

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
COMMITTEE ON LAW AND GOVERNMENT

Remote location using Microsoft® Teams
Wednesday, June 17, 2020
2:30 p.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCILWOMAN CHERELLE L. PARKER, CHAIR
COUNCILMAN DEREK GREEN, VICE-CHAIR
COUNCILWOMAN CINDY BASS
COUNCILWOMAN KENDRA BROOKS
COUNCILWOMAN HELEN GYM
COUNCILMAN CURTIS JONES, JR.
COUNCILMAN DAVID OH
COUNCILMAN BRIAN O'NEILL
COUNCILWOMAN MARIA QUINONES-SANCHEZ
COUNCILMAN MARK SQUILLA

BILLS: 200355, 200363, 200367, 200370, 200377

- - -

1 - - -

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Good
3 afternoon, everyone. I understand that
4 state law currently requires that the
5 following announcement be made at the
6 beginning of every remote public
7 hearing as follows: Due to the current
8 public health emergency, City Council
9 Committees are currently meeting
10 remotely. We are using Microsoft Teams
11 to make the remote hearings possible.
12 Instructions on how the public may view
13 and offer public testimony at public
14 hearings of Council Committees are
15 included in the public hearing notices
16 that are published in the Daily News,
17 Inquirer, Legal Intelligencer prior to
18 the hearing and can also be found on
19 phlcouncil.com.

20 I now note that the hour has
21 come. Rachel, will you please call the
22 roll to take attendance.

23 Members that are in
24 attendance will please indicate that
25 you are present when your name is

1 called. Also, just please say a few
2 brief words when you are responding so
3 that your image will be displayed on
4 screen when you speak.

5 THE CLERK: Councilmember
6 Derek Green.

7 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Present.
8 Looking forward to a good Law and
9 Government Committee hearing.

10 THE CLERK: Councilmember
11 David Oh.

12 COUNCILMAN OH: Present.

13 THE CLERK: Councilmember
14 Helen Gym.

15 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Good
16 morning, Madam Chair. Good morning,
17 colleagues. Looking forward to a Law
18 and Government hearing. It feels like
19 we never left.

20 THE CLERK: Councilmember
21 Curtis Jones.

22 COUNCILMAN JONES: Thank you,
23 Madam Chair, and I concur. It's
24 afternoon, not morning.

25 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER:

1 Afternoon, wow.

2 THE CLERK: Councilmember
3 Brian O'Neill.

4 Councilmember Cindy Bass.

5 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Good
6 afternoon. I am absolutely present.

7 THE CLERK: Councilmember
8 Maria Quinones-Sanchez.

9 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-
10 SANCHEZ: Good afternoon. It's going
11 to be a long day. Thank you for your
12 patience.

13 THE CLERK: Councilmember
14 Mark Squilla.

15 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-
16 SANCHEZ: Somebody needs to put their
17 TV on mute.

18 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Rachel,
19 does that conclude the roll call?

20 THE CLERK: Yes, it does.

21 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
22 you.

23 A quorum of the Committee is
24 present and this hearing --

25 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Brian

1 O'Neill here, Madam Chairwoman.

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: I'm

3 sorry. Who was that speaking?

4 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Brian

5 O'Neill.

6 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER:

7 Councilman O'Neill, thank you. The

8 Clerk will please add Councilman Brian

9 O'Neill to the roll.

10 This is the public hearing on

11 the Committee on Law and Government

12 regarding Bill Nos. 200355, 200363,

13 200367, 200370, and Resolution No.

14 200377.

15 Rachel, will you please read

16 the title of the bills and resolutions.

17 THE CLERK: 200355, an

18 Ordinance amending an Ordinance (Bill

19 No. 180293), entitled "An Ordinance

20 authorizing the revision of lines and

21 grades on a portion of City Plan Nos.

22 34-S and 41-S by striking from the City

23 Plan and vacating the legally open

24 portions of Packer Avenue from

25 Christopher Columbus Boulevard to the

1 Pierhead Line of the Delaware River and
2 reserving and placing on the City Plan
3 a right-of-way for sewer and drainage
4 purposes, water main purposes, and
5 public utility purposes within the
6 lines of Packer Avenue being stricken
7 and authorizing acceptance of the grant
8 to the City of the said right-of-way,
9 under certain terms and conditions.

10 200363, an Ordinance amending
11 Section 20-101 of the Philadelphia
12 Code, entitled "Residence
13 Requirements," by restoring requirement
14 that no person shall be appointed as an
15 employee in the civil service,
16 including but not limited to police
17 officers, unless he or she has been a
18 bona fide resident of the City for at
19 least one year prior to appointment.

20 200367, an Ordinance
21 providing for the submission to the
22 qualified electors of the City of
23 Philadelphia of the proposal set forth
24 in a resolution approved by Council
25 proposing an amendment to the

1 Philadelphia Home Rule Charter relating
2 to the creation of the Citizens Police
3 Oversight Commission; and authorizing
4 the appropriate officers to publish
5 notice and to make arrangements for the
6 special election, all under certain
7 terms and conditions.

8 200370, an Ordinance
9 authorizing the Procurement
10 Commissioner on behalf of the City to
11 enter into a concession agreement with
12 Bicycle Transit Systems, Inc. for the
13 operation, maintenance and expansion of
14 a bicycle sharing system, an essential
15 service during the COVID-19 period,
16 under certain terms and conditions.

17 And 200377, Resolution
18 proposing an amendment to the
19 Philadelphia Home Rule Charter to
20 provide for the creation of a Citizens
21 Police Oversight Commission, and to
22 authorize City Council by ordinance to
23 determine the composition, powers and
24 duties of the Commission; and providing
25 for the submission of the amendment of

1 the electors of Philadelphia.

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Now,
3 before we begin to hear testimony from
4 the witnesses we have for today,
5 everyone who has been invited to the
6 meeting to testify should be aware that
7 this public hearing is being recorded.
8 Because the hearing is public,
9 participants and viewers have no
10 reasonable expectation of privacy. By
11 continuing to be in the meeting, you
12 are consenting to being recorded.

13 Additionally, prior to
14 recognizing members for the questions
15 or comments they have for witnesses, I
16 will note for the record at this time
17 that we will use the chat feature
18 available in Microsoft Teams to allow
19 members to signify that they wish to be
20 recognized. In order to comply with
21 the Sunshine Act, the chat feature must
22 only be used for this purpose.

23 Now, before I ask Rachel to
24 call the first panel for Bill No.
25 200363, I would like to make some

1 opening comments. Let me note for the
2 record that as Chair of City Council's
3 Committee on Labor and Civil Service,
4 when Council President Clarke asked me
5 to introduce Bill No. 200363 on his
6 behalf, I enthusiastically said yes.
7 And since its introduction, I need to
8 say for the benefit of the public that
9 I have been disheartened but not
10 surprised to have people reaching out
11 to me about this bill, which simply
12 requires those who want to work for the
13 City in a civil service capacity to
14 live in the City as a resident for at
15 least one year before becoming employed
16 by the City.

17 They have stated that this
18 bill will hurt the City in its ability
19 to attract top talent and fill empty
20 positions. Now, before I for the
21 record address those concerns, I want
22 to note a few points of interest for
23 the public. You need to know that the
24 bill applies only to civil service new
25 hires, and it does not affect any

1 existing Collective Bargaining
2 Agreement. So this is prospective,
3 only future hires. The bill merely
4 restores the residency requirement that
5 was law for all civil service employees
6 for 55 years and is still the law for
7 civil service laborers who are
8 represented by District Council 33.

9 And I want to note for the record that
10 these are our blue collar workers, who
11 if we haven't learned recently that
12 they are essential, we know that they
13 are on the front line.

14 In addition to that, the Home
15 Rule Charter allows the Civil Service
16 Commission to waive the residency
17 requirement at the request of the
18 Personnel Director when there aren't
19 qualified Philadelphia residents
20 available to fill vacant positions.

21 What you are saying, Cherelle?

22 Although Philadelphia is known for our
23 distinguished eds and meds, let's say
24 the City needed to fill a position and
25 hypothetically they couldn't find no

1 one coming from Drexel, the University
2 of Pennsylvania, Temple, Lasalle,
3 Chestnut Hill College and let's not
4 talk about the two neighboring
5 Historically Black Colleges and
6 Universities that are near us, 45
7 minutes to an hour away, Lincoln
8 University and Cheyney University. We
9 have places that we can go for
10 recruitment.

11 In addition, this waiver
12 process is more than adequate to
13 address hard-to-fill job vacancies
14 requiring special skills or expertise
15 that are not available in the City.
16 That higher education pool that I just
17 acknowledged is a great place to start.
18 In addition, the residency requirement
19 does not apply to appointed positions
20 including the Personnel Director, the
21 Finance Director, the MDO, the City
22 Representative, the Treasurer, heads of
23 department or deputies and exempts.

24 So you might ask yourself why
25 have individuals been saying that this

1 bill will hurt the City in its ability
2 to attract top talent and fill empty
3 positions. I can't answer for them,
4 but I've been assuming that it's
5 related to something else that
6 individuals have been saying for years.
7 And that is, that we in the City of
8 Philadelphia need to better train and
9 educate our citizens so that they are
10 more than qualified to gain access to
11 good family-sustaining jobs.

12 So my question is this:
13 Should we just give up and accept that
14 some Philadelphians may not currently
15 be educated or trained enough according
16 to our desires to do some of these City
17 jobs or should we instead roll up our
18 sleeves and begin working on addressing
19 the underlying issues? I have also
20 heard some say that by having the
21 residency requirement, it puts
22 Philadelphia at a competitive
23 disadvantage with other cities. Again,
24 when I think about the institutions of
25 higher learning in Philadelphia, I

1 don't think that to be the case.

2 In addition to that, let me
3 say this: I would think that by giving
4 a leg up to Philadelphia residents when
5 it comes to City jobs, we are doing a
6 service to our citizenry. Don't forget
7 that we are the poorest big city in the
8 nation, and we use this tool in
9 incentivizing residency with our City
10 hiring as a tool in our toolbox to do
11 away with that narrative and quite
12 frankly that alarming stat. In
13 addition, we should use this as a way
14 to get more of our residents into good
15 family-sustaining jobs.

16 Now, finally I got to state
17 this for the record because some of my
18 constituents who have been paying
19 attention to this have said, Cherelle,
20 something doesn't smell right with this
21 and people are saying that they are
22 against it, particularly in light of
23 the recent events and civil unrest that
24 we've seen take place, not just in our
25 City and state but across the nation

1 and the globe.

2 But what I find really
3 interesting is that around the same
4 time that we moved as it relates to our
5 demographic and Philadelphia became a
6 majority-minority city, all of a sudden
7 there was major concern about folks
8 talking about that we won't have the
9 ability to fill City positions with our
10 residents. Listen, I'm not accusing
11 anyone of anything. I'm just telling
12 you that when engaging in discussion
13 with my constituents about the bill in
14 front of us, that is an issue that was
15 raised. And if that's not the fact,
16 you tell me what is. And if that is
17 the fact, then we need to better
18 educate and train our constituency, and
19 then that's on Philadelphia. That's on
20 us as a city and we need to work with
21 that to get done.

22 Now, with that being said,
23 Rachel, will you please call the first
24 panel we have to testify this afternoon
25 on Bill No. 200363.

1 THE CLERK: Stephanie Tipton
2 and Mike Zaccagni.

3 MS. TIPTON: Good afternoon,
4 Councilmember Parker, Chair of the
5 Committee on Law and Government,
6 Councilmember Green, Vice-chair and
7 members of the Council of the Committee
8 on Law and Government as well as the
9 bill sponsors. My name is Stephanie
10 Tipton. I'm the Chief Administrative
11 Officer for the City of Philadelphia.
12 I'm joined by Mike Zaccagni, Director
13 of the Office of Human Resources.

14 We're here to provide
15 testimony on Bill No. 200363 and answer
16 any questions you might have. Along
17 with me today are representatives from
18 several operating departments as well.
19 For the sake of brevity given the
20 number of witnesses and the other bills
21 that we need to hear today, I'm going
22 to provide a summary of my written
23 testimony which all of you should have.

24 First, the Administration
25 does not oppose the intent of the bill.

1 We strongly believe that every effort
2 should be made to grow our own talent
3 and fill City jobs with City residents,
4 and we're doing that. Currently, we
5 have 85 percent of our civil service
6 applicants and hires residing here in
7 Philadelphia. We're also committed to
8 removing the residency waiver after
9 five years for police, fire and deputy
10 sheriffs in the next round of contract
11 negotiations. However, I also think
12 it's important for us to make the body
13 aware of some of the potential impacts,
14 the potential impacts the bill may have
15 on our recruitment and hiring efforts.

16 We're committed to working
17 collaboratively with Council to
18 realizing the intent of the bill while
19 also minimizing the impacts the bill
20 may have on any of our operations. So
21 that concludes my summary and I'm happy
22 to answer any questions. Mike and I
23 are both here as well as a few other
24 departments.

25 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank

1 you, Stephanie. Well, Mike will you
2 be -- I didn't you hear you, Steph.
3 Did you say that your testimony
4 represented both you and Mike and he's
5 just here to answer questions?

6 MS. TIPTON: Yup.

7 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay.

8 Thank you so very much. And I'm
9 looking in the chat box for any of my
10 colleagues who wish to be recognized.

11 Stephanie, help me if you
12 will. I just heard you say that nearly
13 85 percent of all civil service
14 positions are filled by City residents.
15 So if they say that another way, that
16 means that about 15 percent of all of
17 our civil service positions are filled
18 by nonresidents. Those are the
19 percentages. Tell me the number of
20 employees those percentages represent.

21 MS. TIPTON: Sure. If you
22 give me a second, I think Mike Zaccagni
23 just dropped off of Teams, so he has
24 some of the data. Unfortunately, his
25 computer just died.

1 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: While
2 we're waiting for that, let me just
3 acknowledge for the record that
4 Councilman Squilla and both
5 Councilmember Gym are present. I just
6 see that in the chat box and I just
7 want to make sure the Clerk has that
8 for the record.

9 MS. TIPTON: So what I'm
10 going to do is just shift over here.
11 There's Mike in the back --

12 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thanks,
13 Madam Chair.

14 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Yes,
15 Councilman Squilla?

16 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Just
17 thanking you for recognition.

18 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
19 you. Sure. No problem, sir.

20 Mike, we see you're back and
21 thank you guys for being socially
22 distanced.

23 MR. ZACCAGNI: I apologize
24 for this. I just started. My computer
25 died. Most of the data's on there.

1 But if we look at the overall numbers
2 for the City workforce which are
3 between 28,000 and 30,000, I'm
4 estimating this though in my head.
5 Obviously, we'd look at about if it's
6 15 percent, 10 would be 3, you're
7 looking at about 4500 people that would
8 be from outside the City.

9 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Tell me
10 if you can, Mike, what jobs or
11 departments would you say are most
12 filled by nonresidents.

13 MR. ZACCAGNI: I can probably
14 provide that information. But off the
15 top of my head, there's a lot of
16 smaller positions that this impacts,
17 things like graduate engineers that
18 have a high percentage. Quite frankly,
19 police officer recruit has a higher
20 percentage. We have a smaller number
21 of titles like airport operations
22 worker that has a very high percentage
23 because they have very, very detailed
24 background and requirements. So there
25 are a number of positions throughout

1 that have higher percentages. And then
2 you look at the others, obviously
3 labors have their carve-outs.
4 Correctional officers has a very small
5 percentage of numbers. I believe it
6 was around 6 percent. So when you look
7 at across the department -- we can
8 share some of these numbers with you,
9 Councilwoman. I apologize again for
10 the technology glitch that I just had,
11 but they vary as you look across
12 departments.

13 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Let me
14 ask you this: Why do you think that
15 the City sometimes is having difficulty
16 finding residents to fill its jobs?
17 And from my perspective, I want to know
18 do you think that this perhaps sort of
19 speaks to a larger systemic issue that
20 we are not adequately educating and
21 training our own constituency and
22 particularly, those who are in the
23 minority communities. So aside from
24 what we're talking about today via
25 residency, we can't go through this

1 issue without talking about the future
2 need to change Philadelphia's Rule of
3 Two, right.

4 Councilwoman Blondell
5 Reynolds Brown talked about that, and
6 that's something that we're not going
7 to give up hope on but we'll deal with
8 that at another time. Tell me what do
9 you think the barrier is about why
10 we're having difficulty finding
11 residents to fill these jobs with all
12 of the institutions of higher learning
13 that I just acknowledged, and excuse
14 me, CCP which is truly the City's
15 college, Community College of
16 Philadelphia, I did not mention CCP in
17 my opening. Tell me what you think the
18 difficulty is.

19 MR. ZACCAGNI: Councilwoman,
20 including my day job here, I've been in
21 adult education for over 30 years. And
22 actually teaching in a
23 return-to-learning program that is
24 predominantly focused on minority
25 individuals who are trying to get their

1 degree back. So, yes, we have a
2 challenge across the City of educating
3 our citizens and making sure that
4 education is a priority.

5 And when I say education, I
6 just don't mean college degree. I mean
7 any type of education. The CTE
8 programs in the schools, we just
9 actually changed the requirements for
10 all of our entry-level trades classes
11 so that those positions can qualify now
12 without having the six months
13 experience. So a high school student
14 coming out of an approved CTE program
15 qualifies for all of our entry-level
16 trades. I agree with you that this is
17 a longer term thing. We have to look
18 at this from an educational standpoint.
19 Unfortunately, that's sort of our
20 abilities with NHR or within the City
21 to be able to deal with that. But as I
22 said, I've been in education a long
23 time and these are systemic issues that
24 go across the board that we have to do
25 a better job on. I agree with you 100

1 percent on those.

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: So,
3 Stephanie and Mike, let me just say for
4 the record I appreciate your testimony
5 and the roles that both of you serve
6 for the Administration. I just want to
7 say to the viewing public that I don't
8 agree. I do not agree that the waiver
9 process -- and that's what I want
10 residents of the City to know, that if
11 there is any position that we have to
12 fill in the City of Philadelphia and
13 let's just say by chance that we could
14 not find anyone within the pool that
15 has City residency, the City has the
16 ability, there is a process in place
17 that the Administration can work with
18 the Civil Service Commission and they
19 can get a waiver, and they can get
20 waivers like candy if they wanted to.

21 I'm talking about they can
22 say we have -- remember, they just said
23 that there are about 4500 jobs and that
24 was just an estimate. Let's say 3500
25 to 4500 jobs in the City until they get

1 the actual numbers that are filled by
2 people 15 percent who are not residents
3 of the City of Philadelphia and if that
4 is the case and they needed to get
5 1,000 more waivers, there is a process
6 included already relative to waivers
7 that the City can employ. And if the
8 Administration thinks that they need a
9 process that is even more simple, I
10 mean if the existing waiver process
11 needs to be streamlined even more, that
12 is something that we can work on.

13 Right now I'm looking --

14 MS. TIPTON: Councilmember,
15 can I just -- I just want to --

16 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Sure.

17 MS. TIPTON: -- give
18 clarification. I think we recognize
19 the waiver process and we're thankful
20 there's a waiver process in place under
21 the ordinance. I think one of the
22 things that is a bit challenging is
23 sometimes we don't know at the time of
24 recruitment that a waiver might be
25 necessary. And so, we don't know what

1 the job market might look like or if
2 there's changing conditions. And so,
3 we may have to go through a full
4 recruitment and testing cycle before we
5 recognize that we don't have enough
6 people, we've exhausted a list and now
7 we may be in a position to request a
8 waiver. So I think we recognize that
9 there is a process in place and surely,
10 we will use it, if necessary. But I
11 think it's just important to understand
12 that that could cause a delay in the
13 overall time to hire and filling of
14 certain positions within departments.
15 So I appreciate that there's a waiver
16 process. I think it's important to
17 make sure the body understands that we
18 may not always know at the time that
19 we're starting to recruit and test for
20 a particular position.

21 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER:
22 Stephanie, listen, I really do
23 appreciate you clarifying that for the
24 record. But again, for the benefit of
25 the viewing public, I want you to know

1 that the City currently has a hiring
2 freeze for the foreseeable future and
3 we don't know how long that hiring
4 freeze will be in existence, especially
5 given not \$649 million but the \$749
6 million budget hold that we are working
7 right now in partnership with the
8 Administration to try to fill.

9 In addition to that for those
10 who are watching, note that if what you
11 just described, Stephanie, and I take
12 you at your word that sometimes you
13 just don't know, if what we need to do
14 is further streamline that waiver
15 process to make it even more simpler
16 for you when you just find out at the
17 last minute when we need to hire
18 someone immediately, I know I and many
19 of my colleagues here would be more
20 than happy to work with you all if
21 legislation would be required or if you
22 would be able to do that via Executive
23 Order just from the Administration.
24 But if that is what you needed to
25 streamline that waiver process, call on

1 us to help you. We want to do that,
2 but we want to ensure that
3 Philadelphians are incentivized and get
4 access to the ability to these self-
5 sustaining jobs.

6 Chair recognizes Councilman
7 Curtis Jones for questions.

8 COUNCILMAN JONES: Thank you,
9 Madam Chair. I really because of the
10 long agenda for today wanted to put
11 myself on mute for every other bill
12 other than mine just for brevity.
13 However, I feel compelled to ask the
14 question that Philadelphia is the only
15 city of the first class in the
16 Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, correct,
17 yes?

18 MS. TIPTON: Yes.

19 COUNCILMAN JONES: Other
20 municipalities that are smaller than us
21 have residency requirements, correct?

22 MS. TIPTON: I'm not aware of
23 the specific residency requirements.
24 They may be more similar to what we
25 have currently where you do have to

1 live in the City within a certain
2 period of time after being hired which
3 is currently the case here.

4 COUNCILMAN JONES: Well, I
5 would like to provide to the Chair the
6 surrounding eight counties and look at
7 those that have residency requirements
8 and then look at comparable job
9 classifications and ask them the
10 question of how they find talent in a
11 smaller population when we have 1.5
12 million people to choose from with
13 hundreds of education institutions,
14 from certifications, technical
15 institutions to schools of higher
16 learning, how they manage to do that
17 and we cannot.

18 The other thing that I would
19 say as a comment, Madam Chair,
20 particularly with police, it is not
21 allowed for police to serve in their
22 own district that they actually live
23 in. So if you live in the 4th
24 Councilmanic District, you can't live
25 in the 4th Councilmanic District. You

1 have to live in the 9th and vice versa.
2 So on my block there was a police
3 officer that would get off of work, and
4 I've never forgotten this, who lived on
5 my block and there were young people,
6 spirited young people, who often spoke
7 too loud, drank too much and did the
8 things that young people do. Whenever
9 she came home, all of that activity
10 stopped. Whenever she got out of her
11 car and in her partial uniform and her
12 service belt and all of her equipment,
13 all she had to do is glance across the
14 street and the climate on my block
15 changed. This is an important factor
16 in this legislation because all of the
17 bills that you see today are in some
18 way related and need to be kind of
19 packaged like they are.

20 So when you ride by a
21 situation, I don't know about you but,
22 Councilmember Parker, and others when
23 you're a District Councilperson when
24 you ride through somebody else's
25 District, you kind of care about that

1 problem they may not have, but you're
2 not reaching for the memo pad or the
3 iPhone to solve it because I don't live
4 here. That's their issue. Now,
5 At-large people don't get that.

6 I'm talking about when you
7 have a district, I know exactly when
8 I'm out of my district. When more
9 people live in the City of
10 Philadelphia, no matter what department
11 you have, whether you're in sanitation,
12 whether you're in policing, whether
13 you're in social work, no matter what
14 department, you take ownership because
15 the problem is yours. You can't drive
16 over to another county line and be done
17 with it.

18 Thank you, Madam Chair.

19 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
20 you. Thank you, Councilman Jones, and
21 your point is well-noted for the
22 record. Not only do we want to promote
23 residency, but it makes good economic
24 sense, right, to have those people
25 contributing to our tax base and

1 particularly, real estate taxes and
2 helping us to grow the economic pie.
3 So thank you.

4 Are there any comments or
5 questions from any other members of the
6 Committee for this panel?

7 (No response.)

8 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Hearing
9 none, I want to say thank you,
10 Stephanie and Mike, for your testimony.
11 We appreciate it a great deal.

12 There being known, Rachel,
13 will you please call the next panel to
14 testify on this bill.

15 THE CLERK: Bilal Qayyum,
16 Jihad Ali and Joann Bell.

17 MR. QAYYUM: Good afternoon.
18 My name is Bilal --

19 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Bilal,
20 Jihad and Joann, can I just hear the
21 three of you say something so we can
22 know that your audio is working.

23 MR. QAYYUM: Yes, this is
24 Bilal Qayyum.

25 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Jihad.

1 MR. ALI: Good afternoon,
2 Chairperson. This is Jihad Ali.

3 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Joann.
4 Okay. We'll give Ms. Bell
5 some time to get on. Lonnie, if you're
6 here and we have any more technical
7 difficulties, let's see what we can do
8 to get Ms. Bell connected.

9 With that being said, we'll
10 start with you, Bilal. If you can just
11 state your name for the record and
12 proceed with your testimony.

13 MR. QAYYUM: Good afternoon.
14 My name is Bilal Qayyum, President of
15 the Father's Day Rally Committee. I
16 would like to thank Councilwoman
17 Cherelle Parker and members of the Law
18 and Government Committee for holding
19 this hearing on Resolution No. 200363,
20 Civil Service Residency Requirement.

21 My testimony, Councilwoman,
22 will not be long. A lot of what was
23 said earlier, actually my good friend
24 Councilman Jones was actually making
25 some comments that I was going to make,

1 but I will say to the Councilmembers
2 and to the citizens of this City as a
3 citizen of the City, I feel insulted
4 that we're even having some of this
5 conversation with 1.5 or 1.6 million
6 Philadelphians, we can't find qualified
7 individuals out of our City. It's
8 almost an insult to me that that's even
9 part of the discussion. There is no
10 position in City government, and I've
11 worked in City government for 34 years,
12 that we can't find somebody in the City
13 of Philadelphia to fill. There are
14 talented people in all races in every
15 neighborhood in this City. If we do
16 the right outreach, we can find those
17 individuals.

18 So once again, I am totally
19 in favor of that, in order to work in
20 Philadelphia you should live in
21 Philadelphia. So I am totally in favor
22 of this bill. Also, I would like to
23 say that one of the things that we
24 don't like to talk about is always the
25 elephant in the room and that is White

1 institutional racism. For many years
2 in the City of Philadelphia,
3 particularly Black folks could not get
4 in some positions even though they were
5 qualified, not only qualified but
6 overqualified to work in City
7 government because of racism. I think
8 that we also and this time that we're
9 living in now, that has to be put on
10 the table when we talk about when we
11 hear this argument we can't find
12 workers. In some sense I'm hearing
13 that argument we can't find White
14 workers to work in positions, but we
15 have plenty of Black workers that they
16 don't open up the opportunities for
17 those individuals to have a shot to
18 fulfill these positions. So once
19 again, I am totally in favor of this
20 bill.

21 I hope that all Council will
22 support it and vote on it. It's past
23 due. And particularly, as it relates
24 to the police if you look at the last
25 police classes, most of them have been

1 White and a lot of them are
2 non-Philadelphians; they don't
3 understand Philadelphia, they don't
4 have the culture or the understanding
5 of our culture, the majority of people
6 in the City are people of color which
7 is creating some of the problems we're
8 seeing now in the City of Philadelphia.

9 I don't know who those
10 individuals were last week or the week
11 before last during the incidents in the
12 City, if they were Philadelphians or
13 non-Philadelphians, police officers
14 committing some of the acts they have
15 done. So I believe that this is on
16 time and we need to get behind this
17 fully and hopefully, once again that
18 Council will vote unanimously to pass
19 this bill, and thank you very much.

20 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
21 you, Bilal, for your testimony.

22 Jihad, will you state your
23 name for the record and proceed with
24 your testimony. And we'll close out
25 this panel with Ms. Joann Bell. I see

1 that she has joined us.

2 MR. ALI: I am Jihad Ali.

3 I'm providing testimony on Ordinance
4 200363, restoring the residency
5 requirements for civil service
6 including police officers. I am a
7 veteran and I m a retired Sergeant of
8 the Philadelphia Police Department. I
9 served from 1984 to 2001, and also my
10 daughter is an active duty police
11 officer. I think it's important that
12 this Council restores the Residency
13 Requirement, Section 20-101 of the
14 Philadelphia Code.

15 When Councilman Kenney who
16 was the original sponsor of the bill in
17 2008, when it was asked what was the
18 reason that we were doing that bill at
19 that time by Councilman -- Vice
20 Councilman Green at the time,
21 Councilman Jones, Goode, Councilwoman
22 Blackwell, the reason was given was
23 that it was to get the best and the
24 brightest for the job.

25 Councilman Goode in the

1 transcript at the time, Councilman
2 Goode and Councilman Jones along with
3 Blackwell asked several questions about
4 why is it that we can't get the best
5 and the brightest when it comes to the
6 Police Department, but the rest of the
7 City, we basically get 90 percent of
8 whatever is there. So at the time,
9 there was a lot of contention over this
10 bill. I became a police officer in
11 1984. I was four years out of the
12 Marine Corp. and I applied for the job,
13 but that was an error where we were
14 trying to have African-Americans
15 included in the ranks of the Police
16 Department.

17 You had before that time, we
18 used to have with the former Police
19 Commissioner Sylvester Johnson would
20 tell you, there were very little Blacks
21 on the department at that time,
22 African-Americans. So the thrust was
23 to get African-Americans on that job
24 and we really increased the job -- so
25 don't forget, we had the likes of

1 Willie Williams, Sr., Sylvester
2 Johnson, Alphonso Deal who went through
3 hell just to be a police officer. So
4 we started by getting the department
5 started reflecting more of the
6 diversity of the City and then all of a
7 sudden, this is after I got out, I got
8 out in 2001, in 2008 Councilman Kenney
9 at the time was the champion of this
10 bill. People on my side of the table
11 would argue that the reason was to
12 enlighten the Police Department because
13 we were saying at the time that it was
14 going to eliminate Philadelphians from
15 applying for the jobs, and that's what
16 gave us the advantage; being from
17 Philadelphia, we applied for the job.

18 One of the points that
19 Councilwoman Blackwell raised at the
20 time was that Council is there to look
21 out for the benefits and opportunities
22 for the people that elect them.
23 Unfortunately, what happens now is we
24 get people that will take the job, they
25 come in from the counties, they're like

1 an occupying force, they can't relate
2 to the people. And the counties
3 surrounding Philadelphia, it's possible
4 that you don't interact with an
5 African-American on a daily basis for
6 weeks at a time. So I think it's
7 important that we consider this in
8 light of the recent murder of George
9 Floyd and Rayshard Brooks. It's
10 appropriate that this Council
11 re-examine the policies and practices
12 and procedures that may result in rules
13 and regulations that were adopted years
14 ago that are eliminating us from the
15 very jobs that we seek to fill. So
16 thank you for allowing me to provide
17 testimony.

18 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
19 you so much for your testimony.

20 The Chair recognizes
21 Ms. Joann Bell. I know she's on now.
22 Ms. Bell, if you can just state your
23 name for the record and proceed with
24 your testimony.

25 Ms. Bell, you're muted.

1 Unmute yourself.

2 MS. BELL: Can you hear me
3 now?

4 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Yes, we
5 can hear you now. Thank you so very
6 much. State your name and please
7 proceed.

8 MS. BELL: Okay. My name is
9 Joann Bell, and I'm the co-convener of
10 Black Women's Leadership Council and
11 Organization representing an active
12 membership of over 500 women mostly
13 residing in Philadelphia (inaudible) as
14 cohosts of Black Women's Leadership
15 Council and we are streaming live. You
16 are on the live broadcast because we
17 are on radio today and we are on 900 am
18 and 96.1 and we're streaming across the
19 country, perhaps rural. So since 2000,
20 Black Women's Leadership Council has
21 been at the forefront of police reform.
22 We recognize that law enforcement works
23 hard, but we need the officers to see
24 the residents of Philadelphia as
25 people, and that people are sometimes

1 in distress. And we do not need an
2 occupying force. I agree with the
3 gentlemen before us.

4 We were extremely concerned
5 by the change in the residency rules.
6 I have lived in Philadelphia for many
7 years and I have worked with the Police
8 Department. I've worked with Willie
9 Williams and I remember when he came
10 into power and how he was treated and
11 how the officers tried to isolate him.
12 He was not able to bring up a command
13 structure that could support him.
14 We've seen the police dealing with the
15 insistent ravages of poverty and
16 discrimination and we believe that
17 there is a history here of implicit
18 bias and cultural insensitivity. And
19 it doesn't matter how much training you
20 give someone. It's that they have to
21 feel like they have a stake in the
22 City.

23 We want the officers to be
24 required to live in the City because no
25 city or municipality should be policed

1 by an outside occupying force who
2 develops a disdain for the people who
3 will pay their salary. No City
4 employee should enjoy salary and
5 benefits provided by taxpayers' base
6 that's struggling for decent schools
7 and clean streets and other public
8 accommodations without contributing to
9 that tax base. Officers who live in
10 the City have a stake in the City and
11 an overall outcome to a good policing.

12 Philadelphia residents will
13 view them as neighbors and not as
14 aggressors. Philadelphia is an ethnic
15 mosaic whose beauty can only be
16 enhanced by Committee peace officers,
17 and I emphasize peace officers who,
18 they, themselves view themselves as a
19 part of the community. And finally, I
20 want to say that I have two retired
21 police officers in my family, both
22 served Philadelphia and the
23 Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. They
24 serve with an understanding and a
25 compassion while living in the City and

1 raised educated children who went on to
2 become college graduates. Living in
3 the City was not an impediment to the
4 success of raising their children. I
5 thank you.

6 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
7 you. We want to say a special thank
8 you to Mr. Qayyum, Mr. Ali and Ms. Bell
9 for your testimony. And for affirming
10 what we have heard from residents
11 across the City of Philadelphia,
12 particularly in response to the civil
13 unrest and, that is, it makes good
14 commonsense and good economic sense for
15 the police policing Philadelphia to be
16 Philadelphians, very simply.

17 I do have to ask you for the
18 record though and, Ms. Bell, I want to
19 have both you and Mr. Qayyum answer
20 this question because both of you
21 acknowledge your familiarity with
22 employment in the City. We're talking
23 about this impacting not just the new
24 hiring of police officers in the City
25 of Philadelphia, but we're talking

1 about the entire City of Philadelphia,
2 a cohort of employees, we're talking
3 about 28,000 to 30,000.

4 What do you think about this
5 as it relates to positions that are
6 non-police related? Do you think it's
7 necessary from that perspective as
8 well? And, Mr. Qayyum and Ms. Bell,
9 can either one of you respond?

10 MS. BELL: I believe that all
11 City employees should live in the City.
12 I have a history in the background. I
13 was once the Vice-president of District
14 Council 47 so I represented an employee
15 organization. And I think the City
16 benefits because if you increase the
17 tax base, you have a stake in where you
18 live and I think it's important that if
19 you're going to enjoy the benefits, the
20 tax-based benefits, that you ought to
21 contribute to that and not just totally
22 by wage tax, by real estate tax, by
23 everything that you do. When you have
24 a stake in something, you want to see
25 it do better and you want to see it

1 grow. So I want all City employees
2 regardless of what level or where they
3 serve to live in the City of
4 Philadelphia. If I did it and could do
5 it, they could do it.

6 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER:
7 Mr. Qayyum.

8 MR. QAYYUM: Yes,
9 Councilwoman. I echo what Ms. Bell
10 just said and in my previous remark and
11 I'm serious about this, and Councilman
12 Jones said we have a city of 1.5, 1.6
13 million people. No way in the world
14 you can tell me that there is not
15 someone sitting in someone's house
16 given the opportunity, could perform
17 any position in the City of
18 Philadelphia, from elected officials to
19 appointed officials to every line item
20 in the City of Philadelphia where
21 there's workers. There's somebody in
22 this City if you give them the
23 opportunity should be hired and they
24 could perform the jobs, so I think
25 clearly that everyone who works in the

1 City of Philadelphia has to and should
2 be work -- and also, I want to make
3 this comment. I know this bill talks
4 about a person has to live in the City
5 for one year before they could apply
6 for a job and if they are successful in
7 that job, they have to live in the City
8 for at least five years because of
9 collective bargaining.

