

6/22/2022

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
JOINT COMMITTEES ON CHILDREN AND YOUTH
AND FINANCE

Remote location using Microsoft® Teams
Wednesday, June 22, 2022
10:00 a.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCILWOMAN HELEN GYM, CHAIR
COUNCILMAN DEREK S. GREEN, CHAIR
COUNCILWOMAN CINDY BASS
COUNCILMAN ALLAN DOMB
COUNCILWOMAN JAMIE GAUTHIER
COUNCILMAN KENYATTA JOHNSON
COUNCILMAN DAVID OH
COUNCILWOMAN MARIA D. QUINONES-SANCHEZ
COUNCILMAN MARK SQUILLA
COUNCILMAN ISAIAH THOMAS

RESOLUTION: 220149

6/22/2022

1 - - -

2 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Good

3 morning, everyone. This is the joint
4 hearing of the Committees on Children
5 and Youth and on Finance regarding
6 Resolution No. 220149. I'm glad to be
7 joined by my Co-Chair on the Finance
8 Committee, Councilmember Derek Green.

9 Good morning, Councilman and to the
10 members of both the Committees on
11 Children and Youth and on Finance.

12 Before we begin, I'd like to
13 recognize Mr. Nick Spiva who will read
14 the required announcements.

15 THE CLERK: Thank you, Chair.
16 I understand that state law currently
17 requires that the following
18 announcement be made at the beginning
19 of every remote public hearing as
20 follows: Due to the current public
21 health emergency, City Council
22 Committees are currently meeting
23 remotely. We are using Microsoft
24 Teams to make these remote hearings
25 possible.

6/22/2022

1 Instructions for how the
2 public may view and offer public
3 testimony at public hearings of
4 Council Committees are included in the
5 public hearing notices that are
6 published in the Daily News, Inquirer
7 and Legal Intelligencer prior to the
8 hearings and can also be found on
9 PHLCouncil.com.

10 Everyone who's been invited
11 to the meeting to testify should be
12 aware that this public hearing is
13 being recorded. Because the hearing
14 is public, participants and viewers
15 have no reasonable expectation of
16 privacy. By continuing to be in the
17 meeting, you're consenting to being
18 recorded.

19 Additionally, prior to
20 Councilmember Gym recognizing Members
21 for questions or comments they have
22 for witnesses, I will note for the
23 record at this time that we will use
24 the chat feature in Microsoft Teams to
25 allow Members to signify that they

6/22/2022

1 wish to be recognized. In order to
2 comply with the Sunshine Act, the chat
3 feature must only be used for this
4 purpose. Thank you.

5 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you
6 so much, Mr. Spiva. Will you please
7 call the roll to take attendance.
8 Members who are in attendance, good
9 morning. Please indicate that you are
10 present when your name is called.
11 Also, please say a few brief words
12 when responding so that your image
13 will be displayed on screen when you
14 speak.

15 THE CLERK: Councilmember
16 Thomas.

17 COUNCILMAN THOMAS: Good
18 morning, Chairpersons. I'm present.

19 THE CLERK: Councilmember
20 Gauthier.

21 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Good
22 morning to the Chairs. Good morning,
23 colleagues. And good morning to the
24 panelists. Present.

25 THE CLERK: Councilmember

6/22/2022

1 Johnson.

2 (No response.)

3 THE CLERK: Councilmember

4 Quinones-Sanchez.

5 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-

6 SANCHEZ: Good morning, Chairs. I am

7 present.

8 THE CLERK: Councilmember

9 Bass.

10 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Good

11 morning, Chairs and colleagues. And

12 the City of Philadelphia, good

13 morning.

14 THE CLERK: Councilmember Oh.

15 COUNCILMAN OH: Good morning.

16 I'm present.

17 THE CLERK: Councilmember

18 Domb.

19 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Good

20 morning, Madam Chair and colleagues.

21 I'm present. Thank you.

22 THE CLERK: Councilmember

23 Jones.

24 (No response.)

25 THE CLERK: Councilmember

6/22/2022

1 Squilla.

2 (No response.)

3 THE CLERK: Co-Chair Green.

4 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Good

5 Morning, Madam Co-Chair. Good

6 morning, colleagues. I am present.

7 THE CLERK: Co-Chair Gym.

8 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Good

9 morning, Chair Green. Good morning,

10 colleagues. I too am present. Thank

11 you so much. A quorum of the

12 Committee is present and this hearing

13 is now called to order.

14 Will the Clerk please read

15 the title of the resolution.

16 THE CLERK: Resolution No.

17 220149, authorizing the City Council

18 Committees on Children and Youth and

19 on Finance to hold hearings regarding

20 the Philadelphia Parking Authority's

21 unorthodox and contested request for

22 the School District to repay the

23 Parking Authority nearly \$11 million.

24 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you

25 very much. Before we begin, and I do

6/22/2022

1 have a few opening remarks, I did want
2 to invite any of my colleagues to also
3 offer any opening remarks at this
4 time.

5 (No response.)

6 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. So
7 I think I will -- I want to talk a
8 little bit about our opening remarks
9 for today. Fifteen years ago I stood
10 with public school parents, educators
11 and civic leaders to demand
12 accountability and change from the
13 Philadelphia Parking Authority. We
14 reminded the PPA of one of its central
15 missions as a public trust to fund our
16 public schools.

17 When the Commonwealth of
18 Pennsylvania took over the governance
19 of the PPA in 2004, it promised at
20 least \$45 million a year to the School
21 District. As former Pennsylvania
22 House of Representatives Majority
23 Leader John Purcell stated, Every
24 dollar we can squeeze from the Parking
25 Authority should be dedicated to

6/22/2022

1 educating Philadelphia's children."

2 Years later by the time
3 parents and advocates had arrived, the
4 agency had not delivered a single
5 penny to the School District and it
6 never would have, if not for advocates
7 who refused to tolerate an agency that
8 gobbled up any and every dollar that
9 would otherwise go to the School
10 District for itself.

11 Over the course of the next
12 15 years and up to this very day, this
13 has been a consistent story of the
14 Parking Authority through multiple
15 leadership changes, through round-
16 robin Board appointments, despite
17 embarrassing media exposés and
18 investigations, formal audits
19 reporting poor and wasteful financial
20 practices and promises that have been
21 made before this very body in hearing
22 after hearing, despite measures we've
23 taken, including mandatory quarterly
24 meetings between the City, the School
25 District and the PPA.

6/22/2022

1 Despite all of this, we are
2 here today because this is an agency
3 that remains far, far from its
4 mission. In decision after decision,
5 it has systematically, purposely and
6 often times secretly to the detriment
7 of our City and our School District
8 taken money that should have gone to
9 the City's school children and spent
10 it on itself.

11 Mr. Spiva, would you please
12 post the graphic that we have on the
13 PPA's most recent revenues.

14 THE CLERK: Yes, I'm sharing
15 it now, Chair Gym.

16 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you.
17 We can go to the next slide. As we
18 can see, the Philadelphia Parking
19 Authority has repeatedly -- since its
20 funding, the Philadelphia Parking
21 Authority has become a quarter billion
22 dollar agency and its earnings come
23 entirely within Philadelphia's
24 boundaries and primarily from fees on
25 Philadelphia residents. And yet over

6/22/2022

1 20 years, it has delivered a total of
2 \$132 million to the Philadelphia
3 public schools. And as we can see
4 based on its original founding, that
5 is barely 18 percent of the money that
6 would have been promised to us.

7 You can go to the next slide.

8 This is a slide of the contributions
9 from the PPA to the School District of
10 Philadelphia between 2005 to 2021.

11 The red line shows the amount owed
12 under Act 22 that was originally
13 promised and the bottom line shows the
14 amount that the School District of
15 Philadelphia has actually received.

16 Next slide. The next slide
17 shows this revenue compared to the
18 Philadelphia Parking Authority's own
19 Onstreet Revenue Division, which have
20 steadily increased over the years.

21 And obviously as you can see, the
22 pandemic has created significant
23 issues for everybody. But
24 nonetheless, contributions from the
25 Onstreet Revenue Division are

6/22/2022

1 consistently less than 10 percent.

2 Next slide. This has largely
3 been because of things that have been
4 well-known by the Parking Authority,
5 including the fact that the Parking
6 Authority has known expenses,
7 including rampant patronage, bloated
8 executive salaries, outrageous bonuses
9 that have been revealed in the past.

10 The PPA's Executive Director makes 43
11 percent more than executive directors
12 in comparable parking authorities
13 around the country.

14 Next slide. The PPA Director
15 of Onstreet Parking makes 34 percent
16 more than divisions of senior
17 directors and other comparable
18 authorities in other cities.

19 Political patronage, including rampant
20 nepotism has been revealed in media
21 exposé after media exposé. 23 percent
22 of Philadelphia Parking Authority
23 employees are politically connected,
24 including children of former Board
25 members and other types of concerning

6/22/2022

1 relationships.

2 And finally, the number of
3 employees that the PPA currently has
4 is 500 percent more than the number of
5 employees in comparable other Parking
6 Authorities in other cities. And
7 despite this all, the PPA only pulls
8 in just 3 percent more in revenues.

9 Councilmembers, colleagues, I
10 invite you to review the minutes of a
11 Council hearing in 2012 when the PPA
12 came before this very body requesting
13 a 50 percent increase in parking meter
14 fees, claiming that funds to the
15 School District would rise to at least
16 \$18 million a year. Not only has the
17 PPA never met that threshold, in the
18 immediate years following that parking
19 meter increase, funding to the School
20 District actually dropped.

21 For 15 of its last 18 years
22 under state control, the agency's
23 payments to the School District of
24 Philadelphia have been erratic and
25 paltry at best. Last year it

6/22/2022

1 delivered \$0 to the School District at
2 a time when our schools struggled to
3 open, find staffing or had to scramble
4 just to get its students on the
5 Internet.

6 Again as I said, stories of
7 revenue diversions away from the
8 public schools and toward the PPA
9 shock the senses. And frankly,
10 they've only gotten worse since 2014
11 when the PPA lobbied the state to
12 remove formal City oversight over its
13 budget. In addition to all of this,
14 again this has included the
15 undisclosed revelation that the PPA
16 has been diverting millions of dollars
17 in Onstreet Parking revenue in order
18 to voluntarily prepay and seek a 100
19 percent fully-funded pension fund,
20 which according to its own press
21 release in 2019 it was able to achieve
22 over the course of two years.

23 This diversion of District
24 revenue toward that pension fund had
25 never been publicly disclosed before

6/22/2022

1 to the District or to the City of
2 Philadelphia. It was never made clear
3 in financial audits that were
4 delivered to our body, and that's why
5 when the PPA announced last fall that
6 it demanded an \$11 million repayment
7 from City school children, this body
8 drew the line. It is a shame that we
9 had to issue a formal subpoena for
10 documents. But I want to be clear to
11 my colleagues that this is because for
12 months the District had requested an
13 explanation for the alleged
14 overpayment, and the PPA simply
15 refused to provide it.

16 Today for the very first time
17 we will hear an explanation. I recite
18 this history to inform the viewing
19 public that today's hearing is not
20 about a moment in time, it is not
21 about an \$11 million dispute which the
22 PPA will claim is now resolved. This
23 is about a consistent and willful
24 track record over decades up until
25 this very moment to shortchange the

6/22/2022

1 children of this City and its
2 taxpayers.

3 It is also about a renewed
4 call for formal oversight over the
5 PPA's budgeting process, including
6 City signoff on the PPA's budget.
7 Every dollar taken from the District
8 by the PPA is a dollar that is made up
9 for by the taxpayers of the City of
10 Philadelphia, and we are no longer
11 going to tolerate the financial chaos
12 and questionable expenses of this
13 entity.

14 This hearing will try to
15 discern for the first time what the
16 actual cost allocation is to the
17 Onstreet Revenue Division, which is
18 the key division whose revenues over
19 expenses go towards the City and the
20 School District of Philadelphia. And
21 colleagues, despite the fact that
22 Council delivered a subpoena for
23 documents, the submitted financial
24 documents that were returned to us are
25 still incomplete and still do not

6/22/2022

1 allow this body or the public to see
2 all the expenses and spending the PPA
3 is deducting from the payment it
4 provides our schools.

5 It is impossible to judge the
6 validity of the PPA's spending and
7 claims that they have carried through
8 on reforms identified in audits
9 because they've failed to provide
10 clear documentation. As such, as
11 requested in our subpoena. So this
12 hearing will be continued and further
13 documentation under subpoena, if
14 necessary, will resume after the
15 conclusion of today's meeting.

16 The documents do demonstrate
17 however that the PPA's known problems,
18 patronage, other things continue to
19 this day. Bizarre practices remain in
20 place, which we won't focus on now but
21 include things like a website where
22 people can simply apply to work there
23 without applying for an existing job
24 or paying politically connected
25 teenagers at the high school and

6/22/2022

1 collegiate level up to \$30,000
2 stipends as interns, capital
3 expenditures including a disastrous
4 and costly stint at the infamous Lot
5 9, which is a topic that we will delve
6 into today, shows that the PPA
7 continues to load onto its operating
8 expenses and Onstreet Division.
9 Things like vehicle replacement,
10 building improvements which are
11 typically on the capital budget, and
12 we'll be discussing the PPA's OPEB
13 Trust, also known as Other Post-
14 employment Benefits Trust, a
15 heretofore secret diversion of
16 Onstreet revenue dollars whose
17 payments are far beyond national
18 norms.

19 Today's hearing will also
20 cover the agency's current crisis
21 around fiscal accountability and its
22 diminished capacity to manage its own
23 finances. Its latest Executive
24 Director was ousted in March. The
25 testimony by Ms. Grossman, which all

6/22/2022

1 of us have before us, indicates that
2 the Authority may not hire its
3 Executive Director until the end of
4 this year.

5 Last week its CFO either
6 abruptly resigned or was fired, we
7 don't actually know, but is otherwise
8 gone. And though the agency's fiscal
9 year ended on March 30th, it has yet
10 to announce how much money is going to
11 the School District of Philadelphia
12 for FY2022, which is months beyond its
13 usual notification and is completely
14 unacceptable.

15 I remind the public that the
16 PPA is the only agency that reports to
17 no one but itself. There is no
18 oversight over its budget, not by
19 Harrisburg and not by the City of
20 Philadelphia, and this model has
21 failed. It is long past time for us
22 to seek a longer-term formal financial
23 oversight over this body. And let's
24 be clear, it doesn't have to be this
25 way. The PPA lauds itself as an

6/22/2022

1 accredited parking organization with
2 distinction, and today will once again
3 state its intent to find new areas for
4 improvement.

5 And to the members of the
6 Parking Authority who are new to the
7 Board or to the agency, you may not
8 have been directly responsible for the
9 past, but you are absolutely
10 responsible for fixing this agency
11 from this moment on to gain any
12 credibility in the City and in front
13 of this Council. The PPA must commit
14 to formal oversight, greater
15 disclosure and a true partnership.
16 This hearing will serve as the
17 backbone of that process.

18 Will the Clerk now before --
19 just once again before we call the
20 first witness, do any of my colleagues
21 have any opening remarks at this time?

22 (No response.)

23 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Seeing
24 none, will the Clerk please call the
25 first panel for Resolution No. 220149.

6/22/2022

1 THE CLERK: Our first
2 testifier is Uri Monson from the
3 School District of Philadelphia.

4 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Good
5 morning, Mr. Monson. Are you
6 connected and ready to proceed?

7 MR. MONSON: Good morning. I
8 am. Can you all hear me fine?

9 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: We can
10 hear you just great. If you could
11 please state your name for the record
12 and you may proceed with your
13 testimony.

14 MR. MONSON: Thank you. And
15 good morning, Chair Gym and Chair
16 Green and other Councilmembers who are
17 present. My name is Uri Monson. I am
18 the Chief Financial Officer for the
19 School District of Philadelphia.
20 Thank you for the opportunity to
21 testify at the hearing. I believe
22 some background is important to
23 understand the context.

24 As most of you are aware, it
25 has been mentioned already since the

6/22/2022

1 Commonwealth took over the Parking
2 Authority almost 20 years ago, the
3 Parking Authority, the PPA, and the
4 School District have been inexorably
5 linked. It stems from initial
6 promises made at the time of the
7 takeover that any excess annual funds
8 generated by the PPA would be given to
9 the School District once required
10 payments to the City had been
11 satisfied. And at the time, the House
12 Majority Leader estimated this
13 resulting in \$45 million a year in
14 revenues for the District.

15 As has been mentioned, the
16 promise has never been achieved. The
17 highest amount we ever received in
18 2018-19 was 15.4 million. And when
19 you leave out the pandemic-impacted
20 year last year when we received no
21 funds, the low amount was just 2.2
22 million. And the average funding
23 amount over the course of 13 years was
24 about a little over \$10 million a
25 year. And more challenging for us

6/22/2022

1 than the inconsistent funding levels
2 is the lack of information-sharing
3 that occurred between the PPA and the
4 District for most of that period.

5 We did have improvement as a
6 result of Council hearings in 2017,
7 which has led to -- we do have
8 periodic meetings now between the PPA,
9 the City Finance Office and the School
10 District. That information that's
11 shared does provide some insight into
12 PPA performance and resulting impact,
13 though at times it is incomplete,
14 rarely includes projections regarding
15 the payment that'll be made at the end
16 of the year. And the lack of
17 projections makes it very difficult
18 for the District to plan on use of
19 those funds both in the upcoming
20 fiscal year as well as long-term
21 planning, as you know the District
22 does a five-year planning process
23 every year.

24 And as you mentioned in your
25 opening statement, even today June

6/22/2022

1 22nd, nearly three months after the
2 close, the PPA's fiscal year we still
3 don't know any amount of any payment
4 the District will receive, and that's
5 a payment that's routinely provided in
6 early July. As it relates to the
7 particular issue that I guess
8 triggered this hearing in November of
9 '21, I was informed by the Executive
10 Director of the PPA that the PPA had
11 made adjustments to its financial
12 statements the prior year and that by
13 their calculations, the District had
14 been overpaid \$10.9 million. And he
15 indicated as a result, the District
16 owed the PPA that amount but gave no
17 indication as to the basis of the
18 calculations, whether or not the PPA
19 was requiring or payment of the amount
20 or would be withholding that amount
21 from future payments.

22 Needless to say, this
23 information was unprecedented in the
24 history of the PPA providing funds,
25 raised a lot of questions and

6/22/2022

1 concerns. PPA did agree to a meeting
2 between their professional financial
3 staff and consultants along with
4 parallel individuals from the
5 District, which that meeting left many
6 questions unanswered.

7 And after several attempts to
8 request clarification, I did send a
9 formal letter January 25th
10 highlighting concerns the District had
11 with certain PPA decisions, in
12 accounting for pension liabilities and
13 payments, the use of operating funds
14 for capital expenditures, existence of
15 a separate trust fund and specifically
16 what the PPA was demanding regarding
17 the liability they were claiming and
18 reporting in their audited financial
19 statements, which is important that it
20 was in their audited financial
21 statements because we have to put out
22 our own financial statements. And if
23 they're showing that we owe the money
24 and we're not showing we owe the
25 money, there's a problematic conflict.

6/22/2022

1 One day later Mr. Petri
2 responded in the letter which disputed
3 the Act would guide the payments and
4 declined to address the accounting
5 concerns. After reviewing the letter,
6 we did respond. I sent a response on
7 February 4th citing to the PPA's
8 formula laws as well as the
9 calculations descriptions provided in
10 the PPA's own financial statements.
11 And again, we reiterated the same
12 questions from the initial letter.

13 We received no additional
14 correspondence regarding the issue
15 until we were informed that the PPA
16 and the City had resolved the issues.
17 And on May 5th, received a letter from
18 the Chair of the PPA indicating that
19 PPA was making an adjustment for OPEB
20 funding for two prior fiscal years as
21 well as the correction of a pension
22 misstatement for Fiscal Year 2021.

23 Those actions eliminated the
24 overpayment to the District. While
25 that resolution relieved the current

6/22/2022

1 pressures on the District regarding
2 the claim of overpayment, several of
3 our questions remain unanswered
4 regarding prior year calculations,
5 history of the trust fund, policy
6 decisions regarding funding for
7 capital expenditures and in large
8 part, ways to improve information-
9 sharing throughout the year to ensure
10 predictability of PPA payment amounts
11 and thereby allow for better budgeting
12 for use of those funds by the
13 District. That concludes my testimony
14 and I'm happy to respond to any
15 questions from members of the Joint
16 Committee.

17 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you
18 so much, Mr. Monson. Just for
19 clarity, could you give us some
20 background on your accounting and
21 pension experience.

22 MR. MONSON: My personal
23 accounting and pension experience?

24 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Well, I
25 think your professional accounting

6/22/2022

1 experience. So you appear before us
2 as formally the CFO of the School
3 District of Philadelphia?

4 MR. MONSON: I did work with
5 the City's pension. I was an
6 Assistant Budget Director for the City
7 actually over 20 years ago. I was at
8 PICA for 12 years, part of which
9 involved overseeing or responding to
10 issues on the City's pension fund.
11 Was CFO Montgomery County where I
12 actually ran the pension fund for the
13 county. And obviously, at the
14 District with a lot of work with PSERS
15 and the state pension fund, which
16 consumes a significant portion of
17 District budget finances.

18 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Given your
19 wide-ranging experience and depth of
20 experience around this area, can you
21 tell us what your opinion is of the
22 PPA's pension fund decisions? Is it
23 typical?

24 MR. MONSON: I don't think
25 it's typical. I think there are

6/22/2022

1 points at which decisions can be made
2 to either set aside funds or make
3 decisions to fund pensions instead of
4 other obligations. What's unique
5 about this approach is in any of those
6 situations, for example, at the
7 county, when the county had been
8 underfunding pension payments for a
9 long time, we made a strategic
10 decision to fund at the proper level.
11 But we knew that by doing that, it
12 meant that there were other priorities
13 we could not do. So we were making
14 choices, which is what most
15 organizations face, is that if we put
16 it to pensions and if the District has
17 that issue and has to do that and, for
18 example, we're making a choice to put
19 more money towards retirement benefits
20 and therefore not invest in more
21 counselors in schools, there's a
22 trade-off.

23 I think what's unique about
24 this case is the PPA isn't making that
25 trade-off. Whatever they choose to

6/22/2022

1 spend this way doesn't come out of a
2 policy choice from them or for their
3 expenditures. It comes out of the
4 School District's pocket. So it's
5 sort of a freebie for them.

6 And I think what's
7 frustrating for us, and this covers
8 the pension and I'd also say the
9 capital expenditure issue is and I've
10 certainly done this in areas where
11 I've pay-as-you-go capital, but for
12 any of those issues, you understand
13 the trade-offs and you're actually
14 stating those policy decisions
15 publicly.

16 Here it's not trade-offs for
17 them. It's a trade-off they get. The
18 District doesn't get money and we're
19 not aware of what those policy changes
20 are. No, it's not public. There's no
21 warning for us. We just get a basic
22 number at the end of what we're owed
23 without realizing that decisions have
24 been made to fund things in particular
25 ways, be it the pensions via the

6/22/2022

1 capital expenditures, and that lack of
2 understanding information preparedness
3 is what's probably the most
4 frustrating.

5 COUNCILWOMAN GYM:

6 Mr. Monson, just for the viewing
7 public, could you explain pay-as-you-
8 go since some people may not quite
9 understand what the options are around
10 it versus what the Parking Authority
11 is choosing to do?

12 MR. MONSON: Sure. So
13 pay-as-you-go is essentially -- so
14 normally, for capital-type
15 expenditures, so long-term which could
16 be buildings, facilities, repairs,
17 large vehicles, in the School District
18 case, school buses for example, you
19 pay for that with borrowed money, with
20 capital funds because you're trying to
21 amortize or spread the cost of it over
22 the lifetime use of the -- so if you
23 have a building that's going to last
24 40 years, 20-year borrowing allows you
25 to do those repairs and large

6/22/2022

1 borrowings.

2 There are times when you
3 either have a sudden influx of large
4 one-time money. So for example, the
5 District is devoting a portion of its
6 federal funds towards capital
7 facilities investment or to the
8 opposite when I first started the
9 District, the District had no access
10 to capital markets. They couldn't
11 borrow money because of the fiscal
12 problems. So in those cases, we're
13 using operating money for capital, but
14 it's normally not the best practice to
15 do that. And again, there are reasons
16 to do it.

17 In each of those cases, the
18 issue for us was explaining publicly
19 and explaining both from the District
20 to the Board and to the public that we
21 were making these choices for these
22 reasons so that they could weigh in
23 and there was response. And again, we
24 knew we were making internal trade-
25 offs when we made those choices, so

6/22/2022

1 putting more money into facilities
2 with the federal money means less
3 available for hiring even staff beyond
4 what we've done, but those were
5 choices we felt were the right ones to
6 make.

7 We surveyed on it with the
8 public and got that information out
9 there, so they are significant fiscal
10 policy choices. And for a public
11 entity, they need to be clear and
12 transparent.

13 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: And I
14 think as you noted very clearly is
15 that the consequence is that every
16 dollar towards that decision which is
17 voluntary doesn't go towards the
18 School District of Philadelphia.

19 When you first came on, we
20 both came on, you in your respective
21 capacity at the School District of
22 Philadelphia and myself on City
23 Council in 2016, came together and
24 established via a hearing a quarterly,
25 you know, an intergovernmental

6/22/2022

1 agreement with the Parking Authority
2 and the City of Philadelphia, that
3 there would be quarterly meetings
4 between those three entities in order
5 to assure that there weren't financial
6 surprises or things that surprised the
7 District year over year, and that it
8 should result in information-sharing
9 engagement around financial issues.

10 Despite that, once again you
11 said that you were and continue to be
12 surprised by actions and decisions
13 made by the Authority that were never
14 consulted with you or in which you had
15 any information given until well after
16 the fact. So what more do you think
17 is needed to provide meaningful
18 oversight and transparency of the
19 Parking Authority in order to assure
20 stable, consistent and responsible
21 funding?

22 MR. MONSON: So in fairness
23 we do have the periodic meetings with
24 the three entities and they continue
25 to have them with all three

6/22/2022

1 represented. I think the data being
2 more timely sometimes, and there's
3 certain data points that either the
4 City or the School District requested
5 to get a better understanding, to have
6 actually projections.

7 If you're six months into a
8 fiscal year, the documents you're
9 sharing should have a better sense of
10 where you think you're going to end
11 up. And actually, by January they're
12 nine months into their fiscal year so
13 we should have a pretty good idea of
14 where they think they're going to end
15 up for the fiscal year, which impacts
16 our payment, so we very rarely even
17 until we do strong questioning and get
18 any kind of projection data.

