

3/20/2023

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
COMMITTEE ON HOUSING, NEIGHBORHOOD DEVELOPMENT
AND THE HOMELESS

Remote location using Microsoft® Teams
Monday, March 20, 2023
1:00 p.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCILWOMAN JAMIE GAUTHIER, CHAIR
COUNCILMAN CURTIS JONES, JR., VICE-CHAIR
COUNCILWOMAN CINDY BASS
COUNCILWOMAN KENDRA BROOKS
COUNCILMAN MICHAEL DRISCOLL
COUNCILWOMAN KATHERINE GILMORE RICHARDSON
COUNCILMAN MARK SQUILLA

RESOLUTION: 221031

3/20/2023

1 - - -

2 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Good
3 afternoon. I understand that state
4 law currently requires that the
5 following announcement be made at the
6 beginning of every remote public
7 hearing as follows: Due to the
8 current public health emergency, City
9 Council Committees are currently
10 meeting remotely. We are using
11 Microsoft Teams to make these remote
12 hearings possible.

13 Instructions for how the
14 public may view and offer public
15 testimony of public hearings of
16 Council Committees are included in
17 the public hearing notices that are
18 published in the Daily News, Inquirer
19 and Legal Intelligencer prior to the
20 hearings and can also be found on
21 PHLCouncil.com.

22 I now note that the hour has
23 come. Cydnea Shearlds, will you
24 please call the roll to take
25 attendance. Members that are in

3/20/2023

1 attendance will please indicate that
2 you are present when your name is
3 called. Also, please say a few brief
4 words when responding so that your
5 image will be displayed on screen
6 when you speak.

7 THE CLERK: Vice-Chair Jones.

8 COUNCILMAN JONES: Present,
9 Madam Chair and colleagues.

10 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Good
11 afternoon.

12 COUNCILMAN JONES: Good
13 afternoon.

14 THE CLERK: Councilwoman
15 Gilmore Richardson.

16 COUNCILWOMAN GILMORE
17 RICHARDSON: Good afternoon, Madam
18 Chair and colleagues. I am present.

19 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Good
20 afternoon.

21 THE CLERK: Councilmember
22 Bass.

23 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Good
24 afternoon. I am present. Thank you.

25 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Good

3/20/2023

1 afternoon.

2 THE CLERK: Councilmember
3 Squilla.

4 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Oh,
5 there you go. Sorry, I was stuck on
6 mute. Good afternoon, Madam Chair,
7 colleagues. Present.

8 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Good
9 afternoon.

10 THE CLERK: Councilmember
11 Brooks.

12 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: Good
13 afternoon, colleagues. I'm present.

14 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Good
15 afternoon.

16 THE CLERK: Councilmember
17 Driscoll.

18 COUNCILMAN DRISCOLL: Good
19 afternoon all. I'm present.

20 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Good
21 afternoon.

22 Thank you. A quorum of the
23 Committee has been established and
24 this hearing is now called to order.
25 This is the public hearing of the

3/20/2023

1 Committee on Housing, Neighborhood
2 Development and The Homeless
3 regarding Resolution No. 221031.

4 Ms. Shearlds, will you please
5 read the title of the bill.

6 THE CLERK: Resolution No.
7 221031, authorizing the City Council
8 Committee on Housing, Neighborhood
9 Development and The Homeless to
10 conduct hearings regarding
11 discrimination against households
12 holding tenant-based vouchers,
13 putting thousands of vulnerable
14 Philadelphians at risk of
15 homelessness, and the effect of this
16 discrimination on Philadelphia's
17 affordable housing crisis.

18 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:
19 Before we begin to hear testimony
20 from the witnesses we have for today,
21 everyone who has been invited to the
22 meeting to testify should be aware
23 that this public hearing is being
24 recorded. Because the hearing is
25 public, participants and viewers have

3/20/2023

1 no reasonable expectation of privacy.

2 By continuing to be in the meeting,
3 you are consenting to being recorded.

4 Additionally, prior to
5 recognizing Members for the questions
6 or comments they have for witnesses,
7 I will note for the record at this
8 time that we will use the chat
9 feature available in Microsoft Teams
10 to allow Members to signify that they
11 wish to be recognized. In order to
12 comply with the Sunshine Act, the
13 chat feature must only be used for
14 this purpose.

15 Before we begin, I'd like to
16 make a few remarks about the
17 legislation before this Committee
18 today. Good afternoon, everyone.
19 I'd like to thank those offering
20 testimony for being here today as
21 well as my fellow Housing Committee
22 members and everyone listening in.

23 We're here today to discuss
24 discrimination against families and
25 individuals using housing vouchers

3/20/2023

1 and how that discrimination has
2 largely kept our most vulnerable
3 residents from being able to find
4 places to live in a housing market
5 that is already hostile toward
6 low-income people.

7 About 50 years ago, the
8 federal government began implementing
9 a new type of housing assistance to
10 low-income families that was designed
11 to offer more choice in the private
12 rental market. By awarding vouchers
13 that households could use in exchange
14 for rent, renters would no longer be
15 forced to accept whatever apartment
16 the local housing authority had
17 available at that moment, but could
18 instead work with a private landlord
19 in a neighborhood of their choice and
20 that landlord would get paid the
21 voucher amount from the government
22 every month, or that was the belief
23 at least.

24 Fast-forward to today.
25 Voucher-holding households have very

3/20/2023

1 little choice in a rental market
2 designed to keep low-income families
3 of color from high-quality homes. I
4 want to shine a light on how dire a
5 situation this is for our lower-
6 income rental households and
7 vulnerable populations who rely on
8 vouchers for a safe, healthy and
9 affordable home.

10 Direct rental assistance
11 provided by tenant vouchers is the
12 quickest and most effective way to
13 get low-income families into homes
14 given the severe lack of affordable
15 housing. This is because vouchers
16 serve families earning a much lower
17 income than most new apartment
18 buildings constructed with government
19 subsidy as well as new
20 rent-restricted units created through
21 the zoning code's various
22 mixed-income housing and mixed-income
23 neighborhood provisions.

24 In 2022, 75 percent of PHA's
25 almost 19,000 voucher households were

3/20/2023

1 classified as extremely low income,
2 earning 30 percent of the region's
3 area median income or below, well
4 below in most circumstances. There's
5 no way that government can build that
6 many deeply affordable housing units.
7 And so, we need direct rental
8 assistance vouchers to fill the gap.

9 The vouchers only work if
10 landlords accept them. That's why
11 Philadelphia created the local Fair
12 Practices Ordinance, which protects
13 tenants from unfair rental practices
14 by landlords and prohibits landlords
15 from refusing to rent based on a
16 tenant's source of income, including
17 tenant-based vouchers.

18 I am grateful that this
19 ordinance exists. Studies show that
20 voucher utilization rates are higher
21 and racial segregation is lower in
22 jurisdictions that have these source
23 of income anti-discrimination laws in
24 place. And so, I shutter to think
25 about where we would be without them.

3/20/2023

1 However, we know in practice that
2 most landlords still see accepting
3 tenant vouchers as a choice and not
4 the legal requirement that it is.

5 Local studies show that more
6 than 65 percent of Philadelphia
7 landlords are still not accepting
8 tenant-based vouchers citywide, and
9 that figure goes up to 83 percent in
10 low-poverty neighborhoods. This
11 widespread discrimination
12 disproportionately affects Black
13 households who comprise over 80
14 percent of PHA's voucher population.

15 Tenant vouchers are a proxy
16 for other types of discrimination
17 we're all too familiar with and are
18 federally protected against, such as
19 race, gender, natural origin, family
20 status and disability. My office
21 gets calls weekly from constituents
22 who cannot find a place to use their
23 vouchers, and it really came to a
24 head last year in my District when
25 almost 400 government-subsidized

3/20/2023

1 housing units in University City were
2 cleared at the same time.

3 Many of these families were
4 provided vouchers to help them
5 relocate, but none of them were able
6 to find commensurate relocation
7 housing in University City, most
8 having to move multiple miles away
9 unless they were able to find a unit
10 within a PHA complex. And
11 considering the development boom that
12 the City is experiencing, this
13 problem is only going to get worse if
14 we don't intervene.

15 Let's think about what it
16 means to be forced to give up your
17 voucher, something that many voucher-
18 holders have had no choice but to do
19 if they wanted to actually find a
20 place to live. Giving up a voucher
21 means giving up hundreds of dollars
22 in rental assistance each month that
23 you're entitled today by law which is
24 often times up to half of your
25 effective income. That is absolutely

3/20/2023

1 life-shattering.

2 This heartbreaking but
3 increasingly common scenario really
4 crystallized for me the severity of
5 this issue. Not only does it make
6 you feel like an other or lesser
7 than, but it strips you and your
8 family of the many opportunities that
9 living in amenity-rich neighborhoods
10 provide, such as walkable access to
11 schools, health care, basic goods and
12 services and family-sustaining jobs.
13 Everyone deserves a high-quality
14 stable home in whatever neighborhood
15 they please. And residents using
16 housing vouchers deserve the freedom
17 to look across Philadelphia and use
18 their voucher wherever there's a
19 vacancy. Because for many of our
20 neighbors, there housing voucher is
21 nothing more than a false promise of
22 hope in housing security.

23 I fully understand that
24 changes might need to be made to this
25 program to ensure that it works

3/20/2023

1 better for property owners. But let
2 me be clear, Philadelphia will no
3 longer stand for the rampant illegal
4 discrimination against working-class
5 Black and Brown families using
6 housing vouchers. To discriminatory
7 landlords, your time is up. We are
8 cracking down on this injustice
9 today. Thank you so much.

10 And I'd like to offer an
11 opportunity for other members of the
12 Committee to make opening remarks.

13 Councilmember Brooks.

14 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: Thank
15 you so much. I want to start by
16 thanking you, Chair Gauthier, for
17 spearheading this hearing and
18 bringing much-needed attention to
19 this issue, because we're in a midst
20 of a housing crisis in Philadelphia
21 and discrimination against those who
22 have vouchers is such a major part of
23 this problem as you spoke earlier.

24 With skyrocketing rent and
25 housing prices, vouchers are one of

3/20/2023

1 the few tools we currently have to
2 keep families off the streets and
3 keep Philadelphians in their homes
4 and in their communities and also
5 give children safe, stable and
6 healthy homes from which to go to
7 school and grow up.

8 The discrimination that those
9 voucher-holders face undermines the
10 life-saving benefits that housing
11 vouchers provide. And we've heard
12 countless stories in our office from
13 folks being denied an apartment
14 because they have a voucher even
15 though their rent will be fully paid.

16 While this discrimination is
17 clearly illegal, enforcement of these
18 policies is so weak that landlords
19 feel comfortable to even blatantly
20 list on their advertisement that
21 vouchers are not accepted. And this
22 type of discrimination takes a toll
23 on Philadelphians and our City.

24 Those with vouchers must
25 spend a huge amount of time and

3/20/2023

1 energy trying to find a landlord who
2 is willing to comply with the law and
3 accept their vouchers. And voucher-
4 holders also must spend hours waiting
5 through complicated, slow and
6 dehumanizing process of using that
7 voucher or extending the voucher
8 timelines, which is something we
9 heard earlier that happens quite
10 often.

11 And this time and energy can
12 be spent with folks spending time
13 with their families, in communities
14 and even working, right. So voucher
15 discrimination we know is rooted in
16 racism and classism and also is a
17 result of government failure. So
18 when the federal government stopped
19 building public housing vouchers or
20 sold as a free mar -- better for the
21 free market and an alternative to
22 providing housing, however the
23 voucher program has served in large
24 part as a subsidy for big landlords
25 who make large profits while tenants

3/20/2023

1 are forced into undesirable buildings
2 and neighborhoods and compelled to
3 spend months and months looking for a
4 landlord that's willing to accept it
5 and also while navigating the
6 bureaucracy, and sometimes it
7 requires a lawyer.

8 Our voucher system simply
9 does not work, and at least currently
10 in its present form. 4 in 10 tenants
11 with emergency housing vouchers are
12 unable to use it. For example, in
13 November 2022 there were nearly 800
14 Philadelphia families unable to find
15 a home even though they had the
16 vouchers, and there are thousands of
17 Philadelphians who definitely need a
18 stable home even if they have money
19 to pay their rent but aren't able to
20 because of the voucher discrimination
21 in our broken system.

22 So we need to imagine new
23 tools to address the housing crisis
24 in Philadelphia, one that works for
25 tenants. But in the meantime, we

3/20/2023

1 need to make sure vouchers work for
2 Philadelphians. That just means
3 stronger or more stringent and
4 effective enforcement of the
5 prohibition of voucher
6 discrimination.

7 It means a more accessible
8 and simple PHA process that does not
9 require a lawyer and does not leave
10 tenants feeling dehumanized. It
11 means higher voucher limits from the
12 federal government so that residents
13 can live in neighborhoods that they
14 want to, and a strong voucher system
15 means that families can stay in
16 communities, children can stay in
17 their school and all Philadelphians
18 have a right to a stable and healthy
19 home because that's a basic right.

20 So thank you so much,
21 Councilmember Gauthier, for
22 organizing this hearing. And I look
23 forward to learning more about this
24 and joining you in this work towards
25 solutions moving toward.

3/20/2023

1 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
2 you so much, Councilmember.

3 Are there any other members
4 of the Committee that would like to
5 make opening comments?

6 (No response.)

7 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Okay.
8 Great. Ms. Shearlds, will you please
9 call the first panel or witness we
10 have to testify today.

11 THE CLERK: Sari Bernstein
12 and Dominique Wiggins.

13 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:
14 Wonderful. Sari Bernstein, are you
15 there and connected?

16 MS. BERNSTEIN: I'm here.
17 Good afternoon. Can you hear me
18 okay?

19 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: I
20 can. Can you please state your name
21 for the record and proceed with your
22 testimony.

23 MS. BERNSTEIN: Yes. My name
24 is Sari Bernstein and I am a staff
25 attorney at the Public Interest Law

3/20/2023

1 Center. Thank you for allowing me to
2 testify today about voucher
3 discrimination, a pervasive issue in
4 Philadelphia that prevents low-income
5 renters of color from obtaining safe,
6 quality and affordable housing in
7 neighborhoods of their choice.

8 As you know, Philadelphia has
9 an affordable housing crisis. I will
10 not repeat all of the statistics that
11 Councilmembers Gauthier and Brooks
12 just mentioned, but we refer the
13 Committee to our written testimony
14 that's in the record.

15 In practice as you know, the
16 largest rental assistance program in
17 Philadelphia is the Housing Choice
18 Voucher Program, commonly referred to
19 as Section 8 which is funded by the
20 United States Department of Housing
21 and Urban Development and
22 administered locally by the
23 Philadelphia Housing Authority.

24 Philadelphia's local Fair
25 Practices Ordinance prohibits

3/20/2023

1 discrimination on the basis of source
2 of income, which is defined broadly.
3 It includes any lawful source of
4 income including, but not limited to,
5 housing assistance programs. And
6 consistent with the language of the
7 ordinance, the Philadelphia
8 Commission on Human Relations, which
9 I will refer to as the Commission,
10 the City agency charged with
11 enforcing the Fair Practices
12 Ordinance, interprets this protection
13 to include any lawful income, subsidy
14 or benefit with which an individual
15 supports themselves and their
16 dependents including, but not limited
17 to, federal, state or local public
18 assistance, medical assistance or
19 rental assistance programs.

20 Although the law has been on
21 the books for over 40 years, we know
22 that it is flagrantly violated. In
23 addition to some of the statistics
24 you already heard today, more
25 recently in 2022 the City's draft

3/20/2023

1 Assessment of Fair Housing cited that
2 nearly 50 percent of respondents said
3 that source of income is the reason
4 they were treated differently when
5 looking for housing. This is the
6 second highest response after race.

7 And not only did surveyed
8 individuals routinely raise source of
9 income discrimination, but
10 representatives from both fair
11 housing organizations cited increased
12 reports of source of income
13 discrimination. Housing Choice
14 voucher-holders in Philadelphia are
15 largely located in low-income,
16 racially concentrated neighborhoods
17 and not in integrated, opportunity-
18 rich neighborhoods as envisioned by
19 the HCV program.

20 I was really disappointed to
21 see that 43 percent of housing choice
22 voucher households live in
23 neighborhoods that are 80 percent
24 Black, whereas only 1 percent of
25 housing choice voucher households

3/20/2023

1 live in neighborhoods that are over
2 80 percent White.

3 In other words, despite the
4 subsidy these Philadelphians are
5 actually locked out of the rental
6 house market in large swaths of the
7 City, and statistics bear this out.
8 We know that of the 863 emergency
9 housing choice vouchers administered
10 to Philadelphia in 2021, 322 or
11 nearly 40 percent of the vouchers
12 issued under the program are unused
13 today.

14 So the City must take urgent
15 steps to ensure that Philadelphia
16 landlords follow this vital tenant
17 protection, because fair housing laws
18 are only realized, their objectives
19 with a parallel commitment to
20 enforcement. Studies show this as
21 well. Jurisdictions with strong
22 source of income discrimination
23 protections, including enforcement
24 show that voucher utilization goes
25 up. Because in Philadelphia source

3/20/2023

1 of income discrimination complaints
2 require administrative exhaustion at
3 the Commission, meaning complainants
4 must first file their allegations of
5 discrimination with the Commission
6 before proceeding to court, the
7 Commission plays a real key role in
8 efforts to enforce the law and reduce
9 source of income discrimination.

10 The Law Center's recent
11 experience representing both
12 individuals and the Housing Equality
13 Center of Pennsylvania, a fair
14 housing organization, and source of
15 income discrimination complaints at
16 the Commission provides insight into
17 targeted steps the City and in
18 particular the Commission can take to
19 counteract this form of
20 discrimination.

21 Our experience also shows
22 that enforcement really works. A
23 recent settlement with a large
24 Philadelphia landlord resulted in the
25 landlord agreeing to encourage and

3/20/2023

1 accept voucher applications in all 77
2 of their properties. This is
3 significant.

4 So the following
5 recommendations come with an
6 appreciation that the Commission's
7 resources and budget are currently
8 too limited to accomplish its
9 laudable goals. We, therefore, call
10 on City Council to increase funding
11 and other resources to the Commission
12 so that it may realize its
13 Charter-mandated duties.

14 These recommendations reflect
15 that primary mandate of the
16 Commission to educate, investigate
17 and to enforce. First, the
18 Commission must educate the public,
19 housing providers and tenants alike
20 through advertising, targeted social
21 media and print and other means that
22 source of income is a protected class
23 under the ordinance.

24 Voucher-holders are turned
25 away from rental opportunities solely

3/20/2023

1 because of their voucher status so
2 often and so flagrantly, that they're
3 reasonably shocked to learn that this
4 behavior is a violation of the law.

5 The education should be broad, visual
6 and undertaken in conjunction with
7 fair housing organizations,
8 community-based organizations and
9 Office of Homeless Services contract
10 providers to reach the most impacted
11 communities.

12 Second, the Commission must
13 be both proactive and responsive in
14 its duties to investigate violations
15 of the ordinance. Voucher-holders
16 experiencing housing instability
17 cannot be solely responsible for
18 ferretting out, reporting and
19 confronting discriminatory behavior.

20 The Commission should also
21 proactively engage with fair housing
22 organizations and other local
23 agencies to root out the
24 discriminatory conduct. But when
25 voucher-holders do come forward with

3/20/2023

1 allegations of discrimination, the
2 Commission must timely respond to and
3 investigate those complaints in a
4 manner accessible to unrepresented
5 individuals.

6 By way of example, for three
7 complaints our office filed in August
8 of 2019, the Commission took between
9 11 months and two years to complete
10 its investigations. This is too
11 long. The ordinance calls for an
12 investigation period of 100 days and
13 less impractical, and to provide
14 notice when the investigation period
15 does exceed 100 days.

16 Then once the investigation
17 concludes, the Commission cannot shy
18 away from issues of fact. For
19 example, on one occasion just by
20 written proof that discrimination
21 occurred, the Commission apparently
22 dismissed the claim simply because
23 the landlord denied it. And on
24 another occasion, despite
25 collaborating proof that

3/20/2023

1 discrimination occurred, the
2 Commission dismissed that claim too.

3 And third, the Commission's
4 obligation to enforce the source of
5 income protection is tied to the
6 administrative exhaustion requirement
7 in the ordinance. The Commission has
8 one full year of exclusive
9 jurisdiction while it investigates or
10 otherwise contemplates the complaint.

11 City Council should consider
12 amending the Fair Practices Ordinance
13 to bring this requirement in line
14 with other jurisdictions and areas of
15 the law. For example, City Council
16 could provide that a person may file
17 a complaint with the Commission or
18 has a private right of action in the
19 Philadelphia Court of Common Pleas,
20 or City Council could follow a model
21 that's akin to the EEOC, that is, a
22 person must first file a complaint
23 with the Commission, after which the
24 Commission has 100 days to
25 investigate.

3/20/2023

1 Before this 100 days expires,
2 the person may request to receive
3 what's called a Notice of Right to
4 Sue if the Commission will be unable
5 to complete the investigation within
6 100 days. After 100 days, a person
7 may request and must receive a Notice
8 of Right to Sue if the investigation
9 is not complete.

10 And finally, transparency is
11 paramount to fair housing
12 enforcement. The Commission must
13 publicize settlement agreements and
14 public hearing decisions that further
15 the purpose of the Fair Practices
16 Ordinance and the Fair Housing law.
17 The Commission's commitment to
18 achieving fair housing in
19 Philadelphia is commendable, and it's
20 in a really unique position to put
21 teeth into this often ignored
22 provision of the ordinance. The
23 scope of the problem is simply too
24 large to go unattended.

25 Philadelphia must ensure that

3/20/2023

1 housing providers abide by its source
2 of information discrimination
3 protection. We are glad to engage
4 and work through solutions with the
5 Commission and with all relevant
6 partners. Thank you for holding this
7 important hearing.

8 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
9 you so much for being here today, for
10 your work and for that really
11 illuminating testimony.

12 Dominique Wiggins, are you
13 there and connected?

14 MS. WIGGINS: Yes. Hi. Good
15 afternoon, everyone.

16 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Hi.
17 Good afternoon. Can you please state
18 your name for the record and proceed
19 with your testimony.

20 MS. WIGGINS: Yes. Hi. My
21 name is Dominique Wiggins. I'm an
22 attorney at Community Legal Services
23 in the Housing Unit. Thank you and
24 good afternoon to the Commission and
25 the Committee for allowing us the

3/20/2023

1 opportunity to address the issues
2 that we find as it relates to
3 Resolution 221031.

4 Community Legal Services is a
5 nonprofit organization providing free
6 civil legal representation to
7 low-income Philadelphians as well as
8 systematic advocacy and support of
9 our clients. The Housing Unit
10 represents over 3,000 tenant
11 households annually, many of whom are
12 Section 8 Housing Choice voucher-
13 holders.

14 There are many barriers
15 facing our clients. My colleagues
16 and I have witnessed how many
17 low-income tenants faced metaphorical
18 ripped walls and slamming doors when
19 searching for housing, high
20 application fees, minimum income
21 requirements, stringent credit
22 checks, blanket bans on tenants with
23 eviction records, high security
24 deposits due immediately, landlord
25 reference bias and burdensome

3/20/2023

1 insurance requirements to name a few
2 are some of the issues that we
3 frequently see our tenants facing on
4 a daily basis.

5 Even more challenging is
6 finding accessible housing for people
7 with disabilities because there's so
8 many Philadelphia rowhomes and
9 apartment buildings having staircases
10 and not having accessibility for
11 those who have mobility issues. The
12 City Council was instrumental in
13 passing the Renters' Access Act in
14 2021, which prohibits Philadelphia
15 landlords from blanket bans based on
16 credit scores or eviction history by
17 requiring an individualized
18 assessment of a tenant's credit and
19 prohibiting the use of certain
20 eviction records, and we continue to
21 work towards implementing those
22 changes on the ground.

23 Along with the challenges
24 facing all tenants, tenants with
25 vouchers face the additional barrier

3/20/2023

1 of discrimination simply because they
2 are a participant in the subsidized
3 housing program. Being able to
4 provide proof of income that meet
5 these requirements or have lengthy
6 credit checks or job history
7 requirements are really difficult for
8 these tenants as they are on
9 subsidized income.

10 While there are many reasons
11 a landlord may refuse to rent to
12 people with vouchers, including race
13 and class-based prejudices, many
14 landlords voice frustration,
15 confusion or misconceptions about the
16 Philadelphia Housing Authority and
17 its administration of the program.

18 We can look at how voucher
19 success rates to measure how many
20 vouchers are issued by Housing
21 Authority that result in a lease-
22 signing to know that vouchers are
23 easy to use in Philadelphia. In the
24 '90s, a study found that voucher
25 success rates nationwide was about 81

3/20/2023

1 percent. In 2001, it was measured at
2 69 percent. And in a recent HUD
3 study of 2019, data puts the rate at
4 about 62 percent nationally.

5 And while this study doesn't
6 include PHA, HUD data on PHA's
7 Emergency Housing Voucher utilization
8 indicates that 59 percent of
9 emergency housing vouchers in
10 Philadelphia have been utilized. 863
11 awarded by HUD and only 512 leased.
12 That means 4 out of every 10 tenants
13 given an emergency housing voucher
14 cannot use it and are at risk of
15 losing it. And as of November of
16 2022, there were 738 households with
17 vouchers who were looking for a place
18 to rent and most of those households
19 are still looking for places to rent
20 despite being almost six months past
21 that point.

22 PHA's subsidized over 20,000
23 tenant families through their voucher
24 program. As such, PHA is an
25 important partner in the City of

3/20/2023

1 Philadelphia, and we propose the
2 following ways in which we as tenant
3 advocates, the City of Philadelphia,
4 landlord associations and PHA can
5 partner to find solutions to the
6 following issues facing tenants with
7 vouchers: The first of which is
8 education for tenants and all
9 landlords that refusing to rent to a
10 tenant with a voucher is
11 discrimination under the Philadelphia
12 unfair practice ordinance.

13 PHA as a public agency can
14 have an important role in this
15 education through its communication
16 with tenants and landlords and its
17 public-facing documents and
18 information. But essentially, just
19 educating tenants and landlords
20 across the City of Philadelphia will
21 increase the number of tenants who
22 are able to successfully use their
23 vouchers when starting the renting
24 process.

25 Secondly, flexibility in the

3/20/2023

1 voucher issuance and timeliness so
2 that tenants have the paperwork and
3 the time that they need to find
4 housing. In light of the many
5 barriers that tenants face moving
6 with vouchers, it is important that
7 tenants are able to timely obtain a
8 voucher when they find a place to
9 rent so they don't lose that
10 opportunity.

11 Tenants also often need
12 extensions on their voucher when they
13 can't find a place to rent right away
14 and need to be allowed those
15 extensions. Both these issues
16 present tenants -- present challenges
17 to tenants currently. Additionally,
18 the ease of access for both tenants
19 and landlords, the voucher leasing
20 process is often challenging and
21 confusing for both tenants and
22 landlords and it can take a long time
23 to finalize.

24 PHA has already been taking
25 steps to improve the leasing process,

3/20/2023

1 and we want to work with PHA
2 landlords and the City to continue to
3 identify ways to make the process
4 more successful for everyone. The
5 solutions are going to address speedy
6 inspections and re-inspections, clear
7 communication about the next steps
8 and timeliness, a leasing process
9 that matches the timeline of private
10 markets so that voucher tenants have
11 an equal opportunity and footing when
12 it comes to renting.

13 Lastly, we're asking to
14 ensure that the PHA's payment
15 standards are in line with what
16 landlords are able to charge on the
17 private market so that tenants can
18 meaningfully lease up with their
19 vouchers throughout the City. As has
20 already been stated by Councilmembers
21 and by Sari, housing has increased
22 significantly and with that, we are
23 hoping that PHA will be updating
24 their payment information and their
25 standards on an annual basis.

3/20/2023

1 I continue to ask HUD for
2 permission when necessary for
3 increases so that tenants who do have
4 these vouchers can afford housing in
5 safe neighborhoods that they so
6 choose. In addition to these
7 proposals, we look forward to
8 partnering with the City and
9 landlords to identify solutions to
10 other barriers raised by tenants
11 renting with vouchers, including
12 housing counseling to assist tenants
13 looking for housing and rental
14 assistance to help cover emergencies
15 and for security deposits.

16 We appreciate Councilmember
17 Gauthier for hosting this hearing and
18 City Council for your investigation
19 of these issues and possible
20 solutions. Thank you so much for
21 your time.

22 THE CLERK: Good afternoon,
23 everyone. The Chair is experiencing
24 some technical difficulties so we're
25 waiting for her to log back on.

3/20/2023

1 (Brief pause.)

2 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:

3 Hello? Ms. Shearlds?

4 THE CLERK: I can hear you,
5 Councilmember.

6 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Okay.

7 Ms. Shearlds, are we (inaudible) --

8 THE CLERK: I'm sorry, Chair
9 Gauthier. I couldn't quite make out
10 what you were saying.

11 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Okay.

12 Can you hear me better now?

13 THE CLERK: Yes.

14 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Okay.

15 Did we finish fully with the last set
16 of testimony?

17 THE CLERK: Yes, Dominique
18 just finished her testimony.

19 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Okay.

20 Thank you so much. I'm sorry
21 (inaudible).

22 I wanted to ask a few
23 questions. First of all, thank you
24 so much for the testimony from the
25 Public Interest Law Center. Are you

3/20/2023

1 able to tell us -- you know, I
2 appreciated how you gave us very
3 detailed thoughts on how the Human
4 Relations Commission have added
5 capacity to do this work in a better
6 way that would help more tenants and
7 on how we can amend the Fair
8 Practices Ordinance.

9 I was wondering if you could
10 share more just as you're thinking
11 about that capacity at the
12 Commission, what does that look like
13 in terms of an expansion from where
14 we are to where we really need to be
15 to enforce (inaudible) and are there
16 places and localities that are doing
17 this work really well and have what
18 is needed, both at the local
19 enforcement place but also in terms
20 of how the ordinance is actually
21 written? Are there localities that
22 we can look to?

23 MS. BERNSTEIN: So I
24 apologize, Councilmember. The end of
25 your questions got cut off a bit, but

3/20/2023

1 I'm going to do my best to try to
2 answer them. And if I miss
3 something, please ask me again.

4 You know, in terms of what I
5 heard from your last question about
6 other jurisdictions, our experience
7 at the Law Center is of course
8 limited to Philadelphia, but some of
9 these ideas do come from some things
10 that other jurisdictions are doing.

11 For example, that's where the
12 idea about City Council considering
13 about whether to require
14 administrative exhaustion at the
15 Commission. It's something that they
16 would want to take a look at again.
17 For example, in New York City and
18 D.C., there's not administrative
19 exhaustion requirement, which means
20 that the private right of action can
21 go straight into court. And so, that
22 can potentially have different
23 consequences.

24 As to your first question, I
25 certainly don't want to speak for the

3/20/2023

1 Commission and I don't know that I
2 have the insight to say exactly what
3 their resources are and what they
4 could believe. But just speaking
5 from our experience, it's simply that
6 the investigations do take quite a
7 bit of time.

8 And so, in working here we
9 hear from tenants about what they are
10 going through. Usually the
11 discrimination is occurring, right,
12 at a moment of severe crisis for
13 these tenants and for the family.
14 The number one priority as it should
15 be is finding a place to live, and
16 that's where the statute of
17 limitations comes in. And it's so
18 important that tenants do have 300
19 days to file a complaint.

20 However, tenants also
21 reasonably when they do find a place
22 to live, they need to live their busy
23 lives, whatever that may be. And so,
24 we're trying to think through what
25 resources might the Commission need

3/20/2023

1 to be able to focus on the three
2 things that I spoke about, which is
3 number one, the enforcement piece, so
4 what resources are needed to try to
5 move that enforcement piece along as
6 quickly as possible for all the
7 parties.