10 I think the City really has
11 to challenge that Collective Bargaining
12 Agreement. When they go into a
13 collective agreement, they need to
14 challenge that. I think that once you
15 get a job in the City of Philadelphia,
16 you should work in the City of
17 Philadelphia until you die. I'm very
18 clear on that. I very strongly believe
19 that we could do this as a city. We
20 have very talented people in this City,
21 in all neighborhoods, in all ethnic
22 groups. So I believe strongly that we
23 need to have people working in Philly
24 living in Philly. Thank you.

25 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank

1 you so much.

2 Are there any other questions
3 or comments from members of the
4 Committee?

5 (No response.)

6 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: There
7 being none, Rachel, will you please
8 call the next panel to testify on this
9 bill.

10 And thank you, Mr. Qayyum, Mr
11 Ali and Ms. Bell.

12 MS. BELL: Thank you.

13 MR. ALI: Thank you.

14 THE CLERK: The next panel is
15 Cathy Scott.

16 MS. SCOTT: Good afternoon,
17 Chair Parker. I appreciate the
18 opportunity to testify.

19 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
20 you so much, Ms. Scott. You are
21 connected. Just please state your name
22 for the record and proceed with your
23 testimony.

24 MS. SCOTT: Well, my name is
25 Catherine Scott. I'm President of

1 AFSCME District Council 47, and I did
2 submit written testimony however. I'd
3 like to -- you have that on the record
4 for the record. I just wanted to
5 respond to some of the issues that have
6 been raised, which I think are very
7 legitimate questions. I just want to
8 let people know that AFSCME District
9 Council 47 Local 2186 and 2187
10 represents members and job
11 classifications, some of which have
12 extremely unique and hard-to-find
13 positions.

14 The other part of the problem
15 and I have heard people testify that
16 there is no job that someone who lives
17 in the City of Philadelphia could not
18 fill. I want to start off also by
19 saying I absolutely support residency
20 for people who work in the City of
21 Philadelphia. However, there are not
22 29,000 civil service employees. That
23 29,000 employees of the City of
24 Philadelphia include exempt employees
25 that do not have a residency

1 requirement. And right now the
2 stringency for hiring people who are
3 civil service, they have the most
4 stringent requirements for being
5 employed by the City and rightly so,
6 because they provide the citizens of
7 the City with the basic services that
8 need to be provided but we have
9 pathologists, we have medical
10 specialists, we have pharmacists, other
11 positions that we represent and I'm
12 going to focus a little on just one
13 which is librarian.

14 There is only one school,
15 Drexel University, that offers a
16 Master's in Library Science for someone
17 to become a librarian which is a
18 requirement to be a librarian in the
19 City of Philadelphia. We had a
20 program -- so the library has to
21 recruit from outside the City because
22 there are not enough graduates from
23 Drexel to provide for librarians in the
24 City. We had a program -- we were
25 concerned about diversity, so we tried

1 to work with the library to get more
2 people who work in the library to get
3 their Bachelor's degree to go to
4 Community College, get their Bachelor's
5 degree and promote them to being
6 librarians. The library had a grant
7 for that. We had some people very
8 successfully complete the program and
9 then the money dried up.

10 And so, instead of investing
11 in people who work for the library and
12 get them their Master's Degree, there
13 wasn't the financial support there to
14 be able to continue to do that. So we
15 support promoting education and degrees
16 and the opportunity for people to be
17 able to be residents of the City of
18 Philadelphia and to hold those jobs and
19 be taxpayers and all of the things that
20 you are talking about. I do want to
21 point out, however, the City has a
22 freeze, but the contractors that they
23 contract with are hiring. They don't
24 have a freeze. So you have contracted
25 agencies that are presently hiring to

1 do work that would be done by civil
2 service employees. Contractors do not
3 have a residency requirement. There is
4 no residency requirement for exempt
5 employees.

6 So I would suggest that, yes,
7 there is a possibility for a waiver.
8 There are many waivers for the
9 positions of the classes for members of
10 ours that are in those
11 difficult-to-fill positions, but I
12 think that Council should also think
13 about a residency requirement for
14 contractors who work in the City of
15 Philadelphia. The City pays their
16 wages. They pay their benefits under
17 these contracts and I think that this
18 is something that the City should also
19 consider because you don't want the
20 unintended consequence of civil service
21 employees, those positions not being
22 filled and then the City says, oh, we
23 can't fill it, we're contracting out
24 the work and then you have people
25 living in New Jersey or any place else,

1 Delaware, who are coming into the City
2 and providing those services.

3 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
4 you so very much, Ms. Scott. Does that
5 conclude your testimony?

6 MS. SCOTT: It does, yes.
7 Thank you.

8 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: So,
9 one, let me just state for the record
10 that you noted when you opened up that
11 you submitted written testimony. Our
12 office has not received a copy of your
13 written testimony. So if there is
14 someone from your staff who can forward
15 that testimony to Rachel Meadows, who
16 is now the Clerk for this Committee, we
17 can forward that written testimony to
18 all members of the Committee. We'll
19 also forward it to all members of
20 Council, so thank you so very much
21 because we don't have that.

22 In addition to that,
23 Stephanie, we want you to know that we
24 see your note that you want to provide
25 a point of clarification following the

1 last witness's testimony, and we will
2 get to you as soon as we are finished
3 questioning Ms. Scott.

4 So, one, for the benefit of
5 the people who are listening, you just
6 heard Cathy Scott mention exempt
7 employees. You should note for the
8 record, and again this is the benefit
9 of the viewing public, that all exempt
10 employees have to be residents of the
11 City of Philadelphia, all exempt
12 employees have to be residents of the
13 City of Philadelphia.

14 Now, Ms. Scott, as I ask my
15 first question of you, I must state for
16 the record when you mentioned Drexel
17 University and you mentioned library
18 sciences, Councilwoman Augusta Clark
19 who was an attorney but also had a
20 Master's Degree in Library Sciences
21 from Drexel University, I sort of heard
22 her echoing the importance of this
23 industry. But you would not state for
24 the record that the waiver process that
25 the City currently has in existence,

1 that even if Drexel is the only
2 institution in our area, institution of
3 higher learning in our area that offers
4 a Master's in Library Services, there
5 are no other institutions that do offer
6 this program and have we as a City ever
7 attempted to work with any of those
8 other institutions that we have in our
9 area, including Lincoln and Cheyney
10 University to talk about that path?
11 And let me ask you this: Is a Master's
12 of Library Science the standard
13 operating requirement for library
14 associations or affiliated
15 organizations across the nation? We
16 just worked with them as it related to
17 the City doing away with all fines and
18 fees relative to the library, so I want
19 you to answer both of those questions.

20 MS. SCOTT: A Master's in
21 Library Science is to my knowledge
22 required as the minimum for it being a
23 librarian for public service.

24 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay.
25 Do you know since you are obviously --

1 you mentioned 2186 and 2187, do you
2 know whether or not the City has worked
3 to establish a pool to work with
4 institutions of higher learning, a plan
5 to work with Historically Black
6 Colleges? You mentioned a program with
7 CCP. Do you know of any additional
8 efforts that the City has put forward
9 in order to recruit people for those
10 library roles?

11 MS. SCOTT: I do not know of
12 any attempt by the City to develop
13 additional programs in the City of
14 Philadelphia. The closest Master's in
15 Library Science that I know of behind
16 Drexel is Clarion University in
17 Pennsylvania. But frankly beyond that,
18 most of them are outside of state. The
19 present waiver system for librarians is
20 one year. And so, they have a year
21 after they are hired by the City to
22 move into the City, so that is a waiver
23 that does exist. I'm just saying that
24 there are a lot of waivers in civil
25 service in the City of Philadelphia

1 because of the difficulty in getting
2 people in some job classifications.

3 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: So you
4 mentioned one in librarians. But when
5 you mentioned pharmacy and
6 pathologists, I have a very difficult
7 time with those two industries in
8 particular in thinking that there's a
9 difficult time to recruit if we've
10 established some sort of systemic
11 process or feeders with institutions of
12 higher learning in our region.

13 In addition to that let me
14 just say again for the record, exempt
15 employees don't have to be residents
16 for a year before working, but they do
17 however have to live in the City six
18 months after beginning to work for the
19 City. So let's make sure we clarify
20 that for the record. Let me ask you a
21 few questions for the benefit of the
22 public who may not know what DC 47 is.

23 And help me here, DC 47 is
24 often referred to as the White Collar
25 union as compared to District Council

1 33 which is referred to as the Blue
2 Collar union. I want you to, if you
3 can, walk me through how many members
4 you currently have in District Council
5 47, and then tell us how many of
6 those -- give me the demographic, the
7 racial demographic of that membership.

8 MS. SCOTT: Presently, Local
9 2186 which is the first level
10 supervisors in the City of Philadelphia
11 has around 1,050 members, all civil
12 service. Local 2187 that represents
13 the professional employees of the City,
14 I know it's referred to as the White
15 Collar union. It's -- but the only
16 classifications are professional
17 employees, and there are approximately
18 2400 people in Local 218 -- employees
19 of the City in Local 2187. This would
20 be off the top of my head, but I would
21 say that the demographics is majority
22 women in Local 2187.

23 I think that the majority is
24 around 65 percent women, 35 percent
25 men. I believe that the racial

1 breakdown is around 60 percent
2 African-Ameri -- people of color in
3 Local 2187 and around 40 percent White.

4 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay.
5 So just for the benefit of the viewing
6 public, I want you to say this simply
7 for me. What's the total amount of
8 membership in District Council 47 when
9 you're talking to people about how many
10 City workers you represent, what number
11 do you use?

12 MS. SCOTT: Around 3500.

13 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: So you
14 use that there are 3500 members in
15 total that you represent in DC 47?

16 MS. SCOTT: No. We have
17 eight Locals in District Council 47.
18 Two of them represent employees of the
19 City of Philadelphia. And of those two
20 Locals, they represent more than the
21 City of Philadelphia. They have
22 Parking Authority members. They have
23 Housing Authority members, First
24 Judicial District. So I'm only talking
25 about the civil service employees in

1 those Locals is around 3500.

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: That's
3 3500. But I'm asking you for the
4 benefit of the viewing public and my
5 colleagues when you're talking about
6 representing District Council 47
7 overall with all of those different
8 employees who work for different
9 agencies that you referenced, what's
10 the total number?

11 MS. SCOTT: Around 6300.

12 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay,
13 around 6300. And because we're trying
14 to give the public a snapshot of what
15 District Council 47's membership looks
16 like just across the board, when you
17 look at that demographic, what does
18 that look like as it relates to race?

19 MS. SCOTT: Entirely for
20 District Council 47?

21 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Yes.

22 MS. SCOTT: I would say 70 to
23 75 percent African-American and 25
24 percent other.

25 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay.

1 I thank you for putting that on the
2 record because that helps us get some
3 context about this. And the reason why
4 for me is because I'm struggling to
5 understand that as our City has gotten
6 more diverse and we are a
7 majority-minority city, particularly
8 when you talk about and I want to be
9 very specific, the pathologists, the
10 pharmacists and the librarians, they
11 continue to be positions that people
12 have come to -- and believe me, I'm
13 Chair of City Council's Committee on
14 Labor and Civil Service so I'm the one
15 who gets the letters from folks saying
16 that there is not enough diversity in
17 those areas. How is it more difficult
18 to hire from the populous and what is
19 the challenge with us seeming to find
20 more diversity as it relates to those
21 positions, particularly those that you
22 described as being very hard to fill?

23 MS. SCOTT: Well, I don't
24 think that there's enough money that is
25 devoted to education with the City in

1 trying to promote high school graduates
2 to go into colleges that are in the
3 City to get these kinds of degrees.

4 These are very expensive degrees to get
5 because most of them -- all of them
6 that you just mentioned require
7 post-secondary education.

8 Pathologists, for example, have many
9 years of post-graduate school beyond
10 getting their medical degree, so I
11 think that there needs to be more
12 emphasis in supporting minorities and
13 women going into these positions
14 because it's extremely difficult for
15 them to have the money to put into
16 getting these educations. They have to
17 rely on scholarships, and I think that
18 the City can provide more scholarships
19 for people who are interested in going
20 into those fields. We have a --

21 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: I thank
22 you for your response and I really do
23 appreciate it. And the reason why I
24 say it is because I appreciate you
25 acknowledging that overall District

1 Council 47 is a majority-minority
2 union, its membership is. Is that
3 accurate according to the demographic
4 you just said?

5 MS. SCOTT: Yes, that's
6 correct.

7 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: So
8 District Council 47 is a
9 majority-minority union, and you have
10 the great honor and privilege as
11 serving as the leader of a
12 majority-minority union. And when we
13 look at a union like District Council
14 33 that is also majority-minority,
15 their members are frontline workers.
16 They are paid less on a whole when you
17 compare what they're paid to DC 47
18 workers, and also it's still currently
19 the law right now for any DC 33 worker
20 to be a resident of Philadelphia for a
21 year before working for the City, so
22 I'm trying to understand why District
23 Council 33 has no trouble recruiting
24 workers under the parameters of the
25 law, but even with the waiver process

1 that DC 47 is saying that it is having
2 trouble. I mean, the flexibility, and
3 I understand what you're saying, when
4 you look at the pool of those who have
5 a Master's Degree in Library Sciences,
6 and Drexel University according to your
7 testimony is the only institution that
8 offers that degree and you mentioned
9 pathologists and pharmacists, that it's
10 very hard. But with the waiver in
11 existence if we needed to recruit
12 people and for that, we could just use
13 the waiver process. Tell me why you
14 think it's still a problem.

15 MS. SCOTT: Well, the waiver
16 pro -- my reading of this amendment was
17 that it was going to make it more
18 difficult to have the waiver process.
19 I understand that there is a waiver
20 process in the City Charter. But if
21 you're basically doing a one-year
22 requirement, I think many people will
23 look at that and say, well, I'm not a
24 resident for a year. I might as well
25 not apply.

1 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: I --

2 MS. SCOTT: People look at
3 applications online. There isn't
4 anything that says online other than
5 you have to be a resident of the City
6 of Philadelphia for one year. People
7 living outside the City who look at
8 that will say, well, there's no point
9 in me even applying because I'm not
10 going to be considered. Where we do
11 have a process, it's just that I think
12 as Mike Zaccagni was mentioning earlier
13 where, yes, there is a process and,
14 yes, it can work but that doesn't mean
15 that everybody is aware of that.

16 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Let me
17 just note for the record that the
18 waiver process we noted for the record
19 is adequate and it addresses the need
20 for us to work towards getting people
21 to those hard-to-fill job vacancies
22 that require a special skill or an
23 expertise that we don't believe is
24 available in the City. I want to thank
25 you so very much --

1 MS. SCOTT: Could I also add,
2 Councilwoman, that there are some
3 waivers for District Council 33
4 positions.

5 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: And
6 listen, if they have acquired some
7 waivers, that is why. I thank you for
8 acknowledging that. Although their
9 employees are currently -- the law for
10 any DC 33 workers, that they have
11 residents of Philadelphia for a year
12 before working for the City, but even
13 there you acknowledged that if they
14 needed a waiver to sort of, you know,
15 usurp the guidelines, even you just
16 acknowledging that there's some 33
17 employees who have had to request
18 waivers, you make my point. That if we
19 need to use the waiver process, it is
20 available. So --

21 MS. SCOTT: Actually, the
22 requirement is only for laborers in the
23 Charter.

24 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: It's
25 for laborers, and all of the laborers

1 are members of District Council 33.

2 MS. SCOTT: They are, but
3 there are a lot more people beyond
4 laborers that work for District Council
5 33 or that are represented by District
6 Council 33.

7 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The
8 point that we make is that when a
9 waiver process has been needed and it
10 needed to be accessed, the waiver
11 process has been able to be accessed so
12 it's more than adequate to help fill
13 those positions that we say are hard to
14 fill.

15 Let me just state for the
16 record before I move on to my next
17 colleague, that when people talk about
18 more broadly how this is a bad policy,
19 I want us to keep in mind the following
20 facts: We're talking about
21 Philadelphia being the largest poorest
22 city in America; we're a
23 majority-minority city and we've been
24 talking about for years how about we
25 need to get our own residents in good

1 family-sustaining jobs and this is a
2 vehicle to do such.

3 Do we have any other
4 colleagues who are interested in posing
5 any questions or comments to members on
6 this panel?

7 (No response.)

8 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Hearing
9 none thank you, Ms. Scott, for your
10 testimony. We will also note that
11 there is other testimony that has been
12 provided that we will give to the
13 stenographer to put on the record.

14 Rachel, can you please call
15 the next panel to testify on the bill.

16 And, Stephanie --

17 MS. TIPTON: Yes, sorry.

18 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: When
19 Rachel calls the next panel to come up,
20 once they get up, just make sure you
21 speak first. So, Rachel, just call
22 them.

23 MS. TIPTON: Thank you.

24 THE CLERK: There is no other
25 panel on this bill.

1 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: All of
2 the written testimony that we have is
3 one from the Committee of Seventy, the
4 other is from Chuck McQuilkin who is
5 the Vice-president of IAFF Local 22.

6 Stephanie, please provide the
7 clarity to the record that you
8 acknowledged earlier.

9 MS. TIPTON: Sure. Well,
10 Chairwoman, you actually took my one
11 point of clarification which I
12 appreciated, that the residency
13 requirements for exempts are the same
14 for civil service employees so we do
15 have to live in the City within six
16 months of hire. I also think you
17 raised a really great point about
18 HBCUs. The surrounding HBCUs, we've
19 done a number of recruitment efforts to
20 those surrounding colleges and
21 universities. I will note, though,
22 unless they are a resident of
23 Philadelphia or have some tie to
24 Philadelphia where they plan to move
25 in, unless they're applying for a

1 position that does have a waiver, we
2 may be unable to kind of recruit them
3 into some of the positions in civil
4 service that might require the one-year
5 residency. And I also just wanted to
6 note that there are HBCUs that do offer
7 the Master's of Library Science Degree,
8 so part of our recruitment efforts will
9 be focused on those schools as well.

10 Again, as long as we do have
11 the waiver for the librarians, I think
12 we can certainly explore other colleges
13 and universities that offer that
14 degree, so I just wanted to make those
15 points for the record.

16 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
17 you, Stephanie. I appreciate you
18 clarifying that for the record.

19 And I want to say again for
20 the benefit of the listening audience,
21 I am a proud graduate of Lincoln
22 University. It's the first
23 Historically Black degree-granting
24 institution of higher learning in the
25 nation. I am also a certified

1 Secondary English teacher by
2 profession. My undergraduate degree is
3 in English and Education.

4 Councilman Curtis Jones, I
5 was about 30 seconds away from moving
6 to PG County in Maryland, because
7 during our sophomore and junior years
8 the Education Department in PG County
9 practically took up residence on the
10 campus of Lincoln University. So when
11 people often say, wow, there's surely a
12 whole lot of educators who graduated
13 from Lincoln University that are not
14 from Maryland, a lot of people from
15 Philadelphia, from Jersey, from New
16 York who moved to Maryland to teach in
17 PG County.

18 And when people ask me,
19 Cherelle, how do you explain that, why
20 aren't they teaching in Philadelphia?
21 I often say to people, that is because
22 PG County put the time, energy and
23 resources and spent them on Lincoln's
24 campus when we were in our sophomore
25 and junior years. So by the time we

1 needed to make the decision, we were
2 well-prepared and working through those
3 residency issues. So thank you,
4 Stephanie, so very much.

5 Is there anyone else here to
6 testify on the bill whose name that has
7 not been called?

8 (No response.)

9 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Hearing
10 none, Rachel, will you please call the
11 first panel we have to testify this
12 afternoon on Bill No. 200367 and
13 Resolution No. 200377.

14 THE CLERK: Vanessa Garrett
15 Harley and Hans Menos.

16 COUNCILMAN JONES: Madam
17 Chair?

18 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Yes,
19 Councilman Jones.

20 COUNCILMAN JONES: Can I be
21 recognized before the panel?

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Sure,
23 Councilman Jones.

24 COUNCILMAN JONES: First of
25 all, thank you, Madam Chair and members

1 of the Committee. Those who are here
2 to testify, thank you for your
3 patience. Those who are listening on
4 the radio and also on Channel 64, thank
5 you for paying attention.

6 Before I say what I have to
7 say, I want to state for the record
8 that 99 percent of Philadelphia police
9 officers protect and serve to the
10 standard that we want to hold them to.
11 So this Commission is pretty much for
12 the 1 percent that do not. I say that
13 in knowledge of those individuals who
14 graduate out of our training academy.
15 I go every year thanks to Sheriff Bilal
16 go to a Steer Straight program to talk
17 to those recruits, to talk to them
18 about being a Philadelphian, being an
19 African-American and some of the things
20 that they should be prepared for and
21 watch out for. So the Citizens Police
22 Oversight Commission represented in
23 Bill No. 200367 and Resolution No.
24 200377 is not an attack on them. This
25 ballot measure is an amendment to the

1 Philadelphia Home Rule Charter. It is
2 aiming for a November election to be
3 ratified by the City and its citizens.

4 This new Commission will add
5 to the City's list of independent
6 Commissions like the Zoning Commission
7 and the Ethics Board and other
8 Commissions that do not have to worry
9 about where their funding is coming
10 from, do not have to worry about if the
11 boss, whoever they may be, doesn't like
12 independent decisions, that they don't
13 have to fear for their jobs and the
14 future of their Commission. It's also
15 going to be allowed, the City of
16 Philadelphia's City Council to
17 determine things like who should be on
18 that Commission, what is the
19 eligibility for members to be on that
20 Commission, inclusive but not limited
21 to having certain powers such as
22 subpoena powers, such as the ability to
23 force or encourage people to testify,
24 to be able to look at certain
25 confidential or semi-confidential

1 records to be able to determine the
2 history of individuals. This mission
3 for this Commission is to improve
4 policing in the City of Philadelphia to
5 encourage certain behaviors and hold
6 them to a higher standard and as
7 importantly, to respond to citizens'
8 complaints in a timely manner and be
9 able to have them feel confident that
10 they will be listened to and those
11 issues will be resolved.

12 The Commission will succeed
13 the current Commission, but will be an
14 orderly, I hope, transition because
15 there are good works that have been
16 done by that Commission. Just by way
17 of background, the first Executive
18 Order that created a Commission was
19 done in 1993 I believe by the Rendell
20 Administration. It was carried through
21 with the Nutter Administration for
22 eight years, but it was an Executive
23 Order that did not have predictable
24 funding, that could not be funded to
25 its appropriate level. In some cases,

1 there was a two-year wait before the
2 time that someone submitted a complaint
3 until there was a resolution. So I
4 want to thank the President's office,
5 President Darrell Clarke, for being
6 bold before any pandemic, before any
7 protest, before any of that to pay
8 attention to this Commission and move
9 it to the position that we see
10 ourselves today, and make sure that it
11 adds predictable funding. That is
12 something that our President insisted
13 on.

14 So I just want to point out
15 that a lot of people out there in the
16 public probably believe that when
17 you're an elected official, you get a
18 get-out-of-jail-free card, that you
19 don't have to submit to some of the
20 things that -- I will only remind you
21 of former State Representative Jewel
22 Williams being in the back of the
23 police car handcuffed from the back in
24 an embarrassing position because he
25 walked up and questioned a stop that

1 was in his district. I will remind you
2 of my father who was at the Reading
3 Terminal and he was shopping at a meat
4 counter and he had filled up his bag
5 and a gentleman who was a White
6 gentleman came up and picked up his bag
7 and started walking away. He was a
8 senior citizen. To a degree, my father
9 thought it was funny because he
10 couldn't run. And when the young man
11 or the gentleman started running for
12 the police, the police automatically
13 came over and looked at the situation
14 and figured it was my father. This is
15 not something I read about. This is
16 something that I lived through.

17 In addition, I can tell you
18 about my first car ride while
19 African-American. I chronicled the
20 fact that I bought a hooptie and was
21 pulled over and summarily embarrassed
22 about that. I won't reiterate that. I
23 can talk about my daughter who at
24 4:00 a.m. was on the front page of the
25 Daily News, got her door kicked in and

1 it shouldn't require you being the
2 relative of an elected official for you
3 to get courtesy, for you to get treated
4 with dignity and respect as a taxpayer.
5 It should not be justice by zip code,
6 because if I'm in Chestnut Hill,
7 there's a whole different response to
8 policing than in Southwest
9 Philadelphia.

10 I also wanted to say that
11 State Representative Morgan B. Cephas
12 used to work with us in my office and
13 she called me one morning in a panic
14 talking about her sister who was coming
15 home and was approached by an off-duty
16 police officer. He was trying to make
17 advances. She refused those advances.
18 And long story short, she was put in
19 the back of the police vehicle for over
20 12 hours in 90 degree heat until we
21 found her. These are not things that
22 are national. These are things that
23 are local. So it adds to all of the
24 frustration that you see nationally.
25 It's almost like that clarifying moment

1 during MeToo or when women across this
2 nation start saying to themselves, that
3 happened to you as well, oh, it
4 happened to me over here and there was
5 a sea change that happened in behavior
6 because of it. But we're at that point
7 in time again, and we need to carpe
8 diem, seize the moment and make
9 appropriate changes so that the
10 citizens of Philadelphia, Commonwealth
11 of Pennsylvania and around the world
12 have a degree of confidence that they
13 are respected as taxpayers and treated
14 as citizens of this country with
15 dignity and respect.

16 Thank you, Madam Chair.

17 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
18 you, Councilman Jones.

19 Chair recognizes Councilwoman
20 Helen Gym.

21 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you
22 very much, Madam Chair.

23 I'm going to make a very
24 brief comment in lieu of questions
25 because I know we are tight on time for

1 our Committee. First off all, I want
2 to thank the Council's sponsor for this
3 important piece of legislation, for my
4 colleague Curtis Jones for being so
5 dedicated to this issue for so long,
6 but also to our testifiers, especially
7 to Mr. Menos, that what is before us is
8 an opportunity to recreate an entity
9 that you have led over a period of
10 time, and what I am going to be
11 listening for and hopeful for is that
12 we have a chance to do something big,
13 to do something new and to learn
14 lessons from the past.

15 This original Advisory
16 Commission was created by a Mayor's
17 Executive Order. It had certain
18 responsibilities and also some
19 limitations. And so, as Council
20 considers the recreation of this entity
21 that has been in existence for a while,
22 I hope that what we have a chance to do
23 and what we're setting out to do is to
24 learn our lessons and to do something
25 bigger than what we have done, to

1 understand what we are constrained by
2 before so we do not have to be
3 constrained by those things, and then
4 to be really responsible in responses.

5 So I will not be asking any
6 questions. I look forward to moving
7 forward on this because this
8 legislation is necessary in order for
9 us to even open up the possibilities of
10 what we can do in the future. But this
11 is an important moment, and I want us
12 to take it as being something that in
13 which everything is possible for us
14 right now and that whatever limitations
15 that we had, we must know what they are
16 so that we can correct anything that
17 was wrong before and that we can do so
18 much better both by the people who are
19 in our employment but also more
20 importantly, for the public that we
21 serve.

22 Thank you so much, Madam
23 Chair. And thank you to our Council
24 sponsors.

25 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank

1 you, Councilwoman Gym.

2 The Chair recognizes
3 Councilwoman Bass.

4 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Thank
5 you, Madam Chair.

6 I just wanted to go on record
7 on this bill and I don't feel like I
8 need to say a whole lot. There's been
9 a lot that's been said in terms of the
10 support for the bill. But I just
11 wanted to say for me this is very, very
12 simple. If you want to serve the
13 citizens of Philadelphia, I do not
14 think that it is too much to ask that
15 you live in the City of Philadelphia
16 and that this is something that is
17 quite simple and quite easy for me.

18 If you want to be of service
19 of Philadelphians, we are asking that
20 you make a commitment to live in
21 Philadelphia. And if that is too much,
22 then we should find people who are
23 willing to make that commitment. So I
24 just wanted to really be on record and
25 state that.

1 Thank you, Madam Chair.

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
3 you, Councilwoman Bass.

4 Chair recognizes
5 Councilmember Green.

6 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you,
7 Madam Chair.

8 Thank you, Councilmember
9 Jones, Councilmember Gym, and obviously
10 the commentary regarding this
11 legislation, the work we're doing here
12 today in this regard. For me, I think
13 I've given the story and the
14 perspective to colleagues and others of
15 how I once was actually racially
16 profiled while leaving the DA's Office,
17 and I think we need to have this type
18 of level of accountability. It's
19 important we have this, not only for
20 individuals around the City but also
21 the police. I am the nephew of two
22 police officers, one who went off to
23 glory, another who's retired and went
24 back to the family farm. So I've grown
25 up with that perspective.

1 I've also grown up with the
2 perspective of being an African-
3 American right here in the City of
4 Philadelphia. And the other challenge
5 I have is I have a young son who is a
6 teenager who is on the autism spectrum.
7 So for when we have conversations like
8 the talk, it's even more challenging
9 for me when I have a son who can't
10 necessarily communicate like others can
11 if he gets into a situation when he is
12 out in the City of Philadelphia. And
13 so, we have a specific card in his
14 bookbag that says my son's name, our
15 contact information and how to
16 communicate with him. So I always have
17 this challenge of having relatives who
18 have been police officers, but also the
19 concern and challenge that I have a son
20 that if he happens to go into his bag
21 as we've instructed him to do, to get
22 out his card because he can't really
23 communicate like others, what may
24 happen. And we've had that
25 conversation, my wife and I. We've had

1 it with other parents who have had
2 children on the autism spectrum,
3 especially to have Black men on the
4 autism spectrum. So this is an
5 important conversation. It's an
6 important time to have this
7 conversation and I'm glad we're having
8 this now.

9 Thank you, Madam Chair.

10 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
11 you, Councilmember Green.

12 Rachel, will you call the
13 first panel because I see --

14 THE CLERK: Vanessa Garrett
15 Harley and Hans Menos.

16 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay.
17 I see both Vanessa and Hans. Thank
18 you. Good afternoon. You are
19 connected. Please state your name for
20 the record.

21 And, Vanessa, we can start
22 with you. Feel free to start with your
23 testimony.

24 MS. GARRETT HARLEY: Thank
25 you. Vanessa Garrett Harley. Good

1 afternoon, Chairperson Parker and
2 Vice-chair Councilman Green and members
3 of the Committee on Law and Government.
4 I'm Vanessa Garrett Harley, the Deputy
5 Managing Director for Criminal Justice
6 and Public Safety. Thank you for the
7 opportunity to testify today in support
8 of Bill No. 200367 and Resolution No.
9 200377, that seek to amend the
10 Philadelphia Home Rule Charter for the
11 creation of the Citizens Police
12 Oversight Commission, and authorizes
13 the City Council to determine its
14 compositions, powers and duties. If
15 this measure is approved by City
16 Council, a ballot question would be
17 presented to the City voters in the
18 November 2020 election. Thank you for
19 the opportunity to speak with you all
20 this afternoon.

21 As a city and as a country,
22 we're still reeling from the heinous
23 murder of George Floyd in Minneapolis
24 and now we have to wrap our hearts and
25 minds around the tragic shooting of

1 Rayshard Brooks in Atlanta, a police
2 officer-involved shooting is still
3 under investigation. There have been
4 many other controversial cases just
5 like these, which we all fuel the
6 overwhelming number of peaceful
7 protests we see on our streets and
8 across the country. Police violence
9 and misconduct are among several urgent
10 challenges we are battling against
11 simultaneously. Of course, we continue
12 to tackle the COVID-19 pandemic, along
13 with the rising number of shootings and
14 homicides in our City. All these
15 issues have disproportionate impacts on
16 people of color, particularly Black
17 people and highlight the long road to
18 recovery, justice and equality as we
19 unpack the decades-long frustration
20 brought on by systemic racism.

21 We simply cannot squander
22 this opportunity for change. We cannot
23 shy away from this turning point in
24 history. Our residents continue to
25 show courage and resolve in their call

1 for reform. And we in the
2 Administration remain firm in our
3 commitment to meet and exceed those
4 expectations. That is why the
5 Administration supports strengthening
6 the Police Advisory Commission by
7 incorporating it into the Citizens
8 Police Oversight Commission, thus
9 creating an even stronger entity,
10 expanding this body's ability to
11 analyze the policies and practices of
12 the Philadelphia Police Department is
13 another critical step towards us
14 rebuilding trust between law
15 enforcement and communities of color.

16 The creation of the Citizens
17 Police Oversight Commission will
18 further our ability to improve the
19 conduct of officers, boost the quality
20 of internal investigations examining
21 all alleged misconduct, and increase
22 transparency allowing for greater
23 communication between the community and
24 police. This move underscores our
25 shared belief that cities are at the

1 forefront of change and must be the
2 driving forces of reform, especially
3 given the absence of leadership at the
4 federal level.

5 As you know, just last week I
6 spoke before Council discussing the
7 Administration's ongoing work in
8 strengthening police accountability
9 while calling for an end to the
10 unconstitutional practice of stop and
11 frisk. We also outlined how in 2019
12 officers conducted fewer pedestrian
13 stop and frisks of individuals in the
14 City of Philadelphia than during any
15 other year since 2015. This program
16 was also in the Philadelphia Police
17 Department's wide range of efforts to
18 re-educate and retrain police officers
19 on the proper constitutional standards
20 for administering pedestrian stops, but
21 our work does not end there.

22 Anti-violence programming
23 under the Philadelphia Roadmap for
24 Safer Communities seeks to improve
25 relationships between police and

1 residents, while also addressing the
2 trauma that contributes to violence,
3 and connecting individuals in groups at
4 the higher risk of violence to positive
5 alternatives. We employ several
6 evidence-based strategies to do this
7 work, strategies that have been
8 successful in many other major cities.
9 We are committed to strong social
10 services and supports needed to bring
11 about safe and healthy neighborhoods,
12 but constitutional community policing
13 must also be part of that equation.

14 By improving trust in law
15 enforcement, holding officers
16 accountable for their actions,
17 mandating implicit bias training and
18 reviewing practices is part of a new
19 Citizens Police Oversight Commission,
20 we will strengthen our ability to
21 better protect and serve every
22 Philadelphian. I thank you for this
23 opportunity and I'll be happy to
24 respond to any questions you may have.

25 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank

1 you.

2 Mr. Menos, you can state your
3 name and please proceed with your
4 testimony.

5 MR. MENOS: Good afternoon.
6 My name is Hans Menos. I'm the
7 Executive Director of the Police
8 Advisory Commission. Thank you,
9 Councilmember Parker and Councilmember
10 Jones and all members of the Committee,
11 for your support during these trying
12 times for introducing this bill and of
13 course, for the opportunity to testify
14 regarding it.

15 As you're aware, the
16 residents of the City are echoing a
17 global call for police accountability.
18 Nationally, people were demanding
19 justice for Rayshard Brooks, Eric
20 Garner, Laquan MacDonald, Botham Jean,
21 Mike Brown, Tamir Rice, Jamar Clark,
22 Anton Rose, Alton Sterling, Sandra
23 Bland and Breonna Taylor, amongst many
24 others.

25 Here in Philadelphia, our

1 residents are demanding justice for
2 Brandon Tate Brown, Dennis Plowden,
3 David Jones, Jeffrey Dennis and victims
4 of the MOVE bombing and countless
5 others who have had their rights
6 violated or been treated
7 disrespectfully. With the bills put
8 forward today, City Council is
9 responding to the pain of the residents
10 with real and decisive action. I
11 applaud this leadership and pledge to
12 support City Council as they move away
13 from the retired rhetoric of police
14 reform and replace it with a new system
15 that residents can be proud of.

16 In the last three years, the
17 PAC has received feedback on its
18 operations from City residents and from
19 members from City Council. We've seen
20 a lot of support for our initiatives
21 and many people have expressed that
22 there should be -- the policy work that
23 we put forward should be an aspect of
24 our work and not its primary focus.
25 The feedback across the board has been

1 the PAC's lead investigations into
2 police misconduct, and that this is
3 especially true for police use of
4 force, officer courtesy, verbal abuse
5 and general misconduct.

6 For highlighting the history
7 of the PAC's, I'll skip that portion of
8 my testimony because you've already
9 done so and I appreciate it. But
10 currently, we're operating with a staff
11 of seven people, with a budget of
12 approximately \$540,000. This budget
13 includes the staff salary, legal fees,
14 staff training, materials and supplies
15 and outreach expenses. These
16 structural problems make us helpless to
17 respond to the residents and
18 desperate -- sorry, respond to
19 residents desperate to have their
20 specific complaint investigated and
21 resolved by an entity that is civilian-
22 run. I highlight that Philadelphia is
23 one of the four largest police
24 departments in the nation. It joins
25 New York, Chicago, Los Angeles as the

1 other three large departments.