19 And the second piece is if
20 there are fiscal policy changes that
21 will impact us which are never
22 discussed in those meetings and again
23 never discussed publicly. So again,
24 it's how you're funding your pension
25 benefits, the pay-as-you-go capital,

6/22/2022

1 anything that can have an impact on
2 what funds are going to go to the
3 District that are changed from
4 existing policy I think needs to be
5 shared. I would argue should be done
6 publicly, but the very least should be
7 shared in those periodic meetings we
8 have.

9 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you.
10 I want to bump this over to my
11 colleagues.

12 Councilmember Domb. The
13 Chair recognizes Councilmember Domb.

14 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Good
15 morning, Chair. I also want to say
16 good morning to Co-Chair Green.

17 And good morning, Mr. Monson.
18 I think the Chair actually asked
19 partially the questions I had, which
20 is in a perfect world what are you
21 looking for from PPA to give you the
22 tools you need in order to budget more
23 accurately?

24 MR. MONSON: So I think it
25 really is that transparency element of

6/22/2022

1 what's likely to happen. And it's
2 interesting because the timing of
3 their fiscal year is the end of March
4 and our budget's adopted in May, so it
5 actually would time it well for us to
6 have some predictability. We have no
7 control obviously over the operations
8 of the PPA and it's this bizarre
9 formula where we get the leftovers, so
10 I'm not looking into control what
11 we're getting and how it's calculated.
12 We just want to make sure that how
13 it's being calculated is transparent.

14 If there are financial fiscal
15 policy decisions which will impact it,
16 that they're clearly articulated in a
17 timely fashion. And ideally while
18 they're weighing the decision, it
19 might be helpful to give us a chance
20 to comment on it, and then it's really
21 the timely projections. I think
22 that's the biggest issue for us. They
23 know their operations better than we
24 ever will, better than the City ever
25 will.

6/22/2022

1 We can even look at the
2 numbers which they share with us,
3 current staffing, ticket expenditures,
4 revenues so we see all that, but only
5 they can have a sense of the normal
6 timeliness throughout the year what
7 predictability this has for the end of
8 the year and then how all that rolls
9 into the formula what our payment's
10 likely to be.

11 And again, it's not worth if
12 they say you're going to get \$3
13 million, they project that in January
14 that we're going to the bank and if
15 they don't give us 3 million, we're
16 going to call for hearings. It's that
17 we need to have a sense of what's
18 likely to happen. There are always
19 things that will emerge and things
20 that will shift, but to have some
21 projection, some ability to project.
22 And predictability also helps not just
23 with the coming year but as I
24 mentioned, just like the City we do a
25 five-year financial plan and when we

6/22/2022

1 have a sense of predictable revenues
2 that allows us to think about
3 predictable investments in students,
4 the worst thing we can do is have
5 yo-yo investments and students where
6 extra counselors one year that go out
7 the next year because we don't know
8 the predictability of funding. So I
9 think that projection predictability
10 and transparency are probably the key
11 things that would enable us to make
12 the best use of these funds.

13 COUNCILMAN DOMB: So I guess
14 my question is, and you can't probably
15 answer but I'll ask anyway, is the
16 problem they don't have the backroom
17 staff to handle these details or is
18 the problem that they don't want to
19 share it?

20 MR. MONSON: I think that's a
21 question you'd have to ask them.

22 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Okay.
23 Because that's why I'm trying to
24 figure this out. This seems pretty
25 simple to solve. Just share the

6/22/2022

1 information and let's get all of the
2 things. Okay. Thank you. Thank you,
3 Mr. Monson.

4 Thank you, Co-Chairs. This a
5 nice meeting to have.

6 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you
7 so much, Councilmember Domb.

8 The Chair recognizes our
9 Co-Chair Councilmember Green.

10 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you,
11 Madam Co-Chair.

12 Good morning, Mr. Monson. I
13 know we've had multiple conversations
14 over the years and all things fiscal,
15 so it's good to have you here this
16 morning. Just wanted to touch on, you
17 know, from your experience both in
18 your current position and also at PICA
19 and also at Montgomery County,
20 especially as it relates to pension
21 benefits, the question that I have is,
22 and I understand that the Parking
23 Authority much like PICA, is a state
24 authority that has to go through
25 re-authorization. And if I'm correct,

6/22/2022

1 my understanding is that the PPA will
2 be going through re-authorization
3 soon; is that also correct?

4 MR. MONSON: I believe that's
5 correct. I don't know the exact date.

6 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Just like
7 PICA. So this occurs in reference to
8 their spending on pension benefits
9 compared to PICA. My understanding is
10 they've spent a significant amount of
11 money on pensions, and I'm curious for
12 that level of funding. What's a
13 historical type of pension funding and
14 what's considered fully funded?

15 MR. MONSON: So I think there
16 are a couple of ways to look at it and
17 in fairness, much like the District to
18 some extent where we're subject to a
19 fund that's run by somebody else and
20 PSERS who basically sends us a bill.
21 They have to make contributions to the
22 City pension fund because of the way a
23 lot of their -- for one, they were a
24 City agency and a lot of their folks
25 through that pension fund.

6/22/2022

1 I think the issues for -- so
2 number one, one of the things we
3 raised, for example, the District is
4 considered extremely high in districts
5 across the Commonwealth. We have to
6 contribute about 35, almost 36 percent
7 of salary to PSERS, which is a
8 significant number even among public
9 entities.

10 The PPA is over 50 percent.
11 So just on the surface it's a
12 significant number. We did ask that
13 question in one of the letters about
14 why it's so high and whether it's a
15 combination of -- the way the benefits
16 were projected, what contributions
17 they were making earlier that may be
18 underfunded. It's probably more
19 complex, but we don't actually have
20 insight into that.

21 I think the other issues for
22 us are because of the unique nature
23 where just the onstreet parking
24 impacts what goes to the District,
25 it's unclear to us exactly how their

6/22/2022

1 total pension bill essentially, which
2 is for the entire Parking Authority,
3 is allocated across the different
4 areas, so airport, redlight programs,
5 the different programs and onstreet.
6 And again, it may be correct but we
7 just don't have any insight into how
8 it's done or what the choices there
9 are and make sure it's a fair amount.

10 And then the other piece is
11 pension and related OPEB, so post-
12 employment benefit is having an
13 outside trust fund, which I understand
14 the fiscal logic of having something
15 to prepare for unanticipated expenses
16 down the road, but you're making a
17 choice to pay now or at some point
18 have seeded this fund to avoid cost
19 down the road, which is taking the
20 money away from us to make the
21 decision of whether we, the District,
22 would rather have it now to pay for
23 current issues first, potential OPEB
24 issues that may or may not arise down
25 the road, so I think all those kind of

6/22/2022

1 play into the pension issues.

2 COUNCILMAN GREEN: And just
3 like here at the City of Philadelphia
4 we have our MMO or minimum municipal
5 obligation that we have to pay every
6 year in order to make sure that both
7 our retirees are taking care of and
8 also preparing for our future
9 retirees. And so, that's a decision
10 that's made by the entity and left up
11 to the entity.

12 Just like you were saying for
13 the School District there's certain
14 amounts, minimum amounts you have to
15 make based on PSERS. But going
16 forward, putting more money up and
17 above the MMO here in the City or
18 doing more of the School District
19 level, that is a decision that can be
20 made by the leadership of that
21 organization. So just like in the
22 past, they may have been doing a 50
23 percent pension charge which based on
24 your initial outlook without
25 additional information seemed high,

6/22/2022

1 the leadership of the organization can
2 also make changes going forward to
3 reduce that amount, but still do it at
4 a level that prepares their retirees
5 as well as making sure they are
6 preparing for future challenges?

7 MR. MONSON: Yes, that's
8 correct. It's a combination of what
9 are legal requirements, what are
10 fiscal best practices and what are the
11 ongoing current issues. Again, you're
12 always making a choice. Money's
13 finite and you're choosing among
14 priorities. So how you want to do it,
15 what you want to do, and again for a
16 public entity, that should be as
17 transparent and public as possible.

18 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Right.
19 But it's always up to -- and that's
20 something that can be done at any time
21 as long as you're within the
22 parameters and meeting the minimum.
23 So going forward, the organization
24 could make decisions that are more
25 keeping with some of the issues, the

6/22/2022

1 concerns you raised based on new
2 leadership?

3 MR. MONSON: Yes, I believe
4 that's true.

5 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you,
6 Madam Co-Chair.

7 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you,
8 Co-Chair Green.

9 Are there any additional
10 questions or comments from members of
11 this Committee for this witness?

12 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Seeing
13 none, Mr. Monson, thank you very much.
14 It would be great to have you
15 available if there are any follow-up
16 questions at different points during
17 the hearing, recognizing that this may
18 be a little bit more extensive in the
19 next section. Thank you very much.

20 MR. MONSON: Thank you.
21 Good-bye.

22 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Mr. Spiva,
23 could you please call the next panel.

24 THE CLERK: The next witness
25 we have to testify is Beth Grossman,

6/22/2022

1 Chair of the Philadelphia Parking
2 Authority's Board.

3 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Good
4 morning, Chair Grossman. Thank you
5 very much for joining us today. Are
6 you connected?

7 MS. GROSSMAN: Yes, I am.
8 Can everyone hear me?

9 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Yes, we
10 can hear you just fine. I did want to
11 inform the viewing public and Chair
12 Grossman, we have received your full
13 testimony. It has been distributed to
14 all members of the Committee and I had
15 asked in the interest of time, that if
16 you could after doing introductions
17 and clarifications, if you could start
18 your testimony on Page 4 with regard
19 to the resolution.

20 So if you could just state
21 your name for the record first,
22 restate it and then you may proceed.

23 MS. GROSSMAN: Thank you very
24 much. Again, good morning everybody.
25 I'm very happy to be here. My name

6/22/2022

1 for the record is Beth Grossman and I
2 am Chairperson of the Board of the
3 Philadelphia Parking Authority. May I
4 begin, Chair?

5 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Yes,
6 please proceed.

7 MS. GROSSMAN: Thank you.
8 The resolution deals with the
9 distribution of net revenue referred
10 to as onstreet parking, which is the
11 amount largely derived from parking
12 tickets and parking violation debt
13 collection. Specifically, Resolution
14 220149 seeks to look at the figures
15 PPA used to determine the payment
16 given to the School District of
17 Philadelphia in Fiscal Year 2021,
18 which ended on March 30, 2021.

19 As you know, all net revenue
20 from the Onstreet Parking Program has
21 always remained in Philadelphia. And
22 before 2004, all of that revenue was
23 delivered directly to the City. The
24 passage of Act 9 of 2004 created a
25 formula where after the Authority

6/22/2022

1 reaches at the time a \$25 million
2 threshold for its payment to the City,
3 a payment of onstreet parking revenue
4 beyond that threshold could be
5 considered for the School District.

6 Our challenge is that the
7 formula's threshold increases every
8 year to match revenue and for
9 improvements secured in the prior
10 year, making the original \$25 million
11 threshold now more than \$42.3 million
12 and that figure will rise as revenue
13 improves. It is also worth noting
14 that the threshold is never permitted
15 to go down. So in years of reduced
16 performance such as during the COVID-
17 19 pandemic, the threshold remains at
18 the high level.

19 Since 2004 the Philadelphia
20 Parking Authority has contributed \$577
21 million to the City and 132 million to
22 the School District, which almost
23 entirely comes from operational
24 efficiencies developed and implemented
25 by PPA. In Fiscal Year 2020, net

6/22/2022

1 onstreet revenue totaled \$56 million.
2 Of that amount \$41.7 million was
3 distributed to the City and \$14.3
4 million to the School District.

5 In March 2022, the Board
6 launched an initiative to review and
7 resolve the School District payment.

8 In Fiscal Year 2020, the PPA paid
9 \$14.4 million from its onstreet
10 parking revenue to the School
11 District, which \$10.8 million was
12 later determined by auditors to have
13 been in overpayment. In the spirit of
14 partnership with the School District,
15 PPA's new leaders began exploring how
16 we could help with the overpayment and
17 learn that we've been paying into our
18 retiring healthcare trust fund at a
19 higher than typical amount, which we
20 changed just this spring to be more
21 aligned with national best practices.

22 By foregoing its FY20 and
23 FY21 contributions to its retiree
24 healthcare trust fund totaling 10.4
25 million and correcting a pension

6/22/2022

1 liability adjustment for FY21, PPA
2 could legally eliminate the
3 overpayment in conjunction with paying
4 \$859,000 to the City. We're extremely
5 pleased that our three organizations
6 achieved outcomes that supported
7 public education and local government.

8 Just like the positive
9 outcome of the School District, we
10 continue to address quality-of-life
11 issues as best we can whenever and
12 wherever possible. We're working with
13 District City Councilmembers to expand
14 our life-saving red light and speed
15 camera programs in high accident
16 areas, we're supporting the current
17 legislation for the removal of
18 abandoned trucks which have plagued
19 several communities for so many years,
20 we manage and enforce the residential
21 parking permit program which is an
22 ever-increasing demand throughout the
23 City and look forward to working with
24 Councilmembers to reduce the number of
25 violations in the near future.

6/22/2022

1 We will soon begin our bike
2 lane enforcement initiative, which is
3 aimed at saving lives and eliminating
4 injuries to our bicycling residents.
5 We started working with minority
6 business organizations like the
7 African American Chamber of Commerce
8 of Pennsylvania, New Jersey, Delaware
9 and the Greater Philadelphia Hispanic
10 Chamber of Commerce and
11 underrepresented businesses to provide
12 greater access to contract
13 opportunities, and we've just
14 contracted both the nationally
15 regarded human resources firm and
16 financial services firm to assist in
17 fine-tuning our policies, practices
18 and procedures, and we're just getting
19 started.

20 In short, PPA's new Board
21 knows we have to go the extra mile.
22 Our emphases are in refining our
23 systems, bettering the customer
24 experience, generating more revenues
25 to be passed to our City and School

6/22/2022

1 District partners and implementing an
2 impactful social responsibility
3 agenda. We hope partnership between
4 the City, School District and PPA, the
5 Authority's revised financial
6 practices and our several new
7 initiatives will allow us to be a
8 bigger and more beneficial part of
9 Philadelphia. And I hope I adequately
10 addressed the issues of Resolution
11 220149 intended to cover. And of
12 course, if there are any questions, I
13 would be pleased to answer them.

14 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you
15 very much, Chair Grossman, and thank
16 you especially again for abbreviating
17 the testimony. Again as I said, your
18 testimony has been distributed to all
19 members of Council who can review it.
20 I did want to suggest however though
21 that the primary challenge to the
22 delivery of revenue to the School
23 District is not solely about the
24 formula threshold between the City and
25 School District. It is in fact an

6/22/2022

1 obligation, but around many of the
2 questions that I think we'll be having
3 today, which is around the expenses
4 that are deducted that create that
5 kind of challenge once it gets
6 started.

7 I'm going to just ask of --
8 I'm actually going to start with my
9 colleagues. I'm happy to start with
10 them, and then I'll have a few
11 questions. I think what we're going
12 to try to do is focus a little bit of
13 our questions around the \$11 million.
14 We can go into the calculation of the
15 School District and the City SDP
16 contribution numbers. But if we can
17 keep those questions together, that
18 would be helpful.

19 The Chair recognizes
20 Councilmember Domb.

21 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Thank you,
22 Madam Co-Chair.

23 And good morning. Nice to
24 see you.

25 MS. GROSSMAN: Likewise.

6/22/2022

1 COUNCILMAN DOMB: I have
2 three questions for you. The first
3 question is really of the question
4 that I asked Mr. Monson and, that is,
5 he's looking for more information in
6 order to do a better job of the
7 budgeting for the School District.
8 And I guess my question is do you have
9 the ability and capacity of the
10 financial people on your team in order
11 to provide that information to him?
12 He's a smart guy and he can probably
13 tell you exactly what he needs. And
14 if we just get this information
15 shared, we can avoid this problem. I
16 just want to know if that's something
17 that you can agree to do.

18 MS. GROSSMAN: Councilman, it
19 most certainly is. First of all, I
20 and the other Board members are
21 certainly committed to transparency
22 and collaboration. We want to
23 continue our relationships and improve
24 them with the School District, and we
25 are happy to work with Mr. Monson to

6/22/2022

1 provide what information he seeks.

2 As I noted in my portion of
3 the testimony that I just read in, we
4 are in the process of engaging with an
5 outside financial review firm also to
6 take a deep-dive look into our
7 financial department to ensure that we
8 are following best practices and
9 procedures, industry standards, what
10 can we improve, how can we get
11 information out to those who seek it
12 in a timely fashion and look to
13 anything that we can improve.

14 I think because we have such
15 a new Board, now is the time to delve
16 deep in to look at this. And I am
17 sure that this will enable us to work
18 more collaboratively with whatever it
19 is that Mr. Monson needs. And I must
20 acknowledge that I do not have the
21 financial experience that Mr. Monson
22 has in no way, shape or form. I'm a
23 Poli Sci major, what can I tell you.
24 But I can say that we will be happy to
25 work with him.

6/22/2022

1 COUNCILMAN DOMB: That's
2 great. So that's a yes. That's good
3 news.

4 MS. GROSSMAN: That is an
5 absolute yes, sir.

6 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Okay. The
7 second question, I have basically
8 three quick ones, in your Page I guess
9 5 of your testimony, you talk about in
10 Fiscal Year 2020 it says the net
11 Onstreet revenue total 56 million. Do
12 you know what the gross revenue was?

13 MS. GROSSMAN: You know what,
14 that I don't know. I can certainly
15 provide that information to you.
16 That's not a problem.

17 COUNCILMAN DOMB: That would
18 be helpful. And then the other
19 question is not specifically on this.
20 I mean, I'm used to asking these
21 questions. We had this Lot 9 project
22 where I've heard we lost a ton of
23 money. Okay. I'm just trying to
24 understand how that happened. What
25 was that process that occurred and how

6/22/2022

1 do we avoid it in the future because
2 we've had issues like this, whether
3 it's the 46th and Market where we lost
4 80 to 90 million for the Inquirer
5 building, which we dramatically paid a
6 premium for it and have not managed
7 that well.

8 And so, my question is on
9 this lot, can you just give us a
10 brief, not long, but brief overview of
11 what went wrong here? What did we do
12 wrong? What can we learn from this
13 and how do we prevent it from
14 happening again?

15 MS. GROSSMAN: I think
16 basically it was a bunch of things. I
17 think going forward we have to make
18 sure that we have the correct
19 individual overseeing these projects,
20 such as somebody who oversees all our
21 capital development projects. And I
22 think with a strengthened financial
23 department with very, very improved
24 oversight by the Board of projects
25 such as this, I think that will help

6/22/2022

1 eliminate any issues such as this
2 arose.

3 You know, we all have limited
4 funds and we don't wish to needlessly
5 lose them through litigation. I think
6 we are looking to develop a capital
7 projects committee of which Board
8 members will be on it, which will
9 allow for extreme scrutiny and
10 oversight.

11 COUNCILMAN DOMB: If that
12 money hadn't been lost, would that
13 money have gone to the School District
14 or the City? Where would that money
15 have been allocated to?

16 MS. GROSSMAN: You know what,
17 if you could -- you know what,
18 Councilman, I will find out that
19 answer for you. I apologize for not
20 knowing. That's a fair question. Not
21 a problem.

22 COUNCILMAN DOMB: You're
23 relatively new. How long have you
24 been in this position?

25 MS. GROSSMAN: So if I may, I

6/22/2022

1 was appointed to the Board in July.
2 My first meeting was August 24th and I
3 was appointed as Chair in October. So
4 interestingly, I'm proud to say we do
5 have a very -- five out of six of us
6 are new. All of us have been
7 appointed within approximately the
8 last 18 months. So we are learning as
9 we go, but I can tell you that we are
10 all committed to looking at what needs
11 to be improved in the Authority, what
12 are best practices, working and
13 improving our relationships with City
14 and Commonwealth stakeholders and just
15 doing what we can in our obligation to
16 the City and the School District. So
17 it's an exciting time.

18 COUNCILMAN DOMB: One last
19 question that really maybe does not
20 have to do with this hearing, but can
21 the Parking Authority people that are
22 on the street, are they helping us
23 with their eyes and ears as far as
24 seeing issues of crime or homeless or
25 people who have mental illness and

6/22/2022

1 even taking a photo and texting it to
2 the appropriate people with locations
3 so they can be extra people to help us
4 in the public safety area?

5 MS. GROSSMAN: It's funny
6 that you -- I'm glad you actually
7 brought that up, Councilman. The
8 issue that keeps me awake at night
9 that I must acknowledge to all of City
10 Council is the physical well-being of
11 our parking enforcement officers, our
12 tow truck drivers and our booters.
13 Because every day, probably every day
14 without fail, they are subject to
15 verbal and sometimes physical abuse
16 where they have guns drawn on them,
17 where they have been physically
18 struck. And I must commend them for
19 the work that they do day in and day
20 out because that's really a scary
21 thing.

22 I think if they -- look,
23 first and foremost is their physical
24 well-being where I don't want them to
25 do anything that is going to harm

6/22/2022

1 them. That's a paramount importance.
2 But if they can do that and they do
3 capture something, we would be more
4 than happy to share it with the
5 appropriate authorities. But again,
6 their physical well-being that's first
7 and foremost.

8 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Okay. All
9 right. Thank you very much.

10 MS. GROSSMAN: Thank you,
11 sir.

12 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Thank you,
13 Co-Chair.

14 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you
15 very much, Councilmember Domb. Before
16 moving to Councilmember Gauthier, I
17 did have a point of information and a
18 question.

19 One, it's important to note
20 that the PPA is under an
21 intergovernmental authority agreement
22 where you are obligated to meet with
23 the City, the state -- the City, the
24 School District and the PPA on regular
25 meetings to assess finances. And I

6/22/2022

1 think the question here is not whether
2 you will be happy to be cooperative,
3 but that those conversations have not
4 revealed what has been needed, so I
5 think that's a point of information
6 and that actually they clearly need to
7 be strengthened. They are inadequate
8 given the surprises.

9 But as a matter of
10 questioning, you mentioned to
11 Councilmember Domb that you had
12 confidence in the Parking Authority's
13 kind of financial practices. What
14 happened to your last CFO or your most
15 recent CFO?

16 MS. GROSSMAN: Well,
17 Councilwoman, first of all at --
18 excuse me, Council Chair, we are also
19 in the process of re-evaluating our
20 entire financial department, again as
21 I said, to seek best practices, do we
22 have the right talent in there. At
23 this point, I think we just agreed
24 that we need a different type of CFO.
25 We have currently hired a temporary

6/22/2022

1 one who will be starting with this
2 soon and we will see how that works
3 out.

4 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: When will
5 they start with you?

6 MS. GROSSMAN: Within the
7 next couple of days.

8 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: And do you
9 have a name? Are you able to share a
10 name or --

11 MS. GROSSMAN: I'm not able
12 to share that name right now.

13 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Are they a
14 third-party entity or will they be
15 hired directly by the Parking
16 Authority?

17 MS. GROSSMAN: They will be
18 hired directly by the Parking
19 Authority.

20 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. So
21 I think that's one of the key
22 questions here about whether and how
23 soon this individual can get under
24 way. And you felt that letting go of
25 the most recent CFO was because of

6/22/2022

1 concerns about past practices, is that
2 right, or seeking a new direction?
3 What exactly is it?

4 MS. GROSSMAN: I think
5 seeking a new direction. Beyond that,
6 I'm not going to get into any further
7 personnel matters. But I think at
8 this time again looking at our best
9 practices, having a third party come
10 in to evaluate us and work with the
11 CFO I think we're going to really
12 determine what we need and how we can
13 improve.

14 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: And did
15 you just say you had already hired
16 that third party?

17 MS. GROSSMAN: We have not
18 yet announced that yet, but we are in
19 the RFP process and I think that
20 should be concluded soon.

21 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Was your
22 CFO hired under a public hiring
23 process?

24 MS. GROSSMAN: It was
25 contract.

6/22/2022

1 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. The
2 Chair recognizes Councilmember
3 Gauthier.

4 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Thank
5 you, Madam Chair.

6 Good morning, Chair Grossman.

7 MS. GROSSMAN: Good morning.
8 Very nice to meet you. Hello.

9 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Nice
10 to meet you. I wanted to linger for a
11 while on the \$11 million requested
12 from the School District last year. I
13 wanted you to expound more on how the
14 PPA determined that it made an error
15 resulting in an \$11 million
16 overpayment to the School District.
17 What caused the error in the first
18 place and who from a staffing
19 perspective made the determination to
20 ask the District for almost \$11
21 million, especially in the middle of a
22 pandemic?

23 MS. GROSSMAN: Certainly.
24 Beginning in FY2008 consistent with
25 government accounting standards Board

6/22/2022

1 statement 45, the Authority began
2 recording an expense for the future
3 cost of retiree health benefits as
4 determined by an actuarial report.
5 Each department was charged the
6 portion of the expense in the same
7 manner as the allocation of support
8 expense.

9 The actuary recommended an
10 annual amount to record and fund the
11 liability over a 20-year period. The
12 cash for that expense was held in
13 Authority accounts for future
14 investment in an OPEB trust, and the
15 total amount accumulated from FY2009
16 through FY2018 with \$16 million.

17 In 2018, a recommendation was
18 made to convert insurance reserves
19 from cash to letters of credit. Those
20 accounts were funded in the same
21 manner as indicated, OPEB expense.
22 That made \$11.5 million available to
23 further fund the OPEB liability. In
24 2019, the actuary determined that
25 employee health benefits provided by

6/22/2022

1 the unions but paid by the Authority
2 should have been included in the
3 Authority's liability and adjusted the
4 liability for that increased amount.

5 The Authority recorded and
6 planned to fully fund that increased
7 liability in FY2020 in the amount of
8 \$4.9 million, in FY2021 in the amount
9 of 5.5 million. The funding of that
10 liability was reversed enabling the
11 Authority to correct the overpayments
12 of the School District. That
13 determination really was made by the
14 former Executive Director who is no
15 longer with us.

16 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Okay.
17 So it sounds like this was an
18 accounting error and because there's
19 this practice of kind of having the
20 leftover funds go to the District, a
21 determination was made to request
22 those funds, but that was like a
23 choice. I mean, it sounds like that
24 was within PPA's discretion, not
25 something that necessarily had to

6/22/2022

1 happen.

2 MS. GROSSMAN: I think --

3 well, first of all, we never

4 specifically asked for it back in

5 total. I think we just couldn't wipe

6 it off the books. But what I can tell

7 you is going forward, the PPA is

8 adjusting its OPEB funding practices.

9 The goal we're moving from 100

10 percent, we're now at 60 -- from

11 funding 100 percent to 60 percent, and

12 our current level of funding is at 67

13 percent.

14 Additionally, future OPEB

15 funding shortfalls will be made whole

16 over the years appropriate to minimize

17 the impact on current year net revenue

18 calculations. That decision to fund

19 it 100 percent was from our former CFO

20 and Executive Director which is a very

21 unusual practice, so we are now more

22 in line as to what industry standards

23 are.

