

Committee on Finance
November 13, 2019

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

Room 400, City Hall
1400 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19107
Wednesday, November 13, 2019
10:05 a.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCILWOMAN JANNIE L. BLACKWELL, CHAIR
COUNCILMAN BOBBY HENON, VICE-CHAIR
COUNCILWOMAN CHERELLE PARKER
COUNCILMAN ALLAN DOMB
COUNCILMAN WILLIAM K. GREENLEE
COUNCILMAN DAVID OH
COUNCILWOMAN CINDY BASS
COUNCILWOMAN BLONDELL REYNOLDS BROWN

BILL: 190746

- - -

1 - - -

2 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Good
3 morning. The Committee on Finance is called
4 to order. This morning we will hear
5 Bill No. 190746 regarding wage tax
6 reduction. We will ask the Clerk to read
7 the title of the bill.

8 THE CLERK: 190746, an ordinance
9 amending Section 19-1508 of the Philadelphia
10 Code, entitled "Refunds and Forgiveness for
11 Poverty Income," to revise the tax rate
12 under certain terms and conditions.

13 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank you
14 very much. We will ask the panel,
15 especially the Bill Sponsor if they have any
16 statements they would like to make.
17 Councilman Domb, Bill Sponsor? While he's
18 preparing to speak, we will ask our first
19 panelist Rob Dubow, Finance Director, to
20 come forward. He'll testify first. Thank
21 you.

22 (Witness approached Witness
23 Table.)

24 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: All
25 right. Councilman Domb will make his

1 statement, that he is the Sponsor of this
2 bill. All right. We'll wait. We will now
3 then ask the Finance Director to make his
4 statement.

5 MR. DUBOW: Morning, Chair
6 Blackwell and Members of the Committee. I'm
7 Rob Dubow, the Finance Director.

8 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
9 you. Excuse me. I forgot to note that we
10 do have a quorum. To my left, Councilman
11 Bill Greenlee. To his left, Vice-chair
12 Bobby Henon. To my right, Councilman David
13 Oh, and to his right, Sponsor of the bill
14 Allan Domb. To our extreme left,
15 Councilwoman Cherelle Parker. Thank you
16 very much. We more than have a quorum and
17 we're happy to see everyone here. Thank
18 you. Please continue, Mr. Dubow.

19 MR. DUBOW: Thank you for the
20 opportunity to testify on Bill No. 190746.
21 While the Administration supports the bill's
22 intent for reasons I'll discuss later in the
23 testimony, we don't support its passage at
24 this time. This legislation would expand
25 the current .5 percent income-based wage tax

1 refund in two stages. Starting in July 2020
2 with FY 21, qualifying Philadelphia
3 residents would receive a roughly 2.37
4 percent refund and qualifying nonresidents
5 would receive roughly a 1.95 refund.

6 Both residents and nonresidents
7 would effectively pay only the PICA portion
8 of the wage tax. And following the
9 scheduled sunset of the PICA portion of the
10 wage tax, qualifying residents and
11 nonresidents would receive a full wage tax
12 refund.

13 As I said, we support the bill's
14 intent which is to increase the income of
15 Philadelphians who are living in poverty and
16 promoting economic mobility. For that
17 reason working with Council to combat
18 poverty will be a priority of the 21 budget.
19 We would like to spend more time working
20 with the Bill Sponsor and other Members of
21 Council to shape an approach that is
22 targeted to residents living at or near
23 poverty and it does not include nonresidents
24 or individuals who may pay limited wage tax
25 but have other sources of income and are

1 nonpoverty.

2 We're concerned the inclusion of
3 commuters diverts funds that could be used
4 to aid Philadelphians and allocates finite
5 City resources to provide tax relief to
6 people who don't live in the City. Research
7 and experience in other cities have shown
8 that increasing incomes of people in poverty
9 when coupled with Earned Income Tax Credit
10 is among the most impactful levers at scale
11 to move individuals and families out of
12 poverty. The Administration believes an
13 approach that provides refunds more closely
14 aligned with the EITC could generate the
15 intended results, further incentivize the
16 EITC uptake and use scarce municipal
17 resources with efficiency and efficacy.

18 As currently drafted, the bill's
19 refund expands an existing Department of
20 Revenue program and the increased benefit
21 would likely increase utilization of
22 refunds. Roughly 2,000 refunds are issued
23 annually through the existing program.
24 Analysis from Revenue suggests that based on
25 2016 data, roughly 51,000 wage taxpayers

1 including commuters would be eligible for up
2 to about \$25 million in annual refunds
3 following adoption of legislation.

4 At this level, the benefits would
5 average about \$40 per month for taxpayers
6 which would obviously be a help, but not
7 enough to lift people out of poverty.

8 Revenue also anticipates needing to hire a
9 couple of employees to process refunds. The
10 rebate program requires individuals to file
11 a completed Pennsylvania form confirming
12 their income eligibility.

13 The threshold is determined by the
14 state, meaning not all taxpayers need would
15 be eligible for a refund, while including
16 those of high incomes from pensions and
17 other sources not taxable by the
18 Commonwealth. Linking access to assistance
19 to the PA program could also leave out
20 individuals who don't file the form or file
21 it incorrectly.

22 In addition, the existing rebate
23 system is complicated to administer and
24 would grow even more, so if uptake were to
25 grow following this legislation. Employers

1 file tax returns on behalf of their
2 employees serving as their agents for the
3 wage tax. That means that employers must
4 retrieve the information that is needed to
5 process an employee's refund and then the
6 data has to be verified by Revenue.

7 It's also challenging for Revenue
8 to aggregate paperwork for individuals who
9 have multiple jobs. In the City's inclusive
10 growth strategy released in early 2019, the
11 Administration called for state action to
12 give Philadelphia the flexibility to have
13 more progressive, efficient and competitive
14 tax structure. The Commonwealth's
15 uniformity clause prevents Philadelphia from
16 enacting a more progressive tax structure
17 that would meet the intent of this bill to
18 lower wage tax contributions for low-income
19 earners in poverty.

20 We look forward to working with
21 Council to develop an approach to raise
22 incomes focused on impoverished
23 Philadelphians that is accessible and
24 maximizes the impact to the funds we use.
25 This concludes my testimony and I'm

1 available to answer any questions you may
2 have.

3 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank you
4 very much. We note that Councilwoman Cindy
5 Bass is also here. Before we --
6 Councilwoman Blondell Reynolds Brown is here
7 as well. So we thank the Committee for
8 being present. And now we want to call on
9 Councilman Allan Domb, Sponsor of the bill
10 for his statement.

11 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Thank you, Madam
12 Chair, and thanks for your testimony, Rob.
13 As elected officials, we are charged with
14 providing essential services in creating
15 policies that improve and benefit the
16 quality of life for all Philadelphians. And
17 in many cases where we have made gains as a
18 result of our legislative actions, whether
19 it's tackling the opioid crisis, providing
20 affordable housing or improving education,
21 we are faced with a barrier that we have yet
22 to truly overcome. And that barrier is
23 poverty.

24 It's been clinging to our City for
25 decades and it can no longer be acceptable

1 for a quarter of our population to live in
2 poverty. Furthermore, as elected officials
3 we could no longer tolerate being the
4 largest, poorest city in the country. Many
5 of us have made great strides in providing
6 programs that offer opportunities for
7 individuals and families to improve their
8 financial health.

9 Many of those opportunities have
10 created pathways to sustainable good paying
11 jobs, but we are here today to discuss an
12 opportunity that would provide assistance to
13 those living in poverty. The legislation
14 that I introduced, Bill No. 190746, would
15 provide a wage tax refund to almost 60,000
16 low-income Philadelphia households.

17 It would amend the City's current
18 reimbursement amount of a half of a percent.
19 We currently have a program where we
20 reimburse a half of a percent. This just
21 increases that program to 2.6 percent which
22 is the City's portion of the wage tax.

23 The impact, this would allow a
24 family of four earning an income of \$34,250
25 to receive about \$810 a year, a family of

1 four, \$34,250; \$810 a year. By 2024 if the
2 PICA portion of the wage tax is removed,
3 that reimbursement rate would be increased
4 allowing that same family to be reimbursed
5 more than \$1300.

6 I want to make it really clear,
7 this is not a new program. It is simply
8 expanding the current program administered
9 by the City's Revenue Department, allowing
10 low-income individuals and families to
11 receive an amount and almost full refund on
12 the amount they pay the City in wage taxes.
13 The facts are that Philadelphia taxes its
14 poorest population at the highest rate of
15 the top 50 cities in the country at 18
16 percent, larger than any other large city
17 across the country.

18 More, we shouldn't be filling the
19 City's coffers on the back of people earning
20 poverty wages. We should be putting their
21 hard-earned money back into their pockets to
22 help them thrive. This program is similar
23 to the Federal Earned Income Tax Credit. As
24 most in this legislative body know, we all
25 have been a tireless advocate for making

1 sure that everyone who qualifies for the
2 EITC applies for it.

3 Unfortunately, due to the states
4 uniformity clause, it's illegal for
5 Philadelphia to create an exact local copy
6 of the EITC program. We started
7 conversations with the Revenue Department in
8 March, and it has been understood that we
9 must rely on the state's verification
10 process. This would alleviate some of the
11 work on the City's end.

12 Since the program already exists,
13 Revenue does know how to manage it. If
14 Revenue needs to hire two new people to help
15 process a surge of refund applications, this
16 should not be a difficult task, especially
17 considering that we will be helping
18 thousands of low-income individuals.

19 Additionally, the City's
20 processing method is less strenuous because
21 those applying would already receive the
22 state's refund and the state would have
23 already verified that the taxpayer falls
24 within the guidelines. The structure of
25 this bill and its expansion of the wage tax

1 refund is the only legal way to provide wage
2 tax relief to our lowest income taxpayers.
3 And just because our tools might be dull but
4 uniformity, doesn't mean that we shouldn't
5 use them to help those who need relief the
6 most.

7 The administrative burden to
8 expand the program is extremely minor and
9 well worth it to put more money directly in
10 the hands of low-income workers.

11 Additionally, the City has the ability to
12 cover the costs to provide these refunds.
13 It has already shown it has the will to
14 increase its budget which in the last four
15 years went up \$855 million and tax revenues
16 have increased dramatically with the
17 thriving economy and they have outpaced
18 projections annually.

19 We need to extend this success to
20 the neighborhoods who need it most.
21 Understandably, this is just one step that
22 our City must take to help people in need.
23 Safe neighborhoods, quality schools,
24 fighting the infestation of drugs and
25 creating good paying jobs will all have to

1 be addressed to move the City forward. But
2 for individuals and families struggling to
3 get by, giving them immediate assistance to
4 pay their bills, buy food and help with the
5 day-to-day financial burden they face is
6 something all of us should be working on.

7 In addition to the testimony
8 you're about to hear from Benefits Data
9 Trust, I have written testimony in support
10 of this bill from CLS, the Campaign for
11 Working Families and the Reinvestment Fund.
12 It's time to make our tax system fair. I
13 hope City Council, all my colleagues and the
14 Mayor will join me in this effort.

15 And I will say on a personal note,
16 it's not right. It's an embarrassment to
17 me. It's wrong. We should not be taxing
18 people who can't put food on the table.
19 It's just wrong. And whatever we can do to
20 correct that and fix it, we need to do. So
21 thank you very much. Thank you, Chair.

22 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank you
23 very much, Councilman Domb. How do we
24 compare to other cities with this wage tax,
25 Mr. Dubow?

1 MR. DUBOW: So our wage tax is
2 relatively high compared to other cities.
3 And as the Councilman says, unlike other
4 cities we can't do a graduated tax. We have
5 to go a flat rate.

6 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: That's
7 what we're worried about. Councilman
8 Greenlee?