2 However, our City offers the
3 least amount of civilian involvement in
4 their police department. Of course,
5 with support from Council and the
6 residents this will change. For
7 additional context when I say
8 involvement, in Los Angeles their
9 Police Board serves as -- operates the
10 police department and the police
11 commissioner reports to them, so they
12 set policy and practice for their
13 police department.

14 In New York City and Chicago,
15 they have civilian-led boards that have
16 a budget tied directly to the police
17 department's budget garnering for those
18 two Boards somewhere between \$16
19 million and \$19 million per Board and
20 an average of about 180 employees, if
21 not more. (Inaudible) and if the PAC
22 was offered these hours, they would be
23 grounded by some core values. These
24 core values would be service, equity,
25 transparency and justice. And we went

1 through this by paying close attention
2 to aggregate numbers and to track our
3 own performance and to make every
4 effort to improve outcomes. In my
5 formal testimony, you'll see some of
6 the charting and the attention we've
7 paid to PPD investigations of civilian
8 complaints and what trends we've seen
9 and how equity is affected in these
10 trends, specifically some evidence that
11 shows us that Black residents are more
12 likely to have more than one complaint
13 about officers. Officers who do
14 have -- additionally, officers who have
15 more than one complaint are more likely
16 to have more than one complaint by
17 Black residents so it works in both
18 directions.

19 If the new Civilian Police
20 Oversight Commission is formed, my
21 recommendation to respond to
22 Councilmember Gym would be to structure
23 it in a very detailed way. I would
24 recommend a special investigation unit
25 that would continue the current work of

1 the PAC that would do a lot of policy
2 and practice work. I would recommend a
3 misconduct investigation unit. That
4 would be the largest unit that would
5 serve as a frontline investigative unit
6 in the cases of police misconduct, a
7 Committee Engagement Unit. The PAC --
8 the current PAC has struggled with a
9 seven-person staff to fully engage the
10 community and make sure that they know
11 where we are, who we are and how they
12 can file complaints. That would change
13 with appropriate resources.

14 A Data Management Unit, this
15 unit would support the entire
16 organization and ensure that data was
17 used in all aspects of decision-making.
18 We would have an Audits Unit to assess
19 the work product of the Philadelphia
20 Police Department by auditing any
21 investigation that it led. An
22 Administrative Prosecution Unit, this
23 unit could present any cases that the
24 PAC investigators investigated to any
25 Disciplinary Board. It could supplant

1 the current Police Department advocate
2 and will be staffed with deterrents.

3 And finally, a Training Unit.

4 This unit would help and train new
5 staff and provide training to incoming
6 staff. So this would help keep our
7 staff fresh and aware of the best
8 practices in the field. Of course to
9 accomplish this and in order to meet
10 the needs of the residents of the City,
11 the Commission would need significant
12 powers. Attached to my written
13 testimony, the sample of some of the
14 powers to be considered and I look
15 forward to discussing those in detail
16 in the coming months. Additionally,
17 funding for the Police Oversight
18 Commission should be guaranteed. My
19 recommendation would be at least 1.5
20 percent of the Police Department's
21 budget. This would ensure minimum
22 staffing needs will be met and would
23 ensure independence while insulating
24 the City from disproportionate
25 increases or decreases in police

1 budgets.

2 In conclusion, as we have
3 learned in many instances of misconduct
4 and police violence, police oversight
5 is an intricate part of public safety.
6 Clearly, the City Council agrees or
7 recognizes this is a necessary and
8 vital function and is committed to
9 providing the safety mechanism to the
10 residents of the City. The PAC staff
11 and Commissioners have unique insight
12 and expertise in the policing in this
13 City, and we look forward to working
14 with City Council and other leadership
15 to craft the future for police
16 oversight in Philadelphia.

17 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
18 you both, Hans and Vanessa, for your
19 testimony.

20 The Chair recognizes
21 Councilwoman Maria Quinones-Sanchez.

22 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-
23 SANCHEZ: Thank you, Madam Chair. I
24 know it's been a long day and I
25 appreciate the robust conversations.

1 These are all very, very important
2 issues.

3 I want to thank Councilman
4 Jones. Both Councilman Jones and I
5 served on the Police Oversight post the
6 Justice Department report that really
7 spelled out all of the challenges that
8 we have structurally in the Police
9 Department. When you measure the 8
10 Can't Wait, Philadelphia had met seven
11 of those eight. The last one, and I
12 want to go to it because Hans brought
13 it up, the issue of comprehensive
14 reporting. And we all know that if
15 it's not measured, it's not managed.
16 So I want to get from both Vanessa and
17 Hans in a report of that magnitude
18 where we really are measuring and
19 managing, what are the one, two, three
20 points that absolutely are key for
21 departments to interface with the
22 Police Department like both of you do
23 on a day-to-day basis, and thank you so
24 much for your service.

25 MR. MENOS: So if I

1 understand the question correctly, what
2 are the key data points that are
3 necessary for public safety; is that
4 generally correct?

5 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-

6 SANCHEZ: Absolutely, that should be
7 regularly available, simple for people
8 to measure, monitor, review.

9 MR. MENOS: So there's so
10 many, and thank you for that really
11 thoughtful question. One is that I
12 would definitely say that we highlight
13 the difference between complaints and
14 findings. And policing is a very
15 personal profession. We know car stops
16 and pedestrian stops and other
17 interactions are highly personal. Not
18 a lot of witnesses, sometimes not a lot
19 to corroborate a complaint. So while
20 each individual complaint may not fully
21 be founded, the concentration of many
22 complaints on one particular person is
23 an important data point as we consider
24 things like early warning systems and
25 discipline in the future. And

1 specifically, if there's an officer who
2 has many verbal abuse complaints, we're
3 forced into a consideration. Are we
4 saying that a bunch of residents who
5 don't know each other all decided to
6 pick on one officer or is an officer
7 despite the fact that there's not
8 evidence of each investigation that
9 maybe found accountable may just by the
10 volume of the complaint have an issue
11 that we can address, so that is
12 certainly one.

13 I would say use of force
14 incidents overall is a very important
15 one, but I will take a step back from
16 use of force data collection to
17 understand how we're defining use of
18 force. Very recently, the Police
19 Advisory Commission forwarded a report
20 to the Police Department requesting
21 that they consider the (inaudible)
22 and/or pointing of a firearm a use of
23 force. Currently, that's not
24 considered a use of force in this
25 jurisdiction, but is in other

1 jurisdictions. So our data is only
2 good as how we classify things on the
3 back-end, so I would say certainly
4 identifying use of force, but also
5 understanding what use of force
6 classification is for sure.

7 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-

8 SANCHEZ: And would you include verbal
9 in that? One of the things that we've
10 seen lately with the videos is this
11 real use of saying certain things that
12 are threatening, potential use of
13 force. How would you measure that?

14 MR. MENOS: So it's a great
15 question. So there's so many ways to
16 measure that, and I'll remind some
17 folks of my 2018 now, it's been so
18 long, Body-on-Camera report where we
19 talked about how other jurisdictions
20 are auditing their body-on-camera video
21 for exactly what you're referencing,
22 just a random audit with a randomly
23 pulled different officer's video and
24 look for procedural justice. A fancy
25 word for saying how are you talking to

1 people, how are you communicating with
2 people, and are you likely to curse at
3 somebody for no reason or otherwise
4 make a threat for no reason and are you
5 effectively not de-escalating the way
6 that the Police Department prefers for
7 you to do. So there are jurisdictions,
8 the most notable one is New Orleans and
9 I can send you their audits, where they
10 try to measure for procedural justice
11 by looking at different units and
12 different districts, body-on-camera
13 footage and the prescribed numbers. So
14 they might say, this is an example,
15 we're going to get 30 hours of the 17th
16 District to figure out in that 30 hours
17 of video how procedural justice is
18 going in that area of the police
19 department, so that's one concrete way
20 of measuring that we can do tomorrow.

21 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-

22 SANCHEZ: Vanessa, briefly. Thank you
23 so much again for your service.

24 MS. GARRETT HARLEY:

25 Absolutely. I would just say as we're

1 looking at things through a racial
2 equity lens right now, as we know it's
3 increasingly important, we would also
4 want to look at everything in terms of
5 diversity in both the composition of
6 the force as well as potentially in
7 those arrests and/or stops that are
8 being made and measure them pretty
9 concretely and consistently.

10 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-

11 SANCHEZ: Thank you, Madam Chair.

12 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Sure.

13 Thank you, Councilwoman.

14 Councilman Jones, did you
15 have any comments?

16 COUNCILMAN JONES: No. Just
17 thank you for your service, your
18 thoughtfulness in difficult situations.
19 Underfunded, overwhelmed you kept
20 going. So thank you and we look
21 forward to your input going forward to
22 help shape an appropriate way to
23 restore the faith and trust of the
24 citizens. Thank you.

25 MR. MENOS: Thank you very

1 much.

2 And, Chair Parker, if I may
3 have another minute just to respond to
4 Councilmember Gym's indirect questions
5 about lessons learned and what would be
6 constrained by it. I would just say
7 that one lesson learned, how to
8 consider, is giving the PAC direct
9 access and extraordinary clear powers.
10 Some of the problems we've had have
11 related to ongoing elongated debates
12 about access to information, and those
13 are two things that we could solve by
14 giving us direct access to as much
15 information as possible. I'm talking
16 about databases and programs and clear
17 powers that are beyond debate.

18 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
19 you so very much.

20 Are there any other questions
21 or comments from members of the
22 Committee?

23 (No response.)

24 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: There
25 being none, thank both of you, Vanessa

1 and Hans, for your testimony. We
2 greatly appreciate it.

3 Rachel, can you please call
4 the next panel to testify on the bill
5 and resolution.

6 THE CLERK: Representative
7 Donna Bullock and Senator Sharif Street
8 if he is still available.

9 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: While
10 Representative Bullock and Senator
11 Street are getting prepared to testify,
12 let me just say a huge thank you to
13 Representative Bullock and Senator
14 Street for all of the work you all have
15 done on the state level to assist the
16 City during this very trying time
17 economically when our revenue has been
18 hit like something we would never have
19 expected. But the reason why we don't
20 have to make that terrible choice about
21 increasing our real estate taxes is
22 because you all worked very hard on the
23 State level to ensure that the School
24 District of Philadelphia was at least
25 level-funded and that meant we didn't

1 have to make that terrible decision.

2 In addition to that, the
3 rental assistance, the mortgage
4 assistance, we know that doesn't
5 happen, and assistance for particularly
6 disadvantaged small businesses, that
7 doesn't happen without the bulk of you
8 and we want to say thank you.

9 Please state your name for
10 the record, Representative Bullock, and
11 please proceed with your testimony.

12 STATE REPRESENTATIVE BULLOCK:

13 Thank you. Representative Donna
14 Bullock and thank you, Chairwoman
15 Parker, for those kind remarks. You
16 understand more than anyone the work
17 that it requires at the State to get
18 the kind of resources that our City
19 needs, so I want to thank you for your
20 leadership both at the State when you
21 were our leader of the Philadelphia
22 Delegation and now as the Councilmember
23 here in the City of Philadelphia and
24 the Chair of this Committee.

25 I would like to say thank you

1 as well to Councilman Curtis Jones and
2 his staff and the other members of this
3 Committee for affording me the
4 opportunity to address you this
5 afternoon. As the State Representative
6 for the 195th Legislative District,
7 Vice-chair of the Pennsylvania
8 Legislative Black Caucus, a member of
9 the Police Reform Working Group and
10 perhaps more importantly, a former City
11 Council staffer, it is an honor to be
12 in your chamber, albeit virtually.

13 The current national caucus
14 on police violence has brought into
15 focus long overdue review of policing
16 and use of force in the United States.
17 We have an opportunity to repair a
18 broken relationship between police and
19 communities in the wake of George
20 Floyd, Breonna Taylor and Rayshard
21 Brooks. Local, state and federal
22 officials are responding to these acts
23 of police violence with both proposals
24 to hold police accountable and to
25 require transparency. The Police

1 Reform Working Group is a group of
2 state and city legislators, lawyers and
3 other community leaders who began
4 reviewing and compiling proposals, many
5 of which had already been on the table.

6 A blueprint for police reform
7 exists, though it is complex and is a
8 complex and challenging patchwork of
9 policy recommendations and legislation
10 sitting in the Committee in Harrisburg
11 or actions taken by individuals and
12 collective police departments,
13 municipalities and states in response
14 to present taskforce on cities 21st
15 policing or other police reform and
16 accountability organizations. One such
17 recommendation is to create or empower
18 independent well-financed civilian-led
19 and managed Review Boards with subpoena
20 and disciplinary powers to recommend
21 Internal Affairs and criminal
22 investigations per the negotiated
23 disciplinary code.

24 Earlier this month, Governor
25 Wolf established by his own Executive

1 Order an Oversight Commission to
2 investigate, challenge -- I'm sorry, to
3 investigate alleged misconduct by
4 Pennsylvania state troopers,
5 municipalities across the Commonwealth
6 and, in fact, across the country are
7 aggressively working to establish and
8 refine existing civilian oversight
9 boards. Why, because the public has
10 called for it. And experience has
11 shown that strong independent oversight
12 boards can build legitimacy and public
13 trust to increase police transparency
14 and accountability, but poorly funded
15 or weak, powerless oversight boards can
16 have the exact opposite effect, further
17 eroding a public's trust in law
18 enforcement and elected officials.

19 In Philadelphia, we already
20 have a mechanism for oversight in
21 place, our Police Advisory Commission.
22 But the 30-year-old Commission needs a
23 serious overhaul and reinvestment. The
24 Police Advisory Commission was borne
25 out of the hard work of the coalition

1 of police accountability in early
2 1990s. And at the time, then Mayor Ed
3 Rendell and City Council actually
4 disagreed, forcing the Councilmembers
5 to override the Mayor's veto to
6 establish a Commission.

7 The Commission has since had
8 checkered periods of visibility and
9 adequate funding and overall
10 effectiveness. To change that to
11 establish a more meaningful, effective
12 and responsive Civilian Police Review
13 Board, it won't be easy. It will take
14 time. It will take money and it will
15 take a whole lot of political will
16 power. The Civilian Oversight Board
17 must be independent, fully funded and
18 staffed. It must have the authority to
19 conduct contemporaneous, independent
20 review of civilian complaints and use
21 of force incidents. It must be
22 insulated from (inaudible) police
23 manipulation. It must be a trusted
24 watchdog, a trusted watchdog, and that
25 watchdog must have bark.

1 Councilman Jones' resolution
2 and ballot measure to establish the
3 Citizens Police Oversight Board is a
4 step in the right direction. If we are
5 going to replace the Police Advisory
6 Commission and establish this new
7 Citizen Oversight Board, there are
8 models and professional standards to
9 consider. In 1995, as a wave of
10 citizen oversight agencies were being
11 established across this country, mostly
12 in response to the Rodney King
13 incident, the National Association for
14 Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement
15 also known as NACO was established as
16 the nation's only professional
17 association of organizations and
18 individuals working directly in
19 oversight. NACO had legitimized police
20 oversight as the professional field of
21 study and practice and facilitated the
22 development of professional standards,
23 including a code of ethics and core
24 competencies and training guidelines
25 for oversight practitioners.

1 According to NACO, of the
2 18,000 police departments in the
3 country, about 200 cities have
4 Oversight Boards currently in
5 operation. They are primarily
6 associated with large municipal police
7 agencies like Philadelphia in a
8 different size, responsibilities and
9 other ways. There are many structures
10 to consider. There are a number of
11 factors that can also contribute to the
12 success of the Review Board,
13 independence, ample and effective
14 authority, access to public officials,
15 access to records and investigations,
16 meaningful support from the
17 Administration, adequate resources and
18 staff, strong mandates, strong
19 authority, expectations and community
20 stakeholder engagement.

21 There are also examples of
22 cities who went through this same
23 process that Philadelphia is
24 considering at this moment, a complete
25 overhaul of a failed or inadequate

1 Civilian Review Board. Chicago has
2 seen no less than three versions of a
3 Civilian Review Board. In 2007, the
4 city established the Independent Police
5 Review Authority to replace the Office
6 of Professional Standards, a Civilian
7 Oversight Board that reported to the
8 police department. The Independent
9 Police Review Authority was viewed as
10 more independent because it answered to
11 its Mayor instead. However, the
12 structure, staff and review process
13 remained otherwise unchanged. After
14 failing to effectively investigate
15 police complaints, any at all, the U.S.
16 Department of Justice released a
17 scathing report, and Independent Police
18 Review Authority was then replaced
19 again with the new civilian oversight
20 agency, the Civilian Office of Police
21 Accountability in 2016.

22 The Civilian Office was set
23 up to operate independently as both the
24 police department and the Mayor and was
25 appropriated significant amount of

1 funding. As a result, the Civilian
2 Office has been more transparent and
3 provides data on citizens complaints
4 and their adjudication. San
5 Francisco's Office of Citizens
6 Complaints formed by ballot measure in
7 1982 was similarly plagued by periods
8 of underfunding and manipulation by its
9 strong connections to law enforcement.

10 After 2016, U.S. Department
11 of Justice's assessment and public
12 outcry, that office also saw many
13 changes and those changes were adopted,
14 including the authority to investigate
15 all police-involved shootings. In
16 2018, St. Louis gave their Civilian
17 Oversight Board subpoena powers and
18 enhanced minority participation on the
19 Board. In Washington, D.C. the Office
20 of Police Complaints is successful in
21 large part because of its independence
22 from the metropolitan police
23 department. Four of its five members
24 cannot have any current ties to law
25 enforcement. The office also has

1 significant input from its City
2 Council, has access to police
3 investigation records, including body
4 camera footage and regularly engages
5 the community through outreach efforts.

6 Denver and Phoenix have two
7 of the strongest Civilian Oversight
8 Boards with monitoring investigative
9 powers as well as sanctioning and
10 disciplining authority in some cases.
11 No matter the past success of these
12 Review Boards, many cities are
13 considering additional rounds of
14 changes to bolster their Civilian
15 Review Boards in light of our current
16 events. Civilian Oversight Boards help
17 build public trust. They hold police
18 accountable and foster transparency.
19 But they are not a silver bullet to
20 police reform. Effective Civilian
21 Oversight Boards are critical and
22 necessary, a very critical and
23 necessary component to a larger police
24 reform agenda. That agenda includes
25 some of the recommendations of the

1 Police Reform Working Group, the
2 present 21st Century Policing Taskforce
3 and the work of many advocate-lead
4 groups in Philadelphia and across the
5 nation.

6 What we have learned is that
7 a single incident of excessive force
8 can shine the light on years of
9 built-up public distrust and spark
10 widespread demand for change. We also
11 know it's not about just one incident.
12 It is about the hundreds of civilians
13 who are shot, injured and killed by
14 police yearly. It's about the years of
15 corruption and police abuse, but it is
16 also about that police officer who is
17 risking their lives every day, who is
18 ethical, who performs their job with
19 professionalism and care and who is a
20 part of our community.

21 Policing cannot remain
22 static. It must evolve in the public
23 if demanding that evolution happens
24 now. With the Civilian-led Oversight
25 Review Board that has subpoena

1 authority, adequate funding and staff,
2 access to public officials at the local
3 and state level and with the
4 coordinated response from the City and
5 state to police reform, we have an
6 opportunity, as Councilwoman Helen Gym
7 has mentioned, an opportunity to do
8 something here; an opportunity to
9 create a watchdog with true bite.

10 I would like to thank again
11 Councilman Jones, the co-sponsor of
12 this measure, and every member of the
13 Committee in City Council for giving me
14 the time to speak today, and I
15 encourage you to consider this pivotal
16 moment in history. Together as elected
17 officials, police and residents, we can
18 create an Oversight Board that can
19 transform police community relations
20 for generations to come.

21 Thank you again, Chairwoman
22 Parker, for this opportunity.

23 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
24 you so much, Representative Bullock.

25 And, State Senator Street, we

1 know it's a little later than we
2 expected. But we want to thank you,
3 State Senator, for your patience. But
4 I won't go through it all but I want
5 you to know that prior to
6 Representative Bullock speaking, we
7 gave you all much due respect and
8 acknowledgement of your work at the
9 state level for delivering for
10 Philadelphia with rental assistance,
11 mortgage assistance, disadvantaged
12 business assistance and we thank you on
13 the record, Senator. Please feel free
14 to state your name for the record and
15 proceed with your testimony.

16 SENATOR STREET: My name is
17 Sharif Street. I'm State Senator from
18 the 3rd District, resident of North
19 Philadelphia. I live in the 5th
20 Council District. I am pleased to
21 testify today. I want to thank Council
22 for its work. I want to thank you all
23 for beginning the work of reimagining
24 public safety in the Commonwealth or in
25 the City of Philadelphia. This is a

1 part of a larger conversation we've
2 been having about public safety in the
3 Commonwealth. I want to thank my
4 colleague Representative Bullock for
5 her comments and I won't repeat many of
6 the things she said, but amen and I
7 second her comments.

8 To truncate some of this,
9 one, I think it is critically important
10 given what we've seen both locally in
11 the Commonwealth and nationally, that
12 we send a strong message about police
13 reform. I think this measure or the
14 measures, because there are multiple
15 measures, in terms of strengthening the
16 teeth of the Citizens Review Board I
17 guess, strengthening, solidifying it as
18 a Charter function and making its
19 funding more certain, making it more
20 independent and more accountable and
21 giving it more greater power to
22 investigate concerns around policing
23 will increase the confidence of the
24 average Philadelphian in what's wrong.

25 And I want to say this, look,

1 we know that there are many, if not the
2 overwhelming majority of police
3 officers go to work to do the right
4 thing. But when you take your car to
5 the shop and they say why are you here,
6 you tell them what's wrong with the
7 car. You say, I have a tire that needs
8 to be changed and it's broken. You
9 don't say, I have three good tires, the
10 engine's good, the carburetor's fine,
11 the steering is fine. You don't
12 enumerate all the things that are going
13 well. You point out what needs to be
14 corrected. And in this respect,
15 Council is doing an overhaul of our
16 criminal justice system and they're
17 really reimagining public safety.

18 I want to thank Councilwoman
19 Parker for her very timely legislation
20 requiring that folks, police of the
21 City of Philadelphia to live in the
22 City of Philadelphia as well. I agree
23 that's also timely legislation. I want
24 to point out that transparency in
25 policing is incredibly important, and

1 this is not inconsistent with what
2 we're doing at the Commonwealth, what
3 we're talking -- we're considering
4 legislation introduced by my colleague
5 Senator Costa who is around a police
6 accountability database that would
7 allow police departments or to know
8 when hiring folks, what their previous
9 records are and to dispel some of the
10 panacea about whether you need
11 oversight. There is information that
12 only a governmental agency can access
13 about one's prior record. So one could
14 have worked in another agency and this
15 Board would be able to then look at the
16 data of prior history when a person
17 could have been living in another
18 place, fired from the Police Department
19 and then wants to be rehired in
20 Philadelphia. There needs to be
21 methodologies to make sure that you can
22 examine what their prior record is.
23 And if a person is terminated or needs
24 to be terminated, what the full scope
25 of their record is, not just what's

1 happening this instance and I think
2 this will help.

3 Moreover, sort of connecting
4 some of what was said earlier, the idea
5 that people should live in the City
6 also stops people from hopping
7 jurisdictions from municipality to
8 municipality, and we don't need to be
9 hiring a police officer who maybe lived
10 outside the City, did something wrong
11 and then comes to the City of
12 Philadelphia and get hired. This is
13 not an insignificant incident. Antwon
14 Rose was killed in the City of East
15 Pittsburgh after an officer was on the
16 job just seven hours; had been fired
17 from another police department, rehired
18 and because there wasn't an appropriate
19 review of the practices for hiring and
20 discipline and because there wasn't an
21 appropriate database and because you
22 did not have to live in the
23 jurisdiction in which you worked, he
24 was able to hop from jurisdiction to
25 jurisdiction. So in many respects,

1 these bills work together for Council
2 to have greater accountability and
3 greater understanding of why people are
4 testifying.

5 And some of the perspective I
6 think we can offer is the perspective
7 of people who look at municipalities
8 across the Commonwealth and what is
9 happening. So I want to commend
10 Council for its reimagining of this. I
11 think this is part of a larger
12 discussion around policing, and I will
13 say because people always say when you
14 testify on these discrete issues, that
15 does not mean that we don't need to
16 look at other issues, and I know that
17 you are. But issues like things that
18 contribute to -- issues like what the
19 scope of work police officers are doing
20 are also relevant.

21 There was a time in the City
22 when things got too cold, you had
23 police officers to try and get people
24 off the streets for Code Blue. A then
25 Councilmember working with the Mayor,

1 Councilman John Street working with
2 Mayor Ed Rendell put in place what's
3 now the Sidewalk bill where folks
4 like -- people like Sister Mary and
5 folks from One Day At A Time get people
6 off the streets in Code Blue and police
7 officers do that so there isn't a
8 confrontational experience when that
9 happens. And that was another
10 generation of Council's reimagining how
11 we dealt with policing.

12 At the time it was
13 controversial and people thought, well,
14 this is something the police have to
15 do. Well, we now believe that the
16 services that Sister Mary and groups
17 like One Day At A Time provide during
18 Code Blues are essential. I think you
19 will find the original Executive Order
20 and then legislation creating today's
21 Citizen Review Board were met with
22 opposition, but people now believe that
23 it should be even stronger. Our
24 process in making a more just city is
25 an evolutionary process, and I commend

1 Council in moving us along the way.
2 And how you re-examine public safety, I
3 encourage you to re-examine it in a
4 broad way, to think about it as a part
5 of the scope of what you overall do
6 when you think about what goes on in
7 our schools, in our communities and how
8 we do it.

9 And I think most poignant on
10 this point was Councilman Jones' point
11 about the fact that police officers
12 continue even when off duty to provide
13 a modicum of additional service when
14 they're just walking around the
15 community. I served as outside counsel
16 to the Sheriff of Philadelphia for five
17 years. And during that time had the
18 experience to know that sheriff
19 deputies, many of whom lived in the
20 City, when they were off duty would
21 still provide a certain measure of
22 comfort to people knowing that you had
23 a sheriff deputy on that block, knowing
24 that you had persons in law
25 enforcement. The presence of people

1 who are involved in law enforcement who
2 are moving around communities even when
3 they are off duty provide a modicum of
4 safety.

5 And finally, I will conclude
6 with this: I had a young man come into
7 my office today, resident of North
8 Philly, a young father in his early 20s
9 who said to me, why can't you all
10 figure out a way to have the people
11 that police us be from the communities
12 where they can recognize the person who
13 is doing something wrong and who needs
14 to be policed and a person who is just
15 engaging in something that is normative
16 behavior in our communities. And he
17 moreover suggested that normative
18 behaviors in Philadelphia, in North
19 Philadelphia where he lived, where he
20 was born and raised and where he was
21 raising his young child with his
22 fiancée, that normative behaviors here
23 might look a little different than what
24 they look like in other parts of the
25 state or the country and that a person

1 having a chance to have lived in our
2 community, lived in our City would
3 therefore be in better position to
4 recognize who is actually doing
5 something wrong and who is doing
6 something right.

7 And moreover he said, why
8 can't we have a process where people in
9 the community, people in the community
10 can have some say about whether
11 officers are exercising that discretion
12 in a reasonable way. Those weren't his
13 exact words, but that was the point.
14 Now, he wanted two things: People to
15 live in the community and, two, that
16 people in the community would have some
17 ability to monitor and control the
18 people that were policing them. And he
19 thought it was an absurd thing that old
20 folks like us, and we now get to be old
21 folks, that we didn't get it.

22 And what I explained to him,
23 not only did the members of City
24 Council get it, but in fact I was
25 scheduled -- at that time I told him

1 about 30 minutes, but that was about
2 three hours ago, 30 minutes that I was
3 going to be speaking with members of
4 Council about these very issues and
5 that City Council of Philadelphia did
6 understand. So some of the rhetoric
7 that people are out there protesting
8 about is, in fact, completely
9 consistent with what Council is doing
10 and they may express it in a different
11 language, they may talk about community
12 patrols. But all they really want is
13 people from their neighborhoods to
14 patrol the community and the police not
15 to be outsiders to the community.

16 And they talk about we need
17 accountability. But what they really
18 want to know is that people understand
19 what's going on. And they want to know
20 that when something wrong is done, that
21 the people who are making the decisions
22 about whether the police aren't
23 policing themselves, that there is a
24 community input. And this young man
25 recognized, he recognized the fact that

1 we needed police. But he said, we
2 obviously can't have a lawless society.
3 But he recognizes how we did policing
4 had to change to be a little different.

5 So I encourage you to
6 continue with this strengthened Police
7 Advisory Commission. I encourage you
8 in your efforts to make sure that we
9 have police officers living in the
10 City, and I encourage you to continue
11 to reimagine policing overall in what
12 the role of police are in our society.
13 They certainly are needed and we
14 certainly thank them. But it is part
15 of a larger picture of how we deal with
16 criminal justice, how we keep our
17 communities safe, and I thank you for
18 your role. And to the extent that we
19 are in the Commonwealth can be helpful,
20 we look forward to it.

21 I will note we do plan on --
22 I deal with legislation. I think we're
23 at a movement to ban chokeholds. But I
24 think that we at the State and those in
25 the City really do have to listen to

1 what people are saying to us. We have
2 to reimagine public safety in both
3 measures I've heard today, take our
4 great steps in that regard. I thank
5 you and that concludes my testimony. I
6 stand ready for questions.

7 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
8 you very much, Representative Bullock
9 and State Senator Street.

10 Are there any comments or
11 questions from members of the
12 Committee?

13 Chair recognizes
14 Councilmember Jones.

15 COUNCILMAN JONES: Yes. I
16 just want to thank you for being our
17 partners. We get to propose
18 legislation among people that are not
19 from another planet, if you would and
20 they kind of have to travel through the
21 same streets and see the same
22 conditions. You get to go and deal
23 with people who might not see an urban
24 African-American for a year up close
25 and personal and not understand some of

1 the things that they go through. So
2 thank you, Senator, and thank you,
3 Representative.

4 And my closing is that I saw
5 a video on I think it might have been
6 Good Morning America. It was a young
7 man similar to the young man you were
8 talking to. He was playing basketball
9 in his driveway. When the police car
10 came down the street, he hid behind his
11 father's car until the police car
12 passed him. His father caught it on
13 film recorded by his security system,
14 played it back and looked at it twice
15 and then asked him, why did you hide
16 from the police officers. He said,
17 because they might shoot me.

18 We have to restore the trust
19 and faith, that we're not sending
20 warriors but guardians and people who
21 are there to protect and serve. So
22 thank you, Senator, for your patience.
23 I know you got a lot to work to do, but
24 it was worth waiting for.

25 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank

1 you, Councilman Jones.

2 Chair recognizes,

3 Councilmember Green. We can't hear
4 you, Councilman Green.

5 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Can you
6 hear me now?

7 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Yes, we
8 can.

9 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Sorry. I
10 was doing the unmute, mute challenge.
11 But I want to say to both Senator
12 Street and Representative Bullock,
13 thank you for your advocacy in
14 Harrisburg. I have to say this is
15 probably one of the first times that
16 we've had this level of collaboration
17 at the local and state level and also
18 federal level on a lot of these issues.
19 I have been commending my colleague and
20 Majority Leader Cherelle Parker helping
21 to put together a lot of those calls
22 and really during COVID-19, to have a
23 lot of different conversations
24 regarding issues and issues dealing
25 with COVID-19 and that's been able to

1 transform into this issue regarding the
2 unrest that's happening in our City and
3 our State.

4 And I know from the work in
5 reference to some of the arbitration
6 legislation we're trying to get done
7 and I'm just curious, what has been the
8 prospective from some of your
9 colleagues in Harrisburg on the House
10 and Senate side? I know there's been
11 some movement and some leadership that
12 the House was taking in reference to
13 kind of taking over the Chambers. And
14 I know on the Senate side, Senator
15 Street, you've also been working very
16 hard in that regard. So we're doing a
17 lot of what we can at the local level
18 but the same has to be done at the
19 state level and I'm curious as to how
20 is that moving.

21 SENATOR STREET: So I don't
22 know if Representative Bullock is still
23 here. I'll let her go and --

24 STATE REPRESENTATIVE BULLOCK:
25 Yes.

1 SENATOR STREET: -- you can
2 talk about the House and then I'll go.

3 STATE REPRESENTATIVE BULLOCK:
4 Sure. Thank you. Representative
5 Bullock.

6 As you know, members of the
7 Pennsylvania Legislative Black Caucus
8 had taken over the Speakers session
9 last week and it had helped move along
10 some bills through Committee and in
11 regards to the arbitration, there is a
12 bill that I'm working on closely with
13 my colleagues on the other side of the
14 aisle, Russ Diamond and several other
15 members. There's an active draft right
16 now. There seems to be some interest
17 on both sides of the aisle. Although I
18 would say that not all members
19 regardless of party are supportive of
20 any revisions to arbitrations so we're
21 treading carefully, so we're looking at
22 how we can reform arbitration in a way
23 that will address concerns of the
24 public while also respecting the values
25 that we have in labor. And so, that's

1 something that we are working on now
2 and hopefully, we can have something
3 that has some bipartisan support and
4 move through the House in the upcoming
5 weeks.

6 SENATOR STREET: So in the
7 Senate, we didn't have quite the
8 dramatic -- we didn't have quite that
9 opportunity for the dramatic statement
10 that the House made. But fortunately,
11 the Senate's Law and Justice and
12 Judiciary Committees are holding joint
13 hearings. Those are two separate
14 committees in the Senate; Law and
15 Justice is one and Judiciary is another
16 one, are holding joint hearings that
17 were most of the day today. I'm not on
18 either of those committees. Although I
19 am on the Sentencing Commission, I'm
20 not on either of those committees.
21 They're holding hearings most of the
22 day today and most of the day tomorrow
23 on issues around criminal justice
24 reform, specifically looking at some of
25 the issues around policing. And I

1 imagine that that will be one of the
2 bills or one of the topics for which
3 parties can offer testimony. And so, I
4 don't specifically know what the
5 appetite is for the House bills. I
6 don't think there's a bill pending in
7 the Senate to change the arbitration
8 system. But one thing that there was
9 significant discussion about was not
10 just the topic of -- not just the topic
11 of whether we use arbitrators or
12 whether we use an arbitration system,
13 but how are the arbitrators themselves
14 selected and why is it that people feel
15 that we can't get arbitrators in those
16 roles who are responding in a more
17 effective way. And so, we're having
18 conversations both with colleagues but
19 also with the Wolf Administration about
20 what the real process is around the
21 arbitrator selection.

22 I'm not exactly sure what we
23 can do in that space. But what I will
24 say is I think we have to look at it
25 from both perspectives, both the

1 arbitration process and then the
2 arbitrator selection, because in theory
3 arbitration shouldn't be so bad. There
4 should be -- it's really supposed to be
5 an expedited quasi-judicial process for
6 dealing with proceedings and not have
7 them draw out. But the arbitrators
8 should be using the same level of
9 dispassionate, unbiased review as we
10 would expect from judges and to the
11 extent that the public doesn't feel the
12 arbitrators or in evidence doesn't
13 demonstrate that arbitrators are as
14 independent, dispassionate and unbiased
15 as judges, I think we need to not look
16 at not just whether we go through
17 arbitration but perhaps we could have
18 an arbitration process if we had a
19 process for screening, vetting and
20 selecting arbitrators that yielded a
21 better quality arbitrator. So I think
22 we should look at both sets of issues,
23 and I'm certainly open to it and
24 waiting whatever legislation comes out
25 of the House.

1 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you,
2 Madam Chair. Thank you, Senator Street
3 and Representative Bullock.

4 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
5 you, Councilmember Green.

6 Are there any more questions
7 or comments from members of the
8 Committee?

9 (No response.)

10 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: There
11 being none, I want to say again thank
12 you, Senator Street, for coming back to
13 join us.

14 Representative Bullock, thank
15 you so very much for staying with us in
16 your testimony.

17 Rachel, please call the next
18 panel to testify on the bill and
19 resolution.

20 THE CLERK: Minister Rodney
21 Muhammad and Mary Henin.

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER:
23 Minister Muhammad and Ms. Henin?

24 MR. MUHAMMAD: Yes.

25 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay.

1 Great. You're here --

2 MR. MUHAMMAD: Can you hear
3 me?

4 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Yes, I
5 just heard Minister Muhammad.