24 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Okay.

25 The misstatement or the error which

6/22/2022

1 caused you to rescind the request to
2 the School District was found after
3 months of advocacy and months of
4 questions from a host of folks,
5 including folks on Council about the
6 overpayment. How did all that
7 advocacy relate to the decision to
8 rescind that request?

9 MS. GROSSMAN: Listen, we're
10 a new Board. I wasn't here previously
11 for that, but I think once we saw the
12 error, look, we just want to do what
13 is right. And although it took time
14 going back and forth, listen, we're
15 always happy to collaborate. We want
16 to be a Board doing what is right
17 going forward, building on positive
18 foundations from the previous Board.
19 But as all of you are, we are
20 certainly committed to providing
21 monies to the City and the School
22 District, and we hope to improve our
23 financial practices going, on going
24 forward so a hiccup like this does not
25 happen in the future.

6/22/2022

1 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Okay.

2 I mean, the fact that this error or
3 misstatement occurred after quite a
4 lot of questions were asked kind of
5 begs the question of whether there
6 were other misstatements or errors in
7 past years and also suggest that we
8 might take a look at what happened in
9 past years to see if we can find any
10 misstatements. What do you think
11 about that and has there been any
12 effort to examine past years from
13 (inaudible) --

14 MS. GROSSMAN: Oh, you went
15 mute, Councilwoman.

16 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Oh,
17 I'm sorry. Okay.

18 MS. GROSSMAN: I caught --

19 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: The
20 fact that when you all asked for this
21 money from the District this kind of
22 riled up a lot of people, right, on
23 Council and the advocacy community and
24 it caused a lot of people to ask
25 questions, and then you found that

6/22/2022

1 there was an error on PPA's part and
2 you rescinded that request, but the
3 entire situation kind of begs the
4 question of whether we should look at
5 past years to see if there were errors
6 or misstatements in those years too.
7 Has there been any effort to identify
8 misstatements in past years?

9 MS. GROSSMAN: I mean, I
10 can't certainly -- look, we're here to
11 go forward. I can't speak to anything
12 that has been done in past years. But
13 I will tell you our audit every year
14 is posted on our website. It is
15 provided to City Councilmembers. It
16 is provided to the Mayor. It is
17 provided to our legislature up in
18 Harrisburg.

19 So any -- and we have been
20 audited numerous times, well over 20
21 times in the past several years. So
22 our books are open. People are free
23 to examine what we have provided over
24 the past years, and we will answer any
25 other questions that may come up from

6/22/2022

1 past practice. I can only speak about
2 going forward what we're going to do,
3 which we're happy to do. But we
4 welcome all inquir -- inquiries.

5 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Okay.

6 I can appreciate the fact that you
7 hire an auditor on an annual basis to
8 look at your books and that you're
9 providing that information to the
10 public. But has there ever been an
11 independent third party who has
12 overseen the review process or who has
13 looked for misstatements or errors in
14 the calculations of PPA's
15 contributions to the City and the
16 School District?

17 MS. GROSSMAN: I'm not sure
18 exactly on that issue, but we've been
19 audited by the Pennsylvania Auditor
20 General. We've been audited by
21 Ms. Rhyndhart. And again, as I said
22 we're audited every year. I'm not
23 sure if there are any other outside
24 parties who have audited, forgive me.
25 There's a lot of history going on

6/22/2022

1 here. But, yeah, so other agencies
2 have whether specifically for that
3 issue, I don't know.

4 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: But
5 there's no sort of regular practice by
6 which an independent third party comes
7 in and oversees that process?

8 MS. GROSSMAN: That is what
9 our auditor does. They are
10 independent and they come in every
11 year to do this.

12 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Your
13 auditor is hired by your agency?

14 MS. GROSSMAN: Yes.

15 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Okay.
16 That's not independent. I mean,
17 that's just a matter of fact.

18 MS. GROSSMAN: Okay.

19 COUNCILWOMAN GAUTHIER: Okay.
20 I would suggest that we take a look at
21 whether we need to examine whether
22 there were errors and misstatements in
23 past years, and it would be very
24 important to have a party that was
25 more independent to be able to weigh

6/22/2022

1 in on that matter.

2 I don't have any more
3 questions. Thank you, Madam Chair.

4 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you
5 very much, Councilmember Gauthier.

6 Just as a point of
7 clarification, did you say, Chair
8 Grossman, that your third party is
9 going to review if the same mistake
10 that was made has happened in the
11 past?

12 MS. GROSSMAN: We could
13 certainly have them look at it.
14 That's fine.

15 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay.
16 Well, can there be a commitment to
17 that?

18 MS. GROSSMAN: We'll have
19 to -- sure, we can commit to that.
20 That's fine. That's a reasonable
21 request.

22 Council, may I just follow up
23 with one thing from Councilman Domb's
24 request, one of his questions. The
25 2020 gross revenue from the Parking

6/22/2022

1 Authority was \$1.35 million. Thank
2 you for that courtesy, and Lot 9 would
3 have been financed.

4 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: And I just
5 want to be clear that the audits that
6 I think Councilmember Gauthier raised
7 referenced multiple issues and
8 problems with the Parking Authority
9 and made multiple recommendations on
10 the record that were presented to the
11 Board and we just want to make clear.

12 We also want to make clear
13 that I think the specific area that
14 we're looking at is about expenses
15 that are deducted from the Onstreet
16 revenue that then reduced the amount
17 of money that goes to the School
18 District of Philadelphia in
19 particular.

20 The Chair recognizes
21 Councilmember Green, my Co-Chair
22 Councilmember Green.

23 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you,
24 Madam Co-Chair.

25 Ms. Grossman, it's good to

6/22/2022

1 see you. Thank you for taking on this
2 role. And I just wanted to ask a
3 couple of questions in reference to --
4 you made reference to you bringing a
5 third-party entity to do a financial
6 review of your systems within the
7 Philadelphia Parking Authority, and
8 I'm not sure if I caught what was the
9 timeline for this review.

10 MS. GROSSMAN: As soon as
11 we -- as soon as we -- we're getting
12 ready actually to commit through the
13 RFP process, and I believe this one
14 with this company I think will be a
15 three-month prac -- a three-month
16 commitment to this.

17 COUNCILMAN GREEN: So right
18 now internally the Philadelphia
19 Parking Authority is putting together
20 a request for proposals and then
21 you're going to issue that out to the
22 public. Then you'll review those that
23 apply and then based on your process
24 of selection, identify a firm to do
25 this review and you anticipate that it

6/22/2022

1 will be a three-month review?

2 MS. GROSSMAN: Actually we've
3 already committed. We actually have
4 somebody selected, but I don't think
5 they've been formally notified so
6 we're actually ahead of the game
7 there.

8 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Got you.
9 Okay. So you selected -- so based on
10 your RFP process, you have identified
11 someone and you're now in the process
12 of communicating their selection and
13 then we'll go forward with
14 memorializing or executing a contract
15 for their services, but you believe
16 it'll be a three-year time period for
17 that --

18 MS. GROSSMAN: Three months.

19 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Sorry,
20 three months. Thank you for
21 correcting the record, a three-month
22 time period for their review. And as
23 part of that review, will they be
24 looking at all dynamics of the
25 organization referencing positions or

6/22/2022

1 will they be making any other type of
2 analysis like, you know, we've had a
3 conversation earlier about the pension
4 perspective, are they just looking at
5 your internal structures in reference
6 to the positions, but also looking at
7 policies as well?

8 MS. GROSSMAN: Everything,
9 policies, practices, procedures, do we
10 have the right technology in place, do
11 we have the right talent, do we need
12 more accountants or this and that,
13 what can make it more effective. And
14 everything from soup to nuts will be
15 considered in that, because the Board
16 really needs a full fresh look to see
17 what is going on, what do we need to
18 do, and we really want to know, and
19 I'm not being flip, the good, the bad
20 and the ugly.

21 COUNCILMAN GREEN: So based
22 on the review if this firm were to
23 say, hey, you have been spending a lot
24 of money on your pension benefits and
25 they say, well, consistent with other

6/22/2022

1 organizations that are like size, you
2 should pay a different amount, that's
3 something that may come from that
4 organization and it's the intention of
5 the Board to review those type of
6 policy guidelines and then make a
7 decision going forward. So it's a
8 good possibility some of the issues
9 that have been raised regarding the
10 amount of money spent on pension
11 dollars may be different going forward
12 based on a review from this third
13 party?

14 MS. GROSSMAN: Sure, it could
15 be. We'll be open to suggestions and
16 recommendations they make. And as I
17 said, we just want to do what is
18 consistent with industry standards.

19 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay.
20 Thank you, Madam Co-Chair.

21 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you,
22 Co-Chair Green.

23 The Chair recognizes
24 Councilmember Thomas.

25 COUNCILMAN THOMAS: Good

6/22/2022

1 morning, Chairs, and all the different
2 government workers that are here
3 today. It's good to see everybody.
4 Thank you for this conversation. As
5 the Chair of the Streets and Services
6 Committee as well as a school
7 advocate, this is something that's
8 very near and dear to my heart.

9 Just a couple questions very
10 quickly. First, just for contextual
11 purposes, Ms. Grossman, can you please
12 explain to us and to the listening
13 audience who works for the PPA as it
14 relates to the different type of
15 unions that have employees that are
16 under PPA? So when I think about not
17 just the folks who are writing
18 tickets -- but also in the midst of
19 Councilmember Gym's presentation, one
20 of the things that we see was that
21 there were issues as it relates to
22 hiring practice, nepotism, upper
23 echelon salaries, what are the unions
24 that represent the workers over at the
25 PPA?

6/22/2022

1 MS. GROSSMAN: Certainly.
2 Can you give me one moment? I'm going
3 through all my notes. We have
4 District Council 33, District Council
5 47, our Teamsters Local 115, TWU and
6 District Council 21. And I commend
7 all of them for the work that they do
8 day in and day out.

9 COUNCILMAN THOMAS: As do I.
10 And so, when I think about those
11 unions and a lot of the parents and
12 families who make up the membership of
13 those unions, a lot of those folks are
14 like parents of people who are in the
15 School District of Philadelphia,
16 specifically thinking about what I
17 know about those unions as well as
18 some of the requirements based on City
19 residency and things of that capacity.

20 I think that this is an
21 important conversation to have as it
22 relates to revenue. I'm wondering do
23 we have an amount or an estimated
24 amount that we feel like the PPA is
25 going to be contributing to the School

6/22/2022

1 District for this fiscal year for next
2 fiscal year, especially looking at
3 some of the conditions that we're
4 facing because of the pandemic?

5 MS. GROSSMAN: Yes, that is
6 in process now. And as normally
7 during our timeline, it's usually
8 given or provided by the end of June
9 or July. So finance is currently
10 working on that now.

11 COUNCILMAN THOMAS: How close
12 are you normally to the projected
13 revenue based on your estimations
14 compared to how much you actually
15 give? So I looked at -- one of the
16 charts said that only 18 percent of
17 the revenue that was promised actually
18 goes to the School District. If I've
19 read that graphic correctly, we
20 promised a certain amount of money and
21 the School District only got 18
22 percent of what we promised.

23 I'm concerned about that, not
24 just because of the revenue but
25 because of budget projections. Over

6/22/2022

1 the next couple years the School
2 District is anticipating a deficit.
3 So I'm wondering when we look at that
4 type of disproportionate estimate, how
5 close can we start to get as it
6 relates to our projections so we can
7 put ourselves in a position where we
8 can plan for the anticipated deficit
9 that we know we're going to face in a
10 couple years? I'm sorry. Did that
11 question make sense?

12 MS. GROSSMAN: Yeah --

13 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: And if I
14 could, Chair Grossman, Chair Thomas, I
15 just want a quick point of
16 information. The slide that was
17 included about the 18 percent was
18 based off the original promise at the
19 inception of the Parking Authority's
20 takeover by the state, which
21 originally was around \$45 million
22 every single year.

23 But for, Chair Grossman,
24 regardless of whether the PPA has met
25 that \$45 million initially promised

6/22/2022

1 threshold which it to be clear never
2 has, I think the biggest concern that
3 I think Chair Councilmember Thomas is
4 relating to is that effectively
5 despite being created in the best
6 interests of the City and the School
7 District of Philadelphia, but very
8 specifically the School District of
9 Philadelphia, the percent of Onstreet
10 revenues going to the School District
11 of Philadelphia is around 10 percent
12 of Onstreet revenues.

13 So it is an ongoing question.
14 Do you have a goal I think is what
15 Councilmember Thomas is asking. What
16 can be expected? Because it certainly
17 does feel like you consistently and
18 systematically make decisions in which
19 you have the option to deliver the
20 money to the School District or you
21 have the option to pay a college
22 intern an enormous salary or to fund
23 tuition payments for individuals or to
24 divert into other expenses. I think
25 that is the question that's in play

6/22/2022

1 regardless of the exact percentage.

2 MS. GROSSMAN: Okay. First
3 of all to begin with, that \$45 million
4 level, that was repealed in 2004.
5 Again, I will reiterate Act 9 of 2004
6 set the thresholds for what we are
7 required to give to the City and then
8 the --

9 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Chair
10 Grossman, just as a point of
11 clarification --

12 MS. GROSSMAN: As a --

13 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: -- point
14 of clarification, you said that the
15 \$45 million was repealed at the time
16 of the -- and 2004 was the time that
17 the state takeover agency was created.
18 So you're saying it was repealed upon
19 its creation?

20 MS. GROSSMAN: It was Act 94
21 of 2004 which was subsequently
22 repealed, and in its place was Act 9
23 of 2004 which set the threshold.

24 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: When was
25 Act 9?

6/22/2022

1 MS. GROSSMAN: 2004 or 2005.

2 I'm not sure. It might have been
3 around that, 2004. So again, as I
4 stated earlier, we meet -- our current
5 threshold is \$42.3 million which is
6 given to the City. Anything above
7 that goes to the School District. As
8 for projections, it's a little bit
9 difficult to do that. So many things
10 come into play whether we have
11 sufficient amount of PEOs on the
12 street, we're subject to a pandemic,
13 so I think it's very hard to offer
14 projections.

15 COUNCILMAN THOMAS: So I do
16 have a couple more questions, but I'm
17 sort of limited on time and I know we
18 are as well too. What I would just
19 ask is that can we see a commitment to
20 work with the PPA moving forward to
21 put us in a position to be able to
22 better understand what we can do to
23 assure some type of accurate estimates
24 as it relates to the School District
25 of Philadelphia.

6/22/2022

1 The deficit that the School
2 District of Philadelphia is going to
3 face, right, and the reason I asked
4 about the membership is because these
5 are also your folks too because their
6 children go to these schools. The
7 deficit that the School District is
8 going to face in a couple years is
9 going to be one that's significant,
10 and praying that I'm still around as
11 well as a lot of my colleagues, we are
12 going to be in a position where we're
13 going to have to figure out where this
14 revenue is going to come from.

15 So I'm concerned not just
16 about meeting the \$42.3 million, but
17 when we don't meet it, to be able to
18 understand that well ahead of time so
19 we could plan, but more importantly to
20 understand why we don't meet it. I
21 think that is going to be very
22 important for the work that we do.

23 So when I think about over
24 the next couple years and looking at
25 the turnover that has happened at PPA,

6/22/2022

1 what are you doing to essentially put
2 us in a position to feel comfortable
3 with the direction that PPA is moving
4 in, is going and moving forward as it
5 relates to leadership, government
6 relation folks, upper level staff,
7 some of the accusations and reports
8 that we've heard? What is the plan
9 moving forward so that we can be more
10 effective, more efficient and better
11 serve the constituents of
12 Philadelphia?

13 Co-Chairs, that is my last
14 question. Thank you for allowing me
15 to be a part of this conversation and
16 more importantly, thank you both for
17 your advocacy on such an important
18 issue.

19 MS. GROSSMAN: Sure. I think
20 again going forward improving our
21 policies, procedures and practices as
22 well as if there are new initiatives
23 or expanding things such as our red
24 light program or our speed light
25 program or other initiatives for which

6/22/2022

1 we oversee that. We welcome, you
2 know, we want to have good positive
3 and thorough financial reviews going
4 forward. And if obviously -- and if
5 anybody on City Council wishes to meet
6 or has inquiries about our reviews, we
7 are happy to meet. Again, I cannot
8 emphasize enough, we're committed to
9 transparency and collaboration and
10 cooperation with all of you.

11 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: I want to
12 thank Chair -- Councilmember Thomas
13 for his line of questioning. I also
14 want to remind Chair Grossman that you
15 are the Chair of the Board of a public
16 entity. It is your responsibility to
17 have projections. It is your
18 responsibility to understand costs.
19 Certainly, ones that are unpredicted
20 are difficult, but that is partly why
21 you have planning.

22 And one of the consistent
23 hallmarks of our work is that there
24 isn't clear planning about the School
25 District and its revenues. In fact,

6/22/2022

1 it appears again and again to have
2 systematic decisions that are made
3 that are diverting revenue away from
4 the District and towards voluntary
5 expenses that then deduct money away
6 from the School District of
7 Philadelphia. I want to make that
8 very clear, it is your responsibility
9 to do the planning that is necessary.
10 You should have a goal for the
11 District.

12 You should be able to figure
13 out, as Councilmember Thomas
14 explained, if you're not meeting that
15 goal, why you're not meeting that
16 goal. And it is unacceptable that an
17 entity only provides this District
18 less than 10 percent of revenues and
19 that should be cause for a concern.
20 This is not an accident. This is not
21 due to unforeseen circumstances
22 solely. It is purposeful practices
23 and decisions made by the Authority.

24 The Chair recognizes
25 Councilmember Quinones-Sanchez after

6/22/2022

1 which we will invite Councilmember Oh.

2 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-

3 SANCHEZ: Thank you, Madam Chair, and
4 to both of the Chairs.

5 And to Beth Grossman, I want
6 to continue a little bit of the line
7 of questioning, but I also want to
8 thank you for taking on this role. We
9 look forward to you and the new
10 members putting forth some of this
11 vision for what the role of the PPA
12 is. And in that regard, I want to ask
13 you what do you see as the PPA's
14 mission and then what do you see as
15 its goal, as its goals as it relates
16 to its intergovernmental relationship
17 with the City of Philadelphia and the
18 School District?

19 MS. GROSSMAN: Certainly, and
20 if I may, I will just read what our
21 mission statement is because it's
22 always important for the public to
23 know that, which is to contribute to
24 the economic vitality of Philadelphia
25 and the surrounding region by

6/22/2022

1 effectively managing and providing
2 convenient parking on the street, at
3 the airport and in garages and lots,
4 effectively operating a system of red
5 light camera enforcement, regulating
6 taxi cabs, limousine and
7 transportation network companies and
8 other transportation-related
9 activities.

10 I also understand that part
11 of that of course is to contribute as
12 mandated funds to both the City of
13 Philadelphia and the School District.
14 Going forward, we want to run
15 efficiently and successfully and
16 continue to be able to meet thresholds
17 and above and beyond hopefully for the
18 School District.

19 But the other thing that I
20 think I feel comfortable with speaking
21 on behalf of all of the Board is that
22 we are also committed to being a
23 safety agency where we can also
24 contribute like many other City
25 agencies to quality of life and public

6/22/2022

1 safety. You know, I know people think
2 of the Parking Authority as just
3 issuing tickets, but there are so many
4 positive things that we do such as
5 overseeing red light and speed light
6 cameras, which decreases fatalities
7 and accidents.

8 We're starting to enforce our
9 bicycle lane enforcement project, and
10 I think being able to help make
11 Philadelphia as I'd like to say a
12 drivable, parkable, bikeable and
13 walkable city is an extraordinary
14 thing. I know our Deputy Executive
15 Director Corinne O'Connor has
16 testified numerous times before
17 Council regarding different
18 initiatives such as hopefully PPA can
19 play a role in removing aban -- the
20 34,000 abandoned cars throughout the
21 City, tractor trailers that are parked
22 in residential areas and other
23 initiatives.

24 So we really hope to work
25 with all partnerships, the legislative

6/22/2022

1 branch, executive branch, other City
2 agencies to make Philadelphia what it
3 can be and reach its potential. And
4 it's a very exciting time with a very
5 collaborative Board.

6 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-

7 SANCHEZ: I appreciate that. And on
8 the quality-of-life neighborhood
9 issues, I think there is a role for
10 you to play. As it relates to the
11 organizational -- and Councilmember
12 Thomas was asking about this, one
13 thing is to have a fiscal review of
14 what you're doing. Another is to have
15 an organizational review of do you
16 have the administrative team and
17 capacity that you need, are you in
18 line with best practices.

19 Can you speak to if the Board
20 is planning any organizational review
21 of functions and layers in your
22 administrative team?

23 MS. GROSSMAN: Absolutely.
24 We're deep into the process of an RFP,
25 getting somebody to come in and do,

6/22/2022

1 again much like the financial piece
2 into the HR piece, looking at all our
3 policies and practices, do we have the
4 right talent, are we dealing with
5 diversity, equity and inclusion, do we
6 have the right teams and other things.

7 So I also think as I said
8 before, because we have a new Board,
9 making sure we have the right people
10 and we're making this an appropriate
11 and good welcoming place for folks to
12 work and make us effective with the
13 most talented people. We're looking
14 into evaluating that as well.

15 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-
16 SANCHEZ: What's the timeline for that
17 review?

18 MS. GROSSMAN: I think we are
19 almost complete with the RFP, with the
20 proposal. So as soon as I'm -- I am
21 not on that committee so I can't speak
22 to that, I'm not sure. But I think we
23 are getting ready to get it out of the
24 gate on that.

25 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-

6/22/2022

1 SANCHEZ: Do you have a scope of
2 services that you would be willing to
3 share with the Administration and
4 Council?

5 MS. GROSSMAN: Yes, yes.

6 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-

7 SANCHEZ: If you could get that over
8 to the Chair --

9 MS. GROSSMAN: Sure.

10 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-

11 SANCHEZ: -- that would be important.
12 And then finally, and I hope that
13 there will be moving forward after
14 this public discussion an opportunity
15 for real intergovernmental
16 discussions. One of the things we've
17 learned whether it's the PICA Board,
18 the School District, one of the things
19 that has helped create more
20 transparency has been this kind of
21 five-year budgeting situation.

22 Are you guys open to doing
23 more of a five-year projecting? I
24 agree with all of my colleagues in
25 that you have been operating, you

6/22/2022

1 know, you came in, you're doing a lot
2 of cleanup. But moving forward to
3 build some of that trust around
4 accountability, what has helped the
5 City of Philadelphia, what has helped
6 the School District is that five-year
7 planning. Is the Board open to a
8 similar process so that it would help
9 all of us with predictability around
10 your goals?

11 MS. GROSSMAN: Sure. I think
12 that's a very fair thing to ask. Our
13 financial partner who's going to come
14 in and take a look at us, we'd be
15 happy to look into that.

16 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-
17 SANCHEZ: I think without a five-year
18 plan it makes it really, really
19 difficult for the School District. I
20 think everybody here, again I think
21 everybody has articulated, you know,
22 for us this is about running the most
23 effective agency with efficiencies.
24 There are some growth opportunities
25 for the agencies that will improve

6/22/2022

1 quality of life. We'd like to be part
2 of that conversation because we're
3 making choices when we do that and
4 when we're bringing more online
5 business services that comes at an
6 expense, and we all want to make sure
7 that we all agree that that is worth
8 it.

9 So, yeah, I would hope that
10 in your conversations with our Finance
11 Director, with Uri at the School
12 District their experience with the
13 five-year plan, that that is something
14 that the Board would adopt as a best
15 practice, right. And I think it would
16 lead to building some of this trust
17 that we're trying to get to here, and
18 I know you're coming in at a very
19 difficult situation, but this has been
20 a 20-plus year conversation.

21 I think what you're hearing
22 is a level of frustration. It's what
23 we hear when we're out in the street,
24 right, like PPA knows how to write
25 tickets, PPA knows their tickets, how

6/22/2022

1 does that translate to more
2 predictability for the School
3 District. I look forward to working
4 with you and our Chairs as we go
5 through this process. I think the
6 more your policies are in line, the
7 more your HR stuff is more
8 transparent. All of those things I
9 think the better.

10 People are going to feel
11 around your decision-making capacity
12 and what your mission is. I think
13 there's a real concern about a bloated
14 agency versus an efficient agency that
15 is very, very legitimate, and I know
16 you're taking those seriously.

17 Thank you, Madam Chair.

18 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you
19 very much, Councilmember Quinones-
20 Sanchez.

21 The Chair recognizes
22 Councilmember Oh.

23 COUNCILMAN OH: Thank you
24 very much, Chair.

25 And let's see, good morning,

6/22/2022

1 Chairperson. Thank you for being
2 here. I just wanted to provide a
3 level of information since as it turns
4 out, I guess if you've been around
5 long enough, you know something,
6 right. So I'm going to later
7 distribute a 22-slide PowerPoint kind
8 of on the history of this issue, just
9 especially for our newer colleagues to
10 understand kind of what is the
11 background about what we can and what
12 we cannot do as a City Council and why
13 there is complexities with the Parking
14 Authority.

15 I don't think anybody's
16 fought more with the Parking Authority
17 than I have over the history of time,
18 from resolutions that have the
19 independent auditing by the
20 Controller, and ultimately also a
21 resolution for the Attorney General
22 who is actually the only person in the
23 state that can actually fully audit
24 the Parking Authority, and the
25 Attorney General assigned it to the

6/22/2022

1 Auditor General. That's kind of in
2 the state law.

3 And some of the reasons why
4 that has occurred, so originally the
5 City created an authority to issue
6 bonds to build parking facilities. It
7 later then empowered that authority to
8 do onstreet enforcement, and that
9 authority was controlled by the City.
10 And at a certain point in time, there
11 was a takeover of that authority
12 specifically to fund the schools. In
13 other words, it's illegal and
14 unconstitutional to take a City entity
15 department or function. Under Article
16 3 Section 32 of the Pennsylvania
17 Constitution specifically forbades it
18 because that was a practice by the
19 state at that point in time.

20 So, one, it's illegal to do.
21 Number two, if you do that, you need a
22 state need. And so, what was created
23 in the first Act, Act 22, was the
24 claim that because the state was now
25 responsible for the Philadelphia

6/22/2022

1 School District and could not afford
2 to fund it, therefore it was not a
3 small amount of money. It wasn't 5
4 million or 6 million. They said it
5 was up to 45 million a year, up to.

6 But in Supreme Court cases in
7 every appeal that the City and the
8 state was engaged with the Parking
9 Authority in particular, the claim was
10 that the state could not afford the
11 \$45 million, so it was clearly
12 identified as \$45 million at minimum
13 per year that the state was obliged to
14 give to the City that it could not
15 afford. That's how that came about,
16 45 million.

