currently how it's
3 set out, but what we are doing now is, we
4 are also, as I mentioned in my testimony,
5 doing a compensation review for all sort
6 of benchmark positions, and we consider
7 benchmarks like the positions that sort
8 of set the salary scales for all other
9 positions in City government. We're
10 going to be concluding that compensation
11 review soon. And so it is our intent
12 that moving forward, we do those types of
13 compensation reviews on a more regular
14 basis to ensure that we're not only
15 looking at the highest levels of
16 government but we're looking across the
17 organization and making sure that we're
18 paying people competitively and fairly
19 for the work that they're doing.

20 COUNCILMAN JONES: I'm glad you
21 said that, and I'm going to let it go,
22 because I know in our trades within the
23 City of Philadelphia, we're having a hard
24 time recruiting and retaining those kinds
25 of electricians, plumbers, carpenters,

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 because the private sector pays so much
3 better. So I'm glad we're looking up and
4 down the food chain to see where we can
5 assist in retention and recruitment.

6 Member Harrity talks about all
7 the time the billboard on I-95 that says
8 come down, be a police officer in Miami
9 and live on the beach. So we are up
10 against it.

11 So thank you, Mr. President.

12 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

13 Thank you. Thank you, Councilman.

14 The Chair recognizes
15 Councilwoman Gilmore Richardson.

16 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Thank
17 you. Thank you so much, Council
18 President, and thank you and
19 Councilmember Jones for your questions,
20 and thank you, Ms. Tipton, for all of
21 your work on the Special Committee for
22 Municipal Retention and Hiring. We
23 appreciate the work that we've been able
24 to do in that committee, and look forward
25 to the implementation of some of the

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 recommendations in the next year.

3 I wanted to circle back

4 specifically to the point that you talked

5 about, because that's actually what I had

6 a question regarding, around how now in

7 order for the Administration to have the

8 ability to allow for higher compensation

9 for some of the salaries of the specified

10 officers, they have to place those

11 positions technically in the system under

12 a different position title.

13 For the record for this

14 hearing, if you would be able to specify

15 from all the positions that are listed

16 under Section 20-303 and the ones that

17 you all want to include, including the

18 four that came to us yesterday in the

19 form of the amendment, can you specify

20 now which of all of those positions, and

21 I think it's 25 total, currently have to

22 go under a different or additional title

23 in order to be paid, I guess, the salary

24 that the Administration would like to pay

25 for that position?

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 And in addition to that, you
3 had talked about the comprehensive review
4 of compensations across all these
5 specified officers and how you are also
6 doing this across government, but I
7 wanted to know if this review will be as
8 comprehensive as the one that happened
9 when the Home Rule Charter was initially
10 instituted to ensure that all City
11 positions were on par with the private
12 sector so that the City had the ability
13 to attract, retain, and maintain the very
14 best of talent across government.

15 MS. TIPTON: I can't speak to
16 what was done originally with the Home
17 Rule Charter, but we have retained a
18 third party that is sort of skilled and
19 has expertise in doing these types of
20 compensation reviews. We have a few
21 members of our staff internally who also
22 support the work that this third party is
23 doing.

24 And so they are going through a
25 very rigorous process to look at the

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 salaries, compare them against other
3 benchmarks, also speaking internally with
4 various stakeholders to understand the
5 current challenges with our salaries or
6 pay to come to the final review.

7 We have not done this in many
8 years, and my hope is between this bill
9 and also us completing this process, that
10 this will be something in the future that
11 we are doing more regularly.

12 We certainly would like to
13 build up our capacity inhouse to do this
14 type of compensation review. I mean,
15 it's sort of best practice and a lot of
16 large organizations have folks that do
17 this kind of work regularly, and so that
18 is what we're hoping to do.

19 On your first question,
20 Councilwoman, I can get that information
21 to you if that -- I can make that
22 available to the Chair.

23 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Okay.
24 That would be great. If you could send
25 us that information as soon as possible,

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 by the end of the week, if possible,
3 because that allows us to further
4 understand also where there could
5 potentially be any revenue gaps or
6 additional dollars possibly available
7 based on what the salaries may be
8 established for these specified officers.

9 I just need to understand based
10 on when we look at the budget and we're
11 reviewing the budget line by line and all
12 these positions are notated inside of the
13 Administration and/or each said
14 department, we need to understand where
15 there will potentially be gaps after
16 potentially this legislation would pass.
17 You understand what the question is?

18 MS. TIPTON: I do.

19 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON:
20 Because some of them may have two titles
21 or three, and so we just need to know
22 where the other changes will be reflected
23 line by line in the budget.

24 MS. TIPTON: Certainly. We can
25 do that.

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Okay.