9 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank you,
10 Madam Chair. Thank you, Councilman Domb.
11 Mr. Dubow, a few years ago there was a vote
12 to take away the so-called cowen(ph) tax
13 cut. That's similarities of what we're
14 talking about here. I voted for that
15 because I think I was convinced the City had
16 a real financial problem. I took a little
17 heat for it. People reminded me who I
18 worked for for 26 years, but that's okay. I
19 think it was the right thing to do then.
20 But I heard on KYW today and other cities
21 were talking about it, and I know things can
22 change, but that we're much better
23 financially.

24 I guess just on a general sense
25 and, Councilman Domb, touch on this, why

1 shouldn't people who are working but not
2 making a lot of money, but are working, a
3 lot of City residents, we put some stuff on
4 them, we put some fees, I voted for most of
5 that, I voted for the soda tax, all that and
6 I don't apologize.

7 But why isn't -- shouldn't a
8 priority be given to those people again who
9 are working in the City of the Philadelphia
10 not making a lot of money and in a sense
11 sort of make up for some of the other stuff
12 that we're going after them? I know it's a
13 way general question.

14 MR. DUBOW: Yeah, and I think our
15 issue is not with the intent of the bill.
16 Our issue is we want to make sure that we're
17 providing that relief in the most effective
18 way possible. We would like to have those
19 discussions as part of 21 budget process,
20 and the change that this bill suggests
21 doesn't go into effect until FY21. So
22 having those discussions as part of the
23 budget process wouldn't delay the impact if
24 we decided, yes, this is the best way to do
25 it. But we'd really like to take a broader

1 look and see what's the best way to provide
2 that relief.

3 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: You talk
4 about the administrative burden -- I'm
5 sorry, maybe you said -- how much would that
6 be? Since you have a program already and
7 you're kind of expanding, you know, it's
8 expanding. Kind of define how much of an
9 administrative burden that would be.

10 MR. DUBOW: Two new employees
11 would be the additional administrative
12 burden.

13 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: I mean, you
14 know, two new employees, benefits, money,
15 doesn't sound like a lot.

16 MR. DUBOW: I think the real issue
17 is wanting to take the time to figure out
18 the best way to do this, and knowing that we
19 have the time because it's a bill that
20 doesn't have an impact until FY21.

21 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Okay. I --
22 Well, I'm not going to debate back and
23 forth. But to me, I think the way
24 Councilman Domb ended his statement, it just
25 seems fair that these are the people that we

1 need to help. This seems like a reasonable
2 way to do it to me, but I'll leave it at
3 that for the time being. Thank you, Madam
4 Chair.

5 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
6 you. Councilwoman Parker?

7 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you,
8 Madam Chair. And I just say good morning,
9 Mr. Dubow.

10 MR. DUBOW: Good morning.

11 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: I want to
12 start by saying a special thank you to
13 Councilman Allan Domb because, Councilman
14 Domb, I view what you've proffered as a tool
15 to get around the legislative refuse to give
16 Philadelphia the authority to enact its own
17 more progressive tax structure relative to
18 what we face with the uniformity clause.
19 And so, I want to thank you for being
20 thoughtful in that way in thinking about
21 Philadelphia's most vulnerable constituency.

22 And as with every time we've had a
23 conversation about this uniformity clause,
24 it makes me think about the impact on
25 nonPhiladelphians. And with that in mind,

1 if you could just refresh my memory, what
2 did you say our projected revenue collection
3 was supposed to be at about \$5 billion,
4 almost \$5 billion. What percentage of that
5 \$5 billion would you say the wage tax
6 represents?

7 MR. DUBOW: The wage tax combining
8 the PICA portion and the City portion is
9 about \$2 billion, so it's a big portion of
10 it.

11 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Repeat that
12 for us, if you will.

13 MR. DUBOW: About \$2 billion.

14 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: About \$2
15 billion, so almost about 44, 45 percent of
16 that number.

17 MR. DUBOW: Right.

18 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: When you
19 note that you think the average benefit
20 would be about \$41 a month and, you know, it
21 really always bugs me when I hear people
22 talk about how little any ROI is for people
23 who are struggling to make ends meet because
24 every little bit will count. But is there a
25 difference -- and some news outlet had even

1 said that it would be as much as \$800 a year
2 for a family.

3 Is there a difference in what that
4 amount would be for Philadelphia residents
5 versus nonresidents or again, it will be the
6 same across the board?

7 MR. DUBOW: It would be the same
8 across the board and the amount that you get
9 depends on how many family members you have.

10 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Great. Let
11 me also ask: Did you say about \$25 million,
12 that's the economic impact you think this
13 would have or was that in your testimony or
14 have I just heard it amongst the noise
15 relative --

16 MR. DUBOW: Yeah, I don't think
17 that was in my testimony.

18 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: So when you
19 think about the annual impact to the City's
20 revenue, what number would apply to that?

21 MR. DUBOW: So I think the highest
22 amount would be about \$25 million.

23 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Oh, okay.
24 All right, annual impact to the City's
25 revenue. So let me just see, if registering

1 for the program does somehow fall on the
2 wage earner, you kept talking about
3 implementation of challenges because they
4 already have to contend with applying to
5 other programs like LIHEAP and SNAP, like
6 how would all of that work, especially when
7 in your testimony you make reference to that
8 state form? And I hate to bureaucracy
9 associate it when people know what the
10 number of the forms are, but just how to get
11 there to even receive the benefit. So what
12 do you think about that?

13 MR. DUBOW: So it's a separate
14 application. I think the need to apply is
15 one of the reasons that the participation
16 rate in the current program is relatively
17 small, because it's a complicated procedure
18 for someone who wants to get the refund.

19 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay. I
20 just also want to note to Bill Sponsor
21 Councilman Allan Domb. I want to just note,
22 Councilman Domb, that I appreciate you and
23 your team acquiring the testimony of
24 Community Legal Services along with the
25 Reinvestment Fund, Campaign for Working

1 Families in particular because these are
2 organizations I know that I and all of our
3 colleagues have really relied on, because
4 when our people are in need of assistance
5 and they can't receive those services, those
6 are the people who we turn to, so I just
7 wanted to say thank you on the record for
8 that work. And thank you, Mr. Dubow, for
9 your testimony.

10 MR. DUBOW: Thank you.

11 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
12 you. Councilwoman Reynolds Brown?

13 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Good
14 morning, good morning and thank you, Madam
15 Chairwoman. Good morning, Rob Dubow.

16 MR. DUBOW: Morning.

17 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Let
18 me start first by echoing and underscoring
19 but I would say punctuating Councilwoman
20 Parker's comments with regards to Domb's
21 analysis, evidence matters, facts matter.
22 And to know that you've reached out to CLS
23 which is an organization I count on heavily
24 when we're trying to help those of us who
25 are on the edge of circumstances, just helps

1 to build a case for me, is always very, very
2 compelling so thank you for that.

3 What I need to know is given this
4 state law known as the uniformity clause, do
5 you know of any instances across the
6 Commonwealth where a local municipality had
7 to look at the uniformity clause and say,
8 no, we're not going to honor that because we
9 have to take care of this. Do you know of
10 any cases like that at all?

11 MR. DUBOW: I don't know of
12 anything like that. I know there is an
13 exemption for a specific class and
14 low-income individuals are defined as a
15 class.

16 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Is
17 that right?

18 MR. DUBOW: Yeah, and that's why
19 we're able to do the credit that we already
20 have for the wage tax.

21 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: So
22 given that exemption, we then are not in
23 noncompliance with the objective that's been
24 articulated in this bill?

25 MR. DUBOW: Right, this bill

1 doesn't violate the uniformity clause.

2 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: And
3 given the surplus, which for me makes it
4 very, very difficult to argue, given the
5 surplus and given the increase, we're simply
6 raising the number in many ways to capture
7 more families. State again why there is
8 reservation given what we're trying to
9 achieve.

10 MR. DUBOW: Yeah, so what we
11 really want to be able to do is as we go
12 through the FY21 budget process, because
13 this is something that doesn't go into
14 effect until FY21, look at whether this is
15 the best way to provide the relief that we
16 all want to provide and to go through a
17 process where we look at what our options
18 are and figure out what the best option is.

19 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: So
20 in effect you suggest we push this ball down
21 the hill a little bit and not reckon with
22 the reality that we're going to have to
23 reckon with anyway?

24 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

25 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: One

1 thing I learned from Councilwoman Sanchez
2 when looking at any kind of matter, in the
3 equation who are the losers in this effort?
4 We have winners and we have losers. So who
5 would be the losers in this?

6 MR. DUBOW: So I don't -- it's not
7 like a change in a tax where there's an
8 increase for some people and a decrease for
9 others. The only kind of loss is the loss
10 of revenue and what impact that might have
11 on our budget.

12 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: The
13 loss of revenue with the backdrop of a
14 surplus?

15 MR. DUBOW: Right. So notice in
16 my testimony I'm not saying we shouldn't do
17 this because of the cost.

18 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Yes,
19 I heard that.

20 MR. DUBOW: But you're asking me
21 who the losers would be, and that's the
22 downside.

23 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN:
24 Okay. All right. Thank you very much.
25 Thank you, Madam Chairwoman.

1 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
2 you. Councilman Henon? Councilman Domb?
3 Councilwoman Bass?

4 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Thank you.
5 Thank you, Madam Chair. Good morning.

6 MR. DUBOW: Good morning.

7 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: How are you?

8 MR. DUBOW: Good. How are you?

9 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: I'm very well.
10 Thank you. I just have a couple of
11 questions. The first is on the
12 communication that the Administration has
13 had with the sponsor because I find that so
14 much of the time the communication is a part
15 of the issue as to why we can't resolve so
16 many of the things that in my mind could so
17 easily be resolved.

18 And so, I noticed earlier in your
19 testimony you said that you just needed to
20 sit down with a sponsor and work out some
21 details. And it's my understanding you have
22 had some conversations with the Sponsor so I
23 don't know why we would want to delay
24 something knowing that you all are kind of
25 on the same page in terms of wanting this to

1 happen, working to make it happen, but it
2 almost sounds like it's just a matter of
3 time and amount in the Administration's
4 eyes.

5 So I don't understand, you know,
6 what the communication has been and why we
7 haven't been able to be more effective to
8 try to make this work on the
9 Administration's behalf.

10 MR. DUBOW: And it's really a
11 matter of figuring out what the best relief
12 is. Maybe this bill may not be this bill.
13 But again, it's something that doesn't take
14 effect until FY21, so it seems like
15 something that could be part of a larger
16 budget discussion when we're talking about
17 things that happen in 21.

18 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: But if we're
19 having the conversations now and knowing
20 that our budget has been -- that we have
21 significant surpluses in the last few years.
22 Isn't that something that we can have that
23 conversation now and take all of that into
24 account to have a dialogue so that we can
25 get something done now? We don't have to

1 wait even though it doesn't come into effect
2 until 2021.

3 MR. DUBOW: Right. And we had had
4 discussions yesterday about things to do in
5 the current year because that's where we
6 are. But when we look at 21, there will be
7 a whole series of things we're looking at
8 and it makes sense to look at things that
9 have an impact in 21 as part of that larger
10 conversation rather than isolation.

11 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Okay. I would
12 disagree with that. I think that we can
13 have some of these conversations along the
14 way and that at the end of the day, we would
15 take into account those other conversations
16 when we get to the budget cycle next year.
17 But I think that we have plenty of time to
18 work this out, try to figure out ways that
19 the Administration could support it and
20 figure this out now.

21 One of my concerns is that it
22 seems like when it comes to low-income
23 folks, poor folks, we always want to say,
24 oh, it's not going to make a difference, oh,
25 they don't need that money. And even

1 hearing your testimony, it says that it's
2 about \$41 which is not likely enough to lift
3 people out of poverty. Well, I agree, \$41
4 is not enough to lift someone out of
5 poverty. But if you ask someone who's
6 living in poverty, do you want your \$41 a
7 month or do you want the City of
8 Philadelphia to have it, guess what they
9 would say?