17 And while this was litigated
18 in state court numerous times -- and
19 by the way, the City never got past
20 initial filings. It actually never
21 went to court on this because it
22 primarily made a claim under the Home
23 Rule Charter, which was continuously
24 dismissed and in all its machinations
25 during that time, they were arguing

6/22/2022

1 about the initial filing of this case,
2 which was the taking of the School
3 District and the claim of 45 million.

4 In the meantime, even though
5 they're arguing this in court, the
6 legislature had changed to Act 9. And
7 the reason in part that was done was
8 because under the SRC, the City could
9 not give the School District money
10 without being obliged to give that
11 same amount of money every year
12 thereafter.

13 So for example, if the School
14 District needed 25 million and the
15 City had an extra 25 million, if the
16 City gave 25 million to the School
17 District, it would be obliged to give
18 the School District 25 million every
19 year thereafter, therefore kind of in
20 a situation which might have been
21 cooperative between the City and the
22 state and the Parking Authority.

23 The City took 25 million as a
24 way of receiving that money and then
25 finding ways to get it to the School

6/22/2022

1 District, but then the excess would go
2 to the School District. But the July
3 2012 statute which was done by the
4 state legislature, which had just
5 unilaterally by itself extended the
6 cooperation agreement. That July 2012
7 statute just empowered the Parking
8 Authority to enforce and administer
9 all onstreet parking in the City of
10 Philadelphia without any cooperation
11 agreement. So the issue has been the
12 lack of a cooperation agreement, the
13 illegal seizing of the Parking
14 Authority from the City of
15 Philadelphia.

16 The City Controller cannot
17 audit all of the Parking Authority
18 because it has City functions and it
19 has state functions, so only the
20 Attorney General can actually do that,
21 and it was done. And there were
22 failings found in that part. So
23 fundamentally, what we can and what we
24 cannot do, what the state will allow
25 with the Parking Authority ultimately

6/22/2022

1 will come down to the voluntary
2 cooperation of the Parking Authority,
3 number one. And number two, whether
4 or not we have, and I believe we do, a
5 legal case to take back onstreet
6 parking in order to get back to a
7 cooperation agreement. So that's kind
8 of the history of this. And I will
9 distribute that just so that everybody
10 does kind of understand the history of
11 what has occurred and why it has
12 developed in this manner.

13 Thank you very much, Chair.

14 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you
15 very much, Councilmember Oh.

16 So, Chair Grossman, one of
17 the areas that we are focused on is
18 specifically clarifying the details
19 regarding the PPA's annual calculation
20 of expenses that are deductible from
21 Onstreet revenues. This is
22 particularly important because it
23 obviously impacts not only how much
24 money goes to the City of
25 Philadelphia, but specifically to the

6/22/2022

1 School District where it has
2 repeatedly struggled to get beyond a
3 modest sum of money.

4 Could you please state for
5 the record the types of expenses that
6 have been deducted from the Onstreet
7 Revenue Division? What are they and
8 how would you characterize them?

9 MS. GROSSMAN: If you would
10 just give me a moment. So as
11 (inaudible) law, we transfer revenues
12 of the system of Onstreet parking
13 regulation net to the operating
14 administrative systems -- expenses of
15 the system of onstreet parking. And
16 that's what it is.

17 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: That would
18 make sense, and I think that that is
19 something that has been commonly
20 understood. I think one of the
21 questions is long-term liability which
22 is the OPEB funding would not be
23 considered a typical direct expense of
24 Onstreet revenues. It's not a day-to-
25 day operational expense. It's long-

6/22/2022

1 term liability.

2 In fact, in the earlier
3 iterations of the state law, that was
4 specifically prohibited. And at no
5 point in time did you ever inform the
6 School District of Philadelphia, did
7 the Authority ever inform the School
8 District of Philadelphia that those
9 calculations have been factored into
10 the reductions that would otherwise go
11 to the School District.

12 In the District's letter to
13 the Philadelphia Parking Authority on
14 January 25th of this year, they had
15 requested a review of the history of
16 calculations around OPEB funding. So
17 following up on that, how long has
18 long-term OPEB and pension
19 calculations been factored into the
20 onstreet revenue reductions?

21 MS. GROSSMAN: To my
22 knowledge, I believe it began in 2018.

23 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: And do you
24 know the amount?

25 MS. GROSSMAN: Excuse me.

6/22/2022

1 I'm sorry. Beginning in FY2008.

2 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Could you
3 clarify that for a moment? So you
4 believe that starting in 2008 the
5 Parking Authority diverted Onstreet
6 revenues, some amount of Onstreet
7 revenues into the OPEB fund; is that
8 right?

9 MS. GROSSMAN: Correct.

10 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: I thought
11 OPEB was created in 2016, so what was
12 it funding in 2008?

13 MS. GROSSMAN: All I could
14 say is what I will tell you is, number
15 one, I must reiterate again I was not
16 here. Okay. So I'm only telling the
17 analysis as to what has been given to
18 me. And as I've read before, I'm
19 happy to read it again if you wish.
20 Beginning in FY2008 consistent with
21 the Government Accounting Standards
22 Board Statement 45, the Authority
23 began recording an expense for the
24 future cost of retiree health benefits
25 as determined by an actuarial report.

6/22/2022

1 Each department was charged a portion
2 of the expense in the same manner as
3 the allocation of support expense
4 (inaudible).

5 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Mr. Spiva,
6 do we lose Chair Grossman?

7 THE CLERK: I believe we lost
8 her from the Teams meeting.

9 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. I
10 think we will strive to get Chair
11 Grossman back.

12 Thank you everybody for your
13 patience while we are trying to
14 reconnect Philadelphia Parking
15 Authority Board Chair Beth Grossman to
16 the meeting.

17 (Brief recess.)

18 THE CLERK: Here again PPA
19 Board Chair Grossman is re-entering.

20 MS. GROSSMAN: Forgive me. I
21 am so sorry. Technology --

22 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: That's no
23 problem. We all have it.

24 MS. GROSSMAN: Technology.
25 The actuary recommended an annual

6/22/2022

1 amount to record and fund the
2 liability over a 20-year period and
3 the cash for that expense was held in
4 Authority accounts for future
5 investment in an OPEB trust. The
6 total amount accumulated from FY2009
7 through FY2018 was \$16 million. And
8 again, in 2018 a recommendation was
9 made to convert insurance reserves
10 from cash to letters of credit. Those
11 accounts were funded in the same
12 manner as indicated, as an indicated
13 OPEB expense. That made \$11.5 million
14 available to further fund the OPEB
15 liability.

16 And again, also to further
17 reiterate, Chair, the OPEB expense is
18 a separate line item under personnel
19 expense in the budget and on monthly
20 income statements are IS2s for every
21 department. The budget and all
22 monthly income statements are
23 presented and approved at public Board
24 meetings and are included in the
25 minutes posted on the Authority

6/22/2022

1 website.

2 The documents are provided to
3 and reviewed with finance officials of
4 the City and School District, and the
5 Authority's independent audit also
6 includes the OPEB liability as well as
7 the amount funded in the trust, and
8 the audit report is reviewed, accepted
9 by the Board and posted on the
10 Authority website and again is
11 provided to officials of the City and
12 the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania.

13 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Notably
14 the IS2s were requested by subpoena
15 and were not returned to us as part of
16 our subpoenaed request just to be
17 clear. Can you commit that the IS2s
18 will be resubmitted back to us and
19 will not appear in a PDF format?
20 Actually it is pretty disappointing
21 that the PPA gave us documents, 750
22 pages' worth in a single PDF document.
23 That is not a standard return.

24 We are requesting that the
25 IS2s be returned as stated in the

6/22/2022

1 subpoena, be provided to this Council
2 body in a searchable format either by
3 Excel spreadsheet or however can
4 happen, but certainly not by PDF.
5 Could you commit to that?

6 MS. GROSSMAN: We could
7 provide you with the IS2s.

8 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Yeah.
9 Thank you. Again, could you -- you
10 had said very clearly that the
11 understanding of what are the expenses
12 of Onstreet revenue should be the
13 expenses of Onstreet revenue. What
14 are the direct costs of day-to-day
15 operations on it? OPEB and its like
16 are long-term liabilities. How do you
17 rationalize that as an Onstreet
18 revenue expense, operational expense
19 and not as a liability?

20 MS. GROSSMAN: I can't answer
21 that. I will get back to you on that
22 answer. I don't want to misstate
23 anything.

24 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Can you
25 clarify which of the following types

6/22/2022

1 of expenses have also been calculated
2 as part of Onstreet revenue? Do you
3 consider capital expenses such as
4 construction maintenance, purchase of
5 properties and facilities to be part
6 of the Onstreet revenue expenses?

7 MS. GROSSMAN: Yes.

8 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: I'm sorry?

9 MS. GROSSMAN: Yes.

10 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: You
11 consider capital expenses to be part
12 of operating Onstreet revenues?

13 MS. GROSSMAN: They are
14 financed over longer periods of time
15 capital projects.

16 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Correct.
17 But why are they on the opera -- you
18 have a capital budget; is that
19 correct?

20 MS. GROSSMAN: Yes.

21 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: You have a
22 capital budget, yes. Every entity has
23 a capital budget. Why are they not
24 put on the capital budget expense?

25 MS. GROSSMAN: Why is what

6/22/2022

1 not put on the capital budget expense?

2 COUNCILWOMAN GYM:

3 Construction costs, maintenance,
4 purchase of properties and facilities.
5 Why are those not considered capital
6 expenses? Why are they considered
7 operating expenses?

8 MS. GROSSMAN: I will have to
9 get back to you. Again, I'm not going
10 to misstate anything in which I'm not
11 familiar. I am not a finance person.

12 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Well, that
13 is partly why we did request again,
14 you know, that this hearing had to
15 include individuals who could answer
16 that question. Is there nobody who is
17 with you today who can answer that
18 question?

19 MS. GROSSMAN: No.

20 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Do you
21 also include -- how do you distribute,
22 how do you calculate, I mean, OPEB
23 overall is the overall retirement fund
24 for the entire Parking Authority,
25 amongst you have multiple divisions as

6/22/2022

1 you know. So how do you exactly
2 calculate the School District's
3 contribution into OPEB?

4 MS. GROSSMAN: It's the
5 same -- you know, it's the same
6 allocation. And again, it's for
7 health care only. It is not pension.

8 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. And
9 again to be clear, when you say it's
10 the same, the School District of
11 Philadelphia had repeatedly made this
12 request as of October at which point
13 you were the Chair of the Board. And
14 for more than seven months up until
15 now they had not received a response
16 about this. So when you say it's the
17 same, actually we don't know what
18 you're talking about. This is also
19 partly why we're very clear that the
20 documents that you submitted to us
21 again are insufficient. They did not
22 make that clear, and it is impossible
23 to discern whether or how you are
24 making these calculations.

25 So do you have some means of

6/22/2022

1 documentation that shows what is
2 specifically the Onstreet revenue
3 contributions, where they come from,
4 what personnel they attach to,
5 et cetera, that allows us to ensure
6 that these are truly Onstreet revenue
7 expenses and not simply a division of
8 the Parking Authority's payments into
9 OPEB?

10 MS. GROSSMAN: We can provide
11 that.

12 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Do you
13 know when?

14 MS. GROSSMAN: No.

15 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Can you
16 commit to 30 days?

17 MS. GROSSMAN: Yes.

18 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: One of the
19 other things that we had requested in
20 the subpoena was a clear cost
21 allocation document. The one that was
22 provided to us again did not cover any
23 of these areas. So can we sit down
24 with you, the School District and the
25 City of Philadelphia to review the

6/22/2022

1 cost allocation document that you
2 submitted to us, review why it is
3 inadequate and make sure that the one
4 that does get submitted in the next 30
5 days adequately answers the questions
6 that are requested by the City, the
7 School District and this Council body?

8 MS. GROSSMAN: Yes, we're
9 happy to answer any questions in
10 determining whether it's adequate or
11 inadequate.

12 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: All right.
13 Thank you. I think the other areas
14 that we had questions about, you know,
15 there are a number of questions
16 about -- we'll touch base on a few
17 things. I guess one of the questions
18 I do have is a little bit around the
19 PPA's records that showed that
20 multiple high school interns with a
21 salary of nearly \$20,000 and college
22 interns were hired in the Onstreet
23 Division with a salary of \$31,657.
24 Can you explain why you would be
25 paying that much and why they are put

6/22/2022

1 onto the Onstreet Revenue Division?

2 MS. GROSSMAN: Number one,
3 I'm unfamiliar with that. If anything
4 had occurred such as that, that was
5 before I got here. Second, that was
6 not with any of the document requests
7 or questions that were given to me in
8 regard to this hearing so I cannot
9 answer that.

10 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Did you
11 review the documents that were
12 submitted to the Council body under
13 the subpoena?

14 MS. GROSSMAN: To the best
15 that I could, yes.

16 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay.
17 Well, those documents were the ones
18 that were submitted to us under the
19 subpoena. Is there anybody who is
20 with you who can answer that question?

21 MS. GROSSMAN: No.

22 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Do you
23 believe that that would be a good use
24 of public funds given that there was a
25 choice made about the amount of money

6/22/2022

1 that could go towards the School
2 District of Philadelphia?

3 MS. GROSSMAN: I cannot
4 answer that. That's something I would
5 review and I'm not going to
6 hypothesize or assume anything.

7 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. To
8 be clear, again those numbers were on
9 official documents that were submitted
10 to the Council body as part of the
11 subpoena. Would you have concerns?

12 MS. GROSSMAN: Again, that's
13 something I have to look at in the
14 full context of it. I am not going to
15 give an off-the-hip answer.

16 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. In
17 addition, could you answer questions
18 about the pay of PPA executive
19 salaries that exceed, for example, the
20 cost of Boston's Commissioner
21 Transportation and Parking by \$91,000?
22 This is from the 2019 Controller's
23 report. And the PPA Senior Director
24 of Onstreet Parking receives \$180,000
25 annual salary which exceeds comparable

6/22/2022

1 positions in Miami, Pittsburgh,
2 Portland by \$26,000, \$62,000 and
3 \$66,000 respectively? Could you
4 answer questions about the choice to
5 make onstreet revenue salaries so
6 excessively high and out of whack with
7 comparable parking authorities across
8 the country?

9 MS. GROSSMAN: Again no, I
10 cannot. These salary decisions were
11 made prior to me joining the Board of
12 the Parking Authority.

13 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Is it your
14 intent to retain those salaries or do
15 you plan to review salary
16 compensation?

17 MS. GROSSMAN: I think with
18 our HR people going into we're happy
19 to look at it.

20 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: So the
21 question is are you looking at it, not
22 whether you're happy to. Are you
23 looking into executive salaries?

24 MS. GROSSMAN: Not at this
25 juncture. Again, we're waiting for HR

6/22/2022

1 people, a third-party HR agency to
2 come in and evaluate us.

3 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: So as I
4 noted, the PPA executive salaries are
5 among the highest amongst comparable
6 parking organizations according to a
7 2019 report, but the PPA pays its
8 parking enforcement officers the
9 lowest amongst comparable authorities.
10 Can you explain the discrepancy
11 between executive salary and parking
12 enforcement officer salaries?

13 MS. GROSSMAN: And again, no,
14 I cannot because again these decisions
15 were made prior to me coming here.
16 And again, that's something we're
17 happy to evaluate with our third-party
18 partner when we come in and we review
19 pay structures and other HR issues.

20 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay.
21 Again, not asking whether you're happy
22 to. Are you planning to review those
23 salary structures?

24 MS. GROSSMAN: Again, yes,
25 we're happy to. And also part of that

6/22/2022

1 is --

2 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: No, my
3 question is are you planning to, not
4 are you happy to. Maybe it's like a
5 question about rhetoric, but I'm
6 trying to go for clarity here. Are
7 you planning to, yes or no?

8 MS. GROSSMAN: Yes.

9 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. And
10 if you don't have a comment on that,
11 can you personally state, because you
12 are the Board Chair, can you
13 personally state your opinion on the
14 discrepancy between the salaries
15 amongst executives and your lowest --
16 and your parking enforcement officers
17 as well as the high rate of salaries
18 amongst executives?

19 MS. GROSSMAN: No, I'm going
20 to not -- well, I'm not going to
21 proffer an opinion on that.

22 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Is there a
23 reason why?

24 MS. GROSSMAN: Because I
25 don't think it's appropriate. And

6/22/2022

1 again, I'm not going to proffer an
2 opinion on that.

3 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Even
4 though you're the Chair of the Board
5 and you have committed to change?

6 MS. GROSSMAN: Yes,
7 absolutely. But this is something
8 that as I've acknowledged we are happy
9 and will look at, but my opinion is
10 irrelevant.

11 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: As Board
12 Chair, you feel that your opinion is
13 irrelevant?

14 MS. GROSSMAN: No, but I
15 think we're talking about practices
16 and any changes that would, if
17 necessarily be made, that is a Board
18 decision along with executives in
19 here.

20 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: And within
21 that conversation, you believe your
22 opinion is irrelevant?

23 MS. GROSSMAN: I'm not going
24 to -- my opinion is irrelevant, but
25 we're talking about practices and

6/22/2022

1 procedures. And I'm not going to
2 proffer -- I'm not comfortable. I
3 don't think it's relevant to give an
4 opinion based on our salary structure.
5 I'm not going to do that.

6 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay.
7 Even though there have been multiple
8 audits addressing this and multiple
9 recommendations have been made by
10 state level and city level agencies
11 around this very issue?

12 MS. GROSSMAN: And we will
13 analyze this and take a look at it
14 going forward. That is our goal --

15 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. I
16 just want to put on the record though
17 that this commitment has been stated
18 before and it has not changed.

19 MS. GROSSMAN: Well, I'm
20 happy to say that we're a new Board
21 who is committed going forward and
22 looking at it.

23 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. I
24 am going to turn to Councilmember
25 Squilla who has a question in the

6/22/2022

1 queue. So the Chair recognizes
2 Councilmember Squilla.

3 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank
4 you. Thank you, Madam Chair.
5 Appreciate it and thank you for your
6 questioning.

7 My question is just a basic
8 question, that I hear that you say
9 you're going to be working closer with
10 Council legislative body. What ways
11 do you see you will be doing that and
12 will it be different than it was
13 previously?

14 MS. GROSSMAN: Well, again I
15 can't speak about what was done
16 previously because I wasn't here. But
17 I'm always open and welcome to explore
18 pilot programs or things that will
19 improve the quality of life or public
20 safety for people in the different
21 Councilmanic Districts or across
22 citywide or if anybody or if any
23 Councilperson has a question for PPA
24 or any ideas, we welcome that as well.
25 We're all part of making Philadelphia

6/22/2022

1 a better place.

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All
3 right. So you expect to engage more
4 with Council and with the
5 Administration on these policies that
6 you have?

7 MS. GROSSMAN: Whether it's
8 policies or whether Council has
9 initiatives or pending legislation to
10 see if PPA can play a role in that,
11 we're opening a collab -- a
12 communication.

13 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: The
14 reason I was asking, I mean, we are
15 doing something currently. Now, we
16 have the sound meter cameras that
17 we're looking at working with the PPA
18 and how to implement that. I think we
19 could have a good-working relationship
20 together. We should have a good-
21 working relationship together. So I
22 think there are opportunities for us
23 to do that and I think that
24 collaboration builds trust amongst
25 each other and I think goes a long way

6/22/2022

1 to getting things, you know, Parking
2 Authority is a big arm of the City
3 enforcement mechanism and for parking,
4 for parking lots. So I think by
5 working together we will actually
6 improve the City instead of working in
7 separate directions.

8 So I'm looking forward to
9 that collaboration. I must say that
10 during this process with this
11 legislation that I introduced that the
12 Parking Authority has been great in
13 advising us and giving us ideas and
14 also reaching out to other places that
15 have done this and looking at other
16 vendors and looking for vendors and
17 things like that. So I think that's
18 more of the things we need to be doing
19 and I think we see that opportunity is
20 there. So I just want to hopefully
21 know that we can continue to do that
22 and even make it stronger in the
23 future.

24 MS. GROSSMAN: Thank you.

25 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All

6/22/2022

1 right. Well, thank you so much for
2 your time.

3 Thank you, Madam Chair.

4 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you
5 so much, Councilmember Squilla. And
6 thank you very much for pointing out
7 this important dialogue about
8 collaboration.

9 As you know, colleagues,
10 Finance Director Rob Dubow submitted
11 to all of us which we distributed
12 formal testimony that discussed one of
13 the areas where we see the most
14 potential for collaboration and, that
15 is, around his statement. And I'm
16 going to take a moment to read his
17 statement:

18 He wrote that prior to 2012
19 through an agreement between the City
20 and the Philadelphia Parking Authority
21 and the subsequent state law, the
22 Mayor had substantial authority over
23 the PPA's budget. That authority
24 included the Parking Authority being
25 required to consult with and

6/22/2022

1 ultimately receive approval of the
2 City through the Finance Director for
3 its budget.

4 Moreover, the PPA was
5 required to provide the City with
6 monthly statements regarding its
7 receipts and expenditures, annual
8 staffing summaries and a monthly
9 variance analysis for any variance in
10 monthly and/or year-to-date revenue of
11 expenses which exceeded 10 percent of
12 budget or \$10,000.

13 Finally, the Finance Director
14 was authorized to require mid-year
15 budget changes in the event of a cost
16 overrun or revenue shortfall. The
17 2012 legislation took that authority
18 away from the City and giving it much
19 less ability to effect what happens to
20 operations that directly impact its
21 finances. And that's the end of
22 Director Dubow's statement.

23 Additionally I think,
24 colleagues, as you know we discussed
25 that in 2012 the Parking Authority

6/22/2022

1 came before this Council body, had
2 requested an increase by more than 50
3 percent an increase in meter fees,
4 promising that the School District
5 would see those revenues come to
6 fruition \$18 million a year. That
7 amount of money was never delivered.
8 And again as I said earlier in my
9 opening remarks that money actually
10 declined. It did not grow.

11 So Director Dubow's statement
12 makes clear that the City of
13 Philadelphia would like to, and I
14 would echo that from our Council body,
15 would like to reinstate the 2012 --
16 the pre-2012 understanding in which
17 the City of Philadelphia has sign-off
18 authority on the Parking Authority's
19 budget.

20 Given the numerous concerns
21 regarding the PPA's financial
22 practices, questions that cannot be
23 answered today, the grave concerns
24 regarding recent organizational
25 leadership changes and the failure to

6/22/2022

1 fully deliver on financial promises
2 made by the District, including to be
3 clear, Chair Grossman, under your
4 watch the \$11 million mistake about
5 the pension fund was on your watch.

6 It was informed to the
7 District in October of 2021. There
8 was almost seven months that had to go
9 by before it was resolved, and no
10 answers were ever given to the
11 District. So given these kinds of
12 concerns, the question on the table is
13 will the Parking Authority agree to
14 City oversight over its budget?

15 MS. GROSSMAN: No, I cannot
16 commit to that.

17 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: And can
18 you explain why?

19 MS. GROSSMAN: Because we
20 follow the laws of the Commonwealth
21 and I can't -- that's something, an
22 answer that I cannot give as a single
23 individual. We're run by a Board. We
24 have executives within here. And so,
25 that's certainly an answer that I

6/22/2022

1 cannot and will not give nor will I
2 commit to it.

3 We are looking forward to
4 improving the Parking Authority going
5 forward. We look to collaborate and
6 build trust with the School District
7 and the City, and that's what we plan
8 on doing.

9 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: So nothing
10 prevents you from providing some of
11 that information to us. You
12 actually -- so I want to be clear,
13 you're saying no is giving an answer
14 to us before consulting with members
15 of your Board --

16 MS. GROSSMAN: I'm not
17 answering --

18 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: -- if you
19 are willing --

20 MS. GROSSMAN: No, I can't
21 answer the question and I cannot
22 commit to an answer.

23 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. So
24 do you commit to going back to your
25 Board for a review of this request?

6/22/2022

1 MS. GROSSMAN: They can hear
2 us. I mean, certainly we could
3 discuss it. But I don't think --

4 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: I think my
5 question is a yes or no --

6 MS. GROSSMAN: No.

7 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: -- a
8 request was made to you and is
9 established by the City's Finance
10 Director and by this City Council
11 body. Can you commit to going back to
12 your Board with that question?

13 MS. GROSSMAN: I certainly
14 can.

15 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: I thought
16 I heard you say no?

17 MS. GROSSMAN: I certainly
18 can. If that's what -- we can.
19 That's fine. Again, we are legislated
20 by state laws. We follow those laws,
21 but I can certainly take it back to
22 the Board.

23 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Right.
24 And to be clear, nothing prevents the
25 Board from voluntarily providing this.

6/22/2022

1 It's not prohibited by state law. The
2 state law in 2012 merely removed the
3 requirement. But the Board in the
4 spirit of collaboration recognized
5 these serious concerns, shifts in
6 financial management and oversight
7 over the entity. As you noted, there
8 may be things that you don't even know
9 that you don't know. Can you commit
10 to having a discussion with your Board
11 that the City has financial oversight
12 and sign off on your budget?

13 MS. GROSSMAN: We can
14 certainly bring it up to the Board.

15 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. And
16 will you commit to bringing it up to
17 your Board?

18 MS. GROSSMAN: Yes, I will
19 commit to bring it up to the Board.

20 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. And
21 do you believe that this would be
22 helpful to the Parking Authority?

23 MS. GROSSMAN: I'm sorry. Do
24 I believe what would be helpful to the
25 Parking Authority?

6/22/2022

1 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: An
2 oversight and collaboration with the
3 City of Philadelphia on your budget?

4 MS. GROSSMAN: We do
5 collaborate. We collaborate with the
6 City. We collaborate with the School
7 District as we do during meetings
8 throughout the year. So I don't
9 think -- I don't necessarily know if
10 any further changes or oversight needs
11 to be done.

12 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. But
13 you know we're here because you didn't
14 collaborate or communicate with the
15 School District of Philadelphia about
16 an \$11 million mistake that was never
17 explained until today?

18 MS. GROSSMAN: Well, I
19 disagree. We did communicate. We
20 provided documents, but we will
21 certainly discuss and respond to your
22 inquiry.

23 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Can the
24 Parking Authority commit to providing
25 quarterly financial statements to the

6/22/2022

1 School District and to the City of
2 Philadelphia, particularly around
3 expenses, salaries, and any shifts in
4 policy that would have a significant
5 impact on School District and/or City
6 revenues?

7 MS. GROSSMAN: Certainly, the
8 Board can certainly discuss and
9 respond to that accordingly.

10 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. And
11 will the Board consider approval and
12 consultation with the School District
13 of Philadelphia and the City of
14 Philadelphia around major policy
15 shifts that could have an impact on
16 revenues?

17 MS. GROSSMAN: Again, we will
18 discuss and respond to that.

19 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Are there
20 any other things that the Authority is
21 willing to discuss or commit to at
22 this time in terms of how it intends
23 to work going forward?