3 And I just, lastly, just wanted to
4 underscore the question that was
5 presented by Council President Clarke and
6 Councilmember Jones relative to
7 understanding how Council will have a
8 role in this process, knowing that it is
9 our responsibility to set forth a
10 balanced budget on behalf of the City
11 each year. Okay? Thank you very much.

12 Thank you, Council President.

13 MS. TIPTON: Thank you.

14 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Thank
15 you.

16 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

17 Thank you, Councilwoman.

18 Any additional questions by our
19 members for this witness?

20 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Oh,
21 CP, I apologize. I have one additional
22 question. Thank you, Council President.

23 In the amendment that was
24 circulated yesterday regarding the Public
25 Safety Director position, the salary was

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 already established for that position in
3 the legislation. Can you speak to the
4 inclusion of that specific position?

5 MS. TIPTON: So including that
6 position would allow us to also -- so,
7 yes, there is a salary that's set in the
8 ordinance that created the position.
9 This would allow us, again, like with the
10 other positions, to look and make sure
11 that that salary is still competitive
12 moving forward.

13 So I'd like to think that the
14 salary is very competitive when we set it
15 out, but the market is changing quickly,
16 so we still want to make sure that we're
17 also looking at that salary too as part
18 of this.

19 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
20 Council Lady, actually the ordinance
21 mentions a minimum salary.

22 MS. TIPTON: Right.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So
24 it was -- we always had the capability as
25 Council to increase that number under the

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 existing plan, but this now allows, if
3 this particular bill passes, for the
4 Administration -- my understanding, that
5 some people raised some eyebrows when
6 that 265 was referenced in the bill, and
7 I'm understanding that that's likely
8 going to have to go up based on other
9 recruitment for individuals for that
10 particular position. It's a different
11 kind of world out here.

12 MS. TIPTON: It is, and we also
13 want to make sure that the future
14 administrations have the flexibility to,
15 again, recruit the best people for these
16 roles, and making sure that we can remain
17 competitive with the salaries is a big
18 piece of that.

19 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
20 Yeah. I'm sure that --

21 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: No,
22 no, no. I agree.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: I'm
24 sure the City Council will be looking to
25 do, in a like-minded way, to be able to

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 recruit individuals to work here in
3 Council, because we have had some
4 challenges over the last couple of years
5 of hiring on our staff levels. We get
6 people -- particularly when we hire
7 younger people, they tend to have a much
8 shorter tenure than those of us old heads
9 that kind of hang around and get pensions
10 and stuff. That seems to be a foreign
11 word in today's world --

12 MS. TIPTON: Yes.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: --
14 being able to capture.

15 So there are no other
16 questions. I want to thank you. Thank
17 you very much for your testimony.

18 MS. TIPTON: Thank you.

19 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
20 Again, there will likely be an additional
21 amendment on the sunset provisions to
22 just kind of get a sense of how this is
23 working under this new strategy, but
24 we'll reach out to you all as we place a
25 potential additional amendment.

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 MS. TIPTON: Okay. Thank you.

3 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

4 You're welcome.

5 Any other witnesses on this
6 particular bill today?

7 (No response.)

8 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: No
9 additional questions.

10 With that, thank you very much
11 for your testimony today. We'll be in
12 touch.

13 Thank you. All right. There
14 being no further questions from the
15 members of the Committee and no other
16 witnesses to testify, I will ask is there
17 anyone else present in this hearing whose
18 name we have failed to call and wishes to
19 offer testimony on the bill being
20 considered today?

21 (No response.)

22 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

23 Hearing none, I want to thank all of the
24 witnesses for their participation. We
25 value your opinion. I now invite all

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 witnesses to please disconnect from the
3 hearing before we go into our public
4 meeting. We will now pause the
5 proceeding briefly as multiple
6 participants; i.e., one, leave the
7 hearing. Thank you very much.

8 And at this time, we will now
9 go into our public meeting to consider
10 the action to be taken on the bill before
11 the Committee today.

12 We will now convene the public
13 meeting. Mr. Christmas, will you please
14 call the roll to take attendance, and
15 members that are in attendance, please
16 indicate by simply saying present or aye.

17 THE CLERK: Council Lady Bass.
18 (No response.)

19 THE CLERK: Council Lady
20 Brooks.

21 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: Present.