10 MR. DUBOW: Yeah, and again, we're
11 not saying we shouldn't do something. We're
12 saying we should figure out what the best
13 approach is and that might be something that
14 gets people more than \$41 a month.

15 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Well, I think
16 the \$41 is a start and I think that start
17 should begin as quickly as possible so if we
18 can do it now, we could be assured that we
19 could have at least \$41. And moving
20 forward, we could hopefully have a whole lot
21 more than that. I think it will make a big
22 difference.

23 The other thing I just wanted to
24 mention, this so much reminds me of a bill
25 that I had floated back in the spring around

1 tax amnesty and the idea that we give, and I
2 know that we're working on the tax abatement
3 structure right now, and I'm hopeful that
4 we'll have some significant changes around
5 tax payments. I truly believe that we will
6 as a body make some changes to tax payments.

7 But when we talked about tax
8 amnesty, the idea that we have people who
9 were willing to pay but really didn't have
10 the availability to pay when the tax bill
11 was due and because the City's interest and
12 penalty rate were just so extraordinarily
13 high, that that was something that we could
14 look at in terms of reducing the amount that
15 people would pay to the City on those
16 figures so that they could clear up any debt
17 that they had, so that they could find their
18 way clear and try to really have their
19 financial house in order.

20 And I think just going back, I'm
21 going to make another plug for support for
22 tax amnesty, that the City of Philadelphia
23 do a tax amnesty program some time in the
24 year 2020. That's something I think that we
25 just really can't minimize the impact that

1 it would have when we talk about taxes, the
2 way that taxes are affected, folks are
3 affected here in the City of Philadelphia
4 disproportionately and how we can make an
5 even level playing field.

6 Right now it's not even. It's not
7 level. But if we do some things to help
8 some folks out, we can greatly change what
9 we're doing here in terms of taxation of
10 policy here in the City of Philadelphia, so
11 I certainly hope that the Administration
12 would take that into account, particularly
13 in light of all of the surpluses that we
14 have had in recent years.

15 The City is doing very well
16 financially, at least on paper. So if we
17 can take into account that folks out here
18 are really struggling in a neighborhood, I
19 think that this will be something that will
20 be very helpful in terms of Councilman
21 Domb's bill as also looking at tax amnesty
22 in the future as well, so thank you.

23 MR. DUBOW: Thank you.

24 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
25 you, Madam Cindy Bass. Councilman Domb?

1 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Thank you, Madam
2 Chairwoman, and thank you to my colleagues
3 who asked questions today. I appreciate it.
4 Last few questions, Rob. The way I
5 understand it, the wage tax the City
6 collects is about \$2 billion a year. And
7 this program could cost maybe \$25 million.
8 So we're looking at a program that costs, if
9 I do the math correctly, just over 1 percent
10 of the total wage tax collection.

11 MR. DUBOW: That sounds about
12 right.

13 COUNCILMAN DOMB: And then the
14 other question, in the five-year plan for
15 the City, what is the projected growth of
16 wage tax collection, just in the growth? Is
17 it in the \$80 million to \$85 million per
18 year range?

19 MR. DUBOW: I'll tell you in a
20 second. Yeah, in the kind of 60-ish, 70-ish
21 range.

22 COUNCILMAN DOMB: So the growth of
23 wage taxes would even -- it's about
24 one-third of the wage tax that would help
25 60,000 households?

1 MR. DUBOW: That's right. But
2 that's kind of in a larger context of the
3 plan showing fund balances going down each
4 year. So if we're looking at the five
5 years, so we have to look at what happens
6 with our five-year plan.

7 COUNCILMAN DOMB: But keep in mind
8 one thing, we haven't weighed any economic
9 benefit about the fact that the people
10 getting this money are not going to put the
11 money in a 401k. They're going to pay off
12 bills. They're going to spend the money in
13 neighborhoods. They're going to
14 reinvigorate their economy with this money,
15 so it's going back into the economy. So
16 there's an economic benefit there also,
17 which I'm not even counting in this
18 proposal.

19 I'm just looking at this and
20 saying, you know what, it's terrible that we
21 have the reputation of the top 50 cities,
22 that we tax lower-income and people in
23 poverty the highest and we should eliminate
24 that reputation and give the money back to
25 them. They can't even put food on the table

1 let alone -- it's just not right. Anyway
2 thank you for your testimony. Thank you,
3 Madam Chair.

4 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
5 you. Are there any other questions for
6 Mr. Dubow?

7 (No response.)

8 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank you
9 very much. We'll call forward Panel 2, Will
10 Gonzales from Cieba, Pauline Abernathy,
11 Benefits Data Trust and a Greg Waltman who's
12 asked to speak here today.

13 (Panel approached Witness Table.)

14 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: We also
15 have written testimony from Monty Wilson,
16 Esquire, CLS; Ira Goldstein, Reinvestment
17 Fund; Mary Arthur, Campaign for Working
18 Families Inc. and Michael Dershowitz, a
19 business owner. That will be made as part
20 of the record as though they made the
21 presentations. Thank you. You may start in
22 either order.

23 MS. ABERNATHY: Good morning.
24 Thank you, Chairperson Blackwell and Members
25 of the Finance Committee, for the

1 opportunity to testify today in strong
2 support of this legislation to provide much
3 needed wage tax relief to low-income working
4 Philadelphians.

5 My name is Pauline Abernathy. I'm
6 Chief Strategy Officer for Benefits Data
7 Trust, a national nonprofit headquartered
8 here in Philadelphia across the street, with
9 a mission of providing -- helping people
10 live healthier more independent lives by
11 creating smarter ways to access essential
12 benefits and services, including tax
13 benefits such as the one we're discussing
14 today.

15 I don't need to tell any of you
16 that Philadelphia has the highest poverty
17 rate of any big city in the nation. It also
18 has the highest local wage tax in the
19 nation. Philadelphia's wage tax has been
20 mentioned as particularly pernicious and
21 regressive because it applies to every
22 dollar someone earns and it is the same
23 whether you earn \$2,000 or \$200,000. We are
24 literally taxing working Philadelphians in
25 and into poverty.

1 By contrast, New York City
2 provides a refundable Earned Income Tax
3 Credit that supplements the Federal EITC and
4 the State EITC and helps lift thousands of
5 New Yorkers out of poverty. So rather than
6 taxing their wages, it is supplementing
7 them. Every day BDT and our partners
8 BenePhilly initiative that helps people
9 city-wide access essential benefits and
10 services.

11 Here's a Philadelphian struggling
12 to make ends meet, a 43-year-old
13 Philadelphia man in Brewerytown recently
14 came to one of the BenePhilly centers for
15 help applying for energy assistance and food
16 assistance. He is raising three children on
17 his own, including an infant. He earns
18 \$15,000 a year at a catering company.

19 That means he paid about \$580 in
20 wage taxes. Under this bill if it were in
21 effect, he'd get a \$354 wage tax refund and
22 ultimately a full refund once the bill goes
23 full into effect. That's money he can use
24 to feed his children, pay his utility bills,
25 pay off his credit card debt. And this is

1 not an isolated case.

2 We estimate that between a half
3 and a third of BDT's working clients in
4 Philadelphia would benefit from this bill.
5 By 2024, a family of four could receive more
6 than \$1300 in wage tax relief, making this
7 bill a potentially valuable tool in the
8 City's strategy to reduce the number of
9 Philadelphians living in poverty by 2024.

10 As has been stated, low-income
11 residents are currently eligible for the 0.5
12 refund of the City wage tax, but very people
13 receive it. Last year less than 2 percent
14 of those eligible received it. The City and
15 state tax refund have identical eligibility
16 rules. So why did over 98 percent of those
17 who got the state tax not get the local tax
18 refund?

19 The answer is because the local
20 tax refund currently requires a separate
21 paper application form. BDT's core business
22 is to develop smarter ways to access
23 benefits and services. We know from
24 experience that the more complicated you
25 make an application, the fewer people will

1 get the benefit.

2 If you want to help more people
3 and make it easier to administer a benefit,
4 the way to do that is to tie it to another
5 benefit or an action, and that's what we
6 recommend be done in this case with the City
7 wage tax refund. We offer administrative
8 recommendations to increase the bill's
9 impact without changing anything in the bill
10 as drafted.

11 First is to work with the state to
12 make the process as automatic as possible.
13 Taxpayers should not have to fill out a
14 separate application for the local wage tax
15 refund if Philadelphians receiving the state
16 special tax refund are all eligible for the
17 City refund. The state could simply issue
18 local refunds when a resident claims the
19 state's special tax refund.

20 The City would then reimburse the
21 state for the total amount of the local
22 refunds. This is essentially how New York
23 City administers its EITC of how the EITC is
24 administered in New York City, the state
25 administers it. It is by far the simplest

1 solution.

2 The state of Pennsylvania
3 administers the local sales tax here as
4 well, so it's a -- precedent is here in
5 Pennsylvania as well as in New York state.
6 Alternatively, the City could obtain a list
7 from the state of all Philadelphian
8 residents who qualified for the state's
9 special tax refund and automatically issued
10 tax refunds to them.

11 Under either approach, automating
12 the process would both increase the
13 poverty-fighting impact of the tax refund
14 and reduce the administrative burden on
15 taxpayers and the Department of Revenue.
16 Second, short of the state administering the
17 local wage tax refund, which is by far the
18 best solution, there are low cost
19 opportunities for the City to greatly
20 simplify the local refund application.

21 CLS in their written testimony
22 made that point as well. This is a
23 complicated application and really isn't
24 necessary. Currently, the City tax form
25 asks people to report their wages in

1 six-month increments, January to June and
2 July to December. This is burdensome and
3 would not be necessary if the City applied a
4 single tax rate for the entire calendar
5 year.

6 In addition, there is no need for
7 filers to have to attach a paper copy of
8 their state tax form and their W2s because
9 the City Department of Revenue is already
10 checking with the state to confirm the
11 taxpayer qualified for the state's special
12 tax refund before issuing a local tax
13 refund. Lastly, this form should be
14 available for submission online and on a
15 mobile device.

16 Finally, the City can do much more
17 to get the word out about the local wage tax
18 refund. First, the City could ensure
19 national companies like Intuit who runs
20 TurboTax and H&R Block, promote and support
21 the local wage tax refund in the same way
22 that they currently support and promote the
23 state tax refund. In addition, community
24 partners like the Campaign for Working
25 Families could expand their efforts to help

1 eligible residents claim the local refund.

2 Thank you again, Chairperson
3 Blackwell, for the opportunity to testify in
4 support of this bill by increasing the value
5 of the wage tax refund and improving how it
6 is administered. This legislation will help
7 tens of thousands of Philadelphian families.

8 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank you
9 very much.

10 MR. GONZALES: Buenos dias. Good
11 morning. Thank you for inviting Cieba to
12 testify on this important bill before this
13 Committee of Council and thank you
14 Councilman Domb for introducing the bill.
15 Cieba supports allowing more than 60,000
16 Philadelphia households --

17 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
18 you. Please give us your name first.

19 MR. GONZALES: Oh, I'm sorry. My
20 name is Will Gonzales. I'm the Executive
21 Director of Cieba. Cieba supports allowing
22 more than 60,000 Philadelphians to be
23 reimbursed when they pay the City wage
24 taxes. This bill is important to Latinos,
25 the poorest ethnic group in the nation, in

1 the poorest big city, because it does more
2 than establish a local Earned Income Tax
3 Credit.

4 This bill is a powerful tool to
5 help our children. A local EITC will
6 magnify the federal EITC's well-documented
7 long-term positive effects on children.
8 According to numerous studies, some of them
9 catalogued in the CDC report from March 2019
10 stated that the EITC has kept more children
11 above the poverty line than any other tax
12 credit program.

13 A local EITC program in Montgomery
14 County, Maryland, for example, adopted in
15 1998, decreased the probability of low
16 birthrate babies by 1.9 to 2.4 percentage
17 points among likely eligible voters.
18 Philadelphia EITC will also decrease the
19 heavy tax burden borne by low-income workers
20 here in the City.