24 MS. GROSSMAN: Not at this
25 time, no.

6/22/2022

1 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. We
2 are going to go back to a couple of
3 additional questions. I think one of
4 the questions that we have I just want
5 to follow up with Councilmember Domb's
6 questions about Lot 9 in particular.
7 As you know, the PPA sunk \$3.6 million
8 on building renovations, construction
9 consultants and office furniture on a
10 new headquarters and a location known
11 as Lot 9.

12 This was money that was
13 deducted from Onstreet revenues, but
14 was never communicated to the School
15 District of Philadelphia. According
16 to L&I, this work was performed
17 without any of the necessary permits
18 and inspections. And as a result, the
19 office building did not receive a
20 certificate of occupancy. But the PPA
21 moved its workers into the building
22 nonetheless only to have them move out
23 in less than a month due to what we
24 understand to be terrible plumbing
25 problems that rendered the building

6/22/2022

1 effectively unusable.

2 So could you clarify for us
3 how much exactly did the PPA spend on
4 all aspects of the Lot 9 project, and
5 specifically what amounts of that came
6 out of the Onstreet Revenue Division?

7 MS. GROSSMAN: First, it was
8 not deducted from Onstreet, and I do
9 not have the exact amount so I cannot
10 answer that question.

11 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: So none of
12 the money was deducted from Onstreet
13 revenues?

14 MS. GROSSMAN: Correct.

15 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: So was the
16 media reporting on that incorrectly
17 then?

18 MS. GROSSMAN: I can't answer
19 that.

20 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: You can't
21 answer it because you didn't read the
22 media report or because you're not
23 sure --

24 MS. GROSSMAN: It's not
25 deducted from -- if that's what they

6/22/2022

1 reported, then that's -- I don't know.
2 I can't look at an article. I don't
3 have articles in front of me. What I
4 can tell you is it was not deducted
5 from Onstreet.

6 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: No costs
7 related to the Lot 9 project were
8 deducted from Onstreet revenue; is
9 that correct?

10 MS. GROSSMAN: That is
11 correct.

12 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay.
13 That's what you're stating. Who made
14 the decision to at least build and
15 move to the Lot 9 project?

16 MS. GROSSMAN: Again, that
17 was before me. I do not know.

18 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Are you
19 planning to review that decision in
20 order for you to know so there can be
21 controls or measures?

22 MS. GROSSMAN: Sure.

23 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: You are
24 planning to review those decisions?

25 MS. GROSSMAN: Well, I think

6/22/2022

1 as part as creating a Capital Project
2 Committee, I think that would
3 certainly go into that analysis.

4 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. And
5 do you intend to make that information
6 or that reporting on the Lot 9
7 decision-making public?

8 MS. GROSSMAN: That's
9 something we can discuss and respond
10 to.

11 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. If
12 the money didn't come out of the
13 School District of Philadelphia, where
14 were the revenues coming from for the
15 Lot 9 project?

16 MS. GROSSMAN: That I don't
17 know. That I can get back to again.
18 That was before me.

19 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: The
20 decision to rescind it though was not
21 under your leadership? You --

22 MS. GROSSMAN: To rescind
23 what --

24 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: -- were in
25 on September 2021.

6/22/2022

1 MS. GROSSMAN: To settle it
2 and resolve the issue, yes, that fell
3 under us.

4 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. So
5 if you don't know where the revenues
6 came from, how do you know they didn't
7 come from Onstreet revenue?

8 MS. GROSSMAN: That I know
9 that they did not come from Onstreet.

10 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. So
11 you just know that it didn't come from
12 Onstreet revenue, but you have no idea
13 where the 3.6 million came from?

14 MS. GROSSMAN: The details of
15 this I will be happy to respond and
16 get back to you on. I do not want to
17 make a misstatement or assume
18 anything.

19 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: And what
20 kind of internal controls or review
21 processes do you currently have in
22 place to assure protections on this or
23 who is actually looking out about it?
24 These are a number of questions that
25 we had asked through the formal

6/22/2022

1 processes. I'm just trying to
2 understand what is your oversight on
3 revenues that would allow you not to
4 know where the revenues came from?

5 MS. GROSSMAN: Finance and
6 legal counsel. That's where --

7 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. So
8 you have your finance. Your CFO is no
9 longer present; is that correct?

10 MS. GROSSMAN: Correct.

11 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: And your
12 legal counsel, and who is your current
13 legal counsel?

14 MS. GROSSMAN: Dennis Weldon.

15 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. And
16 Dennis Weldon is currently working as
17 your day-to-day CEO effectively or how
18 are you characterizing Mr. Weldon's
19 current role?

20 MS. GROSSMAN: He is Interim-
21 acting Executive Director.

22 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. Did
23 you say you don't have a current
24 acting CFO; is that right?

25 MS. GROSSMAN: No.

6/22/2022

1 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. But
2 you did say that you expect that your
3 new CFO will be hired in a matter of
4 days?

5 MS. GROSSMAN: Will be
6 beginning in a matter -- will be
7 starting in a matter of days.

8 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: So you've
9 already hired this individual?

10 MS. GROSSMAN: Yes.

11 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. All
12 right. I do want to ask a little bit
13 about certain areas regarding going
14 back to hiring. One of the things
15 that we had discussed was that the
16 Parking Authority has 500 percent more
17 employees than comparable parking
18 authorities across the country.

19 Many of these jobs go to
20 individuals who are politically
21 connected. A 2019 audit by the City
22 Controller found that it was 23
23 percent or 25 employees of 107
24 employees sampled either held
25 political positions or resided with

6/22/2022

1 someone who did, and specifically 21
2 employees were or lived with a
3 Committee person. Two were Ward
4 leaders. Two were Committee and two
5 were both Committee members and Ward
6 leaders. And the study did not count
7 employees who might otherwise have had
8 influential political connections,
9 such as close friends, extended family
10 members. So again, I think these
11 positions make up more than a quarter
12 of the workforce. Can you explain why
13 that is the case?

14 MS. GROSSMAN: No, I cannot.
15 These hires occurred before I was
16 here. I cannot, but I will also note
17 that we did respond in writing to the
18 Controller's report to which you are
19 referring. We did respond in writing.
20 We could certainly make that available
21 to you.

22 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Since that
23 report was done in 2019, have those
24 numbers changed at all?

25 MS. GROSSMAN: I have no

6/22/2022

1 idea.

2 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. So
3 you responded to the report in
4 writing, but you don't know whether
5 anything has changed?

6 MS. GROSSMAN: I did not
7 respond in writing --

8 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: I know
9 but --

10 MS. GROSSMAN: -- it was
11 responded. So I don't know who is
12 politically connected. I do not ask
13 people's nor does the Board political
14 party affiliation. I have no idea.

15 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: So I think
16 earlier, Chair Grossman, one of the
17 things that you had said is that you
18 are attentive to and should be
19 attentive to reports that have been
20 done by the Authority including
21 recommendations that have been made.
22 And you have been the Chair since
23 September of 2021 or you've been the
24 Chair since October of 2021.

25 And I'm trying to understand,

6/22/2022

1 while I understand again I'm clear
2 that you may not be responsible for
3 the past, you are responsible for what
4 happens from the moment you stepped
5 onto the Board and that includes being
6 aware of areas that have been publicly
7 reported as glaring areas of problems
8 and not willfully responding, knowing
9 or investigating, raising questions
10 about neglect or willfulness about not
11 doing that.

12 So I'm just trying to give
13 you some area to respond back about
14 why you're not interested in paying
15 attention to, inquiring about or
16 seeing any changes around an area
17 that's been highlighted before.

18 MS. GROSSMAN: Please don't
19 put words in my mouth. Second of all,
20 we are committed to making our hiring
21 process open and fair. We look
22 forward to people applying on our
23 website. We look forward to hiring
24 the people who are the most qualified
25 and have the best skills for their

6/22/2022

1 jobs. So to think that I've neglected
2 this or not concerned, that's not so.

3 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. I
4 asked you specifically about positions
5 and whether there had been any changes
6 around particularly patronage
7 positions, political hirings. You
8 said that you were not interested.
9 You don't ask about that. Do you
10 consider it an area of concern?

11 MS. GROSSMAN: I'm interested
12 in this and I'm certainly -- but I
13 don't ask -- you know, all I could say
14 is, you know, it -- no, first of all,
15 I don't want it to be a place of
16 patronage. Second of all, we're happy
17 again to explore this with our third
18 party HR person who's coming in to
19 look at this. But again, the Board is
20 committed to hiring those people who
21 want to work here, wish to have
22 careers here and are the best people
23 to hire for the job. We want talented
24 folks who are committed to the mission
25 of the Parking Authority.

6/22/2022

1 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: And I
2 appreciate that. I do. I do think
3 it's notable though that your website
4 still allows people to randomly apply
5 for a job even though it may not be
6 listed, so they can just submit things
7 and I don't know if that's typical of
8 most public agencies or in a public
9 hiring process.

10 MS. GROSSMAN: I don't know
11 how to answer that. Universities do
12 that as well. You keep people's
13 resumés online. I don't think
14 anything is wrong with that.

15 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. You
16 don't think there's any problem even
17 though in past practices there are a
18 number of individuals who hold jobs
19 for which there were never public
20 advertisements for or formal titles
21 with prior to their hire?

22 MS. GROSSMAN: Within the
23 PPA?

24 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Yeah.

25 MS. GROSSMAN: Sorry, I

6/22/2022

1 can't -- well, no, we are committed to
2 advertising all jobs or doing --

3 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: And hiring
4 for jobs that have been advertised and
5 not creating jobs?

6 MS. GROSSMAN: Correct.

7 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. I
8 appreciate that.

9 Are there any other questions
10 from members of the Committee for this
11 witness?

12 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Madam
13 Co-Chair, I just have a question.

14 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Yes.
15 Thank you very much. The Chair
16 recognizes my Co-Chair Councilmember
17 Green.

18 COUNCILMAN GREEN: I just
19 wanted -- during the colloquy with
20 Co-Chair Gym, you made reference to
21 Human Resources professional. So I
22 want to make sure I understand that
23 earlier when I was asking questions
24 you made reference to bring in a
25 third-party entity to come in to

6/22/2022

1 review the finances, the positions,
2 staffing, policies from a financial
3 perspective. But in your conversation
4 with Councilmember Gym, you made
5 reference to Human Resources. Is that
6 a separate entity that you're bringing
7 in or is it the same entities
8 reviewing both Human Resources as well
9 as financial position structure, all
10 the above?

11 MS. GROSSMAN: Chair, it's a
12 separate -- that's separate.

13 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Oh,
14 separate. Okay.

15 MS. GROSSMAN: Yeah. There
16 are two such distinct things. So
17 again, it will be a deep dive into HR
18 practices, policies and procedures and
19 hiring.

20 COUNCILMAN GREEN: And so,
21 have you issued an RFP? Are you
22 drafting an RFP? And what's the
23 timeline for this HR third-party
24 entity to come in?

25 MS. GROSSMAN: RFP has been

6/22/2022

1 issued. I think we are reviewing
2 those that have been submitted.
3 Again, I can find that answer out for
4 you. I'm not on that committee, but
5 we're well underway I think with the
6 receipt of people who have submitted.

7 COUNCILMAN GREEN: So then
8 within the Board, you've established a
9 committee to focus on HR issues, you
10 issued the RFP, that committee's going
11 to review the responses, make a
12 selection, I guess will recommend that
13 selection to the entire Board, and
14 then that HR committee will then be
15 working with this third-party
16 consultant to review policy procedures
17 within Parking Authority and then at
18 some point after reviewing that
19 information, present it to the Board
20 for ideas and/or adoption for a change
21 that may occur within the
22 organization?

23 MS. GROSSMAN: That is
24 correct.

25 COUNCILMAN GREEN: And so, on

6/22/2022

1 the financial side a similar process
2 is also occurring. You have a
3 committee of the Board that's working
4 on financial issues. This issue in
5 the RFP will have a third-party entity
6 come in to review that information,
7 review the work that they do, then
8 make the recommendations to the Board
9 for the Board to adopt changes they
10 may take going forward?

11 MS. GROSSMAN: That is
12 correct.

13 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay. And
14 what's the timeline? I know the
15 timeline for the financial review you
16 said was three months to the time of
17 executing the contract. What's the
18 timeline on the HR perspective?

19 MS. GROSSMAN: That I will
20 have to get back to because I'm not
21 sure. I don't want to misstate
22 anything.

23 COUNCILMAN GREEN: And for
24 both the HR review and also the
25 financial review, have you identified

6/22/2022

1 a range of dollars for that cost?

2 MS. GROSSMAN: You mean what
3 they submit. They submitted different
4 costs obviously. There's a different
5 range of how much it costs from each
6 one, so I'm not familiar with the HR
7 one --

8 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Right.

9 MS. GROSSMAN -- with regard
10 to the finance one, yes.

11 COUNCILMAN GREEN: No, I was
12 just curious in reference to have you
13 identified what that range may be in
14 reference to the cost that you will be
15 using from dollars from the PPA's
16 budget for the financial review and
17 also the HR review?

18 MS. GROSSMAN: Yes. I think
19 the range for the financial one I
20 think was maybe \$150,000 to over 300.

21 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay. And
22 then you haven't established that for
23 the HR review as of yet?

24 MS. GROSSMAN: That I do not
25 know. I don't want to --

6/22/2022

1 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay. The
2 committee may know that, got you.

3 MS. GROSSMAN: -- I'm not on
4 that committee, no. But we think that
5 this is a --

6 COUNCILMAN GREEN: And was it
7 the Board is now how many members --
8 I'm sorry?

9 MS. GROSSMAN: I'm sorry.
10 What did you --

11 COUNCILMAN GREEN: I guess my
12 other question is what's the current
13 size of the Board as of right now?

14 MS. GROSSMAN: Six.

15 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Six
16 members?

17 MS. GROSSMAN: Yes.

18 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Is there
19 another vacancy?

20 MS. GROSSMAN: No.

21 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay. And
22 then when do you anticipate being at
23 the full complement for the Board?

24 MS. GROSSMAN: We have a full
25 complement of the Board.

6/22/2022

1 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Oh, so the
2 Board only has six members?

3 MS. GROSSMAN: Correct.

4 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Got you.
5 Okay. All right. Thank you, Madam
6 Co-Chair.

7 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you
8 Co-Chair Green.

9 Chair Grossman, I think we
10 are at the conclusion of this section
11 of the hearing. But I want to make it
12 clear that the PPA still needs to
13 provide us with documents that were
14 not submitted. This is particularly
15 important given the refusal to commit
16 to some of the requests by the City
17 Finance Director.

18 We cannot possibly know how
19 you're spending public money based on
20 incomplete documents and the answers
21 that were given today. So we want to
22 make it clear that we will still be
23 requesting those documents from you.
24 We will put it in writing. We would
25 prefer not to have to subpoena. But

6/22/2022

1 if necessary, we will do so.

2 I think if we can have a
3 commitment from you that a response
4 will be given within the next 30 days,
5 that we don't have to go through a
6 formal subpoena process as we felt
7 that we had to before. But to make it
8 clear even though we went through a
9 formal subpoena process, we did not
10 get the requested documents and, in
11 fact, got 750 pages that were jumbled
12 together in a single PDF and were not
13 searchable.

14 In the interest of
15 transparency and collaboration, we
16 don't feel like that was a good step
17 and would request that future
18 documents to this Committee and to
19 this Council body be delivered in a
20 manner that would be reflective of a
21 real interest in the collaborative
22 work necessary to correct past
23 mistakes so that we don't repeat them
24 going forward into the future.

25 I would like to thank all the

6/22/2022

1 panels and witnesses for their
2 participation today. Thank you very
3 much for your time, and you can
4 disconnect.

5 Before we formally conclude,
6 Co-Chair Green, I wanted to offer any
7 time for any of my colleagues to offer
8 any other closing remarks or
9 questions.

10 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Yeah, I
11 would just like to make a point. I
12 just hope that as we are moving
13 forward with this new leadership of
14 the Philadelphia Parking Authority,
15 that this moves forward in the spirit
16 of collaboration in reference to
17 addressing some of these issues. Look
18 forward to getting more information
19 regarding the review that will be done
20 by the HR entity as well as your
21 financial entity in reference to how
22 the Parking Authority can improve as
23 an organization, and also, I'm sure
24 they'll have their own suggestions
25 regarding the operations and financial

6/22/2022

1 and fiscal matters of the organization
2 and hopefully that we are now moving
3 in a new direction with a spirit of
4 collaboration both for the
5 organization and activities it's
6 trying to achieve within the City of
7 Philadelphia.

8 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you
9 very much, Co-Chair Green, for those
10 comments.

11 I'd also like to offer a few
12 closing remarks as well. First of
13 all, I want to thank the viewing
14 public for the time that you spent
15 watching this hearing. We came into
16 it with the level of seriousness and
17 of course came into it at a time when
18 the Parking Authority had made what
19 School District CFO Uri Monson said
20 was just absolutely unprecedented even
21 amongst its 20-year history of fraught
22 financial relationships with the
23 School District of Philadelphia, and
24 that was an "\$11 million accounting
25 error," and we're not really sure

6/22/2022

1 exactly what that is, and that that
2 had not been previously shared.

3 Many of the questions that we
4 asked today remain unanswered,
5 including regarding the details of how
6 the PPA determines the calculations of
7 its City and District contributions
8 each year, what the universe of
9 expenses are that are deducted from
10 Onstreet revenue streams which go
11 towards the School District of
12 Philadelphia and the City of
13 Philadelphia.

14 There are unanswered
15 questions raised by my colleagues that
16 are outstanding regarding the impact
17 of past Parking Authority mistakes and
18 the impact on School District funding.
19 And once again, we are in a place
20 where we are starting over.

21 Additionally, while we
22 welcome a third party of PPA financial
23 practices as stated by Councilmember
24 Gauthier, if the PPA hires them,
25 they're not technically independent.

6/22/2022

1 They aren't independent, period. And
2 we do need an independent review of
3 the financial practices, the policies,
4 HR policies of the PPA, because we
5 have heard promises made before
6 following past disgraceful
7 resignations of executive directors.

8 We have learned clearly from
9 the past that these reviews and
10 statements about pending policy
11 changes are no guarantee that anything
12 ever changes at the Authority, and
13 especially concerning is the current
14 state of the PPA leadership. Right
15 now the organization removed its
16 Executive Director and Chief Financial
17 Officer and with the potential for
18 significant time gaps filling these
19 leadership roles and most importantly,
20 getting answers back to entities such
21 as the City, the School District and
22 our City Council body and the newness
23 of the majority, the vast majority of
24 the Board currently.

25 So I do have major concerns

6/22/2022

1 remaining about the capacity of the
2 PPA's Board and the PPA's leadership
3 to engage in the kind of
4 transformation that's necessary and
5 the kind of transparency and clarity
6 that's necessary to ensure effective
7 financial management of the Parking
8 Authority.

9 And I also want to be clear
10 about what we believe to be needed for
11 meaningful change. As is requested by
12 the City, as has been requested by our
13 City Council body, the PPA should
14 re-establish City sign-off on the
15 PPA's budget as it existed prior to
16 2012. Post-2012 we have seen numerous
17 problems, including deeply troubling
18 issues around secret settlements that
19 have gone out from disgraced and
20 predatory Parking Authority Directors.

21 We have seen finances go all
22 over the map in terms of the School
23 District of Philadelphia, questionable
24 diversion of Onstreet revenues,
25 continuing questions about why capital

6/22/2022

1 expenditures are placed onto operating
2 revenues. So I want to be clear that
3 the City and this Council body are
4 united in believing that the City
5 should have signed off on the PPA's
6 budget. We believe it is in the best
7 interest of the Board as well as in
8 the best interest of the City and the
9 taxpayers of Philadelphia.

10 We had requested disclosure
11 and approval by City, state and the
12 School District of Philadelphia of any
13 major policy shifts that have
14 significant impact on long-term
15 liabilities or School District of
16 Philadelphia finances. This is very
17 clear. I think the OPEB funding is a
18 perfect example of that. Long-ranging
19 questions about capital expenditures,
20 tuition payments, all sorts of things
21 that have raised eyebrows, shocked the
22 senses, these types of decisions are
23 not merely those that go to the
24 Parking Authority, but should be
25 shared in the spirit of collaboration

6/22/2022

1 and transparency with the entities
2 that the Parking Authority is required
3 to support.

4 And finally, we requested
5 quarterly financial reports and data
6 in addition to the quarterly financial
7 meetings that we already have with the
8 Parking Authority. Clearly, those
9 quarterly meetings were not enough to
10 provide full disclosure, full
11 transparency and to predict the
12 Parking Authority's financial
13 contributions, including projections
14 of revenues and expenses, projections
15 of contributions to the City and the
16 School District of Philadelphia.

17 We will clearly continue to
18 follow up on the issues with the
19 subpoena documents that were raised
20 earlier today, myself directly with
21 Chair Grossman. We will continue
22 pursuing documents that will let us
23 understand how the organization is
24 spending Philadelphia's taxpayer
25 money, and we will continue to engage

6/22/2022

1 with the Philadelphia Parking
2 Authority Board and the City of
3 Philadelphia around the need for these
4 crucial structural changes. But it is
5 clear that we have been here before.

6 We will enter into this work
7 with a renewed spirit of work and
8 purpose going forward. But to be
9 clear, the motivation behind this was
10 disastrous and it caused significant
11 financial chaos for two extremely
12 important entities within the City of
13 Philadelphia, primarily the School
14 District of Philadelphia.

15 We are not going to tolerate
16 this amount of chaos going forward.
17 We will continue to hold the Parking
18 Authority accountable as we hold
19 ourselves and our City accountable to
20 its obligations. And this hearing
21 will be continued at a later date.

22 Before we conclude, is there
23 anyone else here to testify on the
24 resolution whose name has not yet been
25 called?

6/22/2022

1 (No response.)

2 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Hearing

3 none, this concludes the business

4 before the Joint Committee on Children

5 and Youth and on Finance for today. I

6 want to thank the Committee members on

7 Children and Youth and on Finance. I

8 want to especially thank my Co-Chair

9 of the Finance Committee Councilmember

10 Green for his work in this area and

11 his partnership in making sure that we

12 get answers.

13 We will now recess this

14 hearing until the call of the Chair.

15 And thank you everybody for your

16 attention to this very important

17 issue.

18 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank

19 you, Madam Chair. Have a good day.

20 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you

21 very much.

22 (Joint Committees on Children

23 and Youth and Finance concluded at

24 12:21 p.m.)

25

6/22/2022

1 C E R T I F I C A T I O N

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

TANEHA CARROLL
Court Reporter - Notary Public

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I, hereby certify that the
proceedings and evidence noted are contained
fully and accurately in the stenographic notes
taken by me in the foregoing matter, and that
this is a correct transcript of the same.

(The foregoing certification of
this transcript does not apply to any
reproduction of the same by any means, unless
under the direct control and/or supervision
of the certifying reporter.)