8 Two, the investigation piece
9 which can be both in response to
10 tenant complaints or it might be
11 proactive. And based on either
12 listings, postings that might say
13 that landlords will not take Section
14 8 vouchers or Housing Choice vouchers
15 or other comments that are heard from
16 folks within the community.

17 And then the final piece of
18 that which is the education piece, I
19 think we picture and we know this
20 from other jurisdictions as well
21 where there's a really strong, very
22 broad education campaign which does
23 require resources, that that works
24 very well to have tenants understand
25 what they are supposed to be

3/20/2023

1 experiencing when they are looking
2 for an apartment and then also what
3 landlords are required to do under
4 the law.

5 You know, I guess what I want
6 to just sort of say is that the
7 issues that the Commission are
8 dealing with, the source of income
9 discrimination in particular because
10 it's so blatant, they're sometimes
11 straightforward and a lot of times,
12 at least the folks that we talk to,
13 they have written proof of the
14 discrimination. They get it in a
15 text message or they get it in an
16 email. So our hope is that the
17 Commission is investigating this
18 complaint, that they should move
19 along quicker so that the tenant can
20 see resolution of those complaints.

21 I hope that answers your
22 questions, but please tell me if not.

23 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:

24 That's very helpful. Thank you. And
25 I also heard you say that you thought

3/20/2023

1 the Commission should provide more
2 educational opportunities for
3 landlords and property owners. Can
4 you talk more about what that might
5 look like in practice?

6 MS. BERNSTEIN: Sure. And I
7 think this is something that the fair
8 housing organizations will also have
9 a lot to say about because this is
10 really sort of their bread and
11 butter. But landlords need to
12 understand what the law requires so
13 that they can follow the law. And I
14 think there's different ways one can
15 think about going about that.

16 Working with community-based
17 organizations, working with the
18 Office of Homeless Services, I'm sure
19 that the Commission would be able to
20 understand where are the target
21 communities, the landlords of the
22 property, management companies, the
23 housing providers that need this kind
24 of education and try to target the
25 education to those communities.

3/20/2023

1 Education can take a lot of
2 different forms. I think there can
3 be meetings. There can be really
4 easily accessible information on
5 websites, particularly on the
6 Commission's website which can
7 include information about the law,
8 what it looks like to follow the law,
9 what are the consequences for not
10 following the law.

11 And then there are other more
12 creative ways to think about an
13 education campaign that is simply
14 public, on buses, in the subway,
15 places where folks are every single
16 day so that they can understand that
17 this is something required under the
18 law and really matters, so that if
19 they have questions they know who to
20 go to, to talk about what the law
21 requires.

22 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
23 you for that.

24 And, Ms. Wiggins, do you want
25 to add anything from your experience

3/20/2023

1 working with your clients at CLS?
2 Are there things that you think the
3 City can do to make this work better
4 and are there places that are really
5 cracking down on this sort of
6 discrimination?

7 MS. WIGGINS: Thank you so
8 much for the question, Councilwoman.
9 Specifically, are there any specific
10 agencies that I know of directly that
11 are cracking down on this issue other
12 than PILC, not necessarily to my
13 personal knowledge, but that doesn't
14 mean that the work is not being done.

15 One of the major issues that
16 we see is just the timeline, the
17 quick turnaround time. Just like
18 Sari mentioned when it comes to the
19 PCHR complaints, tenants who I see
20 are most likely tenants who are
21 already in Landlord Tenant Court for
22 one reason or another and whether the
23 landlord is seeking to just get
24 possession of the property so that
25 they can sell it or the market value

3/20/2023

1 is increased so it's no longer
2 profitable for them to have a Section
3 8 Housing Choice Voucher tenant
4 there.

5 The time period that these
6 tenants are forced to relocate, pack
7 up and move is very short and there's
8 not much time that we can always buy
9 them, but we do know that the process
10 is that there is support that is
11 needed. Directly what that support
12 is, I'm not sure of at this current
13 time. But the biggest issue at the
14 time in which these tenants are
15 forced to move, they have the
16 vouchers, the vouchers are set in
17 place, but the voucher process is
18 very timely, it's very arduous, it's
19 a lot of paperwork, it's not super
20 detailed and outlined in exactly what
21 steps are next, and tenants find
22 themselves needing a lot of
23 additional support when it comes time
24 for them to vacate and move on to a
25 new location.

3/20/2023

1 And once you throw in the
2 fact that landlords are already
3 discriminating against them because
4 they have the voucher, it makes that
5 process for them a lot more
6 difficult, a lot more stressful, a
7 lot more, you know. It just makes
8 them have a more difficult time and
9 it gives tenants less hope that they
10 will find housing that's actually
11 affordable, safe and accessible for
12 themselves and their family.

13 I know at CLS it's our
14 biggest desire to make sure that we
15 can help tenants transition more
16 smoothly into the next housing
17 opportunity. And we will work with
18 the City Council and PHA and whatever
19 means that's necessary to make sure
20 we can provide that additional
21 support to tenants when they're
22 looking for new housing.

23 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
24 you so much.

25 Are there any additional

3/20/2023

1 questions or comments for this panel
2 from members of the Committee?

3 (No response.)

4 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Okay.
5 Ms. Shearlds, can you please call the
6 next panel or witness to testify.

7 THE CLERK: Dolores Bell,
8 Tomika England, Dionna Roundtree, Kim
9 Waller, Rachel Wentworth.

10 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:
11 Dolores Bell, are you there and
12 connected?

13 MS. BELL: Yes, ma'am. Good
14 afternoon.

15 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Good
16 afternoon. Can you please state your
17 name for the record and proceed with
18 your testimony.

19 MS. BELL: Yes, ma'am. My
20 name is Dolores Bell and I'm a
21 Section 8 tenant currently living in
22 Frankford. I'm here today as a
23 member of Renters United Philadelphia
24 and as someone who believes that all
25 tenants deserve to be treated fairly.

3/20/2023

1 Thank you for inviting me to share my
2 story about how difficult it is as a
3 voucher-holder to find housing in
4 Philadelphia.

5 I have lived in my current
6 apartment for nearly almost four
7 years, but I want to move for two
8 reasons. First, my parents are
9 getting old and they need someone to
10 look after them. They live in
11 Germantown, and I would like to move
12 to an apartment closer to them so
13 that I can help them out when they
14 need it.

15 Second, it is my dream to be
16 a foster parent. I have 10
17 grandchildren already and 2 great-
18 grand and I believe that children
19 need guidance and all the love they
20 deserve. I want to provide this
21 guidance and love as a foster parent,
22 but my apartment is currently too
23 small. To host a foster child long-
24 term, I need a two-bedroom apartment.
25 But finding an apartment where I can

3/20/2023

1 use a voucher is very hard in
2 Philadelphia.

3 I've searched online for a
4 two-bedroom apartment in Germantown
5 and I see there are plenty of
6 options, but many of the apartments
7 are too expensive and won't cover my
8 voucher. I wish the voucher would
9 cover higher rents because that would
10 make it easier to find housing.

11 And once you look at
12 apartments that are in the voucher
13 price range, most of them won't
14 accept vouchers. I called 10 to 20
15 places and they all told me they
16 don't accept the vouchers. I'm a
17 good tenant. I have references and
18 photos to prove that. It's just that
19 they throw you anywhere that they
20 want to throw you, in neighborhoods
21 that's really terrible and that's not
22 livable.

23 And the apartment that I live
24 in it's not bad, but it's not good at
25 the end of the day. But finding an

3/20/2023

1 apartment where a voucher is used is
2 very hard in Philadelphia. Once
3 again, I've searched for an apartment
4 in Germantown and I see that there
5 are plenty, but many of them are not
6 accepting.

7 I've called and I've called
8 and I've called. I'm a good tenant
9 also once again. I have references
10 and photos to prove that. My
11 apartment's in good condition. I've
12 always paid my rent, but I don't even
13 have the chance to prove that I'm a
14 good tenant when landlords flat-out
15 refuse to accept voucher-holders.
16 It's hurtful at times to be
17 stereotyped like this. It doesn't
18 have to be this hard.

19 I lived in North Carolina
20 prior to that. Where I lived before,
21 it was much easier to find a good
22 apartment with a voucher. And the
23 housing authorities there, they
24 assisted voucher-holders through the
25 process. They even provided a list

3/20/2023

1 of places that accepted Section 8,
2 and the homes available in North
3 Carolina are clean and nice places.
4 If I didn't have to care for my
5 parents, I would go back. I would
6 move back to North Carolina.

7 The City needs to really take
8 action and listen to the tenants who
9 testify here today. We're not being
10 treated fairly by the landlords and
11 refuse to even consider our
12 application just because we have
13 vouchers. I want to find a place
14 where I can care for my parents and a
15 foster child, but I need to find a
16 landlord who will accept my voucher
17 first. It shouldn't be this hard.
18 But I thank you for your time.
19 Respectfully, Dolores Bell. That's
20 all I had to --

21 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
22 you so much --

23 MS. BELL: -- say.

24 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
25 you so much, Ms. Bell, for being here

3/20/2023

1 with us. I'm so sorry to hear how
2 hard it's been for you to find safe
3 housing and a good situation for you
4 and your family. And thank you also
5 for sharing how differently this
6 works in North Carolina. That's
7 something that we should be
8 emulating. So I appreciate you.

9 MS. BELL: Yes, ma'am.

10 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:

11 Tomika England. I see you there.
12 Nice to see you. Can you state your
13 name for the record and proceed with
14 your testimony.

15 MS. ENGLAND: My name is
16 Tomika England and I am the mother of
17 three adult children. In 1987 after
18 the birth of my first child, I
19 applied for Section 8 now known as
20 Housing Choice Voucher. I lived at
21 the mercy of others for many years.
22 At one point I had to send my 2-year-
23 old daughter out of state to live
24 with family because it was easier to
25 find housing for one than for two.

3/20/2023

1 I was living in transitional
2 housing in 1995 when my number came
3 up. I found a property that would
4 work for my family and a landlord
5 willing to accept the voucher. The
6 benefits of that stability can't be
7 overstated. Whether I had no job, a
8 piece of job or was fully employed, I
9 was always certain that we had a
10 safe, warm and affordable place to
11 lay our heads every night.

12 Housing security allowed me
13 to obtain a Bachelor's degree and a
14 liveable income. My children have
15 gone their own ways, but they know
16 where home is. My eligibility for
17 Section 8 ended in 2020, but I have
18 been in the same house since 1995.

19 However, in February of 2019
20 that stability was threatened because
21 my landlord did not want to renew my
22 lease. I needed to find housing in
23 60 days. The search was
24 anxiety-producing. I couldn't even
25 find property owners who would

3/20/2023

1 respond to my inquiry because of the
2 voucher.

3 In these gentrifying years
4 being unhoused has become yet another
5 crisis. There are many employed
6 typically functioning people who are
7 unhoused or living precariously
8 simply because they can't afford
9 rent. I thought me and my teen
10 daughter were going to be homeless.

11 The search for housing is
12 fraught with bias and discrimination.
13 Black, young, number of children,
14 unmarried and then you add a Section
15 8 voucher, and we all know your
16 perception as a quality tenant drops
17 into the toilet so much so that we
18 also know you better ask first. So I
19 called, I emailed, I texted, do you
20 accept Section 8? No, sorry, nope.
21 And these were only the ones who
22 responded. Typically landlords don't
23 respond. Little did I know it's
24 illegal to refuse a prospective
25 tenant based on holding a voucher,

3/20/2023

1 which is source of income
2 discrimination.

3 Thankfully at the same time
4 Charlene Samuels, Constituent
5 Services Director extraordinaire,
6 worked with PHA to address my
7 landlord's financial needs which
8 allowed me to stay in my home.

9 Though my own situation had
10 stabilized, I understood that many
11 people struggle to find safe,
12 affordable housing even with a
13 voucher.

14 I was connected to Public
15 Interest Law Center to file a
16 complaint with the Philadelphia
17 Commission on Human Relations because
18 I had written evidence of two
19 refusals based on holding a voucher.
20 Unfortunately, that process was less
21 than ideal. I filed two complaints
22 in August of 2019. The first
23 complaint was dismissed even though
24 the landlord texted that they didn't
25 accept vouchers. Why wasn't that

3/20/2023

1 evidence enough?

2 The second complaint
3 languished until the Commission
4 eventually found probable cause to
5 proceed two years after the filing.
6 But then it took another year to go
7 through the conciliation process with
8 the Commissioner. The complaint was
9 finally settled in June of 2022.

10 Three years is too long, especially
11 when the evidence is in writing and
12 the landlord admits to
13 discrimination. My situation was
14 resolved. But what happened to me
15 happens people every day without much
16 in the way of justice.

17 Most people are living so
18 insecurely that it only takes a
19 momentary glitch in the matrix to end
20 up on the street. The rights of
21 those who need housing assistance
22 should be enforced as vigorously as
23 laws against racial, gender identity,
24 sexual orientation and religious
25 discrimination.

3/20/2023

1 Please put in place policies
2 that support tenants who are trying
3 to enforce their rights before the
4 PCHR. Landlords must comply with
5 Philadelphia's law against source of
6 income discrimination just like all
7 of the other protected classes.
8 Thank you.

9 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
10 you so much, Tomika. Thank you for
11 sharing your experience trying to
12 find secure affordable housing and
13 your experience in trying to report
14 one of these claims and move it
15 forward, and thanks also for your
16 critical work. I know you were a
17 part of Councilmember Brooks' office
18 when she did really, really critical
19 work on this like the Renters' Access
20 bill, and we appreciate you.

21 MS. ENGLAND: Thank you.

22 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:
23 Dionna Roundtree, are you there? I
24 see you. Can you state your name for
25 the record and proceed with your

3/20/2023

1 testimony.

2 (No response.)

3 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:

4 Dionna?

5 (No response.)

6 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Okay.

7 I'll wait to see if they will come
8 on.

9 Is Kim Waller there and
10 connected?

11 MS. WALLER: Hello?

12 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Hi.

13 Will you please state your name for
14 the record and proceed with your
15 testimony.

16 MS. WALLER: Hi. My name is
17 Kimberly Waller. I'm a tenant in
18 Bartram's Village in Southwest
19 Philadelphia and I have had a
20 voucher. Actually this is my second
21 voucher. The first one expired and I
22 never found a place to live. Some of
23 the properties were very
24 uninhabitable and some of the
25 landlords wouldn't even rent to me

3/20/2023

1 because I had a voucher. And they
2 would just refuse to give me a call
3 back.

4 And the few that did call
5 back asked questions like, well, how
6 much is your voucher worth, and why
7 do you want to live in this area,
8 things of that nature. Right now the
9 voucher I have some of the landlords
10 haven't even called back. I've had
11 to call the realtors to get a call
12 back. And even with that, it's like
13 ducking and dodging. It's like they
14 don't want to be bothered with us.

15 And I spoke with one
16 gentleman. And he said, he doesn't
17 even want to deal with Section 8
18 anymore because I guess the pandemic
19 really -- I guess just threw them off
20 and just really dissuaded them from
21 wanting to deal with Section 8. And
22 it makes it look bad on people like
23 myself who do get up and go to work
24 every day and who do pay rent and who
25 are upstanding citizens and tenants.

3/20/2023

1 And when I did have my
2 voucher, I spoke with people in the
3 Hot Mobility program because I wanted
4 to point out I was told that I had to
5 reapply to the county, get on the
6 waiting list, and I found out that
7 was not true. It was all a lie.
8 When I tried to get help, it was
9 really no one to help you, that
10 basically said you're on your own.
11 Those were the exact words, you are
12 on your own.

13 There's not enough properties
14 for the amount of voucher-holders
15 that are out there. What are we
16 supposed to do? And there has to be
17 something that can be done.
18 Everybody deserves a safe, clean
19 place to live. You know, they're
20 talking about low income. Oh,
21 they're making low-income housing.
22 They're bringing low-income housing,
23 you know, the rent -- there will be
24 all places for people to live in West
25 and Southwest Philadelphia, but it's

3/20/2023

1 not low income for people in my
2 income bracket. Low income for 100
3 to 100,000-plus, that's not helping
4 people like myself. Hello?

5 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Yes,
6 I hear you. We hear you, Ms. Waller.
7 Are you fin --

8 MS. WALLER: No, I didn't
9 know whether the phone had cut off or
10 not. I'm sorry.

11 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: We
12 hear you loudly and clearly.

13 MS. WALLER: Yes. And I just
14 want it to be known we are here, we
15 see you, we hear you, and we know
16 what you're doing. Just know that we
17 know it's wrong. I know when I'm
18 being lied to and so do the rest of
19 us tenants. And when people get fed
20 up, we get fed up and show up in
21 numbers.

22 And there's also a thing
23 called escrow. And when we start
24 putting our money away, hey, don't
25 say you didn't know because you need

3/20/2023

1 to treat your tenants right. People
2 in Bartram's Village have been
3 waiting for years for help. Like
4 right now we need help. There's been
5 break-ins.

6 I've been asking for years.
7 I've been volunteering with PHA as a
8 PHA ambassador to get help for
9 Bartram's Village. Even now I've
10 been asking, we need cameras, okay.
11 Cameras, there's been break-ins.
12 People been getting robbed. Simple
13 things that they put up in other
14 communities, why can't we get them.
15 What's the problem. We're not
16 important enough to put it in a
17 nutshell.

18 We need to be treated right.
19 I get up and go to work just like
20 many other tenants do. My dollar
21 counts, it matters. I have a
22 voucher. I need a place to live. A
23 two-bedroom apartment -- I mean a
24 two-bedroom voucher, I have a
25 voucher. They didn't even put the

3/20/2023

1 amount of the voucher on my voucher,
2 like how much my voucher is supposed
3 to be. It's not on there. It's
4 illegible. The name of the person
5 who signed it, the representative,
6 you can't even tell who the person
7 is.

8 And I know Bret Holden is
9 there. I'm quite sure he can find
10 out who did this. I'm quite sure
11 Mr. Kelvin Jeremiah is there. He can
12 find out who did this. I'm quite
13 sure Mr. Kyle Flood -- someone is
14 there that can tell me who signed on
15 my voucher and did not put the price,
16 the amount that my voucher should --
17 the value of my voucher, it should
18 state the amount. It's not on there.
19 There should be a name of a
20 representative, a Mr. or Mrs.

21 Just say it was Cynthia Brown
22 just using it as an example, it says
23 nothing. It's just a last name
24 written in cursive. You can't
25 even -- it's illegible, come on. And

3/20/2023

1 they make it that -- I believe they
2 do it that way just to leave you
3 running in circles.

4 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
5 you so much, Ms. Waller. Thank you
6 for sharing your story and the
7 frustrations with using the voucher
8 as well as some of the things that
9 you're confronting at Bartram's
10 Village. We do have Bret Holden and
11 Kelvin Jeremiah here, and I know
12 that --

13 MS. WALLER: That's
14 wonderful.

15 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
16 you. We're all listening and we will
17 follow up on those specific concerns,
18 and thank you so much for your
19 testimony today.

20 MS. WALLER: You are very
21 welcome. Have a great day.

22 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: You
23 too.

24 Rachel Wentworth, are you
25 there and connected?

3/20/2023

1 MS. WENTWORTH: Yes, I am
2 here.

3 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:
4 Please state your name for the record
5 and proceed with your testimony.

6 MS. WENTWORTH: Good
7 afternoon. My name is Rachel
8 Wentworth and I'm the Executive
9 Director of the Housing Equality
10 Center. HECP has worked since 1956
11 to advocate for the rights of
12 individuals and families to have
13 nondiscriminatory access to the
14 housing of their choice in the
15 Greater Philadelphia region.

16 To this end, one of the main
17 activities conducted by HECP is its
18 Fair Housing Testing program. Fair
19 Housing Testing is essentially
20 mystery shopping in order to observe
21 the business practices of a housing
22 provider such as a landlord or a
23 property manager. Testing is
24 typically conducted to document
25 whether homeseekers are being treated

3/20/2023

1 equally or whether the housing
2 providers are complying with fair
3 housing laws as well as providing
4 qualitative data regarding the
5 experiences faced by consumers.

6 Over the past two years, HECP
7 has begun to test for compliance in
8 the source of income protections in
9 rental housing under the Philadelphia
10 Fair Practices Ordinance. During
11 this period, HECP has sent testers to
12 inquire about the willingness of
13 housing providers advertising
14 affordable housing units falling
15 within the fair market rent standard
16 to accept housing choice vouchers as
17 the form of payment.

18 In 62 tester contacts, 42 of
19 those or 71 percent of the testers
20 were told that vouchers were not
21 accepted. Only 10 testers or 16
22 percent were told that voucher-
23 holders were permitted to apply. And
24 the remaining tests were inconclusive
25 with housing providers either

3/20/2023

1 declining to provide a definitive
2 answer, telling testers that the unit
3 was already rented or testers being
4 unable to have a conversation in
5 which substantive information was
6 exchanged.

7 And in all of the context
8 where testers were told that vouchers
9 were not accepted, the providers were
10 all very straightforward in stating
11 this policy. Some of them were like,
12 no, we don't participate in the
13 Section 8 program; no, we do not
14 accept housing vouchers. Some
15 providers stated some variation of,
16 no, we're not required to. And in
17 many cases, housing providers
18 volunteered broader policies such as
19 none of our policies are registered
20 with the Section 8 program, none of
21 our owners accept vouchers or owners
22 decide individually whether or not
23 they want to participate in the
24 Section 8 program.

25 And then in addition in a

3/20/2023

1 small number of tests, housing
2 providers also indicated additionally
3 that other types of nonemployment
4 income such as child support or SSDI
5 would not count towards income
6 qualifications. And although this is
7 a preliminary series of tests that
8 represents a small and
9 nonrepresentative sample of rental
10 transactions occurring in
11 Philadelphia, they do tell us that
12 source of income protections are
13 routinely and blatantly disregarded
14 by landlords, property managers and
15 rental agencies throughout the City.

16 It's apparent that voucher-
17 holders regularly face unlawful
18 discrimination as an additional
19 barrier if their search for a limited
20 supply of affordable rental housing
21 in Philadelphia. And additionally,
22 the recurrent and unconcealed denial
23 faced by our testers leads us to
24 presume that there's also a
25 widespread perpetuation of the

3/20/2023

1 erroneous belief that engaging in
2 discrimination based on source of
3 income is a lawful practice.

4 So effective enforcement and
5 substantial consumer and provider
6 education regarding the current
7 existing protections are truly vital
8 to ensuring the rights of voucher-
9 holders and holding rental housing
10 providers accountable to their fair
11 housing obligations. Thank you for
12 your attention to this important
13 issue and for the opportunity to
14 comment.

15 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
16 you so much for being here today and
17 thank you for your really important
18 work.

19 David Smith, are you there
20 and connected?

21 MR. SMITH: I'm going to tell
22 you something. It's going to be
23 short and sweet, but it is going to
24 be a lot of detail. So if it goes a
25 little over, it goes a little over

3/20/2023

1 because I got to get it out.

2 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: The
3 floor is yours. Thank you so much.
4 Please state your name for the record
5 first and then --

6 MR. SMITH: My name's David
7 Smith. I live in Northeast
8 Philadelphia. I've been there all my
9 life. I finally got a place after --
10 it was six months. I'm an autistic
11 man, and I honestly -- what I went
12 through, I ended up almost committing
13 suicide over it.

14 A lot of places would not
15 take me. We went through place and
16 to place and to place. I thought
17 that I was going to end up in a very
18 bad neighborhood or living in a group
19 home, because that's another thing we
20 got to address with people with
21 disabilities, with autism. High
22 functioning mental illness doesn't
23 mean I'm the good doctor and I can
24 work 40 hours a week. That's because
25 we got these MAGA Republicans in

3/20/2023

1 office that don't give a damn about
2 people like me. I'm sorry I'm
3 getting emotional.

4 And what we need to do is
5 take a look at the standards. I do
6 think for disabled people the waiting
7 period should be indefinite.

8 Meaning, you got that much time, the
9 rest of your life if you have to. I
10 also think that the houses need to be
11 mandatory and I mean mandatory, and
12 people need to go to jail if they
13 don't take it. I'm sorry. I'm
14 starting to go off-script here.
15 Because people like me, it's going to
16 be life and death literally.

17 I do not want to end up in a
18 group home. I like my freedom
19 because I can come and go as I
20 please. Just because I'm high
21 functioning, I can't afford it. I
22 can't afford \$1200, \$1300 a month.
23 And I think the standards should be
24 1122. It should be \$1200, \$1300,
25 \$1400.

3/20/2023

1 And I honestly think that
2 what they need to do is start -- I'm
3 going to say something that no one's
4 ever thought about, and I know that
5 you're only City Council but it
6 should be noted. I think the United
7 Nations need to get involved and hold
8 sanctions against the country and
9 say, you do not sup -- we do it in
10 other countries, why not us. You
11 need to say, you know what, you don't
12 supply houses to the most needy, I'm
13 not talking able-bodied, I'm talking
14 disabled, senior citizens, then we're
15 going to hold sanctions. I bet you
16 that would end the housing crisis
17 like (gestured) if they did that.
18 And I do, I think it needs to be an
19 arrestable offense if they don't.
20 I'm sorry. I know it sounds a little
21 harsh, but we need to come down like
22 an iron fist on some of these people.
23 The next thing we need to do,
24 here's how you do help landlords.
25 You tell them, okay, if their

3/20/2023

1 rejections happen to be, okay, well,
2 we have to fix up the stuff and all
3 that, perhaps give them a loan,
4 perhaps give them tax abatement or
5 something like that so they can say,
6 oh, okay, we'll consider it. But
7 something needs to be done for people
8 like me.

9 People like me, I almost
10 ended up -- you don't know what I
11 went through. My mom and I ended up
12 with arguments and everything. I
13 finally found this person here. If I
14 did not find her, I would not have a
15 place to live and I would be in a
16 group home. I'm sorry. I'm tired of
17 this.

18 It's got to be done and it's
19 got to be done now, and it has to be
20 done with -- and to the activists, we
21 need protests, but not 1,000 people
22 here and there. We need millions of
23 people protesting for housing. I
24 mean, we're not leaving until you do
25 it. And if you don't do it, then you

3/20/2023

1 might as well resign. That's what we
2 need. Sorry, but I needed to tell
3 you that.

4 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Don't
5 be sorry, Mr. Gray. You know, I
6 think this conversation has to be
7 real. It has to show the real
8 impact, that a struggle to find
9 housing or inability to thoroughly
10 access housing has on people's lives,
11 right.

12 Many people are landing in
13 hospitals or in jails when it's an
14 affordable housing issue --

15 MR. SMITH: Or dying.

16 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Or
17 dying like you laid out. And so,
18 when we say --

19 MR. SMITH: That's why I said
20 it's a human right.

21 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Yep.

22 MR. SMITH: That's why I said
23 that if they discriminate, if that
24 person dies, then that person should
25 have the right to -- or if that

3/20/2023

1 person gets sick for it, then that
2 person can sue that landlord and
3 become a millionaire themselves,
4 because that's the type of thing we
5 need to do.

6 I think if they see that
7 there's consequences and I mean harsh
8 consequences, maybe they'll be more
9 willing to do it because they'll be
10 too afraid not to.

11 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
12 you for drawing that out for us. We
13 appreciate you.

14 Dionna Roundtree, I see you
15 there. Are you able to state your
16 name for the record and proceed with
17 your testimony?

18 MS. ROUNDTREE: Yes. My name
19 is Dionna Roundtree. I'll start my
20 testimony. Back in 2007 I had moved
21 into Bartram's Village with my two
22 young children. I moved over there
23 in 2007. I lived over in Bartram for
24 about 10, 11 years. I got my voucher
25 2020. It took -- once I got the

3/20/2023

1 voucher, you know, I was very happy.

2 What I didn't know is the
3 extent of what it meant to have the
4 voucher. Once you get the voucher,
5 you're kind of left out on your own
6 to search for a home and deal with
7 the remarks from landlords, um -- I'm
8 sorry, I'm sorry. I went through a
9 lot having a voucher. I had
10 landlords say to me, are you able to
11 afford the place that I was looking
12 at.

13 I have an opposite type of
14 situation. I saw a lot of houses
15 where landlords said they would
16 accept the voucher. But once they
17 saw me in person, that flew out the
18 window. That flew out the window.
19 Once they saw me in person, that I
20 was a Black woman, that was the end
21 of a lot of searches that I had to
22 deal with having my voucher.

23 During the time that I was at
24 Bartram Village, like Ms. Waller
25 stated, we needed and still need a

3/20/2023

1 lot of help over there, especially
2 cameras. My son had -- a year before
3 I got my voucher, my youngest son was
4 shot in the back, literally across
5 the street from Bartram Village.

6 There were -- well, I was told there
7 were no cameras. It was hard to get
8 in touch with investigators, which I
9 found that shooting wasn't even
10 investigated.

11 It's just the -- the other
12 thing with that, having a voucher, is
13 the housing that are listed online,
14 they're not livable homes. I
15 literally saw a home that smelled
16 like gas was leaking. There were no
17 markets, no stores. I asked the
18 person that was showing the home
19 where is the nearest market. She
20 told me she did not know and
21 proceeded to ask me if I have
22 (inaudible). I saw a house where the
23 washer and dryer was in the bathroom.
24 These houses that were on the list
25 for Section 8 vouchers are

3/20/2023

1 ridiculous. It's just ridiculous.

2 Finally, I found a house.

3 Had no pictures, I kind of went out

4 on a limb and said I don't have

5 anything to lose and found a landlord

6 that was willing to take my voucher.

7 Not everyone -- not everyone is

8 fortunate. A lot of folks in Bartram

9 Village that I did know that received

10 their voucher gave it up, strictly

11 because two bedrooms is hard to find,

12 that's number one.

13 For us residents that only

14 needed two bedrooms, it's not

15 happening. It's not happening. I

16 think the vouchers need to be changed

17 or updated or something because two

18 bedrooms is unlikely to find. I just

19 want to thank you guys for having me

20 and hearing me speak. I really hope

21 there are changes.

22 I do want to say one thing,

23 something that Ms. Waller stated.

24 The voucher does not have an amount

25 on the actual paper. I'm not sure

3/20/2023

1 why that is, but I believe that it
2 should be. And I also believe that
3 the vouchers should be a lot higher
4 because, you know, the world we live
5 in everything has gone up for
6 working-class folks.

7 Our money is being divided
8 and the person -- you have to have a
9 roof over your head and everything
10 else. But I'm very grateful that you
11 guys listened to my testimony. I do
12 feel like it's really depressing, so
13 I understand what the last gentleman
14 was stating because I was willing to
15 quit and give up my voucher also.

16 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
17 you, Ms. Roundtree. Thank you so
18 much for being here and thank you for
19 sharing your story and for really
20 highlighting how all of this is tied
21 together, right. A lack of
22 affordable housing, gun violence, the
23 toll that that takes on people.

24 And I thank you for your
25 recommendations on the voucher

3/20/2023

1 program but also on changes as we
2 heard before that need to be made in
3 terms of our investments in the
4 public housing sites that we have.
5 And I also wanted to say, I don't
6 know how helpful it will be, but
7 we'll follow up to get your
8 information because you should have a
9 good understanding of the
10 investigation into your son's
11 shooting.

12 And so, if that is -- we'd
13 like to follow up with you on that.
14 If that's something that you want
15 with PPD to get a sense of what
16 exactly happened and who's
17 responsible for that investigation.

18 MS. ROUNDTREE: That would be
19 great.

20 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
21 you so much for joining us today.

22 Are there other members from
23 the Committee that have questions or
24 comments for this panel?

25 (No response.)

3/20/2023

1 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:

2 Ms. Shearlds, will you please call
3 the next panel to testify.

4 THE CLERK: Sherry Thomas,
5 Jesse Keel and Erin Blair.

6 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:

7 Sherry Thomas, are you there and
8 connected?

9 MS. THOMAS: Yes, I am. Good
10 afternoon, Councilwoman Gauthier.

11 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Good
12 afternoon. Please state your name
13 for the record and proceed with your
14 testimony.