21 As has been stated before today
22 and I see that there is a need to echo it as
23 often as possible because that's the way to
24 bring in the point, is that people who live
25 in the Philadelphia area bear the highest

1 tax burden of any metro area in the United
2 States. If City leadership can be sensitive
3 to the tax burdens borne by big businesses
4 and take into consideration that to marshal
5 all-out efforts to forge plans, to implement
6 tax cuts, to attract corporations like
7 Amazon to Philadelphia, then the City has
8 the capacity to muster ways to implement a
9 local EITC to help low-wage earning families
10 stay in Philadelphia. That includes
11 streamlining how people access that local
12 EITC as stated by the Benefit Data Trust.

13 If we are committed to equitable
14 economic development, then we must aim to
15 encourage workers to live and work in the
16 City at the same time that we seek to
17 encourage corporations to come to
18 Philadelphia. A local EITC is a good
19 investment. EITC's incentivized low-income
20 individuals to enter the labor force.
21 Please note that by itself the Pennsylvania
22 Tax Forgiven Credit does not incentivize
23 people to work. And its benefits are
24 limited to the amount of tax the taxpayer
25 owes and this is not helpful to those who

1 pay little tax, including the lowest income
2 wage earners and many who are just entering
3 the work force from welfare.

4 The EITC -- local EITC
5 reimbursement of City wage taxes will also
6 bolster the economies of Philadelphia's
7 neighborhoods. Using the conservative
8 multiplier effect of 1.15 for tax refunds
9 determined by the Federal Reserve Bank of
10 Atlanta, one can project that the local EITC
11 will result in a 15 percent return for local
12 businesses for each dollar that the City
13 reimburses a low-wage worker in taxes.

14 This makes the local EITC a
15 powerful weapon in the arsenal that City
16 Council is building to help low-income
17 Philadelphians via a Special Committee on
18 Poverty, Prevention and Reduction.
19 Philadelphia is poised to make the most out
20 of a local EITC. United Way has marshaled a
21 collective of strong community
22 organizations, including Cieba, to provide,
23 volunteer income tax assistance services to
24 help low-income workers secure free
25 assistance with their income tax return

1 preparation and thereby access the federal
2 EITC.

3 The Department of Revenue of the
4 City has also shown great leadership in this
5 area by working with the volunteer income
6 tax assistance centers to access the federal
7 EITC. Accordingly, the Department of
8 Revenue and the Volunteer Income Tax
9 Assistance sites can collaborate to make
10 work the local EITC.

11 Thank you for your attention to
12 this matter. We welcome the opportunity to
13 provide you with additional information
14 about the importance of putting into place a
15 local EITC in Philadelphia.

16 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank you
17 very much.

18 MR. GONZALES: Thank you.

19 MR. WALTMAN: Council, General
20 Council, my name is Greg Waltman. I'm
21 representing Clean Energy Company, G1
22 Quantum. Before I begin, why I'm here, I
23 would just like to echo Councilwoman Bass'
24 comments about the \$41 and the income tax
25 initiative coming sooner than later.

1 Obviously, election year and economic
2 uncertainty, having that will allow the
3 dollar to cut across the periphery of
4 Philadelphia to stimulate growth, and that
5 would be a positive initiative, again admits
6 economic uncertainty.

7 Why am I here today? Well, it's a
8 similar tax. I guess you can think about
9 wire fraud as an intangible federal tax to
10 an extent. But the reason why I'm here
11 today is several-fold. There's an issue
12 regarding a gentleman by the name of Mark
13 Rubin and Nicole Lapin from the 76ers
14 basketball organization.

15 There's an ongoing issue where
16 once previously Nicole Lapin was a reporter.
17 I flagged shadowbanking and insider trading
18 fraud several years ago, and this matter has
19 been kind of progressing going on and on, on
20 a type of issue where they're allocating
21 resources to California-based social media
22 to explore different types of big data wire
23 fraud. And I just want to bring it to your
24 attention so that the Council could properly
25 address it in the proper context.

1 I mean, it has dissipated to an
2 extent, but there seems to be a blurred line
3 between issues like that that I've just
4 described to you which I will follow up with
5 you in email reaching finality and
6 continuing on, like I said, in this blurred
7 line of value, social media and allocating
8 resources to execute wire dragnets for
9 pretty malicious needs. So on that note, I
10 thank you for the Council's time and I
11 appreciate you addressing that issue.
12 Thanks.

13 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank you
14 very much. Councilman Domb?

15 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Thank you, Madam
16 Chair. I just want to thank the panel for
17 being here today and testifying and
18 information is very valuable. I also want
19 to thank all the written testimony we
20 received from all the other organizations,
21 so thank you very much for your support. We
22 really appreciate it. Thank you.

23 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
24 you. We thank those also who submitted
25 written testimony for submitting that for

1 this important issue. Are there any other
2 comments or questions? Is there anyone else
3 here who would like to testify?

4 (No response.)

5 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Seeing
6 none, this will conclude our part of the
7 hearing and we will enter Stated Meeting.
8 The Chair now recognizes Councilman Henon
9 for a motion on Bill No. 190746.

10 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you,
11 Madam Chair. I move that Bill No. 190746 be
12 reported from this Committee with a
13 favorable recommendation. I further move
14 that the rules of Council be suspended as to
15 permit the first reading of this bill in our
16 next session of City Council.

17 (Duly seconded.)

18 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: It is
19 removed and properly seconded that Bill No.
20 190746 be reported from this Committee with
21 the favorable recommendation and further
22 move that the rules of Council be suspended
23 to permit first reading of this bill at the
24 next session of Council. All those in favor
25 of the motion will signify by saying Aye.

1 (Aye.)

2 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Oppose?

3 (No response.)

4 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: The Ayes
5 have it. The motion carries, and Bill No.
6 190746 will be reported from this Committee
7 with a favorable recommendation and a
8 request that the rules of Council be
9 suspended so as to permit first reading at
10 our next session of Council.

11 Let me thank all Members of the
12 Finance Committee, all of you here to
13 testify. And this meeting is adjourned.

14 (Committee on Appropriations
15 concluded at 11:00 a.m.)

16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

I, hereby certify that the
proceedings and evidence noted are contained
fully and accurately in the stenographic
notes taken by me in the foregoing matter,
and this is a correct transcript of the
same.

Court Reporter - Notary Public

(The foregoing certification of
this transcript does not apply to any
reproduction of the same by any means,
unless under the direct control and/or
supervision of the certifying reporter.)

Committee on Finance
November 13, 2019

Page 1

A	Administra...	analysis 5:24	13:3 21:4	behalf 7:1	bills 13:4	build 22:1	3:5 8:12
a.m 1:6 48:15	3:21 5:12	21:21	35:15,16	26:9	32:12 35:24	building	13:21 14:10
abatement	7:11 25:12	and/or 49:22	43:23,25	believe 29:5	birthrate	43:16	17:4,8 25:5
29:2	27:19 30:11	annual 6:2	44:6,9	believes 5:12	41:16	burden 12:7	33:3 46:16
Abernathy	Administra...	19:19,24	associate 20:9	benefit 5:20	bit 18:24	13:5 16:4,9	47:8,11
33:10,23	26:3,9	annually 5:23	assured 28:18	8:15 18:19	23:21	16:12 38:14	Chairperson
34:5	administrat...	12:18	Atlanta 43:10	20:11 32:9	Blackwell	41:19 42:1	33:24 40:2
ability 12:11	12:7 16:4,9	answer 8:1	attach 39:7	32:16 36:4	1:11 2:2,13	burdens 42:3	Chairwoman
able 22:19	16:11 37:7	36:19	attention	37:1,3,5	2:24 3:6,8	burdensome	21:15 24:25
23:11 26:7	38:14	anticipates	44:11 45:24	42:12	8:3 13:22	39:2	31:2
acceptable	admits 45:5	6:8	attract 42:6	benefits 6:4	14:6 17:5	bureaucracy	challenges
8:25	adopted	anyway 23:23	authority	13:8 16:14	21:11 25:1	20:8	20:3
access 6:18	41:14	33:1	17:16	33:11 34:6	30:24 33:4	business	challenging
34:11 35:9	adoption 6:3	apologize	automatic	34:12,13	33:8,14,24	33:19 36:21	7:7
36:22 42:11	advocate	15:6	37:12	35:9 36:23	40:3,8,17	businesses	change 14:22
44:1,6	10:25	application	automatical...	42:23	44:16 46:13	42:3 43:12	15:20 24:7
accessible	affordable	20:14 36:21	38:9	BenePhilly	46:23 47:5	buy 13:4	30:8
7:23	8:20	36:25 37:14	automating	35:8,14	47:18 48:2		changes 29:4
account	agents 7:2	38:20,23	38:11	best 15:24	48:4	C	29:6
26:24 27:15	aggregate 7:8	applications	availability	16:1,18	Block 39:20	C 49:1,1	changing
30:12,17	ago 14:11	11:15	29:10	23:15,18	Blondell 1:14	calendar 39:4	37:9
accurately	45:18	applied 39:3	available 8:1	26:11 28:12	8:6	California-...	charged 8:13
49:4	agree 28:3	applies 11:2	39:14	38:18	blurred 46:2	45:21	checking
achieve 23:9	aid 5:4	34:21	average 6:5	better 14:22	46:6	call 8:8 33:9	39:10
acquiring	aim 42:14	apply 19:20	18:19	big 18:9	board 19:6,8	called 2:3	Cherelle 1:12
20:23	aligned 5:14	20:14 49:20	Aye 47:25	28:21 34:17	Bobby 1:11	7:11	3:15
action 7:11	all-out 42:5	applying	48:1	41:1 42:3	3:12	Campaign	Chief 34:6
37:5	Allan 1:12	11:21 20:4	Ayes 48:4	45:22	body 10:24	13:10 20:25	children
actions 8:18	3:14 8:9	35:15		bill 1:17 2:5,7	29:6	33:17 39:24	35:16,24
addition 6:22	17:13 20:21	appreciate	B	2:15,17 3:2	bolster 43:6	capacity 42:8	41:5,7,10
13:7 39:6	alleviate	20:22 31:3	babies 41:16	3:11,13,20	borne 41:19	capture 23:6	Cieba 33:10
39:23	11:10	46:11,22	back 10:19	4:20 7:17	42:3	card 35:25	40:11,15,21
additional	allocates 5:4	approach	10:21 16:22	8:9 9:14	Boulevard	care 22:9	40:21 43:22
16:11 44:13	allocating	4:21 5:13	28:25 29:20	11:25 13:10	1:5	carries 48:5	Cindy 1:14
Additionally	45:20 46:7	7:21 28:13	32:15,24	15:15,20	Brewerytown	case 22:1	8:4 30:25
11:19 12:11	allow 9:23	38:11	backdrop	16:19 20:20	35:13	36:1 37:6	circumstan...
address 45:25	45:2	approached	24:13	22:24,25	bring 41:24	cases 8:17	21:25
addressed	allowing 10:4	2:22 33:13	balances 32:3	26:12,12	45:23	22:10	cities 5:7
13:1	10:9 40:15	Appropriat...	ball 23:20	28:24 29:10	broader	catalogued	10:15 13:24
addressing	40:21	48:14	Bank 43:9	30:21 35:20	15:25	41:9	14:2,4,20
46:11	Alternatively	area 41:25	barrier 8:21	35:22 36:4	Brown 1:14	catering	32:21
adjourned	38:6	42:1 44:5	8:22	36:7 37:9	8:6 21:12	35:18	city 1:1,4 5:5
48:13	Amazon 42:7	argue 23:4	based 5:24	40:4,12,14	21:13,17	CDC 41:9	5:6 8:24 9:4
administer	amend 9:17	arsenal 43:15	basketball	40:24 41:4	22:16,21	centers 35:14	10:12,16
6:23 37:3	amending 2:9	Arthur 33:17	45:14	47:9,11,15	23:2,19,25	44:6	12:11,22
administered	amnesty 29:1	articulated	Bass 1:14 8:5	47:19,23	24:12,18,23	certain 2:12	13:1,13
10:8 37:24	29:8,22,23	22:24	25:3,4,7,9	48:5	budget 4:18	30:11	14:15 15:3
40:6	30:21	asked 31:3	26:18 27:11	bill's 3:21	12:14 15:19	certainly	15:9 18:8
administeri...	amount 9:18	33:12	28:15 30:25	4:13 5:18	15:23 23:12	certification	28:7 29:15
38:16	10:11,12	asking 24:20	Bass' 44:23	37:8	24:11 26:16	49:19	29:22 30:3
administers	19:4,8,22	asks 38:25	BDT 35:7	billion 18:3,4	26:20 27:16	certify 49:2	30:10,15
37:23,25	26:3 29:14	assistance	BDT's 36:3	18:5,9,13	Buenos 40:10	certifying	31:5,15
38:3	37:21 42:24	6:18 9:12	36:21	18:15 31:6	bugs 18:21	49:23	34:17 35:1
			bear 41:25			Chair 1:11	