22 THE CLERK: Councilman
23 Driscoll.

24 COUNCILMAN DRISCOLL: Present.

25 THE CLERK: Council Lady

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 Gauthier.
3 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:
4 Present.
5 THE CLERK: Council Lady
6 Gilmore Richardson.
7 COUNCILWOMAN RICHARDSON: Good
8 morning, Council President. Good
9 morning, colleagues. I am present.
10 THE CLERK: Councilman Harrity.
11 COUNCILMAN HARRITY: Present.
12 THE CLERK: Councilman Johnson.
13 (No response.)
14 THE CLERK: Councilman Jones.
15 COUNCILMAN JONES: Present.
16 THE CLERK: Council Lady
17 Lozada.
18 COUNCILWOMAN LOZADA: Good
19 morning, everyone. I'm present.
20 THE CLERK: Councilman O'Neill.
21 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Present.
22 THE CLERK: Councilman
23 Phillips.
24 COUNCILMAN PHILLIPS: Good
25 morning, colleagues. Good morning,

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 viewing public. Present.
3 THE CLERK: Councilman Squilla.
4 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Good
5 morning, colleagues and Council
6 President. Present.
7 THE CLERK: Councilman Thomas.
8 (No response.)
9 THE CLERK: Council Lady
10 Vaughn.
11 COUNCILWOMAN VAUGHN: Present.
12 THE CLERK: Council President
13 Clarke.
14 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
15 Present.
16 Thank you very much. We will
17 now go into our public meeting.
18 The Chair recognizes
19 Councilmember Jones for a motion on the
20 amendment to Bill No. 200253.
21 THE CLERK: Now, Council
22 President -- pardon me, Councilman Jones.
23 I just wanted to note that we have
24 circulated the new amendment, which adds
25 in a two-year sunset provision. So

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 that's the amendment that has been
3 circulated that you now have and that we
4 are now considering.

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
6 Okay. So is that included in the
7 earlier -- it's just one amendment,
8 right?

9 THE CLERK: No. All of the
10 amendments are in one document, the new
11 amendment.

12 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
13 Thank you. Cool. Okay. Thank you,
14 Mr. Christmas. Quick work.

15 THE CLERK: So you can start
16 over, Councilman Jones. You were about
17 to --

18 COUNCILMAN JONES: Thank you,
19 Mr. Christmas.

20 Thank you, Mr. President. I
21 offer an amendment to Bill No. 200253. A
22 copy of that amendment has been
23 circulated to all members of the
24 Committee. I move for the adoption of
25 the amendment to Bill No. 200253.

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 (Duly seconded.)

3 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

4 Thank you. The Chair notes that
5 Councilman Squilla seconded the motion.

6 It's been moved and properly
7 seconded that the amendment to Bill No.
8 200253 be approved.

9 All in favor of the motion
10 signify by saying aye.

11 (Aye.)

12 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:

13 Those opposed?

14 (No response.)

15 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: The
16 ayes have it, the motion carries, and the
17 amendment to Bill No. 200253 has been
18 approved.

19 The Chair again recognizes
20 Councilmember Jones for a motion on Bill
21 No. 200253, as amended.

22 COUNCILMAN JONES: Thank you,
23 Mr. President. I move for the adoption
24 to Bill No. 200253, as amended, be
25 approved by this Committee and that the

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253
2 rules of Council be suspended to permit
3 next reading of this bill at our next
4 session of Council.

5 (Duly seconded.)

6 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: The
7 Chair notes that Councilman Squilla
8 seconded the motion.

9 It's been moved and properly
10 seconded that Bill No. 200253, as
11 amended, be reported from this Committee
12 with a favorable recommendation at our
13 next session of Council.

14 All those in favor indicate by
15 saying aye.

16 (Aye.)

17 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
18 Those opposed?

19 (No response.)

20 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: The
21 ayes have it, the motion carries, and
22 Bill No. 200253, as amended, will be
23 reported from this Committee with a
24 favorable recommendation with a rules
25 suspension at our next session of

1 10/18/23 - WHOLE - BILL 200253

2 Council.

3 That concludes the business
4 before the Committee of the Whole today.

5 Thank you all very much for your
6 participation and your attendance.

7 Thank you.

8 - - -

9 (Committee of the Whole
10 concluded at 10:54 a.m.)

11 - - -

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

CERTIFICATE

3

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the

4

proceedings, evidence and objections are

5

contained fully and accurately in the

6

stenographic notes taken by me upon the

7

foregoing matter, and that this is a true and

8

correct transcript of same.

9

10

11

12

13

Michele L. Murphy

14

15

MICHELE L. MURPHY

16

RPR-Notary Public

17

18

19

20

21

(The foregoing certification of this

22

transcript does not apply to any reproduction

23

of the same by any means, unless under the

24

direct control and/or supervision of the

25

certifying reporter.)