6/22/2022

<u>WORD</u> <u>INDEX</u>					
< \$ >	115 81:5	19:25 47:14	156:11	accumulated	administrative
\$0 13:1	12 27:8	52:11		66:15 110:6	94:16, 22
\$1.35 75:1	12:21 165:24	22nd 23:1	< 8 >	accurate 86:23	106:14
\$10 21:24	13 21:23	22-slide 100:7	80 57:4	accurately	adopt 98:14
\$10,000 129:12	132 48:21	23 11:21		35:23 166:1	152:9
\$10.8 49:11	15 8:12 12:21	143:22	< 9 >	accusations	adopted 36:4
\$10.9 23:14	15.4 21:18	24th 59:2	9 17:5 47:24	88:7	adoption
\$11 6:23 14:6,	18 10:5 12:21	25 103:14, 15,	56:21 75:2	achieve 13:21	151:20
21 53:13	59:8 82:16, 21	16, 18, 23	85:5, 22, 25	158:6	advertised
65:11, 15, 20	83:17	143:23	103:6 137:6,	achieved	149:4
131:4 135:16	19 48:17	25th 24:9	11 138:4	21:16 50:6	advertisements
158:24	< 2 >	107:14	139:7, 15	acknowledge	148:20
\$11.5 66:22	2.2 21:21	< 3 >	140:6, 15	55:20 60:9	advertising
110:13	20 10:1 21:2	3 12:8 37:15	90 57:4	acknowledged	149:2
\$132 10:2	27:7 71:20	101:16	94 85:20	123:8	advising
\$14.3 49:3	2004 7:19	3.6 141:13	< A >	Act 4:2 10:12	127:13
\$14.4 49:9	47:22, 24	30 47:18	a.m 1:1	25:3 47:24	advocacy 69:3,
\$150,000	48:19 85:4, 5,	116:16 117:4	aban 93:19	85:5, 20, 22, 25	7 70:23 88:17
153:20	16, 21, 23 86:1,	156:4	abandoned	101:23 103:6	advocate 80:7
\$16 66:16	3	300 153:20	50:18 93:20	acting 142:21,	advocates 8:3,
110:7	2005 10:10	30th 18:9	abbreviating	24	6
\$18 12:16	86:1	32 101:16	52:16	actions 25:23	affiliation
130:6	2008 108:4, 12	33 81:4	ability 37:21	33:12	145:14
\$180,000	2012 12:11	34 11:15	54:9 129:19	activities 92:9	afford 102:1,
119:24	104:3, 6	34,000 93:20	able 13:21	158:5	10, 15
\$20,000 117:21	128:18 129:17,	35 41:6	63:9, 11 73:25	actual 15:16	African 51:7
\$25 48:1, 10	25 130:15	36 41:6	86:21 87:17	actuarial 66:4	agencies 73:1
\$26,000 120:2	134:2 161:16	< 4 >	90:12 92:16	108:25	92:25 94:2
\$3 37:12	2014 13:10	4 46:18	93:10	actuary 66:9,	97:25 124:10
\$3.6 137:7	2016 32:23	40 30:24	abruptly 18:6	24 109:25	148:8
\$30,000 17:1	108:11	43 11:10	absolute 56:5	addition 13:13	agency 8:4, 7
\$31,657 117:23	2017 22:6	45 66:1 102:5,	absolutely	119:17 163:6	9:2, 22 18:16
\$4.9 67:8	2018 66:17	16 103:3	19:9 94:23	additional	19:7, 10 40:24
\$41.7 49:2	107:22 110:8	108:22	123:7 158:20	25:13 43:25	73:13 85:17
\$42.3 48:11	2018-19 21:18	46th 57:3	45:9 137:3	45:9 137:3	92:23 97:23
86:5 87:16	2019 13:21	47 81:5	abuse 60:15	Additionally	99:14 121:1
\$45 7:20	66:24 119:22	4th 25:7	accepted 111:8	3:19 68:14	agency's 12:22
21:13 83:21,	121:7 143:21	< 5 >	access 31:9	129:23 159:21	17:20 18:8
25 85:3, 15	144:23	5 56:9 102:3	51:12	address 25:4	agenda 52:3
102:11, 12	2020 48:25	5.5 67:9	accident 50:15	50:10	ago 7:9 21:2
\$56 49:1	49:8 56:10	50 12:13	90:20	addressed	27:7
\$577 48:20	74:25	41:10 43:22	accidents 93:7	52:10	agree 24:1
\$62,000 120:2	2021 10:10	130:2	accountability	addressing	54:17 96:24
\$66,000 120:3	25:22 47:17,	500 12:4	7:12 17:21	124:8 157:17	98:7 131:13
\$859,000 50:4	18 131:7	143:16	97:4	adequate	agreed 62:23
\$91,000 119:21	140:25 145:23,	56 56:11	accountable	117:10	agreement
	24	5th 25:17	164:18, 19	adequately	33:1 61:21
< 1 >	2022 1:1 49:5	< 6 >	accountants	52:9 117:5	104:6, 11, 12
10 11:1 84:11	20-plus 98:20	6 102:4	78:12	adjusted 67:3	105:7 128:19
90:18 129:11	20-year 30:24	60 68:10, 11	accounting	adjusting 68:8	ahead 77:6
10.4 49:24	66:11 110:2	67 68:12	24:12 25:4	adjustment	87:18
10:00 1:1	158:21	< 7 >	26:20, 23, 25	25:19 50:1	aimed 51:3
100 13:18	21 23:9 81:6	750 111:21	65:25 67:18	adjustments	airport 42:4
68:9, 11, 19	144:1		108:21 158:24	23:11	92:3
107 143:23	22 1:1 10:12		accounts	administer	aligned 49:21
	101:23		66:13, 20	104:8	ALLAN 1:1
	220149 1:1		110:4, 11	Administration	alleged 14:13
	2:6 6:17		accredited	96:3 126:5	allocated 42:3
			19:1		58:15

6/22/2022

allocation 15:16 66:7 109:3 115:6 116:21 117:1 allow 3:25 16:1 26:11 52:7 58:9 104:24 142:3 allowing 88:14 allows 30:24 38:2 116:5 148:4 American 51:7 amortize 30:21 amount 10:11, 14 21:17, 21, 23 23:3, 16, 19, 20 40:10 42:9 44:3 47:11 49:2, 19 66:10, 15 67:4, 7, 8 75:16 79:2, 10 81:23, 24 82:20 86:11 102:3 103:11 107:24 108:6 110:1, 6 111:7 118:25 130:7 138:9 164:16 amounts 26:10 43:14 138:5 analysis 78:2 108:17 129:9 140:3 analyze 124:13 and/or 129:10 136:5 151:20 166:21 announce 18:10 announced 14:5 64:18 announcement 2:18 announcements 2:14 annual 21:7 66:10 72:7 105:19 109:25 119:25 129:7 answer 38:15 52:13 58:19 71:24 112:20, 22 114:15, 17 117:9 118:9, 20 119:4, 15, 17 120:4 131:22, 25	132:13, 21, 22 138:10, 18, 21 148:11 151:3 answered 130:23 answering 132:17 answers 117:5 131:10 155:20 160:20 165:12 anticipate 76:25 154:22 anticipated 83:8 anticipating 83:2 anybody 89:5 118:19 125:22 anybody's 100:15 anyway 38:15 apologize 58:19 appeal 102:7 appear 27:1 111:19 appears 90:1 apply 16:22 76:23 148:4 166:19 applying 16:23 146:22 appointed 59:1, 3, 7 appointments 8:16 appreciate 72:6 94:7 125:5 148:2 149:8 approach 28:5 appropriate 60:2 61:5 68:16 95:10 122:25 approval 129:1 136:11 162:11 approved 110:23 approximately 59:7 area 27:20 60:4 75:13 146:13, 16 147:10 165:10 areas 19:3 29:10 42:4 50:16 93:22	105:17 116:23 117:13 128:13 143:13 146:6, 7 argue 35:5 arguing 102:25 103:5 arm 127:2 arose 58:2 arrived 8:3 Article 101:15 139:2 articles 139:3 articulated 36:16 97:21 aside 28:2 asked 35:18 46:15 54:4 68:4 70:4, 20 87:3 141:25 147:4 159:4 asking 56:20 84:15 94:12 121:21 126:14 149:23 aspects 138:4 assess 61:25 assigned 100:25 assist 51:16 Assistant 27:6 assume 119:6 141:17 assure 33:5, 19 86:23 141:22 attach 116:4 attempts 24:7 attendance 4:7, 8 attention 146:15 165:16 145:18, 19 Attorney 100:21, 25 104:20 audience 80:13 audit 71:13 100:23 104:17 111:5, 8 143:21 audited 24:18, 20 71:20 72:19, 20, 22, 24 auditing 100:19	auditor 72:7, 19 73:9, 13 101:1 auditors 49:12 audits 8:18 14:3 16:8 75:5 124:8 August 59:2 authorities 11:12, 18 12:6 61:5 120:7 121:9 143:18 Authority 6:23 7:13, 25 8:14 9:19, 21 11:4, 6, 22 18:2 19:6 21:2, 3 30:10 33:1, 13, 19 39:23, 24 42:2 47:3, 25 48:20 59:11, 21 61:21 63:16, 19 66:1, 13 67:1, 5, 11 75:1, 8 76:7, 19 90:23 93:2 100:14, 16, 24 101:5, 7, 9, 11 102:9 103:22 104:8, 14, 17, 25 105:2 107:7, 13 108:5, 22 109:15 110:4, 25 111:10 114:24 120:12 127:2, 12 128:20, 22, 23, 24 129:17, 25 130:18 131:13 132:4 134:22, 25 135:24 136:20 143:16 145:20 147:25 151:17 157:14, 22 158:18 159:17 160:12 161:8, 20 162:24 163:2, 8 164:2, 18 Authority's 6:20 10:18 46:2 52:5 62:12 67:3 83:19 111:5 116:8 130:18 163:12	authorized 129:14 authorizing 6:17 available 32:3 45:15 66:22 110:14 144:20 average 21:22 avoid 42:18 54:15 57:1 awake 60:8 aware 3:12 20:24 29:19 146:6 < B > back 68:4 69:14 105:5, 6 109:11 111:18 112:21 114:9 132:24 133:11, 21 137:2 140:17 141:16 143:14 146:13 152:20 160:20 backbone 19:17 background 20:22 26:20 100:11 backroom 38:16 bad 78:19 bank 37:14 barely 10:5 base 117:16 based 10:4 43:15, 23 45:1 76:23 77:9 78:21 79:12 81:18 82:13 83:18 124:4 155:19 basic 29:21 125:7 basically 40:20 56:7 57:16 basis 23:17 72:7 BASS 1:1 5:9, 10 began 49:15 66:1 107:22 108:23 beginning 2:18 65:24 108:1, 20 143:6	begs 70:5 71:3 behalf 92:21 believe 20:21 40:4 45:3 76:13 77:15 105:4 107:22 108:4 109:7 118:23 123:21 134:21, 24 161:10 162:6 believing 162:4 beneficial 52:8 benefit 42:12 Benefits 17:14 28:19 34:25 39:21 40:8 41:15 66:3, 25 78:24 108:24 best 12:25 31:14 38:12 44:10 49:21 50:11 55:8 59:12 62:21 64:8 84:5 94:18 98:14 118:14 146:25 147:22 162:6, 8 Beth 45:25 47:1 91:5 109:15 better 26:11 34:5, 9 36:23, 24 54:6 86:22 88:10 99:9 126:1 bettering 51:23 beyond 17:17 18:12 32:3 48:4 64:5 92:17 106:2 bicycle 93:9 bicycling 51:4 big 127:2 bigger 52:8 biggest 36:22 84:2 bike 51:1 bikeable 93:12 bill 40:20 42:1 billion 9:21 bit 7:8 45:18 53:12 86:8 91:6 117:18 143:12 Bizarre 16:19 36:8
---	--	---	---	---	--

6/22/2022

bloated 11:7 99:13	9:24	16, 19 115:24 159:6	71:10 74:13 81:1 84:16	challenge 48:6 52:21 53:5	12:6
Board 8:16 11:24 19:7 31:20 46:2 47:2 49:5 51:20 54:20 55:15 57:24 58:7 59:1 65:25 69:10, 16, 18 75:11 78:15 79:5 89:15 92:21 94:5, 19 95:8 96:17 97:7 98:14 108:22 109:15, 19 110:23 111:9 115:13 120:11 122:12 123:4, 11, 17 124:20 131:23 132:15, 25 133:12, 22, 25 134:3, 10, 14, 17, 19 136:8, 11 145:13 146:5 147:19 151:8, 13, 19 152:3, 8, 9 154:7, 13, 23, 25 155:2 160:24 161:2 162:7 164:2	branch 94:1 brief 4:11 57:10 109:17 bring 134:14, 19 149:24 bringing 76:4 98:4 134:16 150:6 brought 60:7 budget 13:13 15:6 17:11 18:18 27:6, 17 35:22 82:25 110:19, 21 113:18, 22, 23, 24 114:1 128:23 129:3, 12, 15 130:19 131:14 134:12 135:3 153:16 161:15 162:6 budgeting 15:5 26:11 54:7 96:21 budget's 36:4 build 97:3 101:6 132:6 139:14 building 17:10 30:23 57:5 69:17 98:16 137:8, 19, 21, 25 buildings 30:16 builds 126:24 bump 35:10 bunch 57:16 buses 30:18 business 51:6 98:5 165:3 businesses 51:11	call 4:7 15:4 19:19, 24 37:16 45:23 165:14 called 4:10 6:13 164:25 camera 50:15 92:5 cameras 93:6 126:16 capacity 17:22 32:21 54:9 81:19 94:17 99:11 161:1 capital 17:2, 11 24:14 26:7 29:9, 11 30:1, 20 31:6, 10, 13 34:25 57:21 58:6 113:3, 11, 15, 18, 22, 23, 24 114:1, 5 140:1 161:25 162:19 capital-type 30:14 capture 61:3 care 43:7 115:7 careers 147:22 carried 16:7 CARROLL 166:11 cars 93:20 case 28:24 30:18 103:1 105:5 144:13 cases 31:12, 17 102:6 cash 66:12, 19 110:3, 10 caught 70:18 76:8 cause 90:19 caused 65:17 69:1 70:24 164:10 central 7:14 CEO 142:17 certain 24:11 34:3 43:13 82:20 101:10 143:13 certainly 29:10 54:19, 21 56:14 65:23 69:20	certify 166:1 certifying 166:22 cetera 116:5 CFO 18:5 27:2, 11 62:14, 15, 24 63:25 64:11, 22 68:19 142:8, 24 143:3 158:19 CHAIR 1:1 2:15 5:20 6:9 9:15 20:15 25:18 35:13, 15, 18 39:8 46:1, 4, 11 47:4 52:15 53:19 59:3 62:18 65:2, 5, 6 74:3, 7 75:20 79:23 80:5 83:14, 23 84:3 85:9 89:12, 14, 15 90:24 91:3 96:8 99:17, 21, 24 105:13, 16 109:6, 10, 15, 19 110:17 115:13 122:12 123:4, 12 125:1, 4 128:3 131:3 145:16, 22, 24 149:15 150:11 155:9 163:21 165:14, 19 Chairperson 47:2 100:1 Chairpersons 4:18 Chairs 4:22 5:6, 11 80:1 91:4 99:4	challenges 44:6 21:25 Chamber 51:7, 10 chance 36:19 change 7:12 123:5 151:20 161:11 changed 35:3 49:20 103:6 124:18 144:24 145:5 changes 8:15 29:19 34:20 44:2 123:16 129:15 130:25 135:10 146:16 147:5 152:9 160:11, 12 164:4 chaos 15:11 164:11, 16 characterize 106:8 characterizing 142:18 charge 43:23 charged 66:5 109:1 Charter 102:23 charts 82:16 chat 3:24 4:2 Chief 20:18 160:16 CHILDREN 1:1 2:4, 11 6:18 8:1 9:9 11:24 14:7 15:1 87:6 165:4, 7, 22 choice 28:18 29:2 42:17 44:12 67:23 118:25 120:4 choices 28:14 31:21, 25 32:5, 10 42:8 98:3 choose 28:25 choosing 30:11 44:13 CINDY 1:1 circumstances 90:21 cities 11:18	citing 25:7 CITY 1:1 2:21 5:12 6:17 8:24 9:7 13:12 14:1, 7 15:1, 6, 9, 19 18:19 19:12 21:10 22:9 25:16 27:6 32:22 33:2 34:4 36:24 37:24 40:22, 24 43:3, 17 47:23 48:2, 21 49:3 50:4, 13, 23 51:25 52:4, 24 53:15 58:14 59:13, 16 60:9 61:23 69:21 71:15 72:15 81:18 84:6 85:7 86:6 89:5 91:17 92:12, 24 93:13, 21 94:1 97:5 100:12 101:5, 9, 14 102:7, 14, 19 103:8, 15, 16, 21, 23 104:9, 14, 16, 18 105:24 111:4, 11 116:25 117:6 124:10 127:2, 6 128:19 129:2, 5, 18 130:12, 17 131:14 132:7 133:10 134:11 135:3, 6 136:1, 5, 13 143:21 155:16 158:6 159:7, 12 160:21, 22 161:12, 13, 14 162:3, 4, 8, 11 163:15 164:2, 12, 19 City's 9:9 27:5, 10 133:9 citywide 125:22 civic 7:11 claim 14:22 26:2 101:24 102:9, 22 103:3

6/22/2022

claiming 12:14 24:17	collaborate 69:15 132:5	comments 3:21 45:10	communities 50:19	connections 144:8	continuing 3:16 161:25
claims 16:7	135:5, 6, 14	158:10	community 70:23	consenting 3:17	continuously 102:23
clarification 24:8 74:7	collaboration 54:22 89:9	Commerce 51:7, 10	companies 92:7	consequence 32:15	contract 51:12
85:11, 14	126:24 127:9	Commissioner 119:20	company 76:14	consider 113:3,	64:25 77:14
clarifications 46:17	128:8, 14	commit 19:13	comparable 11:12, 17 12:5	11 136:11	152:17
clarify 108:3	134:4 135:2	74:19 76:12	119:25 120:7	147:10	contracted 51:14
112:25 138:2	156:15 157:16	111:17 112:5	121:5, 9	considered 40:14 41:4	contribute 41:6 91:23
clarifying 105:18	158:4 162:25	116:16 131:16	143:17	48:5 78:15	92:11, 24
clarity 26:19	collaborative 94:5 156:21	133:11 134:9,	compared 10:17 40:9	106:23 114:5,	contributed 48:20
122:6 161:5	collaboratively 55:18	16, 19 135:24	82:14	6	contributing 81:25
cleanup 97:2	colleagues 4:23 5:11, 20	136:21 155:15	compensation 120:16	consistent 8:13 14:23	contribution 53:16 115:3
clear 14:2, 10	6:6, 10 7:2	commitment 74:16 76:16	complement 154:23, 25	33:20 65:24	contributions 10:8, 24 40:21
16:10 18:24	12:9 14:11	86:19 124:17	complete 95:19	78:25 79:18	41:16 49:23
32:11 75:5, 11,	15:21 19:20	156:3	completely 18:13	89:22 108:20	72:15 116:3
12 84:1 89:24	35:11 53:9	committed 54:21 59:10	complex 41:19	consistently 11:1 84:17	159:7 163:13,
90:8 111:17	87:11 96:24	69:20 77:3	complexities 100:13	constituents 88:11	15
115:9, 19, 22	100:9 128:9	89:8 92:22	comply 4:2	Constitution 101:17	control 12:22
116:20 119:8	129:24 157:7	123:5 124:21	concern 84:2	construction 113:4 114:3	36:7, 10
130:12 131:3	159:15	146:20 147:20,	90:19 99:13	137:8	166:21
132:12 133:24	collection 47:13	24 149:1	147:10	consult 128:25	controlled 101:9
146:1 155:12,	college 84:21	Committee 2:8 6:12	concerned 82:23 87:15	consultant 151:16	Controller 100:20 104:16
22 156:8	117:21	26:16 45:11	147:2	consultants 24:3 137:9	143:22
161:9 162:2,	collegiate 17:1	46:14 58:7	concerning 11:25 160:13	consultation 136:12	Controller's 119:22 144:18
17 164:5, 9	colloquy 149:19	80:6 95:21	concerns 24:1,	consulted 33:14	controls 139:21 141:20
clearly 32:14	combination 41:15 44:8	140:2 144:3, 4,	10 25:5 45:1	consulting 132:14	convenient 92:2
36:16 62:6	come 9:22	5 149:10	64:1 119:11	consumes 27:16	conversation 78:3 80:4
102:11 112:10	29:1 64:9	151:4, 9, 14	130:20, 23	contained 166:1	81:21 88:15
160:8 163:8,	71:25 73:10	152:3 154:2, 4	131:12 134:5	contested 6:21	98:2, 20
17	79:3 86:10	156:18 165:4,	160:25	context 20:23	123:21 150:3
CLERK 2:15	87:14 94:25	6, 9	conclude 157:5 164:22	119:14	conversations 39:13 62:3
4:15, 19, 25	97:13 105:1	COMMITTEE S 1:1 2:4, 10,	concluded 64:20 165:23	contextual 80:10	98:10
5:3, 8, 14, 17,	116:3 121:2,	22 3:4 6:18	concludes 26:13 165:3	continue 16:18 33:11,	convert 66:18
22, 25 6:3, 7,	18 130:5	165:22	conclusion 16:15 155:10	24 50:10	110:9
14, 16 9:14	140:12 141:7,	committee's 151:10	conditions 82:3	54:23 91:6	cooperation 89:10 104:6,
19:18, 24 20:1	149:25	commonly 106:19	confidence 62:12	92:16 127:21	10, 12 105:2, 7
45:24 109:7,	150:24 152:6	Commonwealth 7:17 21:1	conclusion 16:15 155:10	163:17, 21, 25	cooperative 62:2 103:21
18	comes 29:3	41:5 59:14	concluded 64:20 165:23	164:17	Corinne 93:15
close 23:2	48:23 73:6	111:12 131:20	concludes 26:13 165:3	continued 16:12 164:21	correct 39:25
82:11 83:5	98:5	communicate 135:14, 19	conclusion 16:15 155:10	continues 17:7	44:8 57:18
144:9	comfortable 88:2 92:20	communicated 137:14	conditions 82:3		67:11 108:9
closer 125:9	124:2	communicating 77:12	confidence 62:12		113:16, 19
closing 157:8	coming 37:23	communication 126:12	conflict 24:25		
158:12	98:18 121:15		conjunction 50:3		
Co-Chair 2:7	140:14 147:18		connected 11:23 16:24		
6:3, 5, 7 35:16	commend 60:18 81:6		20:6 46:6		
39:9, 11 45:6,	comment 36:20 122:10		143:21 145:12		
8 53:22 61:13					
75:21, 24					
79:20, 22					
149:13, 16, 20					
155:6, 8 157:6					
158:9 165:8					
Co-Chairs 39:4 88:13					
collab 126:11					

6/22/2022

138:14 139:9, 11 142:9, 10 149:6 151:24 152:12 155:3 156:22 166:1 correcting 49:25 77:21 correction 25:21 correctly 82:19	18 150:13, 20 151:7, 25 152:13, 23 153:8, 11, 21 154:1, 6, 11, 15, 18, 21 155:1, 4 157:10 165:18 Councilmanic 125:21 Councilmember 2:8 3:20 4:15, 19, 25 5:3, 8, 14, 17, 22, 25 35:12, 13 39:7, 9 53:20 61:15, 16 62:11 65:2 74:5 75:6, 21, 22 79:24 80:19 84:3, 15 89:12 90:13, 25 91:1 94:11 99:19, 22 105:15 124:24 125:2 128:5 137:5 149:16 150:4 159:23 165:9 Councilmember s 12:9 20:16 50:13, 24 71:15 Councilperson 125:23 COUNCILWO MAN 1:1 2:2 4:5, 21 5:5, 10 6:8, 24 7:6 9:16 19:23 20:4, 9 26:17, 24 27:18 30:5 32:13 35:9 39:6 45:7, 12, 22 46:3, 9 47:5 52:14 61:14 62:17 63:4, 8, 13, 20 64:14, 21 65:1, 4, 9 67:16 68:24 70:1, 15, 16, 19 72:5 73:4, 12, 15, 19 74:4, 15 75:4 79:21 83:13 85:9, 13, 24 89:11 91:2 94:6 95:15, 25 96:6, 10 97:16 99:18 105:14	106:17 107:23 108:2, 10 109:5, 9, 22 111:13 112:8, 24 113:8, 10, 16, 21 114:2, 12, 20 115:8 116:12, 15, 18 117:12 118:10, 16, 22 119:7, 16 120:13, 20 121:3, 20 122:2, 9, 22 123:3, 11, 20 124:6, 15, 23 128:4 131:17 132:9, 18, 23 133:4, 7, 15, 23 134:15, 20 135:1, 12, 23 136:10, 19 137:1 138:11, 15, 20 139:6, 12, 18, 23 140:4, 11, 19, 24 141:4, 10, 19 142:7, 11, 15, 22 143:1, 8, 11 144:22 145:2, 8, 15 147:3 148:1, 15, 24 149:3, 7, 14 155:7 158:8 165:2, 20 counsel 142:6, 12, 13 counselors 28:21 38:6 count 144:6 country 11:13 120:8 143:18 County 27:11, 13 28:7 39:19 couple 40:16 63:7 76:3 80:9 83:1, 10 86:16 87:8, 24 137:2 course 8:11 13:22 21:23 52:12 92:11 158:17 Court 102:6, 18, 21 103:5 166:12 courtesy 75:2 cover 17:20	52:11 116:22 covers 29:7 COVID 48:16 create 53:4 96:19 created 10:22 47:24 84:5 85:17 101:5, 22 108:11 creating 140:1 149:5 creation 85:19 credibility 19:12 credit 66:19 110:10 crime 59:24 crisis 17:20 crucial 164:4 curious 40:11 153:12 current 2:20 17:20 25:25 37:3 39:18 42:23 44:11 50:16 68:12, 17 86:4 142:12, 19, 23 154:12 160:13 currently 2:16, 22 12:3 62:25 82:9 126:15 141:21 142:16 160:24 customer 51:23 < D > Daily 3:6 data 34:1, 3, 18 163:5 date 40:5 164:21 DAVID 1:1 day 8:12 16:19 25:1 60:13, 19 81:8 106:25 165:19 days 63:7 116:16 117:5 143:4, 7 156:4 day-to 106:24 day-to-day 112:14 142:17 dealing 95:4 deals 47:8 dear 80:8 debt 47:12 decades 14:24	decision 9:4 28:10 32:16 36:18 42:21 43:9, 19 68:18 69:7 79:7 123:18 139:14, 19 140:20 decision- making 99:11 140:7 decisions 24:11 26:6 27:22 28:1, 3 29:14, 23 33:12 36:15 44:24 84:18 90:2, 23 120:10 121:14 139:24 162:22 declined 25:4 130:10 decreases 93:6 dedicated 7:25 deduct 90:5 deducted 53:4 75:15 106:6 137:13 138:8, 12, 25 139:4, 8 159:9 deductible 105:20 deducting 16:3 deep 55:16 94:24 150:17 deep-dive 55:6 deeply 161:17 deficit 83:2, 8 87:1, 7 Delaware 51:8 deliver 84:19 131:1 delivered 8:4 10:1 13:1 14:4 15:22 47:23 130:7 156:19 delivery 52:22 delve 17:5 55:15 demand 7:11 50:22 demanded 14:6 demanding 24:16 demonstrate 16:16 Dennis 142:14, 16	department 55:7 57:23 62:20 66:5 101:15 109:1 110:21 depth 27:19 Deputy 93:14 DEREK 1:1 2:8 derived 47:11 descriptions 25:9 despite 8:16, 22 9:1 12:7 15:21 33:10 84:5 details 38:17 105:18 141:14 159:5 determination 65:19 67:13, 21 determine 47:15 64:12 determined 49:12 65:14 66:4, 24 108:25 determines 159:6 determining 117:10 detriment 9:6 develop 58:6 developed 48:24 105:12 development 57:21 devoting 31:5 dialogue 128:7 different 42:3, 5 45:16 62:24 79:2, 11 80:1, 14 93:17 125:12, 20 153:3, 4 difficult 22:17 86:9 89:20 97:19 98:19 diminished 17:22 direct 106:23 112:14 166:21 direction 64:2, 5 88:3 158:3 directions 127:7 directly 19:8 47:23 63:15,
---	---	---	--	---	---