15 MS. THOMAS: Sure. I'm
16 Sherry Thomas. I am the Director of
17 Housing at the Legal Clinic for the
18 Disabled. The Legal Clinic for the
19 Disabled, otherwise known as LCD, is
20 a direct legal services agency. We
21 serve low-income individuals living
22 with physical and mental health
23 disabilities, and we are partnered in
24 the Philadelphia Eviction Prevention
25 Project. I thank you for this

3/20/2023

1 opportunity to testify in support of
2 Resolution No. 221031.

3 Many of LCD clients are
4 Housing Choice voucher-holders and
5 many of them due to their disability
6 live on fixed income. So this
7 subsidy is one of the few ways they
8 can afford safe and suitable housing.
9 Very --

10 (Background
11 interruption.)

12 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:

13 Sorry. One second.

14 Ms. Roundtree.

15 Ms. Roundtree.

16 MS. ROUNDTREE: Yes. I'm
17 sorry.

18 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Can
19 we have you go on mute?

20 MS. ROUNDTREE: Yes.

21 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
22 you so much and thanks again for
23 being here today.

24 Proceed.

25 MS. THOMAS: Okay. Thank you

3/20/2023

1 so much. As I was saying, many of
2 LCD's clients are voucher-holders and
3 many of them due to their disability
4 are on fixed incomes, so that the
5 voucher is really one of the very few
6 ways that folks with physical and
7 mental health disabilities are able
8 to access safe and suitable housing.
9 However, what we found in our work is
10 that at every stage there's
11 opportunity for source of income
12 discrimination, whether that's
13 explicit or implicit.

14 So finalizing a lease as we
15 heard today using a voucher can take
16 several months. This includes
17 locating a landlord who accepts the
18 voucher, undergoing an inspection,
19 negotiating the rent and then finally
20 actually signing the lease. And
21 every stage of this process provides
22 an opportunity for implicit or
23 explicit source of income
24 discrimination.

25 Finding a landlord who

3/20/2023

1 accepts a housing voucher can feel
2 like finding a needle in a haystack.
3 Renters use websites such as
4 affordablehousing.com, which is what
5 is linked through PHA. But what we
6 have heard from multiple renters is
7 that that website is not accurate.
8 Often they find that properties that
9 are listed as available are actually
10 unavailable once they find out if
11 they even get a call back.

12 And this is especially
13 frustrating for people living with
14 physical and mental disabilities.
15 Living with a disability, it often
16 means less time and often times less
17 ability to conduct a housing search
18 without assistance. People living
19 with disabilities often spend
20 considerable time performing day-to-
21 day activities and accessing health
22 care. And so, this stretches out the
23 time it takes to find housing. And
24 we heard in Mr. Gray's testimony that
25 the time limits on being able to use

3/20/2023

1 a voucher is really detrimental for
2 people living with disabilities.

3 Once someone actually locates
4 a property, they must still apply.
5 And at this stage, they're subject to
6 just discretion. Recently we had an
7 LCD client who applied for housing,
8 but once the landlord found out that
9 they were using a voucher, they were
10 told they were no longer looking at
11 applications, although he was able to
12 submit one.

13 Finally or actually next, the
14 property must undergo an inspection.
15 And this can take several weeks to
16 complete. We do appreciate that the
17 program doesn't want to fund
18 properties that have habitability
19 issues. However, the way the current
20 rental market is going, it rewards
21 speed. Suitable properties are
22 snatched up within days of them
23 coming on the market.

24 We've had clients reach this
25 inspection stage and then landlords

3/20/2023

1 back out at that point saying that
2 it's taking too long. And this
3 distinction of speed between voucher-
4 holders and those who don't hold a
5 voucher severely puts people at a
6 disadvantage, and it gives an
7 opportunity for -- this is implicit
8 discrimination of an entire group
9 being discriminated against simply
10 because of how the rent is going to
11 be paid. And at that point, someone
12 has already invested several weeks
13 looking at one property, and now they
14 have to start from ground zero.

15 Lastly, after a property
16 passes inspection, the landlord must
17 then accept the rent limits that are
18 actually placed by the subsidy. And
19 we've seen at that stage too where
20 landlords have backed out at the
21 final stage. And this is largely due
22 to rent increasing exponentially due
23 to the absence of rent control as
24 well as the limitations that PHA has
25 on subsidizing higher rents.

3/20/2023

1 Voucher-holders are once
2 again treated differently than those
3 who are not voucher-holders simply
4 because the way their rent is being
5 paid. So this is just a small sample
6 of the challenges that we see as
7 practitioners with our clients. At
8 every stage, all four of these
9 stages, there's an opportunity for
10 explicit and implicit discrimination
11 and a distinction between a voucher-
12 holder and nonvoucher holder.

13 So LCD truly appreciates the
14 Committee's recognition of these
15 issues and we're looking forward to
16 working on equitable solutions
17 together. Thank you.

18 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
19 you so much. That was really, you
20 know, that was really informational,
21 especially how you broke down how the
22 discrimination happens at each stage
23 of the process. I think that's very
24 helpful for us or will be very
25 helpful for us as we try to solve

3/20/2023

1 this issue.

2 MS. THOMAS: Thank you so
3 much.

4 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
5 you. Jesse Keel, are you there and
6 connected?

7 MS. KEEL: Yes, I am. Hi.

8 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Hi.
9 Can you please state your name for
10 the record and proceed with your
11 testimony.

12 MS. KEEL: Yes. Well, thank
13 you, Jamie and the rest of the team,
14 for hosting this testimony. I find
15 it to be such a vital conversation,
16 especially as a person who's a young
17 adult who currently holds a voucher
18 and have peers who also have house
19 vouchers and the conversation that we
20 have, right, in regards to the
21 process for us.

22 So I wanted to speak on,
23 like, us having a streamlined system
24 and software platform for voucher
25 support. I'm thinking of those who

3/20/2023

1 have vouchers, those who obtain
2 vouchers that may not be connected to
3 an organization and need support
4 along the way in regards to questions
5 that come up from landlords,
6 questions that they come up with
7 themselves that they're unable to be
8 able to, you know, vocalize when
9 going through a part of the process.

10 So it seems like the process
11 of vouchers is very confusing for
12 both recipients and landlords.
13 Recipients are unsure of how to
14 navigate the conversation with
15 landlords who claim that they don't
16 accept vouchers and are not
17 participating in the "voucher
18 program."

19 And so, this was something
20 that has come up a lot in
21 conversations with landlords where
22 it's, like, how much is your voucher
23 for, and no one has a clear answer
24 for that. And then also, in regards
25 to this concept of a voucher program,

3/20/2023

1 and what I've come to realize is that
2 there is no voucher program. It's
3 just folks have a voucher and it is
4 considered a source of income, right.
5 And so, even literally just today I
6 reached out to someone, they reached
7 back out and I mentioned the voucher,
8 oh, we're not part of the voucher
9 program. And I'm just like, there is
10 no program. It's just are you happy
11 to accept this voucher or not.

12 So there's no clarity on the
13 timeline of voucher assistance. So
14 on one hand, vouchers are said to be
15 considered income as I just
16 mentioned. Yet how are we able to
17 submit these on applications as a
18 source of income so that way there is
19 that accountability if an applicant
20 is denied for income and then it's
21 like, okay, well, now I clearly have
22 the case that this is income
23 discrimination.

24 Vouchers currently do not
25 meet the current market value. So in

3/20/2023

1 areas that are up-and-coming and
2 decent for decent habitable spaces,
3 we have Kensington, we have Fishtown,
4 right, where they have new housing,
5 the City for that specific zip code
6 is only willing to pay no more than
7 \$950. Yet the market rent in this
8 area is \$1200-plus.

9 And I even had a conversation
10 with property management from that
11 area. They mentioned that PHA has
12 directly denied a rent offer from the
13 landlord that didn't align with
14 theirs or even in negotiating a
15 price, PHA was not willing to budge
16 because of what they considered to be
17 market rent.

18 Young people are facing
19 discrimination now more than ever
20 before who lack previous rental
21 history who may or may not have
22 cosigner support. And so, even in
23 those cases where you have property
24 management and landlords who say they
25 outright do accept vouchers, the

3/20/2023

1 screening criteria is not realistic
2 and it's not reflective of the
3 demographic of people who are holding
4 these vouchers, right.

5 So in understanding that the
6 demographic of those who have these
7 vouchers are most likely not coming
8 from a financial outstanding
9 background, so what can that
10 screening criteria look like that is
11 different but still adhering to the
12 comfort level of landlords.

13 I, myself, and young people
14 have had direct interactions with
15 property management who outright
16 ignore our inquiries once we mention
17 a voucher. And young people and
18 other voucher-holders are being faced
19 with limited options and forced to
20 live in areas that are unsafe.

21 So I personally have reached
22 out to -- I personally reached out
23 to -- and I'm going to name-drop
24 because I don't mind. It is what it
25 is. I reached out to an agency

3/20/2023

1 called Rentals 215 that explicitly
2 accepts vouchers. They are actually
3 in the Padmission software and I was
4 ignored. I had a friend who reached
5 out separately, I had them reach out
6 as a test, right, and my friend was
7 responded to immediately. Yet I also
8 did a follow-up with them and their
9 assistant, and still have continued
10 to be ignored. Just to kind of
11 confirm my suspicions, right.

12 And then recently I know OHS
13 has praised Odin Property Management
14 for receiving and accepting vouchers
15 and having a partnership. However,
16 it seems to be that they're only
17 accepting vouchers for specific
18 locations which is just confusing to
19 me. Either you accept vouchers or
20 not, and it shouldn't be contingent
21 upon this location or that location
22 because then you're saying, okay,
23 well -- in a sense it seems like
24 you're redlining me in an area that
25 you deem habitable for someone of my

3/20/2023

1 demographic, financial demographic.

2 We asked for City Council to
3 increase funding that's allocated for
4 homelessness in young adults youth to
5 curate a system of accountability
6 towards PHA, OHS and landlords in
7 order to protect voucher-holders,
8 potential tenants and even landlords
9 as well, so we need support in
10 upholding the Renters' Access Act in
11 ways in which the screening
12 requirements for voucher-holders are
13 different.

14 Another solution would be a
15 re-evaluation of the City's zoning of
16 market value to match the current
17 needs market so that voucher-holders
18 are not being impacted by the rise of
19 gentrification and being susceptible
20 to areas that are unsafe, right.

21 Another solution would be
22 maybe to create a housing agent that
23 acts as a rental agency specific for
24 people with vouchers to be able to
25 conduct a special screening that

3/20/2023

1 eliminates that process outside of
2 this fictional agency, because this
3 application process for voucher-
4 holders is stressful. It's
5 discriminatory.

6 Another solution would be
7 clarity across the board for voucher-
8 holders on extensions that they can
9 rely on. Yeah, I'm currently being
10 told that my extension is not an
11 option even though my case manager
12 explicitly let them know that, hey, I
13 gave her notice of the voucher late
14 because I seen it late, so can we
15 extend it. And it was just met with
16 like, oh, well, you know, that's a
17 grace period. And that's not cool at
18 all.

19 And so, I'm still trying
20 to -- my voucher actually extends
21 this week. And so, I'm trying to
22 figure out -- expires this week, my
23 apologies. So I'm trying to figure
24 out is there an option available for
25 me to have an extension. And lastly,

3/20/2023

1 if we can come up with some working
2 group solutions that include a
3 re-evaluation of landlord
4 requirements when it comes to some of
5 the unrealistic inspections that is
6 held by PHA when let's be real, we do
7 have some HUD-specific properties
8 that they themselves kind of don't
9 meet their own inspection
10 expectations.

11 So thank you so much for
12 letting me speak on behalf of myself
13 and other young people like myself
14 who are being met with housing
15 discrimination and facing
16 homelessness. Yeah. Bye.

17 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
18 you, Jesse. Thanks for your
19 testimony. Thanks for your work that
20 I know is fueled by your own personal
21 experience. And I want to follow up
22 with you, if possible, after the
23 hearing to see if we can get you any
24 assistance on your individual issue
25 with respect to your voucher

3/20/2023

1 extension.

2 MS. KEEL: I appreciate you,
3 Councilwoman Jamie. Thank you.

4 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
5 you.

6 Councilmember Brooks.

7 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: Just a
8 point of clarification. Am I hearing
9 that folks do not know how much their
10 voucher actually is or there's no
11 document that they receive saying how
12 much the voucher is while they're
13 searching for an apartment?

14 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: I
15 think Ms. Roundtree talked about
16 that. Also, Ms. Waller talked about
17 that. So do one of you want to
18 answer that? Is it that it's just
19 not printed on the voucher or do you
20 not know? Is there nothing that
21 tells you?

22 MS. KEEL: So it's not --
23 this is Jesse Keel. It's not printed
24 on the voucher at all as well as
25 there -- if you don't have a case

3/20/2023

1 manager, typically you should receive
2 a document that has a zoning of how
3 much they're willing to pay depending
4 on which zip code. But as I
5 mentioned before, if it's being
6 submitted as a source of income and
7 there's no number on it, then it can
8 be denied as a source of income and
9 not be accountable to income
10 discrimination because there's no
11 number on it so...

12 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: Okay.
13 And my other question is -- I think
14 this is Jesse Keel. You talked about
15 the systems that are in place to
16 assist in the search. I think you
17 and someone else spoke about this
18 earlier. So just for clarity, there
19 is a website or database that they
20 send you to, but the information is
21 not accurate or usable in order for
22 you to find appropriate housing; am I
23 correct?

24 MS. KEEL: Yes, typically.
25 However, in most cases these

3/20/2023

1 researches aren't sent immediately.
2 And if they are, it's something that
3 you have to kind of continue to pull
4 teeth and request. And you -- I know
5 I personally have received different
6 resources from different people so
7 it's not centralized and then as well
8 as when it is received, these things
9 are not updated and accurate.

10 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: Okay.

11 MS. THOMAS: Councilwoman
12 Brooks --

13 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: Yes.

14 MS. THOMAS: I also mentioned
15 that in my testimony. So there is a
16 website called affordablehousing.com
17 that we have heard tenants say that
18 it's not up-to-date. And going to
19 the amount of rent that would be
20 listed on the voucher, so that final
21 stage my understanding is that
22 there's a negotiation that happens
23 between PHA and the landlord, so the
24 landlord would need to accept
25 whatever that negotiated amount is

3/20/2023

1 before they lease up.

2 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: Okay.

3 Thank you.

4 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
5 you so much. Thank you,
6 Councilmember.

7 Erin Blair, can you state
8 your name for the record and proceed
9 with your testimony.

10 MS. BLAIR: Hi. My name is
11 Erin Blair. I am the Director of
12 Nurse Advocacy and Resources for the
13 National Nurse-Led Care Consortium.
14 In this role, I support maternal,
15 child health home visitors serving
16 families in multiple programs across
17 the City of Philadelphia from
18 pregnancy until their children reach
19 school age.

20 Thank you so much for hosting
21 today's hearing. I really appreciate
22 the attention to this devastating and
23 often overlooked issue that blatantly
24 flies in the face of legal precedent
25 that's been set many, many years ago.

3/20/2023

1 We've heard a lot of stats and stuff
2 like that. I'm going to change up my
3 testimony a little bit to more
4 directly speak to the health
5 implications of extended housing
6 insecurity when folks are on
7 vouchers. But I think that pregnant
8 and parenting people are at
9 especially high rates -- experience
10 housing insecurity at higher rates
11 than many other groups of people for
12 many reasons, but discrimination kind
13 of tops out the list often times.
14 And you put on top of that a voucher,
15 it gives landlords even more recourse
16 to choose not to rent a home to
17 families.

18 Housing insecurity and
19 homelessness are responsible for a
20 host of long-term highly expensive,
21 costly-to-taxpayer health outcomes.
22 And in terms of social-emotional
23 outcomes, like we heard from Mr. --
24 I lost -- from one of the --

25 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:

3/20/2023

1 Mr. Gray.

2 MS. BLAIR: Yes, earlier as
3 well as just the -- how do you bond
4 with a baby when you are
5 couch-surfing and try to figure out a
6 safe place to sleep at night, how do
7 you get your child to day care each
8 day when you've been forced into a
9 voucher or a shelter that is an hour
10 and 15 minutes via public
11 transportation away from your child's
12 regular child care or early childhood
13 center.

14 There's a lot of things that
15 we don't necessarily think about, the
16 costs of the housing insecurity, our
17 shelter system, homelessness. One of
18 the best indicators for heart disease
19 in adults is early childhood
20 homelessness and trauma as children,
21 so when we're talking about
22 intergenerational long-term needs --
23 but in my role working, I also direct
24 a small direct grant family support
25 fund and I regularly engage with

3/20/2023

1 landlords around the challenges that
2 they experience and also just trying
3 to get them to let me give them
4 money.

5 I have to fight with
6 landlords to let me give them money
7 because they're so anxious about
8 taking funds after the pandemic and
9 negative experiences associated with
10 the multiple phases of rental
11 assistance as well as dealing with
12 promises of money that never came
13 through, like some of the things we
14 issued in the four-part housing
15 voucher acceptance thing.

16 Some of the landlords, the
17 rare unicorn landlords that I meet
18 that are willing to work with
19 vouchers, still express a lot of
20 frustration around waiting sometimes
21 weeks to months to finally get a
22 payment when they're working with a
23 person to get them into housing, and
24 it's nothing to do with them.
25 They're waiting for an inspection for

3/20/2023

1 almost a month, like a second
2 inspection or a follow-up or things
3 like that, that just prevent
4 everyone.

5 And the other issue is when
6 you consider that the families that
7 often times are receiving these
8 vouchers and waiting on these units,
9 they are taking up spaces in
10 emergency housing that need to be
11 available for people that are newly
12 becoming homeless. There are
13 families that are being separated
14 because there's not adequate space in
15 shelters for them.

16 There are a lot of young
17 people that are choosing dangerous
18 housing situations because there's
19 not adequate space in shelters.
20 Survival sex is a real thing. It's a
21 thing that a lot of people end up
22 using to be able to have a roof over
23 their head and an address to receive
24 mail at so they can continue their
25 benefits and get the supports that

3/20/2023

1 they need. I want that to really
2 sink it. It's something I see
3 regularly. It's something I see
4 regularly with people who are
5 supporting young children.

6 And I think that it's fair
7 for property owners to be concerned
8 about never receiving a payment in
9 the first place, you know. I think
10 that often times we hear about
11 landlords that are bad actors because
12 they're not following through, but
13 this is a scenario and a situation
14 where we really need to examine
15 accountability on PHA and
16 accountability on the City services
17 that are tasked with making sure that
18 funds are accessible, rapid and meet
19 the needs of people.

20 If I have had a job and I
21 only got my job accomplished 6 out of
22 the 10 times they tried to, I
23 probably wouldn't have a job very
24 long. Why are we allowing City
25 services to function in a way where

3/20/2023

1 it only functions 60 percent of the
2 time. And frankly I feel that 60
3 percent is a very generous number.
4 Because if you think about the number
5 of families that are informally
6 refused housing with voucher systems,
7 that's the one that makes an
8 application, right. We're talking
9 about a lot that aren't.

10 So I just want people to
11 think that we are working really hard
12 to improve maternal, child health in
13 the City of Philadelphia. Black
14 women in the City of Philadelphia die
15 at exorbitant rates and they also
16 experience homelessness at far higher
17 rates than their peers.

18 I work with the Philadelphia
19 Homes 4 Youth Coalition. I recommend
20 anyone who's interested in learning
21 more about youth housing issues to
22 join that coalition. Follow up with
23 Jesse. Follow up with me. Please,
24 please, please come hear from young
25 people directly about what solutions

3/20/2023

1 will work for them and what issues.

2 A lot of young people I know
3 with vouchers would not like to live
4 alone, but they are not able to use
5 their voucher if somebody else is not
6 on -- if everyone that's going to
7 live in a household isn't on the
8 voucher, then landlords don't know
9 how to navigate that.

10 But traditionally young
11 people have had a much easier time.
12 Like when you think about college
13 housing, it's four people living in
14 one house together. That doesn't
15 really exist for young people aging
16 out of foster care or for young
17 people with vouchers. And frankly,
18 it's just 100 percent unacceptable
19 that young people are allowed to age
20 out of our foster care system
21 directly into homelessness. They are
22 required by law to have a
23 transitional plan in place for
24 transitioning to adulthood, and 21 is
25 not high enough.

3/20/2023

1 Young people today live with
2 their families for longer, and that
3 means that we should have systems in
4 place that support people for longer.
5 I'm trying to stay within my time.
6 You guys have my written testimony.
7 There's lots of other good stuff in
8 there, but I will open it up for
9 questions and other folks that might
10 have things to say.

11 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
12 you so much, Erin. We really
13 appreciate you adding to what the
14 tenants here did, right, focusing on
15 how this issue impacts real people in
16 their everyday lives, and we
17 appreciate that.

18 Are there any questions or
19 comments for this panel from members
20 of the Committee?

21 (No response.)

22 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Okay.
23 Ms. Shearlds, can you call the next
24 panel or witness to testify?

25 THE CLERK: From the Office

3/20/2023

1 of Homeless Services, we have Liz
2 Hersh. From PHA, we have Kelvin
3 Jeremiah, Bret Holden. And from the
4 Philadelphia Commission on Human
5 Resolutions, we have Kia Ghee.

6 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:
7 Wonderful. Ms. Hersh, I see you
8 there. Can you state your name --

9 MS. HERSH: Hi --

10 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Good
11 afternoon.

12 MS. HERSH: Hi, everybody.
13 Councilmember Madam Chair, it might
14 be helpful to have Kelvin testify
15 first because a lot of what we do
16 actually follows the protocols of
17 PHA, so I think he's probably better
18 situated to provide that context, and
19 then I'm happy to go from there.

20 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
21 you so much.

22 Kelvin, thank you so much for
23 joining us today.

24 MR. JEREMIAH: My pleasure.
25 Good afternoon, Chairwoman Gauthier,

3/20/2023

1 Vice-Chair Jones and other members of
2 the Committee. I'm Kelvin Jeremiah.
3 I'm the President and CEO of the
4 Philadelphia Housing Authority. As
5 you may be aware, PHA is of course
6 the largest landlord in Pennsylvania.
7 We provide housing to over 19,500
8 low-income families through the
9 Housing Choice Voucher Program, what
10 we refer to as HCV, a program that is
11 formerly known as the "Section 8
12 program."

13 PHA is incredibly pleased to
14 see Council's interest in protecting
15 voucher-holders from unfair rental
16 practices and housing discrimination.
17 As I'm sure Council knows, a 2021
18 decision by the Pennsylvania Supreme
19 Court struck down the City of
20 Pittsburgh's source of income
21 ordinance in a unanimous decision.
22 According to the decision and I
23 quote, "Nothing in state statute
24 permits a city to enact legislation
25 requiring residential landlords to

3/20/2023

1 participate in and otherwise
2 voluntary federal housing subsidy."

3 While PHA agrees that the HCV
4 program was intended to be voluntary,
5 we strongly believe and PHA wholly
6 supports all City efforts as well as
7 the state to codify protection for
8 renters to make sure landlords cannot
9 refuse to rent based on one's source
10 of income. As I mentioned earlier,
11 PHA supports 19,500 families in the
12 HCV program.

13 The average household size is
14 three, and the average annual
15 household income is approximately
16 \$16,000, well within the poverty
17 guidelines. This is itself a
18 contributing factor we believe in
19 families ability to quickly find and
20 rent safe, quality, affordable houses
21 in our City.

22 The average number of days to
23 secure a unit before it is submitted
24 to PHA for approval is approximately
25 17 days. That being said, however,

3/20/2023

1 the majority of voucher-holders,
2 approximately 75 percent who find an
3 HCV unit are leased within four
4 months of voucher issuance. The
5 resolution mentioned that the rate of
6 rejection of tenant-based vouchers is
7 high in neighborhoods with low
8 poverty rates.

9 PHA cannot -- I think it
10 mentioned that it's 83 percent of
11 landlords refusing to accept
12 vouchers. PHA unfortunately cannot
13 corroborate that figure as we do not
14 keep data on rejections or refusal by
15 landlords to accept a voucher and
16 participate or participate in the
17 program. However, PHA does advise
18 and ask clients to contact the HCV
19 team if a landlord or owner declines
20 the rent or rejects them as a
21 voucher-holder.

22 Unfortunately, PHA receives
23 very little feedback on these
24 occurrences from our clients.
25 Nonetheless, when PHA clients do

3/20/2023

1 report to PHA, our team will engage
2 with proposed landlords conducting
3 outreach to educate them on the
4 program and its benefits. To this
5 end, PHA has implemented a number of
6 incentives and an assurance program
7 to entice private landlords to
8 participate in the HCV program.

9 In 2021, PHA introduced new
10 monetary incentives to Philadelphia
11 landlords either newly joined in the
12 program or who are adding units to
13 the HCV program. The incentives
14 include time-limited signing bonuses,
15 ranging anywhere from \$300 to \$1,000
16 for opportunity neighborhoods as well
17 as the Owner Assurance Fund.

18 Let me just take a couple of
19 minutes and talk about the Owner
20 Assurance Fund because I think that's
21 probative to the discussion we were
22 having, Madam Chair. The Owner
23 Assurance Fund, which is currently
24 offered to approved landlords, is
25 designed to protect property owners

3/20/2023

1 from unexpected damages beyond the
2 normal wear and tear.

3 Through outreach and
4 engagement, PHA found that many
5 private landlords were hesitant to
6 participate in the program due to the
7 belief that renters with vouchers
8 might cause damage to units beyond,
9 beyond the average rental market
10 client. PHA for its part recognized
11 this, that its population -- that the
12 population that we serve is
13 vulnerable and often comes with a
14 host of other needs that nonmarket
15 rate -- that market rate tenants may
16 know. Wear and tear is sometimes not
17 the same in the private market.

18 As landlords, we saw that
19 implementing the Owner Assurance Fund
20 was a critical component to
21 responding to the owner's request and
22 concerns regarding their
23 participation in programs. Under the
24 terms of the program, PHA reimburses
25 property owners who participate in

3/20/2023

1 the HCV program up to \$2500 to help
2 cover repair expenses, net of any
3 security deposits withheld for
4 damages. Through the end of 2022,
5 over 2500 new units were added to the
6 HCV program, and PHA paid out over \$1
7 million in incentives to HCV
8 landlords.

9 PHA, it's important to note,
10 does not receive any specific
11 federal, state or City funding for
12 this initiative. Instead PHA
13 appropriated these funds in an
14 ongoing effort to reduce barriers
15 faced by recipients of the Housing
16 Choice Voucher. With these incentive
17 programs and continued outreach and
18 marketing to landlords by PHA within
19 the Office of Homeless Services, over
20 900 new City landlords have rented a
21 unit to a PHA voucher-holder since
22 2021. PHA now has over 5200
23 participating landlords renting to
24 voucher-holders in the City up from
25 about 4,000 or 4500 in 2017.

3/20/2023

1 Another area of focus for PHA
2 to increase HCV participation over
3 the past decade has been our Housing
4 Opportunity Program, what we call
5 HOP, which was an early iteration of
6 what has now been promoted nationally
7 by HUD as its mobility program. HOP
8 is a housing mobility initiative
9 aimed at assisting families
10 participating in the HCV program to
11 explore housing choices and to move
12 to opportunity areas within
13 Philadelphia and surrounding
14 communities.

15 Opportunity areas offer as
16 you all know more desirable life
17 opportunities for HCV families,
18 including a better quality of life in
19 housing, diversity neighborhoods and
20 access to better schools, nearby
21 shopping and of course increased
22 employment opportunity. In 2022, PHA
23 assisted -- in 2022 alone, PHA
24 assisted over 50 families to use
25 their voucher to find and move to

3/20/2023

1 quality housing in cooperating
2 neighborhoods.

3 In another initiative to
4 encourage moves to higher-opportunity
5 areas, PHA now use -- PHA now bases
6 our voucher payment standard on HUD's
7 Small Area Fair Market Rents, SAFMRs
8 as it's referred to. In contrast to
9 the previously used citywide fair
10 market rents, the SAFMRs are zip-code
11 based which enables PHA to offer
12 higher subsidy levels in higher
13 opportunity areas, that is, areas
14 with lower poverty rates and better
15 access to job opportunities and
16 neighborhood amenities.

17 PHA organizes its
18 SAFMRs-based payment standards into
19 five groupings, with Group 5
20 representing the highest opportunity
21 area. As can be seen from the
22 attachment provided in my testimony,
23 the current subsidy levels in Group 5
24 are significantly higher than it is
25 in Group 1, for example. PHA's

3/20/2023

1 maximum voucher subsidy level for a
2 two-bedroom apartment in Group 5
3 neighborhood is approximately \$885
4 higher than it is in Group 1. Even
5 with these higher voucher payment
6 standards, voucher-holders struggle
7 to find decent housing in all areas
8 of the City.

9 Higher opportunity areas
10 present unique challenges, including
11 landlords unwillingness to
12 participate in the program. Voucher-
13 holders lack familiarity with and
14 access to these areas and other
15 factors. However, progress is being
16 made, Madam Chair. The increased
17 payment standards that PHA
18 implemented in October 2022 have
19 already resulted in 95 new owners
20 listing units to voucher-holders in
21 Groups 4 and 5 in recent months. In
22 total over 1800, over 1800 PHA
23 voucher-holders now live in Groups 4
24 and 5 areas. Much more work needs to
25 be done in that regard.

3/20/2023

1 While PHA does acknowledge
2 potential discrimination on the basis
3 of source of income, I would like to
4 close with comments on the importance
5 of credit worthiness, something that
6 is often used by landlords as the
7 basis for not renting to Section 8 or
8 Housing Choice Voucher recipients.
9 It is critical I think to
10 differentiate denials due to source
11 of income and those as a result to
12 credit.

13 Credit is an easily important
14 component of the private market's
15 decision to rent, as you know. PHA
16 does not conduct credit checks. And
17 credit for PHA would never prevent a
18 household from receiving a voucher.
19 Yet it does, as I'm sure you know,
20 impact a household's ability to
21 secure rental units in the private
22 market. PHA has played a major role
23 in the relocation, for example, of
24 University Townhomes residents in
25 administering our tenant protection

3/20/2023

1 vouchers and assisting residents
2 securing units and landlords'
3 approval with HCV program.

4 Even with PHA's assistance,
5 many residents have had a difficult
6 time securing units due to their
7 credit rating and/or rental payment
8 history. For example, PHA located an
9 owner in the Wynnefield section of
10 West Philadelphia willing to rent to
11 voucher-holders from University City
12 Townhomes. Five residents were
13 referred by PHA. And of those five,
14 only two were accepted as the owner's
15 management company had to reject the
16 other three due to their low credit
17 scores. We have to address that
18 issue. And so, it often is frankly a
19 guise to reject HCV participants.

20 Lastly, working in parallel
21 to codify source of income rules at
22 the state level, PHA asks City
23 Council to also consider the impact
24 credit counseling and other credit
25 repair might have in improving

3/20/2023

1 low-income families' ability to find
2 and secure safe, decent and
3 affordable quality housing in our
4 City. Thank you for your time and I
5 welcome any questions that the
6 Committee may have.

7 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
8 you so much, Mr. Jeremiah, for your
9 testimony and also for your work. My
10 office has worked very closely with
11 yours on helping tenants to access
12 vouchers as it relates to the
13 Townhomes, as it relates to West Park
14 and even more broadly, and we
15 appreciate you and we appreciate the
16 things that you have done proactively
17 to try to make the program work
18 better.

19 And I want you to know that
20 City Council aims to be your partner
21 in making this work as well as it can
22 for everyone in Philadelphia who
23 needs vouchers to access safe and
24 affordable housing. If you can stay
25 on, that would be wonderful. I'm

3/20/2023

1 going to have the other panelists go,
2 and then we will have questions for
3 all of you.