Committee on Finance
November 13, 2019

Page 2

36:12,14 37:6,17,20 37:23,24 38:6,19,24 39:3,9,16 39:18 40:23 41:1,20 42:2,7,16 43:5,12,15 44:4 47:16 City's 7:9 9:17,22 10:9,19 11:11,19 19:19,24 29:11 36:8 city-wide 35:9 claim 40:1 claims 37:18 class 22:13,15 clause 7:15 11:4 17:18 17:23 22:4 22:7 23:1 Clean 44:21 clear 10:6 29:16,18 Clerk 2:6,8 clients 36:3 clinging 8:24 closely 5:13 CLS 13:10 21:22 33:16 38:21 Code 2:10 coffers 10:19 collaborate 44:9 colleagues 13:13 21:3 31:2 collection 18:2 31:10 31:16 collective 43:21 collects 31:6 combat 4:17 combining 18:7 come 2:20 27:1 42:17	comes 27:22 coming 44:25 comments 21:20 44:24 47:2 committed 42:13 Committee 1:2 2:3 3:6 8:7 33:25 40:13 43:17 47:12,20 48:6,12,14 Commonwe... 6:18 22:6 Commonwe... 7:14 communica... 25:12,14 26:6 community 20:24 39:23 43:21 commuters 5:3 6:1 companies 39:19 company 35:18 44:21 compare 13:24 compared 14:2 compelling 22:2 competitive 7:13 completed 6:11 complicated 6:23 20:17 36:24 38:23 concerned 5:2 concerns 27:21 conclude 47:6 concluded 48:15 concludes 7:25 conditions 2:12	confirm 39:10 confirming 6:11 conservative 43:7 consideration 42:4 considering 11:17 constituency 17:21 contained 49:3 contend 20:4 context 32:2 45:25 continue 3:18 continuing 46:6 contrast 35:1 contributions 7:18 control 49:22 conversation 17:23 26:23 27:10 conversations 11:7 25:22 26:19 27:13 27:15 convinced 14:15 copy 11:5 39:7 core 36:21 corporations 42:6,17 correct 13:20 49:6 correctly 31:9 cost 24:17 31:7 38:18 costs 12:12 31:8 Council 1:1 4:17,21 7:21 13:13 40:13 43:16 44:19,20 45:24 47:14 47:16,22,24 48:8,10	Council's 46:10 Councilman 1:11,12,13 1:13 2:17 2:25 3:10 3:12 8:9,11 13:23 14:3 14:7,9,10 14:25 16:3 16:13,21,24 17:13,13 20:21,22 25:2,2 30:20,25 31:1,13,22 32:7 40:14 46:14,15 47:8,10 Councilwo... 1:11,12,14 1:14 2:2,13 2:24 3:8,15 8:3,4,6 13:22 14:6 17:5,6,7,11 18:11,14,18 19:10,18,23 20:19 21:11 21:12,13,17 21:19 22:16 22:21 23:2 23:19,25 24:1,12,18 24:23 25:1 25:3,4,7,9 26:18 27:11 28:15 30:24 33:4,8,14 40:8,17 44:16,23 46:13,23 47:5,18 48:2,4 count 18:24 21:23 counting 32:17 country 9:4 10:15,17 County 41:14 couple 6:9 25:10	coupled 5:9 Court 49:12 cover 12:12 cowen(ph) 14:12 create 11:5 created 9:10 creating 8:14 12:25 34:11 credit 5:9 10:23 22:19 35:3,25 41:3,12 42:22 crisis 8:19 current 3:25 9:17 10:8 20:16 27:5 currently 5:18 9:19 36:11,20 38:24 39:22 cut 14:13 45:3 cuts 42:6 cycle 27:16	5:19 10:9 11:7 38:15 39:9 44:3,7 depends 19:9 Dershowitz 33:18 described 46:4 details 25:21 determined 6:13 43:9 develop 7:21 36:22 development 42:14 device 39:15 dialogue 26:24 dias 40:10 difference 18:25 19:3 27:24 28:22 different 45:22 difficult 11:16 23:4 direct 49:22 directly 12:9 Director 2:19 3:3,7 40:21 disagree 27:12 discuss 3:22 9:11 discussing 34:13 discussion 26:16 discussions 15:19,22 27:4 disproporti... 30:4 dissipated 46:1 diverts 5:3 doing 30:9,15 dollar 34:22 43:12 45:3 Domb 1:12 2:17,25 3:14 8:9,11 13:23 14:10 Department	14:25 16:24 17:13,14 20:21,22 25:2 30:25 31:1,13,22 32:7 40:14 46:14,15 Domb's 21:20 30:21 downside 24:22 drafted 5:18 37:10 dragnets 46:8 dramatically 12:16 drugs 12:24 Dubow 2:19 3:5,7,18,19 13:25 14:1 14:11 15:14 16:10,16 17:9,10 18:7,13,17 19:7,16,21 20:13 21:8 21:10,15,16 22:11,18,25 23:10,24 24:6,15,20 25:6,8 26:10 27:3 28:10 30:23 31:11,19 32:1 33:6 due 11:3 29:11 dull 12:3 Duly 47:17	35:17 easier 37:3 easily 25:17 echo 41:22 44:23 echoing 21:18 economic 4:16 19:12 32:8,16 42:14 45:1 45:6 economies 43:6 economy 12:17 32:14 32:15 edge 21:25 education 8:20 effect 15:21 23:14,20 26:14 27:1 35:21,23 43:8 effective 15:17 26:7 effectively 4:7 effects 41:7 efficacy 5:17 efficiency 5:17 efficient 7:13 effort 13:14 24:3 efforts 39:25 42:5 EITC 5:14,16 11:2,6 35:3 35:4 37:23 37:23 41:5 41:10,13,18 42:9,12,18 43:4,4,10 43:14,20 44:2,7,10 44:15 EITC's 41:6 42:19 either 33:22 38:11 elected 8:13 9:2 election 45:1
--	---	---	---	--	---	--	--

Committee on Finance
November 13, 2019

Page 3

eligibility 6:12 36:15	Excuse 3:9	47:13,21	follow 46:4	generate 5:14	11:24	41:25	6:15 34:12
eligible 6:1,15	execute 46:8	48:7	following 4:8	gentleman	H	hill 23:21	35:17 43:1
36:11,14	Executive	federal 10:23	6:3,25	45:12	H&R 39:20	hire 6:8 11:14	43:22
37:16 40:1	40:20	35:3 41:6	food 13:4,18	getting 32:10	half 9:18,20	honor 22:8	inclusion 5:2
41:17	exemption	43:9 44:1,6	32:25 35:15	give 7:12	36:2	hope 13:13	inclusive 7:9
eliminate	22:13,22	45:9	force 42:20	17:15 29:1	Hall 1:4	30:11	income 2:11
32:23	existing 5:19	feed 35:24	43:3	32:24 40:18	hands 12:10	hopeful 29:3	4:14,25 5:9
email 46:5	5:23 6:22	fees 15:4	foregoing	given 15:8	happen 26:1	hopefully	6:12 9:24
embarrass...	exists 11:12	fewer 36:25	49:5,19	22:3,22	26:1,17	28:20	10:23 12:2
13:16	expand 3:24	field 30:5	forge 42:5	23:3,4,5,8	happens 32:5	house 29:19	35:2 41:2
employee's	12:8 39:25	fighting	Forgiven	giving 13:3	happy 3:17	households	43:1,23,25
7:5	expanding	12:24	42:22	go 14:5 15:21	hard-earned	9:16 31:25	44:5,8,24
employees	10:8 16:7,8	figure 16:17	Forgiveness	23:11,13,16	40:16	housing 8:20	income-based
6:9 7:2	expands 5:19	23:18 27:18	2:10	goes 35:22	10:21		3:25
16:10,14	expansion	27:20 28:12	forgot 3:9	going 15:12	hate 20:8	I	incomes 5:8
employers	11:25	figures 29:16	form 6:11,20	16:22 22:8	He'll 2:20	idea 29:1,8	6:16 7:22
6:25 7:3	experience	figuring	20:8 36:21	23:22 27:24	headquarte...	identical	incorrectly
enact 17:16	5:7 36:24	26:11	38:24 39:8	29:20,21	34:7	36:15	6:21
enacting 7:16	explore 45:22	file 6:10,20	39:13	32:3,10,11	health 9:8	illegal 11:4	increase 4:14
encourage	extend 12:19	6:20 7:1	forms 20:10	32:12,13,15	healthier	immediate	5:21 12:14
42:15,17	extent 45:10	filers 39:7	forth 16:23	45:19	34:10	13:3	23:5 24:8
ended 16:24	46:2	fill 37:13	forward 2:20	Goldstein	hear 2:4 13:8	impact 7:24	37:8 38:12
ends 18:23	29:12	filling 10:18	7:20 13:1	33:16	18:21	9:23 15:23	increased
35:12	extreme 3:14	finality 46:5	28:20 33:9	Gonzales	heard 14:20	16:20 17:24	5:20 10:3
energy 35:15	extremely	Finally 39:16	four 9:24	33:10 40:10	19:14 24:19	19:12,19,24	12:16
44:21	12:8	Finance 1:2	10:1 12:14	40:19,20	hearing 28:1	24:10 27:9	increases
ensure 39:18	eyes 26:4	2:3,19 3:3,7	36:5	44:18	47:7	29:25 37:9	9:21
enter 42:20		33:25 48:12	fraud 45:9,18	good 2:2 9:10	heat 14:17	38:13	increasing
47:7	F	financial 9:8	45:23	12:25 17:8	heavily 21:23	impactful	5:8 40:4
entering 43:2	F 1:5 49:1	13:5 14:16	free 43:24	17:10 21:13	heavy 41:19	5:10	increments
entire 39:4	face 13:5	29:19	full 4:11	21:14,15	help 6:6	implement	39:1
entitled 2:10	17:18	financially	10:11 35:22	25:5,6,8	10:22 11:14	42:5,8	independent
equation 24:3	faced 8:21	14:23 30:16	35:23	33:23 40:10	12:5,22	implementa...	34:10
equitable	fact 32:9	find 25:13	fully 49:4	42:18	13:4 17:1	20:3	individuals
42:13	facts 10:13	29:17	fund 13:11	graduated	21:24 30:7	importance	4:24 5:11
especially	21:21	finite 5:4	20:25 32:3	14:4	31:24 35:15	44:14	6:10,20 7:8
2:15 11:16	fair 13:12	21:18 25:11	33:17	great 9:5	37:2 39:25	important	9:7 10:10
20:6	16:25	37:11 39:18	funds 5:3	19:10 44:4	40:6 41:5	40:12,24	11:18 13:2
Esquire	fall 20:1	40:18 47:15	7:24	greatly 30:8	42:9 43:16	47:1	22:14 42:20
33:16	falls 11:23	47:23 48:9	further 5:15	38:19	43:24	helpful 30:20	infant 35:17
essential 8:14	families 5:11	five 32:4	47:13,21	Greenlee 1:13	42:25	impooverished	infestation
34:11 35:9	9:7 10:10	five-year	Furthermore	3:11 14:8,9	helping 11:17	7:22	12:24
essentially	13:2,11	31:14 32:6	9:2	16:3,13,21	34:9	improve 8:15	information
37:22	21:1 23:7	fix 13:20	future 30:22	Greg 33:11	helps 21:25	9:7	7:4 44:13
establish 41:2	33:18 39:25	flagged 45:17	FY 4:2	44:20	35:4,8	improving	46:18
estimate 36:2	40:7 42:9	flat 14:5	FY21 15:21	group 40:25	Henon 1:11	8:20 40:5	initiative 35:8
ethnic 40:25	family 9:24	flexibility	16:20 23:12	grow 6:24,25	3:12 25:2	incentivize	44:25 45:5
evidence	9:25 10:4	7:12	23:14 26:14	growth 7:10	47:8,10	5:15 42:22	insider 45:17
21:21 49:3	19:2,9 36:5	floated 28:25	G	31:15,16,22	high 6:16	incentivized	instances
exact 11:5	far 37:25	focused 7:22	G1 44:21	45:4	14:2 29:13	42:19	22:5
example	38:17	folks 27:23,23	gains 8:17	guess 14:24	highest 10:14	include 4:23	intangible
41:14	favor 47:24	30:2,8,17	general 14:24	28:8 45:8	19:21 32:23	42:10	45:9
	favorable		15:13 44:19	guidelines	34:16,18	including 6:1	intended 5:15