6/22/2022

18 129:20 163:20 Director 11:10, 14 17:24 18:3 23:10 27:6 67:14 68:20 93:15 98:11 119:23 128:10 129:2, 13, 22 130:11 133:10 142:21 155:17 160:16 directors 11:11, 17 160:7 161:20 disagree 135:19 disappointing 111:20 disastrous 17:3 164:10 discern 15:15 115:23 disclosed 13:25 disclosure 19:15 162:10 163:10 disconnect 157:4 discrepancy 121:10 122:14 discretion 67:24 discuss 133:3 135:21 136:8, 18, 21 140:9 discussed 34:22, 23 128:12 129:24 143:15 discussing 17:12 discussion 96:14 134:10 discussions 96:16 disgraced 161:19 disgraceful 160:6 dismissed 102:24 displayed 4:13 disproportionat e 83:4 dispute 14:21 disputed 25:2 distinct 150:16	distinction 19:2 distribute 100:7 105:9 114:21 distributed 46:13 49:3 52:18 128:11 distribution 47:9 District 6:22 7:21 8:5, 10, 25 9:7 10:9, 14 12:15, 20, 23 13:1, 23 14:1, 12 15:7, 20 18:11 20:3, 19 21:4, 9, 14 22:4, 10, 18, 21 23:4, 13, 15 24:5, 10 25:24 26:1, 13 27:3, 14, 17 28:16 29:18 30:17 31:5, 9, 19 32:18, 21 33:7 34:4 35:3 40:17 41:3, 24 42:21 43:13, 18 47:16 48:5, 22 49:4, 7, 11, 14 50:9, 13 52:1, 4, 23, 25 53:15 54:7, 24 58:13 59:16 61:24 65:12, 16, 20 67:12, 20 69:2, 22 70:21 72:16 75:18 81:4, 6, 15 82:1, 18, 21 83:2 84:7, 8, 10, 20 86:7, 24 87:2, 7 89:25 90:4, 6, 11, 17 91:18 92:13, 18 96:18 97:6, 19 98:12 99:3 102:1 103:3, 9, 14, 17, 18 104:1, 2 106:1 107:6, 8, 11 111:4 115:10 116:24 117:7 119:2 130:4 131:2, 7, 11 132:6 135:7, 15 136:1, 5, 12 137:15 140:13	158:19, 23 159:7, 11, 18 160:21 161:23 162:12, 15 163:16 164:14 districts 41:4 125:21 District's 29:4 107:12 115:2 dive 150:17 diversion 13:23 17:15 161:24 diversions 13:7 diversity 95:5 divert 84:24 diverted 108:5 diverting 13:16 90:3 Division 10:19, 25 15:17, 18 17:8 106:7 116:7 117:23 118:1 138:6 divisions 11:16 114:25 document 111:22 116:21 117:1 118:6 documentation 16:10, 13 116:1 documents 14:10 15:23, 24 16:16 34:8 111:2, 21 115:20 118:11, 17 119:9 135:20 155:13, 20, 23 156:10, 18 163:19, 22 doing 28:11 43:18, 22 46:16 59:15 69:16 88:1 94:14 96:22 97:1 125:11 126:15 127:18 132:8 146:11 149:2 dollar 7:24 8:8 9:22 15:7, 8 32:16 dollars 13:16 17:16 79:11 153:1, 15 DOMB 1:1 5:18, 19 35:12, 13, 14 38:13,	22 39:7 53:20, 21 54:1 56:1, 6, 17 58:11, 22 59:18 61:8, 12, 15 62:11 Domb's 74:23 137:5 drafting 150:22 dramatically 57:5 drawn 60:16 drew 14:8 drivable 93:12 drivers 60:12 dropped 12:20 Dubow 128:10 Dubow's 129:22 130:11 Due 2:20 90:21 137:23 dynamics 77:24 < E > earlier 41:17 78:3 86:4 107:2 130:8 145:16 149:23 163:20 early 23:6 earnings 9:22 ears 59:23 echelon 80:23 echo 130:14 economic 91:24 educating 8:1 education 50:7 educators 7:10 effect 129:19 effective 78:13 88:10 95:12 97:23 161:6 effectively 84:4 92:1, 4 138:1 142:17 efficiencies 48:24 97:23 efficient 88:10 99:14 efficiently 92:15 effort 70:12 71:7 either 18:5 28:2 31:3 34:3 112:2	143:24 element 35:25 eliminate 50:2 58:1 eliminated 25:23 eliminating 51:3 embarrassing 8:17 emerge 37:19 emergency 2:21 emphases 51:22 emphasize 89:8 employee 66:25 employees 11:23 12:3, 5 80:15 143:17, 23, 24 144:2, 7 employment 17:14 42:12 empowered 101:7 104:7 enable 38:11 55:17 enabling 67:10 ended 18:9 47:18 enforce 50:20 93:8 104:8 enforcement 51:2 60:11 92:5 93:9 101:8 121:8, 12 122:16 127:3 engage 126:3 161:3 163:25 engaged 102:8 engagement 33:9 engaging 55:4 enormous 84:22 ensure 26:9 55:7 116:5 161:6 enter 164:6 entire 42:2 62:20 71:3 114:24 151:13 entirely 9:23 48:23 entities 33:4, 24 41:9 150:7	160:20 163:1 164:12 entity 15:13 32:11 43:10, 11 44:16 63:14 76:5 89:16 90:17 101:14 113:22 134:7 149:25 150:6, 24 152:5 157:20, 21 equity 95:5 erratic 12:24 error 65:14, 17 67:18 68:25 69:12 70:2 71:1 158:25 errors 70:6 71:5 72:13 73:22 especially 39:20 52:16 65:21 82:2 100:9 160:13 165:8 essentially 30:13 42:1 88:1 established 32:24 133:9 151:8 153:22 estimate 83:4 estimated 21:12 81:23 estimates 86:23 estimations 82:13 et 116:5 evaluate 64:10 121:2, 17 evaluating 95:14 event 129:15 ever-increasing 50:22 everybody 10:23 46:24 80:3 97:20, 21 105:9 109:12 165:15 evidence 166:1 exact 40:5 85:1 138:9 exactly 41:25 54:13 64:3
--	--	---	---	--	--

6/22/2022

72:18 115:1 138:3 159:1 examine 70:12 71:23 73:21 example 28:6, 18 30:18 31:4 41:3 103:13 119:19 162:18 exceed 119:19 exceeded 129:11 exceeds 119:25 Excel 112:3 excess 21:7 104:1 excessively 120:6 exciting 59:17 94:4 excuse 62:18 107:25 executing 77:14 152:17 executive 11:8, 10, 11 17:23 18:3 23:9 67:14 68:20 93:14 94:1 119:18 120:23 121:4, 11 142:21 160:7, 16 executives 122:15, 18 123:18 131:24 existed 161:15 existence 24:14 existing 16:23 35:4 expand 50:13 expanding 88:23 expect 126:3 143:2 expectation 3:15 expected 84:16 expenditure 29:9 expenditures 17:3 24:14 26:7 29:3 30:1, 15 37:3 129:7 162:1, 19 expense 66:2, 6, 8, 12, 21 98:6 106:23, 25 108:23	109:2, 3 110:3, 13, 17, 19 112:18 113:24 114:1 expenses 11:6 15:12, 19 16:2 17:8 42:15 53:3 75:14 84:24 90:5 105:20 106:5, 14 112:11, 13 113:1, 3, 6, 11 114:6, 7 116:7 129:11 136:3 159:9 163:14 experience 26:21, 23 27:1, 19, 20 39:17 51:24 55:21 98:12 explain 30:7 80:12 117:24 121:10 131:18 144:12 explained 90:14 135:17 explaining 31:18, 19 explanation 14:13, 17 explore 125:17 147:17 exploring 49:15 exposé 11:21 exposés 8:17 expound 65:13 extended 104:5 144:9 extensive 45:18 extent 40:18 extra 38:6 51:21 60:3 103:15 extraordinary 93:13 extreme 58:9 extremely 41:4 50:4 164:11 eyebrows 162:21 eyes 59:23 < F > face 28:15 83:9 87:3, 8 facilities 30:16 31:7 32:1	101:6 113:5 114:4 facing 82:4 fact 11:5 15:21 33:16 52:25 70:2, 20 72:6 73:17 89:25 107:2 156:11 factored 107:9, 19 fail 60:14 failed 16:9 18:21 failings 104:22 failure 130:25 fair 42:9 58:20 97:12 146:21 fairness 33:22 40:17 fall 14:5 familiar 114:11 153:6 families 81:12 family 144:9 far 9:3 17:17 59:23 fashion 36:17 55:12 fatalities 93:6 feature 3:24 4:3 February 25:7 federal 31:6 32:2 feel 81:24 84:17 88:2 92:20 99:10 123:12 156:16 fees 9:24 12:14 130:3 fell 141:2 felt 32:5 63:24 156:6 Fifteen 7:9 figure 38:24 48:12 87:13 90:12 figures 47:14 filing 103:1 filings 102:20 filling 160:18 finally 12:2 96:12 129:13 163:4 FINANCE 1:1 2:5, 7, 11 6:19 22:9 82:9	98:10 111:3 114:11 128:10 129:2, 13 133:9 142:5, 8 153:10 155:17 165:5, 7, 9, 23 financed 75:3 113:14 finances 17:23 27:17 61:25 129:21 150:1 161:21 162:16 financial 8:19 14:3 15:11, 23 18:22 20:18 23:11 24:2, 18, 20, 22 25:10 33:5, 9 36:14 37:25 51:16 52:5 54:10 55:5, 7, 21 57:22 62:13, 20 69:23 76:5 89:3 95:1 97:13 130:21 131:1 134:6, 11 135:25 150:2, 9 152:1, 4, 15, 25 153:16, 19 157:21, 25 158:22 159:22 160:3, 16 161:7 163:5, 6, 12 164:11 find 13:3 19:3 58:18 70:9 151:3 finding 103:25 fine 20:8 46:10 74:14, 20 133:19 fine-tuning 51:17 finite 44:13 fired 18:6 firm 51:15, 16 55:5 76:24 78:22 first 14:16 15:15 19:20, 25 20:1 31:8 32:19 42:23 46:21 54:2, 19 59:2 60:23 61:6 62:17 65:17 68:3 80:10 85:2	101:23 138:7 147:14 158:12 fiscal 17:21 18:8 22:20 23:2 25:20, 22 31:11 32:9 34:8, 12, 15, 20 36:3, 14 39:14 42:14 44:10 47:17 48:25 49:8 56:10 82:1, 2 94:13 158:1 five 59:5 five-year 22:22 37:25 96:21, 23 97:6, 17 98:13 fixing 19:10 flip 78:19 focus 16:20 53:12 151:9 focused 105:17 folks 40:24 69:4, 5 80:17 81:13 87:5 88:6 95:11 147:24 follow 74:22 131:20 133:20 137:5 163:18 following 2:17 12:18 55:8 107:17 112:25 160:6 follows 2:20 follow-up 45:15 forbades 101:17 foregoing 49:22 166:1, 18 foremost 60:23 61:7 forgive 72:24 109:20 form 55:22 formal 8:18 13:12 14:9 15:4 18:22 19:14 24:9 128:12 141:25 148:20 156:6, 9 formally 27:2 77:5 157:5 format 111:19 112:2	former 7:21 11:24 67:14 68:19 formula 25:8 36:9 37:9 47:25 52:24 formula's 48:7 forth 69:14 91:10 forward 43:16 44:2, 23 50:23 57:17 68:7 69:17, 24 71:11 72:2 77:13 79:7, 11 86:20 88:4, 9, 20 89:4 91:9 92:14 96:13 97:2 99:3 124:14, 21 127:8 132:3, 5 136:23 146:22, 23 152:10 156:24 157:13, 15, 18 164:8, 16 fought 100:16 found 3:8 69:2 70:25 104:22 143:22 foundations 69:18 founding 10:4 frankly 13:9 fraught 158:21 free 71:22 freebie 29:5 fresh 78:16 friends 144:9 front 19:12 139:3 fruition 130:6 frustrating 29:7 30:4 frustration 98:22 full 46:12 78:16 119:14 154:23, 24 163:10 fully 40:14 67:6 100:23 131:1 166:1 fully-funded 13:19 function 101:15
--	--	--	---	---	--

6/22/2022

functions 94:21 104:18, 19 fund 7:15 13:19, 24 24:15 26:5 27:10, 12, 15, 22 28:3, 10 29:24 40:19, 22, 25 42:13, 18 49:18, 24 66:10, 23 67:6 68:18 84:22 101:12 102:2 108:7 110:1, 14 114:23 131:5 fundamentally 104:23 funded 40:14 66:20 110:11 111:7 funding 9:20 12:19 21:22 22:1 25:20 26:6 33:21 34:24 38:8 40:12, 13 67:9 68:8, 11, 12, 15 106:22 107:16 108:12 159:18 162:17 funds 12:14 21:7, 21 22:19 23:24 24:13 26:12 28:2 30:20 31:6 35:2 38:12 58:4 67:20, 22 92:12 118:24 funny 60:5 furniture 137:9 further 16:12 64:6 66:23 110:14, 16 135:10 future 23:21 43:8 44:6 50:25 57:1 66:2, 13 68:14 69:25 108:24 110:4 127:23 156:17, 24 FY20 49:22 FY2008 65:24 108:1, 20 FY2009 66:15 110:6	FY2018 66:16 110:7 FY2020 67:7 FY2021 67:8 FY2022 18:12 FY21 49:23 50:1 < G > gain 19:11 game 77:6 gaps 160:18 garages 92:3 gate 95:24 GAUTHIER 1:1 4:20, 21 61:16 65:3, 4, 9 67:16 68:24 70:1, 16, 19 72:5 73:4, 12, 15, 19 74:5 75:6 159:24 General 72:20 100:21, 25 101:1 104:20 generated 21:8 generating 51:24 getting 36:11 51:18 76:11 94:25 95:23 127:1 157:18 160:20 give 26:19 35:21 36:19 37:15 57:9 81:2 82:15 85:7 102:14 103:9, 10, 17 106:10 119:15 124:3 131:22 132:1 146:12 given 21:8 27:18 33:15 47:16 62:8 82:8 86:6 108:17 118:7, 24 130:20 131:10, 11 155:15, 21 156:4 giving 127:13 129:18 132:13 glad 2:6 60:6 glaring 146:7 go 8:9 9:17 10:7 15:19 30:8 32:17 35:2 38:6	39:24 48:15 51:21 53:14 59:9 63:24 67:20 71:11 77:13 87:6 99:4 104:1 107:10 119:1 122:6 131:8 137:2 140:3 143:19 156:5 159:10 161:21 162:23 goal 68:9 84:14 90:10, 15, 16 91:15 124:14 goals 91:15 97:10 gobbled 8:8 goes 41:24 75:17 82:18 86:7 105:24 126:25 going 15:11 18:10 30:23 34:10, 14 35:2 37:12, 14, 16 40:2 43:15 44:2, 23 53:7, 8, 11 57:17 60:25 64:6, 11 68:7 69:14, 17, 23 72:2, 25 74:9 76:21 78:17 79:7, 11 81:2, 25 83:9 84:10 87:2, 8, 9, 12, 13, 14, 21 88:4, 20 89:3 92:14 97:13 99:10 100:6 114:9 119:5, 14 120:18 122:19, 20 123:1, 23 124:1, 5, 14, 21, 24 125:9 128:16 132:4, 24 133:11 136:23 137:2 143:13 151:10 152:10 156:24 164:8, 15, 16 Good 2:2, 9 4:8, 17, 21, 22, 23 5:6, 10, 12, 15, 19 6:4, 5, 8, 9 20:4, 7, 15 34:13 35:14,	16, 17 39:12, 15 46:3, 24 53:23 56:2 65:6, 7 75:25 78:19 79:8, 25 80:3 89:2 95:11 99:25 118:23 126:20 156:16 165:19 Good-bye 45:21 good-working 126:19 gotten 13:10 governance 7:18 government 50:7 65:25 80:2 88:5 108:21 graphic 9:12 82:19 grave 130:23 great 20:10 45:14 56:2 127:12 greater 19:14 51:9, 12 GREEN 1:1 2:8 6:3, 4, 9 20:16 35:16 39:9, 10 40:6 43:2 44:18 45:5, 8 75:21, 22, 23 76:17 77:8, 19 78:21 79:19, 22 149:12, 17, 18 150:13, 20 151:7, 25 152:13, 23 153:8, 11, 21 154:1, 6, 11, 15, 18, 21 155:1, 4, 8 157:6, 10 158:9 165:10 gross 56:12 74:25 Grossman 17:25 45:25 46:4, 7, 12, 23 47:1, 7 52:15 53:25 54:18 56:4, 13 57:15 58:16, 25 60:5 61:10 62:16 63:6, 11, 17 64:4, 17, 24 65:6, 7, 23	68:2 69:9 70:14, 18 71:9 72:17 73:8, 14, 18 74:8, 12, 18 75:25 76:10 77:2, 18 78:8 79:14 80:11 81:1 82:5 83:12, 14, 23 85:2, 10, 12, 20 86:1 88:19 89:14 91:5, 19 94:23 95:18 96:5, 9 97:11 105:16 106:9 107:21, 25 108:9, 13 109:6, 11, 15, 19, 20, 24 112:6, 20 113:7, 9, 13, 20, 25 114:8, 19 115:4 116:10, 14, 17 117:8 118:2, 14, 21 119:3, 12 120:9, 17, 24 121:13, 24 122:8, 19, 24 123:6, 14, 23 124:12, 19 125:14 126:7 127:24 131:3, 15, 19 132:16, 20 133:1, 6, 13, 17 134:13, 18, 23 135:4, 18 136:7, 17, 24 138:7, 14, 18, 24 139:10, 16, 22, 25 140:8, 16, 22 141:1, 8, 14 142:5, 10, 14, 20, 25 143:5, 10 144:14, 25 145:6, 10, 16 146:18 147:11 148:10, 22, 25 149:6 150:11, 15, 25 151:23 152:11, 19 153:2, 9, 18, 24 154:3, 9, 14, 17, 20, 24 155:3, 9 163:21 grow 130:10 growth 97:24	guarantee 160:11 guess 23:7 38:13 54:8 56:8 100:4 117:17 151:12 154:11 guide 25:3 guidelines 79:6 guns 60:16 guy 54:12 guys 96:22 GYM 1:1 2:2 3:20 4:5 6:7, 8, 24 7:6 9:15, 16 19:23 20:4, 9, 15 26:17, 24 27:18 30:5 32:13 35:9 39:6 45:7, 12, 22 46:3, 9 47:5 52:14 61:14 63:4, 8, 13, 20 64:14, 21 65:1 74:4, 15 75:4 79:21 83:13 85:9, 13, 24 89:11 99:18 105:14 106:17 107:23 108:2, 10 109:5, 9, 22 111:13 112:8, 24 113:8, 10, 16, 21 114:2, 12, 20 115:8 116:12, 15, 18 117:12 118:10, 16, 22 119:7, 16 120:13, 20 121:3, 20 122:2, 9, 22 123:3, 11, 20 124:6, 15, 23 128:4 131:17 132:9, 18, 23 133:4, 7, 15, 23 134:15, 20 135:1, 12, 23 136:10, 19 137:1 138:11, 15, 20 139:6, 12, 18, 23 140:4, 11, 19, 24 141:4, 10, 19 142:7, 11, 15, 22 143:1, 8, 11 144:22 145:2, 8, 15
---	--	---	---	---	---

6/22/2022

147:3 148:1, 15, 24 149:3, 7, 14, 20 150:4 155:7 158:8 165:2, 20 Gym's 80:19	32:24 45:17 59:20 98:21 114:14 118:8 155:11 158:15 164:20 165:2, 14 hearings 2:24 3:3, 8 6:19 22:6 37:16 heart 80:8 held 66:12 110:3 143:24 HELEN 1:1 Hello 65:8 help 49:16 57:25 60:3 93:10 97:8 helped 96:19 97:4, 5 helpful 36:19 53:18 56:18 134:22, 24 helping 59:22 helps 37:22 heretofore 17:15 hey 78:23 hiccup 69:24 high 16:25 41:4, 14 43:25 48:18 50:15 117:20 120:6 122:17 higher 49:19 highest 21:17 121:5 highlighted 146:17 highlighting 24:10 hire 18:2 72:7 147:23 148:21 hired 62:25 63:15, 18 64:15, 22 73:13 117:22 143:3, 9 hires 144:15 159:24 hiring 32:3 64:22 80:22 143:14 146:20, 23 147:20 148:9 149:3 150:19 hirings 147:7 Hispanic 51:9	historical 40:13 history 14:18 23:24 26:5 72:25 100:8, 17 105:8, 10 107:15 158:21 hold 6:19 148:18 164:17, 18 Home 102:22 homeless 59:24 hope 52:3, 9 69:22 93:24 96:12 98:9 157:12 hopefully 92:17 93:18 127:20 158:2 host 69:4 House 7:22 21:11 HR 95:2 99:7 120:18, 25 121:1, 19 147:18 150:17, 23 151:9, 14 152:18, 24 153:6, 17, 23 157:20 160:4 human 51:15 149:21 150:5, 8 hypothesize 119:6 < I > idea 34:13 141:12 145:1, 14 ideally 36:17 ideas 125:24 127:13 151:20 identified 16:8 77:10 102:12 152:25 153:13 identify 71:7 76:24 illegal 101:13, 20 104:13 illness 59:25 image 4:12 immediate 12:18 impact 22:12 34:21 35:1 36:15 68:17 129:20 136:5,	15 159:16, 18 162:14 impactful 52:2 impacts 34:15 41:24 105:23 implement 126:18 implemented 48:24 implementing 52:1 importance 61:1 important 20:22 24:19 61:19 73:24 81:21 87:22 88:17 91:22 96:11 105:22 128:7 155:15 164:12 165:16 importantly 87:19 88:16 160:19 impossible 16:5 115:22 improve 26:8 54:23 55:10, 13 64:13 69:22 97:25 125:19 127:6 157:22 improved 57:23 59:11 improvement 19:4 22:5 improvements 17:10 48:9 improves 48:13 improving 59:13 88:20 132:4 inadequate 62:7 117:3, 11 inaudible 70:13 106:11 109:4 inception 83:19 include 16:21 114:15, 21 included 3:4 13:14 67:2 83:17 110:24 128:24 includes 22:14 111:6 146:5	including 8:23 11:5, 7, 19, 24 15:5 17:3 69:5 131:2 145:20 159:5 161:17 163:13 inclusion 95:5 income 110:20, 22 incomplete 15:25 22:13 155:20 inconsistent 22:1 incorrectly 138:16 increase 12:13, 19 130:2, 3 increased 10:20 67:4, 6 increases 48:7 independent 72:11 73:6, 10, 16, 25 100:19 111:5 159:25 160:1, 2 indicate 4:9 indicated 23:15 66:21 110:12 indicates 18:1 indicating 25:18 indication 23:17 individual 57:19 63:23 131:23 143:9 individuals 24:4 84:23 114:15 143:20 148:18 industry 55:9 68:22 79:18 inexorably 21:4 infamous 17:4 influential 144:8 influx 31:3 inform 14:18 46:11 107:5, 7 information 22:10 23:23 26:8 30:2 32:8 33:15 39:1 43:25 54:5, 11, 14 55:1, 11 56:15	61:17 62:5 72:9 83:16 100:3 132:11 140:5 151:19 152:6 157:18 information- sharing 22:2 33:8 informed 23:9 25:15 131:6 initial 21:5 25:12 43:24 102:20 103:1 initially 83:25 initiative 49:6 51:2 initiatives 52:7 88:22, 25 93:18, 23 126:9 injuries 51:4 inquir 72:4 Inquirer 3:6 57:4 inquiries 72:4 89:6 inquiring 146:15 inquiry 135:22 insight 22:11 41:20 42:7 inspections 137:18 Instructions 3:1 insufficient 115:21 insurance 66:18 110:9 Intelligencer 3:7 intend 140:5 intended 52:11 intends 136:22 intent 19:3 120:14 intention 79:4 interest 46:15 156:14, 21 162:7, 8 interested 146:14 147:8, 11 interesting 36:2 interestingly 59:4 interests 84:6
---	--	--	--	--	--

6/22/2022

intergovernmental 32:25 61:21 91:16 96:15 Interim 142:20 intern 84:22 internal 31:24 78:5 141:20 internally 76:18 Internet 13:5 interns 17:2 117:20, 22 introduced 127:11 introductions 46:16 invest 28:20 investigating 146:9 investigations 8:18 investment 31:7 66:14 110:5 investments 38:3, 5 invite 7:2 12:10 91:1 invited 3:10 involved 27:9 irrelevant 123:10, 13, 22, 24 IS2s 110:20 111:14, 17, 25 112:7 ISAIAH 1:1 issue 14:9 23:7 25:14 28:17 29:9 31:18 36:22 60:8 72:18 73:3 76:21 88:18 100:8 101:5 104:11 124:11 141:2 152:4 165:17 issued 150:21 151:1, 10 issues 10:23 25:16 27:10 29:12 33:9 41:1, 21 42:23, 24 43:1 44:11, 25 50:11 52:10 57:2 58:1 59:24 75:7 79:8	80:21 94:9 121:19 151:9 152:4 157:17 161:18 163:18 issuing 93:3 item 110:18 iterations 107:3 it'll 77:16 its 7:14 9:3, 19, 22 10:4 12:21 13:4, 12, 20 15:1 17:7, 21, 22, 23 18:2, 5, 12, 18 19:3 23:11 31:5 48:2 49:9, 22, 23 68:8 85:19, 22 89:25 91:15, 16 94:3 102:24 112:15 121:7 129:3, 6, 20 131:14 137:21 158:21 159:7 160:15 164:20 < J > JAMIE 1:1 January 24:9 34:11 37:13 107:14 Jersey 51:8 job 16:23 54:6 147:23 148:5 jobs 143:19 147:1 148:18 149:2, 4, 5 John 7:23 JOHNSON 1:1 5:1 joined 2:7 joining 46:5 120:11 JOINT 1:1 2:3 26:15 165:4, 22 Jones 5:23 judge 16:5 July 23:6 59:1 82:9 104:2, 6 jumbled 156:11 juncture 120:25 June 1:1	22:25 82:8 < K > keep 53:17 148:12 keeping 44:25 keeps 60:8 KENYATTA 1:1 key 15:18 38:10 63:21 kind 34:18 42:25 53:5 62:13 67:19 70:4, 21 71:3 96:20 100:7, 10 101:1 103:19 105:7, 10 141:20 161:3, 5 kinds 131:11 knew 28:11 31:24 know 18:7 22:21 23:3 32:25 36:23 38:7 39:13, 17 40:5 47:19 54:16 56:12, 13, 14 58:3, 16, 17 73:3 78:2, 18 81:17 83:9 86:17 89:2 91:23 93:1, 14 97:1, 21 98:18 99:15 100:5 107:24 114:14 115:1, 5, 17 116:13 117:14 127:1, 21 128:9 129:24 134:8, 9 135:9, 13 137:7 139:1, 17, 20 140:17 141:5, 6, 8, 11 142:4 145:4, 8, 11 147:13, 14 148:7, 10 152:14 153:25 154:2 155:18 knowing 58:20 146:8 knowledge 107:22 known 11:6 16:17 17:13 137:10	knows 51:21 98:24, 25 < L > L&I 137:16 lack 22:2, 16 30:1 104:12 lane 51:2 93:9 large 26:7 30:17, 25 31:3 largely 11:2 47:11 latest 17:23 lauds 18:25 launched 49:6 law 2:16 101:2 106:11 107:3 128:21 134:1, 2 laws 25:8 131:20 133:20 layers 94:21 lead 98:16 Leader 7:23 21:12 leaders 7:11 49:15 144:4, 6 leadership 8:15 43:20 44:1 45:2 88:5 130:25 140:21 157:13 160:14, 19 161:2 learn 49:17 57:12 learned 96:17 160:8 learning 59:8 leave 21:19 led 22:7 left 24:5 43:10 leftover 67:20 leftovers 36:9 Legal 3:7 44:9 105:5 142:6, 12, 13 legally 50:2 legislated 133:19 legislation 50:17 126:9 127:11 129:17 legislative 93:25 125:10 legislature 71:17 103:6 104:4	legitimate 99:15 letter 24:9 25:2, 5, 12, 17 107:12 letters 41:13 66:19 110:10 letting 63:24 level 17:1 28:10 40:12 43:19 44:4 48:18 68:12 85:4 88:6 98:22 100:3 124:10 158:16 levels 22:1 liabilities 24:12 112:16 162:15 liability 24:17 50:1 66:11, 23 67:3, 4, 7, 10 106:21 107:1 110:2, 15 111:6 112:19 life 92:25 98:1 125:19 life-saving 50:14 lifetime 30:22 light 50:14 88:24 92:5 93:5 Likewise 53:25 limited 58:3 86:17 limousine 92:6 line 10:11, 13 14:8 68:22 89:13 91:6 94:18 99:6 110:18 linger 65:10 linked 21:5 listed 148:6 Listen 69:9, 14 listening 80:12 litigated 102:17 litigation 58:5 little 7:8 21:24 45:18 53:12 86:8 91:6 117:18 143:12 lived 144:2 lives 51:3 load 17:7 lobbied 13:11	local 50:7 81:5 location 1:1 137:10 locations 60:2 logic 42:14 long 18:21 28:9 44:21 57:10 58:23 100:5 106:25 107:17 126:25 longer 15:10 67:15 113:14 142:9 longer-term 18:22 Long-ranging 162:18 long-term 22:20 30:15 106:21 107:18 112:16 162:14 look 37:1 40:16 47:14 50:23 55:6, 12, 16 60:22 69:12 70:8 71:4, 10 72:8 73:20 74:13 78:16 83:3 91:9 97:14, 15 99:3 119:13 120:19 123:9 124:13 132:5 139:2 146:21, 23 147:19 157:17 looked 72:13 82:15 looking 35:21 36:10 54:5 58:6 59:10 64:8 75:14 77:24 78:4, 6 82:2 87:24 95:2, 13 120:21, 23 124:22 126:17 127:8, 15, 16 132:3 141:23 lose 58:5 109:6 lost 56:22 57:3 58:12 109:7 Lot 17:4 23:25 27:14 40:23, 24 56:21 57:9
---	---	---	---	---	---