4 MR. JEREMIAH: Absolutely.

5 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:

6 Ms. Hersh, please state your name for
7 the record and proceed with your
8 testimony.

9 MS. HERSH: Okay. Good
10 afternoon, everybody. Liz Hersh, the
11 Director of the City's Office of
12 Homeless Services. First of all, I
13 just wanted to thank you, Committee
14 Chairmember Gauthier and members of
15 the Committee, for holding this
16 hearing and for focusing on this
17 critical issue.

18 We were very, very excited
19 when the American Rescue Plan passed
20 and the City got 863 vouchers to add
21 on to the 19,000-and-something that
22 PHA has, but then were dedicated to
23 people experiencing homelessness.
24 And I think our people have -- we
25 have 68 percent leased up, but it's

3/20/2023

1 been tremendously challenging.

2 The source of income
3 discrimination, racial discrimination
4 and also discrimination against
5 people who are Megan's Law offenders
6 continue to be huge barriers for
7 people, so I'm very appreciative that
8 you're recognizing this issue and
9 focusing on understanding it better
10 and what might be done.

11 I also really appreciated
12 some of the early testimony about
13 solutions, and I thought some very
14 innovative solutions were raised.
15 Early on in my career in
16 Philadelphia, I was the Executive
17 Director of the Tenants Action Group
18 and we did fair housing enforcement,
19 especially around racial
20 discrimination and presence of
21 children, and we did find that
22 testing is absolutely critical. It's
23 really the best way.

24 As I was really glad to hear
25 that there were some resources going

3/20/2023

1 to testing and that that's something
2 that might be expanded, and that
3 combines with public education, I
4 think are both great ideas. I think
5 the private right of action and the
6 extended time -- one of the things
7 that one of the speakers said was
8 that when people are in a housing
9 crisis and looking for a place, the
10 idea of getting legal assistance is
11 very overwhelming because they're in
12 a situation where they just need to
13 find a place to live. So having
14 enough time once they get settled to
15 go back and look at legal recourse I
16 think is a really important piece of
17 this.

18 And the Office of Homeless
19 Services administers two rental
20 assistance programs: Supportive
21 Housing which has about 2800 units,
22 and Rapid Re-Housing which last year
23 was about 591 households. These are
24 both subsidy programs. Some of the
25 rapid rehousing is entirely

3/20/2023

1 tenant-based. And we contracted out
2 to a series of providers, and those
3 providers do give the applicants the
4 names of three units where they might
5 be able to live.

6 How do they do this? It's
7 really relationship-building. It's
8 very, very hands-on. And we find
9 that when -- the most important
10 thing -- well, there's a number of
11 important things. One is somebody
12 mentioned getting paid on time and
13 another is having somebody at the
14 other end of the phone. So if and
15 when there's a problem, there's
16 somebody who's going to step in and
17 resolve it.

18 And so, in our programs there
19 are service providers who work with
20 the landlord and work with the
21 residents to the extent possible.
22 I'm not going to tell you that it's a
23 perfect system. People do or tenants
24 do have choices about what services
25 they accept. We can't make somebody

3/20/2023

1 accept services, but we have found
2 that those relationships between the
3 landlords and the providers do help
4 pave the way for others. And as
5 Kelvin mentioned, kind of the Loss
6 Contingency Fund so that if they do
7 experience damages, that they are
8 able to be made whole.

9 In August of 2021, we did a
10 survey of landlords and 400 landlords
11 responded. 77 percent said they did
12 not rent to Housing Choice voucher-
13 holders. 82 percent said they didn't
14 even know about the program. And 62
15 percent just on its face said they
16 weren't interested in learning. So I
17 think that was really brought home to
18 us in concrete terms kind of an
19 uphill battle that we were fighting
20 in order to make sure that people who
21 are exiting homelessness who has this
22 very precious resource of a subsidy
23 had a way of being successful in
24 their housing search.

25 So thanks in part to PHA, we

3/20/2023

1 do have housing navigators. Those
2 having housing navigators actually
3 work with the housing case managers
4 who are responsible for helping
5 people find the units. We did as
6 somebody mentioned also establish
7 Padmission, and it's open to any
8 landlord who wants to work in
9 partnership with the City. It is
10 updated daily, so if there's --
11 sometimes units go really fast. We
12 do our best to keep it updated, but
13 we want to know if there's problems
14 with it or inconsistencies or
15 information, so we can fix that.

16 Currently, we have 150
17 landlords with over 200 units ranging
18 from efficiencies to five bedrooms in
19 Padmission, and then those again are
20 for the providers to help their
21 participants find units. Most
22 recently what we have begun to do is
23 to establish a landlord gateway led
24 by Ebonye Williams who is our
25 Landlord Affairs -- Director of

3/20/2023

1 Landlord Affairs who unfortunately
2 was unable to be with us today. She
3 brought together 16 public agencies
4 to create this Landlord Gateway,
5 which will serve as a one-stop shop
6 for property owners and managers to
7 access all the City's various rental
8 assistance programs.

9 As it stands now, if you are
10 a property manager owner, rental
11 property manager owner, who wants to
12 do something about the affordable
13 housing crisis or help people end
14 homelessness, and we find that many
15 actually do, it's very, very hard to
16 access the City's system so we are
17 developing a website, a web-based
18 application, a dedicated unit to work
19 with landlords and provide
20 navigational support. And we are
21 working together with Planning and
22 Development, Revenue, PHA, the
23 Register of Wills -- Wills, not
24 whales, DBHIDS, L&I, Revenue,
25 Commerce, DHS, the School District

3/20/2023

1 and PHDC to make it easier and more
2 accessible for those property owners
3 and managers to work with the City
4 and access our rental assistance
5 programs and be part of the solution.

6 So with that, I will stop and
7 of course we'll be available for
8 questions. And thank you again for
9 bringing light to this critical
10 issue, and we stand ready to do
11 whatever we can to help and support
12 in trying to solve this problem.
13 Thank you.

14 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
15 you, Ms. Hersh. We are appreciative
16 of the work that you do every day to
17 end and prevent homelessness and
18 we're appreciative of your
19 partnership, as we try to make the
20 voucher program more accessible and
21 more useful for people in the City.

22 Kia Ghee, are you there and
23 connected?

24 MS. GHEE: Yes, I'm here.
25 Can you hear me?

3/20/2023

1 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Yes.

2 Can you please state your name for
3 the record and proceed with your
4 testimony.

5 MS. GHEE: Yes. Good
6 afternoon, Chairperson Gauthier and
7 members of the Committee on Housing,
8 Neighborhood Development and
9 Homelessness. I'm Kia Ghee. I am
10 the Executive Director of the
11 Philadelphia Commission on Human
12 Relations. So I just wanted to say
13 thank you for the opportunity to
14 testify today at this hearing
15 initiated by Resolution 221031, and
16 thank you to the panels who have
17 testified so far. Their testimony
18 has been very informative and we take
19 the feedback constructively.

20 As the City's official civil
21 rights agency, enforcement agency we
22 are tasked with investigating
23 complaints of discrimination, whether
24 that be in employment, public
25 accommodation, housing or real

3/20/2023

1 property. Since 1980 the Fair
2 Practices Ordinance has prohibited
3 discrimination based on source of
4 income, including public assistance
5 and housing assistance programs, such
6 as Housing Choice Vouchers so that
7 families can, in fact, choose to live
8 where they desire in neighborhoods
9 that they desire.

10 In addition since 2002, it
11 has been unlawful to give false or
12 misleading information with regard to
13 properties such as representing that
14 a property is not available for
15 inspection, sale or rental, when in
16 fact it is. And it's also unlawful
17 to treat tenants who use Section 8
18 vouchers differently in terms of the
19 price, in terms of conditions and
20 privileges of tenancy based on the
21 fact that they are Section 8 voucher
22 user or any other source of income.

23 When property owners refuse
24 to rent, sell or lease to families
25 who utilize housing vouchers, they

3/20/2023

1 are engaging in unlawful conduct that
2 is a direct violation of the Fair
3 Practices Ordinance. I am here today
4 because despite the undeniable
5 benefit of the program, there are
6 still families who are unlawfully
7 denied the opportunity to rent in
8 neighborhoods of their choosing.

9 Over the last five years, the
10 Commission has received dozens of
11 complaints against landlords and
12 brokers across the City of unlawful
13 discrimination based on source of
14 income. The Commission has garnered
15 over 20,000 in damages for these
16 complainants who have faced source of
17 income discrimination, and we have
18 also successfully negotiated
19 resolutions in which landlords agree
20 to adopt written policies against
21 discrimination, receive annual
22 training on compliance with the Fair
23 Practices Ordinance and encourage
24 tenants with Housing Choice vouchers
25 to apply.

3/20/2023

1 Despite these gains, there is
2 a correlation between source of
3 income discrimination and preferred
4 neighborhoods and increased
5 concentration of voucher users in
6 distressed neighborhoods. There are
7 several steps that we believe can be
8 taken to strengthen protection for
9 those experiencing source of income
10 discrimination.

11 First, we would recommend
12 that legislation be passed that
13 expressly prohibits housing providers
14 by making, publishing, circulating,
15 issuing or displaying any written
16 communication or advertisement
17 containing language of no Section 8,
18 not Section 8 approved, not set up
19 for Section 8, and provide as the
20 other panelists said private right of
21 action for those who are impacted.

22 Second, we recommend making
23 it unlawful for our housing providers
24 to refuse to cooperate with minor
25 administrative paperwork or

3/20/2023

1 requirements for the Housing Choice
2 Voucher Program such as completing
3 routine paperwork or allowing an
4 inspection of their property.

5 Finally, we understand the
6 magnitude of the lack of resources
7 that exist, but we will continue to
8 use the resources that we have
9 available to us to partner with
10 elected officials, community partners
11 and others to facilitate proactive
12 public education campaigns that
13 clearly explain tenant rights and
14 landlord responsibilities under this
15 law.

16 We stand with you in
17 understanding the magnitude of this
18 problem and we know that Philadelphia
19 is known for its diversity. Source
20 of income discrimination harms the
21 City's goal of fair housing practices
22 across all neighborhoods. These
23 types of discriminatory practices
24 disproportionately impact minority
25 families, which lead to displacement

3/20/2023

1 and lower quality of life.

2 Our mission is to end this
3 discriminatory practice as well as
4 all forms of discrimination, and we
5 stand committed to partnering with
6 City Council to enhance the
7 protections for Philadelphia's
8 vulnerable population. With that
9 said, thank you for your time and I
10 am available to answer any questions
11 that you may have.

12 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
13 you so much, Ms. Ghee, for your
14 testimony but also for the work you
15 do on a daily basis to protect
16 people's housing and enforce on bad
17 actors. We at Council want to make
18 sure that the Fair Housing Commission
19 has the support and the resources
20 necessary to protect people even
21 more. Thank you.

22 My first set of questions for
23 this panel are for Kelvin Jeremiah.
24 Are you still there?

25 MR. JEREMIAH: I'm here.

3/20/2023

1 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Okay.

2 Can you describe how proactive and
3 hands-on PHA staff are with voucher
4 households during their apartment
5 searches? We heard from several
6 people that they felt that they
7 needed -- that they kind of were out
8 there on their own and they felt that
9 they needed more assistance in terms
10 of finding a suitable place to use
11 their voucher.

12 So can you just talk about
13 how that typically goes and can you
14 also describe if there are things
15 that you want to add to that in order
16 to help folks to use their vouchers
17 more effectively?

18 MR. JEREMIAH: So absolutely,
19 Madam Chair. What underlies the
20 Housing Choice Voucher Program is
21 choice. And so, we have to as PHA,
22 the administrator of the Housing
23 Choice Voucher Program, we have to be
24 particularly careful not to steer
25 residents and participants in any

3/20/2023

1 particular geographic location. That
2 would be illegal.

3 Having said that, we
4 painstakingly work with our
5 participants as well as landlords, so
6 there are a number of resources that
7 we provide. Remember that it's
8 voluntary, that we provide to
9 recipients. For example, we have
10 vacancy lists that we receive from
11 various landlords who we know are
12 participating in the program. We
13 have GoSection8 as another electronic
14 resource.

15 We frequently reach out to
16 landlords in high opportunity areas
17 to help navigate -- help a tenant
18 navigate renting in those areas. And
19 so, it is very hands -- every
20 participant is assigned to a case
21 manager and that case manager is not
22 only responsible for helping the
23 participant with the issuance of the
24 voucher but to help them find units
25 to the extent that units are

3/20/2023

1 available.

2 What we're finding though is
3 all too often units are more readily
4 available in certain geographic
5 locations of the City. Often those
6 locations are not the most desirable,
7 in part because the rents there are
8 the lowest, tend to be at the lowest
9 levels. And so, there is a lot of
10 effort that is put in upfront.

11 So when a tenant comes to PHA
12 to issue a voucher, the voucher
13 outlines the date that the voucher
14 will be good for. Up to 120 days
15 extensions are permitted, and we do
16 that very liberally. It does not
17 contain the voucher "amount" because
18 as you all know, that changes
19 virtually by zip code, by location,
20 by neighborhoods, et cetera.

21 It looks something like this
22 (indicating). But in addition -- so
23 that's the voucher, a full-page
24 document that they get signed by PHA.
25 In the name of voucher, what is there

3/20/2023

1 is the unit size. So it could be
2 anywhere from zero to a one bedroom
3 to six bedrooms as an example. Every
4 voucher recipient it's important to
5 note receives this, which is a PHA
6 guide, a housing search and moving
7 guide most recently updated November
8 2022, and it outlines all of the
9 steps that are required, everything
10 you need to know from the minute that
11 you're issued the voucher, the
12 introduction, how to search for a
13 unit, when your voucher expires, how
14 the rents are determined, what is
15 required for inspection. And so, all
16 of those things, yes. It's very
17 technical. It's very involved
18 because the law requires us as the
19 administrator of the program to
20 adhere to certain requirements.

21 Councilmember, I will not
22 exaggerate, but these are the
23 regulations. There are four volumes,
24 right, that we have to adhere to.
25 And so, yes, is it bureaucratic?

3/20/2023

1 Absolutely. It's not the same when a
2 private tenant or market rate tenant
3 goes out and looks for a unit. The
4 landlord isn't subject to any HQS
5 inspections. We are required to do
6 an HQS inspection. The landlord
7 isn't -- PHA as the administrator is
8 required to engage with the landlord
9 to make sure that the rents are
10 "reasonable" which requires the rent
11 reasonableness and test. We have to
12 make sure that the family, the
13 household, can afford to pay that
14 rent, their portion of the rent, not
15 exceeding -- in the case of PHA
16 actually 28 percent, but not
17 exceeding the 30 percent threshold.

18 And so, the incentive
19 programs that we have are aimed at
20 addressing some of those barriers.
21 The sign-in bonus, for example, is to
22 bridge the gap. So if it takes 30
23 days, then a landlord would be able
24 to be compensated for the time that
25 it takes us to go through the

3/20/2023

1 inspection process. And, yes, we
2 often do find as part of the process
3 that there isn't a smoke detector or
4 a window is broken or there's an
5 egress issue.

6 You know, you just name it.
7 If the unit fails inspection, it
8 requires re-inspection. So a lot of
9 that that is involved before we can
10 actually sign somebody up and approve
11 the lease, we have to ensure that the
12 unit meets the HUD-required
13 habitability test, which is the HQS
14 standard.

15 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
16 you. Based on the testimony that you
17 heard today, I would ask you and
18 Ms. Hersh, based on particularly what
19 the tenants said about how hard it
20 was to use vouchers, are there things
21 that you would add to the support
22 that is offered to tenants to find
23 units if resources were available? I
24 know that all of this depends on
25 resources, but I'm interested in

3/20/2023

1 hearing what you think could change.

2 MR. JEREMIAH: No,
3 absolutely. I think there are a
4 number of solutions. It's quite
5 disheartening to hear some of the
6 stories from the participants who are
7 at Bartram's Village and looking to
8 get Section 8 housing, the Housing
9 Choice Voucher. The story that we
10 heard from the gentleman who has some
11 disabilities, it's really
12 disheartening because I know from
13 PHA's perspective we spend a lot of
14 time helping as best we can.

15 In terms of the need for
16 resources, I will echo some of the
17 suggestions that we've already heard.
18 I think we have to be bold and
19 intentional in how we use the
20 resources that we have. As I said,
21 we've already spent over \$1 million
22 and continuing in terms of the
23 landlord incentive programs.

24 I would love to expand on
25 opportunity, but these are monies

3/20/2023

1 that PHA is taking out of its
2 operating funds that can go directly
3 to providing housing to what's
4 combating housing issues, right. I
5 would love to work more closely with
6 the Commission to broaden its reach
7 so that we are speaking in tandem.

8 In my early public service
9 life, I was a housing discrimination
10 compliance officer and I investigated
11 a lot of complaints in that area. I
12 would love to see the Council
13 providing more resources to the
14 Commission so that they can -- or
15 advocacy groups to do the kind of
16 testing. One of the ways that we
17 combat housing discrimination is
18 actually to do the testing.

19 You're not going to hear --
20 landlords often when they decline
21 somebody, they're not telling you
22 because you're Black or you're a
23 woman or you're single, et cetera.
24 They will tell you that it's because
25 of your criminal record. It's

3/20/2023

1 because of your credit, et cetera.
2 One of the biggest areas to help
3 navigate and provide that kind of
4 information that allows us to combat
5 housing discrimination is to do that
6 testing and to bring those cases
7 against those landlords and to have
8 more tougher penalties for those
9 violations.

10 I typically didn't settle
11 those cases unless they were
12 incredibly punitive on the landlords,
13 and I did a lot of that and I think
14 we can. I would also say that part
15 of why this was so disheartening is
16 because of our own landlord outreach
17 and tenant outreach programs. So
18 every tenant goes through a voucher
19 briefing and this is part of the
20 voucher briefing. Every landlord
21 that participates in the program goes
22 through that. I am concerned about
23 those landlords that do not. And I
24 would respectfully suggest to the
25 Council that perhaps as part of the

3/20/2023

1 issuance of the rental license, that
2 maybe that would be a condition, that
3 fair housing training would be a
4 condition of the issuance of that
5 license.

6 I don't want to make it more
7 bureaucratic, but I think we want to
8 make sure that people are in the
9 know. And too often as Liz suggested
10 a moment ago, they tend to say, no,
11 we've never heard about the Housing
12 Choice Voucher Program, we've never
13 heard about the Section 8. But what
14 was telling from the analysis that
15 the City did is that 67 percent
16 didn't care to know.

17 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Yes,
18 thank you for that. I would also ask
19 is there anything stopping the City
20 from requiring -- I'm sure there are
21 lots of things that would want to
22 stop the City from this, but is there
23 anything stopping the City from
24 requiring enrollment in these
25 programs if you are to receive a

3/20/2023

1 rental license?

2 MR. JEREMIAH: I'm not
3 specifically aware. I would only
4 point to the Pittsburgh case where
5 the Supreme Court said that it's a
6 voluntary program. So I think that
7 might be legislation that might need
8 to come from the state and not the
9 City.

10 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:
11 Ms. Bernstein, I know you wanted to
12 also offer some comment on the
13 Pittsburgh things. Can you do that
14 here?

15 MS. BERNSTEIN: Sure. Yeah,
16 thank you for the question. With
17 regards to the Pittsburgh case that
18 came out of the Pennsylvania Supreme
19 Court, the Pittsburgh ordinance was
20 similar to Philadelphia's, but
21 Pittsburgh's Home Rule Charter has
22 limitations as a second-class city
23 including a business exclusion, and
24 that's what the Pennsylvania Supreme
25 Court struck down their ordinance on.

3/20/2023

1 That statute is 53 Pa.C.S. § 2962,
2 but Philadelphia Home Rule Char --
3 excuse me, Home Rule is a first-class
4 city and does not have that
5 limitation. That's 53 Pa.C.S.
6 § 13101. So I just wanted to quickly
7 raise that distinction because it's a
8 really, really important one in the
9 conversation about Philadelphia's
10 source of income protection.

11 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
12 you so much. Can you also comment on
13 the possibility of requiring
14 enrollment in these programs if you
15 were to receive a rental license in
16 Pennsylvania? Is that possible or
17 would that be prohibited?

18 MS. BERNSTEIN: I think it's
19 an interesting idea. It's not one
20 that I have completely thought
21 through, but I think it's one that we
22 should talk about. I'll be happy to
23 work with the members of the
24 Committee and anyone else of course
25 to talk about that and what that

3/20/2023

1 might look like to make sure that it
2 makes sense under the state laws and
3 the city laws and the federal laws.

4 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Okay.
5 Thank you.

6 MS. BERNSTEIN: Thank you.

7 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Going
8 back to Ms. Hersh, thank you for your
9 testimony earlier. You talked about
10 how OHS is trying to create a better
11 way for landlords and property owners
12 to really connect to information
13 about Section 8 and other programs.

14 Are you doing anything sort
15 of -- what do you think needs to
16 happen on the tenant side? We heard
17 a lot of testimony from people who
18 said it was really hard for them to
19 use vouchers and they kind of felt
20 like they didn't have enough support.
21 Is OHS thinking through this aspect
22 of the voucher program and what ideas
23 do you have based on the testimony
24 that you heard?

25 MS. HERSH: Yeah, that's a

3/20/2023

1 great question. Yes, I share
2 Kelvin's expression of
3 how disheartening -- it's
4 heartbreaking really. And I think
5 with our -- and also, with the young
6 adults, the issues that they are
7 encountering are definitely more
8 severe than adults because they have
9 the -- the bias that people have
10 against young people partying and all
11 of that sort of thing that they have
12 to overcome.

13 And I think through the
14 process we're going through with the
15 Youth Homelessness Demonstration
16 Project Planning, what they have
17 expressed to us is that they would
18 really like somebody to walk beside
19 them to explain how do you find a
20 unit, help me negotiate with the
21 landlord, help me understand the
22 application and what's legal and
23 what's not.

24 So I think that some people,
25 they have the wherewithal to do all

3/20/2023

1 of this on their own and they figure
2 it out. But I think for others, more
3 education, more walking side-by-side
4 with them, more information, I think
5 all of those things would be hugely
6 helpful.

7 I think for us we have -- the
8 limitations that we have are resource
9 limitations. We have one case
10 manager to about every 20 residents
11 and they're working with people at
12 all different stages in their housing
13 search. And so, there are just
14 limits which is why we focused on
15 giving them resources, like
16 Padmission, like the housing
17 navigators because it's been a way of
18 helping more of our participants by
19 giving the housing case managers more
20 resources.

21 I will say that some of the
22 upstream strategies that we saw that
23 really make a difference were the
24 landlord incentives. You know,
25 rental properties are a business and

3/20/2023

1 money talks. And so, the incentives
2 that PHA put on the ground with the
3 emergency housing vouchers, we saw
4 those be very successful. We've
5 actually expanded our incentives
6 related to our Rapid Re-Housing
7 program, so we now give more upfront
8 money, and that Loss Contingency
9 Fund, those things I think also
10 really, really make a difference. So
11 those are some of the things that I
12 think we would put on our wishlist
13 that we think would be helpful. And
14 certainly, if there's other ideas
15 that people have, we'd love to hear
16 them.

17 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
18 you. I have two more questions for
19 Kia, and then I'm going to open it up
20 for the Committee because we are
21 going rather long, even though this
22 is something we can probably talk
23 about all day.

24 Ms. Ghee, what resources
25 would the Fair Housing Commission

3/20/2023

1 need to expedite its investigations
2 and determinations after a complaint
3 is filed? And I mean in terms of
4 staffing, in terms of resources from
5 the budget. What do you all need to
6 be able to do more of what you do?

7 MS. GHEE: So I would tend to
8 agree with some of the testimony
9 that's already been said in terms of
10 resources needed for testing. We're
11 a proactive enforcement, which is one
12 of the biggest problems right now
13 with our existing infrastructure. We
14 have more of a reactive enforcement
15 scope. And so, we rely on the
16 complaints that come in.

17 But frankly, the number of
18 complaints that we receive are not
19 matching the magnitude of the crisis
20 that's being described here today.
21 So having testers to be able to go
22 out into the field and see what's
23 going on firsthand so we can initiate
24 those complaints on our own.

25 Also, in terms of

3/20/2023

1 investigations, we have over the last
2 18 months since I've been here been
3 focusing on efficiency and
4 comprehensiveness in terms of
5 investigation. Clearing our
6 caseloads of old cases that we have
7 sufficient information to be able to
8 make a determination.

9 So I would say in terms of
10 increasing the speed of the
11 investigation, I'm confident right
12 now that when cases come through
13 they're getting the adequate
14 attention and we're handling them as
15 quickly as possible to get to a
16 resolution that's equitable for the
17 complaint.

18 We need more resources. We
19 need funding for investigators. We
20 have a very, very small team. Our
21 agency is both Fair Housing
22 Commission as well as the Commission
23 on Human Relations.

24 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Can
25 you sort of just expound, when you

3/20/2023

1 say a small team, how many people do
2 the work of the Fair Housing
3 Commission?

4 MS. GHEE: We have six
5 investigators for all kinds of
6 discrimination, so there's over 17
7 protected classes, source of income
8 being one of them. And as I said,
9 the three major categories, public
10 accommodation, housing and
11 employment. And so, our
12 investigators are looking at all of
13 that. And so, if we had more
14 resources, we could do more targeted
15 outreach.

16 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Do
17 you have a sense of how many staff is
18 more appropriate to both have a
19 proactive as well as a really strong
20 sort of investigative and enforcement
21 arm?

22 MS. GHEE: I think if we were
23 to be able to have enough staff to
24 have a task force that looks
25 specifically at source of income,

3/20/2023

1 that would at least be more than we
2 have now. I'm going to say at least
3 three. I don't want to be greedy. I
4 come from humble beginnings. I'm
5 just honored to be here testifying.
6 I never thought in my wildest dreams
7 I would be testifying for City
8 Council.

9 So I would say that we're
10 happy, we'll make it work with what
11 we have. But if we have more, we can
12 do more. And I know that with the
13 problem being what it is, we need to
14 do more. We'll be happy if we can
15 get three more investigators. We'll
16 be happy if we can get two more
17 investigators. If we can get double,
18 we'd be ecstatic and we would be able
19 to do a lot of great work in terms of
20 this protection.

21 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: We
22 can be greedy when it comes to
23 housing justice. I know you have
24 limitations, but me and Kendra will
25 be greedy for you as well as the rest

3/20/2023

1 of the Housing Committee. I'll
2 actually end my questions right there
3 because I know we are taking a really
4 long time.

5 Are there other members of
6 the Committee that have questions or
7 comments for the panel?

8 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: I just
9 have a clarifying question. I know
10 you talked about -- this is for Kia.
11 The question, income discrimination,
12 is it currently legal for landlords
13 to make, publish or circulate or
14 issue any display of written
15 communication with the language that
16 says, no Section 8?

17 MS. GHEE: It's not
18 explicitly or expressly written in
19 the Fair Practices Ordinance in that
20 way. I think it would be helpful for
21 landlords to say that so that they
22 know it's expressly prohibited. But
23 right now the act itself is unlawful
24 because they're doing it to dissuade
25 renters from renting, so that's

3/20/2023

1 disparate treatment for them. But I
2 do think when it's clear in written
3 language, that's easier for a
4 provider to understand.

5 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: So is
6 it an idea of legislation to add a
7 private right of action associated
8 with that?

9 MS. GHEE: If there was --
10 yes. If they have add a private
11 right of action, I think that
12 landlords will be more likely to --
13 less likely rather to make
14 advertisements containing that
15 language because they know that they
16 will be immediately held accountable
17 by people who are disadvantaged based
18 on that language.

19 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: So if
20 that's the case, could that be done
21 for all housing discrimination
22 prohibitions?

23 MS. GHEE: So there is a
24 private right of action that exists
25 once we've completed our

3/20/2023

1 investigation, but they have to go
2 through our process. But if there
3 was something in the legislation that
4 clearly identifies that that alone
5 using this particular type of
6 language would be sufficient to
7 trigger a filing of a complaint
8 against them in a competent
9 jurisdiction, I think that would stop
10 a lot of it.

11 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: Okay.

12 All right. Thank you so much.

13 One other question I have. I
14 think with Bret, or maybe, Kelvin,
15 this might be for you. What is the
16 process for granting the extensions
17 on the vouchers? So if people are
18 unable to find an apartment, what is
19 the process for the extension if they
20 aren't able to find it within the
21 30-day time frame?

22 MR. JEREMIAH: With 120 days.

23 It's simply contacting their
24 caseworker and requesting an
25 extension.

3/20/2023

1 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: So
2 we'll have phone calls that people
3 are unable to contact --

4 MR. JEREMIAH: There's --

5 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: They're
6 having a hard time contacting their
7 caseworker to make that happen.

8 MR. JEREMIAH: So they can
9 come into our office. There's a form
10 that they can complete and they can
11 submit that. They can download the
12 form online as well and have it
13 completed. We'll accept it over
14 email as well.

15 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: Okay.
16 All right.

17 That's it. That's all my
18 questions, Councilmember.

19 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
20 you, Councilmember.

21 Councilmember Bass.

22 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Good
23 afternoon, everybody. I just had a
24 quick question for Liz actually.

25 Liz, can you go back over

3/20/2023

1 those numbers that you gave us
2 earlier, the 80 percent-plus of
3 landlords were not aware of the
4 requirement to accept the vouchers --

5 MS. HERSH: Yes.

6 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: -- and
7 then there was 60 -- uh-huh.

8 MS. HERSH: Yep. So 77
9 percent said they did not currently
10 rent to Housing Choice voucher-
11 holders. 82 percent said they didn't
12 know about the Emergency Housing
13 Voucher Program. That was when it
14 was brand new. We had just gotten it
15 from the federal government. And 62
16 percent said they were not interested
17 in learning about the Emergency
18 Housing Voucher Program.

19 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: And I ask
20 that because those numbers really
21 struck me hard because it just seems
22 as if there's such a stigma around
23 people who have the vouchers, that
24 they can't even get their foot in the
25 door because people are unwilling at

3/20/2023

1 any point to give any consideration
2 if you have a voucher.

3 And so, my question -- I know
4 that there was a question in terms of
5 making a requirement that landlords
6 have to accept, and that question
7 wasn't able to be answered today.

8 But my question is beyond
9 requirement. Do we do anything to
10 incentivize or can we think of
11 something to do to incentivize
12 landlords to at least be aware and
13 hopefully that would open up some
14 opportunities?

15 And, Kelvin, my good friend
16 Kelvin, I don't know if you want to
17 weigh in on that as well.

18 MR. JEREMIAH: Sure. So I
19 think this is an excellent, excellent
20 question. I think we sought to
21 address barriers to accessing market
22 rate units through our incentive
23 programs. And when we did that, we
24 saw as I shared in my testimony a
25 marked increase, a marked increase,

3/20/2023

1 in participation among private
2 landlords, especially landlords in
3 the higher opportunity neighborhoods.

4 I think now we're hovering over 800
5 participants in those neighborhoods.

6 And so, we have to remember
7 in my view that this is a business,
8 and the stereotypes that exist, the
9 negative feedback that we've gotten,
10 we've done this and we've brought in
11 property owners and we talked to
12 them, what do you need from us to
13 encourage, to nudge participation.

14 Part of the issue was the
15 bureaucratic nature of the process.
16 They can go out and they can rent to
17 somebody without having an
18 inspection. We require an
19 inspection. So we try to streamline
20 that process considerably so that
21 they're not losing money.

22 Every time a unit goes
23 unfilled in the private market, it
24 means that the landlord isn't
25 collecting rent. They want to

3/20/2023

1 collect rent. And so, the signing
2 bonus is intended to bridge some of
3 that gap. Secondly, one of the
4 biggest issues that we heard from
5 landlords is when we rent to a
6 person, a private market rate tenant,
7 the damage to those units are nearly
8 comparable to the HCV participants.
9 And so, they have to -- let me back
10 up and say, PHA is a landlord as
11 well, right, so we see it in some
12 practical ways.

13 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Yes.