Committee on Finance
November 13, 2019

Page 4

intent 3:22 4:14 7:17 15:15 interest 29:11 introduced 9:14 introducing 40:14 Intuit 39:19 investment 42:19 inviting 40:11 Ira 33:16 isolated 36:1 isolation 27:10 issue 15:15 15:16 16:16 25:15 37:17 45:11,15,20 46:11 47:1 issued 5:22 38:9 issues 46:3 issuing 39:12	22:12 25:23 26:5 29:2 32:20 36:23 knowing 16:18 25:24 26:19 known 22:4 KYW 14:20	34:24 little 14:16 18:22,24 23:21 43:1 live 5:6 9:1 34:10 41:24 42:15 lives 34:10 living 4:15,22 9:13 28:6 36:9 local 11:5 22:6 34:18 36:17,19 37:14,18,21 38:3,17,20 39:12,17,21 40:1 41:2,5 41:13 42:9 42:11,18 43:4,10,11 43:14,20 44:10,15 long-term 41:7 longer 8:25 9:3 look 7:20 16:1 22:7 23:14,17 27:6,8 29:14 32:5 looking 24:2 27:7 30:21 31:8 32:4 32:19 losers 24:3,4 24:5,21 loss 24:9,9,13 lot 15:2,3,10 16:15 28:20 low 38:18 41:15 low-income 7:18 9:16 10:10 11:18 12:10 22:14 27:22 34:3 36:10 41:19 42:19 43:16 43:24 low-wage 42:9 43:13	lower 7:18 lower-income 32:22 lowest 12:2 43:1	M Madam 8:11 14:10 17:3 17:8 21:14 24:25 25:5 30:25 31:1 33:3 46:15 47:11 magnify 41:6 making 10:25 15:2,10 36:6 malicious 46:9 man 35:13 manage 11:13 March 11:8 41:9 Mark 45:12 marshal 42:4 marshaled 43:20 Mary 33:17 Maryland 41:14 math 31:9 matter 21:21 24:2 26:2 26:11 44:12 45:18 49:5 matters 21:21 maximizes 7:24 Mayor 13:14 mean 12:4 16:13 46:1 meaning 6:14 means 7:3 35:19 49:21 media 45:21 46:7 meet 7:17 18:23 35:12 meeting 47:7 48:13 members 3:6 4:20 19:9	33:24 48:11 memory 18:1 mention 28:24 mentioned 34:20 method 11:20 metro 42:1 Michael 33:18 million 6:2 12:15 19:11 19:22 31:7 31:17,17 mind 17:25 25:16 32:7 minimize 29:25 minor 12:8 mission 34:9 mobile 39:15 mobility 4:16 money 10:21 12:9 15:2 15:10 16:14 27:25 32:10 32:11,12,14 32:24 35:23 Montgomery 41:13 month 6:5 18:20 28:7 28:14 Monty 33:15 morning 2:3 2:4 3:5 17:8 17:10 21:14 21:14,15,16 25:5,6 33:23 40:11 motion 47:9 47:25 48:5 move 5:11 13:1 47:11 47:13,22 moving 28:19 multiple 7:9 multiplier 43:8 municipal 5:16 municipality 22:6	muster 42:8 N N 49:1 name 34:5 40:18,20 44:20 45:12 nation 34:17 34:19 40:25 national 34:7 39:19 near 4:22 necessary 38:24 39:3 need 6:14 12:5,19,20 12:22 13:20 17:1 20:14 21:4 22:3 27:25 34:15 39:6 41:22 needed 7:4 25:19 34:3 needing 6:8 needs 11:14 46:9 neighborho... 30:18 neighborho... 12:20,23 32:13 43:7 new 10:7 11:14 16:10 16:14 35:1 35:5 37:22 37:24 38:5 news 18:25 Nicole 45:13 45:16 noise 19:14 noncomplia... 22:23 nonPhiladel... 17:25 nonpoverty 5:1 nonprofit 34:7 nonresidents 4:4,6,11,23 19:5 Notary 49:12 note 3:9 8:4 13:15 18:19	20:20,21 42:21 46:9 noted 49:3 notes 49:5 notice 24:15 noticed 25:18 November 1:6 number 18:16 19:20 20:10 23:6 36:8 numerous 41:8 O O 49:1 objective 22:23 obtain 38:6 obviously 6:6 45:1 offer 9:6 37:7 Officer 34:6 officials 8:13 9:2 oh 1:13 3:13 19:23 27:24 27:24 40:19 okay 14:18 16:21 19:23 20:19 24:24 27:11 once 35:22 45:16 one-third 31:24 ongoing 45:15 online 39:14 opioid 8:19 opportunities 9:6,9 38:19 opportunity 3:20 9:12 34:1 40:3 44:12 Oppose 48:2 option 23:18 options 23:17 order 2:4 29:19 33:22 ordinance 2:8 organization	21:23 45:14 organizations 21:2 43:22 46:20 outlet 18:25 outpaced 12:17 overcome 8:22 owes 42:25 owner 33:19 P PA 6:19 page 25:25 paid 35:19 panel 2:14 33:9,13 46:16 panelist 2:19 paper 30:16 36:21 39:7 paperwork 7:8 Parker 1:12 3:15 17:6,7 17:11 18:11 18:14,18 19:10,18,23 20:19 Parker's 21:20 part 15:19,22 25:14 26:15 27:9 33:19 47:6 participation 20:15 particular 21:1 particularly 30:12 34:20 partners 35:7 39:24 passage 3:23 pathways 9:10 Pauline 33:10 34:5 pay 4:7,24 10:12 13:4 29:9,10,15 32:11 35:24 35:25 40:23
---	---	---	--	--	---	--	---	---

Committee on Finance
November 13, 2019

Page 5

43:1 paying 9:10 12:25 payments 29:5,6 penalty 29:12 Pennsylvania 1:5 6:11 38:2,5 42:21 pensions 6:16 people 5:6,8 6:7 10:19 11:14 12:22 13:18 14:17 15:1,8 16:25 18:21 18:22 20:9 21:4,6 24:8 28:3,14 29:8,15 32:9,22 34:9 35:8 36:12,25 37:2 38:25 41:24 42:11 42:23 percent 3:25 4:4 9:18,20 9:21 10:16 18:15 31:9 36:13,16 43:11 percentage 18:4 41:16 periphery 45:3 permit 47:15 47:23 48:9 pernicious 34:20 personal 13:15 Philadelphia 1:1,5 2:9 4:2 7:12,15 9:16 10:13 11:5 15:9 17:16 19:4 28:8 29:22 30:3,10 34:8,16 35:13 36:4	40:16 41:18 41:25 42:7 42:10,18 43:19 44:15 45:4 Philadelphi... 17:21 34:19 43:6 Philadelphi... 35:11 38:7 40:7 Philadelphi... 4:15 5:4 7:23 8:16 34:4,24 36:9 37:15 40:22 43:17 PICA 4:7,9 10:2 18:8 place 44:14 plan 31:14 32:3,6 plans 42:5 playing 30:5 Please 3:18 40:18 42:21 plenty 27:17 plug 29:21 pockets 10:21 point 38:22 41:24 points 41:17 poised 43:19 policies 8:15 policy 30:10 poor 27:23 poorest 9:4 10:14 40:25 41:1 population 9:1 10:14 portion 4:7,9 9:22 10:2 18:8,8,9 positive 41:7 45:5 possible 15:18 28:17 37:12 41:23 potentially 36:7 poverty 2:11 4:15,18,23	5:8,12 6:7 7:19 8:23 9:2,13 10:20 28:3 28:5,6 32:23 34:16 34:25 35:5 36:9 41:11 43:18 poverty-fig... 38:13 powerful 41:4 43:15 precedent 38:4 preparation 44:1 preparing 2:18 present 1:10 8:8 presentations 33:21 pretty 46:9 Prevention 43:18 prevents 7:15 previously 45:16 priority 4:18 15:8 probability 41:15 problem 14:16 procedure 20:17 proceedings 49:3 process 6:9 7:5 11:10 11:15 15:19 15:23 23:12 23:17 37:12 38:12 processing 11:20 proffered 17:14 program 5:20 5:23 6:10 6:19 9:19 9:21 10:7,8	10:22 11:6 11:12 12:8 16:6 20:1 20:16 29:23 31:7,8 41:12,13 programs 9:6 20:5 progressing 45:19 progressive 7:13,16 17:17 project 43:10 projected 18:2 31:15 projections 12:18 promote 39:20,22 promoting 4:16 proper 45:25 properly 45:24 47:19 proposal 32:18 provide 5:5 9:12,15 12:1,12 16:1 23:15 23:16 34:2 43:22 44:13 provides 5:13 35:2 providing 8:14,19 9:5 15:17 34:9 Public 49:12 punctuating 21:19 push 23:20 put 12:9 13:18 15:3 15:4 32:10 32:25 putting 10:20 44:14	qualifies 11:1 qualifying 4:2,4,10 quality 8:16 12:23 quarter 9:1 question 15:13 31:14 questions 8:1 25:11 31:3 31:4 33:5 47:2 quickly 28:17 quorum 3:10 3:16 R R 49:1 raise 7:21 raising 23:6 35:16 range 31:18 31:21 rate 2:11 10:3 10:14 14:5 20:16 29:12 34:17 39:4 reached 21:22 reaching 46:5 read 2:6 reading 47:15 47:23 48:9 real 14:16 16:16 reality 23:22 really 10:6 15:25 18:21 21:3 23:11 26:10 29:9 29:18,25 30:18 38:23 46:22 reason 4:17 45:10 reasonable 17:1 reasons 3:22 20:15 rebate 6:10 6:22 receive 4:3,5 4:11 9:25 10:11 11:21	20:11 21:5 36:5,13 received 36:14 46:20 receiving 37:15 reckon 23:21 23:23 recognizes 47:8 recommend 37:6 recommend... 47:13,21 48:7 recommend... 37:8 record 21:7 33:20 reduce 36:8 38:14 reducing 29:14 reduction 2:6 43:18 reference 20:7 refresh 18:1 refund 4:1,4 4:5,12 5:19 6:15 7:5 9:15 10:11 11:15,22 12:1 20:18 35:21,22 36:12,15,18 36:20 37:7 37:15,16,17 37:19 38:9 38:13,17,20 39:12,13,18 39:21,23 40:1,5 refundable 35:2 refunds 2:10 5:13,22,22 6:2,9 12:12 37:18,22 38:10 43:8 refuse 17:15 regarding 2:5 45:12	regards 21:20 registering 19:25 regressive 34:21 reimburse 9:20 37:20 reimbursed 10:4 40:23 reimburse... 9:18 10:3 43:5 reimburses 43:13 Reinvestme... 13:11 20:25 33:16 reinvigorate 32:14 relative 17:17 19:15 relatively 14:2 20:16 released 7:10 relied 21:3 relief 5:5 12:2 12:5 15:17 16:2 23:15 26:11 34:3 36:6 rely 11:9 reminded 14:17 reminds 28:24 removed 10:2 47:19 Repeat 18:11 report 38:25 41:9 reported 47:12,20 48:6 reporter 45:16 49:12 49:23 representing 44:21 represents 18:6 reproduction 49:21 reputation	32:21,24 request 48:8 requires 6:10 36:20 Research 5:6 reservation 23:8 Reserve 43:9 resident 37:18 residents 4:3 4:6,10,22 15:3 19:4 36:11 38:8 40:1 resolve 25:15 resolved 25:17 resources 5:5 5:17 45:21 46:8 response 33:7 47:4 48:3 result 8:18 43:11 results 5:15 retrieve 7:4 return 43:11 43:25 returns 7:1 revenue 5:20 5:24 6:8 7:6 7:7 10:9 11:7,13,14 18:2 19:20 19:25 24:10 24:13 38:15 39:9 44:3,8 revenues 12:15 revise 2:11 Reynolds 1:14 8:6 21:12,13,17 22:16,21 23:2,19,25 24:12,18,23 right 2:25 3:2 3:12,13 13:16 14:19 18:17 19:24 22:17,25 24:15,24
---	--	--	--	---	--	--	---