6 Is Ms. Henin here, Mary
7 Henin?

8 MS. HENIN: Yes, I'm here.

9 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay.
10 So thank you both so very much for
11 being here. Please state your name for
12 the record. We'll begin with Minister
13 Muhammad, and proceed with your
14 testimony.

15 MR. MUHAMMAD: Okay. I'm
16 Minister Rodney Muhammad. I'm the
17 minister of the Delaware Valley
18 covering a number of cities and I'm
19 also the member of Mosque No. 12 here
20 in the City of Philadelphia and
21 President of the Philadelphia branch of
22 the NAACP.

23 First, I want to thank you,
24 Councilman Jones, for inviting me to
25 testify and I want to thank you,

1 Councilwoman Cherelle Parker, chairing
2 this convening. I have listened to
3 this in its entirety so I'm going to do
4 my very, very best in brief comments
5 not to be redundant because too many
6 important things have already been
7 said.

8 I think a question raised by
9 Councilwoman Green helped me to segue
10 into a point that I wanted to make that
11 I didn't want to forget, because good
12 laws history has taught us have been
13 tossed out because the right people
14 weren't there to execute those laws and
15 sometimes people confuse the person's
16 inability to really execute a good law
17 with the law being good in the first
18 place. So if we look for an Oversight
19 Committee, I'm listening to Senator
20 Street, we really got to file down and
21 look at the type of individuals that go
22 in to execute a Commission that's going
23 to really have teeth, making sure that
24 we got people on that Commission that
25 are willing to run with those teeth, if

1 it's necessary.

2 One of the things that I've
3 learned and I'll get into that, about
4 30 years of my life living here in the
5 City of Philadelphia, but being a baby
6 boomer, you start out as a child
7 knowing how to use a rotary phone and
8 you're blessed to still be alive when
9 the iPhone comes out and there's a lot
10 of history on that between just those
11 two phones as tools.

12 But being a baby boomer, one
13 of the things that we used to watch on
14 television as a child was the Andy
15 Griffith Show. The Andy Griffith Show
16 was about a sheriff and his deputy.
17 And one of the things that you know
18 about the Andy Griffith show is that
19 you figure they both went through some
20 training to become a sheriff or a
21 deputy. But in there as you watched
22 each series, when you review back on
23 it, this guy hardly ever carried a gun.
24 He was already mentally poised to
25 de-escalate a situation that he would

1 find in the town of Mayberry. But his
2 deputy, Barney Fife, always wanted to
3 have a gun on him, didn't seem
4 satisfied until he could pull every gun
5 and toy they had on the rack off. And
6 often times in the program, Andy
7 Griffith would have to de-escalate his
8 deputy who was all revved up to go out
9 and start firing bullets with the guns
10 that they have.

11 Now, of course it's comedy.
12 But when you look at this situation
13 we're in that's not really comical, you
14 can see the type of mindset that too
15 often we have on the police force. And
16 Andy Griffith was a good officer and
17 his good showed by de-escalating one
18 that could have been a bad one. We
19 have too many good officers, but the
20 goodness is not good enough to stop the
21 bad ones. That's why we're having this
22 conversation today. And so, I just
23 wanted to note that.

24 I am for residency, so I
25 agree with Bilal Qayyum, Jihad Ali,

1 Joann Bell and others about residency.
2 I think you have to have skin in the
3 game. If you're going to work for
4 government in Philadelphia, if you're
5 going to service Philadelphia's
6 citizens, one of the things you ought
7 to do is live in the City. And you
8 have people who live outside of the
9 City too often. I just think they
10 don't have enough -- they can't have
11 enough interest in a place that they
12 don't live in. They just work there
13 and that tends to be the limit to their
14 real emotional involvement.

15 When you don't know a lot
16 about people, those areas of unknown
17 create unfounded fears but they're
18 fears nevertheless. And when a person
19 has a gun and a badge to use their gun
20 coupled with their own personal fears,
21 too often you get this failed
22 experiment. So when George Floyd was
23 murdered and protests started in
24 Philadelphia, we sent a press release
25 from the NAACP to the press that we

1 feel that having White police officers
2 deployed in identified Black
3 neighborhoods, especially since this
4 happened, is a failed experiment. And
5 where we can, we need to move
6 immediately to redeploy White police
7 officers from these areas until there's
8 some greater therapeutic reach to
9 helping the situation, because while a
10 White officer too often gets a few
11 demerits on his record, we have to take
12 people to the morgue and hold a
13 funeral. And so, that is our position
14 on that.

15 I do think that the Oversight
16 Committee is necessary, but too often
17 these committees fail in their duty
18 because they're not empowered enough,
19 they're not endowed enough with the
20 kind of funding and things that they
21 need so we're going to do everything we
22 can do to get behind it. I represent
23 the only community in the City of
24 Philadelphia that is completely unarmed
25 with criminal weapons. We don't keep

1 guns. We don't carry guns and it's not
2 our way. So when we go out in the
3 community which is just as dangerous as
4 any other citizen, we go out with an
5 imperative, we go out to work in a
6 community with love and drawing on
7 something that's greater inside the
8 people who reside there than the
9 average police is looking for.

10 So I finish with one point.
11 I too like Councilman Jones was given
12 the opportunity to go and spend a few
13 minutes with police cadets, and I try
14 my best to remind them that before they
15 get assigned, that they're going to
16 probably be assigned to a neighborhood
17 in Philadelphia where they're going to
18 go in with a mindset to look for
19 criminals and to look for crimes, and I
20 try to remind them the area that you
21 have been assigned, called an
22 identified Black or Latino neighborhood
23 too often is already a crime scene, but
24 they're not trained to look for those
25 kinds of crimes so they're not trained

1 to look for those kinds of criminals.
2 But if you are assigned to a
3 neighborhood with decayed housing that
4 too often results from bank denials,
5 redlining, if you go there and see
6 people who are academically more
7 impaired than they should be on levels
8 to operate anywhere in this country and
9 generate a living wage for yourself and
10 your family, failed schools and
11 substandard education, that's a crime
12 but nobody's going to jail for that.

13 High illiteracy which we're
14 fighting, there's about a little over
15 200,000-something adults who can't fill
16 out an application for a job. Food
17 deserts and people (inaudible) from the
18 schools, trying to raise children on
19 almost junk food, and drugs, guns and
20 folks with a damaged self-concept, it's
21 a recipe for delinquency. It's a
22 recipe for (inaudible) and even crime
23 that's being bred. And so, too
24 often these officers are going into
25 neighborhoods not necessarily trying to

1 pick out a criminal from the regular
2 resident. And as Senator Street said,
3 not necessarily looking for who's doing
4 wrong and who's not doing wrong, but
5 too often they have criminalized the
6 whole lot of us, and that's what you
7 call profiling.

8 I'm for a change of laws, but
9 I know that laws don't change
10 conditions. We have to go after
11 conditions. Dr. King said it even, the
12 law can't make a man love me, religion
13 and education must do that. He said,
14 but the law can keep them from lynching
15 me, and I think that's pretty important
16 too. So he knew that he was fighting
17 (inaudible) that there were conditions
18 behind the law.

19 We tend to go back to the
20 root of how we started in this country.
21 It started with an idea of fight was --
22 that's how they treated the (inaudible)
23 man. That's how we were brought here
24 for another whole reason than the
25 things we're fighting for right now.

1 And these 13 little colonies were
2 populated with that kind of attitude.
3 When attitudes hardened, they produced
4 belief systems. Those belief systems
5 are supported through an educational
6 system and religion. And then
7 ultimately, you take your beliefs and
8 you codify them into law. And so, I
9 represent a people that were first
10 written into this Constitution in its
11 articles as three-fifths of a man, not
12 a whole man, and then we had to begin
13 to fight for manhood, even today trying
14 to define it for ourselves and not have
15 someone else define it for us.

16 So we are behind that
17 residency rule. We are behind having a
18 strong Oversight Committee. But I want
19 to say that with the residency rule, I
20 have worked in the City for nearly 30
21 years, a robust cadre of young bright
22 minds graduating from some of the best
23 schools in this country, but because we
24 can't get adequate employment in the
25 private sector, many of these young

1 people move away from the City of
2 Philadelphia reducing our skilled labor
3 pool, and everybody's not going to
4 graduate from college and get a job
5 with the government. So we have a big
6 fight on our hands.

7 And in 2010, the NAACP and
8 National Action Network and the Urban
9 League came to a memo of understanding
10 with Comcast to work toward diversity.
11 Comcast has done a lot better since
12 2010, but we're not where we really
13 want to be but that's only one
14 corporation. What do we do with all of
15 these other corporations that are here,
16 because we're not going to get all of
17 your graduates into government, but we
18 have a private sector here that I'm
19 sure is pulling people from other
20 counties to fill in many of their
21 positions, but that can come from some
22 of our young people graduating from
23 many of these schools right in the City
24 of Philadelphia to provide us with
25 future work for the government here.

1 So I thank you all for allowing me to
2 have a few words with you.

3 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
4 you, Minister Muhammad, for your
5 testimony.

6 And before Ms. Mary Henin
7 states her name for the record and
8 proceeds with her testimony for the
9 benefit for all of our members, I just
10 want to note for the record that
11 Council President Clarke is well aware
12 that our hearing is still moving
13 forward. We have just three more
14 people to testify and only two bills
15 that we need to get through. So don't
16 feel rushed or pressed as it relates to
17 time.

18 Ms. Henin, will you please
19 proceed with your testimony.

20 COUNCILMAN JONES: Madam
21 Chair?

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Yes,
23 Councilman.

24 COUNCILMAN JONES: Can you
25 make sure he gives us that testimony in

1 writing because some of that I'm going
2 to use, the Andy Griffith thing.

3 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Oh,
4 yes. We'll get that, Councilman Jones.
5 That was before my time so I definitely
6 need to read it too, Councilman Jones.

7 Ms. Henin, thank you so much
8 for your patience. Please state your
9 name for the record and proceed with
10 your testimony.

11 MS. HENIN: Good evening.
12 Mary Henin here. Thank you, Council
13 President Clarke and Chair Parker,
14 Committee members and the PAC for
15 inviting me to testify today. My name
16 is Mary Henin. I've been a Public
17 Defender at the Defender Association
18 and a Philadelphia resident for six
19 years. I'm testifying today to support
20 Council's proposed ballot initiative to
21 create an independent Police Oversight
22 Commission, but I'm also here to
23 emphasize to everyone that it is not
24 enough to create an independent
25 commission. It must be funded to the

1 City's maximum capacity and given the
2 power necessary to hold PPD accountable
3 and effect real change to its
4 practices.

5 When people think of police
6 harm, they think most often of physical
7 abuse. But my story will show you how
8 something as simple as not filling out
9 paperwork puts Philadelphia citizens in
10 danger of police violence. I filed a
11 complaint with PAC from an incident
12 that started back in February when the
13 police courtesy towed my car. I don't
14 use my car every day like a lot of
15 other people. So I didn't notice it
16 missing until a week or so after the
17 police moved it.

18 There was a restricted
19 parking sign that had been torn up and
20 thrown on the street, so I figured out
21 right away that the police must have
22 moved it. I called the 18th District
23 and asked them if they towed the car.
24 The District said it had no record of
25 my car being towed or of any towing

1 that happened on my block for the whole
2 month of February or before. They told
3 me the only way to get help finding my
4 car was if I called 911 and reported it
5 stolen. Just in case, though, the next
6 day after reporting it stolen, I did go
7 out and look for my car and I found it
8 three blocks away and it was ticketed
9 by PPD, specifically per courtesy
10 towing.

11 I called 911 again and I
12 reported the car found. But being a
13 lawyer, I knew that I should keep all
14 of those reports because the last thing
15 I wanted to do was to get arrested for
16 driving my own car. Now, fast-forward
17 three months, a friend and I are
18 driving to visit his brother and his
19 sister-in-law at the Jersey shore.
20 Just mere blocks from his house, four
21 SUV cops in what looked like full
22 tactical gear blocked us in on a dead-
23 end street. They pointed their tasers
24 and their guns at us. It was too crazy
25 to even process at this point. They

1 screamed at us to get out of the car
2 with our hands up to back towards them,
3 not look them in the face and then they
4 immediately handcuffed us both and took
5 us to the side of the road.

6 They searched my friend right
7 away. They searched the car. I'm a
8 lawyer and I have a cool head and a
9 thick skin, but I was terrified. I was
10 shaking. When they told me that the
11 car was stolen, I explained the
12 situation to them right away. I even
13 told them that I had the police report
14 in the glove compartment of the car,
15 and of course they had my license and
16 my registration and they could verify
17 all the information. But they kept us
18 handcuffed on the side of the road for
19 an hour before they were able to verify
20 my story and let us go. Even though
21 they had all the reports, they had the
22 registration information, they kept us
23 handcuffed there scared and terrified
24 because they didn't believe me.

25 And I cannot emphasize one

1 point enough, which is that I did
2 everything that PPD told me to do. I
3 kept all the reports. I did my
4 diligence and I couldn't avoid this
5 traumatizing and humiliating
6 experience. But let me tell you about
7 my experience with the PAC. I filed my
8 complaint as soon as I returned to
9 Philadelphia. PAC was thoughtful,
10 diligent and concerned. They called me
11 within hours of filing. They
12 double-checked all the information to
13 make sure they had everything they
14 needed to fill out a complete report.
15 They responded to every question or
16 request I had after the fact, and this
17 was all while working with a reduced
18 staff and from home.

19 But in my conversations with
20 them, I could tell there was a hint of
21 pessimism in my conversations because
22 there was this understanding that while
23 they cared deeply about what happened
24 to me and that they wanted to see
25 something happen, some consequences,

1 once this got into the hands of
2 Internal Affairs, they might just look
3 at it like it was a paperwork issue or
4 even just a simple mistake. But when
5 we talk about police accountability,
6 we're not talking about individual
7 mistakes or bad apples. We're talking
8 about needing to oversee an entire
9 system that subjects everyday citizens
10 to violence and dangerous.

11 So much of the current
12 process is designed to shield the
13 police from oversight. They're almost
14 certainly guaranteed to keep their jobs
15 for violations much more serious than
16 not writing down where they towed a
17 car. The District Attorney's Office
18 gives us the information as Defense
19 attorneys that the police involved in
20 our cases have been complained against
21 or disciplined, and then those same
22 District Attorneys do everything in
23 their power to make sure we cannot
24 introduce that evidence to a jury or a
25 judge. So what's the point of the

1 current process. It barely holds
2 police accountable in the moment and
3 it's designed to prevent future
4 accountability. So it's important to
5 create an independent Commission.
6 You've heard everyone tell you today
7 and I will say it myself it needs to be
8 strong. It needs to be funded in the
9 way that other cities fund their
10 commissions, as a percentage of the
11 police budget. That way the bigger
12 your police force is, the bigger your
13 commission is. It needs to have
14 independent subpoena power and the
15 ability to conduct its own full
16 investigation.

17 The Commission needs the
18 strength to match the level of force
19 police used against me and countless
20 others who suffered much worse. It
21 needs the strength to match the force
22 of Internal Affairs and the FOP, but
23 that can't happen without real money
24 and meaningful investigative power.
25 The people who work at PAC are

1 dedicated and capable and they care
2 about protecting citizens, but they
3 need our support and they need
4 Council's support, so thank you for
5 your time.

6 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
7 you so very much for your testimony,
8 Ms. Henin and Mr. Rodney Muhammad.

9 Are there any questions or
10 comments from members of the Committee?

11 (No response.)

12 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: There
13 being none, thank you so very much for
14 your testimony and we appreciate your
15 patience here today.

16 Rachel, can you please call
17 the first panel we have to testify this
18 afternoon on Bill No. 200370.

19 THE CLERK: Christopher
20 Puchalsky and Alison Cohen.

21 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER:
22 Christopher and Alison, welcome, we see
23 you.

24 Christopher, we'll start with
25 you so when both of you proceed, just

1 state your name for the record and
2 please feel free to proceed with your
3 testimony.

4 MR. PUCHALSKY: Thanks. Good
5 afternoon. Good evening, Chair Parker
6 and the Committee members. My name is
7 Christopher Puchalsky. I'm the
8 Director of Policy and Strategic
9 Initiatives at the Office of
10 Transportation, Infrastructure and
11 Sustainability. And I'll just say as
12 I've been listening to your
13 deliberations and the testimony, I'm
14 truly humbled to come and present on my
15 bill after all of the weighted topics
16 that you all have been dealing with
17 today. And I think -- I'm truly not
18 trying to butter you up here, but that
19 the residents of Philadelphia would be
20 glad that they all knew that there's
21 careful deliberation of these really
22 important issues. So as a resident,
23 I'll just say that.

24 I am pleased to appear before
25 you today on Council Bill 200370. This

1 bill authorizes the City of
2 Philadelphia through the Managing
3 Director's Office to enter into a
4 concession agreement with Bicycle
5 Transit Systems for a concession to
6 operate, expand and finance the Indego
7 bike sharing system. I'd like to thank
8 the bill's sponsor Councilmember Kendra
9 Brooks for support of his project and
10 our continued commitment to provide
11 City services with equity and dignity
12 and I'd also like to thank the
13 co-sponsors of the bill.

14 OTIS is pleased to be working
15 with Bicycle Transit Systems, a
16 Philadelphia-based company that has
17 been responsible for building and
18 operating the Indego bike share program
19 over the last five years. Throughout
20 this time, Bicycle Transit has provided
21 excellent service to the City of
22 Philadelphia as the contracted
23 operations company, and we believe that
24 the term sheet presented to the
25 Committee today represents a

1 significant benefit to the City,
2 residents, workers and visitors. Over
3 the past five years, the Indego program
4 has expanded from 60 bikes -- 60
5 stations and 600 bikes to more than 140
6 stations and 1400 bicycles. More than
7 3.5 million trips have been made on
8 Indego to date and we just had our
9 five-year anniversary.

10 We're particularly proud of
11 the role that Indego has played during
12 the current crisis. Indego has
13 provided socially distanced
14 transportation during the entirety of
15 the COVID-19 crisis, allowing
16 low-income Philadelphians in particular
17 to access work and essential services.
18 While other systems across the country
19 shutdown, Indego operated continuously
20 throughout the recent civil unrest.
21 And on June 6th, the day when there was
22 a massive rally on the Parkway where
23 Philadelphians from all walks of life
24 gathered to say that Black Lives
25 Matter, Indego had its fourth highest

1 ridership day ever. So whether it's
2 attending a Civil Rights rally, getting
3 to a medical appointment, going to work
4 or just giving some exercise,
5 Philadelphians have come to rely on
6 Indego.

7 I know we're a little late,
8 so let me do some summarizing of the
9 next bit of my testimony. You have it
10 in written form. Bicycle Transit was
11 selected through an RFP process. We
12 had six bidders. We did demos with
13 three of them. We went into
14 pre-contract discussions with two, and
15 we ended up selecting Bicycle Transit
16 for two reasons. I'll call it value
17 and values. Bicycle Transit's offer
18 had the highest monetary value of any
19 of the bids that we received, but more
20 than that, its values. Alison's
21 company, her and her entire team, have
22 the kind of shared values that not only
23 the Administration should have, but I
24 think a lot of members of Council have
25 about a commitment to equity, to

1 diversity, to inclusion, to battling
2 climate change and providing low-income
3 Philadelphians and all Philadelphians
4 and visitors with convenient
5 transportation. The details are in the
6 term sheet.

7 I'll also say Bicycle Transit
8 Systems executed an economic
9 opportunity plan that requires a best
10 and good faith effort to achieve MBE
11 and WBE participation goals of 7
12 percent for each category, and that was
13 the highest of any of the offers that
14 we received. This EOP will continue to
15 work for its diversity goals which have
16 already been achieved under the current
17 operating contract. Bicycle Transit is
18 a national women-led firm headquartered
19 here in Philadelphia that currently
20 employs more than 50 people in
21 Philadelphia, approximately 35 of which
22 work every day on the Indego system.

23 So with that, we respectfully
24 request that the Committee report Bill
25 200370 out of Committee and that the

1 Council rules be suspended to allow
2 first reading of the bill at the next
3 session of Council. I'm happy to
4 answer any questions you have and I'm
5 joined by Aaron Ritz, the Indego
6 program manager for oTIS and James
7 Tillit of the Law Department, who can
8 answer any law and contracting
9 questions that you have.

10 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
11 you, Christopher. We appreciate your
12 testimony and stand by.

13 We will hear from Alison
14 Cohen now. Alison, just state your
15 name for the record please, and proceed
16 with your testimony.

17 MS. COHEN: Great. Thank you
18 so much. Good after -- good evening,
19 Chair Parker, and Committee members.
20 My name is Alison Cohen. I am the
21 President and CEO of Bicycle Transit
22 Systems. I've lived in Mount Airy
23 section of Philadelphia, and the 8th
24 Council District. I grew up here in
25 Philadelphia. My wife and I have owned

1 our house in Mount Airy since 2009 and
2 we have a rising 2nd grader and two
3 rising kindergartners at our
4 neighborhood school Houston Elementary.

5 I'm honored to appear before
6 you today regarding Bill 200370 about
7 the concession contract in which Chris
8 just spoke to expand and operate
9 Indego. First of all, I want to thank
10 Council for recognizing that bikes and
11 bike share are core to providing
12 transportation to all Philadelphians
13 and key to helping the City recover
14 from the COVID pandemic and hearing
15 this bill in this very crowded and very
16 important summer session. Except for
17 the few of you whom I've had the
18 privilege to meet and even show you my
19 headquarters here in Philadelphia, you
20 probably never heard of myself or my
21 company Bicycle Transit.

22 Bike Transit based here in
23 Philadelphia has quietly and behind the
24 scenes powered growth, innovation and
25 equity and bike share here in

1 Philadelphia and across the U.S. for
2 the last five years. We operate bike
3 share systems in Philadelphia, Los
4 Angeles and Las Vegas. Bike Transit
5 has 130 employees nationwide, including
6 over 60 here in Philadelphia. The
7 Philadelphia employees both operate
8 Indego, lead our core company functions
9 and we run a 16-hour day, seven days a
10 week, 365-day-a-year call center for 15
11 bike share systems across the country.

12 Bike Transit has been a
13 contracted operator to the City since
14 inception in 2015 for Indego. The
15 successful partnership with OTIS with,
16 Independence Blue Cross, the Better
17 Bike Share Partnership and many other
18 stakeholders has led to results that we
19 are all deeply proud of. As Chris
20 mentioned, Indego has been a true
21 transportation system that has provided
22 over 3.5 million rides in five years.
23 Indego is a national leader in bike
24 share for accessible and equitable bike
25 share with over 30 percent of our

1 riders identifying as Black or Latinx
2 and 45 percent of our riders as
3 low-income.

4 Indego is a resilient
5 transportation system that is there
6 when Philly needs it. As Chris
7 discussed, our system stayed open
8 during all of the recent Black Lives
9 Matter protests when many other bike
10 share systems such as Washington, D.C.
11 Chicago and New York closed. Our
12 system has stayed open throughout the
13 COVID pandemic and has been highly used
14 by essential workers as SEPTA greatly
15 decreased service. In fact, the
16 low-income Access Pass has had
17 increased ridership since COVID, when
18 all other rider classes have decreased.
19 We've also been there during the Pope's
20 visit, the SEPTA strike, blizzards,
21 floods and everything else you can
22 imagine, we've been there.

23 The Indego stakeholder team
24 has been built on strong relationships
25 that have proven positive and resilient

1 through a turbulent five years here in
2 Philly in the micromobility industry
3 and in our country. Today the City has
4 taken the financial responsibility for
5 launching, growing and operating Indego
6 with Bike Transit as a contracted
7 operator. With the new concession
8 contract, Bike Transit will take on
9 responsibility to expand and operate
10 Indego for the next 10 years. The only
11 major area where Indego has fallen
12 short to date is that with only 140
13 stations and 1400 bikes is simply not
14 large enough to truly serve all
15 Philadelphians. Under this contract,
16 we're committing to expanding the
17 system to 3,500 bikes and 350 stations
18 across Philadelphia at no cost to the
19 City.

20 The expansion starting in
21 2021 will be distributed and expanding
22 to new areas and densifying the core
23 system to be able to accommodate the
24 new neighborhoods. The bidding process
25 was a competitive one. It was not just

1 handed out to the local champion. We
2 beat out tech giants Uber and Lyft and
3 others with an offer that includes more
4 than \$19 million in capital investment,
5 up to \$500,000 a year of support to the
6 City which is crucial to the system's
7 success. Bikes and bike share are key
8 aspects in enabling the economic
9 recovery in Philadelphia from the COVID
10 pandemic, and this is a role that we're
11 seeing bikes playing in cities all over
12 the world.

13 As communities have reopened
14 in China, Europe and elsewhere, people
15 are utilizing bikes and bike share as
16 socially distanced, reliable and
17 healthy means of transportation to get
18 back to work and for older children to
19 get to school. I encourage you to call
20 on oTIS and to myself and my company to
21 consider further ways which bike share
22 can support the City's needs during the
23 recovery.

24 Finally, I want to share for
25 a moment about myself and our company

1 and our commitment to Philadelphia and
2 to diversity, equity, inclusion and
3 justice. While living in Mount Airy, I
4 launched bike share systems in
5 Washington, D.C., Boston and New York.
6 I left that company and started Bike
7 Transit with a sole mission to win and
8 run Philadelphia and to start a company
9 that not only was an incredible
10 operations company, but that I could
11 control the values under which we
12 operated. Since just after startup,
13 Bike Transit has intentionally attacked
14 diversity, equity, inclusion and
15 justice head-on and created internal
16 systems and processes to include equity
17 in everything we do.

18 Currently, the demographics
19 of our company include -- excuse me, in
20 leadership, 31 percent female
21 leadership and 54 percent minority
22 leadership. And our overall workforce
23 is 36 percent female and 50 percent
24 non-White. That's what I mean when I
25 say minority. We'll continue always to

1 examine and re-examine how we can
2 deconstruct White privilege and power
3 within our company and within our bike
4 share systems. We'll continue to
5 create a just working environment for
6 our employees and utilize bike share as
7 a tool to fight for mobility and
8 economic justice for Black people and
9 other people of color in Philadelphia.

10 Thank you to the bill's
11 sponsor Councilmember Kendra Brooks and
12 the entire Committee for support of
13 this project. I respectfully ask that
14 the Committee move Bill 200370 forward
15 for City Council approval. Thank you
16 so much for your time and
17 consideration. I'm happy to answer any
18 questions you may have.

19 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: So,
20 Alison, thank you so very much for your
21 testimony, you as well, Christopher.

22 Alison, I want to have you
23 state for the record, when did you say
24 you bought your house in Mount Airy?

25 MS. COHEN: 2009.

1 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: So you
2 bought your house in 2009. I am proud
3 to note for the record that I was your
4 State Representative when you purchased
5 your house, so you made a good
6 investment. And while I don't have any
7 questions for you, as an
8 African-American woman who has lived
9 the life in skin that I don't have the
10 luxury of taking on and taking off, I
11 watch very carefully the people I see,
12 particularly as we watched over the
13 past few weeks as we look back on the
14 civil unrest, but I watched those who
15 have been saying that Black Lives
16 Matter and I watch very carefully
17 through that lens, and it's really
18 interesting that some folks say that
19 Black Lives Matter until it comes time
20 to talk about the sharing of real power
21 and ownership and in wealth and in
22 economics.

23 So I wanted to say to you,
24 one, thank you for putting your
25 investment and sharing in the wealth

1 and power of your business, and you've
2 done it not just as a woman-owned firm
3 but a diverse firm, both with your
4 employees and your Executive Board,
5 yes, we did our homework. You're a
6 locally grown firm and you successfully
7 expanded nationally. You continue to
8 grow. You talked about weathering
9 COVID.

10 And if my grandfather were
11 alive, he would say that he was the
12 person that taught me to always root
13 for the underdog. So when I found out
14 you did outbid the big guys, I was real
15 pleased to hear about that, so I want
16 to say thank you very much.

17 And I see that Councilman
18 Green has a comment. And if any other
19 members of the Committee have comments,
20 please queue up via chat. And
21 Councilwoman Brooks has asked to be
22 recognized after all members of the
23 Committee have spoken.

24 Chair now recognizes
25 Councilmember Green.

1 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Yes, I'll
2 be very brief. I want to thank my
3 colleague Councilmember Kendra Brooks
4 for sponsoring this legislation. I'm
5 honored to co-sponsor. I want to thank
6 Chris for the work that he does and,
7 Alison, for the great work that you've
8 been doing as an entrepreneur.

9 You must have gone to an
10 outstanding university, maybe somewhere
11 in Charlottesville. I'm not sure.
12 I've heard about it. I think
13 University of Virginia, plus you live
14 in Mount Airy also, wow, great
15 location.

16 Thank you, Madam Chair.

17 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
18 you, Councilmember Green.

19 If there are no further
20 questions from members of the
21 Committee, the Chair now recognizes
22 Councilmember Brooks.

23 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: Thank
24 you so much, Madam Chair.

25 I just wanted to comment real

1 quick and just say thank you for
2 allowing me to speak and be a part of
3 this hearing. And I also want to thank
4 Chris and Alison for their testimony
5 today and the work that they've done on
6 this program and even the
7 considerations that I pushed really
8 hard around the expansion to my
9 neighborhood, which is, you know, the
10 southern part of the Northwest division
11 as well as just the work that Alison
12 has done to become more connected. And
13 I'm very hopeful that Philadelphia as
14 we get on this road to recovery, that
15 safe, green and equitable,
16 transportations are available for
17 everyone and I'm really excited about
18 this work.

19 Thank you so much,
20 Councilperson and Chairperson Parker,
21 for this opportunity and have a great
22 day.

23 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Madam
24 Chair, I have a point of information.

25 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Sure.

1 Sure. Go ahead, Councilman Green.

2 COUNCILMAN GREEN: I believe
3 Councilmember Brooks is very familiar
4 with the very nice part of town.

5 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: Yes,
6 yes, yes.

7 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER:
8 Councilwoman Brooks, I want to note
9 that was very tastefully done, very
10 well done, and thank you for your
11 leadership.

12 The Chair now can visually
13 see Councilmember Squilla.
14 Councilmember Squilla, did you have any
15 comments that you wanted to make?

16 Okay. Are there any other
17 questions from members of the Committee
18 or is there anyone else here to testify
19 on the bill whose name has not been
20 called?

21 (No response.)

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Hearing
23 none, Rachel, will you please call the
24 first panel we have to testify this
25 afternoon on Bill No. 200355.

1 MS. COHEN: Chairperson

2 Parker, I had one more thing.

3 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Sure.

4 Sure.

5 MS. COHEN: I wanted to say
6 as a person who can also not change the
7 color of my skin, I have been digging
8 deep, especially these last few weeks
9 to understand not only what we've done
10 in the past four years at Bike Transit,
11 but what further I can do and I'm
12 deeply looking at the ownership and the
13 leadership of my company, the pressure
14 that I am putting on my supplier, my
15 colleagues, the people who report to me
16 to truly own systemic racism and to
17 take responsibility for it and do
18 better. So I recognize that power and
19 money mean everything and we intend to
20 follow that within bike share and Bike
21 Transit, so thank you so much for your
22 time.

23 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER:
24 Councilmember Brooks, I know you're
25 still watching. I think you better

1 recruit Alison because any smart
2 restart we have of Philadelphia's
3 economy, we need to have an
4 entrepreneur who's put their money,
5 their wealth, power and influence with
6 their Black Lives Matter verbal
7 commitment, so we don't have a whole
8 lot of people that walk the walk and
9 talk the talk so thank, Alison, again.

10 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: Yes.

11 MS. COHEN: Thank you.

12 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Rachel,
13 please call the first panel we have to
14 testify this afternoon on Bill No.
15 200355.

16 THE CLERK: It's just one
17 individual, Rich Lazer.

18 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: You've
19 been multi-tasking, Mr. Lazer. You've
20 been multi-tasking this whole time.

21 MR. LAZER: I try. I try.

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
23 you for your presence. Just state your
24 name for the record and please feel
25 free to proceed with your testimony.

1 MR. LAZER: Thank you. Good
2 afternoon, Chair Parker and members of
3 the Committee. My name is Rich Lazer.
4 I'm Deputy Mayor for Labor and I appear
5 before you today to testify in support
6 of Bill No. 200355.

7 In the summer of 2018, Bill
8 No. 180293 was passed and signed by
9 Mayor Kenney. This bill was to strike
10 and vacate the portion of Packer Avenue
11 from Delaware Avenue to the Pierhead
12 Line of Delaware River from the City
13 Plan. Bill No. 200355 is here for
14 consideration today because the
15 property owners have reached out to the
16 City to indicate that they need a
17 six-month extension in order to
18 complete the agreement.

19 There are a number of
20 property owners who will be affected by
21 the street closure and there have been
22 internal negotiations regarding an
23 agreement over the two-year window.
24 The City's understandings of
25 negotiations are nearly completed and

1 it's possible the parties will go
2 beyond the two-year mark. The
3 Philadelphia Regional Port Authority
4 has reached out to our department about
5 extending the deadline and we are happy
6 to collaborate with them on this
7 matter. I would also like to thank
8 Councilmember Squilla for introducing
9 the ordinance. This is an
10 Administration bill and we thank you
11 for considering it at this time. I'm
12 ready to answer any questions if you
13 have any.

14 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
15 you, Mr. Lazer, for your testimony.

16 Are there any questions or
17 comments from members of the Committee?

18 (No response.)

19 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Is
20 there anyone else here to testify on a
21 bill whose name has not been called
22 yet?

23 (No response.)

24 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: There
25 being no further questions from members

1 of the Committee and no other witnesses
2 to testify, I will ask if there's
3 anyone else present in this hearing
4 whose name we have failed to call and
5 that wishes to offer testimony on any
6 of the bills or resolutions that are
7 being considered today?

8 (No response.)

9 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Hearing
10 none, I want to thank all of the panels
11 and witnesses for their participation
12 today. We value your opinions. I now
13 invite all panels and witnesses to
14 please disconnect from the meeting
15 before we go into our public meeting.

16 We will now pause for a
17 minute, pause the proceedings and we
18 will briefly ask multiple participants
19 who are still on to please leave the
20 hearing. So, colleagues, this will
21 take our technical staff just a few
22 minutes, and then we will conclude the
23 public hearing and go into our public
24 meeting. So let's just give our
25 technical staff a few seconds.

1 Councilman Green, I see
2 you're queued up in the chat box. Is
3 that from previously? Do you have
4 anything you need to add?

5 COUNCILMAN GREEN: No, that
6 was previously. I'm ready for the
7 public meeting.

8 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay.
9 Got it. Thank you.

10 Technical team, you guys, let
11 us know, Lonnie, when we're ready to
12 proceed.

13 (Brief recess.)

14 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Rachel
15 and Lonnie, are we prepared now?

16 COUNCIL TECH SUPPORT: Yes,
17 we are ready on our end.

18 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay.
19 Thank you, Lonnie. This concludes the
20 public hearing of the Committee. We
21 will now go into a public meeting to
22 consider the action to be taken on the
23 bills before the Committee today. We
24 will now convene the public meeting.

25 Rachel, will you please call

1 the roll to take attendance. Members
2 that are in attendance will please
3 indicate that you are present when your
4 name is called. Also, please say a few
5 brief words when responding so that
6 your image will be displayed on the
7 screen as you speak.

8 Please call the roll.

9 THE CLERK: Councilmember
10 Derek Green.

11 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Present.
12 Ready for the public meeting.

13 THE CLERK: Councilmember
14 David Oh.

15 COUNCILMAN OH: Present.
16 Thank you for the hearing.

17 THE CLERK: Councilmember
18 Helen Gym.

19 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Present.
20 THE CLERK: Councilmember
21 Curtis Jones.

22 COUNCILMAN JONES: Present
23 and ready for the meeting.

24 THE CLERK: Councilmember
25 Brian O'Neill.

1 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Present.

2 I'm here.

3 THE CLERK: Councilmember
4 Cindy Bass.

5 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: I am
6 present. Thank you very much.

7 THE CLERK: Councilmember
8 Maria Quinones-Sanchez.

9 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-
10 SANCHEZ: Present and eager.

11 THE CLERK: Councilmember
12 Mark Squilla.

13 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Present.
14 And thank you, Madam Chair, for a great
15 hearing.

16 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Does
17 that conclude the roll, Rachel?

18 THE CLERK: Yes, it does.

19 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank
20 you.

21 The Chair recognizes
22 Councilmember Green for a motion on
23 Bill No. 200363.

24 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you,
25 Madam Chair.