14 MR. JEREMIAH: And so, a
15 landlord who's renting to an HCV
16 participant is incurring incredible
17 costs to make sure the unit's ready
18 after a tenant moves out is
19 discouraging. And so, the landlord
20 incentive assurance of \$2500 net of
21 the security deposit is aimed at
22 doing just that. So those are the
23 two barriers for us. And I would
24 love to see the City help support
25 those initiatives.

3/20/2023

1 We certainly don't have
2 endless resources to be able to do
3 this. We're doing it, as I
4 mentioned, because of the state of
5 the housing crisis in Philadelphia.
6 And so, we've extended it to June
7 30th of this year because of the
8 response that we've been getting, but
9 it's something that I think is very
10 worthwhile, and we've been in
11 concert -- we've been talking to HUD
12 about providing specific funding to
13 help support those initiatives in
14 communities where there are
15 affordability issues. And I'm
16 hopeful that they will consider that.

17 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: You know,
18 something you had said, Kelvin, just
19 gave me some pause regarding the
20 requirement for the inspection. And
21 so, if you have two units let's say
22 on one particular street and one unit
23 requires an inspection because it's
24 going through the program and then
25 there's another unit where the

3/20/2023

1 landlord doesn't want to accept the
2 voucher because they don't want an
3 inspection, then that says to me that
4 the quality of the housing that's
5 being provided by that particular
6 landlord is suspect.

7 And so, I don't know, has
8 there been any thought about some
9 sort of a partnership with L&I maybe
10 to do inspections, more inspections
11 of all properties I guess, but
12 particularly of those that are I
13 would say where a landlord is
14 specifically declining because of the
15 reason that they don't want to do an
16 inspection? Is that a possibility?
17 Have you thought about that or --

18 MR. JEREMIAH: I honestly
19 haven't, Councilmember Bass. I think
20 all of our participants, a lot of
21 them participating in the HCV
22 program, all of those units, 19,000;
23 20,000 are subject to the inspection
24 so we would inspect them. We would
25 not have a basis. L&I does. I think

3/20/2023

1 perhaps that would be a great
2 question for Law and L&I to explore
3 whether or not it's an issue, whether
4 the units are habitable.

5 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Sure.

6 Yeah, because I'm assuming that you
7 don't want an inspection for a
8 reason. There's a reason that you
9 don't want anybody coming in poking
10 around and taking a look around.

11 Okay. Thank you. And thank you all
12 for the work that you do.

13 Kia, thank you for being here
14 and testifying today for your hard
15 work around this very, very important
16 issue. So I appreciate all of you
17 and want to say thank you for the
18 work you're doing and keep up the
19 good work. Thank you.

20 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
21 you, Councilmember Bass.

22 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Thank
23 you, Councilwoman.

24 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
25 you for that really important and

3/20/2023

1 interesting discussion. I agree with
2 everybody here that we have to make
3 this program more financially viable
4 for landlords, easier. We have to do
5 education. But I do also want to
6 challenge this sort of comment that
7 I've heard several times, that being
8 a landlord is a business.

9 I completely agree with that.
10 But in no other business is it
11 acceptable to have blatant
12 discrimination so much so that you're
13 going to put it on your website or
14 put it on your application. If I
15 were to walk into an establishment
16 and they told me I cannot come into
17 that establishment because I'm Black
18 or because I'm a single mom or I'm
19 poor or whatever, I just think the
20 sort of follow-through on that would
21 be different. And we have to take
22 that same approach as it relates to
23 people's housing.

24 And so, anyway I know I'm
25 preaching to the choir, but I just

3/20/2023

1 wanted to say --

2 MR. JEREMIAH: We don't
3 disagree with you, Councilwoman. We
4 don't disagree with you at all.

5 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
6 you. Thank you so much.

7 Alrighty. Are there other
8 questions or comments for this panel
9 from members of the Committee?

10 (No response.)

11 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
12 you. That concludes panel testimony
13 for this resolution.

14 Ms. Shearlds, do we have
15 anyone registered to provide public
16 comment today?

17 THE CLERK: No, Chair.

18 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Okay.
19 We will now take a brief break to --
20 oops. No, no, sorry.

21 There being no further
22 questions from members of the
23 Committee and no other witnesses to
24 testify, I will ask if there is
25 anyone else present in this hearing

3/20/2023

1 whose name we have failed to call and
2 that wishes to offer testimony on the
3 resolution being considered today?

4 (No response.)

5 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER:

6 Hearing none, this concludes the
7 business before the Committee on
8 Housing, Neighborhood Development and
9 The Homeless.

10 I want to thank everybody for
11 coming and being a part of this
12 critical discussion. I want everyone
13 watching and everybody in the hearing
14 today to know that we're not just
15 going to drop this issue. This is
16 not just about a hearing. This was
17 to uncover solutions to move forward
18 so that we can help people get
19 housing.

20 And so, thank you to everyone
21 who has participated today. And
22 thank you so much to all the members
23 of the Committee, and thanks to
24 everyone watching. I hope you all
25 have a great day.

3/20/2023

1 COUNCILWOMAN BROOKS: Have a
2 great day. Thank you.

3 MS. ROUNDTREE: Thank you.
4 Have a great day.

5 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Thank
6 you.

7 (Committee on Housing,
8 Neighborhood Development and The
9 Homeless concluded at 3:52 p.m.)

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

3/20/2023

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

I, hereby certify that the
proceedings and evidence noted are contained
fully and accurately in the stenographic
notes taken by me in the foregoing matter,
and this is a correct transcript of the
same.

TANEHA CARROLL
Court Reporter - Notary Public

(The foregoing certification of this
transcript does not apply to any reproduction
of the same by any means, unless under the
direct control and/or supervision of the
certifying reporter.)

3/20/2023

<u>WORD</u> <u>INDEX</u>					
< \$ >	1956 67:10	40 20:21	83 10:9	acceptance	activities
\$1 117:6	1980 133:1	22:11 72:24	114:10	105:15	67:17 86:21
144:21	1987 54:17	400 10:25	863 22:8	accepted	actors 107:11
\$1,000 115:15	1995 55:2, 18	128:10	33:10 124:20	14:21 53:1	137:17
\$1200 73:22,	< 2 >	42 68:18	< 9 >	68:21 69:9	acts 96:23
24	2 50:17	43 21:21	900 117:20	122:14	actual 80:25
\$1200-plus	20 1:1 51:14	4500 117:25	90s 32:24	accepting 10:2,	add 45:25
93:8	152:10	< 5 >	95 120:19	7 52:6 95:14,	56:14 124:20
\$1300 73:22,	20,000 33:22	5 119:19, 23	< A >	17	138:15 143:21
24	134:15 167:23	120:2, 21, 24	abatement	accepts 85:17	159:6, 10
\$1400 73:25	200 129:17	50 7:7 21:2	75:4	86:1 95:2	added 39:4
\$16,000 113:16	2001 33:1	118:24	abide 29:1	access 12:10	117:5
\$2500 117:1	2002 133:10	512 33:11	ability 86:17	31:13 35:18	adding 110:13
165:20	2007 77:20, 23	5200 117:22	113:19 121:20	59:19 67:13	115:12
\$300 115:15	2017 117:25	53 149:1, 5	123:1	76:10 85:8	addition 20:23
\$885 120:3	2019 26:8	59 33:8	able 7:3 11:5,	96:10 118:20	37:6 69:25
\$950 93:7	33:3 55:19	591 126:23	9 16:19 32:3	119:15 120:14	133:10 140:22
< § >	57:22	< 6 >	34:22 35:7	123:11, 23	additional
§ 149:1, 6	2020 55:17	6 107:21	36:16 39:1	130:7, 16	31:25 47:23
< 1 >	77:25	60 55:23	42:1 44:19	131:4	48:20, 25
1 21:24	2021 22:10	108:1, 2 162:7	77:15 78:10	accessibility	70:18
119:25 120:4	31:14 112:17	62 33:4 68:18	85:7 86:25	31:10	Additionally
1,000 75:21	115:9 117:22	128:14 162:15	87:11 91:8	accessible	6:4 35:17
1:00 1:1	128:9	65 10:6	92:16 96:24	17:7 26:4	70:2, 21
10 16:10	2022 8:24	67 147:15	106:22 109:4	31:6 45:4	address 16:23
33:12 50:16	16:13 20:25	68 124:25	127:5 128:8	48:11 107:18	30:1 36:5
51:14 68:21	33:16 58:9	69 33:2	142:23 154:6,	131:2, 20	57:6 72:20
77:24 107:22	117:4 118:22,	< 7 >	21 155:7	accessing	106:23 122:17
100 26:12, 15	23 120:18	71 68:19	156:23 157:18	86:21 163:21	163:21
27:24 28:1, 6	141:8	738 33:16	160:20 163:7	accommodation	addressing
63:2 109:18	2023 1:1	75 8:24 114:2	166:2	132:25 156:10	142:20
100,000-plus	21 109:24	77 24:1	able-bodied	accomplish	adequate
63:3	221031 1:1	128:11 162:8	74:13	24:8	106:14, 19
11 26:9 77:24	5:3, 7 30:3	< 8 >	absence 88:23	accomplished	155:13
1122 73:24	84:2 132:15	8 19:19 30:12	absolutely	107:21	adhere 141:20,
120 140:14	2500 117:5	42:14 47:3	11:25 124:4	accountability	24
160:22	28 142:16	49:21 53:1	125:22 138:18	92:19 96:5	adhering 94:11
13101 149:6	2800 126:21	54:19 55:17	142:1 144:3	107:15, 16	administered
15 104:10	2962 149:1	56:15, 20	accept 7:15	accountable	19:22 22:9
150 129:16	2-year 54:22	61:17, 21	9:10 15:3	71:10 100:9	administering
16 68:21	< 3 >	69:13, 20, 24	16:4 24:1	159:16	121:25
130:3	3,000 30:10	79:25 112:11	51:14, 16	accurate 86:7	administers
17 113:25	3:52 172:9	121:7 133:17,	52:15 53:16	100:21 101:9	126:19
156:6	30 9:2 142:17,	21 135:17, 18,	55:5 56:20	accurately	administration
18 155:2	22	19 144:8	57:25 68:16	173:1	32:17
1800 120:22	300 41:18	147:13 150:13	69:14, 21	achieving	administrative
19,000 8:25	30-day 160:21	158:16	78:16 88:17	28:18	23:2 27:6
167:22	30th 166:7	80 10:13	91:16 92:11	acknowledge	40:14, 18
19,000-and-	322 22:10	21:23 22:2	93:25 95:19	121:1	135:25
something	< 4 >	162:2	101:24 114:11,	Act 6:12	administrator
124:21	4 16:10 33:12	800 16:13	15 127:25	31:13 96:10	138:22 141:19
19,500 112:7	108:19 120:21,	164:4	128:1 161:13	158:23	142:7
113:11	23	81 32:25	162:4 163:6	action 27:18	admits 58:12
	4,000 117:25	82 128:13	167:1	40:20 53:8	adopt 134:20
		162:11	acceptable	125:17 126:5	adult 54:17
			169:11	135:21 159:7,	90:17
				11, 24	adulthood
				activists 75:20	109:24

3/20/2023

adults 96:4 104:19 151:6, 8	ago 7:7 102:25 147:10	anti-	appreciation	131:4 133:4, 5	10, 12 77:20
advertisement	agree 134:19	discrimination	24:6	138:9	79:4 86:11
14:20 135:16	154:8 169:1, 9	9:23	appreciative	assistant 95:9	88:1 92:7
advertisements	agreeing 23:25	anxiety-	125:7 131:15,	assisted 52:24	126:15 150:8
159:14	agreements	producing	18	118:23, 24	161:25 165:9
advertising	28:13	55:24	approach	assisting 118:9	backed 88:20
24:20 68:13	agrees 113:3	anxious 105:7	169:22	122:1	Background
advise 114:17	aimed 118:9	anybody 168:9	appropriate	associated	84:10 94:9
advocacy 30:8	142:19 165:21	anymore 61:18	100:22 156:18	105:9 159:7	bad 51:24
102:12 145:15	aims 123:20	anyway 169:24	appropriated	associations	61:22 72:18
advocate 67:11	akin 27:21	apartment	117:13	34:4	107:11 137:16
advocates 34:3	align 93:13	7:15 8:17	approval	assuming	bans 30:22
Affairs 129:25	alike 24:19	14:13 31:9	113:24 122:3	168:6	31:15
130:1	allegations	43:2 50:6, 12,	approve	assurance	barrier 31:25
afford 37:4	23:4 26:1	22, 24, 25 51:4,	143:10	115:6, 17, 20,	70:19
56:8 73:21, 22	allocated 96:3	23 52:1, 3, 22	approved	23 116:19	barriers 30:14
78:11 84:8	allow 6:10	64:23 99:13	115:24 135:18	165:20	35:5 37:10
142:13	allowed 35:14	120:2 138:4	approximately	attachment	117:14 125:6
affordability	55:12 57:8	160:18	113:15, 24	119:22	142:20 163:21
166:15	109:19	apartments	114:2 120:3	attendance	165:23
affordable	allowing 19:1	51:6, 12	arduous 47:18	2:25 3:1	Bartram
5:17 8:9, 14	29:25 107:24	apartment's	area 9:3 61:7	attention	77:23 78:24
9:6 19:6, 9	136:3	52:11	93:8, 11 95:24	13:18 71:12	79:5 80:8
48:11 55:10	allows 146:4	apologies	118:1 119:7,	102:22 155:14	Bartram's
57:12 59:12	Alrighty 170:7	97:23	21 145:11	attorney 18:25	60:18 64:2, 9
68:14 70:20	alternative	apologize	areas 27:14	29:22	66:9 77:21
76:14 81:22	15:21	39:24	93:1 94:20	August 26:7	144:7
113:20 123:3,	ambassador	apparent 70:16	96:20 118:12,	57:22 128:9	based 9:15
24 130:12	64:8	apparently	15 119:5, 13	authorities	31:15 42:11
affordablehousing.com 86:4	amend 39:7	26:21	120:7, 9, 14, 24	52:23	56:25 57:19
101:16	amending	applicant	139:16, 18	authority 7:16	71:2 113:9
afraid 77:10	27:12	92:19	146:2	19:23 32:16,	119:11 133:3,
afternoon 2:3	amenities	applicants	arguments	21 112:4	20 134:13
3:11, 13, 17, 20,	119:16	127:3	75:12	authorizing	143:16, 18
24 4:1, 6, 9, 13,	amenity-rich	application	arm 156:21	5:7	150:23 159:17
15, 19, 21 6:18	12:9	30:20 53:12	arrestable	autism 72:21	bases 119:5
18:17 29:15,	American	97:3 108:8	74:19	autistic 72:10	basic 12:11
17, 24 37:22	124:19	130:18 151:22	asked 61:5	available 6:9	17:19
49:14, 16 67:7	amount 7:21	169:14	79:17 96:2	7:17 53:2	basically 62:10
83:10, 12	14:25 62:14	applications	asking 36:13	86:9 97:24	basis 20:1
111:11, 25	65:1, 16, 18	24:1 87:11	64:6, 10	106:11 131:7	31:4 36:25
124:10 132:6	80:24 101:19,	92:17	asks 122:22	133:14 136:9	121:2, 7
161:23	25 140:17	applied 54:19	aspect 150:21	137:10 140:1,	137:15 167:25
age 102:19	analysis 147:14	87:7	Assessment	4 143:23	BASS 1:1
109:19	and/or 122:7	apply 68:23	21:1 31:18	average	3:22, 23
agencies 25:23	173:22	87:4 134:25	assigned	113:13, 14, 22	161:21, 22
46:10 70:15	announcement	173:20	139:20	116:9	162:6, 19
130:3	2:5	appreciate	assist 37:12	awarded 33:11	165:13 166:17
agency 20:10	annual 36:25	37:16 54:8	100:16	awarding 7:12	167:19 168:5,
34:13 83:20	113:14 134:21	59:20 77:13	assistance 7:9	aware 5:22	21, 22 172:5
94:25 96:23	annually 30:11	87:16 99:2	8:10 9:8	112:5 148:3	bathroom
97:2 132:21	annually 30:11	102:21 110:13,	11:22 19:16	162:3 163:12	79:23
155:21	answer 40:2	17 123:15	20:5, 18, 19	< B >	battle 128:19
agent 96:22	69:2 91:23	168:16	37:14 58:21	baby 104:4	bear 22:7
aging 109:15	99:18 137:10	appreciated	86:18 92:13	Bachelor's	becoming
	answered	39:2 125:11	98:24 105:11	55:13	106:12
	163:7	appreciates	122:4 126:10,	back 37:25	bedroom 141:2
	answers 43:21	89:13	20 130:8	53:5, 6 61:3, 5,	

3/20/2023

bedrooms 80:11, 14, 18 129:18 141:3	56:13 78:20 108:13 145:22 169:17	19 160:11 161:1, 5, 15 172:1	12 109:16, 20 147:16	Chairwoman 111:25	choices 118:11 127:24
began 7:8	Blair 83:5	brought 128:17 130:3 164:10	career 125:15	challenge 169:6	choir 169:25
beginning 2:6	102:7, 10, 11 104:2	Brown 13:5 65:21	careful 138:24	challenges 31:23 35:16 89:6 105:1 120:10	choose 37:6 103:16 133:7
beginnings 157:4	blanket 30:22 31:15	budget 24:7 154:5	Carolina 52:19 53:3, 6 54:6	chance 52:13	choosing 106:17 134:8
begun 68:7 129:22	blatant 43:10 169:11	build 9:5	CARROLL 173:12	change 103:2 144:1	CINDY 1:1
behalf 98:12	blatantly 14:19 70:13 102:23	building 15:19	case 92:22 97:11 99:25 129:3 139:20, 21 142:15 148:4, 17 152:9, 19 159:20	changing 31:5 35:20 125:1	circles 66:3
behavior 25:4, 19	board 97:7	buildings 8:18 16:1 31:9	caseloads 155:6	chance 52:13	circulate 158:13
belief 7:22 71:1 116:7	bold 144:18	burdensome 30:25	cases 69:17 93:23 100:25 146:6, 11 155:6, 12	change 103:2 144:1	circulating 135:14
believe 41:4 50:18 66:1 81:1, 2 113:5, 18 135:7	bond 104:3	bureaucracy 16:6	caseworker 160:24 161:7	changed 80:16	circumstances 9:4
believes 49:24	bonus 142:21 165:2	bureaucratic 141:25 147:7 164:15	categories 156:9	changes 12:24 31:22 80:21 82:1 140:18	cited 21:1, 11
Bell 49:7, 11, 13, 19, 20 53:19, 23, 25 54:9	bonuses 115:14	buses 45:14	cause 58:4 116:8	Char 149:2	citizens 61:25 74:14
benefit 20:14 134:5	books 20:21	business 67:21 148:23 152:25 164:7 169:8, 10 171:7	cases 69:17 93:23 100:25 146:6, 11 155:6, 12	charge 36:16	CITY 1:1 2:8 5:7 11:1, 7, 12 14:23 20:10 22:7, 14 23:17 24:10 27:11, 15, 20 31:12 33:25 34:3, 20 36:2, 19 37:8, 18 40:12, 17 46:3 48:18 53:7 70:15 74:5 93:5 96:2 102:17 107:16, 24 108:13, 14 112:19, 24 113:6, 21 117:11, 20, 24 120:8 122:11, 22 123:4, 20 124:20 129:9 131:3, 21 134:12 137:6 140:5 147:15, 19, 22, 23 148:9, 22 149:4 150:3 157:7 165:24
benefits 14:10 55:6 106:25 115:4	boom 11:11	but 41:22	caseworker 160:24 161:7	charged 20:10	City's 20:25 96:15 124:11 130:7, 16 132:20 136:21
Bernstein 18:11, 14, 16, 23, 24 39:23 44:6 148:11, 15 149:18 150:6	bothered 61:14	butter 44:11	categories 156:9	Charlene 57:4	citywide 10:8 119:9
best 40:1 104:18 125:23 129:12 144:14	bracket 63:2	buy 47:8	cause 58:4 116:8	Charter 148:21	civil 30:6 132:20
bet 74:15	brand 162:14	Bye 98:16	Center 19:1 23:13 38:25 40:7 57:15 67:10 104:13	Charter- mandated 24:13	claim 26:22 27:2 91:15
better 13:1 15:20 38:12 39:5 46:3 56:18 111:17 118:18, 20 119:14 123:18 125:9 150:10	break 170:19	call 2:24 18:9 24:9 49:5 61:2, 4, 11 83:2 86:11 110:23 118:4 171:1	Center's 23:10	chat 6:8, 13	claims 59:14
beyond 116:1, 8, 9 163:8	break-ins 64:5, 11	called 3:3 4:24 28:3 51:14 52:7, 8 56:19 61:10 63:23 95:1 101:16	centralized 101:7	chat 6:8, 13	clarification 99:8
bias 30:25 56:12 151:9	Bret 65:8 66:10 111:3 160:14	calls 10:21 26:11 161:2	CEO 112:3	checks 30:22 32:6 121:16	
big 15:24	brief 3:3 38:1 170:19	cameras 64:10, 11 79:2, 7	certain 31:19 55:9 140:4 141:20	child 50:23 53:15 54:18 70:4 102:15 104:7, 12 108:12	
biggest 47:13 48:14 146:2 154:12 165:4	briefing 146:19, 20	campaign 42:22 45:13	certainly 40:25 153:14 166:1	childhood 104:12, 19	
bill 5:5 59:20	bring 27:13 146:6	campaigns 136:12	certification 173:19	children 14:5 17:16 50:18 54:17 55:14 56:13 77:22 102:18 104:20 107:5 125:21	
birth 54:18	bringing 13:18 62:22 131:9	capacity 39:5, 11	certify 173:1	child's 104:11	
bit 39:25 41:7 103:3	broad 25:5 42:22	care 12:11 53:4, 14 86:22 102:13 104:7, 158:8 159:5,	certifying 173:23	choice 7:11, 19 8:1 10:3 11:18 19:7, 17 21:13, 21, 25 22:9 30:12 42:14 47:3 54:20 67:14 68:16 84:4 112:9 117:16 121:8 128:12 133:6 134:24 136:1 138:20, 21, 23 144:9 147:12 162:10	
Black 10:12 13:5 21:24	broaden 145:6		cetera 140:20 145:23 146:1	choice 7:11, 19 8:1 10:3 11:18 19:7, 17 21:13, 21, 25 22:9 30:12 42:14 47:3 54:20 67:14 68:16 84:4 112:9 117:16 121:8 128:12 133:6 134:24 136:1 138:20, 21, 23 144:9 147:12 162:10	
	broadly 20:2 123:14		CHAIR 1:1 3:9, 18 4:6 13:16 37:23 38:8 111:13 115:22 120:16 138:19 170:17	choice 7:11, 19 8:1 10:3 11:18 19:7, 17 21:13, 21, 25 22:9 30:12 42:14 47:3 54:20 67:14 68:16 84:4 112:9 117:16 121:8 128:12 133:6 134:24 136:1 138:20, 21, 23 144:9 147:12 162:10	
	broke 89:21		Chairmember 124:14	choice 7:11, 19 8:1 10:3 11:18 19:7, 17 21:13, 21, 25 22:9 30:12 42:14 47:3 54:20 67:14 68:16 84:4 112:9 117:16 121:8 128:12 133:6 134:24 136:1 138:20, 21, 23 144:9 147:12 162:10	
	broken 16:21 143:4		Chairperson 132:6	choice 7:11, 19 8:1 10:3 11:18 19:7, 17 21:13, 21, 25 22:9 30:12 42:14 47:3 54:20 67:14 68:16 84:4 112:9 117:16 121:8 128:12 133:6 134:24 136:1 138:20, 21, 23 144:9 147:12 162:10	
	brokers 134:12			choice 7:11, 19 8:1 10:3 11:18 19:7, 17 21:13, 21, 25 22:9 30:12 42:14 47:3 54:20 67:14 68:16 84:4 112:9 117:16 121:8 128:12 133:6 134:24 136:1 138:20, 21, 23 144:9 147:12 162:10	
	BROOKS 1:1 4:11, 12 13:13, 14 19:11 59:17 99:6, 7 100:12 101:10, 12, 13 102:2 158:8 159:5,			choice 7:11, 19 8:1 10:3 11:18 19:7, 17 21:13, 21, 25 22:9 30:12 42:14 47:3 54:20 67:14 68:16 84:4 112:9 117:16 121:8 128:12 133:6 134:24 136:1 138:20, 21, 23 144:9 147:12 162:10	

3/20/2023

clarifying 158:9	college 109:12	153:25 155:22	competent 160:8	concrete 128:18	constituents 10:21
clarity 92:12	color 8:3 19:5	156:3	complainants 23:3 134:16	condition 52:11 147:2, 4	constructed 8:18
97:7 100:18	combat 145:17 146:4	Commissioner 58:8	complaint 27:10, 17, 22	conditions 133:19	constructively 132:19
class 24:22	combating 145:4	Commission's 24:6 27:3	41:19 43:18	conduct 5:10	consumer 71:5
class-based 32:13	combines 126:3	28:17 45:6	57:16, 23 58:2,	25:24 86:17	consumers 68:5
classes 59:7	come 2:23	commitment 22:19 28:17	8 154:2	96:25 121:16	contact 114:18
156:7	24:5 25:25	committed 137:5	155:17 160:7	134:1	161:3
classified 9:1	40:9 60:7	COMMITTEE 1:1 4:23 5:1,	complaints 23:1, 15 26:3,	conducted 67:17, 24	contacting 160:23 161:6
classism 15:16	65:25 73:19	8 6:17, 21	7 42:10 43:20	conducting 115:2	contacts 68:18
clean 53:3	74:21 91:5, 6,	13:12 18:4	46:19 57:21	confident 155:11	contain 140:17
clear 13:2	20 92:1 98:1	19:13 29:25	132:23 134:11	confirm 95:11	contained 173:1
36:6 91:23	108:24 148:8	49:2 82:23	145:11 154:16,	confronting 25:19 66:9	containing 135:17 159:14
159:2	154:16 155:12	110:20 112:2	18, 24	confusing 35:21 91:11	contemplates 27:10
cleared 11:2	157:4 161:9	123:6 124:13,	complete 26:9	95:18	context 69:7
Clearing 155:5	169:16	15 132:7	28:5, 9 87:16	confusion 32:15	Contingency 128:6 153:8
clearly 14:17	comes 36:12	149:24 153:20	161:10	conjunction 25:6	contingent 95:20
63:12 92:21	41:17 46:18	158:1, 6 170:9,	completed 159:25 161:13	connect 150:12	continue 31:20 36:2
136:13 160:4	47:23 98:4	23 171:7, 23	completely 149:20 169:9	connected 18:15 29:13	37:1 101:3
CLERK 3:7,	116:13 140:11	172:7	completing 136:2	49:12 57:14	106:24 125:6
14, 21 4:2, 10,	157:22	Committees 2:9, 16	complex 11:10	60:10 66:25	136:7
16 5:6 18:11	comfort 94:12	Committee's 89:14	compliance 68:7 134:22	71:20 83:8	continued 95:9 117:17
37:22 38:4, 8,	comfortable 14:19	committing 72:12	145:10	90:6 91:2	continuing 6:2
13, 17 49:7	coming 87:23	common 12:3	complicated 15:5	131:23	144:22
83:4 110:25	94:7 168:9	27:19	comply 6:12	consenting 6:3	contract 25:9
170:17	171:11	commonly 19:18	15:2 59:4	consequences 40:23 45:9	contracted 127:1
client 87:7	commendable 28:19	communication 34:15 36:7	complying 68:2	77:7, 8	contrast 119:8
116:10	commensurate 11:6	135:16 158:15	component 116:20 121:14	consider 27:11	contributing 113:18
clients 30:9,	comment 71:14 148:12	communities 14:4 15:13	comprehensive ness 155:4	53:11 75:6	control 88:23
15 46:1 84:3	149:12 169:6	17:16 25:11	comprise 10:13	106:6 122:23	173:22
85:2 87:24	170:16	44:21, 25	concentrated 21:16	166:16	conversation 69:4 76:6
89:7 114:18,	comments 6:6	64:14 118:14	concentration 135:5	considerable 86:20	90:15, 19
24, 25	18:5 42:15	166:14	concept 91:25	considerably 164:20	91:14 93:9
Clinic 83:17,	49:1 82:24	Community 29:22 30:4	concerned 107:7 146:22	consideration 163:1	149:9
18	110:19 121:4	42:16 136:10	concerns 66:17 116:22	considered 92:4, 15 93:16	conversations 91:21
close 121:4	158:7 170:8	community- based 25:8	concert 166:11	171:3	cool 97:17
closely 123:10	Commerce 130:25	44:16	conciliation 58:7	consist 20:6	cooperate 135:24
145:5	Commission 20:8, 9 23:3, 5,	44:22	concluded 172:9	Consortium 102:13	cooperating 119:1
closer 50:12	7, 16, 18 24:11,	company 122:15	concludes 26:17 170:12	Constituent 57:4	correct 100:23
CLS 46:1	16, 18 25:12,	comparable 165:8	171:6		173:1
48:13	20 26:2, 8, 17,	compelled 16:2			
Coalition 108:19, 22	21 27:2, 7, 17,	compensated 142:24			
code 93:5	23, 24 28:4, 12				
100:4 140:19	29:5, 24 39:4,				
code's 8:21	12 40:15 41:1,				
codify 113:7	25 43:7, 17				
122:21	44:1, 19 57:17				
collaborating 26:25	58:3 111:4				
colleagues 3:9,	132:11 134:10,				
18 4:7, 13	14 137:18				
30:15	145:6, 14				
collect 165:1					
collecting 164:25					

3/20/2023

correlation 135:2	77:11 81:16 82:20 83:1, 6, 10, 11 84:12, 18, 21 89:18 90:4, 8 98:17 99:3, 4, 7, 14 100:12 101:10, 11, 13 102:2, 4 103:25 110:11, 22 111:6, 10, 20 123:7 124:5 131:14 132:1 137:12 138:1 143:15 147:17 148:10 149:11 150:4, 7 153:17 155:24 156:16 157:21 158:8 159:5, 19 160:11 161:1, 5, 15, 19, 22 162:6, 19 165:13 166:17 168:5, 20, 22, 23, 24 170:3, 5, 11, 18 171:5 172:1, 5	121:5, 12, 13, 16, 17 122:7, 16, 24 146:1 criminal 145:25 crisis 5:17 13:20 16:23 19:9 41:12 56:5 74:16 126:9 130:13 154:19 166:5 criteria 94:1, 10 critical 59:16, 18 116:20 121:9 124:17 125:22 131:9 171:12 crystallized 12:4 curate 96:5 current 2:8 47:12 50:5 71:6 87:19 92:25 96:16 119:23 currently 2:4, 9 14:1 16:9 24:7 35:17 49:21 50:22 90:17 92:24 97:9 115:23 129:16 158:12 162:9 cursive 65:24 CURTIS 1:1 cut 39:25 63:9 Cydnea 2:23 Cynthia 65:21 < D > D.C 40:18 Daily 2:18 31:4 129:10 137:15 damage 116:8 165:7 damages 116:1 117:4 128:7 134:15 damn 73:1 dangerous 106:17 data 33:3, 6 68:4 114:14 database 100:19 date 140:13	daughter 54:23 56:10 David 71:19 72:6 day 45:16 51:25 58:15 61:24 66:21 86:21 104:7, 8 131:16 153:23 171:25 172:2, 4 days 26:12, 15 27:24 28:1, 6 41:19 55:23 87:22 113:22, 25 140:14 142:23 160:22 day-to 86:20 DBHIDS 130:24 deal 61:17, 21 78:6, 22 dealing 43:8 105:11 death 73:16 decade 118:3 decent 93:2 120:7 123:2 decide 69:22 decision 112:18, 21, 22 121:15 decisions 28:14 decline 145:20 declines 114:19 declining 69:1 167:14 dedicated 124:22 130:18 deem 95:25 deeply 9:6 defined 20:2 definitely 16:17 151:7 definitive 69:1 degree 55:13 dehumanized 17:10 dehumanizing 15:6 demographic 94:3, 6 96:1 Demonstration 151:15 denial 70:22 denials 121:10 denied 14:13 26:23 92:20	93:12 100:8 134:7 Department 19:20 dependents 20:16 depending 100:3 depends 143:24 deposit 165:21 deposits 30:24 37:15 117:3 depressing 81:12 describe 138:2, 14 described 154:20 deserve 12:16 49:25 50:20 deserves 12:13 62:18 designed 7:10 8:2 115:25 desirable 118:16 140:6 desire 48:14 133:8, 9 despite 22:3 26:24 33:20 134:4 135:1 detail 71:24 detailed 39:3 47:20 detector 143:3 determination 155:8 determinations 154:2 determined 141:14 detrimental 87:1 devastating 102:22 developing 130:17 DEVELOPME NT 1:1 5:2, 9 11:11 19:21 130:22 132:8 171:8 172:8 DHS 130:25 die 108:14 dies 76:24 difference 152:23 153:10	different 40:22 44:14 45:2 94:11 96:13 101:5, 6 152:12 169:21 differentiate 121:10 differently 21:4 54:5 89:2 133:18 difficult 32:7 48:6, 8 50:2 122:5 difficulties 37:24 Dionna 49:8 59:23 60:4 77:14, 19 dire 8:4 Direct 8:10 9:7 83:20 94:14 104:23, 24 134:2 173:22 directly 46:10 47:11 93:12 103:4 108:25 109:21 145:2 Director 57:5 67:9 83:16 102:11 124:11 125:17 129:25 132:10 disabilities 31:7 72:21 83:23 85:7 86:14, 19 87:2 144:11 disability 10:20 84:5 85:3 86:15 disabled 73:6 74:14 83:18, 19 disadvantage 88:6 disadvantaged 159:17 disagree 170:3, 4 disappointed 21:20 discouraging 165:19 discretion 87:6 discriminate 76:23 discriminated 88:9
-----------------------------	---	---	--	--	---