	11 11:1	7:8	administrat	21, 22, 25
\$	12:1 13:1	action	ions	38:7, 17
\$100,000	14:1 15:1	34:10	19:11	amendments
22:16	16:1 17:1	actual	21:23	11:6 37:10
	18:1 19:1	12:11	22:17	and/or
1	20:1 21:1	18:24	31:14	28:13
10/18/23	22:1 23:1	actuality	Administrat	announcemen
2:1 3:1	24:1 25:1	14:14	ive	t
4:1 5:1	26:1 27:1	addition	8:5, 14	2:5
6:1 7:1	28:1 29:1	26:2	administrat	annual
8:1 9:1	30:1 31:1	additional	ors	6:11 8:21
10:1 11:1	32:1 33:1	25:22 28:6	18:13	9:2, 19
12:1 13:1	34:1 35:1	29:18, 21	adoption	10:2 14:23
14:1 15:1	36:1, 20	32:20, 25	37:24	apologize
16:1 17:1	37:1, 21, 25	33:9	38:23	29:21
18:1 19:1	38:1, 8, 17,	Additional	agree	appoint
20:1 21:1	21, 24	y	15:18	12:20
22:1 23:1	39:1, 10, 22	6:25	31:22	appointed
24:1 25:1	40:1	addressed	ahead	22:22
26:1 27:1	25	14:15	13:12	approach
28:1 29:1	25:21	addresses	aims	9:5 10:3
30:1 31:1	265	11:9	10:3	14:10
32:1 33:1	31:6	addressing	aligned	approved
34:1 35:1		16:15	12:23	38:8, 18, 25
36:1 37:1	A	adds	alignment	arbiter
38:1 39:1	a.m.	11:7 36:24	9:17	21:2
40:1	40:10	adjustments	allowance	aspects
10:54	ability	9:9, 16	20:22	17:23
40:10	9:15 11:14	Administration	amended	assist
	13:4 20:25	ion	38:21, 24	24:5
2	21:6, 12, 22	10:23	39:11, 22	assuming
20-303	25:8 26:12	14:17	amending	17:10
6:8 8:18	account	16:14, 15	6:8 8:17	at-will
25:16	9:13	17:13	amendment	21:25
200253	accounted	19:17	16:8 25:19	attempt
2:1 3:1	3:24	25:7, 24	29:23	14:9
4:1 5:1, 21	accurately	28:13 31:4	32:21, 25	attendance
6:1, 7 7:1	10:18		36:20, 24	2:22, 23
8:1, 16, 25	Act		37:2, 7, 11,	
9:1 10:1,				

34:14, 15 40:6 attract 11:14 26:13 authority 14:16 authorizati on 14:18 aware 6:18 15:4 21:17 aye 34:16 38:10, 11 39:15, 16 ayes 38:16 39:21	23:14 Bass 3:3 34:17 beach 24:9 begin 2:4 6:15 begs 20:18 behalf 19:10 29:10 believes 19:5 benchmark 10:24 23:6 benchmarks 10:8 23:7 27:3 benefits 16:12 big 31:17 bill 2:1 3:1 4:1 5:1, 21, 23 6:1, 6, 7 7:1 8:1, 16, 17, 24, 25 9:1, 5, 20 10:1, 11, 21 11:1, 2, 6, 13, 18 12:1 13:1 14:1, 8 15:1, 5 16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1 21:1	22:1 23:1 24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1, 8 28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1, 3, 6 32:1 33:1, 6, 19 34:1, 10 35:1 36:1, 20 37:1, 21, 25 38:1, 7, 17, 20, 24 39:1, 3, 10, 22 40:1 billboard 24:7 bit 20:7 board 12:23 14:10 briefly 34:5 Brooks 3:6, 7 34:20, 21 budget 28:10, 11, 23 29:10 build 27:13 builds 21:20 business 40:3 butts 16:25	C call 2:22 7:12 33:18 34:14 called 2:25 5:19 cap 10:15 12:18 22:21 capability 30:24 capacity 27:13 caps 9:11 14:18 capture 32:14 carpenters 23:25 carries 38:16 39:21 cases 18:20 22:20 ceilings 9:6 chain 24:4 Chair 8:10, 11 18:8 24:14 27:22 36:18 38:4, 19	39:7 challenges 10:17 16:22 17:4 27:5 32:4 change 9:22 10:15 11:9 15:2, 11 changing 17:19 30:15 Charter 22:6 26:9, 17 Chat 7:5, 8 Chief 8:4, 14 Christmas 2:21 3:2 5:22 6:2 7:11 34:13 37:14, 19 circle 25:3 circulated 29:24 36:24 37:3, 23 cities 10:7 City 2:8 8:15 9:4, 24 10:4, 9, 24 11:2 13:3 20:14 23:9, 23
--	---	--	---	--