1 I move that Bill No. 200363
2 be reported from this Committee with a
3 favorable recommendation and further
4 move that the rules of Council be
5 suspended to permit first reading of
6 this bill at the next session of
7 Council.

8 (Duly seconded.)

9 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The
10 Chair notes that for the record
11 Councilmember Oh has seconded that
12 motion.

13 It has been moved and
14 properly seconded that Bill No. 200363
15 be reported from this Committee with a
16 favorable recommendation and further
17 move that the rules of Council be
18 suspended to permit first reading of
19 this bill at the next session of
20 Council. All those in favor of the
21 motion will signify by saying aye.

22 (Aye.)

23 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Those
24 opposed?

25 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Madam

1 Chair Lady?

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Yes.

3 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: This is
4 Brian O'Neill. I'd like to be recorded
5 as voting no.

6 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay.
7 We have one nay vote that is
8 Councilmember O'Neill who will be
9 recorded as nay.

10 The ayes have it and the
11 motion carries.

12 The Chair recognizes
13 Councilmember Jones for a motion on
14 Bill No. 200367.

15 COUNCILMAN JONES: Thank you,
16 Madam Chair.

17 I move that Bill No. 200367
18 be reported from this Committee with a
19 favorable recommendation and further
20 move that the rules of Council be
21 suspended to permit first reading of
22 this bill at our next session of
23 Council.

24 (Duly seconded.)

25 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The

1 Chair notes for the record that
2 Councilmember David Oh seconds the
3 motion.

4 It has been moved and
5 properly seconded that Bill No. 200367
6 be reported from this Committee with a
7 favorable recommendation and further
8 move that the rules of Council be
9 suspended to permit first reading of
10 this bill at the next session of
11 Council. All those in favor of the
12 motion will signify by saying aye.

13 (Aye.)

14 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Those
15 opposed?

16 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: No.
17 Madam Chair Lady, Brian O'Neill. I'd
18 like to be recorded as voting no.

19 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER:
20 Councilmember Brian O'Neill will be
21 recorded as voting no. The ayes --

22 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: And also
23 on the resolution when it comes up.

24 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The
25 ayes have it and the motion carries.

1 The Chair recognizes
2 Councilmember Jones for a motion on the
3 amendment to Resolution No. 200377.

4 COUNCILMAN JONES: Thank you
5 again, Madam Chair.

6 I offer an amendment to
7 Resolution No. 200377. A copy of this
8 amendment has been circulated to all
9 members of the Committee and I move
10 that the amendment to Resolution No.
11 200377 be approved.

12 (Duly seconded.)

13 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The
14 Chair notes for the record that
15 Councilmember Oh seconds the motion.

16 It has been moved and
17 properly seconded that the amendment to
18 Resolution No. 200377 be approved. All
19 those in favor of the motion will
20 signify by saying aye.

21 (Aye.)

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: We have
23 one opposed, Councilman Brian O'Neill.

24 The ayes have it. The motion
25 carries. And the amendment to

1 Resolution No. 200377 has been
2 approved.

3 The Chair recognizes
4 Councilmember Jones for a motion on
5 Resolution No. 200377 as amended.

6 COUNCILMAN JONES: Thank you
7 again, Madam Chair.

8 I move that Resolution No.
9 200377 as amended be reported from this
10 Committee with a favorable
11 recommendation.

12 (Duly seconded.)

13 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The
14 Chair notes for the record that
15 Councilmember Oh seconds the motion.

16 It has been moved and
17 properly seconded that Resolution No.
18 200377 as amended be reported from this
19 Committee with a favorable
20 recommendation. All those in favor of
21 the motion will signify by saying aye.

22 (Aye.)

23 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Those
24 opposed?

25 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: No.

1 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: One no.

2 Councilmember O'Neill is a no.

3 The ayes have it and the
4 motion carries.

5 The Chair recognizes
6 Councilmember Green for a motion on the
7 amendment to Bill No. 200370.

8 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you,
9 Madam Chair.

10 I offer an amendment to Bill
11 No. 200370. A copy of the amendment
12 has been circulated to all members of
13 the Committee. I move that the
14 amendment to Bill No. 200370 be
15 approved.

16 (Duly seconded.)

17 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The
18 Chair notes for the record that
19 Councilmember Oh seconds the motion.

20 It has been moved and
21 properly seconded that the amendment to
22 Bill No. 200370 be approved. All those
23 in favor of the motion will signify by
24 saying aye.

25 (Aye.)

1 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Those
2 opposed?

3 (No response.)

4 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The
5 ayes have it and the motion carries,
6 and the amendment to Bill No. 200370
7 has been approved.

8 The Chair recognizes
9 Councilmember Green for a motion on
10 Bill No. 200370 as amended.

11 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you,
12 Madam Chair.

13 I move that Bill No. 200370
14 as amended be reported from this
15 Committee with a favorable
16 recommendation and further move that
17 the rules of Council be suspended to
18 permit first reading of this bill at
19 the next session of Council.

20 (Duly seconded.)

21 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The
22 Chair notes for the record that
23 Councilmember Oh seconds the motion.

24 It has been moved and
25 properly seconded that Bill No. 200370

1 as amended be reported from this
2 Committee with a favorable
3 recommendation and further move that
4 the rules of Council be suspended to
5 permit first reading of this bill at
6 the next session of Council. All those
7 in favor of the motion will signify by
8 saying aye.

9 (Aye.)

10 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Those
11 opposed?

12 (No response.)

13 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The
14 ayes have it and the motion carries.

15 The Chair recognizes
16 Councilmember Squilla for a motion on
17 Bill No. 200355.

18 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank
19 you, Madam Chair.

20 I move that the motion 2 --

21 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: 200355.

22 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: 200355
23 be approved with a suspension of the
24 rules to be read at the next session of
25 Council.

1 (Duly seconded.)

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER:

3 Seconded. So Councilman Squilla moved,
4 that he recommended that that bill be
5 reported from this Committee with a
6 favorable recommendation and that we
7 suspend the rules and permit first
8 reading at our next session of Council.
9 That motion was seconded by
10 Councilmember David Oh.

11 It has been moved and
12 properly seconded that Bill No. 200355
13 be reported from this Committee with a
14 favorable recommendation and further
15 move that the rules of Council be
16 suspended to permit first reading of
17 this bill at the next session of
18 Council. All those in favor of the
19 motion will significant by saying aye.

20 (Aye.)

21 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Those
22 opposed?

23 (No response.)

24 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The
25 ayes have it and the motion carries.

1 This concludes the meeting.
2 That concludes the business before the
3 Committee on Law and Government today,
4 and it was a long one but it was
5 necessary.

6 And, colleagues, I want to
7 say this: I think that everything that
8 needed to come together while we were
9 working during this hearing will
10 hopefully come together and once we get
11 off here, let's hope everything else is
12 smooth sailing as we go about trying to
13 bring some resolution in conducting the
14 people's business.

15 Thank you all so much for
16 your patience and have a good day.

17 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Great
18 job, Madam Chair. Thank you.

19 (Committee on Law and
20 Government adjourned at 6:10 p.m.)

21
22
23
24
25

- - -

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

I, hereby certify that the
proceedings and evidence noted are contained
fully and accurately in the stenographic
notes taken by me in the foregoing matter,
and this is a correct transcript of the
same.

Court Reporter - Notary Public

(The foregoing certification of
this transcript does not apply to any
reproduction of the same by any means,
unless under the direct control and/or
supervision of the certifying reporter.)

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 1

A	accommod...	add 5:8 65:1	adopted	176:25	175:11	142:6,16	23:4 25:15
a.m 76:24	42:8	73:4 182:4	39:13	178:14	178:1,9	151:2	25:23 31:11
Aaron 164:5	accomplish	addition	114:13	179:2	Alison's	Angeles	47:17 61:23
abilities	96:9	10:14 11:11	adult 21:21	agencies	162:20	92:25 93:8	61:24 69:17
22:20	accountabil...	11:18 13:2	adults 146:15	50:25 59:9	alive 141:8	166:4	92:9 97:25
ability 9:18	82:18 88:8	13:13 26:9	advances	111:10	173:11	anniversary	105:2
12:1 14:9	90:17	52:22 56:13	77:17,17	112:7	alleged 87:21	161:9	158:14
23:16 27:4	108:16	76:17 106:2	advantage	agency	109:3	announcem...	164:11
73:22 87:10	109:14	additional	38:16	113:20	allow 8:18	2:5	appreciated
87:18 89:20	110:1	55:7,13	Advisory	121:12,14	121:7 164:1	answer 12:3	68:12
127:17	113:21	93:7 115:13	79:15 87:6	agenda 27:10	allowed	15:15 16:22	approached
157:15	121:6 123:2	125:13	90:8 100:19	115:24,24	28:21 73:15	17:5 43:19	77:15
able 22:21	128:17	additionally	109:21,24	aggregate	allowing	54:19 164:4	appropriate
26:22 41:12	156:5 157:4	8:13 94:14	111:5 129:7	94:2	39:16 87:22	164:8	7:4 39:10
50:14,17	accountable	96:16	advocacy	aggressively	150:1	171:17	74:25 78:9
66:11 73:24	89:16 100:9	address 9:21	132:13	109:7	161:15	180:12	95:13
74:1,9	107:24	11:13	advocate	aggressors	175:2	answered	103:22
121:15	115:18	100:11	96:1	42:14	allows 10:15	113:10	122:18,21
122:24	119:20	107:4	advocate-le...	ago 39:14	Alphonso	Anti-violence	appropriated
132:25	152:2 157:2	134:23	116:3	128:2	38:2	88:22	113:25
154:19	accurate 62:3	addresses	Affairs	agree 22:16	alternatives	Anton 90:22	approval
168:23	accurately	64:19	108:21	22:25 23:8	89:5	Antwon	171:15
absence 88:3	195:4	addressing	156:2	23:8 41:2	Alton 90:22	122:13	approved
absolutely	accusing	12:18 89:1	157:22	120:22	amen 119:6	apologize	6:24 22:14
4:6 48:19	14:10	adds 75:11	affect 9:25	142:25	amend 85:9	18:23 20:9	85:15
98:20 99:6	achieve	77:23	affiliated	agreement	amended	appear	188:11,18
102:25	163:10	adequate	54:14	7:11 10:2	189:5,9,18	159:24	189:2
absurd	achieved	11:12 64:19	affirming	46:12,13	191:10,14	165:5 179:4	190:15,22
127:19	163:16	66:12 110:9	43:9	160:4	192:1	appetite	191:7
abuse 92:4	acknowledge	112:17	affording	179:18,23	amending	136:5	192:23
100:2	18:3 43:21	117:1	107:3	agrees 97:6	5:18 6:10	applaud	approxima...
116:15	acknowled...	148:24	African- 83:2	ahead 176:1	amendment	91:11	57:17 92:12
152:7	11:17 21:13	adequately	African-A...	aiming 73:2	6:25 7:18	apples 156:7	163:21
academically	65:13 68:8	20:20	58:2	airport 19:21	7:25 63:16	applicants	arbitration
146:6	acknowled...	adjourned	African-A...	Airy 164:22	72:25 188:3	16:6	133:5
academy	118:8	194:20	39:5 59:23	165:1 170:3	188:6,8,10	application	134:11,22
72:14	acknowled...	adjudication	72:19 76:19	171:24	188:17,25	146:16	136:7,12
accept 12:13	61:25 65:8	114:4	130:24	174:14	190:7,10,11	applications	137:1,3,17
acceptance	65:16	administeri...	172:8	aisle 134:14	190:14,21	64:3	137:18
6:7	acquired	88:20	African-A...	134:17	191:6	applied 37:12	arbitrations
access 12:10	65:6	Administra...	37:14,22,23	alarming	America	38:17	134:20
27:4 104:9	Act 8:21	15:24 23:6	AFSCME	13:12	66:22 131:6	applies 9:24	arbitrator
104:12,14	action 91:10	23:17 24:8	48:1,8	albeit 107:12	American	apply 11:19	136:21
112:14,15	149:8	26:8,23	afternoon 2:3	Ali 31:16	83:3	46:5 63:25	137:2,21
115:2 117:2	182:22	74:20,21	3:24 4:1,6	32:1,2 36:2	amount 58:7	195:20	arbitrators
121:12	actions 89:16	87:2,5	4:10 14:24	36:2 43:8	93:3 113:25	applying	136:11,13
161:17	108:11	112:17	15:3 31:17	47:11,13	ample 112:13	38:15 64:9	136:15
167:16	active 36:10	136:19	32:1,13	142:25	analyze 87:11	68:25	137:7,12,13
accessed	40:11	162:23	47:16 71:12	Alison 158:20	and/or	appointed	137:20
66:10,11	134:15	180:10	84:18 85:1	158:22	100:22	6:14 11:19	area 54:2,3,9
accessible	activity 29:9	Administra...	85:20 90:5	164:13,14	103:7	45:19	102:18
166:24	acts 35:14	88:7	107:5	164:20	195:22	appointment	145:20
accommod...	107:22	Administra...	158:18	171:20,22	Andy 141:14	6:19 162:3	168:11
168:23	actual 24:1	15:10 95:22	159:5	174:7 175:4	141:15,18	appreciate	areas 60:17

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 2

143:16	attempted	11:15 64:24	bad 66:18	beliefs 148:7	160:15,20	71:12 72:23	144:2
144:7	54:7	65:20 99:7	137:3	believe 16:1	162:10,15	81:7,10	145:22
168:22	attendance	105:8	142:18,21	20:5 35:15	162:17	85:8 90:12	161:24
argue 38:11	2:22,24	175:16	156:7	41:16 44:10	163:7,17	105:4 124:3	167:1,8
argument	183:1,2	Avenue 5:24	badge 143:19	46:18,22	164:21	134:12	171:8
34:11,13	attending	6:6 179:10	bag 76:4,6	57:25 60:12	165:21	136:6	172:15,19
arrangeme...	162:2	179:11	83:20	64:23 74:19	bicycles	138:18	178:6
7:5	attention	average	ballot 72:25	75:16	161:6	158:18	Blacks 37:20
arrested	13:19 72:5	93:20	85:16 111:2	124:15,22	bidders	159:15,25	Blackwell
153:15	75:8 94:1,6	119:24	114:6	154:24	162:12	160:1,13	36:22 37:3
arrests 103:7	attitude	145:9	151:20	160:23	bidding	163:24	38:19
articles	148:2	avoid 155:4	ban 129:23	176:2	168:24	164:2 165:6	Bland 90:23
148:11	attitudes	aware 8:6	bank 146:4	Bell 31:16	bids 162:19	165:15	blessed 141:8
aside 20:23	148:3	16:13 27:22	barely 157:1	32:4,8	big 13:7	171:14	blizzards
asked 9:4	attorney	64:15 90:15	bargaining	35:25 39:21	79:12 149:5	176:19,25	167:20
36:17 37:3	53:19	96:7 150:11	10:1 46:9	39:22,25	173:14	178:14	block 29:2,5
131:15	Attorney's	aye 185:21,22	46:11	40:2,8,9	bigger 79:25	179:6,7,9	29:14
152:23	156:17	187:12,13	bark 110:25	43:8,18	157:11,12	179:13	125:23
173:21	attorneys	188:20,21	Barney 142:2	44:8,10	bike 160:7,18	180:10,21	153:1
asking 59:3	156:19,22	189:21,22	barrier 21:9	45:9 47:11	165:11,22	184:23	blocked
80:5 81:19	attract 9:19	190:24,25	base 30:25	47:12 143:1	165:25	185:1,6,14	153:22
aspect 91:23	12:2	192:8,9	42:5,9	belt 29:12	166:2,4,11	185:19	blocks 153:8
aspects 95:17	audience	193:19,20	44:17	benefit 9:8	166:12,17	186:14,17	153:20
169:8	69:20	ayes 186:10	based 165:22	25:24 53:4	166:23,24	186:22	Blondell 21:4
assess 95:18	audio 31:22	187:21,25	basic 49:7	53:8 56:21	167:9 168:6	187:5,10	blue 10:10
assessment	audit 101:22	188:24	basically 37:7	58:5 59:4	168:8 169:7	190:7,10,14	57:1 123:24
114:11	auditing	190:3 191:5	63:21	69:20 150:9	169:15,21	190:22	124:6
assigned	95:20	192:14	basis 39:5	161:1	170:4,6,13	191:6,10,13	166:16
145:15,16	101:20	193:25	98:23	benefits	171:3,6	191:18,25	blueprint
145:21	audits 95:18		basketball	38:21 42:5	177:10,20	192:5,17	108:6
146:2	102:9	B	131:8	44:16,19,20	177:20	193:4,12,17	Blues 124:18
assist 105:15	Augusta	B 77:11	Bass 1:11 4:4	51:16	bikes 161:4,5	bill's 160:8	board 22:24
assistance	53:18	baby 141:5	4:5 81:3,4	best 36:23	165:10	171:10	59:16 73:7
106:3,4,5	authority	141:12	82:3 184:4	37:4 96:7	168:13,17	bills 1:17	91:25 93:9
118:10,11	58:22,23	Bachelor's	184:5	140:4	169:7,11,15	5:16 15:20	93:19 95:25
118:12	110:18	50:3,4	batting	145:14	Bilal 31:15	29:17 91:7	110:13,16
associated	112:14,19	back 18:11	86:10 163:1	148:22	31:18,19,24	123:1	111:3,7
112:6	113:5,9,18	18:20 22:1	beat 169:2	163:9	32:10,14	134:10	112:12
association	114:14	75:22,23	beauty 42:15	better 12:8	35:21 72:15	136:2,5	113:1,3,7
111:13,17	115:10	77:19 82:24	becoming	14:17 22:25	142:25	150:14	114:17,19
151:17	117:1 180:3	100:15	9:15	44:25 80:18	bill 5:12,18	181:6	116:25
associations	authorize	131:14	began 108:3	89:21 127:3	8:24 9:5,11	182:23	117:18
54:14	7:22	138:12	beginning 2:6	137:21	9:18,24	bipartisan	119:16
assuming	authorizes	141:22	56:18	149:11	10:3 12:1	135:3	121:15
12:4	85:12 160:1	147:19	118:23	166:16	14:13,25	bit 24:22	124:21
At-large 30:5	authorizing	152:12	behalf 7:10	177:18,25	15:9,15,25	162:9	173:4
Atlanta 86:1	5:20 6:7	154:2	9:6	beyond 55:17	16:14,18,19	bite 117:9	boards 93:15
Attached	7:3,9	169:18	behavior	61:9 66:3	27:11 31:14	Black 11:5	93:18
96:12	autism 83:6	172:13	78:5 126:16	104:17	33:22 34:20	34:3,15	108:19
attack 72:24	84:2,4	back-end	behaviors	180:2	35:19 36:16	40:10,14,20	109:9,12,15
attacked	automatica...	101:3	74:5 126:18	bias 41:18	36:18 37:10	55:5 69:23	112:4 115:8
170:13	76:12	background	126:22	89:17	38:10 46:3	84:3 86:16	115:12,15
attempt	available	19:24 44:12	belief 87:25	bicycle 7:12	47:9 67:15	94:11,17	115:16,21
55:12	8:18 10:20	74:17	148:4,4	7:14 160:4	67:25 71:6	107:8 134:7	body 16:12

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 3

25:17 115:3 body's 87:10 body-on-ca... 101:18,20 102:12 bold 75:6 bolster 115:14 bombing 91:4 bona 6:18 bookbag 83:14 boomer 141:6,12 boost 87:19 born 126:20 borne 109:24 boss 73:11 Boston 170:5 Botham 90:20 bought 76:20 171:24 172:2 Boulevard 5:25 box 17:9 18:6 182:2 branch 139:21 Brandon 91:2 breakdown 58:1 bred 146:23 Breonna 90:23 107:20 brevity 15:19 27:12 Brian 1:13 4:3,25 5:4,8 183:25 186:4 187:17,20 188:23 brief 3:2 78:24 140:4 174:2 182:13 183:5 briefly	102:22 181:18 bright 148:21 brightest 36:24 37:5 bring 41:12 89:10 194:13 broad 125:4 broadcast 40:16 broadly 66:18 broken 107:18 120:8 Brooks 1:11 39:9 86:1 90:19 107:21 160:9 171:11 173:21 174:3,22,23 176:3,5,8 177:24 178:10 brother 153:18 brought 86:20 98:12 107:14 147:23 Brown 21:5 90:21 91:2 budget 26:6 92:11,12 93:16,17 96:21 157:11 budgets 97:1 build 109:12 115:17 building 160:17 built 167:24 built-up 116:9 bulk 106:7 bullet 115:19 bullets 142:9 Bullock 105:7,10,13 106:10,12	106:14 117:24 118:6 119:4 130:8 132:12 133:22,24 134:3,5 138:3,14 bunch 100:4 business 118:12 173:1 194:2 194:14 businesses 106:6 butter 159:18 C C 195:1,1 cadets 145:13 cadre 148:21 call 2:21 4:19 8:24 14:23 26:25 31:13 47:8 67:14 67:21 71:10 84:12 86:25 90:17 105:3 138:17 147:7 158:16 162:16 166:10 169:19 176:23 178:13 181:4 182:25 183:8 called 3:1 71:7 77:13 109:10 145:21 152:22 153:4,11 155:10 176:20 180:21 183:4 calling 88:9 calls 67:19 132:21 camera 115:4 campus	70:10,24 candy 23:20 capable 158:1 capacity 9:13 152:1 capital 169:4 car 29:11 75:23 76:18 99:15 120:4 120:7 131:9 131:11,11 152:13,14 152:23,25 153:4,7,12 153:16 154:1,7,11 154:14 156:17 carburetor's 120:10 card 75:18 83:13,22 care 29:25 116:19 158:1 cared 155:23 careful 159:21 carefully 134:21 172:11,16 carpe 78:7 carried 74:20 141:23 carries 186:11 187:25 188:25 190:4 191:5 192:14 193:25 carry 145:1 carve-outs 20:3 case 13:1 24:4 28:3 153:5 cases 74:25 86:4 95:6 95:23 115:10 156:20 category	163:12 Catherine 47:25 Cathy 47:15 53:6 caucus 107:8 107:13 134:7 caught 131:12 cause 25:12 CCP 21:14 21:16 55:7 center 166:10 Century 116:2 CEO 164:21 Cephas 77:11 certain 6:9 7:6,16 25:14 28:1 73:21,24 74:5 79:17 101:11 119:19 125:21 certainly 69:12 100:12 101:3 129:13,14 137:23 156:14 certification 195:19 certifications 28:14 certified 69:25 certify 195:2 certifying 195:23 Chair 1:10 3:16,23 9:2 15:4 18:13 27:6,9 28:5 28:19 30:18 39:20 47:17 60:13 71:17 71:25 78:16 78:19,22 80:23 81:2 81:5 82:1,4 82:7 84:9	97:20,23 103:11 104:2 106:24 130:13 132:2 138:2 150:21 151:13 159:5 164:19 173:24 174:16,21 174:24 175:24 176:12 179:2 184:14,21 184:25 185:10 186:1,12,16 187:1,17 188:1,5,14 189:3,7,14 190:5,9,18 191:8,12,22 192:15,19 194:18 chairing 140:1 Chairperson 32:2 85:1 175:20 177:1 Chairwoman 5:1 68:10 106:14 117:21 challenge 22:2 46:11 46:14 60:19 83:4,17,19 109:2 132:10 challenges 86:10 98:7 challenging 24:22 83:8 108:8 chamber 107:12 Chambers 133:13 champion 38:9 169:1	chance 23:13 79:12,22 127:1 change 21:2 41:5 78:5 86:22 88:1 93:6 95:12 110:10 116:10 129:4 136:7 147:8,9 152:3 163:2 177:6 changed 22:9 29:15 120:8 changes 78:9 114:13,13 115:14 changing 25:2 Channel 72:4 Charlottes... 174:11 Charter 7:1 7:19 10:15 63:20 65:23 73:1 85:10 119:18 charting 94:6 chat 8:17,21 17:9 18:6 173:20 182:2 checkered 110:8 Cherelle 1:10 10:21 13:19 32:17 70:19 132:20 140:1 Chestnut 11:3 77:6 Cheyney 11:8 54:9 Chicago 92:25 93:14 113:1 167:11 Chief 15:10 child 126:21 141:6,14 children 43:1 43:4 84:2 146:18	169:18 China 169:14 choice 105:20 chokeholds 129:23 choose 28:12 Chris 165:7 166:19 167:6 174:6 175:4 Christopher 5:25 158:19 158:22,24 159:7 164:11 171:21 chronicled 76:19 Chuck 68:4 Cindy 1:11 4:4 184:4 circulated 188:8 190:12 cities 12:23 87:25 89:8 108:14 112:3,22 115:12 139:18 157:9 169:11 citizen 33:3 76:8 111:7 111:10 124:21 145:4 citizenry 13:6 citizens 7:2 7:20 12:9 22:3 33:2 49:6 72:21 73:3 78:10 78:14 81:13 85:11 87:7 87:16 89:19 103:24 111:3 114:3 114:5 119:16 143:6 152:9 156:9 158:2 citizens' 74:7 city 1:1 2:8
---	--	--	--	---	---	--	---

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 4

5:21,22 6:2	65:12 66:22	23:18 32:20	classify 101:2	178:11	117:20	73:4,6,14	140:19
6:8,18,22	66:23 68:15	36:5 43:12	clean 42:7	cohort 44:2	126:6	73:18,20	144:16
7:10,22 9:2	73:3,15,16	48:22 49:3	clear 46:18	cohosts 40:14	149:21	74:3,12,13	148:18
9:13,14,16	74:4 81:15	51:1,20	104:9,16	cold 123:22	159:14	74:16,18	151:14
9:18 10:24	82:20 83:3	55:24 57:11	clearly 45:25	collaborate	162:5 194:8	75:8 79:16	158:10
11:15,21	83:12 85:13	58:25 60:14	97:6	180:6	194:10	85:12 87:6	159:6
12:1,7,16	85:15,17,21	68:14 69:3	Clerk 3:5,10	collaboration	comedy	87:8,17	160:25
13:5,7,9,25	86:14 88:14	161:20	3:13,20 4:2	132:16	142:11	89:19 90:8	163:24,25
14:6,9,20	90:16 91:8	162:2	4:7,13,20	collaborati...	comes 13:5	94:20 96:11	164:19
15:11 16:3	91:12,18,19	172:14	5:8,17 15:1	16:17	37:5 122:11	96:18	171:12,14
16:3 17:14	93:2,14	civilian 93:3	18:7 31:15	collar 10:10	137:24	100:19	173:19,23
19:2,8	96:10,24	94:7,19	47:14 52:16	56:24 57:2	141:9	109:1,21,22	174:21
20:15 22:2	97:6,10,13	109:8	67:24 71:14	57:15	172:19	109:24	176:17
22:20 23:10	97:14	110:12,16	84:14 105:6	colleague	187:23	110:6,7	179:3
23:12,15,15	105:16	110:20	138:20	66:17 79:4	comfort	111:6 129:7	180:17
23:25 24:3	106:18,23	111:14	158:19	119:4 121:4	125:22	135:19	181:1
24:7 26:1	107:10	113:1,3,6	178:16	132:19	comical	140:22,24	182:20,23
27:15 28:1	108:2 110:3	113:19,20	183:9,13,17	174:3	142:13	151:22,25	185:2,15
30:9 33:2,3	113:4 115:1	113:22	183:20,24	colleagues	coming 11:1	157:5,13,17	186:18
33:7,10,11	117:4,13	114:1,16	184:3,7,11	3:17 17:10	22:14 52:1	commissio...	187:6 188:9
33:12,15	118:25	115:7,14,16	184:18	26:19 59:5	73:9 77:14	7:10 37:19	189:10,19
34:2,6 35:6	120:21,22	115:20	climate 29:14	67:4 82:14	96:16	93:11	190:13
35:8,12	122:5,10,11	civilian-	163:2	133:9	138:12	Commissio...	191:15
37:7 38:6	122:14	92:21	close 35:24	134:13	command	97:11	192:2 193:5
41:22,24,25	123:21	civilian-led	94:1 130:24	136:18	41:12	commissions	193:13
42:3,10,10	124:24	93:15	closed 167:11	177:15	commend	73:6,8	194:3,19
42:25 43:3	125:20	108:18	closely	181:20	123:9	157:10	committees
43:11,22,24	127:2,23	116:24	134:12	194:6	124:25	commitment	2:9,14
44:1,11,11	128:5	civilians	closest 55:14	collection	commending	81:20,23	135:12,14
44:15 45:1	129:10,25	116:12	closing 131:4	100:16	132:19	87:3 160:10	135:18,20
45:3,12,17	133:2	clarification	closure	collective	comment	162:25	144:17
45:20,22	139:20	24:18 52:25	179:21	10:1 46:9	28:19 46:3	170:1 178:7	committing
46:1,4,7,10	141:5 143:7	68:11	co-convener	46:11,13	78:24	committed	35:14
46:15,16,19	143:9	clarify 56:19	40:9	108:12	173:18	16:7,16	168:16
46:20 48:17	144:23	clarifying	co-sponsor	college 11:3	174:25	89:9 97:8	commonse...
48:20,23	148:20	25:23 69:18	117:11	21:15,15	commentary	Committee	43:14
49:5,7,19	149:1,23	77:25	174:5	22:6 43:2	82:10	1:2 3:9	Commonw...
49:21,24	160:1,11,21	Clarion	co-sponsors	50:4 149:4	comments	4:23 5:11	27:16 42:23
50:17,21	161:1	55:16	160:13	colleges 11:5	8:15 9:1	9:3 15:5,7	78:10 109:5
51:14,15,18	165:13	clarity 68:7	coalition	55:6 61:2	31:4 32:25	31:6 32:15	118:24
51:22 52:1	166:13	Clark 53:18	109:25	68:20 69:12	47:3 67:5	32:18 42:16	119:3,11
53:11,13,25	168:3,19	90:21	code 6:12	colonies	103:15	47:4 52:16	121:2 123:8
54:6,17	169:6	Clarke 9:4	36:14 77:5	148:1	104:21	52:18 60:13	129:19
55:2,8,12	171:15	75:5 150:11	108:23	color 35:6	119:5,7	68:3 72:1	communicate
55:13,21,22	179:12,16	151:13	111:23	58:2 86:16	130:10	79:1 85:3	83:10,16,23
55:25 56:17	City's 21:14	class 27:15	123:24	87:15 171:9	138:7 140:4	90:10 95:7	communica...
56:19 57:10	73:5 152:1	classes 22:10	124:6,18	177:7	158:10	104:22	102:1
57:13,19	169:22	34:25 51:9	codify 148:8	Columbus	173:19	106:24	communica...
58:10,19,21	179:24	167:18	Cohen	5:25	176:15	107:3	87:23
60:5,7,13	civil 6:15 9:3	classification	158:20	Comcast	180:17	108:10	communities
60:25 61:3	9:13,24	101:6	164:14,17	149:10,11	commission	117:13	20:23 87:15
61:18 62:21	10:5,7,15	classificatio...	164:20	come 2:21	7:3,21,24	130:12	88:24
63:20 64:5	13:23 16:5	28:9 48:11	171:25	38:25 60:12	10:16 23:18	134:10	107:19
64:7,24	17:13,17	56:2 57:16	177:1,5	67:19	72:11,22	138:8	125:7 126:2

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 5

126:11,16	100:10	194:1,2	considerati...	continuously	188:7	118:20,21	150:20,23
129:17	152:11	conclusion	100:3	161:19	190:11	120:15	150:24
169:13	155:8	97:2	171:17	contract	core 93:23,24	123:1,10	151:4,6
community	complaints	concrete	179:14	16:10 50:23	111:23	125:1	173:17
21:15 42:19	74:8 94:8	102:19	considerati...	163:17	165:11	127:24	174:1
50:4 87:23	95:12 99:13	concretely	175:7	165:7 168:8	166:8	128:4,5,9	175:23
89:12 95:10	99:22 100:2	103:9	considered	168:15	168:22	150:11	176:1,2
108:3	110:20	concur 3:23	64:10 96:14	contracted	Corp 37:12	151:12	182:1,5
112:19	113:15	conditions	100:24	50:24	corporation	159:25	183:11,15
115:5	114:3,6,20	6:9 7:7,16	181:7	160:22	149:14	162:24	183:22
116:20	complete	25:2 130:22	considering	166:13	corporations	164:1,3,24	184:1,13,24
117:19	50:8 112:24	147:10,11	112:24	168:6	149:15	165:10	185:25
125:15	155:14	147:17	115:13	contracting	correct 27:16	171:15	186:3,15
127:2,9,9	179:18	conduct	121:3	51:23 164:8	27:21 62:6	182:16	187:16,22
127:15,16	completed	87:19	180:11	contractors	80:16 99:4	185:4,7,17	188:4,23
128:11,14	179:25	110:19	considers	50:22 51:2	195:6	185:20	189:6,25
128:15,24	completely	157:15	79:20	51:14	corrected	186:20,23	190:8
144:23	128:8	conducted	consistent	contracts	120:14	187:8,11	191:11
145:3,6	144:24	88:12	128:9	51:17	Correctional	191:17,19	192:18,22
company	complex	conducting	consistently	contribute	20:4	192:4,6,25	193:3
160:16,23	108:7,8	194:13	103:9	44:21	correctly	193:8,15,18	194:17
162:21	comply 8:20	confidence	constituency	112:11	99:1	Council's 9:2	Councilma...
165:21	component	78:12	14:18 20:21	123:18	corroborate	60:13 79:2	28:24,25
166:8	115:23	119:23	constituents	contributes	99:19	124:10	Councilme...
169:20,25	composition	confident	13:18 14:13	89:2	corruption	151:20	3:5,10,13
170:6,8,10	7:23 103:5	74:9	Constitution	contributing	116:15	158:4	3:20 4:2,4,7
170:19	compositions	confidential	148:10	30:25 42:8	cost 168:18	Councilman	4:13 15:4,6
171:3	85:14	73:25	constitutio...	control	Costa 121:5	1:10,12,13	18:5 24:14
177:13	comprehen...	confrontati...	88:19 89:12	127:17	Council 1:1	1:13,14 3:7	29:22 82:5
comparable	98:13	124:8	constrained	170:11	2:8,14 6:24	3:12,22	82:8,9
28:8	computer	confuse	80:1,3	195:22	7:22 9:4	4:25 5:4,7,8	84:11 90:9
compare	17:25 18:24	140:15	104:6	controversial	10:8 15:7	18:4,12,15	90:9 94:22
62:17	concentrati...	connected	contact 83:15	86:4 124:13	16:17 34:21	18:16 27:6	104:4
compared	99:21	32:8 47:21	contained	convene	35:18 36:12	27:8,19	106:22
56:25	concern 14:7	84:19	195:3	182:24	38:20 39:10	28:4 30:20	123:25
compartme...	83:19	175:12	contempor...	convenient	40:10,15,20	32:24 36:15	130:14
154:14	concerned	connecting	110:19	163:4	44:14 48:1	36:19,20,21	132:3 138:5
compassion	41:4 49:25	89:3 122:3	contention	convening	48:9 51:12	36:25 37:1	160:8
42:25	155:10	connections	37:9	140:2	52:20 56:25	37:2 38:8	171:11
compelled	concerns	114:9	context 60:3	conversation	57:4 58:8	45:11 70:4	173:25
27:13	9:21 119:22	consenting	93:7	33:5 83:25	58:17 59:6	71:16,19,20	174:3,18,22
competencies	134:23	8:12	continue	84:5,7	59:15,20	71:23,24	176:3,13,14
111:24	concession	consequence	50:14 60:11	119:1	62:1,8,13	78:18 82:6	177:24
competitive	7:11 160:4	51:20	86:11,24	142:22	62:23 65:3	85:2 98:3,4	180:8 183:9
12:22	160:5 165:7	consequenc...	94:25	conversatio...	66:1,4,6	103:14,16	183:13,17
168:25	168:7	155:25	125:12	83:7 97:25	73:16 79:19	107:1 111:1	183:20,24
compiling	conclude	consider 39:7	129:6,10	132:23	80:23 85:13	117:11	184:3,7,11
108:4	4:19 52:5	51:19 99:23	163:14	136:18	85:16 88:6	124:1	184:22
complained	126:5	100:21	170:25	155:19,21	91:8,12,19	125:10	185:11
156:20	181:22	104:8 111:9	171:4 173:7	cool 154:8	93:5 97:6	130:15	186:8,13
complaint	184:17	112:10	continued	coordinated	97:14	132:1,4,5,9	187:2,20
75:2 92:20	concludes	117:15	160:10	117:4	107:11	138:1	188:2,15
94:12,15,16	16:21 130:5	169:21	continuing	cops 153:21	110:3 115:2	139:24	189:4,15
99:19,20	182:19	182:22	8:11	copy 52:12	117:13	145:11	190:2,6,19