3/20/2023

discriminating 48:3 discrimination 5:11, 16 6:24 7:1 10:11, 16 13:4, 21 14:8, 16, 22 15:15 16:20 17:6 19:3 20:1 21:9, 13 22:22 23:1, 5, 9, 15, 20 26:1, 20 27:1 29:2 32:1 34:11 41:11 43:9, 14 46:6 56:12 57:2 58:13, 25 59:6 70:18 71:2 85:12, 24 88:8 89:10, 22 92:23 93:19 98:15 100:10 103:12 112:16 121:2 125:3, 4, 20 132:23 133:3 134:13, 17, 21 135:3, 10 136:20 137:4 145:9, 17 146:5 156:6 158:11 159:21 169:12 discriminatory 13:6 25:19, 24 97:5 136:23 137:3 discuss 6:23 discussion 115:21 169:1 171:12 disease 104:18 disheartening 144:5, 12 146:15 151:3 dismissed 26:22 27:2 57:23 disparate 159:1 displacement 136:25 display 158:14 displayed 3:5 displaying 135:15 disproportionat ely 10:12 136:24	disregarded 70:13 dissuade 158:24 dissuaded 61:20 distinction 88:3 89:11 149:7 distressed 135:6 District 10:24 130:25 diversity 118:19 136:19 divided 81:7 doctor 72:23 document 67:24 99:11 100:2 140:24 documents 34:17 dodging 61:13 doing 39:16 40:10 63:16 150:14 158:24 165:22 166:3 168:18 dollar 64:20 dollars 11:21 Dolores 49:7, 11, 20 53:19 Dominique 18:12 29:12, 21 38:17 door 162:25 doors 30:18 double 157:17 download 161:11 dozens 134:10 draft 20:25 drawing 77:12 dream 50:15 dreams 157:6 DRISCOLL 1:1 4:17, 18 drop 171:15 drops 56:16 dryer 79:23 ducking 61:13 Due 2:7 30:24 84:5 85:3 88:21, 22 116:6 121:10 122:6, 16 duties 24:13 25:14	dying 76:15, 17 < E > earlier 13:23 15:9 100:18 104:2 113:10 150:9 162:2 early 104:12, 19 118:5 125:12, 15 145:8 earning 8:16 9:2 ease 35:18 easier 51:10 52:21 54:24 109:11 131:1 159:3 169:4 easily 45:4 121:13 easy 32:23 Ebonye 129:24 echo 144:16 ecstatic 157:18 educate 24:16, 18 115:3 educating 34:19 education 25:5 34:8, 15 42:18, 22 44:24, 25 45:1, 13 71:6 126:3 136:12 152:3 169:5 educational 44:2 EEOC 27:21 effect 5:15 effective 8:12 11:25 17:4 71:4 effectively 138:17 efficiencies 129:18 efficiency 155:3 effort 117:14 140:10 efforts 23:8 113:6 egress 143:5 either 42:11 68:25 95:19 115:11 elected 136:10 electronic 139:13	eligibility 55:16 eliminates 97:1 email 43:16 161:14 emailed 56:19 emergencies 37:14 emergency 2:8 16:11 22:8 33:7, 9, 13 106:10 153:3 162:12, 17 emotional 73:3 employed 55:8 56:5 employment 118:22 132:24 156:11 emulating 54:8 enables 119:11 enact 112:24 encountering 151:7 encourage 23:25 119:4 134:23 164:13 ended 55:17 72:12 75:10, 11 endless 166:2 energy 15:1, 11 enforce 23:8 24:17 27:4 39:15 59:3 137:16 enforced 58:22 enforcement 14:17 17:4 22:20, 23 23:22 28:12 39:19 42:3, 5 71:4 125:18 132:21 154:11, 14 156:20 enforcing 20:11 engage 25:21 29:3 104:25 115:1 142:8 engagement 116:4 engaging 71:1 134:1 England 49:8 54:11, 15, 16 59:21 enhance 137:6	enrollment 147:24 149:14 ensure 12:25 22:15 28:25 36:14 143:11 ensuring 71:8 entice 115:7 entire 88:8 entirely 126:25 entitled 11:23 envisioned 21:18 equal 36:11 Equality 23:12 67:9 equally 68:1 equitable 89:16 155:16 Erin 83:5 102:7, 11 110:12 erroneous 71:1 escrow 63:23 especially 58:10 79:1 86:12 89:21 90:16 103:9 125:19 164:2 essentially 34:18 67:19 establish 129:6, 23 established 4:23 establishment 169:15, 17 et 140:20 145:23 146:1 eventually 58:4 Everybody 62:18 111:12 124:10 161:23 169:2 171:10, 13 everyday 110:16 eviction 30:23 31:16, 20 83:24 evidence 57:18 58:1, 11 173:1 exact 62:11 exactly 41:2 47:20 82:16 exaggerate 141:22 examine 107:14	example 16:12 26:6, 19 27:15 40:11, 17 65:22 119:25 121:23 122:8 139:9 141:3 142:21 exceed 26:15 exceeding 142:15, 17 excellent 163:19 exchange 7:13 exchanged 69:6 excited 124:18 exclusion 148:23 exclusive 27:8 excuse 149:3 Executive 67:8 125:16 132:10 exhaustion 23:2 27:6 40:14, 19 exist 109:15 136:7 164:8 existing 71:7 154:13 exists 9:19 159:24 exiting 128:21 exorbitant 108:15 expand 144:24 expanded 126:2 153:5 expansion 39:13 expectation 6:1 expectations 98:10 expedite 154:1 expenses 117:2 expensive 51:7 103:20 experience 23:11, 21 40:6 41:5 45:25 59:11, 13 98:21 103:9 105:2 108:16 128:7 experiences 68:5 105:9 experiencing 11:12 25:16
--	--	--	--	---	--

3/20/2023

37:23 43:1 124:23 135:9 expired 60:21 expires 28:1 97:22 141:13 explain 136:13 151:19 explicit 85:13, 23 89:10 explicitly 95:1 97:12 158:18 explore 118:11 168:2 exponentially 88:22 expound 155:25 express 105:19 expressed 151:17 expression 151:2 expressly 135:13 158:18, 22 extend 97:15 extended 103:5 126:6 166:6 extending 15:7 extends 97:20 extension 97:10, 25 99:1 160:19, 25 extensions 35:12, 15 97:8 140:15 160:16 extent 78:3 127:21 139:25 extraordinaire 57:5 extremely 9:1 < F > face 14:9 31:25 35:5 70:17 102:24 128:15 faced 30:17 68:5 70:23 94:18 117:15 134:16 facilitate 136:11 facing 30:15 31:3, 24 34:6 93:18 98:15	fact 26:18 48:2 133:7, 16, 21 factor 113:18 factors 120:15 failed 171:1 fails 143:7 failure 15:17 Fair 9:11 19:24 20:11 21:1, 10 22:17 23:13 25:7, 21 27:12 28:11, 15, 16, 18 39:7 44:7 67:18 68:2, 10, 15 71:10 107:6 119:7, 9 125:18 133:1 134:2, 22 136:21 137:18 147:3 153:25 155:21 156:2 158:19 fairly 49:25 53:10 falling 68:14 false 12:21 133:11 familiar 10:17 familiarity 120:13 families 6:24 7:10 8:2, 13, 16 11:3 13:5 14:2 15:13 16:14 17:15 33:23 67:12 102:16 103:17 106:6, 13 108:5 110:2 112:8 113:11, 19 118:9, 17, 24 123:1 133:7, 24 134:6 136:25 family 10:19 12:8 41:13 48:12 54:4, 24 55:4 104:24 142:12 family- sustaining 12:12 far 108:16 132:17 fast 129:11 Fast-forward	7:24 feature 6:9, 13 February 55:19 fed 63:19, 20 federal 7:8 15:18 17:12 20:17 113:2 117:11 150:3 162:15 federally 10:18 feedback 114:23 132:19 164:9 feel 12:6 14:19 81:12 86:1 108:2 feeling 17:10 fees 30:20 fellow 6:21 felt 138:6, 8 150:19 ferretting 25:18 fictional 97:2 field 154:22 fight 105:5 fighting 128:19 figure 10:9 97:22, 23 104:5 114:13 152:1 file 23:4 27:16, 22 41:19 57:15 filed 26:7 57:21 154:3 filing 58:5 160:7 fill 9:8 fin 63:7 final 42:17 88:21 101:20 finalize 35:23 finalizing 85:14 finally 28:10 58:9 72:9 75:13 80:2 85:19 87:13 105:21 136:5 financial 57:7 94:8 96:1 financially 169:3 find 7:3 10:22 11:6, 9, 19 15:1 16:14 30:2 34:5	35:3, 8, 13 41:21 47:21 48:10 50:3 51:10 52:21 53:13, 15 54:2, 25 55:22, 25 57:11 59:12 65:9, 12 75:14 76:8 80:11, 18 86:8, 10, 23 90:14 100:22 113:19 114:2 118:25 120:7 123:1 125:21 126:13 127:8 129:5, 21 130:14 139:24 143:2, 22 151:19 160:18, 20 finding 31:6 41:15 50:25 51:25 85:25 86:2 138:10 140:2 finish 38:15 finished 38:18 first 18:9 23:4 24:17 27:22 34:7 38:23 40:24 50:8 53:17 54:18 56:18 57:22 60:21 72:5 107:9 111:15 124:12 135:11 137:22 first-class 149:3 firsthand 154:23 Fishtown 93:3 fist 74:22 five 119:19 122:12, 13 129:18 134:9 fix 75:2 129:15 fixed 84:6 85:4 flagrantly 20:22 25:2 flat-out 52:14 flew 78:17, 18 flexibility 34:25 flies 102:24 Flood 65:13 floor 72:3	focus 42:1 118:1 focused 152:14 focusing 110:14 124:16 125:9 155:3 folks 14:13 15:12 42:16 43:12 45:15 80:8 81:6 85:6 92:3 99:9 103:6 110:9 138:16 follow 22:16 27:20 44:13 45:8 66:17 82:7, 13 98:21 108:22, 23 following 2:5 24:4 34:2, 6 45:10 107:12 follows 2:7 111:16 follow-through 169:20 follow-up 95:8 106:2 foot 162:24 footing 36:11 force 156:24 forced 7:15 11:16 16:1 47:6, 15 94:19 104:8 foregoing 173:1, 19 form 16:10 23:19 68:17 161:9, 12 formerly 112:11 forms 45:2 137:4 fortunate 80:8 forward 17:23 25:25 37:7 59:15 89:15 171:17 foster 50:16, 21, 23 53:15 109:16, 20 found 2:20 32:24 55:3 58:4 60:22 62:6 75:13 79:9 80:2, 5 85:9 87:8 116:4 128:1	four 50:6 89:8 109:13 114:3 141:23 four-part 105:14 frame 160:21 Frankford 49:22 frankly 108:2 109:17 122:18 154:17 fraught 56:12 free 15:20, 21 30:5 freedom 12:16 73:18 frequently 31:3 139:15 friend 95:4, 6 163:15 frustrating 86:13 frustration 32:14 105:20 frustrations 66:7 fueled 98:20 full 27:8 full-page 140:23 fully 12:23 14:15 38:15 55:8 173:1 function 107:25 functioning 56:6 72:22 73:21 functions 108:1 fund 87:17 104:25 115:17, 20, 23 116:19 128:6 153:9 funded 19:19 funding 24:10 96:3 117:11 155:19 166:12 funds 105:8 107:18 117:13 145:2 further 28:14 170:21 < G > gains 135:1 gap 9:8 142:22 165:3
--	---	---	---	---	---

3/20/2023

garnered 134:14	52:4	22 145:19	88:8 98:2	HCV 21:19	help 11:4
gas 79:16	gestured 74:17	150:7 151:14	119:19, 23, 25	112:10 113:3,	37:14 39:6
gateway 129:23 130:4	getting 50:9	153:19, 21	120:2, 4	12 114:3, 18	48:15 50:13
GAUTHIER 1:1 2:2 3:10,	64:12 73:3	154:23 157:2	125:17	115:8, 13	62:8, 9 64:3, 4,
19, 25 4:8, 14,	126:10 127:12	166:24 169:13	groupings	117:1, 6, 7	8 74:24 79:1
20 5:18 13:16	155:13 166:8	171:15	119:19	118:2, 10, 17	117:1 128:3
17:21 18:1, 7,	Ghee 111:5	Good 2:2	groups 103:11	122:3, 19	129:20 130:13
13, 19 19:11	131:22, 24	3:10, 12, 17, 19,	120:21, 23	165:8, 15	131:11 138:16
29:8, 16 37:17	132:5, 9	23, 25 4:6, 8,	145:15	167:21	139:17, 24
38:2, 6, 9, 11,	137:13 153:24	12, 14, 18, 20	grow 14:7	head 10:24	146:2 151:20,
14, 19 43:23	154:7 156:4,	6:18 18:17	guess 43:5	81:9 106:23	21 165:24
45:22 48:23	22 158:17	29:14, 17, 24	61:18, 19	heads 55:11	166:13 171:18
49:4, 10, 15	159:9, 23	37:22 49:13,	167:11	health 2:8	helpful 43:24
53:21, 24	GILMORE	15 51:17, 24	guidance	12:11 83:22	82:6 89:24, 25
54:10 59:9, 22	1:1 3:15, 16	52:8, 11, 14, 21	50:19, 21	85:7 86:21	111:14 152:6
60:3, 6, 12	give 11:16	54:3 67:6	guide 141:6, 7	102:15 103:4,	153:13 158:20
63:5, 11 66:4,	14:5 61:2	72:23 82:9	guidelines	21 108:12	helping 63:3
15, 22 67:3	73:1 75:3, 4	83:9, 11 110:7	113:17	healthy 8:8	123:11 129:4
71:15 72:2	81:15 105:3, 6	111:10, 25	guise 122:19	14:6 17:18	139:22 144:14
76:4, 16, 21	127:3 133:11	124:9 132:5	gun 81:22	hear 5:19	152:18
77:11 81:16	153:7 163:1	140:14 161:22	guys 80:19	18:17 38:4, 12	Hersh 111:2, 7,
82:20 83:1, 6,	given 8:14	163:15 168:19	81:11 110:6	41:9 54:1	9, 12 124:6, 9,
10, 11 84:12,	33:13	goods 12:11	< H >	63:6, 12, 15	10 131:15
18, 21 89:18	gives 48:9	GoSection8	habitability	107:10 108:24	143:18 150:8,
90:4, 8 98:17	88:6 103:15	139:13	87:18 143:13	125:24 131:25	25 162:5, 8
99:4, 14 102:4	Giving 11:20,	gotten 162:14	habitable 93:2	144:5 145:19	hesitant 116:5
103:25 110:11,	21 152:15, 19	164:9	95:25 168:4	153:15	hey 63:24
22 111:6, 10,	glad 29:3	government	half 11:24	heard 14:11	97:12
20, 25 123:7	125:24	7:8, 21 8:18	hand 92:14	15:9 20:24	Hi 29:14, 16,
124:5, 14	glitch 58:19	9:5 15:17, 18	handling	40:5 42:15	20 60:12, 16
131:14 132:1,	go 4:5 14:6	17:12 162:15	155:14	43:25 82:2	90:7, 8 102:10
6 137:12	28:24 40:21	government-	hands 139:19	85:15 86:6, 24	111:9, 12
138:1 143:15	45:20 53:5	subsidized	hands-on	101:17 103:1,	high 30:19, 23
147:17 148:10	58:6 61:23	10:25	127:8 138:3	23 138:5	72:21 73:20
149:11 150:4,	64:19 73:12,	grace 97:17	happen 75:1	143:17 144:10,	103:9 109:25
7 153:17	14, 19 84:19	grand 50:18	150:16 161:7	17 147:11, 13	114:7 139:16
155:24 156:16	111:19 124:1	grandchildren	happened	150:16, 24	higher 9:20
157:21 161:19	126:15 129:11	50:17	58:14 82:16	165:4 169:7	17:11 51:9
168:20, 24	142:25 145:2	grant 104:24	happening	hearing 2:7,	81:3 88:25
170:5, 11, 18	154:21 160:1	granting	80:15	17 4:24, 25	103:10 108:16
171:5	161:25 164:16	160:16	happens 15:9	5:23, 24 13:17	119:12, 24
gender 10:19	goal 136:21	grateful 9:18	58:15 89:22	17:22 28:14	120:4, 5, 9
58:23	goals 24:9	81:10	101:22	29:7 37:17	164:3
generous 108:3	goes 10:9	Gray 76:5	happy 78:1	80:20 98:23	higher-
gentleman	22:24 71:24,	104:1	92:10 111:19	99:8 102:21	opportunity
61:16 81:13	25 138:13	Gray's 86:24	149:22 157:10,	124:16 132:14	119:4
144:10	142:3 146:18,	Great 18:8	14, 16	144:1 170:25	highest 21:6
gentrification	21 164:22	50:17 66:21	hard 51:1	171:6, 13, 16	119:20
96:19	going 11:13	82:19 126:4	52:2, 18 53:17	hearings 2:12,	highlighting
gentrifying	36:5 40:1	151:1 157:19	54:2 79:7	15, 20 5:10	81:20
56:3	41:10 44:15	168:1 171:25	80:11 108:11	heart 104:18	highly 103:20
geographic	56:10 71:21,	172:2, 4	130:15 143:19	heartbreaking	high-quality
139:1 140:4	22, 23 72:17	Greater 67:15	150:18 161:6	12:2 151:4	8:3 12:13
Germantown	73:15 74:3, 15	greedy 157:3,	162:21 168:14	HECP 67:10,	history 31:16
50:11 51:4	87:20 88:10	22, 25	harms 136:20	17 68:6, 11	32:6 93:21
	91:9 94:23	ground 31:22	harsh 74:21	held 98:6	122:8
	101:18 103:2	88:14 153:2	77:7	159:16	hold 74:7, 15
	109:6 124:1	group 72:18	haystack 86:2	Hello 38:3	88:4
	125:25 127:16,	73:18 75:16		60:11 63:4	

3/20/2023

Holden 65:8 66:10 111:3 holder 89:12 holders 11:18 15:4 30:13 68:23 70:17 71:9 88:4 97:4, 8 120:13 128:13 162:11 holding 5:12 29:6 56:25 57:19 71:9 94:3 124:15 holds 90:17 home 8:9 12:14 16:15, 18 17:19 55:16 57:8 72:19 73:18 75:16 78:6 79:15, 18 102:15 103:16 128:17 148:21 149:2, 3 HOMELESS 1:1 5:2, 9 25:9 44:18 56:10 106:12 111:1 117:19 124:12 126:18 171:9 172:9 homelessness 5:15 96:4 98:16 103:19 104:17, 20 108:16 109:21 124:23 128:21 130:14 131:17 132:9 151:15 homes 8:3, 13 14:3, 6 53:2 79:14 108:19 homeseekers 67:25 honestly 72:11 74:1 167:18 honored 157:5 HOP 118:5, 7 hope 12:22 43:16, 21 48:9 80:20 171:24 hopeful 166:16 hopefully 163:13 hoping 36:23 hospitals 76:13 host 50:23 103:20 116:14 hostile 7:5	hosting 37:17 90:14 102:20 Hot 62:3 hour 2:22 104:9 hours 15:4 72:24 house 22:6 55:18 79:22 80:2 90:18 109:14 household 109:7 113:13, 15 121:18 142:13 households 5:11 7:13, 25 8:6, 25 10:13 21:22, 25 30:11 33:16, 18 126:23 138:4 household's 121:20 houses 73:10 74:12 78:14 79:24 113:20 HOUSING 1:1 5:1, 8, 17 6:21, 25 7:4, 9, 16 8:15, 22 9:6 11:1, 7 12:16, 20, 22 13:6, 20, 25 14:10 15:19, 22 16:11, 23 19:6, 9, 17, 20, 23 20:5 21:1, 5, 11, 13, 21, 25 22:9, 17 23:12, 14 24:19 25:7, 16, 21 28:11, 16, 18 29:1, 23 30:9, 12, 19 31:6 32:3, 16, 20 33:7, 9, 13 35:4 36:21 37:4, 12, 13 42:14 44:8, 23 47:3 48:10, 16, 22 50:3 51:10 52:23 54:3, 20, 25 55:2, 12, 22 56:11 57:12 58:21 59:12 62:21, 22 67:9, 14, 18, 19, 21 68:1, 3, 9, 13, 14, 16, 25	69:14, 17 70:1, 20 71:9, 11 74:16 75:23 76:9, 10, 14 79:13 81:22 82:4 83:17 84:4, 8 85:8 86:1, 17, 23 87:7 93:4 96:22 98:14 100:22 103:5, 10, 18 104:16 105:14, 23 106:10, 18 108:6, 21 109:13 112:4, 7, 9, 16 113:2 117:15 118:3, 8, 11, 19 119:1 120:7 121:8 123:3, 24 125:18 126:8, 21 128:12, 24 129:1, 2, 3 130:13 132:7, 25 133:5, 6, 25 134:24 135:13, 23 136:1, 21 137:16, 18 138:20, 22 141:6 144:8 145:3, 4, 9, 17 146:5 147:3, 11 152:12, 16, 19 153:3, 25 155:21 156:2, 10 157:23 158:1 159:21 162:10, 12, 18 166:5 167:4 169:23 171:8, 19 172:7 hovering 164:4 HQS 142:4, 6 143:13 HUD 33:2, 6, 11 37:1 118:7 166:11 HUD-required 143:12 HUD's 119:6 HUD-specific 98:7 huge 14:25 125:6 hugely 152:5 Human 20:8 39:3 57:17	76:20 111:4 132:11 155:23 humble 157:4 hundreds 11:21 hurtful 52:16 < I > idea 40:12 126:10 149:19 159:6 ideal 57:21 ideas 40:9 126:4 150:22 153:14 identifies 160:4 identify 36:3 37:9 identity 58:23 ignore 94:16 ignored 28:21 95:4, 10 illegal 13:3 14:17 56:24 139:2 illegible 65:4, 25 illness 72:22 illuminating 29:11 image 3:5 imagine 16:22 immediately 30:24 95:7 101:1 159:16 impact 76:8 121:20 122:23 136:24 impacted 25:10 96:18 135:21 impacts 110:15 implemented 115:5 120:18 implementing 7:8 31:21 116:19 implications 103:5 implicit 85:13, 22 88:7 89:10 importance 121:4 important 29:7 33:25 34:14 35:6 41:18 64:16 71:12, 17 117:9 121:13	126:16 127:9, 11 141:4 149:8 168:15, 25 impractical 26:13 improve 35:25 108:12 improving 122:25 inability 76:9 inaudible 38:7, 21 39:15 79:22 incentive 117:16 142:18 144:23 163:22 165:20 incentives 115:6, 10, 13 117:7 152:24 153:1, 5 incentivize 163:10, 11 include 20:13 33:6 45:7 98:2 115:14 included 2:16 includes 20:3 85:16 including 9:16 20:4, 16 22:23 32:12 37:11 118:18 120:10 133:4 148:23 income 8:6, 17 9:1, 3, 16, 23 11:25 20:2, 4, 13 21:3, 9, 12 22:22 23:1, 9, 15 24:22 27:5 30:20 32:4, 9 43:8 55:14 57:1 59:6 62:20 63:1, 2 68:8 70:4, 5, 12 71:3 84:6 85:11, 23 92:4, 15, 18, 20, 22 100:6, 8, 9 112:20 113:10, 15 121:3, 11 122:21 125:2 133:4, 22 134:14, 17 135:3, 9 136:20 149:10 156:7, 25	158:11 incomes 85:4 inconclusive 68:24 inconsistencies 129:14 increase 24:10 34:21 96:3 118:2 163:25 increased 21:11 36:21 47:1 118:21 120:16 135:4 increases 37:3 increasing 88:22 155:10 increasingly 12:3 incredible 165:16 incredibly 112:13 146:12 incurring 165:16 indefinite 73:7 indicate 3:1 indicated 70:2 indicates 33:8 indicating 140:22 indicators 104:18 individual 20:14 98:24 individualized 31:17 individually 69:22 individuals 6:25 21:8 23:12 26:5 67:12 83:21 informally 108:5 information 29:2 34:18 36:24 45:4, 7 69:5 82:8 100:20 129:15 133:12 146:4 150:12 152:4 155:7 informational 89:20 informative 132:18 infrastructure 154:13 initiate 154:23
---	--	---	---	--	---

3/20/2023

initiated 132:15	interesting 149:19 169:1	164:14 168:3, 16 171:15	June 58:9 166:6	18, 23 59:16 62:19, 23 63:9,	112:6 114:19 127:20 129:8,
initiative 117:12 118:8 119:3	intergeneration al 104:22	issued 22:12 32:20 105:14 141:11	jurisdiction 27:9 160:9	15, 16, 17, 25 65:8 66:11 74:4, 11, 20	23, 25 130:1, 4 136:14 142:4, 6, 8, 23 144:23
initiatives 165:25 166:13	interprets 20:12	issues 26:18 30:1 31:2, 11 34:6 35:15	jurisdictions 9:22 22:21 27:14 40:6, 10 42:20	75:10 76:5 78:1, 2 79:20 80:9 81:4	146:16, 20 151:21 152:24 164:24 165:10,
injustice 13:8	interruption 84:11	37:19 43:7 46:15 87:19 89:15 108:21	justice 58:16 157:23	82:6 89:20 91:8 95:12 97:12, 16	15, 19 167:1, 6, 13 169:8
innovative 125:14	intervene 11:14	109:1 145:4 151:6 165:4 166:15	< K > KATHERINE 1:1	98:20 99:9, 20 101:4 107:9 109:2, 8	landlords 9:10, 14 10:2, 7 13:7 14:18 15:24 22:16
inquire 68:12	introduced 115:9	issuing 135:15	Keel 83:5 90:5, 7, 12 99:2, 22, 23 100:14, 24	116:16 118:16 121:15, 19 123:19 128:14 129:13 136:18	31:15 32:14 34:9, 16, 19 35:19, 22 36:2, 16 37:9 42:13
Inquirer 2:18	introduction 141:12	iteration 118:5 its 16:10 24:8, 12 25:14 26:10 29:1 32:17 34:15, 16 67:17 115:4 116:10, 11 118:7 119:17 128:15 136:19 145:1, 6 154:1	keep 8:2 14:2, 3 114:14 129:12 168:18 Kelvin 65:11 66:11 111:2, 14, 22 112:2 128:5 137:23 160:14 163:15, 16 166:18 Kelvin's 151:2 KENDRA 1:1 157:24 Kensington 93:3 kept 7:2 key 23:7 Kia 111:5 131:22 132:9 153:19 158:10 168:13 Kim 49:8 60:9 Kimberly 60:17 kind 44:23 78:5 80:3 95:10 98:8 101:3 103:12 128:5, 18 138:7 145:15 146:3 150:19 kinds 156:5 know 10:1 15:15 19:8, 15 20:21 22:8 32:22 39:1 40:4 41:1 42:19 43:5 45:19 46:10 47:9 48:7, 13 55:15 56:15,	139:11 140:18 141:10 143:6, 24 144:12 147:9, 16 148:11 152:24 157:12, 23 158:3, 9, 22 159:15 162:12 163:3, 16 166:17 167:7 169:24 171:14 knowledge 46:13 known 54:19 63:14 83:19 112:11 136:19 knows 112:17 Kyle 65:13	152:24 22:16 31:15 32:14 34:9, 16, 19 35:19, 22 36:2, 16 37:9 42:13 43:3 44:3, 11, 21 48:2 52:14 53:10 56:22 59:4 60:25 61:9 70:14 74:24 78:7, 10, 15 87:25 88:20 91:5, 12, 15, 21 93:24 94:12 96:6, 8 103:15 105:1, 6, 16, 17 107:11 109:8 112:25 113:8 114:11, 15 115:2, 7, 11, 24 116:5, 18 117:8, 18, 20, 23 120:11 121:6 122:2 128:3, 10 129:17 130:19 134:11, 19 139:5, 11, 16 145:20 146:7, 12, 23 150:11 158:12, 21 159:12 162:3 163:5, 12 164:2 165:5 169:4
inquiry 56:1	invested 88:12	< J > jail 73:12 jails 76:13 JAMIE 1:1 90:13 99:3 Jeremiah 65:11 66:11 111:3, 24 112:2 123:8 124:4 137:23, 25 138:18 144:2 148:2 160:22 161:4, 8 163:18 165:14 167:18 170:2 Jesse 83:5 90:5 98:18 99:23 100:14 108:23 job 32:6 55:7, 8 107:20, 21, 23 119:15 jobs 12:12 join 108:22 joined 115:11 joining 17:24 82:21 111:23 JONES 1:1 3:7, 8, 12 112:1 JR 1:1	Keel 83:5 90:5, 7, 12 99:2, 22, 23 100:14, 24 keep 8:2 14:2, 3 114:14 129:12 168:18 Kelvin 65:11 66:11 111:2, 14, 22 112:2 128:5 137:23 160:14 163:15, 16 166:18 Kelvin's 151:2 KENDRA 1:1 157:24 Kensington 93:3 kept 7:2 key 23:7 Kia 111:5 131:22 132:9 153:19 158:10 168:13 Kim 49:8 60:9 Kimberly 60:17 kind 44:23 78:5 80:3 95:10 98:8 101:3 103:12 128:5, 18 138:7 145:15 146:3 150:19 kinds 156:5 know 10:1 15:15 19:8, 15 20:21 22:8 32:22 39:1 40:4 41:1 42:19 43:5 45:19 46:10 47:9 48:7, 13 55:15 56:15,	112:6 114:19 127:20 129:8, 23, 25 130:1, 4 136:14 142:4, 6, 8, 23 144:23 146:16, 20 151:21 152:24 164:24 165:10, 15, 19 167:1, 6, 13 169:8 landlords 9:10, 14 10:2, 7 13:7 14:18 15:24 22:16 31:15 32:14 34:9, 16, 19 35:19, 22 36:2, 16 37:9 42:13 43:3 44:3, 11, 21 48:2 52:14 53:10 56:22 59:4 60:25 61:9 70:14 74:24 78:7, 10, 15 87:25 88:20 91:5, 12, 15, 21 93:24 94:12 96:6, 8 103:15 105:1, 6, 16, 17 107:11 109:8 112:25 113:8 114:11, 15 115:2, 7, 11, 24 116:5, 18 117:8, 18, 20, 23 120:11 121:6 122:2 128:3, 10 129:17 130:19 134:11, 19 139:5, 11, 16 145:20 146:7, 12, 23 150:11 158:12, 21 159:12 162:3 163:5, 12 164:2 165:5 169:4 landlord's 57:7 language 20:6 135:17 158:15 159:3, 15, 18 160:6 languished 58:3 large 15:23, 25 22:6 23:23 28:24	
insecurely 58:18	investigate 24:16 25:14 26:3 27:25				
insecurity 103:6, 10, 18 104:16	investigated 79:10 145:10				
insight 23:16 41:2	investigates 27:9				
inspect 167:24	investigating 43:17 132:22				
inspection 85:18 87:14, 25 88:16 98:9 105:25 106:2 133:15 136:4 141:15 142:6 143:1, 7 164:18, 19 166:20, 23 167:3, 16, 23 168:7	investigation 26:12, 14, 16 28:5, 8 37:18 42:8 82:10, 17 155:5, 11 160:1				
inspections 36:6 98:5 142:5 167:10	investigations 26:10 41:6 154:1 155:1				
instability 25:16	investigative 156:20				
Instructions 2:13	investigators 79:8 155:19 156:5, 12 157:15, 17				
instrumental 31:12	investments 82:3				
insurance 31:1	invited 5:21				
integrated 21:17	inviting 50:1				
Intelligencer 2:19	involved 74:7 141:17 143:9				
intended 113:4 165:2	iron 74:22				
intentional 144:19	issuance 35:1 114:4 139:23 147:1, 4				
interactions 94:14	issue 12:5 13:19 19:3 46:11 47:13 71:13 76:14 90:1 98:24 102:23 106:5 110:15 122:18 124:17 125:8 131:10 140:12 143:5 158:14				
Interest 18:25 38:25 57:15 112:14					
interested 108:20 128:16 143:25 162:16					