26:10, 12 29:10 31:24 City's 9:14 11:14 CLARK 5:25 Clarke 2:2 3:20, 25 4:9, 15, 22 5:11, 14, 15 6:5, 13 7:21, 25 8:6, 9 11:23 12:9 14:5 15:9, 17, 25 18:3 20:15 24:12 29:5, 16 30:19, 23 31:19, 23 32:13, 19 33:3, 8, 22 36:13, 14 37:5, 12 38:3, 12, 15 39:6, 17, 20 clear 19:2 CLERK 3:3, 5, 8, 11, 15, 22 4:3, 5, 11, 17, 20, 25 5:5, 7, 13 6:3, 7 8:3 34:17, 19, 22, 25 35:5, 10,	12, 14, 16, 20, 22 36:3, 7, 9, 12, 21 37:9, 15 Code 6:9 8:18 10:13 22:6 colleagues 3:19 4:7 5:4 16:3 35:9, 25 36:5 color 10:5 12:5 13:22 14:12 comments 7:3 commissioner 13:7, 17 commissioners 12:25 22:15 committee 5:18, 20 8:10, 11, 12 11:22 18:6 24:21, 24 33:15 34:11 37:24 38:25 39:11, 23 40:4, 9 committees 2:8, 14	compare 27:2 compared 10:6 compensated 10:5 compensation 6:11 8:21 9:3, 20 10:2, 22 14:23 15:23 17:20 19:5 23:5, 10, 13 25:8 26:20 27:14 compensation 26:4 compete 9:15 competitive 9:4 16:23 19:6 21:8 30:11, 14 31:17 competitively 10:6 22:23 23:18 completing 27:9 comply 7:8 comprehensive 10:22 26:3, 8	concern 14:8 concert 10:21 concluded 40:10 concludes 11:20 40:3 concluding 23:10 conditions 6:12 8:22 confusion 10:16 consenting 6:24 considered 33:20 considers 9:22 continue 17:11, 13 continuing 2:6 6:23 contracts 16:16 convene 34:12 conversation 15:20 17:6 18:17, 20 conversations 12:10 Conversely 9:19	Cool 37:13 copy 37:22 correct 10:12 correlation 12:6 cost 9:9 11:10 22:12 Council 2:2, 8, 13 3:3, 5, 11, 15, 18, 20, 25 4:9, 11, 15, 22 5:3, 7, 11, 13, 15, 25 6:5, 13 7:17, 21, 25 8:6, 9 11:16, 18, 23 12:9 14:5, 13 15:3, 6, 9, 11, 16, 17, 18, 25 16:11 17:12, 22 18:3 19:9, 13, 24 21:17 24:12, 17 29:5, 7, 12, 16, 22 30:19, 20, 23, 25 31:19, 23, 24 32:3, 13, 19
---	---	--	---	---

33:3, 8, 22 34:17, 19, 25 35:5, 8, 16 36:5, 9, 12, 14, 21 37:5, 12 38:3, 12, 15 39:2, 4, 6, 13, 17, 20 40:2	4:13 5:9 24:15, 16 27:20, 23 28:19 29:2, 14, 17, 20 31:21 34:21 35:3, 7, 18 36:11	16:9 17:2 20:20 decision 21:3 deeper 18:18 department 28:14 departments 10:15 differently 14:25 difficulty 7:20 direction 20:2 21:10 Director 14:22 29:25 disagree 18:21 20:19, 25 21:2 disagreement 14:7 18:22 19:13 disconnect 34:2 discussion 19:23 21:18 discussions 7:15 dive 18:18 document 16:18	37:10 dollars 28:6 dominate 16:4 Driscoll 3:9, 10 34:23, 24 Due 2:6 duly 38:2 39:5 E e-mail 15:12 earlier 37:7 ears 18:15 effectively 9:15 electrician s 23:25 emergent 9:13 employees 17:22 22:2 end 16:9 28:2 ensure 10:3 13:16 22:18 23:14 26:10 entitled 6:9 8:19	equitable 9:3 14:9 equitably 10:6 equity 13:6, 16 establish 6:10 8:20 9:3 13:9 established 5:17 21:11 22:8 28:8 30:2 Establishin g 10:8 Excuse 7:13 existing 31:2 expectation 6:22 expertise 26:19 Explain 12:5 external 16:24 eyebrows 31:5 F failed 33:18 fails 9:12 fairly 19:18
Council's 14:17	country 10:7			
Councilman 3:8, 10, 22, 23 4:3, 5, 6, 17, 18, 20, 25 5:2, 5 7:17, 23 18:8, 10 20:12 21:24 23:20 24:13 34:22, 24 35:10, 11, 12, 14, 15, 20, 21, 22, 24 36:3, 4, 7, 22 37:16, 18 38:5, 22 39:7	couple 11:25 17:9 32:4 COVID-19 2:7 CP 29:21 create 9:6 created 11:7 30:8 creates 9:23 critical 9:18 current 9:8 11:10 12:18 27:5			
Councilmember 7:24 8:11 24:19 29:6 36:19 38:20	D Daily 2:16 data-driven 9:5 10:3 12:3 day			
Councilwoman 3:7, 13, 17				