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 6

191:9,23	117:23	112:3	120:16	cycle 25:4	98:23	deeply	137:13
192:16	120:18	126:25	129:16		days 166:9	155:23	demos 162:12
193:10	130:7	146:8	135:23	D	DC 56:22,23	166:19	denials 146:4
Councilme...	131:25	147:20	144:25	D.C 114:19	58:15 62:17	177:12	Dennis 91:2,3
33:1 110:4	132:7 138:4	148:23	147:1	167:10	62:19 63:1	Defender	densifying
Councilper...	138:10,22	161:18	criminalized	170:5	65:10	151:17,17	168:22
29:23	138:25	166:11	147:5	DA's 82:16	de-escalate	Defense	Denver 115:6
175:20	139:4,9	168:3	criminals	daily 2:16	141:25	156:18	department
Councilwo...	140:1,9	county 30:16	145:19	39:5 76:25	142:7	define 148:14	11:23 20:7
1:10,11,11	150:3,22	70:6,8,17	146:1	damaged	de-escalating	148:15	30:10,14
1:12,14 2:2	151:3 158:6	70:22	crisis 161:12	146:20	102:5	defining	36:8 37:6
3:15,25 4:5	158:12,21	coupled	161:15	danger	142:17	100:17	37:16,21
4:9,15,18	164:10	143:20	critical 87:13	152:10	dead- 153:22	definitely	38:4,12
4:21 5:2,6	171:19	courage	115:21,22	dangerous	deadline	99:12 151:5	41:8 70:8
8:2 16:25	172:1	86:25	critically	145:3	180:5	degree 22:1,6	87:12 93:4
17:7 18:1	173:21	course 86:11	119:9	156:10	deal 21:7	50:3,5,12	93:10,13
18:14,18	174:17,23	90:13 93:4	Cross 166:16	Darrell 75:5	22:21 31:11	53:20 61:10	95:20 96:1
19:9 20:9	175:25	96:8 142:11	crowded	data 17:24	38:2 129:15	63:5,8 69:7	98:6,9,22
20:13 21:4	176:5,7,8	154:15	165:15	95:14,16	129:22	69:14 70:2	100:20
21:19 23:2	176:22	Court 195:12	crucial 169:6	99:2,23	130:22	76:8 77:20	102:6,19
24:16 25:21	177:3,23	courtesy 77:3	CTE 22:7,14	100:16	dealing 41:14	78:12	113:8,16,24
30:19 31:8	178:10,12	92:4 152:13	cultural	101:1 114:3	132:24	degree-gra...	114:10,23
31:19,25	178:18,22	153:9	41:18	121:16	137:6	69:23	121:18
32:3,16,21	180:14,19	covering	culture 35:4	data's 18:25	159:16	degrees	122:17
35:20 36:21	180:24	139:18	35:5	database	dealt 124:11	50:15 61:3	164:7 180:4
38:19 39:18	181:9 182:8	COVID	curious 133:7	121:6	debate	61:4	department's
40:4 43:6	182:14,18	165:14	133:19	122:21	104:17	Delaware 6:1	88:17 93:17
45:6,9	183:19	167:13,17	current 2:7	databases	debates	52:1 139:17	96:20
46:25 47:6	184:5,9,16	169:9 173:9	74:13 94:25	104:16	104:11	179:11,12	departments
47:19 52:3	184:19	COVID-19	95:8 96:1	date 161:8	decades-long	delay 25:12	15:18 16:24
52:8 53:18	185:9,23	7:15 86:12	107:13	168:12	86:19	Delegation	19:11 20:12
54:24 56:3	186:2,6,25	132:22,25	114:24	daughter	decayed	106:22	25:14 92:24
58:4,13	187:14,19	161:15	115:15	36:10 76:23	146:3	deliberation	93:1 98:21
59:2,12,21	187:24	craft 97:15	156:11	David 1:13	decent 42:6	159:21	108:12
59:25 61:21	188:13,22	crazy 153:24	157:1	3:11 91:3	decided	deliberations	112:2 121:7
62:7 64:1	189:13,23	create 108:17	161:12	183:14	100:5	159:13	deployed
64:16 65:2	190:1,17	117:9,18	163:16	187:2	decision 71:1	delinquency	144:2
65:5,24	191:1,4,21	143:17	currently 2:4	193:10	106:1	146:21	deputies
66:7 67:8	192:10,13	151:21,24	2:9 12:14	day 4:11	decision-m...	delivering	11:23
67:18 68:1	192:21	157:5 171:5	16:4 26:1	21:20 32:15	95:17	118:9	125:19
69:16 71:9	193:2,21,24	created 74:18	27:25 28:3	97:24	decisions	demand	deputy 16:9
71:18,22	counsel	79:16	53:25 57:4	116:17	73:12	116:10	85:4 125:23
78:17,19,21	125:15	170:15	62:18 65:9	124:5,17	128:21	demanding	141:16,21
80:25 81:1	counter 76:4	creating 35:7	92:10	135:17,22	decisive	90:18 91:1	142:2,8
81:3,4 82:2	counties 28:6	87:9 124:20	100:23	135:22	91:10	116:23	179:4
82:3 84:10	38:25 39:2	creation 7:2	112:4	152:14	deconstruct	demerits	Derek 1:10
84:16 89:25	149:20	7:20 85:11	163:19	153:6	171:2	144:11	3:6 183:10
97:17,21,22	countless	87:16	170:18	161:21	decreased	demographic	described
99:5 101:7	91:4 157:19	crime 145:23	curse 102:2	162:1	167:15,18	14:5 57:6,7	26:11 60:22
102:21	country	146:11,22	Curtis 1:12	163:22	decreases	59:17 62:3	deserts
103:10,12	40:19 78:14	crimes	3:21 27:7	166:9	96:25	demograph...	146:17
103:13	85:21 86:8	145:19,25	70:4 79:4	175:22	dedicated	57:21	designed
104:18,24	109:6	criminal 85:5	107:1	194:16	79:5 158:1	170:18	156:12
105:9 117:6	111:11	108:21	183:21	day-to-day	deep 177:8	demonstrate	157:3

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 7

desires 12:16	diligent 155:10	disdain 42:2	175:10	duty 36:10	152:3	emphasize 114:9,25	
desperate 92:18,19	direct 104:8	disheartened 9:9	doing 13:5	125:12,20	effective 42:17	125:25	
despite 100:7	104:14	dispassionate 137:9,14	16:4 36:18	126:3	110:11	126:1	
detail 96:15	195:22	dispel 121:9	54:17 63:21	144:17	112:13	engage 95:9	
detailed 19:23 94:23	direction 111:4	displayed 3:3	82:11		115:20	engagement 95:7 112:20	
details 163:5	directions 94:18	183:6	120:15	E 195:1	136:17	engages 115:4	
determine 7:23 73:17	directly 93:16	disproporti... 86:15 96:24	121:2	eager 184:10	effectively 102:5	engaging 14:12	
74:1 85:13	111:18	disrespectf... 91:7	123:19	earlier 32:23	113:14	126:15	
deterrents 96:2	Director 10:18 11:20	distanced 18:22	126:13	64:12 68:8	effectiveness 110:10	engine's 120:10	
develop 55:12	11:21 15:12	161:13	127:4,5	108:24	effort 16:1	engineers 19:17	
development 111:22	85:5 90:7	169:16	128:9	122:4	94:4 163:10	English 70:1	
develops 42:2	159:8	distinguished 10:23	132:10	early 99:24	55:8 68:19	70:3	
devoted 60:25	Director's 160:3	10:23	133:16	110:1 126:8	69:8 88:17	enhanced 42:16	
Diamond 134:14	disadvantage 12:23	distress 41:1	147:3,4	East 122:14	115:5 129:8	114:18	
die 46:17	disadvanta... 106:6	distributed 168:21	174:8	easy 81:17	58:17 74:22	enjoy 42:4	
died 17:25	118:11	district 10:8	Donna 105:7	110:13	98:11	44:19	
18:25	disagreed 110:4	28:22,24,25	106:13	echo 45:9	135:18,20	enlighten 38:12	
diem 78:8	disciplinary 95:25	29:23,25	door 76:25	echoing 53:22 90:16	elect 38:22	ensure 27:2	
difference 99:13	108:20,23	30:7,8	double-che... 155:12	economically 105:17	75:17 77:2	95:16 96:21	
different 59:7	discipline 99:25	44:13 48:1	Dr 147:11	economics 172:22	109:18	96:23	
59:8 77:7	122:20	48:8 56:25	draft 134:15	economy 178:3	117:16	105:23	
101:23	disciplined 156:21	57:4 58:8	drainage 6:3	178:3	election 7:6	enter 7:11	
102:11,12	115:10	58:17,24	dramatic 135:8,9	Ed 110:2	73:2 85:18	160:3	
112:8	disciplining 102:16	59:6,15,20	drank 29:7	124:2	electors 6:22	enthusiasti... 9:6	
126:23	disconnect 181:14	61:25 62:8	draw 137:7	eds 10:23	8:1	entire 44:1	
128:10	discrete 123:14	62:13,22	drawing 145:6	educate 12:9	165:4	95:15 156:8	
129:4	discretion 164:24	65:3 66:1,4	145:6	14:18	elephant 33:25	162:21	
132:23	discriminat... 41:16	66:5 76:1	Drexel 11:1	educated 12:15 43:1	eligibility 73:19	171:12	
difficult 56:6	discussed 167:7	102:16	49:15,23	educating 20:20 22:2	eliminate 38:14	Entirely 59:19	
56:9 60:17	discussing 88:6 96:15	105:24	53:16,21	education 11:16 21:21	eliminating 39:14	entirety 140:3	
61:14 63:18	discussion 14:12 33:9	107:6	54:1 55:16	22:4,5,7,22	elongated 104:11	161:14	
103:18	division 170:2,14	118:7	63:6	60:25 61:7	else's 29:24	entitled 5:19	
difficult-to-... 51:11		districts 102:12	dried 50:9	70:3,8	embarrassed 76:21	6:12	
difficulties 32:7		distrust 116:9	drive 30:15	146:11	embarrassi... 75:24	entity 79:8,20	
difficulty 20:15 21:10		diverse 60:6	driveway 131:9	147:13	emergency 2:8	87:9 92:21	
21:18 56:1		173:3	driving 88:2	educational 22:18 148:5	emotional 143:14	entrepreneur 174:8 178:4	
digging 177:7		diversity 38:6	153:16,18	educations 61:16	emphasis 61:12	entry-level 22:10,15	
dignity 77:4		49:25 60:16	dropped 17:23	educators 70:12		enumerate 120:12	
78:15		60:20 103:5	drugs 146:19	effect 109:16		environment 171:5	
160:11		149:10	due 2:7 34:23			EOP 163:14	
diligence 155:4		163:1,15	118:7				
		170:2,14	Duly 185:8				
		division	186:24				
			188:12				
			189:12				
			190:16				
			191:20				
			193:1				
			duties 7:24				
			85:14				

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 8

equality 86:18	151:11 159:5	90:7 108:25 124:19	expertise 11:14 64:23	familiarity 43:21	136:14 137:11	finally 13:16 42:19 96:3	192:5 193:7 193:16
equation 89:13	164:18 events 13:23	173:4 exempt 48:24	97:12 explain 70:19	family 42:21 82:24	144:1 150:16	126:5 169:24	five 16:9 46:8 114:23
equipment 29:12	115:16 everybody	51:4 53:6,9 53:11 56:14	explained 127:22	146:10 family-sust...	159:2 178:24	finance 11:21 160:6	125:16 160:19
equitable 166:24	64:15 everybody's	exempts 11:23 68:13	154:11 explore 69:12	12:11 13:15 67:1	feels 3:18 fees 54:18	financial 50:13 168:4	161:3 166:2 166:22
175:15	149:3 everyday	exercise 162:4	express 128:10	fancy 101:24 farm 82:24	92:13 female	find 10:25 14:2 23:14	168:1 five-year
equity 93:24	156:9 evidence	exercising 127:11	expressed 91:21	fast-forward 153:16	170:20,23 fewer 88:12	26:16 28:10 33:6,12,16	161:9 flexibility
94:9 103:2	94:10 100:8 exhausted	exhausted 25:6	extending 180:5	father 76:2,8 76:14 126:8	fiancée 126:22	34:11,13 60:19 81:22	63:2 floods 167:21
160:11	137:12 156:24	exist 55:23 existence	extension 179:17	131:12 father's	fide 6:18 field 96:8	124:19 142:1	Floyd 39:9 85:23
162:25	195:3 evidence-b...	26:4 53:25 63:11 79:21	extent 129:18 137:11	32:15 131:11	111:20 fields 61:20	finding 20:16 21:10 153:3	107:20 143:22
165:25	89:6 evolution	existing 10:1 24:10 109:8	137:11 extraordin...	131:11 favor 33:19	Fife 142:2 fight 147:21	findings 99:14	focus 49:12 91:24
170:2,14,16	116:23 evolutionary	exists 108:7 expand 160:6	104:9 extremely	33:21 34:19 185:20	148:13 149:6 171:7	fine 120:10 120:11	107:15 focused 21:24
Eric 90:19	124:25 evolve 116:22	165:8 168:9 expanded	41:4 48:12 61:14	187:11 188:19	fighting 146:14	finer 54:17 finish 145:10	69:9 folks 14:7
eroding 109:17	exact 109:16 127:13	161:4 173:7 expanding	F F 195:1	189:20 190:23	147:16,25 figure 102:16	finished 53:2 fire 16:9	143:22 focus 49:12
error 37:13	101:21 exactly 30:7	87:10 168:16,21	face 154:3 facilitated	192:7 193:18	126:10 141:19	firearm 100:22	91:24 107:15
especially 26:4 79:6	136:22 examine	expansion 7:13 168:20	111:21 fact 14:15,17	favorable 185:3,16	figured 76:14 152:20	first 8:24 14:23 15:24	121:8 124:3 124:5
84:3 88:2	121:22 171:1	175:8 expect 137:10	76:20 100:7 109:6	186:19 187:7	file 95:12 140:20	fired 121:18 122:16	127:20,21 146:20
92:3 144:3	87:20 examining	expectation 8:10	125:11 127:24	189:10,19 191:15	filed 152:10 155:7	firing 142:9 163:18	172:18 follow 177:20
177:8	102:14 example 61:8	expectations 87:4 112:19	128:8,25 155:16	192:2 193:6 193:14	fill 9:19 10:20 10:24 12:2	firm 87:2 173:2,3,6	following 2:5 52:25 66:19
essential 7:14	112:21 examples	expected 105:19	167:15 factor 29:15	fear 73:13 fears 143:17	filling 155:11 fill 9:19 10:20	first 8:24 14:23 15:24	follows 2:7 146:16
10:12	171:1 examining	118:2 expedited	109:6 125:11	143:18,20 8:21	10:24 12:2 14:9 16:3	27:15 53:15 57:9 58:23	food 146:16 146:19
124:18	87:20 example 61:8	137:5 expenses	125:11 127:24	feature 8:17 8:21	20:16 21:11 23:12 26:8	67:21 69:22 71:11,24	footage 102:13
161:17	102:14 examples	92:15 expensive	127:24 128:8,25	February 152:12	23:12 26:8 33:13 39:15	74:17 76:18 79:1 84:13	115:4 FOP 157:22
167:14	112:21 exceed 87:3	61:4 experience	155:16 167:15	153:2 federal 88:4	48:18 51:23 60:22 66:12	132:15 139:23	force 39:1 41:2 42:1
establish 55:3	171:1 examining	118:2 expedited	fact 14:15,17 76:20 100:7	fear 73:13 fears 143:17	66:14 146:15	140:17 148:9	41:2 42:1 73:23 92:4
109:7 110:6	87:20 example 61:8	137:5 expenses	109:6 125:11	143:18,20 8:21	149:20 155:14	158:17 164:2 165:9	100:13,16 100:18,23
110:11	102:14 examples	92:15 expensive	125:11 127:24	feature 8:17 8:21	filled 17:14 17:17 19:12	176:24 178:13	100:24 101:4,5,13
111:2,6	112:21 exceed 87:3	61:4 experience	128:8,25 155:16	February 152:12	24:1 51:22 76:4	185:5,18 186:21	103:6 107:16
established 56:10	171:1 examining	118:2 expedited	167:15 factor 29:15	153:2 federal 88:4	filling 25:13 152:8	187:9 191:18	110:21 116:7
108:25	87:20 example 61:8	137:5 expenses	109:6 125:11	fear 73:13 fears 143:17	film 131:13		142:15
111:11,15	102:14 examples	92:15 expensive	127:24 128:8,25	143:18,20 8:21			
113:4	112:21 exceed 87:3	61:4 experience	155:16 167:15	February 152:12			
estate 31:1	171:1 examining	118:2 expedited	fact 14:15,17 76:20 100:7	153:2 federal 88:4			
44:22	87:20 example 61:8	137:5 expenses	109:6 125:11	fear 73:13 fears 143:17			
105:21	102:14 examples	92:15 expensive	127:24 128:8,25	143:18,20 8:21			
estimate 23:24	112:21 exceed 87:3	61:4 experience	155:16 167:15	February 152:12			
estimating 19:4	171:1 examining	118:2 expedited	fact 14:15,17 76:20 100:7	153:2 federal 88:4			
ethical 116:18	87:20 example 61:8	137:5 expenses	109:6 125:11	fear 73:13 fears 143:17			
ethics 73:7	102:14 examples	92:15 expensive	127:24 128:8,25	143:18,20 8:21			
111:23	112:21 exceed 87:3	61:4 experience	155:16 167:15	February 152:12			
ethnic 42:14	171:1 examining	118:2 expedited	fact 14:15,17 76:20 100:7	153:2 federal 88:4			
46:21	87:20 example 61:8	137:5 expenses	109:6 125:11	fear 73:13 fears 143:17			
Europe 169:14	102:14 examples	92:15 expensive	127:24 128:8,25	143:18,20 8:21			
evening	112:21 exceed 87:3	61:4 experience	155:16 167:15	February 152:12			

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 9

157:12,18 157:21 forced 100:3 forces 88:2 forcing 110:4 forefront 40:21 88:1 foregoing 195:5,19 foreseeable 26:2 forget 13:6 37:25 140:11 forgotten 29:4 form 162:10 formal 94:5 formed 94:20 114:6 former 37:18 75:21 107:10 forth 6:23 fortunately 135:10 forward 3:8 3:17 52:14 52:17,19 55:8 80:6,7 91:8,23 96:15 97:13 103:21,21 129:20 150:13 171:14 forwarded 100:19 foster 115:18 found 2:18 77:21 100:9 153:7,12 173:13 founded 99:21 four 37:11 92:23 114:23 153:20 177:10 fourth 161:25 Francisco's 114:5 frankly 13:12	19:18 55:17 free 84:22 118:13 159:2 178:25 freeze 26:2,4 50:22,24 fresh 96:7 friend 32:23 153:17 154:6 frisk 88:11 frisks 88:13 front 10:13 14:14 76:24 frontline 62:15 95:5 frustration 77:24 86:19 fuel 86:5 fulfill 34:18 full 25:3 121:24 153:21 157:15 fully 35:17 95:9 99:20 110:17 195:4 function 97:8 119:18 functions 166:8 fund 157:9 funded 74:24 109:14 110:17 151:25 157:8 funding 73:9 74:24 75:11 96:17 110:9 114:1 117:1 119:19 144:20 funeral 144:13 funny 76:9 further 26:14 87:18 109:16 169:21 174:19 177:11	180:25 185:3,16 186:19 187:7 191:16 192:3 193:14 future 10:3 21:1 26:2 73:14 80:10 97:15 99:25 149:25 157:3 G gain 12:10 game 143:3 Garner 90:20 garnering 93:17 Garrett 71:14 84:14 84:24,25 85:4 102:24 gathered 161:24 gear 153:22 general 92:5 generally 99:4 generate 146:9 generation 124:10 generations 117:20 gentleman 76:5,6,11 gentlemen 41:3 George 39:8 85:23 107:19 143:22 get-out-of-j... 75:18 getting 38:4 56:1 61:10 61:16 64:20 105:11 162:2 giants 169:2 give 12:13 17:22 21:7	24:17 32:4 41:20 45:22 57:6 59:14 67:12 181:24 given 15:19 26:5 36:22 45:16 82:13 88:3 119:10 145:11 152:1 gives 150:25 156:18 giving 13:3 104:8,14 117:13 119:21 162:4 glad 84:7 159:20 glance 29:13 glitch 20:10 global 90:17 globe 14:1 glory 82:23 glove 154:14 go 11:9 20:25 22:24 25:3 46:12 50:3 61:2 72:15 72:16 81:6 83:20 98:12 118:4 120:3 130:22 131:1 133:23 134:2 137:16 140:21 142:8 145:2 145:4,5,12 145:18 146:5 147:10,19 153:6 154:20 176:1 180:1 181:15,23 182:21 194:12 goals 163:11 163:15 goes 125:6 going 4:10	15:21 18:10 21:6 32:25 38:14 44:19 49:12 61:13 61:19 63:17 64:10 73:15 78:23 79:10 102:15,18 103:20,21 111:5 120:12 128:3,19 140:3,22 143:3,5 144:21 145:15,17 146:12,24 149:3,16 151:1 162:3 good 2:2 3:8 3:15,16 4:5 4:10 12:11 13:14 15:3 30:23 31:17 32:1,13,23 42:11 43:13 43:14 47:16 66:25 74:15 84:18,25 90:5 101:2 120:9,10 131:6 140:11,16 140:17 142:16,17 142:19,20 151:11 159:4,5 163:10 164:18,18 172:5 179:1 194:16 Goode 36:21 36:25 37:2 goodness 142:20 gotten 60:5 government 1:2 3:9,18 5:11 15:5,8 32:18 33:10 33:11 34:7 85:3 143:4 149:5,17,25	194:3,20 governmen... 121:12 Governor 108:24 grader 165:2 grades 5:21 graduate 19:17 69:21 72:14 149:4 graduated 70:12 graduates 43:2 49:22 61:1 149:17 graduating 148:22 149:22 grandfather 173:10 grant 6:7 50:6 great 11:17 31:11 62:10 68:17 101:14 130:4 139:1 164:17 174:7,14 175:21 184:14 194:17 greater 87:22 119:21 123:2,3 144:8 145:7 greatly 105:2 167:14 green 1:10 3:6,7 15:6 36:20 82:5 82:6 84:11 85:2 132:3 132:4,5,9 138:1,5 140:9 173:18,25 174:1,18 175:15,23 176:1,2 182:1,5 183:10,11 184:22,24 190:6,8	191:9,11 grew 164:24 Griffith 141:15,15 141:18 142:7,16 151:2 grounded 93:23 group 107:9 108:1,1 116:1 groups 46:22 89:3 116:4 124:16 grow 16:2 31:2 45:1 173:8 growing 168:5 grown 82:24 83:1 173:6 growth 165:24 guaranteed 96:18 156:14 guardians 131:20 guess 119:17 guidelines 65:15 111:24 gun 141:23 142:3,4 143:19,19 guns 142:9 145:1,1 146:19 153:24 guy 141:23 guys 18:21 173:14 182:10 Gym 1:12 3:14,15 18:5 78:20 78:21 81:1 82:9 94:22 117:6 183:18,19 Gym's 104:4	handcuffed 75:23 154:4 154:18,23 handed 169:1 hands 149:6 154:2 156:1 Hans 71:15 84:15,17 90:6 97:18 98:12,17 105:1 happen 83:24 106:5,7 155:25 157:23 happened 78:3,4,5 144:4 153:1 155:23 happening 122:1 123:9 133:2 happens 38:23 83:20 116:23 124:9 happy 16:21 26:20 89:23 164:3 171:17 180:5 hard 40:23 60:22 63:10 66:13 105:22 109:25 133:16 175:8 hard-to-fill 11:13 64:21 hard-to-find 48:12 hardened 148:3 Harley 71:15 84:15,24,25 85:4 102:24 harm 152:6 Harrisburg 108:10 132:14 133:9 HBCUs 68:18,18
--	--	--	---	---	---	--	--

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 10

69:6 head 19:4,15 57:20 154:8 head-on 170:15 headquarte... 163:18 headquarters 165:19 heads 11:22 health 2:8 healthy 89:11 169:17 hear 8:3 15:21 17:2 31:20 34:11 40:2,5 132:3,6 139:2 164:13 173:15 heard 12:20 17:12 43:10 48:15 53:6 53:21 130:3 139:5 157:6 165:20 174:12 hearing 2:7 2:15,18 3:9 3:18 4:24 5:10 8:7,8 31:8 32:19 34:12 67:8 71:9 150:12 165:14 175:3 176:22 181:3,9,20 181:23 182:20 183:16 184:15 194:9 hearings 2:11 2:14 135:13 135:16,21 hearts 85:24 heat 77:20 heinous 85:22 Helen 1:12 3:14 78:20 117:6	183:18 hell 38:3 help 17:11 27:1 56:23 66:12 96:4 96:6 103:22 115:16 122:2 153:3 helped 134:9 140:9 helpful 129:19 helping 31:2 132:20 144:9 165:13 helpless 92:16 helps 60:2 Henin 138:21 138:23 139:6,7,8 150:6,18 151:7,11,12 151:16 158:8 hid 131:10 hide 131:15 high 19:18,22 22:13 61:1 146:13 higher 11:16 12:25 19:19 20:1 21:12 28:15 54:3 55:4 56:12 69:24 74:6 89:4 highest 161:25 162:18 163:13 highlight 86:17 92:22 99:12 highlighting 92:6 highly 99:17 167:13 Hill 11:3 77:6 hint 155:20 hire 25:13 26:17 60:18 68:16	hired 28:2 45:23 55:21 122:12 hires 9:25 10:3 16:6 hiring 13:10 16:15 26:1 26:3 43:24 49:2 50:23 50:25 121:8 122:9,19 Historically 11:5 55:5 69:23 history 41:17 44:12 74:2 86:24 92:6 117:16 121:16 140:12 141:10 hit 105:18 hold 26:6 50:18 72:10 74:5 107:24 115:17 144:12 152:2 holding 32:18 89:15 135:12,16 135:21 holds 157:1 home 7:1,19 10:14 29:9 73:1 77:15 85:10 155:18 homework 173:5 homicides 86:14 honor 62:10 107:11 honored 165:5 174:5 hooptie 76:20 hop 122:24 hope 21:7 34:21 74:14 79:22 194:11 hopeful 79:11 175:13	hopefully 35:17 135:2 194:10 hopping 122:6 hour 2:20 11:7 154:19 hours 77:20 93:22 102:15,16 122:16 128:2 155:11 house 45:15 133:9,12 134:2 135:4 135:10 136:5 137:25 153:20 165:1 171:24 172:2,5 housing 58:23 146:3 Houston 165:4 huge 105:12 Human 15:13 humbled 159:14 humiliating 155:5 hundreds 28:13 116:12 hurt 9:18 12:1 hypothetic... 10:25 I IAFF 68:5 idea 122:4 147:21 identified 144:2 145:22 identifying 101:4 167:1 illiteracy 146:13 image 3:3 183:6	imagine 136:1 167:22 immediately 26:18 144:6 154:4 impacting 43:23 impacts 16:13,14,19 19:16 86:15 impaired 146:7 impediment 43:3 imperative 145:5 implicit 41:17 89:17 importance 53:22 important 16:12 25:11 25:16 29:15 36:11 39:7 44:18 79:3 80:11 82:19 84:5,6 98:1 99:23 100:14 103:3 119:9 120:25 140:6 147:15 157:4 159:22 165:16 importantly 74:7 80:20 107:10 improve 74:3 87:18 88:24 94:4 improving 89:14 inability 140:16 inadequate 112:25 inaudible 40:13 93:21 100:21 110:22 146:17,22	147:17,22 incentivized 27:3 incentivizing 13:9 inception 166:14 incident 111:13 116:7,11 122:13 152:11 incidents 35:11 100:14 110:21 include 48:24 101:8 170:16,19 included 2:15 24:6 37:15 includes 92:13 115:24 169:3 including 6:16 11:20 21:20 36:6 54:9 111:23 114:14 115:3 166:5 inclusion 163:1 170:2 170:14 inclusive 73:20 incoming 96:5 inconsistent 121:1 incorporati... 87:7 increase 44:16 87:21 109:13 119:23 increased 37:24 167:17 increases 96:25 increasing 105:21 increasingly	103:3 incredible 170:9 incredibly 120:25 Indego 160:6 160:18 161:3,8,11 161:12,19 161:25 162:6 163:22 164:5 165:9 166:8,14,20 166:23 167:4,23 168:5,10,11 independen... 96:23 112:13 114:21 166:16 independent 73:5,12 108:18 109:11 110:17,19 113:4,8,10 113:17 119:20 137:14 151:21,24 157:5,14 independen... 113:23 indicate 2:24 179:16 183:3 indirect 104:4 individual 99:20 156:6 178:17 individuals 11:25 12:6 21:25 33:7 33:17 34:17 35:10 72:13 74:2 82:20 88:13 89:3 108:11 111:18 140:21 industries	56:7 industry 53:23 168:2 influence 178:5 information 19:14 83:15 104:12,15 121:11 154:17,22 155:12 156:18 175:24 Infrastruct... 159:10 initiative 151:20 initiatives 91:20 159:9 injured 116:13 innovation 165:24 input 103:21 115:1 128:24 Inquirer 2:17 insensitivity 41:18 inside 145:7 insight 97:11 insignificant 122:13 insisted 75:12 insistent 41:15 instance 122:1 instances 97:3 institution 54:2,2 63:7 69:24 institutional 34:1 institutions 12:24 21:12 28:13,15 54:5,8 55:4 56:11 instructed 83:21 Instructions 2:12
---	---	---	---	---	---	--	---

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 11

insulated 110:22	87:20 92:1 94:7 108:22	70:15 153:19	90:10 91:3 98:4,4	K	65:14 78:25 80:15 88:5	123:11 129:15	leaders 108:3
insulating 96:23	112:15	Jewel 75:21	103:14,16	keep 66:19	95:10 97:24	largest 66:21	leadership 40:10,14,20
insult 33:8	investigative 95:5 115:8	Jihad 31:16	107:1	96:6 129:16	98:14 99:15	92:23 95:4	88:3 91:11
insulted 33:3	157:24	31:20,25	117:11	144:25	100:5 103:2	Las 166:4	97:14
Intelligencer 2:17	investigators 95:24	32:2 35:22	130:14,15	147:14	106:4	Lasalle 11:2	106:20
intend 177:19	investing 50:10	36:2 142:25	132:1	153:13	116:11	late 162:7	133:11
intent 15:25	investment 169:4 172:6	Joann 31:16	139:24	156:14	118:1,5	lately 101:10	170:20,21
16:18	172:25	31:20 32:3	145:11	Kendra 1:11	120:1 121:7	Latino	170:22
intentionally 170:13	invite 181:13	35:25 39:21	150:20,24	160:8	123:16	145:22	176:11
interact 39:4	invited 8:5	40:9 143:1	151:4,6	171:11	125:18	Latinx 167:1	177:13
interactions 99:17	inviting 139:24	job 11:13	183:21,22	174:3	128:18,19	launched	League 149:9
interest 9:22	151:15	21:20 22:25	186:13,15	Kenney	131:23	170:4	learn 79:13
134:16	involved 126:1	25:1 28:8	188:2,4	36:15 38:8	133:4,10,14	launching	79:24
143:11	156:19	36:24 37:12	189:4,6	179:9	133:22	168:5	learned 10:11
interested 61:19 67:4	involvement 93:3,8	37:23,24	Jones' 111:1	kept 103:19	134:6 136:4	law 1:2 2:4	97:3 104:5
interesting 14:3 172:18	143:14	38:17,24	125:10	154:17,22	141:17	3:8,17 5:11	104:7 116:6
interface 98:21	iPhone 30:3	46:6,7,15	JR 1:12	155:3	143:15	10:5,6 15:5	141:3
internal 87:20	141:9	48:10,16	judge 156:25	key 98:20	147:9 162:7	15:8 32:17	learning 12:25 21:12
108:21	isolate 41:11	56:2 64:21	judges 137:10,15	99:2 165:13	175:9	40:22 62:19	28:16 54:3
156:2	issue 14:14	116:18	Judicial 58:24	169:7	177:24	62:25 65:9	55:4 56:12
157:22	20:19 21:1	122:16	Judiciary 135:12,15	kicked 76:25	182:11	85:3 87:14	69:24
170:15	30:4 79:5	146:16	June 1:5	killed 116:13	knowing 125:22,23	89:14	leave 181:19
179:22	98:13	149:4	161:21	122:14	141:7	109:17	leaving 82:16
intricate 97:5	100:10	194:18	junior 70:7	kind 29:18,25	knowledge 54:21 72:13	111:14	led 79:9
introduce 9:5	133:1 156:3	jobs 12:11,17	70:25	69:2 106:15	known 10:22	114:9,24	95:21
156:24	22:23 48:5	13:5,15	junk 146:19	106:18	31:12	125:24	166:18
introduced 121:4	71:3 74:11	16:3 19:10	jurisdiction 100:25	130:20	111:15	126:1	left 3:19
introducing 90:12 180:8	86:15 98:2	20:16 21:11	122:23,24	133:13	L	135:11,14	170:6
introduction 9:7	123:14,16	23:23,25	122:25	144:20	L 1:10	140:16,17	leg 13:4
investigate 109:2,3	123:17,18	27:5 38:15	jurisdictions 101:1,19	148:2	labor 9:3	147:12,14	leg 13:4
113:14	128:4	39:15 45:24	102:7 122:7	162:22	60:14	147:18	legal 2:17
114:14	132:18,24	50:18 67:1	jury 156:24	kindergart... 165:3	134:25	148:8 164:7	92:13
119:22	132:24	73:13	justice 77:5	kinds 61:3	149:2 179:4	164:8 194:3	legally 5:23
investigated 92:20 95:24	135:23,25	156:14	85:5 86:18	145:25	laborers 10:7	194:19	legislation 26:21 29:16
investigation 86:3 94:24	137:22	John 124:1	90:19 91:1	146:1	65:22,25,25	lawless 129:2	79:3 80:8
95:3,21	159:22	Johnson 37:19 38:2	93:25 98:6	King 111:12	66:4	laws 140:12	82:11 108:9
100:8 115:3	item 45:19	join 138:13	101:24	147:11	labors 20:3	147:8,9	120:19,23
157:16	J	joined 15:12	102:10,17	knew 147:16	Lady 186:1	lawyer	121:4
investigatio...	jail 146:12	36:1 164:5	113:16	153:13	187:17	153:13	124:20
	Jamar 90:21	joins 92:24	120:16	159:20	language 128:11	154:8	129:22
	James 164:6	joint 135:12	129:16	know 9:23	Laquan 90:20	lawyers 108:2	130:18
	Jean 90:20	135:16	135:11,15	10:12 20:17	large 93:1	Lazer 178:17	133:6
	Jeffrey 91:3	27:7,8,19	135:23	23:10 24:23	112:6	178:19,21	174:4
	Jersey 51:25	28:4 30:20	170:3,15	24:25 25:18	114:21	179:1,3	Legislative 107:6,8
		32:24 36:21	171:8	25:25 26:3	168:14	180:15	134:7
		37:2 45:12	Justice's 114:11	26:13,18	larger 20:19	lead 92:1	legislators 108:2
		70:4 71:16		29:21 30:7	115:23	166:8	legitimacy 109:12
		71:19,20,23		31:22 35:9	119:1	leader 62:11	legitimate
		71:24 78:18		39:21 46:3		106:21	
		79:4 82:9		48:8 52:23		132:20	
				54:25 55:2		166:23	
				55:7,11,15			
				56:22 57:14			