3/20/2023

largely 7:2 21:15 88:21	126:10, 15 151:22 158:12	little 8:1 56:23 71:25	longer 7:14 13:3 47:1	low-income 7:6, 10 8:2, 13	116:9, 15, 17
largest 19:16 112:6	legislation 6:17 112:24	74:20 103:3	87:10 110:2, 4	19:4 21:15	119:7, 10
Lastly 36:13 88:15 97:25	135:12 148:7	114:23	long-term 103:20 104:22	30:7, 17 62:21,	121:22 142:2
122:20	159:6 160:3	livable 51:22	look 12:17	22 83:21	163:21 164:23
late 97:13, 14	lengthy 32:5	79:14	17:22 32:18	112:8 123:1	165:6
laudable 24:9	lesser 12:6	live 7:4 11:20	37:7 39:12, 22	low-poverty 10:10	marketing 117:18
law 2:4 11:23	letting 98:12	17:13 21:22	40:16 44:5		markets 36:10
15:2 18:25	level 94:12	22:1 41:15, 22	50:10 51:11	< M >	79:17
20:20 23:8, 10	120:1 122:22	50:10 51:23	61:22 73:5	ma'am 49:13,	market's 121:14
25:4 27:15	levels 119:12,	64:22 72:7	94:10 126:15	19 54:9	match 96:16
28:16 38:25	23 140:9	75:15 81:4	150:1 168:10	Madam 3:9,	matches 36:9
40:7 43:4	liberally 140:16	84:6 94:20	looking 16:3	17 4:6 111:13	matching 154:19
44:12, 13 45:7,	license 147:1,	109:3, 7 110:1	21:5 33:17, 19	115:22 120:16	maternal 102:14 108:12
8, 10, 18, 20	5 148:1	120:23 126:13	37:13 43:1	138:19	matrix 58:19
57:15 59:5	149:15	127:5 133:7	48:22 78:11	MAGA 72:25	matter 173:1
109:22 125:5	lie 62:7	liveable 55:14	87:10 88:13	magnitude 136:6, 17	matters 45:18
136:15 141:18	lied 63:18	lived 50:5	89:15 126:9	154:19	64:21
168:2	life 72:9 73:9,	52:19, 20	144:7 156:12	mail 106:24	maximum 120:1
lawful 20:3,	16 118:16, 18	54:20 77:23	looks 45:8	main 67:16	mean 46:14
13 71:3	137:1 145:9	lives 41:23	140:21 142:3	major 13:22	64:23 72:23
laws 9:23	life-saving 14:10	76:10 110:16	156:24	46:15 121:22	73:11 75:24
22:17 58:23	life-shattering 12:1	living 12:9	lose 35:9 80:5	156:9	77:7 154:3
68:3 150:2, 3	light 8:4 35:4	49:21 55:1	losing 33:15	majority 114:1	meaning 23:3
lawyer 16:7	131:9	56:7 58:17	164:21	making 62:21	73:8
17:9	limb 80:4	72:18 83:21	Loss 128:5	107:17 123:21	meaningfully 36:18
lay 55:11	limitation 149:5	86:13, 15, 18	153:8	135:14, 22	means 11:16,
LCD 83:19	limitations 41:17 88:24	87:2 109:13	lost 103:24	163:5	21 17:2, 7, 11,
84:3 87:7	148:22 152:8,	Liz 111:1	lot 43:11 44:9	man 72:11	15 24:21
89:13	9 157:24	124:10 147:9	45:1 47:19, 22	management 44:22 93:10,	33:12 40:19
LCD's 85:2	limited 20:4,	161:24, 25	48:5, 6, 7	24 94:15	48:19 86:16
lead 136:25	16 24:8 40:8	loan 75:3	71:24 72:14	95:13 122:15	110:3 164:24
leads 70:23	70:19 94:19	local 7:16	78:9, 14, 21	manager 67:23 97:11	173:21
leaking 79:16	limits 17:11	9:11 10:5	79:1 80:8	100:1 130:10,	meant 78:3
learn 25:3	86:25 88:17	19:24 20:17	81:3 91:20	11 139:21	measure 32:19
learning 17:23	152:14	25:22 39:18	103:1 104:14	152:10	measured 33:1
108:20 128:16	line 27:13	localities 39:16, 21	105:19 106:16,	managers 70:14 129:3	media 24:21
162:17	36:15	locally 19:22	21 108:9	130:6 131:3	median 9:3
lease 32:21	linked 86:5	located 21:15	109:2 111:15	152:19	medical 20:18
36:18 55:22	list 14:20	122:8	140:9 143:8	mandate 24:15	meet 32:4
85:14, 20	52:25 62:6	locates 87:3	144:13 145:11	mandatory 73:11	92:25 98:9
102:1 133:24	79:24 103:13	locating 85:17	146:13 150:17	manner 26:4	105:17 107:18
143:11	listed 79:13	location 1:1	157:19 160:10	mar 15:20	meeting 2:10
leased 33:11	86:9 101:20	47:25 95:21	167:20	March 1:1	5:22 6:2
114:3 124:25	listen 53:8	139:1 140:19	lots 110:7	MARK 1:1	meetings 45:3
leasing 35:19,	listened 81:11	locations 95:18 140:5, 6	147:21	marked 163:25	meets 143:12
25 36:8	listening 6:22	locked 22:5	loudly 63:12	market 7:4, 12	Megan's 125:5
leave 17:9	66:16	log 37:25	love 50:19, 21	8:1 15:21	member 49:23
66:2	listing 120:20	35:22 50:23	144:24 145:5,	22:6 36:17	Members 2:25
leaving 75:24	listings 42:12	58:10 88:2	12 153:15	46:25 68:15	6:5, 10, 22
led 129:23	lists 139:10	107:24 153:21	165:24	79:19 87:20,	13:11 18:3
left 78:5	literally 73:16	158:4	low 9:1 62:20	23 92:25 93:7,	49:2 82:22
Legal 2:19	79:4, 15 92:5		63:1, 2 114:7	17 96:16, 17	110:19 112:1
10:4 29:22			122:16		124:14 132:7
30:4, 6 83:17,			lower 8:5, 16		
18, 20 102:24			9:21 119:14		
			137:1		
			lowest 140:8		

3/20/2023

149:23 158:5 170:9, 22 171:22 mental 72:22 83:22 85:7 86:14 mention 94:16 mentioned 19:12 46:18 92:7, 16 93:11 100:5 101:14 113:10 114:5, 10 127:12 128:5 129:6 166:4 mercy 54:21 message 43:15 met 97:15 98:14 metaphorical 30:17 MICHAEL 1:1 Microsoft 2:11 6:9 Microsoft® 1:1 midst 13:19 miles 11:8 million 117:7 144:21 millionaire 77:3 millions 75:22 mind 94:24 minimum 30:20 minor 135:24 minority 136:24 minute 141:10 minutes 104:10 115:19 misconceptions 32:15 misleading 133:12 mission 137:2 mixed-income 8:22 mobility 31:11 62:3 118:7, 8 model 27:20 mom 75:11 169:18 moment 7:17 41:12 147:10 momentary 58:19 Monday 1:1	monetary 115:10 money 16:18 63:24 81:7 105:4, 6, 12 153:1, 8 164:21 monies 144:25 month 7:22 11:22 73:22 106:1 months 16:3 26:9 33:20 72:10 85:16 105:21 114:4 120:21 155:2 mother 54:16 move 11:8 42:5 43:18 47:7, 15, 24 50:7, 11 53:6 59:14 118:11, 25 171:17 moved 77:20, 22 moves 119:4 165:18 moving 17:25 35:5 141:6 much-needed 13:18 multiple 11:8 86:6 102:16 105:10 mute 4:6 84:19 mystery 67:20 < N > name 3:2 18:20, 23 29:18, 21 31:1 49:17, 20 54:13, 15 59:24 60:13, 16 65:4, 19, 23 67:4, 7 72:4 77:16, 18 83:12 90:9 102:8, 10 111:8 124:6 132:2 140:25 143:6 171:1 name-drop 94:23 names 127:4 name's 72:6 National 102:13	nationally 33:4 118:6 Nations 74:7 nationwide 32:25 natural 10:19 nature 61:8 164:15 navigate 91:14 109:9 139:17, 18 146:3 navigating 16:5 navigational 130:20 navigators 129:1, 2 152:17 nearby 118:20 nearest 79:19 nearly 16:13 21:2 22:11 50:6 165:7 necessarily 46:12 104:15 necessary 37:2 48:19 137:20 need 9:7 12:24 16:17, 22 17:1 35:3, 11, 14 39:14 41:22, 25 44:11, 23 50:9, 14, 19, 24 53:15 58:21 63:25 64:4, 10, 18, 22 73:4, 10, 12 74:2, 7, 11, 21, 23 75:21, 22 76:2 77:5 78:25 80:16 82:2 91:3 96:9 101:24 106:10 107:1, 14 126:12 141:10 144:15 148:7 154:1, 5 155:18, 19 157:13 164:12 needed 39:18 42:4 47:11 55:22 76:2 78:25 80:14 138:7, 9 154:10 needing 47:22 needle 86:2 needs 53:7 57:7 74:18	75:7 96:17 104:22 107:19 116:14 120:24 123:23 150:15 needy 74:12 negative 105:9 164:9 negotiate 151:20 negotiated 101:25 134:18 negotiating 85:19 93:14 negotiation 101:22 NEIGHBORH OOD 1:1 5:1, 8 7:19 8:23 12:14 72:18 119:16 120:3 132:8 171:8 172:8 neighborhoods 10:10 12:9 16:2 17:13 19:7 21:16, 18, 23 22:1 37:5 51:20 114:7 115:16 118:19 119:2 133:8 134:8 135:4, 6 136:22 140:20 164:3, 5 neighbors 12:20 net 117:2 165:20 never 60:22 105:12 107:8 121:17 147:11, 12 157:6 new 7:9 8:17, 19 16:22 40:17 47:25 48:22 93:4 115:9 117:5, 20 120:19 162:14 newly 106:11 115:11 News 2:18 nice 53:3 54:12 night 55:11 104:6 nondiscriminat ory 67:13	nonemployment 70:3 nonmarket 116:14 nonprofit 30:5 nonrepresentati ve 70:9 nonvoucher 89:12 nope 56:20 normal 116:2 North 52:19 53:2, 6 54:6 Northeast 72:7 Notary 173:13 note 2:22 6:7 117:9 141:5 noted 74:6 173:1 notes 173:1 notice 26:14 28:3, 7 97:13 notices 2:17 November 16:13 33:15 141:7 nudge 164:13 number 34:21 41:14 42:3 55:2 56:13 70:1 80:12 100:7, 11 108:3, 4 113:22 115:5 127:10 139:6 144:4 154:17 numbers 63:21 162:1, 20 Nurse 102:12 Nurse-Led 102:13 nutshell 64:17 < O > objectives 22:18 obligation 27:4 obligations 71:11 observe 67:20 obtain 35:7 55:13 91:1 obtaining 19:5 occasion 26:19, 24 occurred 26:21 27:1	occurrences 114:24 occurring 41:11 70:10 October 120:18 Odin 95:13 offenders 125:5 offense 74:19 offer 2:14 7:11 13:10 93:12 118:15 119:11 148:12 171:2 offered 115:24 143:22 offering 6:19 office 10:20 14:12 25:9 26:7 44:18 59:17 73:1 110:25 117:19 123:10 124:11 126:18 161:9 officer 145:10 official 132:20 officials 136:10 off-script 73:14 Oh 4:4 62:20 75:6 92:8 97:16 OHS 95:12 96:6 150:10, 21 Okay 18:7, 18 38:6, 11, 14, 19 49:4 60:6 64:10 74:25 75:1, 6 84:25 92:21 95:22 100:12 101:10 102:2 110:22 124:9 138:1 150:4 160:11 161:15 168:11 170:18 old 50:9 54:23 155:6 once 26:16 48:1 51:11 52:2, 9 77:25 78:4, 16, 19 86:10 87:3, 8 89:1 94:16 126:14 159:25 ones 56:21
--	---	---	---	--	---

3/20/2023

one's 74:3 113:9 one-stop 130:5 ongoing 117:14 online 51:3 79:13 161:12 oops 170:20 open 110:8 129:7 153:19 163:13 opening 13:12 18:5 operating 145:2 opportunities 12:8 24:25 44:2 118:17 119:15 163:14 opportunity 13:11 21:17 30:1 35:10 36:11 48:17 71:13 84:1 85:11, 22 88:7 89:9 115:16 118:4, 12, 15, 22 119:13, 20 120:9 132:13 134:7 139:16 144:25 164:3 opposite 78:13 option 97:11, 24 options 51:6 94:19 order 4:24 6:11 67:20 96:7 100:21 128:20 138:15 Ordinance 9:12, 19 19:25 20:7, 12 24:23 25:15 26:11 27:7, 12 28:16, 22 34:12 39:8, 20 68:10 112:21 133:2 134:3, 23 148:19, 25 158:19 organization 23:14 30:5 91:3 organizations 21:11 25:7, 8, 22 44:8, 17 organizes 119:17	organizing 17:22 orientation 58:24 origin 10:19 outcomes 103:21, 23 outlined 47:20 outlines 140:13 141:8 outreach 115:3 116:3 117:17 146:16, 17 156:15 outright 93:25 94:15 outside 97:1 outstanding 94:8 overcome 151:12 overlooked 102:23 overstated 55:7 overwhelming 126:11 owner 114:19 115:17, 19, 22 116:19 122:9 130:10, 11 owners 13:1 44:3 55:25 69:21 107:7 115:25 116:25 120:19 130:6 131:2 133:23 150:11 164:11 owner's 116:21 122:14 < P > p.m 1:1 172:9 Pa.C.S 149:1, 5 pack 47:6 Padmission 95:3 129:7, 19 152:16 paid 7:20 14:15 52:12 88:11 89:5 117:6 127:12 painstakingly 139:4 pandemic 61:18 105:8 panel 18:9 49:1, 6 82:24 83:3 110:19,	24 137:23 158:7 170:8, 12 panelists 124:1 135:20 panels 132:16 paper 80:25 paperwork 35:2 47:19 135:25 136:3 parallel 22:19 122:20 paramount 28:11 parent 50:16, 21 parenting 103:8 parents 50:8 53:5, 14 Park 123:13 part 13:22 15:24 59:17 91:9 92:8 116:10 128:25 131:5 140:7 143:2 146:14, 19, 25 164:14 171:11 participant 32:2 139:20, 23 165:16 participants 5:25 122:19 129:21 138:25 139:5 144:6 152:18 164:5 165:8 167:20 participate 69:12, 23 113:1 114:16 115:8 116:6, 25 120:12 participated 171:21 participates 146:21 participating 91:17 117:23 118:10 139:12 167:21 participation 116:23 118:2 164:1, 13 particular 23:18 43:9 139:1 160:5 166:22 167:5	particularly 45:5 138:24 143:18 167:12 parties 42:7 partner 33:25 34:5 123:20 136:9 partnered 83:23 partnering 37:8 137:5 partners 29:6 136:10 partnership 95:15 129:9 131:19 167:9 party 151:10 passed 124:19 135:12 passes 88:16 passing 31:13 pause 38:1 166:19 pave 128:4 pay 16:19 61:24 93:6 100:3 142:13 payment 36:14, 24 68:17 105:22 107:8 119:6, 18 120:5, 17 122:7 PCHR 46:19 59:4 peers 90:18 108:17 penalties 146:8 Pennsylvania 23:13 112:6, 18 148:18, 24 149:16 people 7:6 31:6 32:12 56:6 57:11 58:15, 17 61:22 62:2, 24 63:1, 4, 19 64:1, 12 72:20 73:2, 6, 12, 15 74:22 75:7, 9, 21, 23 76:12 81:23 86:13, 18 87:2 88:5 93:18 94:3, 13, 17 96:24 98:13 101:6 103:8, 11	106:11, 17, 21 107:4, 19 108:10, 25 109:2, 11, 13, 15, 17, 19 110:1, 4, 15 124:23, 24 125:5, 7 126:8 127:23 128:20 129:5 130:13 131:21 137:20 138:6 147:8 150:17 151:9, 10, 24 152:11 153:15 156:1 159:17 160:17 161:2 162:23, 25 171:18 people's 76:10 137:16 169:23 percent 8:24 9:2 10:6, 9, 14 21:2, 21, 23, 24 22:2, 11 33:1, 2, 4, 8 68:19, 22 108:1, 3 109:18 114:2, 10 124:25 128:11, 13, 15 142:16, 17 147:15 162:9, 11, 16 percent-plus 162:2 perception 56:16 perfect 127:23 performing 86:20 period 26:12, 14 47:5 68:11 73:7 97:17 permission 37:2 permits 112:24 permitted 68:23 140:15 perpetuation 70:25 person 27:16, 22 28:2, 6 65:4, 6 75:13 76:24 77:1, 2 78:17, 19 79:18 81:8 90:16 105:23 165:6 personal 46:13 98:20	personally 94:21, 22 101:5 perspective 144:13 pervasive 19:3 PHA 11:10 17:8 33:6, 24 34:4, 13 35:24 36:1, 23 48:18 57:6 64:7, 8 86:5 88:24 93:11, 15 96:6 98:6 101:23 107:15 111:2, 17 112:5, 13 113:3, 5, 11, 24 114:9, 12, 17, 22, 25 115:1, 5, 9 116:4, 10, 24 117:6, 9, 12, 18, 21, 22 118:1, 22, 23 119:5, 11, 17 120:17, 22 121:1, 15, 17, 22 122:8, 13, 22 124:22 128:25 130:22 138:3, 21 140:11, 24 141:5 142:7, 15 145:1 153:2 165:10 PHA's 8:24 perception 10:14 33:6, 22 36:14 119:25 122:4 144:13 phases 105:10 PHDC 131:1 PHILADELPH IA 1:1 9:11 10:6 12:17 13:2, 20 16:14, 24 19:4, 8, 17, 23 20:7 21:14 22:10, 15, 25 23:24 27:19 28:19, 25 31:8, 14 32:16, 23 33:10 34:1, 3, 11, 20 40:8 49:23 50:4 51:2 52:2 57:16 60:19 62:25 67:15 68:9 70:11, 21 72:8 83:24 102:17 108:13, 14, 18 111:4
---	---	---	--	---	--

3/20/2023

112:4 115:10 118:13 122:10 123:22 125:16 132:11 136:18 149:2 166:5 Philadelphians 5:14 14:3, 23 16:17 17:2, 17 22:4 30:7 Philadelphia's 5:16 19:24 59:5 137:7 148:20 149:9 PHLCouncil.co m 2:21 phone 63:9 127:14 161:2 photos 51:18 52:10 physical 83:22 85:6 86:14 picture 42:19 pictures 80:3 piece 42:3, 5, 8, 17, 18 55:8 126:16 PILC 46:12 Pittsburgh 148:4, 13, 17, 19 Pittsburgh's 112:20 148:21 place 9:24 10:22 11:20 33:17 35:8, 13 39:19 41:15, 21 47:17 53:13 55:10 59:1 60:22 62:19 64:22 72:9, 15, 16 75:15 78:11 100:15 104:6 107:9 109:23 110:4 126:9, 13 138:10 placed 88:18 places 7:4 33:19 39:16 45:15 46:4 51:15 53:1, 3 62:24 72:14 plan 109:23 124:19 Planning 130:21 151:16 platform 90:24 played 121:22	plays 23:7 Pleas 27:19 please 2:24 3:1, 3 5:4 12:15 18:8, 20 29:17 40:3 43:22 49:5, 16 59:1 60:13 67:4 72:4 73:20 83:2, 12 90:9 108:23, 24 124:6 132:2 pleased 112:13 pleasure 111:24 plenty 51:5 52:5 point 33:21 54:22 62:4 88:1, 11 99:8 148:4 163:1 poking 168:9 policies 14:18 59:1 69:18, 19 134:20 policy 69:11 poor 169:19 population 10:14 116:11, 12 137:8 populations 8:7 portion 142:14 position 28:20 possession 46:24 possibility 149:13 167:16 possible 2:12 37:19 42:6 98:22 127:21 149:16 155:15 postings 42:12 potential 96:8 121:2 potentially 40:22 poverty 113:16 114:8 119:14 PPD 82:15 practical 165:12 practice 10:1 19:15 34:12 44:5 71:3 137:3	Practices 9:12, 13 19:25 20:11 27:12 28:15 39:8 67:21 68:10 112:16 133:2 134:3, 23 136:21, 23 158:19 practitioners 89:7 praised 95:13 preaching 169:25 precariously 56:7 precedent 102:24 precious 128:22 preferred 135:3 pregnancy 102:18 pregnant 103:7 prejudices 32:13 preliminary 70:7 presence 125:20 PRESENT 1:1 3:2, 8, 18, 24 4:7, 13, 19 16:10 35:16 120:10 170:25 President 112:3 presume 70:24 prevent 106:3 121:17 131:17 Prevention 83:24 prevents 19:4 previous 93:20 previously 119:9 price 51:13 65:15 93:15 133:19 prices 13:25 primary 24:15 print 24:21 printed 99:19, 23 prior 2:19 6:4 52:20 priority 41:14 privacy 6:1	private 7:11, 18 27:18 36:9, 17 40:20 115:7 116:5, 17 121:14, 21 126:5 135:20 142:2 159:7, 10, 24 164:1, 23 165:6 privileges 133:20 proactive 25:13 42:11 136:11 138:2 154:11 156:19 proactively 25:21 123:16 probable 58:4 probably 107:23 111:17 153:22 probative 115:21 problem 11:13 13:23 28:23 64:15 127:15 131:12 136:18 157:13 problems 129:13 154:12 proceed 18:21 29:18 49:17 54:13 58:5 59:25 60:14 67:5 77:16 83:13 84:24 90:10 102:8 124:7 132:3 proceeded 79:21 proceeding 23:6 proceedings 173:1 process 15:6 17:8 34:24 35:20, 25 36:3, 8 47:9, 17 48:5 52:25 57:20 58:7 85:21 89:23 90:21 91:9, 10 97:1, 3 143:1, 2 151:14 160:2, 16, 19 164:15, 20 profitable 47:2 profits 15:25	program 12:25 15:23 19:16, 18 21:19 22:12 32:3, 17 33:24 62:3 67:18 69:13, 20, 24 82:1 87:17 91:18, 25 92:2, 9, 10 112:9, 10, 12 113:4, 12 114:17 115:4, 6, 8, 12, 13 116:6, 24 117:1, 6 118:4, 7, 10 120:12 122:3 123:17 128:14 131:20 134:5 136:2 138:20, 23 139:12 141:19 146:21 147:12 148:6 150:22 153:7 162:13, 18 166:24 167:22 169:3 programs 20:5, 19 102:16 116:23 117:17 126:20, 24 127:18 130:8 131:5 133:5 142:19 144:23 146:17 147:25 149:14 150:13 163:23 progress 120:15 prohibited 133:2 149:17 158:22 prohibiting 31:19 prohibition 17:5 prohibitions 159:22 prohibits 9:14 19:25 31:14 135:13 Project 83:25 151:16 promise 12:21 promises 105:12 promoted 118:6 proof 26:20, 25 32:4 43:13	properties 24:2 60:23 62:13 86:8 87:18, 21 98:7 133:13 152:25 167:11 property 13:1 44:3, 22 46:24 55:3, 25 67:23 70:14 87:4, 14 88:13, 15 93:10, 23 94:15 95:13 107:7 115:25 116:25 130:6, 10, 11 131:2 133:1, 14, 23 136:4 150:11 164:11 proposals 37:7 propose 34:1 proposed 115:2 prospective 56:24 protect 96:7 115:25 137:15, 20 protected 10:18 24:22 59:7 156:7 protecting 112:14 protection 20:12 22:17 27:5 29:3 113:7 121:25 135:8 149:10 157:20 protections 22:23 68:8 70:12 71:7 137:7 protects 9:12 protesting 75:23 protests 75:21 protocols 111:16 prove 51:18 52:10, 13 provide 12:10 14:11 26:13 27:16 32:4 44:1 48:20 50:20 69:1 111:18 112:7 130:19 135:19
--	--	--	---	--	---

3/20/2023

139:7, 8 146:3 170:15 provided 8:11 11:4 52:25 119:22 167:5 provider 67:22 71:5 159:4 providers 24:19 25:10 29:1 44:23 68:2, 13, 25 69:9, 15, 17 70:2 71:10 127:2, 3, 19 128:3 129:20 135:13, 23 provides 23:16 85:21 providing 15:22 30:5 68:3 145:3, 13 166:12 provision 28:22 provisions 8:23 proxy 10:15 public 2:6, 8, 14, 15, 17 4:25 5:23, 25 15:19 18:25 20:17 24:18 28:14 34:13 38:25 45:14 57:14 82:4 104:10 126:3 130:3 132:24 133:4 136:12 145:8 156:9 170:15 173:13 public-facing 34:17 publicize 28:13 publish 158:13 published 2:18 publishing 135:14 pull 101:3 punitive 146:12 purpose 6:14 28:15 put 28:20 59:1 64:13, 16, 25 65:15 103:14 140:10 153:2, 12 169:13, 14 puts 33:3 88:5	putting 5:13 63:24 < Q > qualifications 70:6 qualitative 68:4 quality 19:6 56:16 113:20 118:18 119:1 123:3 137:1 167:4 question 40:5, 24 46:8 100:13 148:16 151:1 158:9, 11 160:13 161:24 163:3, 4, 6, 8, 20 168:2 questions 6:5 38:23 39:25 43:22 45:19 49:1 61:5 82:23 91:4, 6 110:9, 18 123:5 124:2 131:8 137:10, 22 153:18 158:2, 6 161:18 170:8, 22 quick 46:17 161:24 quicker 43:19 quickest 8:12 quickly 42:6 113:19 149:6 155:15 quit 81:15 quite 15:9 38:9 41:6 65:9, 10, 12 144:4 quorum 4:22 quote 112:23 < R > race 10:19 21:6 32:12 Rachel 49:9 66:24 67:7 racial 9:21 58:23 125:3, 19 racially 21:16 racism 15:16	raise 21:8 149:7 raised 37:10 125:14 rampant 13:3 range 51:13 ranging 115:15 129:17 rapid 107:18 126:22, 25 153:6 rare 105:17 rate 33:3 114:5 116:15 142:2 163:22 165:6 rates 9:20 32:19, 25 103:9, 10 108:15, 17 114:8 119:14 rating 122:7 reach 25:10 87:24 95:5 102:18 139:15 145:6 reached 92:6 94:21, 22, 25 95:4 reactive 154:14 read 5:5 readily 140:3 ready 131:10 165:17 real 23:7 76:7 98:6 106:20 110:15 132:25 realistic 94:1 realize 24:12 92:1 realized 22:18 really 10:23 12:3 21:20 23:22 28:20 29:10 32:7 39:14, 17 42:21 44:10 45:3, 18 46:4 51:21 53:7 59:18 61:19, 20 62:9 71:17 80:20 81:12, 19 85:5 87:1 89:19, 20 102:21 107:1, 14 108:11 109:15 110:12 125:11, 23, 24	126:16 127:7 128:17 129:11 144:11 149:8 150:12, 18 151:4, 18 152:23 153:10 156:19 158:3 162:20 168:25 realtors 61:11 reapply 62:5 reason 21:3 46:22 167:15 168:8 reasonable 6:1 142:10 reasonableness 142:11 reasonably 25:3 41:21 reasons 32:10 50:8 103:12 receive 28:2, 7 99:11 100:1 106:23 117:10 134:21 139:10 147:25 149:15 154:18 received 80:9 101:5, 8 134:10 receives 114:22 141:5 receiving 95:14 106:7 107:8 121:18 recipient 141:4 recipients 91:12, 13 117:15 121:8 139:9 recognition 89:14 recognized 6:11 116:10 recognizing 6:5 125:8 recommend 108:19 135:11, 22 recommendatio ns 24:5, 14 81:25 record 6:7 18:21 19:14 29:18 49:17 54:13 59:25 60:14 67:4 72:4 77:16 83:13 90:10	102:8 124:7 132:3 145:25 recorded 5:24 6:3 records 30:23 31:20 recourse 103:15 126:15 recurrent 70:22 redlining 95:24 reduce 23:8 117:14 re-evaluation 96:15 98:3 refer 19:12 20:9 112:10 reference 30:25 references 51:17 52:9 referred 19:18 119:8 122:13 reflect 24:14 reflective 94:2 refusal 114:14 refusals 57:19 refuse 32:11 52:15 53:11 56:24 61:2 113:9 133:23 135:24 refused 108:6 refusing 9:15 34:9 114:11 regard 120:25 133:12 regarding 5:3, 10 68:4 71:6 116:22 166:19 regards 90:20 91:4, 24 148:17 region 67:15 region's 9:2 Register 130:23 registered 69:19 170:15 regular 104:12 regularly 70:17 104:25 107:3, 4 regulations 141:23 rehousing 126:25 Re-Housing 126:22 153:6	reimburses 116:24 re-inspection 143:8 re-inspections 36:6 reject 122:15, 19 rejection 114:6 rejections 75:1 114:14 rejects 114:20 related 153:6 relates 30:2 123:12, 13 169:22 Relations 20:8 39:4 57:17 132:12 155:23 relationship- building 127:7 relationships 128:2 relevant 29:5 religious 58:24 relocate 11:5 47:6 relocation 11:6 121:23 rely 8:7 97:9 154:15 remaining 68:24 remarks 6:16 13:12 78:7 Remember 139:7 164:6 Remote 1:1 2:6, 11 remotely 2:10 renew 55:21 rent 7:14 9:15 13:24 14:15 16:19 32:11 33:18, 19 34:9 35:9, 13 52:12 56:9 60:25 61:24 62:23 68:15 85:19 88:10, 17, 22, 23 89:4 93:7, 12, 17 101:19 103:16 113:9, 20 114:20 121:15 122:10 128:12 133:24 134:7 142:10, 14
--	---	--	--	---	--