Committee on Finance
November 13, 2019

Page 6

27:3 29:3 30:6 31:12 32:1 33:1 Rob 2:19 3:7 8:12 21:15 31:4 ROI 18:22 Room 1:4 roughly 4:3,5 5:22,25 Rubin 45:13 rules 36:16 47:14,22 48:8 runs 39:19	several-fold 45:11 shadowban... 45:17 shape 4:21 short 38:16 showing 32:3 shown 5:7 12:13 44:4 significant 26:21 29:4 signify 47:25 similar 10:22 45:8 similarities 14:13 simplest 37:25 simplify 38:20 simply 10:7 23:5 37:17 single 39:4 sit 25:20 sites 44:9 six-month 39:1 small 20:17 smarter 34:11 36:22 SNAP 20:5 so-called 14:12 social 45:21 46:7 soda 15:5 solution 38:1 38:18 sooner 44:25 sorry 16:5 40:19 sort 15:11 sound 16:15 sounds 26:2 31:11 sources 4:25 6:17 speak 2:18 33:12 special 17:12 37:16,19 38:9 39:11 43:17	specific 22:13 spend 4:19 32:12 sponsor 2:15 2:17 3:1,13 4:20 8:9 20:20 25:13 25:20,22 spring 28:25 stages 4:1 start 17:12 21:18 28:16 28:16 33:21 started 11:6 Starting 4:1 state 6:14 7:11 11:22 20:8 22:4 23:7 35:4 36:15,17 37:11,15,17 37:21,24 38:2,5,7,16 39:8,10,23 state's 11:9 11:22 37:19 38:8 39:11 stated 36:10 41:10,21 42:12 47:7 statement 3:1 3:4 8:10 16:24 statements 2:16 states 11:3 42:2 stay 42:10 stenographic 49:4 step 12:21 stimulate 45:4 strategy 7:10 34:6 36:8 streamlining 42:11 street 34:8 strenuous 11:20 strides 9:5 strong 34:1 43:21	structure 7:14,16 11:24 17:17 29:3 struggling 13:2 18:23 30:18 35:11 studies 41:8 stuff 15:3,11 submission 39:14 submitted 46:24 submitting 46:25 success 12:19 suggest 23:20 suggests 5:24 15:20 sunset 4:9 supervision 49:23 supplement... 35:6 supplements 35:3 support 3:23 4:13 13:9 27:19 29:21 34:2 39:20 39:22 40:4 46:21 supports 3:21 40:15,21 supposed 18:3 sure 11:1 15:16 surge 11:15 surplus 23:3 23:5 24:14 surpluses 26:21 30:13 suspended 47:14,22 48:9 sustainable 9:10 system 6:23 13:12	13:18 32:25 33:13 tackling 8:19 take 12:22 14:12 15:25 16:17 22:9 26:13,23 27:15 30:12 30:17 42:4 taken 49:5 talk 16:3 18:22 30:1 talked 29:7 talking 14:14 14:21 20:2 26:16 targeted 4:22 task 11:16 tax 2:5,11 3:25 4:8,10 4:11,24 5:5 5:9 7:1,3,14 7:16,18 9:15,22 10:2,23 11:25 12:2 12:15 13:12 13:24 14:1 14:4,12 15:5 17:17 18:5,7 22:20 24:7 29:1,2,5,6,7 29:10,22,23 30:21 31:5 31:10,16,24 32:22 34:3 34:12,18,19 35:2,21 36:6,12,15 36:17,17,20 37:7,14,16 37:19 38:3 38:9,10,13 38:17,24 39:4,8,12 39:12,17,21 39:23 40:5 41:2,11,19 42:1,3,6,22 42:24 43:1 43:8,23,25 44:6,8,24	45:8,9 taxable 6:17 taxation 30:9 taxes 10:12 10:13 30:1 30:2 31:23 35:20 40:24 43:5,13 taxing 13:17 34:24 35:6 taxpayer 11:23 39:11 42:24 taxpayers 5:25 6:5,14 12:2 37:13 38:15 team 20:23 tell 31:19 34:15 tens 40:7 terms 2:12 25:25 29:14 30:9,20 terrible 32:20 testify 2:20 3:20 34:1 40:3,12 47:3 48:13 testifying 46:17 testimony 3:23 7:25 8:12 13:7,9 19:13,17 20:7,23 21:9 24:16 25:19 28:1 33:2,15 38:21 46:19 46:25 thank 2:13,20 3:8,15,17 3:19 8:3,7 8:11 13:21 13:21,22 14:9,10 17:3,5,7,12 17:19 21:7 21:8,10,11 21:14 22:2 24:24,25 25:1,4,5,10	30:22,23,24 31:1,2 33:2 33:2,4,8,21 33:24 40:2 40:8,11,13 40:17 44:11 44:16,18 46:10,13,15 46:16,19,21 46:22,23,24 47:10 48:11 thanks 8:12 46:12 thing 14:19 24:1 28:23 32:8 things 14:21 25:16 26:17 27:4,7,8 30:7 think 14:15 14:19 15:14 16:16,23 17:24 18:19 19:12,16,19 19:21 20:12 20:14 27:12 27:17 28:15 28:16,21 29:20,24 30:19 45:8 thinking 17:20 third 36:3 thoughtful 17:20 thousands 11:18 35:4 40:7 three 35:16 threshold 6:13 thrive 10:22 thriving 12:17 tie 37:4 time 3:24 4:19 13:12 16:17,19 17:3,22 25:14 26:3 27:17 29:23 42:16 46:10	tireless 10:25 title 2:7 today 9:11 14:20 31:3 33:12 34:1 34:14 41:21 45:7,11 46:17 tolerate 9:3 tool 17:14 36:7 41:4 tools 12:3 top 10:15 32:21 total 31:10 37:21 touch 14:25 trading 45:17 transcript 49:6,20 truly 8:22 29:5 Trust 13:9 33:11 34:7 42:12 try 26:8 27:18 29:18 trying 21:24 23:8 TurboTax 39:20 turn 21:6 two 4:1 11:14 16:10,14 type 45:20 types 45:22
S Safe 12:23 sales 38:3 Sanchez 24:1 saying 17:12 24:16 28:11 28:12 32:20 47:25 says 14:3 28:1 scale 5:10 scarce 5:16 scheduled 4:9 schools 12:23 second 31:20 38:16 seconded 47:17,19 Section 2:9 secure 43:24 see 3:17 16:1 19:25 41:22 Seeing 47:5 seek 42:16 sense 14:24 15:10 27:8 sensitive 42:2 separate 20:13 36:20 37:14 series 27:7 services 8:14 20:24 21:5 34:12 35:10 36:23 43:23 serving 7:2 session 47:16 47:24 48:10	several-fold 45:11 shadowban... 45:17 shape 4:21 short 38:16 showing 32:3 shown 5:7 12:13 44:4 significant 26:21 29:4 signify 47:25 similar 10:22 45:8 similarities 14:13 simplest 37:25 simplify 38:20 simply 10:7 23:5 37:17 single 39:4 sit 25:20 sites 44:9 six-month 39:1 small 20:17 smarter 34:11 36:22 SNAP 20:5 so-called 14:12 social 45:21 46:7 soda 15:5 solution 38:1 38:18 sooner 44:25 sorry 16:5 40:19 sort 15:11 sound 16:15 sounds 26:2 31:11 sources 4:25 6:17 speak 2:18 33:12 special 17:12 37:16,19 38:9 39:11 43:17	specific 22:13 spend 4:19 32:12 sponsor 2:15 2:17 3:1,13 4:20 8:9 20:20 25:13 25:20,22 spring 28:25 stages 4:1 start 17:12 21:18 28:16 28:16 33:21 started 11:6 Starting 4:1 state 6:14 7:11 11:22 20:8 22:4 23:7 35:4 36:15,17 37:11,15,17 37:21,24 38:2,5,7,16 39:8,10,23 state's 11:9 11:22 37:19 38:8 39:11 stated 36:10 41:10,21 42:12 47:7 statement 3:1 3:4 8:10 16:24 statements 2:16 states 11:3 42:2 stay 42:10 stenographic 49:4 step 12:21 stimulate 45:4 strategy 7:10 34:6 36:8 streamlining 42:11 street 34:8 strenuous 11:20 strides 9:5 strong 34:1 43:21	structure 7:14,16 11:24 17:17 29:3 struggling 13:2 18:23 30:18 35:11 studies 41:8 stuff 15:3,11 submission 39:14 submitted 46:24 submitting 46:25 success 12:19 suggest 23:20 suggests 5:24 15:20 sunset 4:9 supervision 49:23 supplement... 35:6 supplements 35:3 support 3:23 4:13 13:9 27:19 29:21 34:2 39:20 39:22 40:4 46:21 supports 3:21 40:15,21 supposed 18:3 sure 11:1 15:16 surge 11:15 surplus 23:3 23:5 24:14 surpluses 26:21 30:13 suspended 47:14,22 48:9 sustainable 9:10 system 6:23 13:12	13:18 32:25 33:13 tackling 8:19 take 12:22 14:12 15:25 16:17 22:9 26:13,23 27:15 30:12 30:17 42:4 taken 49:5 talk 16:3 18:22 30:1 talked 29:7 talking 14:14 14:21 20:2 26:16 targeted 4:22 task 11:16 tax 2:5,11 3:25 4:8,10 4:11,24 5:5 5:9 7:1,3,14 7:16,18 9:15,22 10:2,23 11:25 12:2 12:15 13:12 13:24 14:1 14:4,12 15:5 17:17 18:5,7 22:20 24:7 29:1,2,5,6,7 29:10,22,23 30:21 31:5 31:10,16,24 32:22 34:3 34:12,18,19 35:2,21 36:6,12,15 36:17,17,20 37:7,14,16 37:19 38:3 38:9,10,13 38:17,24 39:4,8,12 39:12,17,21 39:23 40:5 41:2,11,19 42:1,3,6,22 42:24 43:1 43:8,23,25 44:6,8,24	45:8,9 taxable 6:17 taxation 30:9 taxes 10:12 10:13 30:1 30:2 31:23 35:20 40:24 43:5,13 taxing 13:17 34:24 35:6 taxpayer 11:23 39:11 42:24 taxpayers 5:25 6:5,14 12:2 37:13 38:15 team 20:23 tell 31:19 34:15 tens 40:7 terms 2:12 25:25 29:14 30:9,20 terrible 32:20 testify 2:20 3:20 34:1 40:3,12 47:3 48:13 testifying 46:17 testimony 3:23 7:25 8:12 13:7,9 19:13,17 20:7,23 21:9 24:16 25:19 28:1 33:2,15 38:21 46:19 46:25 thank 2:13,20 3:8,15,17 3:19 8:3,7 8:11 13:21 13:21,22 14:9,10 17:3,5,7,12 17:19 21:7 21:8,10,11 21:14 22:2 24:24,25 25:1,4,5,10	30:22,23,24 31:1,2 33:2 33:2,4,8,21 33:24 40:2 40:8,11,13 40:17 44:11 44:16,18 46:10,13,15 46:16,19,21 46:22,23,24 47:10 48:11 thanks 8:12 46:12 thing 14:19 24:1 28:23 32:8 things 14:21 25:16 26:17 27:4,7,8 30:7 think 14:15 14:19 15:14 16:16,23 17:24 18:19 19:12,16,19 19:21 20:12 20:14 27:12 27:17 28:15 28:16,21 29:20,24 30:19 45:8 thinking 17:20 third 36:3 thoughtful 17:20 thousands 11:18 35:4 40:7 three 35:16 threshold 6:13 thrive 10:22 thriving 12:17 tie 37:4 time 3:24 4:19 13:12 16:17,19 17:3,22 25:14 26:3 27:17 29:23 42:16 46:10	tireless 10:25 title 2:7 today 9:11 14:20 31:3 33:12 34:1 34:14 41:21 45:7,11 46:17 tolerate 9:3 tool 17:14 36:7 41:4 tools 12:3 top 10:15 32:21 total 31:10 37:21 touch 14:25 trading 45:17 transcript 49:6,20 truly 8:22 29:5 Trust 13:9 33:11 34:7 42:12 try 26:8 27:18 29:18 trying 21:24 23:8 TurboTax 39:20 turn 21:6 two 4:1 11:14 16:10,14 type 45:20 types 45:22
S Safe 12:23 sales 38:3 Sanchez 24:1 saying 17:12 24:16 28:11 28:12 32:20 47:25 says 14:3 28:1 scale 5:10 scarce 5:16 scheduled 4:9 schools 12:23 second 31:20 38:16 seconded 47:17,19 Section 2:9 secure 43:24 see 3:17 16:1 19:25 41:22 Seeing 47:5 seek 42:16 sense 14:24 15:10 27:8 sensitive 42:2 separate 20:13 36:20 37:14 series 27:7 services 8:14 20:24 21:5 34:12 35:10 36:23 43:23 serving 7:2 session 47:16 47:24 48:10	several-fold 45:11 shadowban... 45:17 shape 4:21 short 38:16 showing 32:3 shown 5:7 12:13 44:4 significant 26:21 29:4 signify 47:25 similar 10:22 45:8 similarities 14:13 simplest 37:25 simplify 38:20 simply 10:7 23:5 37:17 single 39:4 sit 25:20 sites 44:9 six-month 39:1 small 20:17 smarter 34:11 36:22 SNAP 20:5 so-called 14:12 social 45:21 46:7 soda 15:5 solution 38:1 38:18 sooner 44:25 sorry 16:5 40:19 sort 15:11 sound 16:15 sounds 26:2 31:11 sources 4:25 6:17 speak 2:18 33:12 special 17:12 37:16,19 38:9 39:11 43:17	specific 22:13 spend 4:19 32:12 sponsor 2:15 2:17 3:1,13 4:20 8:9 20:20 25:13 25:20,22 spring 28:25 stages 4:1 start 17:12 21:18 28:16 28:16 33:21 started 11:6 Starting 4:1 state 6:14 7:11 11:22 20:8 22:4 23:7 35:4 36:15,17 37:11,15,17 37:21,24 38:2,5,7,16 39:8,10,23 state's 11:9 11:22 37:19 38:8 39:11 stated 36:10 41:10,21 42:12 47:7 statement 3:1 3:4 8:10 16:24 statements 2:16 states 11:3 42:2 stay 42:10 stenographic 49:4 step 12:21 stimulate 45:4 strategy 7:10 34:6 36:8 streamlining 42:11 street 34:8 strenuous 11:20 strides 9:5 strong 34:1 43:21	structure 7:14,16 11:24 17:17 29:3 struggling 13:2 18:23 30:18 35:11 studies 41:8 stuff 15:3,11 submission 39:14 submitted 46:24 submitting 46:25 success 12:19 suggest 23:20 suggests 5:24 15:20 sunset 4:9 supervision 49:23 supplement... 35:6 supplements 35:3 support 3:23 4:13 13:9 27:19 29:21 34:2 39:20 39:22 40:4 46:21 supports 3:21 40:15,21 supposed 18:3 sure 11:1 15:16 surge 11:15 surplus 23:3 23:5 24:14 surpluses 26:21 30:13 suspended 47:14,22 48:9 sustainable 9:10 system 6:23 13:12	13:18 32:25 33:13 tackling 8:19 take 12:22 14:12 15:25 16:17 22:9 26:13,23 27:15 30:12 30:17 42:4 taken 49:5 talk 16:3 18:22 30:1 talked 29:7 talking 14:14 14:21 20:2 26:16 targeted 4:22 task 11:16 tax 2:5,11 3:25 4:8,10 4:11,24 5:5 5:9 7:1,3,14 7:16,18 9:15,22 10:2,23 11:25 12:2 12:15 13:12 13:24 14:1 14:4,12 15:5 17:17 18:5,7 22:20 24:7 29:1,2,5,6,7 29:10,22,23 30:21 31:5 31:10,16,24 32:22 34:3 34:12,18,19 35:2,21 36:6,12,15 36:17,17,20 37:7,14,16 37:19 38:3 38:9,10,13 38:17,24 39:4,8,12 39:12,17,21 39:23 40:5 41:2,11,19 42:1,3,6,22 42:24 43:1 43:8,23,25 44:6,8,24	45:8,9 taxable 6:17 taxation 30:9 taxes 10:12 10:13 30:1 30:2 31:23 35:20 40:24 43:5,13 taxing 13:17 34:24 35:6 taxpayer 11:23 39:11 42:24 taxpayers 5:25 6:5,14 12:2 37:13 38:15 team 20:23 tell 31:19 34:15 tens 40:7 terms 2:12 25:25 29:14 30:9,20 terrible 32:20 testify 2:20 3:20 34:1 40:3,12 47:3 48:13 testifying 46:17 testimony 3:23 7:25 8:12 13:7,9 19:13,17 20:7,23 21:9 24:16 25:19 28:1 33:2,15 38:21 46:19 46:25 thank 2:13,20 3:8,15,17 3:19 8:3,7 8:11 13:21 13:21,22 14:9,10 17:3,5,7,12 17:19 21:7 21:8,10,11 21:14 22:2 24:24,25 25:1,4,5,10	30:22,23,24 31:1,2 33:2 33:2,4,8,21 33:24 40:2 40:8,11,13 40:17 44:11 44:16,18 46:10,13,15 46:16,19,21 46:22,23,24 47:10 48:11 thanks 8:12 46:12 thing 14:19 24:1 28:23 32:8 things 14:21 25:16 26:17 27:4,7,8 30:7 think 14:15 14:19 15:14 16:16,23 17:24 18:19 19:12,16,19 19:21 20:12 20:14 27:12 27:17 28:15 28:16,21 29:20,24 30:19 45:8 thinking 17:20 <	