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 12

48:7	limitations	lives 48:16	103:4,20	low-income	119:18,19	69:7	measured
legitimized	79:19 80:14	116:17	119:25	161:16	124:24	match 157:18	98:15
111:19	limited 6:16	161:24	121:15	163:2 167:3	128:21	157:21	measures
lens 103:2	73:20	167:8	123:7,16	167:16	140:23	materials	119:14,15
172:17	Lincoln 11:7	172:15,19	126:23,24	luxury	man 76:10	92:14	130:3
lesson 104:7	54:9 69:21	178:6	129:20	172:10	126:6	matter 30:10	measuring
lessons 79:14	70:10,13	living 34:9	136:24	Lyft 169:2	128:24	30:13 41:19	98:18
79:24 104:5	Lincoln's	42:25 43:2	137:15,22	lynching	131:7,7	115:11	102:20
let's 10:23	70:23	46:24 51:25	140:18,21	147:14	147:12,23	161:25	meat 76:3
11:3 23:13	line 6:1 10:13	64:7 121:17	142:12		148:11,12	167:9	mechanism
23:24 32:7	30:16 45:19	129:9 141:4	145:18,19	M	manage	172:16,19	97:9 109:20
56:19	179:12	146:9 170:3	145:24	m 36:7	28:16	178:6 180:7	medical 49:9
181:24	lines 5:20 6:6	local 48:9	146:1 153:7	MacDonald	managed	195:5	61:10 162:3
194:11	list 25:6 73:5	57:8,12,18	154:3 156:2	90:20	98:15	maximum	meds 10:23
letters 60:15	listen 14:10	57:19,22	172:13	Madam 3:16	108:19	152:1	meet 87:3
level 45:2	25:22 65:6	58:3 68:5	looked 76:13	3:23 5:1	Management	Mayberry	96:9 165:18
57:9 74:25	129:25	77:23	131:14	18:13 27:9	95:14	142:1	meeting 2:9
82:18 88:4	listened	107:21	153:21	28:19 30:18	manager	Mayor 110:2	8:6,11
105:15,23	74:10 140:2	117:2	looking 3:8	71:16,25	164:6	113:11,24	181:14,15
117:3 118:9	listening 53:5	132:17	3:17 17:9	78:16,22	managing	123:25	181:24
132:16,17	69:20 72:3	133:17	19:7 24:13	80:22 81:5	85:5 98:19	124:2 179:4	182:7,21,24
132:18	79:11	169:1	102:11	82:1,7 84:9	160:2	179:9	183:12,23
133:17,19	140:19	locally	103:1	97:23	mandates	Mayor's	194:1
137:8	159:12	119:10	134:21	103:11	112:18	79:16 110:5	member
157:18	little 37:20	173:6	135:24	138:2	mandating	MBE 163:10	107:8
level-funded	49:12 118:1	Locals 58:17	145:9 147:3	150:20	89:17	McQuilkin	117:12
105:25	126:23	58:20 59:1	177:12	174:16,24	manhood	68:4	139:19
levels 146:7	129:4	location 1:4	looks 59:15	175:23	148:13	MDO 11:21	members
librarian	146:14	174:15	Los 92:25	184:14,25	manipulation	Meadows	2:23 8:14
49:13,17,18	148:1 162:7	long 4:11	93:8 166:3	185:25	110:23	52:15	8:19 15:7
54:23	live 9:14 28:1	22:22 26:3	lot 19:15	186:16	114:8	mean 22:6,6	31:5 32:17
librarians	28:22,23,24	27:10 32:22	32:22 35:1	187:17	manner 74:8	24:10 63:2	47:3 48:10
49:23 50:6	29:1 30:3,9	69:10 77:18	37:9 55:24	188:5 189:7	Maria 1:14	64:14	51:9 52:18
55:19 56:4	33:20 40:15	79:5 86:17	66:3 70:12	190:9	4:8 97:21	123:15	52:19 57:3
60:10 69:11	40:16 41:24	97:24	70:14 75:15	191:12	184:8	170:24	57:11 58:14
library 49:16	42:9 44:11	101:18	81:8,9	192:19	Marine 37:12	177:19	58:22,23
49:20 50:1	44:18 45:3	107:15	91:20 95:1	194:18	mark 1:14	meaningful	62:15 66:1
50:2,6,11	46:4,7	194:4	99:18,18	magnitude	4:14 180:2	110:11	67:5 71:25
53:17,20	56:17 68:15	longer 22:17	110:15	98:17	184:12	112:16	73:19 85:2
54:4,12,13	81:15,20	Lonnie 32:5	131:23	main 6:4	market 25:1	157:24	90:10 91:19
54:18,21	118:19	182:11,15	132:18,21	maintenance	Mary 124:4	means 17:16	104:21
55:10,15	120:21	182:19	132:23	7:13	124:16	169:17	107:2
63:5 69:7	122:5,22	look 19:1,5	133:17	major 14:7	138:21	195:21	114:23
license	127:15	20:2,6,11	141:9	89:8 168:11	139:6 150:6	meant 105:25	127:23
154:15	143:7,8,12	22:17 25:1	143:15	majority 35:5	151:12,16	measure	128:3
lieu 78:24	174:13	28:6,8	147:6	57:21,23	Maryland	72:25 85:15	130:11
life 141:4	lived 29:4	34:24 38:20	149:11	120:2	70:6,14,16	98:9 99:8	134:6,15,18
161:23	41:6 76:16	59:17,18	152:14	132:20	massive	101:13,16	138:7 150:9
172:9	122:9	62:13 63:4	162:24	majority-m...	161:22	102:10	151:14
light 13:22	125:19	63:23 64:2	178:8	14:6 60:7	Master's	103:8 111:2	158:10
39:8 115:15	126:19	64:7 73:24	loud 29:7	62:1,9,12	49:16 50:12	114:6	159:6
116:8	127:1,2	80:6 96:14	Louis 114:16	62:14 66:23	53:20 54:4	117:12	162:24
likes 37:25	164:22	97:13	love 145:6	making 22:3	54:11,20	119:13	164:19
limit 143:13	172:8	101:24	147:12	32:24	55:14 63:5	125:21	173:19,22

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 13

176:17	million 26:5	modicum	192:20	27:20	107:13	66:9,10	96:4 102:8
179:2	26:6 28:12	125:13	193:9,19,25	108:13	111:13	71:1 89:10	111:6
180:17,25	33:5 45:13	126:3	Mount	109:5 123:7	149:8	129:1,13	113:19
183:1 188:9	93:19,19	moment	164:22	municipality	163:18	155:14	167:11
190:12	161:7	77:25 78:8	165:1 170:3	41:25 122:7	166:23	194:8	168:7,22,24
membership	166:22	80:11	171:24	122:8	nationally	needing	170:5
40:12 57:7	169:4	112:24	174:14	murder 39:8	77:24 90:18	156:8	News 2:16
58:8 59:15	mind 66:19	117:16	move 55:22	85:23	119:11	needs 4:16	76:25
62:2	minds 85:25	157:2	66:16 68:24	murdered	173:7	24:11 61:11	NHR 22:20
memo 30:2	148:22	169:25	75:8 87:24	143:23	nationwide	96:10,22	nice 176:4
149:9	mindset	monetary	91:4,12	mute 4:17	166:5	106:19	nobody's
men 57:25	142:14	162:18	134:9 135:4	27:11	nay 186:7,9	109:22	146:12
84:3	145:18	money 50:9	144:5 149:1	132:10	near 11:6	120:7,13	non-Philad...
Menos 71:15	mine 27:12	60:24 61:15	171:14	muted 39:25	nearly 17:12	121:20,23	35:2,13
79:7 84:15	minimizing	110:14	185:1,4,17		148:20	126:13	non-police
90:2,5,6	16:19	157:23	186:17,20	N	179:25	157:7,8,13	44:6
98:25 99:9	minimum	177:19	187:8 188:9	N 195:1	necessarily	157:17,21	non-White
101:14	54:22 96:21	178:4	189:8	NAACP	83:10	167:6	170:24
103:25	minister	monitor 99:8	190:13	139:22	146:25	169:22	nonresidents
mentally	138:20,23	127:17	191:13,16	143:25	147:3	negotiated	17:18 19:12
141:24	139:5,12,16	monitoring	192:3,20	149:7	necessary	108:22	normative
mention	139:17	115:8	193:15	NACO	24:25 25:10	negotiations	126:15,17
21:16 53:6	150:4	month	moved 14:4	111:15,19	44:7 80:8	16:11	126:22
mentioned	Minneapolis	108:24	70:16	112:1	97:7 99:3	179:22,25	North 118:18
53:16,17	85:23	153:2	152:17,22	name 2:25	115:22,23	neighborho...	126:7,18
55:1,6 56:4	minorities	months 22:12	185:13	15:9 31:18	141:1	33:15	Northwest
56:5 61:6	61:12	56:18 68:16	187:4	32:11,14	144:16	145:16,22	175:10
63:8 117:7	minority	96:16	188:16	35:23 39:23	152:2 194:5	146:3 165:4	Nos 5:12,21
166:20	20:23 21:24	153:17	189:16	40:6,8	need 9:7,23	175:9	notable 102:8
mentioning	114:18	Morgan	190:20	47:21,24	12:8 14:17	neighborho...	Notary
64:12	170:21,25	77:11	191:24	71:6 83:14	14:20 15:21	46:21 89:11	195:12
mere 153:20	minute 26:17	morgue	193:3,11	84:19 90:3	21:2 24:8	128:13	note 2:20
merely 10:3	104:3	144:12	movement	90:6 106:9	26:13,17	144:3	8:16 9:1,22
message	181:17	morning 3:16	129:23	118:14,16	29:18 35:16	146:25	10:9 26:10
119:12	minutes 11:7	3:16,24	133:11	139:11	40:23 41:1	168:24	52:24 53:7
met 96:22	128:1,2	77:13 131:6	moving 70:5	150:7 151:9	46:13,23	neighboring	64:17 67:10
98:10	145:13	mortgage	80:6 125:1	151:15	49:8 64:19	11:4	68:21 69:6
124:21	181:22	106:3	126:2	159:1,6	65:19 66:25	neighbors	129:21
methodolo...	misconduct	118:11	133:20	164:15,20	78:7 81:8	42:13	142:23
121:21	86:9 87:21	mosaic 42:15	150:12	176:19	82:17 96:11	nephew	150:10
MeToo 78:1	92:2,5 95:3	Mosque	Muhammad	178:24	121:10	82:21	172:3 176:8
metropolitan	95:6 97:3	139:19	138:21,23	179:3	122:8	Network	noted 52:10
114:22	109:3	motion	138:24	180:21	123:15	149:8	64:18 195:3
micromobil...	missing	184:22	139:2,5,13	181:4 183:4	128:16	never 3:19	notes 185:10
168:2	152:16	185:12,21	139:15,16	narrative	137:15	29:4 105:18	187:1
Microsoft 1:4	mission 74:2	186:11,13	150:4 158:8	13:11	144:5,21	165:20	188:14
2:10 8:18	170:7	187:3,12,25	multi-tasking	nation 13:8	150:15	nevertheless	189:14
Mike 15:2,12	mistake	188:2,15,19	178:19,20	13:25 54:15	151:6 158:3	143:18	190:18
16:22 17:1	156:4	188:24	multiple	69:25 78:2	158:3 178:3	new 9:24	191:22
17:4,22	mistakes	189:4,15,21	119:14	92:24 116:5	179:16	43:23 51:25	195:5
18:11,20	156:7	190:4,6,19	181:18	nation's	182:4	70:15 73:4	notice 7:5
19:10 23:3	mobility	190:23	municipal	111:16	needed 10:24	79:13 89:18	152:15
31:10 64:12	171:7	191:5,9,23	112:6	national	24:4 26:24	91:14 92:25	notices 2:15
90:21	models 111:8	192:7,14,16	municipalit...	77:22	63:11 65:14	93:14 94:19	November

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 14

73:2 85:18 number 15:20 17:19 19:20,25 58:10 59:10 68:19 86:6 86:13 112:10 139:18 179:19 numbers 19:1 20:5,8 24:1 94:2 102:13 Nutter 74:21	113:5,20,22 114:2,5,12 114:19,25 126:7 156:17 159:9 160:3 officer 15:11 19:19 29:3 36:11 37:10 38:3 77:16 92:4 100:1 100:6,6 116:16 122:9,15 142:16 144:10 officer's 101:23 officer-invo... 86:2 officers 6:17 7:4 20:4 35:13 36:6 40:23 41:11 41:23 42:9 42:16,17,21 43:24 72:9 82:22 83:18 87:19 88:12 88:18 89:15 94:13,13,14 120:3 123:19,23 124:7 125:11 127:11 129:9 131:16 142:19 144:1,7 146:24 official 75:17 77:2 officials 45:18,19 107:22 109:18 112:14 117:2,17 oh 1:13 3:11 3:12 51:22 78:3 151:3 183:14,15 185:11	187:2 188:15 189:15 190:19 191:23 193:10 Okay 17:7 32:4 40:8 54:24 58:4 59:12,25 84:16 138:25 139:9,15 176:16 182:8,18 186:6 old 127:19,20 older 169:18 once 33:18 34:18 35:17 44:13 46:14 67:20 82:15 156:1 194:10 one's 121:13 one-year 63:21 69:4 ones 142:21 ongoing 88:7 104:11 online 64:3,4 open 5:23 34:16 80:9 137:23 167:7,12 opened 52:10 opening 9:1 21:17 operate 113:23 146:8 160:6 165:8 166:2 166:7 168:9 operated 161:19 170:12 operates 93:9 operating 15:18 54:13 92:10 160:18 163:17 168:5 operation	7:13 112:5 operations 16:20 19:21 91:18 160:23 170:10 operator 166:13 168:7 opinions 181:12 opportunities 34:16 38:21 opportunity 45:16,23 47:18 50:16 79:8 85:7 85:19 86:22 89:23 90:13 107:4,17 117:6,7,8 117:22 135:9 145:12 163:9 175:21 oppose 15:25 opposed 185:24 187:15 188:23 189:24 191:2 192:11 193:22 opposite 109:16 opposition 124:22 order 8:20 26:23 33:19 55:9 74:18 74:23 79:17 80:8 96:9 109:1 124:19 179:17 orderly 74:14 ordinance 5:18,18,19 6:10,20 7:8 7:22 24:21 36:3 180:9 organization	40:11 44:15 95:16 organizatio... 54:15 108:16 111:17 original 36:16 79:15 124:19 Orleans 102:8 oTIS 160:14 164:6 166:15 169:20 ought 44:20 143:6 outbid 173:14 outcome 42:11 outcomes 94:4 outcry 114:12 outlined 88:11 outreach 33:16 92:15 115:5 outside 19:8 42:1 49:21 55:18 64:7 122:10 125:15 143:8 outsiders 128:15 outstanding 174:10 overall 19:1 25:13 42:11 59:7 61:25 100:14 110:9 125:5 129:11 170:22 overdue 107:15 overhaul 109:23 112:25 120:15 overqualified	34:6 override 110:5 oversee 156:8 oversight 7:3 7:21 72:22 85:12 87:8 87:17 89:19 94:20 96:17 97:4,16 98:5 109:1 109:8,11,15 109:20 110:16 111:3,7,10 111:14,19 111:20,25 112:4 113:7 113:19 114:17 115:7,16,21 116:24 117:18 121:11 140:18 144:15 148:18 151:21 156:13 overwhelmed 103:19 overwhelm... 86:6 120:2 owned 164:25 owners 179:15,20 ownership 30:14 172:21 177:12	packaged 29:19 Packer 5:24 6:6 179:10 pad 30:2 page 76:24 paid 62:16,17 94:7 pain 91:9 panacea 121:10 pandemic 75:6 86:12 165:14 167:13 169:10 panel 8:24 14:24 31:6 31:13 35:25 47:8,14 67:6,15,19 67:25 71:11 71:21 84:13 105:4 138:18 158:17 176:24 178:13 panels 181:10 181:13 panic 77:13 paperwork 152:9 156:3 parameters 62:24 parents 84:1 Parker 1:10 2:2 3:25 4:18,21 5:2 5:6 8:2 15:4 16:25 17:7 18:1 18:14,18 19:9 20:13 23:2 24:16 25:21 29:22 30:19 31:8 31:19,25 32:3,17 35:20 39:18 40:4 43:6 45:6 46:25 47:6,17,19 52:3,8	54:24 56:3 58:4,13 59:2,12,21 59:25 61:21 62:7 64:1 64:16 65:5 65:24 66:7 67:8,18 68:1 69:16 71:9,18,22 78:17 80:25 82:2 84:10 84:16 85:1 89:25 90:9 97:17 103:12 104:2,18,24 105:9 106:15 117:22,23 120:19 130:7 131:25 132:7,20 138:4,10,22 138:25 139:4,9 140:1 150:3 150:22 151:3,13 158:6,12,21 159:5 164:10,19 171:19 172:1 174:17 175:20,25 176:7,22 177:2,3,23 178:12,18 178:22 179:2 180:14,19 180:24 181:9 182:8 182:14,18 184:16,19 185:9,23 186:2,6,25 187:14,19 187:24 188:13,22 189:13,23 190:1,17
---	--	--	---	--	--	--	---

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 15

192:10,13	patchwork	57:18 58:2	72:12 96:20	pessimism	116:4	phones	139:11
192:21	108:8	58:9 60:11	163:12	155:21	118:10,19	141:11	150:18
193:2,21,24	path 54:10	61:19 63:12	166:25	PG 70:6,8,17	118:25	physical	151:8
parking	pathologists	63:22 64:2	167:2	70:22	120:21,22	152:6	158:16
58:22	49:9 56:6	64:6,20	170:20,21	pharmacists	121:20	pick 100:6	159:2
152:19	60:9 61:8	66:3,17	170:23,23	49:10 60:10	122:12	147:1	164:15
Parkway	63:9	70:11,14,18	percentage	63:9	125:16	picked 76:6	173:20
161:22	patience 4:12	70:21 73:23	19:18,20,22	pharmacy	126:18,19	picture	176:23
part 33:9	72:3 118:3	75:15 80:18	20:5 157:10	56:5	128:5	129:15	178:13,24
42:19 48:14	131:22	81:22 86:16	percentages	Philadelphia	139:20,21	pie 31:2	181:14,19
69:8 89:13	151:8	86:17 90:18	17:19,20	1:1 6:11,23	141:5 143:4	piece 79:3	182:25
89:18 97:5	158:15	91:21 92:11	20:1	7:1,19 8:1	143:24	Pierhead 6:1	183:2,4,8
114:21	194:16	99:7 102:1	perform	10:19,22	144:24	179:11	pleased
116:20	patrol 128:14	102:2 122:5	45:16,24	12:8,22,25	145:17	Pittsburgh	118:20
119:1	patrols	122:6 123:3	performance	13:4 14:5	149:2,24	122:15	159:24
123:11	128:12	123:7,13,23	94:3	14:19 15:11	151:18	pivotal	160:14
125:4	pause 181:16	124:4,5,13	performs	16:7 21:16	152:9 155:9	117:15	173:15
129:14	181:17	124:22	116:18	23:12 24:3	159:19	place 11:17	pledge 91:11
175:2,10	pay 42:3	125:22,25	period 7:15	27:14 30:10	160:2,22	13:24 23:16	plenty 34:15
176:4	51:16 75:7	126:10	28:2 79:9	33:13,20,21	163:19,21	24:20 25:9	Plowden 91:2
partial 29:11	paying 13:18	127:8,9,14	periods 110:8	34:2 35:3,8	164:23,25	51:25	plus 174:13
participants	72:5 94:1	127:16,18	114:7	36:8,14	165:19,23	109:21	poignant
8:9 181:18	pays 51:15	128:7,13,18	permit 185:5	38:17 39:3	166:1,3,6,7	121:18	125:9
participation	peace 42:16	128:21	185:18	40:13,24	168:18	124:2	point 30:21
114:18	42:17	130:1,18,23	186:21	41:6 42:12	169:9 170:1	140:18	50:21 52:25
163:11	peaceful 86:6	131:20	187:9	42:14,22	170:8 171:9	143:11	64:8 65:18
181:11	pedestrian	136:14	191:18	43:11,15,25	175:13	places 11:9	66:8 68:11
particular	88:12,20	140:13,15	192:5 193:7	44:1 45:4	180:3	placing 6:2	68:17 75:14
25:20 56:8	99:16	140:24	193:16	45:18,20	Philadelphi...	plagued	78:6 86:23
99:22	pending	143:8,16	person 6:14	46:1,15,17	21:2 73:16	114:7	99:23
161:16	136:6	144:12	46:4 99:22	48:17,21,24	143:5 178:2	plan 5:21,23	120:13,24
particularly	Pennsylvania	145:8 146:6	121:16,23	49:19 50:18	Philadelphi...	6:2 55:4	125:10,10
13:22 20:22	11:2 27:16	146:17	126:12,14	51:15 53:11	160:16	68:24	127:13
28:20 31:1	42:23 55:17	148:9 149:1	126:25	53:13 55:14	Philadelphi...	129:21	140:10
34:3,23	78:11 107:7	149:19,22	143:18	55:25 57:10	72:18 89:22	163:9	145:10
43:12 60:7	109:4 134:7	150:14	173:12	58:19,21	119:24	179:13	153:25
60:21 86:16	people 9:10	152:5,15	177:6	62:20 64:6	Philadelphi...	planet 130:19	155:1
106:5	13:21 19:7	157:25	person's	65:11 66:21	12:14 27:3	played	156:25
161:10	24:2 25:6	163:20	140:15	68:23,24	33:6 35:12	131:14	175:24
172:12	28:12 29:5	169:14	personal	70:15,20	38:14 43:16	161:11	pointed
parties 136:3	29:6,8 30:5	171:8,9	99:15,17	72:8 73:1	81:19	playing 131:8	153:23
180:1	30:9,24	172:11	130:25	74:4 77:9	161:16,23	169:11	pointing
partners	33:14 35:5	177:15	143:20	78:10 81:13	162:5 163:3	please 2:21	100:22
130:17	35:6 38:10	178:8	Personnel	81:15,21	163:3	2:24 3:1	points 9:22
partnership	38:22,24	people's	10:18 11:20	83:4,12	165:12	5:8,15	38:18 69:15
26:7 166:15	39:2 40:25	194:14	persons	85:10 87:12	168:15	14:23 31:13	98:20 99:2
166:17	40:25 42:2	percent 16:5	125:24	88:14,16,23	Philly 46:23	40:6 47:7	poised 141:24
parts 126:24	45:13 46:20	17:13,16	perspective	90:25 92:22	46:24 126:8	47:21 67:14	police 6:16
party 134:19	46:23 48:8	19:6 20:6	20:17 44:7	95:19 97:16	167:6 168:2	68:6 71:10	7:2,21 16:9
pass 35:18	48:15,20	23:1 24:2	82:14,25	98:10	phlcouncil....	84:19 90:3	19:19 28:20
167:16	49:2 50:2,7	37:7 57:24	83:2 123:5	105:24	2:19	105:3 106:9	28:21 29:2
passed	50:11,16	57:24 58:1	123:6	106:21,23	Phoenix	106:11	34:24,25
131:12	51:24 53:5	58:3 59:23	perspectives	109:19	115:6	118:13	35:13 36:6
179:8	55:9 56:2	59:24 72:8	136:25	112:7,23	phone 141:7	138:17	36:8,10

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 16

37:6,10,15	129:1,6,9	populous	152:2	55:19 95:23	165:18	124:24,25	185:14
37:18 38:3	129:12	60:18	156:23	108:14	171:2	127:8	187:5
38:12 40:21	131:9,11,16	Port 180:3	157:14,24	116:2	pro 63:16	136:20	188:17
41:7,14	142:15	portion 5:21	171:2	159:14	probably	137:1,5,18	189:17
42:21 43:15	144:1,6	92:7 179:10	172:20	181:3 183:3	19:13 75:16	137:19	190:21
43:24 72:8	145:9,13	portions 5:24	173:1	183:11,15	132:15	153:25	191:25
72:21 75:23	151:21	posing 67:4	177:18	183:19,22	145:16	156:12	193:12
76:12,12	152:5,10,13	position	178:5	184:1,6,10	165:20	157:1	property
77:16,19	152:17,21	10:24 23:11	powered	184:13	problem	162:11	179:15,20
82:21,22	154:13	25:7,20	165:24	presented	18:19 30:1	168:24	proposal 6:23
83:18 85:11	156:5,13,19	33:10 45:17	powerless	85:17	30:15 48:14	processes	proposals
86:1,8 87:6	157:2,11,12	69:1 75:9	109:15	160:24	63:14	170:16	107:23
87:8,12,17	157:19	75:24 127:3	powers 7:23	presently	problems	Procurement	108:4
87:24 88:8	police-invol...	144:13	73:21,22	50:25 57:8	35:7 92:16	7:9	propose
88:16,18,25	114:15	positions	85:14 96:12	President 9:4	104:10	produced	130:17
89:19 90:7	policed 41:25	9:20 10:20	96:14 104:9	32:14 47:25	procedural	148:3	proposed
90:17 91:13	126:14	11:19 12:3	104:17	75:5,12	101:24	product	151:20
92:2,3,23	policies 39:11	14:9 17:14	108:20	139:21	102:10,17	95:19	proposing
93:4,9,10	87:11	17:17 19:16	114:17	150:11	procedures	profession	6:25 7:18
93:10,13,16	policing	19:25 22:11	115:9	151:13	39:12	70:2 99:15	Prosecution
94:19 95:6	30:12 42:11	25:14 34:4	PPD 94:7	164:21	proceed	professional	95:22
95:20 96:1	43:15 74:4	34:14,18	152:2 153:9	President's	32:12 35:23	57:13,16	prospective
96:17,20,25	77:8 89:12	44:5 48:13	155:2	75:4	39:23 40:7	111:8,16,20	10:2 133:8
97:4,4,15	97:12 99:14	49:11 51:9	practically	press 143:24	47:22 90:3	111:22	protect 72:9
98:5,8,22	107:15	51:11,21	70:9	143:25	106:11	113:6	89:21
100:18,20	108:15	60:11,21	practice	pressed	118:15	professiona...	131:21
102:6,18	116:2,21	61:13 65:4	88:10 93:12	150:16	139:13	116:19	protecting
107:9,14,18	119:22	66:13 69:3	95:2 111:21	pressure	150:19	profiled	158:2
107:23,24	120:25	149:21	practices	177:13	151:9	82:16	protest 75:7
107:25	123:12	positive 89:4	39:11 87:11	pretty 72:11	158:25	profiling	protesting
108:6,12,15	124:11	167:25	89:18 96:8	103:8	159:2	147:7	128:7
109:13,21	127:18	possibilities	122:19	147:15	164:15	program	protests 86:7
109:24	128:23	80:9	152:4	prevent	178:25	21:23 22:14	143:23
110:1,12,22	129:3,11	possibility	practitioners	157:3	182:12	49:20,24	167:9
111:3,5,19	135:25	51:7	111:25	previous	proceedings	50:8 54:6	proud 69:21
112:2,6	policy 66:18	possible 2:11	pre-contract	45:10 121:8	137:6	55:6 72:16	91:15
113:4,8,9	91:22 93:12	39:3 80:13	162:14	previously	181:17	88:15 142:6	161:10
113:15,17	95:1 108:9	104:15	predictable	182:3,6	195:3	160:18	166:19
113:20,24	159:8	180:1	74:23 75:11	primarily	proceeds	161:3 164:6	172:2
114:20,22	political	post 98:5	predomina...	112:5	150:8	175:6	proven
115:2,17,20	110:15	post-gradu...	21:24	primary	process 11:12	programmi...	167:25
115:23	pool 11:16	61:9	prefers 102:6	91:24	23:9,16	88:22	provide 7:20
116:1,14,15	23:14 55:3	post-secon...	prepared	prior 2:17	24:5,9,10	programs	15:14,22
116:16	63:4 149:3	61:7	72:20	6:19 8:13	24:19,20	22:8 55:13	19:14 28:5
117:5,17,19	poorest 13:7	potential	105:11	118:5	25:9,16	104:16	39:16 49:6
119:12	66:21	16:13,14	182:15	121:13,16	26:15,25	project 160:9	49:23 52:24
120:2,20	poorly	101:12	prescribed	121:22	53:24 56:11	171:13	61:18 68:6
121:5,7,18	109:14	potentially	102:13	priority 22:4	62:25 63:13	promote	96:5 124:17
122:9,17	Pope's	103:6	presence	privacy 8:10	63:18,20	30:22 50:5	125:12,21
123:19,23	167:19	poverty	125:25	private	64:11,13,18	61:1	126:3
124:6,14	populated	41:15	178:23	148:25	65:19 66:9	promoting	149:24
125:11	148:2	power 41:10	present 1:9	149:18	66:11	50:15	160:10
126:11	population	110:16	2:25 3:7,12	privilege	112:23	proper 88:19	provided
128:14,22	28:11	119:21	4:6,24 18:5	62:10	113:12	properly	42:5 49:8

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 17

67:12	149:19	8:14 15:16	178:12	186:21	52:12 91:17	9:2,21 10:9	55:9 56:9
160:20	purchased	16:22 17:5	182:14,25	187:9	162:19	13:17 18:3	63:11 69:2
161:13	172:4	27:7 31:5	184:17	191:18	163:14	18:8 23:4	178:1
166:21	purpose 8:22	37:3 47:2	racial 57:7,25	192:5 193:8	recess 182:13	25:24 30:22	recruiting
provides	purposes 6:4	48:7 54:19	103:1	193:16	recipe 146:21	32:11 35:23	62:23
114:3	6:4,5	56:21 67:5	racially 82:15	ready 130:6	146:22	39:23 43:18	recruitment
providing	pushed 175:7	78:24 80:6	racism 34:1,7	180:12	recognition	47:22 48:3	11:10 16:15
6:21 7:24	put 4:16	89:24 104:4	86:20	182:6,11,17	18:17	48:4 52:9	24:24 25:4
36:3 52:2	27:10 34:9	104:20	177:16	183:12,23	recognize	53:8,16,24	68:19 69:8
97:9 163:2	55:8 61:15	130:6,11	rack 142:5	real 31:1	24:18 25:5	56:14,20	recruits
165:11	67:13 70:22	138:6 158:9	radio 40:17	44:22 91:10	25:8 40:22	60:2 64:17	72:17
public 2:6,8	77:18 91:7	164:4,9	72:4	101:11	126:12	64:18 66:16	redeploy
2:12,13,13	91:23 124:2	171:18	raise 146:18	105:21	127:4	67:13 68:7	144:6
2:15 5:10	132:21	172:7	raised 14:15	136:20	177:18	69:15,18	redlining
6:5 8:7,8	178:4	174:20	38:19 43:1	143:14	recognized	72:7 81:6	146:5
9:8,23 23:7	puts 12:21	176:17	48:6 68:17	152:3	8:20 17:10	81:24 84:20	reduced
25:25 42:7	152:9	180:12,16	126:20	157:23	71:21	106:10	155:17
53:9 54:23	putting 60:1	180:25	140:8	172:20	128:25,25	118:13,14	reducing
56:22 58:6	172:24	queue 173:20	raising 43:4	173:14	173:22	121:13,22	149:2
59:4,14	177:14	queued 182:2	126:21	174:25	recognizes	121:25	redundant
75:16 80:20		quick 175:1	rally 32:15	realizing	27:6 39:20	139:12	140:5
85:6 97:5	Q	quietly	161:22	16:18	78:19 81:2	144:11	reeling 85:22
99:3 109:9	Qayyum	165:23	162:2	really 14:2	82:4 97:7	150:7,10	reference
109:12	31:15,17,23	QUINONES-	random	25:22 27:9	97:20 129:3	151:9	133:5,12
112:14	31:24 32:13	4:9,15	101:22	37:24 46:10	130:13	152:24	referenced
114:11	32:14 43:8	97:22 99:5	randomly	61:22 68:17	132:2	159:1	59:9
115:17	43:19 44:8	101:7	101:22	80:4 81:24	173:24	164:15	referencing
116:9,22	45:7,8	102:21	range 88:17	83:22 98:6	174:21	171:23	101:21
117:2	47:10	103:10	ranks 37:15	98:18 99:10	184:21	172:3	referred
118:24	142:25	184:9	ratified 73:3	120:17	186:12	178:24	56:24 57:1
119:2	qualified	Quinones-S...	ravages	128:12,17	188:1 189:3	185:10	57:14
120:17	6:22 10:19	1:14 4:8	41:15	129:25	190:5 191:8	187:1	refine 109:8
125:2 130:2	12:10 33:6	97:21 184:8	Rayshard	132:22	192:15	188:14	reflecting
134:24	34:5,5	quite 13:11	39:9 86:1	137:4	recognizing	189:14	38:5
137:11	qualifies	19:18 81:17	90:19	140:16,20	8:14 165:10	190:18	reform 40:21
151:16	22:15	81:17 135:7	107:20	140:23	recommend	191:22	87:1 88:2
181:15,23	qualify 22:11	135:8	re-educate	142:13	94:24 95:2	recorded 8:7	91:14 107:9
181:23	quality 87:19	quorum 4:23	88:18	149:12	108:20	8:12 131:13	108:1,6,15
182:7,20,21	137:21		re-examine	159:21	recommen...	186:4,9	115:20,24
182:24	quasi-judic...	R	39:11 125:2	172:17	94:21 96:19	187:18,21	116:1 117:5
183:12	137:5	R 195:1	125:3 171:1	175:7,17	108:17	records 74:1	119:13
195:12	question	race 59:18	reach 144:8	reason 36:18	185:3,16	112:15	134:22
public's	12:12 27:14	races 33:14	reached	36:22 38:11	186:19	115:3 121:9	135:24
109:17	28:10 43:20	Rachel 2:21	179:15	60:3 61:23	187:7	recover	refused 77:17
publish 7:4	53:15 85:16	4:18 5:15	180:4	102:3,4	189:11,20	165:13	regard 82:12
published	99:1,11	8:23 14:23	reaching 9:10	105:19	191:16	recovery	130:4
2:16	101:15	31:12 47:7	30:2	147:24	192:3 193:6	86:18 169:9	133:16
Puchalsky	140:8	52:15 67:14	read 5:15	reasonable	193:14	169:23	regarding
158:20	155:15	67:19,21	76:15 151:6	8:10 127:12	recommen...	175:14	5:12 82:10
159:4,7	questioned	71:10 84:12	192:24	reasons	108:9	recreate 79:8	90:14
pull 142:4	75:25	105:3	reading	162:16	115:25	recreation	132:24
pulled 76:21	questioning	138:17	63:16 76:2	rebuilding	recommen...	79:20	133:1 165:6
101:23	53:3	158:16	164:2 185:5	87:14	193:4	recruit 19:19	179:22
pulling	questions	176:23	185:18	received	record 8:16	25:19 49:21	regardless