23:18	framework	26:6, 14	2:4, 15, 17	imagine
fashion	11:12	great	5:18, 20	22:14
14:4	future	27:24	6:19, 20	implementat
favor	19:11	guess	7:15 25:14	ion
38:9 39:14	21:22	12:10	33:17, 23	12:12
favorable	27:10	25:23	34:3, 7	14:14
39:12, 24	31:13	guys	hearings	24:25
feature	FYI	15:12	2:11, 13	improve
7:5, 9	17:25		high-	11:14
final		H	ranking	incentives
21:2 27:6	G	hand	17:21	16:12
Finally	gaps	18:7	higher	include
10:20	28:5, 15	hang	25:8	25:17
flexibility	Gauthier	32:9	highest	included
31:14	3:12, 13	happen	23:15	2:14 37:6
folks	35:2, 3	14:2	hire	including
17:2 22:19	general	happened	32:6	25:17 30:5
27:16	14:13	26:8	hiring	inclusion
follow-ups	16:13	happening	24:22 32:5	30:4
16:6	Gilmore	15:22	holistic	increase
food	3:16 20:15	happy	11:3	10:14
24:4	24:15 35:6	5:10 11:21	Home	12:17
foreign	give	hard	26:9, 16	14:18
32:10	17:15, 24	23:23	hope	20:22
form	18:16	Harrisburg	27:8	30:25
25:19	glad	17:2	hoping	increases
formalized	23:20 24:3	Harrity	27:18	22:13
20:10	good	3:22, 23	hour	individuals
forward	2:3 3:17,	24:6	2:19	31:9 32:2
20:18	18, 20, 25	35:10, 11		industry
23:12	4:6, 9, 13,	heads	I	9:17
24:24	15, 18, 22	17:16 32:8	I-95	information
30:12	5:2, 9, 11,	health	24:7	27:20, 25
forward-	16 8:6, 8, 9	2:7	i.e.	inhibit
thinking	35:7, 8, 18,	hear	34:6	13:4
20:16	24, 25 36:4	6:15	identified	inhouse
found	government	hearing	9:10	27:13
2:18 10:12	10:25 13:3			
	23:9, 16			

initially 26:9	Jones 4:5,6 8:11		31:25	31:16
input 19:20 20:23	18:9,10 20:12 21:24 23:20	L	limit 9:14	market 9:14,22 12:16 30:15
Inquirer 2:16	24:19 29:6 35:14,15	labor 9:13	list 11:8	marketplace 9:16 20:8
inside 28:12	36:19,22 37:16,18 38:20,22	lack 13:23	listed 25:15	maximum 19:7 20:4 22:10,11, 15
insight 15:6	justificati	Lady 3:3,5,11, 15 4:11 5:7 30:20 34:17,19, 25 35:5,16 36:9	live 24:9	Mayor 14:24 19:4 21:5,11,19
instituted 26:10	on 19:9,24	language 11:10 18:24	living 9:9 11:10 22:13	means 16:3
Instructions 2:11	justified 20:21	large 27:16	logistical 10:17	mechanism 15:5
Intelligencer 2:17	K	lastly 29:3	lot 27:15	meeting 2:9 6:18, 23 34:4,9, 13 36:17
intent 23:11	Katherine 20:15	leaders 9:24 10:4	low 22:14	Member 24:6
interest 17:17	key 8:23	leadership 10:10	Lozada 4:12,13 35:17,18	members 2:23 7:2,6 8:12 18:6 26:21 29:19 33:15 34:15 37:23
internally 26:21 27:3	kicked 16:25	leave 34:6	M	mentioned 12:15 23:4
interrupt 15:10	kids 20:20	Legal 2:16	made 15:4	mentions 30:21
invite 33:25	kind 15:20 17:18 27:17 31:11 32:9,22	legislation 15:13 20:24 28:16 30:3	maintain 26:13	method 9:12
invited 6:17	kinds 23:24	levels 11:4 13:2 23:15 32:5	make 2:5,10 13:5,25 18:25 27:21 30:10,16 31:13	
issue 10:12	knowing 29:8	life 18:12	makes 13:10	
J		like-minded	making 23:17	
Johnson 4:3 35:12				