Committee on Finance
November 13, 2019

Page 7

uniformity 7:15 11:4 12:4 17:18 17:23 22:4 22:7 23:1 United 42:1 43:20 uptake 5:16 6:24 use 5:16 7:24 12:5 35:23 utility 35:24 utilization 5:21	36:6,12 37:7,14 38:17 39:17 39:21 40:5 40:23 43:2 43:5 wages 10:20 35:6 38:25 wait 3:2 27:1 Waltman 33:11 44:19 44:20 want 8:8 10:6 15:16 17:11 17:19 20:20 20:21 23:11 23:16 25:23 27:23 28:6 28:7 37:2 45:23 46:16 46:18 wanted 21:7 28:23 wanting 16:17 25:25 wants 20:18 way 12:1 15:13,18,24 16:1,18,23 17:2,20 23:15 27:14 29:18 30:2 31:4 37:4 39:21 41:23 43:20 ways 23:6 27:18 34:11 36:22 42:8 we'll 3:2 29:4 33:9 we're 3:17 5:2 14:7,13,22 15:12,16 21:24 22:8 22:19 23:5 23:8,22 26:16,18 27:7 28:10 28:11 29:2 30:9 31:8 32:4 34:13 we've 17:22 weapon 43:15	Wednesday 1:6 weighed 32:8 welcome 44:12 welfare 43:3 well-docum... 41:6 went 12:15 WILLIAM 1:13 willing 29:9 Wilson 33:15 winners 24:4 wire 45:9,22 46:8 Witness 2:22 2:22 33:13 word 39:17 work 11:11 20:6 21:8 25:20 26:8 27:18 37:11 42:15,23 43:3 44:10 worked 14:18 worker 43:13 workers 12:10 41:19 42:15 43:24 working 4:17 4:19 7:20 13:6,11 15:1,2,9 20:25 26:1 29:2 33:17 34:3,24 36:3 39:24 44:5 worried 14:7 worth 12:9 wouldn't 15:23 written 13:9 33:15 38:21 46:19,25 wrong 13:17 13:19	23:10 28:10 31:20 year 9:25 10:1 19:1 27:5,16 29:24 31:6 31:18 32:4 35:18 36:13 39:5 45:1 years 12:15 14:11,18 26:21 30:14 32:5 45:18 yesterday 27:4 York 35:1 37:22,24 38:5 Yorkers 35:5	2.37 4:3 2.4 41:16 2.6 9:21 200,000 34:23 2016 5:25 2019 1:6 7:10 41:9 2020 4:1 29:24 2021 27:2 2024 10:1 36:5,9 21 4:2,18 15:19 26:17 27:6,9 25 6:2 19:11 19:22 31:7 26 14:18	76ers 45:13 8 80 31:17 800 19:1 810 9:25 10:1 85 31:17 855 12:15 9 98 36:16		
V valuable 36:7 46:18 value 40:4 46:7 verification 11:9 verified 7:6 11:23 versus 19:5 Vice-chair 1:11 3:11 view 17:14 violate 23:1 volunteer 43:23 44:5 44:8 vote 14:11 voted 14:14 15:4,5 voters 41:17 vulnerable 17:21			Z 0 0.5 36:11 1 1 31:9 1.15 43:8 1.9 41:16 1.95 4:5 10:05 1:6 11:00 48:15 13 1:6 1300 10:5 36:6 1400 1:5 15 43:11 15,000 35:18 18 10:15 19-1508 2:9 190746 1:17 2:5,8 3:20 9:14 47:9 47:11,20 48:6 19107 1:5 1998 41:15	3 34,250 9:24 10:1 354 35:21 4 40 6:5 400 1:4 401k 32:11 41 18:20 28:2 28:3,6,14 28:16,19 44:24 43-year-old 35:12 44 18:15 45 18:15 5 5 3:25 18:3,4 18:5 50 10:15 32:21 51,000 5:25 580 35:19 6 60-ish 31:20 60,000 9:15 31:25 40:15 40:22 7 70-ish 31:20			
W W2s 39:8 wage 2:5 3:25 4:8,10,11 4:24 5:25 7:3,18 9:15 9:22 10:2 10:12 11:25 12:1 13:24 14:1 18:5,7 20:2 22:20 31:5,10,16 31:23,24 34:3,18,19 35:20,21		X Y Yeah 15:14 19:16 22:18	2 2 18:9,13,14 31:6 33:9 36:13 2,000 5:22 34:23				