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 18

45:2 134:19 regards 134:11 region 56:12 Regional 180:3 registration 154:16,22 regular 147:1 regularly 99:7 115:4 regulations 39:13 rehired 121:19 122:17 reimagine 129:11 130:2 reimagining 118:23 120:17 123:10 124:10 reinvestment 109:23 reiterate 76:22 relate 39:1 related 12:5 29:18 44:6 54:16 104:11 relates 14:4 34:23 44:5 59:18 60:20 150:16 relating 7:1 relations 117:19 relationship 107:18 relationships 88:25 167:24 relative 24:6 54:18 77:2 relatives 83:17 release 143:24 released 113:16 relevant	123:20 reliable 169:16 religion 147:12 148:6 rely 61:17 162:5 remain 87:2 116:21 remained 113:13 remark 45:10 remarks 106:15 remember 23:22 41:9 remind 75:20 76:1 101:16 145:14,20 remote 1:4 2:6,11 remotely 2:10 removing 16:8 Rendell 74:19 110:3 124:2 rental 106:3 118:10 reopened 169:13 repair 107:17 repeat 119:5 replace 91:14 111:5 113:5 replaced 113:18 report 98:6 98:17 100:19 101:18 113:17 154:13 155:14 163:24 177:15 reported 113:7 153:4 153:12 185:2,15 186:18 187:6 189:9	189:18 191:14 192:1 193:5 193:13 reporter 195:12,23 reporting 98:14 153:6 reports 93:11 153:14 154:21 155:3 represent 17:20 49:11 58:10,15,18 58:20 144:22 148:9 Representa... 11:22 75:21 77:11 105:6 105:10,13 106:10,12 106:13 107:5 117:24 118:6 119:4 130:8 131:3 132:12 133:22,24 134:3,4 138:3,14 172:4 representat... 15:17 represented 10:8 17:4 44:14 66:5 72:22 representing 40:11 59:6 represents 48:10 57:12 160:25 reproduction 195:21 request 10:17 25:7 65:17 155:16 163:24 requesting 100:20 require 61:6 64:22 69:4	77:1 107:25 required 26:21 41:24 54:22 requirement 6:13 10:4 10:17 11:18 12:21 32:20 36:13 49:1 49:18 51:3 51:4,13 54:13 63:22 65:22 requirements 6:13 19:24 22:9 27:21 27:23 28:7 36:5 49:4 68:13 requires 2:4 9:12 106:17 163:9 requiring 11:14 120:20 reserving 6:2 reside 145:8 residence 6:12 70:9 residency 10:4,16 11:18 12:21 13:9 16:8 20:25 23:15 27:21,23 28:7 30:23 32:20 36:4 36:12 41:5 48:19,25 51:3,4,13 68:12 69:5 71:3 142:24 143:1 148:17,19 resident 6:18 9:14 62:20 63:24 64:5 68:22 118:18 126:7 147:2 151:18 159:22 residents 10:19 13:4	13:14 14:10 16:3 17:14 20:16 21:11 23:10 24:2 40:24 42:12 43:10 50:17 53:10,12 56:15 65:11 66:25 86:24 89:1 90:16 91:1,9,15 91:18 92:17 92:19 93:6 94:11,17 96:10 97:10 100:4 117:17 159:19 161:2 residing 16:6 40:13 resilient 167:4,25 resolution 5:13 6:24 7:17 32:19 71:13 72:23 75:3 85:8 105:5 111:1 138:19 187:23 188:3,7,10 188:18 189:1,5,8 189:17 194:13 resolutions 5:16 181:6 resolve 86:25 resolved 74:11 92:21 resources 15:13 70:23 95:13 106:18 112:17 respect 77:4 78:15 118:7 120:14 respected 78:13 respectfully 163:23 171:13	respecting 134:24 respects 122:25 respond 44:9 48:5 74:7 89:24 92:17 92:18 94:21 104:3 responded 155:15 responding 3:2 91:9 107:22 136:16 183:5 response 31:7 43:12 47:5 61:22 67:7 71:8 77:7 104:23 108:13 111:12 117:4 138:9 158:11 176:21 180:18,23 181:8 191:3 192:12 193:23 responses 80:4 responsibili... 79:18 112:8 responsibili... 168:4,9 177:17 responsible 80:4 160:17 responsive 110:12 rest 37:6 restart 178:2 restore 103:23 131:18 restores 10:4 36:12 restoring 6:13 36:4 restricted 152:18 result 39:12 114:1	results 146:4 166:18 retired 36:7 42:20 82:23 91:13 retrain 88:18 return-to-l... 21:23 returned 155:8 revenue 105:17 review 99:8 107:15 108:19 110:12,20 112:12 113:1,3,5,9 113:12,18 115:12,15 116:25 119:16 122:19 124:21 137:9 141:22 reviewing 89:18 108:4 revision 5:20 revisions 134:20 revved 142:8 Reynolds 21:5 RFP 162:11 rhetoric 91:13 128:6 Rice 90:21 Rich 178:17 179:3 ride 29:20,24 76:18 rider 167:18 riders 167:1 167:2 ridership 162:1 167:17 rides 166:22 right 13:20 21:3 24:13 26:7 30:24 33:16 49:1 62:19 80:14	83:3 103:2 111:4 120:3 127:6 134:15 140:13 147:25 149:23 152:21 154:6,12 right-of-way 6:3,8 rightly 49:5 rights 91:5 162:2 rising 86:13 165:2,3 risk 89:4 risking 116:17 Ritz 164:5 River 6:1 179:12 road 86:17 154:5,18 175:14 Roadmap 88:23 robust 97:25 148:21 Rodney 111:12 138:20 139:16 158:8 role 129:12 129:18 161:11 169:10 roles 23:5 55:10 136:16 roll 2:22 4:19 5:9 12:17 183:1,8 184:17 room 33:25 root 147:20 173:12 Rose 90:22 122:14 rotary 141:7 round 16:10 rounds 115:13
--	---	---	---	--	--	---	---

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 19

10:15 21:2	142:4	47:25 52:4	94:5 130:21	147:2	52:2 54:4	sheriffs 16:10	131:7
73:1 85:10	saw 114:12	52:6 53:3,6	130:23	send 102:9	89:10	shield 156:12	similarly
148:17,19	131:4	53:14 54:20	142:14	119:12	124:16	shift 18:10	114:7
rules 39:12	saying 10:21	55:11 57:8	146:5	sending	160:11	shine 116:8	simple 24:9
41:5 164:1	11:25 12:6	58:12,16	155:24	131:19	161:17	shoot 131:17	81:12,17
185:4,17	13:21 38:13	59:11,19,22	158:22	senior 76:8	serving 62:11	shooting	99:7 152:8
186:20	48:19 55:23	60:23 62:5	172:11	sense 30:24	session 134:8	85:25 86:2	156:4
187:8	60:15 63:1	63:15 64:2	173:17	34:12 43:14	164:3	shootings	simpler 26:15
191:17	63:3 78:2	65:1,21	176:13	sent 143:24	165:16	86:13	simply 9:11
192:4,24	100:4	66:2 67:9	182:1	Sentencing	185:6,19	114:15	43:16 58:6
193:7,15	101:11,25	screamed	seeing 35:8	135:19	186:22	shop 120:5	86:21
run 76:10	130:1	154:1	169:11	separate	187:10	shopping	168:13
92:22	172:15	screen 3:4	seek 39:15	135:13	191:19	76:3	simultaneo...
140:25	185:21	183:7	85:9	SEPTA	192:6,24	shore 153:19	86:11
166:9 170:8	187:12	screening	seeks 88:24	167:14,20	193:8,17	short 77:18	single 116:7
running	188:20	137:19	seen 13:24	Sergeant	set 6:23 93:12	168:12	sir 18:19
76:11	189:21	sea 78:5	41:14 91:19	36:7	113:22	shot 34:17	sister 77:14
rural 40:19	190:24	searched	94:8 101:10	series 141:22	sets 137:22	116:13	124:4,16
rushed	192:8	154:6,7	113:2	serious 45:11	setting 79:23	show 86:25	sister-in-law
150:16	193:19	second 17:22	119:10	109:23	seven 92:11	141:15,15	153:19
Russ 134:14	says 51:22	119:7	segue 140:9	156:15	98:10	141:18	sitting 45:15
	64:4 83:14	Secondary	seize 78:8	serve 23:5	122:16	152:7	108:10
S	scared	70:1	selected	28:21 42:24	166:9	165:18	situation
safe 89:11	154:23	seconded	136:14	45:3 72:9	seven-person	showed	29:21 76:13
129:17	scathing	185:8,11,14	162:11	80:21 81:12	95:9	142:17	83:11
175:15	113:17	186:24	selecting	89:21 95:5	Seventy 68:3	shown 109:11	141:25
Safer 88:24	scene 145:23	187:5	137:20	131:21	sewer 6:3	shows 94:11	142:12
safety 85:6	scenes 165:24	188:12,17	162:15	168:14	shaking	shutdown	144:9
97:5,9 99:3	scheduled	189:12,17	selection	served 36:9	154:10	161:19	154:12
118:24	127:25	190:16,21	136:21	42:22 98:5	shape 103:22	shy 86:23	situations
119:2	scholarships	191:20,25	137:2	125:15	share 20:8	side 38:10	103:18
120:17	61:17,18	193:1,3,9	self- 27:4	serves 93:9	160:18	133:10,14	six 22:12
125:2 126:4	school 22:13	193:12	self-concept	service 6:15	165:11,25	134:13	56:17 68:15
130:2	49:14 61:1	seconds 70:5	146:20	7:15 9:3,13	166:3,11,17	154:5,18	151:18
sailing	61:9 105:23	181:25	semi-confid...	9:24 10:5,7	166:24,25	sides 134:17	162:12
194:12	165:4	187:2	73:25	10:15 13:6	167:10	Sidewalk	six-month
sake 15:19	169:19	188:15	Senate	16:5 17:13	169:7,15,21	124:3	179:17
salary 42:3,4	schools 22:8	189:15	133:10,14	17:17 23:18	169:24	sign 152:19	size 112:8
92:13	28:15 42:6	190:19	135:7,14	29:12 32:20	170:4 171:4	signed 179:8	skill 64:22
sample 96:13	69:9 125:7	191:23	136:7	36:5 48:22	171:6	significant	skilled 149:2
San 114:4	146:10,18	section 6:11	Senate's	49:3 51:2	177:20	96:11	skills 11:14
SANCHEZ	148:23	36:13	135:11	51:20 54:23	shared 87:25	113:25	skin 143:2
4:10,16	149:23	164:23	Senator	55:25 57:12	162:22	115:1 136:9	154:9 172:9
97:23 99:6	Science 49:16	sector 148:25	105:7,10,13	58:25 60:14	Sharif 105:7	161:1	177:7
101:8	54:12,21	149:18	117:25	68:14 69:4	118:17	193:19	skip 92:7
102:22	55:15 69:7	security	118:3,13,16	81:18 93:24	sharing 7:14	signify 8:19	sleeves 12:18
103:11	sciences	131:13	118:17	98:24	160:7	185:21	small 20:4
184:10	53:18,20	see 18:6,20	121:5 130:9	102:23	172:20,25	187:12	106:6
sanctioning	63:5	29:17 32:7	131:2,22	103:17	sheet 160:24	188:20	smaller 19:16
115:9	scope 121:24	35:25 40:23	132:11	125:13	163:6	189:21	19:20 27:20
Sandra 90:22	123:19	44:24,25	133:14,21	143:5	sheriff 72:15	190:23	28:11
sanitation	125:5	52:24 75:9	134:1 135:6	160:21	125:16,18	192:7	smart 178:1
30:11	Scott 47:15	77:24 84:13	138:2,12	167:15	125:23	silver 115:19	smell 13:20
satisfied	47:16,20,24	84:17 86:7	140:19	services 49:7	141:16,20	similar 27:24	smooth

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 20

194:12 snapshot 59:14 social 30:13 89:9 socially 18:21 161:13 169:16 society 129:2 129:12 sole 170:7 solidifying 119:17 solve 30:3 104:13 somebody 4:16 29:24 33:12 45:21 102:3 someone's 45:15 son 83:5,9,19 son's 83:14 soon 53:2 155:8 sophomore 70:7,24 sorry 5:3 67:17 92:18 109:2 132:9 sort 20:18 22:19 53:21 56:10 65:14 122:3 southern 175:10 Southwest 77:8 space 136:23 spark 116:9 speak 3:4 67:21 85:19 117:14 175:2 183:7 Speakers 134:8 speaking 5:3 118:6 128:3 speaks 20:19 special 7:6 11:14 43:7 64:22 94:24 specialists 49:10	specific 27:23 60:9 83:13 92:20 specifically 94:10 100:1 135:24 136:4 153:9 spectrum 83:6 84:2,4 spelled 98:7 spend 145:12 spent 70:23 spirited 29:6 spoke 29:6 88:6 165:8 spoken 173:23 sponsor 36:16 79:2 160:8 171:11 sponsoring 174:4 sponsors 15:9 80:24 squander 86:21 Squilla 1:14 4:14 18:4 18:12,15,16 176:13,14 180:8 184:12,13 192:16,18 192:22 193:3 194:17 Sr 38:1 St 114:16 staff 52:14 92:10,13,14 95:9 96:5,6 96:7 97:10 107:2 112:18 113:12 117:1 155:18 181:21,25 staffed 96:2 110:18 staffer 107:11 staffing 96:22	stake 41:21 42:10 44:17 44:24 stakeholder 112:20 167:23 stakeholders 166:18 stand 130:6 164:12 standard 54:12 72:10 74:6 standards 88:19 111:8 111:22 113:6 standpoint 22:18 start 11:17 32:10 48:18 78:2 84:21 84:22 141:6 142:9 158:24 170:8 started 18:24 38:4,5 76:7 76:11 143:23 147:20,21 152:12 170:6 starting 25:19 168:20 startup 170:12 stat 13:12 state 2:4 13:16,25 32:11 35:22 39:22 40:6 47:21 52:9 53:15,23 55:18 66:15 72:7 75:21 77:11 81:25 84:19 90:2 105:15,23 106:9,12,17 106:20 107:5,21 108:2 109:4	117:3,5,25 118:3,9,14 118:17 126:25 129:24 130:9 132:17 133:3,19,24 134:3 139:11 151:8 159:1 164:14 171:23 172:4 178:23 stated 9:17 statement 135:9 states 107:16 108:13 150:7 static 116:22 stations 161:5,6 168:13,17 stayed 167:7 167:12 138:15 Steer 72:16 steering 120:11 stenographer 67:13 stenographic 195:4 step 87:13 100:15 111:4 Steph 17:2 Stephanie 15:1,9 17:1 17:11 23:3 25:22 26:11 31:10 52:23 67:16 68:6 69:17 71:4 steps 130:4 Sterling 90:22 stolen 153:5 153:6 154:11 stop 75:25	88:10,13 142:20 stopped 29:10 stops 88:20 99:15,16 103:7 122:6 story 77:18 82:13 152:7 154:20 Straight 72:16 Strategic 159:8 strategies 89:6,7 streaming 40:15,18 streamline 26:14,25 streamlined 24:11 street 29:14 105:7,11,14 117:25 118:16,17 124:1 130:9 131:10 132:12 133:15,21 134:1 135:6 138:2,12 140:20 147:2 152:20 153:23 179:21 streets 42:7 86:7 123:24 124:6 130:21 strength 157:18,21 strengthen 89:20 strengthened 129:6 strengtheni... 87:5 88:8 119:15,17 stricken 6:6 strike 167:20 179:9 striking 5:22	stringency 49:2 stringent 49:4 strong 89:9 109:11 112:18,18 114:9 119:12 148:18 157:8 167:24 stronger 87:9 124:23 strongest 115:7 strongly 16:1 46:18,22 structural 92:16 structurally 98:8 structure 41:13 94:22 113:12 structures 112:9 struggled 95:8 struggling 42:6 60:4 student 22:13 study 111:21 subjects 156:9 submission 6:21 7:25 submit 48:2 75:19 submitted 52:11 75:2 subpoena 73:22 108:19 114:17 116:25 157:14 substandard 146:11 succeed 74:12 success 43:4 112:12 115:11	169:7 successful 46:6 89:8 114:20 166:15 successfully 50:8 173:6 sudden 14:6 38:7 suffered 157:20 suggest 51:6 suggested 126:17 summarily 76:21 summarizing 162:8 summary 15:22 16:21 summer 165:16 179:7 Sunshine 8:21 supervision 195:23 supervisors 57:10 supplant 95:25 supplier 177:14 supplies 92:14 support 34:22 41:13 48:19 50:13 50:15 81:10 85:7 90:11 91:12,20 93:5 95:15 112:16 135:3 151:19 158:3,4 160:9 169:5 169:22 171:12 179:5 182:16 supported 148:5 supporting	61:12 supportive 134:19 supports 87:5 89:10 supposed 137:4 sure 17:21 18:7,19 22:3 24:16 25:17 56:19 67:20 68:9 71:22 75:10 95:10 101:6 103:12 121:21 129:8 134:4 136:22 140:23 149:19 150:25 155:13 156:23 174:11 175:25 176:1 177:3 177:4 surely 25:9 70:11 surprised 9:10 surrounding 28:6 39:3 68:18,20 suspend 193:7 suspended 164:1 185:5 185:18 186:21 187:9 191:17 192:4 193:16 suspension 192:23 Sustainabil... 159:11 sustaining 27:5 SUV 153:21 Sylvester 37:19 38:1 system 7:14
---	--	--	---	--	---	---	---

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 21

120:16	talented	teach 70:16	14:24 31:14	178:25	132:13	72:19 73:17	thinking 56:8
131:13	33:14 46:20	teacher 70:1	47:8,18	180:15	134:4 138:1	75:20 77:21	thinks 24:8
136:8,12	talk 11:4	teaching	48:15 67:15	181:5	138:2,4,11	77:22 80:3	thought 76:9
148:6 156:9	33:24 34:10	21:22 70:20	71:6,11	testing 25:4	138:14	99:24 101:2	124:13
160:7	54:10 60:8	team 162:21	72:2 73:23	thank 3:22	139:10,23	101:9,11	127:19
163:22	66:17 72:16	167:23	85:7 90:13	4:11,21 5:7	139:25	103:1	thoughtful
166:21	72:17 76:23	182:10	105:4,11	16:25 17:8	150:1,3	104:13	99:11 155:9
167:5,7,12	83:8 128:11	Teams 1:4	118:21	18:18,21	151:7,12	119:6	thoughtful...
168:17,23	128:16	2:10 8:18	123:14	27:8 30:18	158:4,6,13	120:12	103:18
system's	134:2 156:5	17:23	138:18	30:19,20	160:7,12	123:17,22	threat 102:4
169:6	172:20	tech 169:2	139:25	31:3,9	164:10,17	127:14	threatening
systemic	178:9,9	182:16	150:14	32:16 35:19	165:9	131:1 140:6	101:12
20:19 22:23	talked 21:5	technical	151:15	35:20 39:16	171:10,15	141:2,13,17	three 31:21
56:10 86:20	101:19	28:14 32:6	158:17	39:18 40:5	171:20	143:6	91:16 93:1
177:16	173:8	181:21,25	176:18,24	43:5,6,7	172:24	144:20	98:19 113:2
systems 7:12	talking 14:8	182:10	178:14	46:24,25	173:16	147:25	120:9 128:2
99:24 148:4	20:24 21:1	technology	179:5	47:10,12,13	174:2,5,16	think 12:24	150:13
148:4 160:5	23:21 30:6	20:10	180:20	47:19 52:3	174:17,23	13:1,3	153:8,17
160:15	43:22,25	teenager 83:6	181:2	52:7,20	175:1,3,19	16:11 17:22	162:13
161:18	44:2 50:20	teeth 119:16	testifying	60:1 61:21	176:10	20:14,18	three-fifths
163:8	58:9,24	140:23,25	123:4	64:24 65:7	177:21	21:9,17	148:11
164:22	59:5 66:20	television	151:19	67:9,23	178:9,11,22	24:18,21	thrown
166:3,11	66:24 77:14	141:14	testimony	69:16 71:3	179:1 180:7	25:8,11,16	152:20
167:10	101:25	tell 14:16	2:13 8:3	71:25 72:2	180:10,14	34:7 36:11	thrust 37:22
170:4,16	104:15	17:19 19:9	15:15,23	72:4 75:4	181:10	39:6 44:4,6	ticketed
171:4	121:3 131:8	21:8,17	17:3 23:4	78:16,17,21	182:9,19	44:15,18	153:8
	156:6,7	37:20 45:14	31:10 32:12	79:2 80:22	183:16	45:24 46:10	tie 68:23
T	talks 46:3	57:5 63:13	32:21 35:21	80:23,25	184:6,14,19	46:14 48:6	tied 93:16
T 195:1,1	Tamir 90:21	76:17 120:6	35:24 36:3	81:4 82:1,2	184:24	51:12,12,17	ties 114:24
table 34:10	tasers 153:23	155:6,20	39:17,19,24	82:6,8 84:9	186:15	57:23 60:24	tight 78:25
38:10 108:5	taskforce	157:6	43:9 47:23	84:10,17,24	188:4 189:6	61:11,17	Tillit 164:7
tackle 86:12	108:14	telling 14:11	48:2 52:5	85:6,18	190:8	63:14,22	time 8:16
tactical	116:2	Temple 11:2	52:11,13,15	89:22,25	191:11	64:11 68:16	14:4 21:8
153:22	tastefully	tend 147:19	52:17 53:1	90:8 97:17	192:18	69:11 81:14	22:23 24:23
take 2:22	176:9	tends 143:13	63:7 67:10	97:23 98:3	194:15,18	82:12,17	25:13,18
13:24 26:11	Tate 91:2	term 22:17	67:11 68:2	98:23 99:10	thankful	119:9,13	28:2 32:5
30:14 38:24	taught	160:24	84:23 90:4	102:22	24:19	122:1 123:6	34:8 35:16
80:12	140:12	163:6	92:8 94:5	103:11,13	thanking	123:11	36:19,20
100:15	173:12	Terminal	96:13 97:19	103:17,20	18:17	124:18	37:1,8,17
110:13,14	tax 30:25	76:3	105:1	103:24,25	thanks 18:12	125:4,6,9	37:21 38:9
110:15	42:9 44:17	terminated	106:11	104:18,25	72:15 159:4	129:22,24	38:13,20
120:4 130:3	44:22,22	121:23,24	118:15	105:12	theory 137:2	131:5 136:6	39:6 56:7,9
144:11	tax-based	terms 6:9 7:7	130:5 136:3	106:8,13,14	therapeutic	136:24	70:22,25
148:7 168:8	44:20	7:16 81:9	138:16	106:19,25	144:8	137:15,21	75:2 78:7
177:17	taxes 31:1	103:4	139:14	117:10,21	thick 154:9	140:8 143:2	78:25 79:10
181:21	105:21	119:15	150:5,8,19	117:23	thing 22:17	143:9	84:6 105:16
183:1	taxpayer	terrible	150:25	118:2,12,21	28:18 120:4	144:15	110:2,14
taken 108:11	77:4	105:20	151:10	118:22	127:19	147:15	117:14
134:8 168:4	taxpayers	106:1	158:7,14	119:3	136:8 151:2	152:5,6	123:21
182:22	50:19 78:13	terrified	159:3,13	120:18	153:14	159:17	124:5,12,17
195:5	taxpayers'	154:9,23	162:9	129:14,17	177:2	162:24	125:17
talent 9:19	42:5	test 25:19	164:12,16	130:4,7,16	things 19:17	174:12	127:25
12:2 16:2	Taylor 90:23	testifiers 79:6	171:21	131:2,2,22	24:22 29:8	177:25	150:17
28:10	107:20	testify 8:6	175:4	131:25	33:23 50:19	194:7	151:5 158:5

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 22

160:20	tool 13:8,10	170:7,13	89:14	148:7	62:2,9,12	utility 6:5	102:17
171:16	171:7	177:10,21	103:23	unable 69:2	62:13	utilize 171:6	131:5
172:19	toolbox 13:10	Transit's	109:13,17	unanimously	unique 48:12	utilizing	videos 101:10
177:22	tools 141:11	162:17	115:17	35:18	97:11	169:15	view 2:12
178:20	top 9:19 12:2	transition	131:18	unarmed	unit 94:24		42:13,18
180:11	19:15 57:20	74:14	trusted	144:24	95:3,4,5,7	V	viewed 113:9
timely 74:8	topic 136:10	transparency	110:23,24	unbiased	95:14,15,18	vacancies	viewers 8:9
120:19,23	136:10	87:22 93:25	try 26:8	137:9,14	95:22,23	11:13 64:21	viewing 23:7
times 90:12	topics 136:2	107:25	102:10	unchanged	96:3,4	vacant 10:20	25:25 53:9
132:15	159:15	109:13	123:23	113:13	United	vacate 179:10	58:5 59:4
142:6	torn 152:19	115:18	145:13,20	unconstitut...	107:16	vacating 5:23	violated 91:6
Tipton 15:1,3	tossed 140:13	120:24	178:21,21	88:10	units 102:11	Valley 139:17	violations
15:10 17:6	total 58:7,15	transparent	trying 21:25	underdog	universities	value 162:16	156:15
17:21 18:9	59:10	114:2	37:14 59:13	173:13	11:6 68:21	162:18	violence 86:8
24:14,17	totally 33:18	transportat...	61:1 62:22	Underfunded	69:13	181:12	89:2,4 97:4
27:18,22	33:21 34:19	159:10	77:16 90:11	103:19	university	values 93:23	107:14,23
67:17,23	44:21	161:14	105:16	underfundi...	11:1,8,8	93:24	152:10
68:9	towed 152:13	163:5	133:6	114:8	49:15 53:17	134:24	156:10
tire 120:7	152:23,25	165:12	146:18,25	undergrad...	53:21 54:10	162:17,20	Virginia
tires 120:9	156:16	166:21	148:13	70:2	55:16 63:6	162:22	174:13
title 5:16	towing	167:5	159:18	underlying	69:22 70:10	170:11	virtually
titles 19:21	152:25	169:17	194:12	12:19	70:13	Vanessa	107:12
today 8:4	153:10	transportat...	turbulent	underscores	174:10,13	71:14 84:14	visibility
15:17,21	town 142:1	175:16	168:1	87:24	unknown	84:17,21,25	110:8
20:24 27:10	176:4	trauma 89:2	turning 86:23	understand	143:16	85:4 97:18	visit 153:18
29:17 40:17	toy 142:5	traumatizing	TV 4:17	2:3 25:11	unmute 40:1	98:16	167:20
75:10 82:12	track 94:2	155:5	twice 131:14	35:3 60:5	132:10	102:22	visitors 161:2
85:7 91:8	trades 22:10	travel 130:20	two 11:4 21:3	62:22 63:3	unpack 86:19	104:25	163:4
117:14	22:16	treading	42:20 56:7	63:19 80:1	unrest 13:23	vary 20:11	visually
118:21	tragic 85:25	134:21	58:18,19	99:1 100:17	43:13 133:2	Vegas 166:4	176:12
126:7 130:3	train 12:8	Treasurer	82:21 93:18	106:16	161:20	vehicle 67:2	vital 97:8
135:17,22	14:18 96:4	11:22	98:19	128:6,18	172:14	77:19	volume
142:22	trained 12:15	treated 41:10	104:13	130:25	upcoming	verbal 92:4	100:10
148:13	145:24,25	77:3 78:13	115:6	177:9	135:4	100:2 101:8	vote 34:22
151:15,19	training	91:6 147:22	127:14,15	understand...	urban 130:23	178:6	35:18 186:7
157:6	20:21 41:19	trends 94:8	135:13	35:4 42:24	149:8	verify 154:16	voters 85:17
158:15	72:14 89:17	94:10	141:11	101:5 123:3	urgent 86:9	154:19	voting 186:5
159:17,25	92:14 96:3	tried 41:11	150:14	149:9	use 8:17 13:8	versa 29:1	187:18,21
160:25	96:5 111:24	49:25	162:14,16	155:22	13:13 25:10	versions	
165:6 168:3	141:20	trips 161:7	165:2	understand...	58:11,14	113:2	W
175:5 179:5	transcript	troopers	two-year	179:24	63:12 65:19	veteran 36:7	wage 44:22
179:14	37:1 195:6	109:4	75:1 179:23	understands	92:3 100:13	veto 110:5	146:9
181:7,12	195:20	trouble 62:23	180:2	25:17	100:16,17	vetting	wages 51:16
182:23	transform	63:2	type 22:7	Unfortunat...	100:22,24	137:19	wait 75:1
194:3	117:19	true 92:3	82:17	17:24 22:19	101:4,5,11	vice 29:1	98:10
today's	133:1	117:9	140:21	38:23	101:12	36:19	waiting 18:2
124:20	Transit 7:12	166:20	142:14	unfounded	107:16	Vice-chair	131:24
told 127:25	160:5,15,20	truly 21:14		143:17	110:20	1:10 15:6	137:24
153:2	162:10,15	159:14,17	U	uniform	136:11,12	85:2 107:7	waive 10:16
154:10,13	163:7,17	168:14	U.S 113:15	29:11	141:7	Vice-presid...	waiver 11:11
155:2	164:21	177:16	114:10	unintended	143:19	44:13 68:5	16:8 23:8
tomorrow	165:21,22	truncate	166:1	51:20	151:2	victims 91:3	23:19 24:10
102:20	166:4,12	119:8	Uber 169:2	union 56:25	152:14	video 101:20	24:19,20,24
135:22	168:6,8	trust 87:14	ultimately	57:2,15	usurp 65:15	101:23	25:8,15

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 23

26:14,25	138:11	way 13:13	162:7	White 33:25	50:1,2,11	107:9 108:1	169:5
51:7 53:24	139:23,25	17:15 29:18	168:16	34:13 35:1	51:1,14,24	109:7	yearly 116:14
55:19,22	140:11	45:13 74:16	169:10	56:24 57:14	54:7 55:3,5	111:18	years 10:6
62:25 63:10	148:18	94:23 102:5	182:11	58:3 76:5	56:18 59:8	116:1	12:6 16:9
63:13,15,18	149:13	102:19	we've 13:24	144:1,6,10	64:14,20	123:25	21:21 33:11
63:19 64:18	150:10	103:22	25:6 41:14	171:2	66:4 77:12	124:1	34:1 37:11
65:14,19	165:9	125:1,4	56:9 66:23	wide 88:17	82:11 88:7	133:15	39:13 41:7
66:9,10	169:24	126:10	68:18 83:21	widespread	88:21 89:7	134:12	46:8 61:9
69:1,11	171:22	127:12	83:24,25	116:10	91:22,24	135:1	66:24 70:7
waivers	173:15	134:22	91:19 94:6	wife 83:25	94:25 95:2	155:17	70:25 74:22
23:20 24:5	174:2,5	136:17	94:8 101:9	164:25	95:19	160:14	91:16 116:8
24:6 51:8	175:3 176:8	145:2 153:3	104:10	Williams	105:14	171:5 194:9	116:14
55:24 65:3	181:10	157:9,11	119:1,10	38:1 41:9	106:16	works 40:22	125:17
65:7,18	194:6	ways 101:15	132:16	75:22	109:25	45:25 74:15	141:4
wake 107:19	wanted 23:20	112:9	167:19,22	Willie 38:1	116:3 118:8	94:17	148:21
walk 57:3	27:10 48:4	169:21	177:9	41:8	118:22,23	world 45:13	151:19
178:8,8	69:5,14	WBE 163:11	weak 109:15	willing 81:23	120:3 123:1	78:11	160:19
walked 75:25	77:10 81:6	we'll 21:7	wealth	140:25	123:19	169:12	161:3 166:2
walking 76:7	81:11,24	32:4,9	172:21,25	win 170:7	131:23	worry 73:8	166:22
125:14	127:14	35:24 52:18	178:5	window	133:4 143:3	73:10	168:1,10
walks 161:23	140:10	139:12	weapons	179:23	143:12	worse 157:20	177:10
want 9:12,21	142:2,23	151:4	144:25	wish 8:19	145:5	worth 131:24	yielded
10:9 18:7	153:15	158:24	weathering	17:10	149:10,25	wow 4:1	137:20
20:17 23:6	155:24	170:25	173:8	wishes 181:5	157:25	70:11	York 70:16
23:9 24:15	172:23	171:4	Wednesday	witness's	161:17	174:14	92:25 93:14
25:25 27:1	174:25	we're 15:14	1:5	53:1	162:3	wrap 85:24	167:11
27:2 30:22	176:15	16:4,7,16	week 35:10	witnesses 8:4	163:15,22	writing 151:1	170:5
31:9 41:23	177:5	18:2 20:24	35:10 88:5	8:15 15:20	169:18	156:16	young 29:5,6
42:20 43:7	wants 121:19	21:6,10	134:9	99:18 181:1	174:6,7	written 15:22	29:8 76:10
43:18 44:24	warning	24:19 25:19	152:16	181:11,13	175:5,11,18	48:2 52:11	83:5 126:6
44:25 45:1	99:24	33:4 34:8	166:10	Wolf 108:25	worked 33:11	52:13,17	126:8,21
46:2 48:7	warriors	35:7 40:18	weeks 39:6	136:19	41:7,8	68:2 96:12	128:24
48:18 50:20	131:20	43:22,25	135:5	woman 172:8	54:16 55:2	148:10	131:6,7
51:19 52:23	Washington	44:2 51:23	172:13	woman-ow...	105:22	162:10	148:21,25
52:24 54:18	114:19	59:13 66:20	177:8	173:2	121:14	wrong 80:17	149:22
57:2 58:6	167:10	66:22 78:6	weighted	women 40:12	122:23	119:24	Yup 17:6
60:8 64:24	170:5	79:23 82:11	159:15	57:22,24	148:20	120:6	
66:19 69:19	wasn't 50:13	84:7 85:22	welcome	61:13 78:1	worker 19:22	122:10	Z
72:7,10	122:18,20	92:10 100:2	158:22	Women's	62:19	126:13	Zaccagni
75:4,14	watch 72:21	100:17	well-financed	40:10,14,20	workers	127:5	15:2,12
79:1 80:11	141:13	102:15,25	108:18	women-led	10:10 34:12	128:20	17:22 18:23
81:12,18	172:11,16	121:2,3,3	well-noted	163:18	34:14,15	147:4,4	19:13 21:19
98:3,12,16	watchdog	129:22	30:21	word 26:12	45:21 58:10		64:12
103:4 106:8	110:24,24	131:19	well-prepa...	101:25	62:15,18,24	X	zip 77:5
106:19	110:25	133:6,16	71:2	words 3:2	65:10 161:2	Y	Zoning 73:6
118:2,4,21	117:9	134:20,21	went 38:2	127:13	167:14		
118:22	watched	136:17	43:1 82:22	150:2 183:5	workforce	year 6:19	0
119:3,25	141:21	142:13,21	82:23 93:25	work 9:12	19:2 170:22	9:15 46:5	
120:18,23	172:12,14	144:21	112:22	14:20 23:17	working	55:20,20	1
123:9	watching	146:13	141:19	24:12 26:20	12:18 16:16	56:16 62:21	1 72:12
128:12,18	26:10	147:25	162:13	29:3 30:13	26:6 31:22	63:24 64:6	1,000 24:5
128:19	177:25	149:12,16	weren't	33:19 34:6	46:23 56:16	65:11 72:15	1,050 57:11
130:16	water 6:4	156:6,7	127:12	34:14 46:2	62:21 65:12	88:15	1.5 28:11
132:11	wave 111:9	161:10	140:14	46:16 48:20	71:2 97:13	130:24	33:5 45:12

Committee on Law and Government
June 17, 2020

Page 24

96:19	193:12	55:1 57:9	4500 19:7	9th 29:1			
1.6 33:5	200363 1:17	2187 48:9	23:23,25				
45:12	5:12 6:10	55:1 57:12	47 44:14 48:1				
10 19:6	8:25 9:5	57:19,22	48:9 56:22				
168:10	14:25 15:15	58:3	56:23 57:5				
100 22:25	32:19 36:4	21st 108:14	58:8,15,17				
12 77:20	184:23	116:2	59:6,20				
139:19	185:1,14	22 68:5	62:1,8,17				
13 148:1	200367 1:17	2400 57:18	63:1				
130 166:5	5:13 6:20	25 59:23	47's 59:15				
140 161:5	71:12 72:23	28,000 19:3	4th 28:23,25				
168:12	85:8 186:14	44:3					
1400 161:6	186:17	29,000 48:22	<u>5</u>				
168:13	187:5	48:23	50 163:20				
15 17:16 19:6	200370 1:17	2nd 165:2	170:23				
24:2 166:10	5:13 7:8		500 40:12				
16 93:18	158:18	<u>3</u>	500,000				
16-hour	159:25	3 19:6	169:5				
166:9	163:25	3,500 168:17	54 170:21				
17 1:5	165:6	3.5 161:7	540,000				
17th 102:15	171:14	166:22	92:12				
18,000 112:2	190:7,11,14	30 21:21 70:5	55 10:6				
180 93:20	190:22	102:15,16	5th 118:19				
180293 5:19	191:6,10,13	128:1,2	<u>6</u>				
179:8	191:25	141:4	6 20:6				
18th 152:22	200377 1:17	148:20	6:10 194:20				
19 93:19	5:14 7:17	166:25	60 58:1 161:4				
169:4	71:13 72:24	30-year-old	161:4 166:6				
195th 107:6	85:9 188:3	109:22	600 161:5				
1982 114:7	188:7,11,18	30,000 19:3	6300 59:11				
1984 36:9	189:1,5,9	44:3	59:13				
37:11	189:18	31 170:20	64 72:4				
1990s 110:2	2007 113:3	33 10:8 57:1	649 26:5				
1993 74:19	2008 36:17	62:14,19,23	65 57:24				
1995 111:9	38:8	65:3,10,16	6th 161:21				
	2009 165:1	66:1,5,6	<u>7</u>				
<u>2</u>	171:25	34 33:11	7 163:11				
2 192:20	172:2	34-S 5:22	70 59:22				
2:30 1:5	2010 149:7	35 57:24	749 26:5				
20-101 6:11	149:12	163:21	75 59:23				
36:13	2015 88:15	350 168:17	<u>8</u>				
200 112:3	166:14	3500 23:24	8 98:9				
200,000-so...	2016 113:21	58:12,14	85 16:5 17:13				
146:15	114:10	59:1,3	8th 164:23				
2000 40:19	2018 101:17	36 170:23	<u>9</u>				
2001 36:9	114:16	365-day-a...	90 37:7 77:20				
38:8	179:7	166:10	900 40:17				
200355 1:17	2019 88:11	3rd 118:18	911 153:4,11				
5:12,17	2020 1:5	<u>4</u>	96.1 40:18				
176:25	85:18	4:00 76:24	99 72:8				
178:15	2021 168:21	40 58:3					
179:6,13	20s 126:8	41-S 5:22					
192:17,21	218 57:18	45 11:6 167:2					
192:22	2186 48:9						