Miami 24:8	necessarily 20:6 21:9, 21,23	offered 11:5	12:14,19 18:25 19:3 30:8,20	parties 19:21
Microsoft 2:10 7:5	necessitate s 12:16	offering 13:5	organizatio n 11:4 23:17	party 26:18,22
minimum 22:9 30:21	newly 11:7,11	officer 8:5,14 10:18 22:7 24:8	organizatio ns 27:16	pass 28:16
morning 2:3 3:18, 19,21 4:2, 7,10,14, 16,19,23 5:3,10,12, 16 8:7,8,9 35:8,9,19, 25 36:5	News 2:16	officer's 9:2 10:14, 16 12:17	original 11:6	passes 31:3
	non-civil 21:25	officers 6:10 8:20 9:4 11:8 13:2,18 22:4,5 25:10 26:5 28:8	originally 26:16	past 19:14 22:17
motion 36:19 38:5,9,16, 20 39:8,21	notated 28:12		outlined 10:20	path 17:14
	note 2:19 7:3, 18 36:23	oftentimes 13:21	outlines 9:21	pause 34:4
move 21:9 37:24 38:23	notes 38:4 39:7	open 19:22	P	pay 21:7 22:20,23 25:24 27:6
moved 38:6 39:9	notice 15:16,21 18:16,19	opinion 33:25	paid 9:25 13:25 14:25 25:23	paying 23:18
moving 23:12 30:12	notices 2:15	opportuniti es 16:11	par 26:11	pays 24:2
multiple 34:5	notificatio n 19:8 21:16	opportunity 11:19	pardon 36:22	peer 10:7
municipal 16:16 24:22	number 30:25	opposed 38:13 39:18	parity 13:6,17	pensions 32:9
mute 7:14	O	order 5:19 7:7 22:18 25:7,23	part 30:17	people 10:5 12:4 13:11,22 14:11 23:18 31:5,15 32:6,7
N	O'NEILL 4:17,18 35:20,21	ordinance 9:8,11 11:11	participant s 6:21 34:6	perked 18:15
nature 17:20	offer 2:12 33:19 37:21		participati on 33:24 40:6	permit 11:17 39:2

person 14:25	police 24:8	presented 29:5	process 12:3 14:6	18:24
personnel 14:22 20:17	position 21:8 22:12 25:12, 25	presently 22:7	17:23 20:10 26:25 27:9	purpose 7:10
Philadelphi a 6:9 8:15, 18 10:13 23:23	29:25 30:2, 4, 6, 8 31:10	President 2:2 3:18, 20, 25 4:7, 9, 15, 22	29:8	putting 16:18
Phillies 4:8	positions 9:7, 10, 18 10:10, 24 11:7 12:24	5:3, 11, 13, 15, 25 6:5, 13 7:18, 21, 25 8:6, 9 11:23	properly 38:6 39:9	Q
Phillips 4:21 7:17, 23, 24 35:23, 24	13:18 19:16 22:22 23:6, 7, 9 25:11, 15, 20 26:11	12:9 14:5 15:9, 17, 25 18:3, 11 20:14	proposed 9:20 11:2, 12	qualified 18:14
Phlcouncil. com. 2:18	28:12 30:10	24:11, 12, 18 29:5, 12, 16, 22	proposes 8:17 9:5	question 20:18 25:6 27:19 28:17 29:4, 22
piece 31:18	possibly 28:6	30:19, 23 31:19, 23	provide 15:15, 21 19:6, 8, 24	questions 7:2 11:22, 25 16:5 18:5 24:19 29:18
place 20:11 25:10 32:24	potential 32:25	32:13, 19 33:3, 8, 22 35:8 36:6, 12, 14, 22	provided 19:21	32:16 33:9, 14
plan 6:12 8:21 9:3, 20 13:8 14:23 15:8, 23 19:5 31:2	potentially 28:5, 15, 16	37:5, 12, 20 38:3, 12, 15, 23 39:6, 17, 20	provision 16:8 17:8, 18 21:15 36:25	Quick 37:14
Plan's 10:2	practice 27:15	prior 2:17 6:25	provisions 8:24 32:21	quickly 30:15
plenty 13:20	present 2:24 3:7, 10, 14, 19, 24 4:14 5:4 7:19 22:17	privacy 6:22	public 2:4, 7, 12, 13, 14 5:19 6:19, 20 13:11 14:13 29:24	quorum 5:18
plumbers 23:25	33:17 34:16, 21, 24 35:4, 9, 11, 15, 19, 21 36:2, 6, 11, 15	private 17:4 24:2 26:11	34:3, 9, 12 36:2, 17	R
point 21:5 25:4		proceeding 34:5	published 2:15	raised 18:7 31:5
			pulling 15:15	rationale 20:13
				reach 32:24
				read 5:23 6:6