3/20/2023

162:10 164:16, 25 165:1, 5 rental 7:12 8:1, 6, 10 9:7, 13 11:22 19:16 20:19 22:5 24:25 37:13 68:9 70:9, 15, 20 71:9 87:20 93:20 96:23 105:10 112:15 116:9 121:21 122:7 126:19 130:7, 10 131:4 133:15 147:1 148:1 149:15 152:25 Rentals 95:1 rented 69:3 117:20 renters 7:14 19:5 31:13 49:23 59:19 86:3, 6 96:10 113:8 116:7 158:25 renting 34:23 36:12 37:11 117:23 121:7 139:18 158:25 165:15 rent-restricted 8:20 rents 51:9 88:25 119:7, 10 140:7 141:14 142:9 repair 117:2 122:25 repeat 19:10 report 59:13 115:1 Reporter 173:13, 23 reporting 25:18 reports 21:12 representation 30:6 representative 65:5, 20 representatives 21:10 representing 23:11 119:20 133:13 represents 30:10 70:8	reproduction 173:20 Republicans 72:25 request 28:2, 7 101:4 116:21 requesting 160:24 require 17:9 23:2 40:13 42:23 164:18 required 43:3 45:17 69:16 109:22 141:9, 15 142:5, 8 requirement 10:4 27:6, 13 40:19 162:4 163:5, 9 166:20 requirements 30:21 31:1 32:5, 7 96:12 98:4 136:1 141:20 requires 2:4 16:7 44:12 45:21 141:18 142:10 143:8 166:23 requiring 31:17 112:25 147:20, 24 149:13 Rescue 124:19 researches 101:1 residential 112:25 residents 7:3 12:15 17:12 80:13 121:24 122:1, 5, 12 127:21 138:25 152:10 resign 76:1 RESOLUTION 1:1 5:3, 6 30:3 43:20 84:2 114:5 132:15 155:16 170:13 171:3 Resolutions 111:5 134:19 resolve 127:17 resolved 58:14	resource 128:22 139:14 152:8 resources 24:7, 11 41:3, 25 42:4, 23 101:6 102:12 125:25 136:6, 8 137:19 139:6 143:23, 25 144:16, 20 145:13 152:15, 20 153:24 154:4, 10 155:18 156:14 166:2 respect 98:25 Respectfully 53:19 146:24 respond 26:2 56:1, 23 responded 56:22 95:7 128:11 respondents 21:2 responding 3:4 116:21 response 18:6 21:6 42:9 49:3 60:2, 5 82:25 110:21 166:8 170:10 171:4 responsibilities 136:14 responsible 25:17 82:17 103:19 129:4 139:22 responsive 25:13 rest 63:18 73:9 90:13 157:25 result 15:17 32:21 121:11 resulted 23:24 120:19 Revenue 130:22, 24 rewards 87:20 rich 21:18 RICHARDSON 1:1 3:15, 17 ridiculous 80:1 right 15:14 17:18, 19	27:18 28:3, 8 35:13 40:20 41:11 61:8 64:1, 4, 18 76:11, 20, 25 81:21 90:20 92:4 93:4 94:4 95:6, 11 96:20 108:8 110:14 126:5 135:20 141:24 145:4 154:12 155:11 158:2, 23 159:7, 11, 24 160:12 161:16 165:11 rights 58:20 59:3 67:11 71:8 132:21 136:13 ripped 30:18 rise 96:18 risk 5:14 33:14 robbed 64:12 role 23:7 34:14 102:14 104:23 121:22 roll 2:24 roof 81:9 106:22 root 25:23 rooted 15:15 Roundtree 49:8 59:23 77:14, 18, 19 81:17 82:18 84:14, 15, 16, 20 99:15 172:3 routine 136:3 routinely 21:8 70:13 rowhomes 31:8 Rule 148:21 149:2, 3 rules 122:21 running 66:3 < S > safe 8:8 14:5 19:5 37:5 48:11 54:2 55:10 57:11 62:18 84:8 85:8 104:6 113:20 123:2, 23	SAFMRs 119:7, 10 SAFMRs- based 119:18 sale 133:15 sample 70:9 89:5 Samuels 57:4 sanctions 74:8, 15 Sari 18:11, 14, 24 36:21 46:18 saw 78:14, 17, 19 79:15, 22 116:18 152:22 153:3 163:24 saying 38:10 85:1 88:1 95:22 99:11 says 65:22 158:16 167:3 scenario 12:3 107:13 school 14:7 17:17 102:19 130:25 schools 12:11 118:20 scope 28:23 154:15 scores 31:16 122:17 screen 3:5 screening 94:1, 10 96:11, 25 search 55:23 56:11 70:19 78:6 86:17 100:16 128:24 141:6, 12 152:13 searched 51:3 52:3 searches 78:21 138:5 searching 30:19 99:13 second 21:6 25:12 50:15 58:2 60:20 84:13 106:1 135:22 second-class 148:22 Secondly 34:25 165:3 Section 19:19 30:12 42:13	47:2 49:21 53:1 54:19 55:17 56:14, 20 61:17, 21 69:13, 20, 24 79:25 112:11 121:7 122:9 133:17, 21 135:17, 18, 19 144:8 147:13 150:13 158:16 secure 59:12 113:23 121:21 123:2 securing 122:2, 6 security 12:22 30:23 37:15 55:12 117:3 165:21 see 10:2 21:21 31:3 43:20 46:16, 19 51:5 52:4 54:11, 12 59:24 60:7 63:15 77:6, 14 89:6 98:23 107:2, 3 111:7 112:14 145:12 154:22 165:11, 24 seeking 46:23 seen 88:19 97:14 119:21 segregation 9:21 sell 46:25 133:24 send 54:22 100:20 senior 74:14 sense 82:15 95:23 150:2 156:17 sent 68:11 101:1 separated 106:13 separately 95:5 series 70:7 127:2 serve 8:16 83:21 116:12 130:5 served 15:23 service 127:19 145:8
---	---	--	---	--	--

3/20/2023

services 12:12 25:9 29:22 30:4 44:18 57:5 83:20 107:16, 25 111:1 117:19 124:12 126:19 127:24 128:1 serving 102:15 set 38:15 47:16 102:25 135:18 137:22 settle 146:10 settled 58:9 126:14 settlement 23:23 28:13 severe 8:14 41:12 151:8 severely 88:5 severity 12:4 sex 106:20 sexual 58:24 share 39:10 50:1 151:1 shared 163:24 sharing 54:5 59:11 66:6 81:19 Shearlds 2:23 5:4 18:8 38:3, 7 49:5 83:2 110:23 170:14 shelter 104:9, 17 shelters 106:15, 19 Sherry 83:4, 7, 16 shine 8:4 shocked 25:3 shooting 79:9 82:11 shop 130:5 shopping 67:20 118:21 short 47:7 71:23 shot 79:4 show 9:19 10:5 22:20, 24 63:20 76:7 showing 79:18 shows 23:21 shutter 9:24 shy 26:17 sick 77:1 side 150:16	side-by-side 152:3 sign 143:10 signed 65:5, 14 140:24 significant 24:3 significantly 36:22 119:24 signify 6:10 sign-in 142:21 signing 32:22 85:20 115:14 165:1 similar 148:20 simple 17:8 64:12 simply 16:8 26:22 28:23 32:1 41:5 45:13 56:8 88:9 89:3 160:23 single 45:15 145:23 169:18 sink 107:2 sites 82:4 situated 111:18 situation 8:5 54:3 57:9 58:13 78:14 107:13 126:12 situations 106:18 six 33:20 72:10 141:3 156:4 size 113:13 141:1 skyrocketing 13:24 slamming 30:18 sleep 104:6 slow 15:5 small 50:23 70:1, 8 89:5 104:24 119:7 155:20 156:1 smelled 79:15 Smith 71:19, 21 72:6, 7 76:15, 19, 22 smoke 143:3 smoothly 48:16 snatched 87:22 social 24:20	social- emotional 103:22 software 90:24 95:3 sold 15:20 solely 24:25 25:17 solution 96:14, 21 97:6 131:5 solutions 17:25 29:4 34:5 36:5 37:9, 20 89:16 98:2 108:25 125:13, 14 144:4 171:17 solve 89:25 131:12 somebody 109:5 127:11, 13, 16, 25 129:6 143:10 145:21 151:18 164:17 son 79:2, 3 son's 82:10 Sorry 4:5 38:8, 20 54:1 56:20 63:10 73:2, 13 74:20 75:16 76:2, 5 78:8 84:13, 17 170:20 sort 43:6 44:10 46:5 150:14 151:11 155:25 156:20 167:9 169:6, 20 sought 163:20 sounds 74:20 source 9:16, 22 20:1, 3 21:3, 8, 12 22:22, 25 23:9, 14 24:22 27:4 29:1 43:8 57:1 59:5 68:8 70:12 71:2 85:11, 23 92:4, 18 100:6, 8 112:20 113:9 121:3, 10 122:21 125:2 133:3, 22 134:13, 16 135:2, 9	136:19 149:10 156:7, 25 Southwest 60:18 62:25 space 106:14, 19 spaces 93:2 106:9 speak 3:6 40:25 80:20 90:22 98:12 103:4 speakers 126:7 speaking 41:4 145:7 spearheading 13:17 special 96:25 specific 46:9 66:17 93:5 95:17 96:23 117:10 166:12 Specifically 46:9 148:3 156:25 167:14 speed 87:21 88:3 155:10 speedy 36:5 spend 14:25 15:4 16:3 86:19 144:13 spending 15:12 spent 15:12 144:21 spoke 13:23 42:2 61:15 62:2 100:17 SQUILLA 1:1 4:3, 4 SSDI 70:4 stability 55:6, 20 stabilized 57:10 stable 12:14 14:5 16:18 17:18 staff 18:24 138:3 156:17, 23 staffing 154:4 stage 85:10, 21 87:5, 25 88:19, 21 89:8, 22 101:21 stages 89:9 152:12 staircases 31:9	stand 13:3 131:10 136:16 137:5 standard 68:15 119:6 143:14 standards 36:15, 25 73:5, 23 119:18 120:6, 17 stands 130:9 start 13:15 63:23 74:2 77:19 88:14 starting 34:23 73:14 state 2:3 18:20 20:17 29:17 49:16 54:12, 23 59:24 60:13 65:18 67:4 72:4 77:15 83:12 90:9 102:7 111:8 112:23 113:7 117:11 122:22 124:6 132:2 148:8 150:2 166:4 stated 36:20 69:15 78:25 80:23 States 19:20 stating 69:10 81:14 statistics 19:10 20:23 22:7 stats 103:1 status 10:20 25:1 statute 41:16 112:23 149:1 stay 17:15, 16 57:8 110:5 123:24 steer 138:24 stenographic 173:1 step 127:16 steps 22:15 23:17 35:25 36:7 47:21 135:7 141:9 stereotyped 52:17 stereotypes	164:8 stigma 162:22 stop 131:6 147:22 160:9 stopped 15:18 stopping 147:19, 23 stores 79:17 stories 14:12 144:6 story 50:2 66:6 81:19 144:9 straight 40:21 straightforward 43:11 69:10 strategies 152:22 streamline 164:19 streamlined 90:23 street 58:20 79:5 166:22 streets 14:2 strengthen 135:8 stressful 48:6 97:4 stretches 86:22 strictly 80:10 stringent 17:3 30:21 strips 12:7 strong 17:14 22:21 42:21 156:19 stronger 17:3 strongly 113:5 struck 112:19 148:25 162:21 struggle 57:11 76:8 120:6 stuck 4:5 Studies 9:19 10:5 22:20 study 32:24 33:3, 5 stuff 75:2 103:1 110:7 subject 87:5 142:4 167:23 submit 87:12 92:17 161:11 submitted 100:6 113:23 subsidized 32:2, 9 33:22
---	--	---	---	--	--

3/20/2023

subsidizing 88:25	supposed 42:25 62:16	talk 43:12 44:4 45:20	tenant-based 5:12 9:17	testifying 157:5, 7	124:13 131:8,
subsidy 8:19 15:24 20:13	65:2	115:19 138:12	10:8 114:6	168:14	13, 14 132:13,
22:4 84:7	Supreme 112:18 148:5,	149:22, 25	127:1	testimony 2:15 5:19	16 137:9, 12,
88:18 113:2	18, 24	153:22	tenants 9:13	6:20 18:22	21 143:15
119:12, 23	sure 17:1	talked 99:15,	15:25 16:10,	19:13 29:11,	147:18 148:16
120:1 126:24	44:6, 18 47:12	16 100:14	25 17:10	19 38:16, 18,	149:11 150:5,
128:22	48:14, 19 65:9,	150:9 158:10	24:19 30:17,	24 49:18	6, 8 153:17
substantial 71:5	10, 13 80:25	164:11	22 31:3, 24	54:14 60:1, 15	160:12 161:19
substantive 69:5	83:15 107:17	talking 62:20	32:8 33:12	66:19 67:5	168:11, 13, 17,
subway 45:14	112:17 113:8	74:13 104:21	34:6, 8, 16, 19,	77:17, 20	19, 20, 22, 24
success 32:19,	121:19 128:20	108:8 166:11	21 35:2, 5, 7,	81:11 83:14	170:5, 6, 11
25	137:18 142:9,	talks 153:1	11, 16, 17, 18,	86:24 90:11,	171:10, 20, 22
successful 36:4 128:23	12 147:8, 20	tandem 145:7	21 36:10, 17	14 98:19	172:2, 3, 5
153:4	148:15 150:1	TANEHA 173:12	37:3, 10, 12	101:15 102:9	Thankfully 57:3
successfully 34:22 134:18	163:18 165:17	target 44:20,	39:6 41:9, 13,	103:3 110:6	thanking 13:16
Sue 28:4, 8	168:5	24	18, 20 42:24	119:22 123:9	thanks 59:15
77:2	surrounding 118:13	targeted 23:17	46:19, 20 47:6,	124:8 125:12	84:22 98:18,
sufficient 155:7 160:6	survey 128:10	24:20 156:14	14, 21 48:9, 15,	132:4, 17	19 128:25
suggest 146:24	surveyed 21:7	task 156:24	21 49:25 53:8	137:14 143:16	171:23
suggested 147:9	Survival 106:20	tasked 107:17	59:2 61:25	150:9, 17, 23	theirs 93:14
suggestions 144:17	susceptible 96:19	132:22	63:19 64:1, 20	154:8 163:24	thing 63:22
suicide 72:13	suspect 167:6	tax 75:4	96:8 101:17	170:12 171:2	72:19 74:23
suitable 84:8	suspicious 95:11	team 90:13	110:14 116:15	Testing 67:18,	77:4 79:12
85:8 87:21	swaths 22:6	114:19 115:1	123:11 125:17	19, 23 125:22	80:22 105:15
138:10	sweet 71:23	155:20 156:1	127:23 133:17	126:1 145:16,	106:20, 21
Sunshine 6:12	system 16:8,	Teams 1:1	134:24 143:19,	18 146:6	127:10 151:11
sup 74:9	21 17:14	2:11 6:9	22	154:10	things 40:9
super 47:19	90:23 96:5	tear 116:2, 16	tenant's 9:16	tests 68:24	42:2 46:2
supervision 173:22	104:17 109:20	technical 37:24 141:17	31:18	70:1, 7	61:8 64:13
supply 70:20	127:23 130:16	teen 56:9	tend 140:8	text 43:15	66:8 101:8
74:12	systematic 30:8	teeth 28:21	147:10 154:7	texted 56:19	104:14 105:13
support 30:8	systems 100:15 108:6	101:4	term 50:24	57:24	106:2 110:10
47:10, 11, 23	110:3	tell 39:1	terms 39:13,	Thank 3:24	123:16 126:6
48:21 59:2	< T >	43:22 65:6, 14	19 40:4 82:3	4:22 6:19	127:11 138:14
70:4 84:1	take 2:24	70:11 71:21	103:22 116:24	13:9, 14 17:20	141:16 143:20
90:25 91:3	22:14 23:18	74:25 76:2	128:18 133:18,	18:1 19:1	147:21 148:13
93:22 96:9	35:22 40:16	127:22 145:24	19 138:9	29:6, 8, 23	152:5 153:9,
102:14 104:24	41:6 42:13	telling 69:2	144:15, 22	37:20 38:20,	11
110:4 130:20	45:1 53:7	145:21 147:14	154:3, 4, 9, 25	23 43:24	think 9:24
131:11 137:19	72:15 73:5, 13	tells 99:21	155:4, 9	45:22 46:7	11:15 41:24
143:21 150:20	80:6 85:15	tenancy 133:20	157:19 163:4	48:23 50:1	42:19 44:7, 14,
165:24 166:13	87:15 115:18	tenant 8:11	terrible 51:21	53:18, 21, 24	15 45:2, 12
supporting 107:5	132:18 169:21	10:3, 15 22:16	test 68:7 95:6	54:4 59:8, 9,	46:2 73:6, 10,
Supportive 126:20	170:19	30:10 33:23	142:11 143:13	10, 21 66:4, 5,	23 74:1, 6, 18
supports 20:15 106:25	taken 135:8	34:2, 10 42:10	tester 68:18	15, 18 71:11,	76:6 77:6
113:6, 11	173:1	43:19 46:21	testers 68:11,	15, 17 72:3	80:16 89:23
	takes 14:22	47:3 49:21	19, 21 69:2, 3,	77:11 80:19	99:15 100:13,
	58:18 81:23	51:17 52:8, 14	8 70:23	81:16, 17, 18,	16 103:7
	86:23 142:22,	56:16, 25	154:21	24 82:20	104:15 107:6,
	25	60:17 121:25	testified 132:17	83:25 84:21,	9 108:4, 11
		136:13 139:17	testify 5:22	25 89:17, 18	109:12 111:17
		140:11 142:2	18:10 19:2	90:2, 4, 12	114:9 115:20
		146:17, 18	49:6 53:9	98:11, 17 99:3,	121:9 124:24
		150:16 165:6,	83:3 84:1	4 102:3, 4, 5,	126:4, 16
		18	110:24 111:14	20 110:11	128:17 144:1,
			132:14 170:24	111:20, 22	3, 18 146:13
				123:4, 7	147:7 148:6
					149:18, 21

3/20/2023

150:15 151:4, 13, 24 152:2, 4, 7 153:9, 12, 13 156:22 158:20 159:2, 11 160:9, 14 163:10, 19, 20 164:4 166:9 167:19, 25 169:19 thinking 39:10 90:25 150:21 third 27:3 Thomas 83:4, 7, 9, 15, 16 84:25 90:2 101:11, 14 thoroughly 76:9 thought 43:25 56:9 72:16 74:4 125:13 149:20 157:6 167:8, 17 thoughts 39:3 thousands 5:13 16:16 threatened 55:20 three 26:6 42:1 54:17 58:10 113:14 122:16 127:4 156:9 157:3, 15 threshold 142:17 threw 61:19 throw 48:1 51:19, 20 tied 27:5 81:20 time 6:8 11:2 13:7 14:25 15:11, 12 35:3, 22 37:21 41:7 46:17 47:5, 8, 13, 14, 23 48:8 53:18 57:3 73:8 78:23 86:16, 20, 23, 25 108:2 109:11 110:5 122:6 123:4 126:6, 14 127:12 137:9 142:24 144:14 158:4 160:21 161:6 164:22	time-limited 115:14 timeline 36:9 46:16 92:13 timelines 15:8 timeliness 35:1 36:8 timely 26:2 35:7 47:18 times 11:24 43:11 52:16 86:16 103:13 106:7 107:10, 22 169:7 tired 75:16 title 5:5 today 5:20 6:18, 20, 23 7:24 11:23 13:9 18:10 19:2 20:24 22:13 29:9 49:22 53:9 66:19 71:16 82:21 84:23 85:15 92:5 110:1 111:23 130:2 132:14 134:3 143:17 154:20 163:7 168:14 170:16 171:3, 14, 21 today's 102:21 toilet 56:17 told 51:15 62:4 68:20, 22 69:8 79:6, 20 87:10 97:10 169:16 toll 14:22 81:23 Tomika 49:8 54:11, 16 59:10 tools 14:1 16:23 top 103:14 tops 103:13 total 120:22 touch 79:8 tougher 146:8 Townhomes 121:24 122:12 123:13 traditionally 109:10 training 134:22 147:3	transactions 70:10 transcript 173:1, 20 transition 48:15 transitional 55:1 109:23 transitioning 109:24 transparency 28:10 transportation 104:11 trauma 104:20 treat 64:1 133:17 treated 21:4 49:25 53:10 64:18 67:25 89:2 treatment 159:1 tremendously 125:1 tried 62:8 107:22 trigger 160:7 true 62:7 truly 71:7 89:13 try 40:1 42:4 44:24 89:25 104:5 123:17 131:19 164:19 trying 15:1 41:24 59:2, 11, 13 97:19, 21, 23 105:2 110:5 131:12 150:10 turnaround 46:17 turned 24:24 two 26:9 42:8 50:7 54:25 57:18, 21 58:5 68:6 77:21 80:11, 14, 17 122:14 126:19 153:18 157:16 165:23 166:21 two-bedroom 50:24 51:4 64:23, 24 120:2 type 7:9 14:22 77:4 78:13 160:5	types 10:16 70:3 136:23 typically 56:6, 22 67:24 100:1, 24 138:13 146:10 < U > uh-huh 162:7 um 78:7 unable 16:12, 14 28:4 69:4 91:7 130:2 160:18 161:3 unacceptable 109:18 unanimous 112:21 unattended 28:24 unavailable 86:10 unconcealed 70:22 uncover 171:17 undeniable 134:4 undergo 87:14 undergoing 85:18 underlies 138:19 undermines 14:9 understand 2:3 12:23 42:24 44:12, 20 45:16 81:13 136:5 151:21 159:4 understanding 82:9 94:5 101:21 125:9 136:17 understood 57:10 undertaken 25:6 undesirable 16:1 unexpected 116:1 unfair 9:13 34:12 112:15 unfilled 164:23 Unfortunately 57:20 114:12, 22 130:1	unhoused 56:4, 7 unicorn 105:17 uninhabitable 60:24 unique 28:20 120:10 unit 11:9 29:23 30:9 69:2 113:23 114:3 117:21 130:18 141:1, 13 142:3 143:7, 12 151:20 164:22 166:22, 25 United 19:20 49:23 74:6 units 8:20 9:6 11:1 68:14 106:8 115:12 116:8 117:5 120:20 121:21 122:2, 6 126:21 127:4 129:5, 11, 17, 21 139:24, 25 140:3 143:23 163:22 165:7 166:21 167:22 168:4 unit's 165:17 University 11:1, 7 121:24 122:11 unlawful 70:17 133:11, 16 134:1, 12 135:23 158:23 unlawfully 134:6 unmarried 56:14 unrealistic 98:5 unrepresented 26:4 unsafe 94:20 96:20 unsure 91:13 unused 22:12 unwilling 162:25 unwillingness 120:11 up-and-coming 93:1	updated 80:17 101:9 129:10, 12 141:7 updating 36:23 upfront 140:10 153:7 uphill 128:19 upholding 96:10 upstanding 61:25 upstream 152:22 up-to-date 101:18 Urban 19:21 urgent 22:14 usable 100:21 use 6:8 7:13 10:22 12:17 16:12 31:19 32:23 33:14 34:22 51:1 86:3, 25 109:4 118:24 119:5 133:17 136:8 138:10, 16 143:20 144:19 150:19 useful 131:21 user 133:22 users 135:5 Usually 41:10 utilization 9:20 22:24 33:7 utilize 133:25 utilized 33:10 < V > vacancy 12:19 139:10 vacate 47:24 value 46:25 65:17 92:25 96:16 variation 69:15 various 8:21 130:7 139:11 viable 169:3 VICE-CHAIR 1:1 3:7 112:1 view 2:14 164:7 viewers 5:25 vigorously 58:22 Village 60:18 64:2, 9 66:10
--	--	--	---	---	--

3/20/2023

77:21 78:24 79:5 80:9 144:7 violated 20:22 violation 25:4 134:2 violations 25:14 146:9 violence 81:22 virtually 140:19 visitors 102:15 visual 25:5 vital 22:16 71:7 90:15 vocalize 91:8 voice 32:14 volumes 141:23 voluntary 113:2, 4 139:8 148:6 volunteered 69:18 volunteering 64:7 voucher 7:21 8:25 9:20 10:14 11:17, 20 12:18, 20 14:14 15:3, 7, 14, 23 16:8, 20 17:5, 11, 14 19:2, 18 21:22, 25 22:24 24:1 25:1 30:12 32:18, 24 33:7, 13, 23 34:10 35:1, 8, 12, 19 36:10 47:3, 17 48:4 51:1, 8, 12 52:1, 22 53:16 54:20 55:5 56:2, 15, 25 57:13, 19 60:20, 21 61:1, 6, 9 62:2 64:22, 24, 25 65:1, 2, 15, 16, 17 66:7 68:22 70:16 71:8 77:24 78:1, 4, 9, 16, 22 79:3, 12 80:6, 10, 24 81:15, 25 85:5, 15, 18 86:1 87:1, 9 88:3, 5 89:11 90:17, 24 91:17, 22,	25 92:2, 3, 7, 8, 11, 13 94:17 97:3, 7, 13, 20 98:25 99:10, 12, 19, 24 101:20 103:14 104:9 105:15 108:6 109:5, 8 112:9 114:4, 15 117:16 118:25 119:6 120:1, 5, 12 121:8, 18 128:12 131:20 133:21 135:5 136:2 138:3, 11, 20, 23 139:24 140:12, 13, 17, 23, 25 141:4, 11, 13 144:9 146:18, 20 147:12 150:22 162:10, 13, 18 163:2 167:2 voucher-holder 50:3 114:21 117:21 voucher- holders 14:9 21:14 24:24 25:15, 25 52:15, 24 62:14 84:4 85:2 89:1, 3 94:18 96:7, 12, 17 112:15 114:1 117:24 120:6, 20, 23 122:11 Voucher- holding 7:25 vouchers 5:12 6:25 7:12 8:8, 11, 15 9:8, 9, 17 10:3, 8, 15, 23 11:4 12:16 13:6, 22, 25 14:11, 21, 24 15:3, 19 16:11, 16 17:1 22:9, 11 31:25 32:12, 20, 22 33:9, 17 34:7, 23 35:6 36:19 37:4, 11 42:14 47:16 51:14, 16 53:13 57:25 68:16,	20 69:8, 14, 21 79:25 80:16 81:3 90:19 91:1, 2, 11, 16 92:14, 24 93:25 94:4, 7 95:2, 14, 17, 19 96:24 103:7 105:19 106:8 109:3, 17 114:6, 12 116:7 122:1 123:12, 23 124:20 133:6, 18, 25 134:24 138:16 143:20 150:19 153:3 160:17 162:4, 23 vulnerable 5:13 7:2 8:7 116:13 137:8 < W > wait 60:7 waiting 15:4 37:25 62:6 64:3 73:6 105:20, 25 106:8 walk 151:18 169:15 walkable 12:10 walking 152:3 Waller 49:9 60:9, 11, 16, 17 63:6, 8, 13 66:5, 13, 20 78:24 80:23 99:16 walls 30:18 want 8:4 13:15 17:14 36:1 40:16, 25 43:5 45:24 50:7, 20 51:20 53:13 55:21 61:7, 14, 17 63:14 69:23 73:17 80:19, 22 82:14 87:17 98:21 99:17 107:1 108:10 123:19 129:13 137:17 138:15 147:6, 7, 21 157:3 163:16 164:25 167:1, 2, 15	168:7, 9, 17 169:5 171:10, 12 wanted 11:19 38:22 62:3 82:5 90:22 124:13 132:12 148:11 149:6 170:1 wanting 61:21 wants 129:8 130:11 warm 55:10 washer 79:23 watching 171:13, 24 way 8:12 9:5 26:6 39:6 58:16 66:2 87:19 89:4 91:4 92:18 107:25 125:23 128:4, 23 150:11 152:17 158:20 ways 34:2 36:3 44:14 45:12 55:15 84:7 85:6 96:11 145:16 165:12 weak 14:18 wear 116:2, 16 web-based 130:17 website 45:6 86:7 100:19 101:16 130:17 169:13 websites 45:5 86:3 week 72:24 97:21, 22 weekly 10:21 weeks 87:15 88:12 105:21 weigh 163:17 welcome 66:21 123:5 well 6:21 8:19 9:3 22:21 30:7 39:17 42:20, 24 61:5 66:8 68:3 75:1 76:1 79:6 88:24 90:12 92:21 95:23 96:9 97:16	99:24 101:7 104:3 105:11 113:6, 16 115:16 123:21 127:10 137:3 139:5 155:22 156:19 157:25 161:12, 14 163:17 165:11 went 72:11, 15 75:11 78:8 80:3 Wentworth 49:9 66:24 67:1, 6, 8 We're 6:23 10:17 13:19 36:13 37:24 41:24 53:9 64:15 66:16 69:16 74:14 75:24 89:15 92:8 104:21 108:8 131:18 140:2 151:14 154:10 155:14 157:9 164:4 166:3 171:14 West 62:24 122:10 123:13 we've 14:11 87:24 88:19 103:1 144:17, 21 147:11, 12 153:4 159:25 164:9, 10 166:6, 8, 10, 11 Whales 130:23, 24 wherewithal 151:25 White 22:2 wholly 113:5 widespread 10:11 70:25 Wiggins 18:12 29:12, 14, 20, 21 45:24 46:7 wildest 157:6 Williams 129:24 willing 15:2 16:4 55:5 77:9 80:6 81:14 93:6, 15 100:3 105:18 122:10 willingness	68:12 Wills 130:23 window 78:18 143:4 wish 6:11 51:8 wishes 171:2 wishlist 153:12 withheld 117:3 witness 18:9 49:6 110:24 witnessed 30:16 witnesses 5:20 6:6 170:23 woman 78:20 145:23 women 108:14 Wonderful 18:14 66:14 111:7 123:25 wondering 39:9 words 3:4 22:3 62:11 work 7:18 9:9 16:9 17:1, 24 29:4, 10 31:21 36:1 39:5, 17 46:3, 14 48:17 55:4 59:16, 19 61:23 64:19 71:18 72:24 85:9 98:19 105:18 108:18 109:1 120:24 123:9, 17, 21 127:19, 20 129:3, 8 130:18 131:3, 16 137:14 139:4 145:5 149:23 156:2 157:10, 19 168:12, 15, 18, 19 worked 57:6 67:10 123:10 working 15:14 41:8 44:16, 17 46:1 89:16 98:1 104:23 105:22 108:11 122:20 130:21 152:11 working-class 13:4 81:6
--	---	---	--	---	---

3/20/2023

works 12:25 16:24 23:22 42:23 54:6 world 81:4 worse 11:13 worth 61:6 worthiness 121:5 worthwhile 166:10 writing 58:11 written 19:13 26:20 39:21 43:13 57:18 65:24 110:6 134:20 135:15 158:14, 18 159:2 wrong 63:17 Wynnefield 122:9 < Y > Yeah 97:9 98:16 148:15 150:25 168:6 year 10:24 27:8 58:6 79:2 126:22 166:7 years 7:7 20:21 26:9 50:7 54:21 56:3 58:5, 10 64:3, 6 68:6 77:24 102:25 134:9 Yep 76:21 162:8 York 40:17 young 56:13 77:22 90:16 93:18 94:13, 17 96:4 98:13 106:16 107:5 108:24 109:2, 10, 15, 16, 19 110:1 151:5, 10 youngest 79:3 youth 96:4 108:19, 21 151:15 < Z > zero 88:14 141:2 zip 93:5 100:4 140:19	zip-code 119:10 zoning 8:21 96:15 100:2				
--	--	--	--	--	--