reading 11:17 39:3	13:14 24:5 31:9	39:11,23	10:22 11:3 23:5,11 26:3,7 27:6,14	salaries 6:9,11 8:19,20 9:4,10,12 10:18 11:3 12:22 13:10,11, 13,24 14:19 19:16,20 21:7 22:7, 14 25:9 27:2,5 28:7 31:17
realize 16:22	recruits 21:20	request 11:16	reviewing 28:11	salary 9:6,22 10:14 12:17,21 19:6,7 20:2 22:16 23:8 25:23 29:25 30:7,11, 14,17,21
reason 16:21 21:9	reference 12:4	research 13:21	reviews 23:13 26:20	scales 23:8
reasonable 6:22	referenced 31:6	respectfull y 11:15	revise 19:7	seconded 38:2,5,7 39:5,8,10
reasons 9:21	referencing 12:2	response 3:4 4:4,24 5:6,24 33:7,21 34:18 35:13 36:8 38:14 39:19	Richardson 3:16,17 20:15 24:15,16 27:23 28:19 29:2,14,20 31:21 35:6,7	Section 6:8 8:18 25:16
recognized 7:7	reflected 28:22	responsibil ity 29:9	rigorous 26:25	sector 17:4 24:2 26:12
recognizes 18:8 24:14 36:18 38:19	regular 13:16 23:13	responsibly 10:19	role 29:8	seeks 8:25 10:11
recognizing 7:2	regularly 19:19 27:11,17	responsive 20:8	roles 13:7 31:16	send 27:24
recommendat ion 39:12,24	relates 14:11	result 16:22	roll 2:22 34:14	
recommendat ions 25:2	relative 29:6	retain 10:9 11:15 20:17 26:13	Rule 26:9,17	
record 7:4,19 10:18 25:13	relaxed 18:14	retained 21:6 26:17	rules 11:16 18:15 20:6 39:2,24	
recorded 6:20,24	relaxing 20:6	retaining 23:24	S	
recruit 20:17 21:6,12 31:15 32:2	remain 31:16	retention 24:5,22	Safety 29:25	
recruiting 22:19 23:24	remedies 18:21	revenue 28:5		
recruitment	remote 2:10	review		
	remotely 2:9			
	removing 17:22			
	reported			

sense 32:22	19:10 26:15 30:3	sunset 16:8 17:7, 17 32:21 36:25	11:9 technically 25:11	11:24 12:8,13 14:20
service 21:25	speaking 27:3	Sunshine 7:8	telling 17:3	15:14,19 18:2,23 21:4 22:3
session 11:18 39:4,13,25	Special 24:21	support 8:16 16:21 26:22	tend 13:22,24 32:7	24:20 26:15 28:18,24
set 13:10 15:24 23:3,8 29:9 30:7, 14	specific 30:4	suspect 19:11	tenure 32:8	29:13 30:5,22 31:12
sets 9:11	specificall y 9:21 25:4	suspended 11:17 39:2	terms 6:12 8:22 19:15	32:12,18 33:2
setting 12:21 19:15	Squilla 4:25 5:2 36:3,4 38:5 39:7	suspension 39:25	testify 6:18 7:12 8:16 11:20 33:16	title 5:23 6:6 10:16 12:20 25:12,22
shorter 32:8	staff 26:21 32:5	system 25:11	testimony 2:13 6:16 11:21 12:2,15 23:4 32:17 33:11,19	titles 28:20
shortly 16:16	stakeholder s 27:4	T taking 11:3	themself 7:14	today 6:17 7:12 11:20 33:6,11,20 34:11 40:4
shows 13:21	standards 9:18	talent 10:9 11:15 26:14	things 17:10	today's 32:11
signify 7:6 38:10	start 37:15	talked 12:2 25:4 26:3	Thomas 5:5 36:7	top 10:9 11:15
simply 34:16	statements 12:6	talking 16:25	threat 2:6	total 25:21
sir 6:3	Stephanie 8:4,13	talks 24:6	time 7:4 13:12 20:22 23:24 24:7 34:8	touch 33:12
skilled 26:18	strategy 17:21 32:23	team 21:7,12,21 22:24	Tipton 8:4,8,13	trades 23:22
sort 23:5,7 26:18 27:15	stuff 32:10	Teams 2:10 7:5		transparenc y 9:23 13:23
speak 16:20	suggested 14:8	technical 7:19 10:12		
	summarize 8:23			

transparent 9:6 13:9	variants 2:8	19:12 21:13 22:25	
transparently 13:4	Vaughn 5:8,9 36:10,11	23:19 24:21,23 26:22	
turn 9:14	Vice 8:11	27:17 32:2 37:14	
two-year 36:25	view 2:12	workforce 16:13,24	
type 27:14	viewers 6:21	working 16:10 32:23	
types 23:12 26:19	viewing 36:2	world 31:11 32:11	
U	W		
ultimately 21:19	wanted 7:18 25:3 26:7 29:3 36:23	written 19:8	
underscore 29:4	Wednesday 5:10		
understand 16:2 20:13 27:4 28:4, 9,14,17	week 28:2	Y	
understandi ng 16:19 29:7 31:4,7	wishes 33:18	year 25:2 29:11	
underway 10:23	witnesses 6:16 33:5, 16,24 34:2	years 12:11 17:9 27:8 32:4	
utilize 9:2	women 10:4 12:4 13:22 14:11	yesterday 25:18 29:24	
		younger 32:7	
V	word 32:11		
variables 9:23	work 10:21 11:11 16:18		
variance 12:24			