6/22/2022

70:4, 22, 24 72:25 75:2 78:23 81:11, 13 87:11 97:1 137:6, 11 138:4 139:7, 15 140:6, 15 lots 92:3 127:4 low 21:21 lowest 121:9 122:15 < M > machinations 102:24 Madam 5:20 6:5 39:11 45:6 53:22 65:5 74:3 75:24 79:20 91:3 99:17 125:4 128:3 149:12 155:5 165:19 maintenance 113:4 114:3 major 55:23 136:14 160:25 162:13 Majority 7:22 21:12 160:23 making 25:19 28:13, 18, 24 31:21, 24 41:17 42:16 44:5, 12 48:10 78:1 95:9, 10 98:3 115:24 125:25 146:20 165:11 manage 17:22 50:20 managed 57:6 management 134:6 161:7 managing 92:1 mandated 92:12 mandatory 8:23 manner 66:7, 21 105:12 109:2 110:12 156:20 map 161:22 March 17:24 18:9 36:3	47:18 49:5 MARIA 1:1 MARK 1:1 Market 57:3 markets 31:10 match 48:8 matter 62:9 73:17 74:1 143:3, 6, 7 166:1 matters 64:7 158:1 Mayor 71:16 128:22 mean 56:20 67:23 70:2 71:9 73:16 114:22 126:14 133:2 153:2 meaningful 33:17 161:11 means 32:2 115:25 166:20 meant 28:12 measures 8:22 139:21 mechanism 127:3 media 8:17 11:20, 21 138:16, 22 meet 61:22 65:8, 10 86:4 87:17, 20 89:5, 7 92:16 meeting 2:22 3:11, 17 16:15 24:1, 5 39:5 44:22 59:2 87:16 90:14, 15 109:8, 16 meetings 8:24 22:8 33:3, 23 34:22 35:7 61:25 110:24 135:7 163:7, 9 members 2:10 3:20, 25 4:8 11:25 19:5 26:15 45:10 46:14 52:19 54:20 58:8 91:10 132:14 144:5, 10 149:10 154:7, 16 155:2 165:6 membership 81:12 87:4	memorializing 77:14 mental 59:25 mentioned 20:25 21:15 22:24 37:24 62:10 merely 134:2 162:23 met 12:17 83:24 meter 12:13, 19 126:16 130:3 Miami 120:1 Microsoft 2:23 3:24 Microsoft® 1:1 middle 65:21 midst 80:18 mid-year 129:14 mile 51:21 million 6:23 7:20 10:2 12:16 14:6, 21 21:13, 18, 22, 24 23:14 37:13, 15 48:1, 10, 11, 21 49:1, 2, 4, 9, 11, 25 53:13 56:11 57:4 65:11, 15, 21 66:16, 22 67:8, 9 75:1 83:21, 25 85:3, 15 86:5 87:16 102:4, 5, 11, 12, 16 103:3, 14, 15, 16, 18, 23 110:7, 13 130:6 131:4 135:16 137:7 141:13 158:24 millions 13:16 minimize 68:16 minimum 43:4, 14 44:22 102:12 minority 51:5 minutes 12:10 110:25 mission 9:4 91:14, 21 99:12 147:24 missions 7:15	misstate 112:22 114:10 152:21 misstatement 25:22 68:25 70:3 141:17 misstatements 70:6, 10 71:6, 8 72:13 73:22 mistake 74:9 131:4 135:16 mistakes 156:23 159:17 MMO 43:4, 17 model 18:20 modest 106:3 moment 14:20, 25 19:11 81:2 106:10 108:3 128:16 146:4 money 9:8 10:5 18:10 24:23, 25 28:19 29:18 30:19 31:4, 11, 13 32:1, 2 40:11 42:20 43:16 56:23 58:12, 13, 14 70:21 75:17 78:24 79:10 82:20 84:20 90:5 102:3 103:9, 11, 24 105:24 106:3 118:25 130:7, 9 137:12 138:12 140:12 155:19 163:25 Money's 44:12 monies 69:21 Monson 20:2, 5, 7, 14, 17 26:18, 22 27:4, 24 30:6, 12 33:22 35:17, 24 38:20 39:3, 12 40:4, 15 44:7 45:3, 13, 20 54:4, 25 55:19, 21 158:19 Montgomery 27:11 39:19 month 137:23 monthly 110:19, 22 129:6, 8, 10	months 14:12 18:12 23:1 34:7, 12 59:8 69:3 77:18, 20 115:14 131:8 152:16 morning 2:3, 9 4:9, 18, 22, 23 5:6, 11, 13, 15, 20 6:5, 6, 9 20:5, 7, 15 35:15, 16, 17 39:12, 16 46:4, 24 53:23 65:6, 7 80:1 99:25 motivation 164:9 mouth 146:19 move 137:22 139:15 moved 137:21 moves 157:15 moving 61:16 68:9 86:20 88:3, 4, 9 96:13 97:2 157:12 158:2 multiple 8:14 39:13 75:7, 9 114:25 117:20 124:7, 8 municipal 43:4 mute 70:15 < N > name 4:10 20:11, 17 46:21, 25 63:9, 10, 12 164:24 national 17:17 49:21 nationally 51:14 nature 41:22 near 50:25 80:8 nearly 6:23 23:1 117:21 necessarily 67:25 123:17 135:9 necessary 16:14 90:9 137:17 156:1, 22 161:4, 6 need 32:11 35:22 37:17 62:6, 24 64:12 73:21 78:11,	17 94:17 101:21, 22 127:18 160:2 164:3 needed 33:17 62:4 103:14 161:10 Needless 23:22 needlessly 58:4 needs 35:4 54:13 55:19 59:10 78:16 135:10 155:12 neglect 146:10 neglected 147:1 neighborhood 94:8 nepotism 11:20 80:22 net 47:9, 19 48:25 56:10 68:17 106:13 network 92:7 never 8:6 12:17 13:25 14:2 21:16 33:13 34:21, 23 48:14 68:3 84:1 102:19, 20 130:7 135:16 137:14 148:19 new 19:3, 6 45:1 49:15 51:8, 20 52:6 55:15 58:23 59:6 64:2, 5 69:10 88:22 91:9 95:8 124:20 137:10 143:3 157:13 158:3 newer 100:9 newness 160:22 News 3:6 56:3 nice 39:5 53:23 65:8, 9 Nick 2:13 night 60:8 nine 34:12 normal 37:5 normally 30:14 31:14 82:6, 12 norms 17:18 notable 148:3
--	--	---	---	--	--

6/22/2022

Notably 111:13	October 59:3	online 98:4	opportunities	93:5	59:21 60:11
Notary 166:12	115:12 131:7	148:13	51:13 97:24	overseen 72:12	62:12 63:15,
note 3:22	145:24	Onstreet	126:22	oversees 57:20	18 74:25 75:8
61:19 144:16	offer 3:2 7:3	10:19, 25	opportunity	73:7	76:7, 19 83:19
noted 32:14	86:13 157:6, 7	11:15 13:17	20:20 96:14	oversight	92:2 93:2
55:2 121:4	158:11	15:17 17:8, 16	127:19	13:12 15:4	100:13, 16, 24
134:7 166:1	Office 22:9	41:23 42:5	opposite 31:8	18:18, 23	101:6 102:8
notes 81:3	137:9, 19	47:10, 20 48:3	option 84:19,	19:14 33:18	103:22 104:7,
166:1	Officer 20:18	49:1, 9 56:11	21	57:24 58:10	9, 13, 17, 25
notices 3:5	121:12 160:17	75:15 84:9, 12	options 30:9	131:14 134:6,	105:2, 6
notification	officers 60:11	101:8 104:9	order 4:1	11 135:2, 10	106:12, 15
18:13	121:8 122:16	105:5, 21	6:13 13:17	142:2	107:13 108:5
notified 77:5	official 119:9	106:6, 12, 15,	33:4, 19 35:22	overview 57:10	109:14 114:24
noting 48:13	officials 111:3,	24 107:20	43:6 54:6, 10	owe 24:23, 24	116:8 119:21,
November	11	108:5, 6	105:6 139:20	owed 10:11	24 120:7, 12
23:8	offs 31:25	112:12, 13, 17	organization	23:16 29:22	121:6, 8, 11
number 12:2,	off-the-hip	113:2, 6, 12	19:1 43:21	< P >	122:16 127:1,
4 29:22 41:2,	119:15	116:2, 6	44:1, 23 77:25	p.m 165:24	3, 4, 12 128:20,
8, 12 50:24	OH 1:1 5:14,	117:22 118:1	79:4 151:22	Page 46:18	24 129:25
101:21 105:3	15 70:14, 16	119:24 120:5	157:23 158:1,	56:8	130:18 131:13
108:14 117:15	91:1 99:22, 23	137:13 138:6,	5 160:15	pages 111:22	132:4 134:22,
118:2 141:24	105:15 150:13	8, 12 139:5, 8	163:23	156:11	25 135:24
148:18	155:1	141:7, 9, 12	organizational	paid 49:8	143:16, 17
numbers 37:2	Okay 7:6	159:10 161:24	94:11, 15, 20	57:5 67:1	147:25 151:17
53:16 119:8	38:22 39:2	OPEB 17:12	130:24	paltry 12:25	157:14, 22
144:24	56:6, 23 61:8	25:19 42:11,	organizations	pandemic	158:18 159:17
numerous	63:20 65:1	23 66:14, 21,	28:15 50:5	10:22 48:17	161:7, 20
71:20 93:16	67:16 68:24	23 68:8, 14	51:6 79:1	65:22 82:4	162:24 163:2,
102:18 130:20	70:1, 17 72:5	106:22 107:16,	121:6	86:12	8, 12 164:1, 17
161:16	73:15, 18, 19	18 108:7, 11	original 10:4	pandemic-	part 26:8
nuts 78:14	74:15 77:9	110:5, 13, 14,	48:10 83:18	impacted	27:8 52:8
< O >	79:19 85:2	17 111:6	originally	21:19	71:1 77:23
obligated	108:16 109:9	112:15 114:22	10:12 83:21	panel 19:25	88:15 92:10
61:22	115:8 118:16	115:3 116:9	101:4	45:23	98:1 103:7
obligation	119:7, 16	162:17	ousted 17:24	panelists 4:24	104:22 111:15
43:5 53:1	121:20 122:9	open 13:3	outcome 50:9	panels 157:1	113:2, 5, 11
59:15	124:6, 15, 23	71:22 79:15	outcomes 50:6	parallel 24:4	119:10 121:25
obligations	132:23 134:15,	96:22 97:7	outlook 43:24	parameters	125:25 140:1
28:4 164:20	20 135:12	125:17 146:21	outrageous	44:22	partially 35:19
obliged 102:13	136:10 137:1	opening 7:1, 3,	11:8	paramount	participants
103:10, 17	139:12 140:4,	8 19:21 22:25	outside 42:13	61:1	3:14
obviously	11 141:4, 10	126:11 130:9	55:5 72:23	parents 7:10	participation
10:21 27:13	142:7, 15, 22	opera 113:17	outstanding	8:3 81:11, 14	157:2
36:7 89:4	143:1, 11	operating 17:7	159:16	parkable 93:12	particular
105:23 153:4	145:2 147:3	24:13 31:13	overall 114:23	parked 93:21	23:7 29:24
occupancy	148:15 149:7	92:4 96:25	overpaid 23:14	Parking 6:20,	75:19 102:9
137:20	150:14 152:13	106:13 113:12	overpayment	23 7:13, 24	137:6
occur 151:21	153:21 154:1,	114:7 162:1	14:14 25:24	8:14 9:18, 20	particularly
occurred 22:3	21 155:5	operational	26:2 49:13, 16	10:18 11:4, 5,	105:22 136:2
56:25 70:3	once 19:2, 19	48:23 106:25	50:3 65:16	12, 15, 22 12:5,	147:6 155:14
101:4 105:11	21:9 33:10	112:18	69:6	13, 18 13:17	parties 72:24
118:4 144:15	53:5 69:11	operations	overpayments	19:1, 6 21:1, 3	partly 89:20
occurring	159:19	36:7, 23	67:11	30:10 33:1, 19	114:13 115:19
152:2	ones 32:5	112:15 129:20	overrun	39:22 41:23	partner 97:13
occurs 40:7	56:8 89:19	157:25	129:16	42:2 46:1	121:18
O'Connor	118:17	opinion 27:21	oversee 89:1	47:3, 10, 11, 12,	partners 52:1
93:15	one-time 31:4	122:13, 21	overseeing	20 48:3, 20	partnership
	ongoing 44:11	123:2, 9, 12, 22,	27:9 57:19	49:10 50:21	19:15 49:14
	84:13	24 124:4			52:3 165:11

6/22/2022

partnerships 93:25	107:18 115:7 131:5	perspective 65:19 78:4 150:3 152:18	85:22 95:11 126:1 141:22 147:15 159:19	politically 11:23 16:24 143:20 145:12	93:18 98:24, 25 109:18 111:21 119:18,
party 64:9, 16 72:11 73:6, 24 74:8 79:13 145:14 147:18 159:22	pensions 28:3, 16 29:25 40:11	Petri 25:1 PHILADELPH IA 1:1 5:12 6:20 7:13 9:18, 20, 25 10:2, 10, 15, 18 11:22 12:24 14:2 15:10, 20 18:11, 20 20:3, 19 27:3 32:18, 22 33:2 43:3 46:1 47:3, 17, 21 48:19 51:9 52:9 75:18 76:7, 18 81:15 84:7, 9, 11 86:25 87:2 88:12 90:7 91:17, 24 92:13 93:11 94:2 97:5 101:25 104:10, 15 105:25 107:6, 8, 13 109:14 115:11 116:25 119:2 125:25 128:20 130:13, 17 135:3, 15 136:2, 13, 14 137:15 140:13 157:14 158:7, 23 159:12, 13 161:23 162:9, 12, 16 163:16 164:1, 3, 13, 14	placed 162:1 places 127:14 plagued 50:18 plan 22:18 37:25 83:8 87:19 88:8 97:18 98:13 120:15 132:7 planned 67:6 planning 22:21, 22 89:21, 24 90:9 94:20 97:7 121:22 122:3, 7 139:19, 24 play 43:1 84:25 86:10 93:19 94:10 126:10 please 4:6, 9, 11 6:14 9:11 19:24 20:11 45:23 47:6 80:11 106:4 146:18 pleased 50:5 52:13 plumbing 137:24 pocket 29:4 point 42:17 61:17 62:5, 23 74:6 83:15 85:10, 13 101:10, 19 107:5 115:12 151:18 157:11 pointing 128:6 points 28:1 34:3 45:16 Poli 55:23 policies 51:17 78:7, 9 88:21 95:3 99:6 126:5, 8 150:2, 18 160:3, 4 policy 26:5 29:2, 14, 19 32:10 34:20 35:4 36:15 79:6 136:4, 14 151:16 160:10 162:13 Political 11:19 143:25 144:8 145:13 147:7	poor 8:19 portion 27:16 31:5 55:2 66:6 109:1 Portland 120:2 position 39:18 58:24 83:7 86:21 87:12 88:2 150:9 positions 77:25 78:6 120:1 143:25 144:11 147:4, 7 150:1 positive 50:8 69:17 89:2 93:4 possibility 79:8 possible 2:25 44:17 50:12 possibly 155:18 post 9:12 17:13 42:11 Post-2012 161:16 posted 71:14 110:25 111:9 potential 42:23 94:3 128:14 160:17 PowerPoint 100:7 PPA 7:14, 19 8:25 10:9 11:14 12:3, 7, 11, 17 13:8, 11, 15 14:5, 14, 22 15:8 16:2 17:6 18:16, 25 19:13 21:3, 8 22:3, 8, 12 23:10, 16, 18, 24 24:1, 11, 16 25:15, 18, 19 26:10 28:24 35:21 36:8 40:1 41:10 47:15 48:25 49:8 50:1 52:4 61:20, 24 65:14 68:7 80:13, 16, 25 81:24 83:24 86:20 87:25 88:3 91:11	25 109:18 111:21 119:18, 23 121:4, 7 125:23 126:10, 17 129:4 137:7, 20 138:3 148:23 155:12 159:6, 22, 24 160:4, 14 161:13 PPA's 9:13 11:10 15:5, 6 16:6, 17 17:12 23:2 25:7, 10 27:22 49:15 51:20 67:24 71:1 72:14 91:13 105:19 117:19 128:23 130:21 153:15 161:2, 15 162:5 prac 76:15 practice 31:14 67:19 68:21 72:1 73:5 80:22 98:15 101:18 practices 8:20 16:19 44:10 49:21 51:17 52:6 55:8 59:12 62:13, 21 64:1, 9 68:8 69:23 78:9 88:21 90:22 94:18 95:3 123:15, 25 130:22 148:17 150:18 159:23 160:3 praying 87:10 pre-2012 130:16 predatory 161:20 predict 163:11 predictability 26:10 36:6 37:7, 22 38:8, 9 97:9 99:2 predictable 38:1, 3 prefer 155:25 premium 57:6 prepare 42:15 preparedness

6/22/2022

30:2	proceedings	properties	purchase	35:19 45:10,	108:18, 19
prepares 44:4	166:1	113:5 114:4	113:4 114:4	16 52:12 53:2,	128:16 138:21
preparing	process 15:5	proposal 95:20	purpose 4:4	11, 13, 17 54:2	ready 20:6
43:8 44:6	19:17 22:22	proposals	164:8	56:21 63:22	76:12 95:23
prepay 13:18	55:4 56:25	76:20	purposeful	69:4 70:4, 25	real 96:15
PRESENT 1:1	62:19 64:19,	protections	90:22	71:25 74:3, 24	99:13 156:21
4:10, 18, 24	23 72:12 73:7	141:22	purposely 9:5	76:3 80:9	realizing 29:23
5:7, 16, 21 6:6,	76:13, 23	proud 59:4	purposes 80:11	86:16 106:21	really 35:25
10, 12 20:17	77:10, 11 82:6	provide 14:15	pursuing	117:5, 9, 14, 15,	36:20 54:3
142:9 151:19	94:24 97:8	16:9 22:11	163:22	17 118:7	59:19 60:20
presentation	99:5 127:10	33:17 51:11	put 24:21	119:17 120:4	64:11 67:13
80:19	146:21 148:9	54:11 55:1	28:15, 18 83:7	130:22 137:3,	78:16, 18
presented	152:1 156:6, 9	56:15 100:2	86:21 88:1	4, 6 141:24	93:24 97:18
75:10 110:23	processes	112:7 116:10	113:24 114:1	146:9 149:9,	158:25
press 13:20	141:21 142:1	129:5 155:13	117:25 124:16	23 157:9	reason 87:3
pressures 26:1	professional	163:10	146:19 155:24	159:3, 15	103:7 122:23
pretty 34:13	24:2 26:25	provided 23:5	putting 32:1	161:25 162:19	126:14
38:24 111:20	149:21	25:9 66:25	43:16 76:19	queue 125:1	reasonable
prevent 57:13	proffer 122:21	71:15, 16, 17,	91:10	quick 56:8	3:15 74:20
prevents	123:1 124:2	23 82:8 111:2,	< Q >	83:15	reasons 31:15,
132:10 133:24	Program	11 112:1	qualified	quickly 80:10	22 101:3
previous 69:18	47:20 50:21	116:22 135:20	146:24	QUINONES	re-
previously	88:24, 25	provides 16:4	quality 92:25	5:5 91:2 94:6	authorization
69:10 125:13,	programs	90:17	98:1 125:19	95:15, 25 96:6,	39:25 40:2
16 159:2	42:4, 5 50:15	providing	quality-of-life	10 97:16	receipt 151:6
primarily 9:24	125:18	23:24 69:20	50:10 94:8	99:19	receipts 129:7
102:22 164:13	prohibited	72:9 92:1	quarter 9:21	QUINONES-	receive 23:4
primary 52:21	107:4 134:1	132:10 133:25	144:11	SANCHEZ	129:1 137:19
prior 3:7, 19	project 37:13,	135:24	quarterly 8:23	1:1 5:4 90:25	received 10:15
23:12 25:20	21 56:21 93:9	PSERS 27:14	32:24 33:3	quite 30:8	21:17, 20
26:4 48:9	138:4 139:7,	40:20 41:7	135:25 163:5,	70:3	25:13, 17
120:11 121:15	15 140:1, 15	43:15	6, 9	quorum 6:11	46:12 115:15
128:18 148:21	projected	public 2:19,	question 38:14,	< R >	receives 119:24
161:15	41:16 82:12	20 3:2, 3, 5, 12,	21 39:21	raised 23:25	receiving
priorities	projecting	14 7:10, 15, 16	41:13 54:3, 8	41:3 45:1	103:24
28:12 44:14	96:23	10:3 13:8	56:7, 19 57:8	75:6 79:9	recess 109:17
privacy 3:16	projection	14:19 16:1	58:20 59:19	159:15 162:21	165:13
probably 30:3	34:18 37:21	18:15 29:20	61:18 62:1	163:19	recite 14:17
38:10, 14	38:9	30:7 31:20	70:5 71:4	raising 146:9	recognize 2:13
41:18 54:12	projections	32:8, 10 41:8	83:11 84:13,	rampant 11:7,	recognized 4:1
60:13	22:14, 17 34:6	44:16, 17	25 88:14	19	134:4
problem 38:16,	36:21 82:25	46:11 50:7	114:16, 18	ran 27:12	recognizes
18 54:15	83:6 86:8, 14	60:4 64:22	118:20 120:21	randomly	35:13 39:8
56:16 58:21	89:17 163:13,	72:10 76:22	122:3, 5	148:4	53:19 65:2
109:23 148:16	14	89:15 91:22	124:25 125:7,	range 153:1, 5,	75:20 79:23
problematic	projects 57:19,	92:25 96:14	8, 23 131:12	13, 19	90:24 99:21
24:25	21, 24 58:7	110:23 118:24	132:21 133:5,	rarely 22:14	125:1 149:16
problems	113:15	125:19 140:7	12 138:10	34:16	recognizing
16:17 31:12	promise 21:16	148:8, 19	149:13 154:12	rate 122:17	3:20 45:17
75:8 137:25	83:18	155:19 158:14	questionable	rationalize	recommend
146:7 161:17	promised 7:19	166:12	15:12 161:23	112:17	151:12
procedures	10:6, 13 82:17,	publicly 13:25	questioning	reach 94:3	recommendatio
51:18 55:9	20, 22 83:25	29:15 31:18	34:17 62:10	reaches 48:1	n 66:17 110:8
78:9 88:21	promises 8:20	34:23 35:6	89:13 91:7	reaching	recommendatio
124:1 150:18	21:6 131:1	146:6	125:6	127:14	ns 75:9 79:16
151:16	160:5	published 3:6	questions 3:21	read 2:13	124:9 145:21
proceed 20:6,	promising	pulls 12:7	23:25 24:6	6:14 55:3	152:8
12 46:22 47:6	130:4	Purcell 7:23	25:12 26:3, 15	82:19 91:20	recommended
	proper 28:10				66:9 109:25

6/22/2022

reconnect 109:14	157:19, 25 159:5, 16	removing 93:19	161:11, 12 162:10 163:4	responded 25:2 145:3, 11	112:12, 13, 18 113:2, 6 116:2,
record 3:23 14:24 20:11 46:21 47:1 66:10 75:10 77:21 106:5 110:1 124:16	regardless 83:24 85:1 region 91:25 regular 61:24 73:5 regulating 92:5 regulation 106:13 reinstate 130:15 reiterate 85:5 red 10:11 50:14 88:23 92:4 93:5	rendered 137:25 renewed 15:3 164:7 renovations 137:8 repairs 30:16, 25 repay 6:22 repayment 14:6 repealed 85:4, 15, 18, 22 repeat 156:23 repeatedly 9:19 106:2 115:11 replacement 17:9 report 66:4 108:25 111:8 119:23 121:7 138:22 144:18, 23 145:3 reported 139:1 146:7 Reporter 166:12, 22 reporting 8:19 24:18 138:16 140:6 reports 18:16 88:7 145:19 163:5 represent 80:24	requesting 12:12 111:24 155:23 requests 118:6 155:16 require 129:14 required 2:14 21:9 85:7 128:25 129:5 163:2 requirement 134:3 requirements 44:9 81:18 requires 2:17 requiring 23:19 rescind 69:1, 8 140:20, 22 rescinded 71:2 reserves 66:18 110:9 resided 143:25 residency 81:19 residential 50:20 93:22 residents 9:25 51:4 resignations 160:7 resigned 18:6 RESOLUTION 1:1 2:6 6:15, 16 19:25 25:25 46:19 47:8, 13 52:10 100:21 164:24 resolutions 100:18 resolve 49:7 141:2 resolved 14:22 25:16 131:9 resources 51:15 149:21 150:5, 8 respective 32:20 respectively 120:3 respond 25:6 26:14 135:21 136:9, 18 140:9 141:15 144:17, 19 145:7 146:13	responding 4:12 27:9 146:8 response 5:2, 24 6:2 7:5 19:22 25:6 31:23 115:15 156:3 165:1 responses 151:11 responsibility 52:2 89:16, 18 90:8 responsible 19:8, 10 33:20 101:25 146:2, 3 restate 46:22 resubmitted 111:18 result 22:6 23:15 33:8 137:18 resulting 21:13 22:12 65:15 resume 16:14 resumés 148:13 retain 120:14 retiree 49:23 66:3 108:24 retirees 43:7, 9 44:4 retirement 28:19 114:23 retiring 49:18 return 111:23 returned 15:24 111:15, 25 revealed 11:9, 20 62:4 revelation 13:15 revenue 10:17, 19, 25 13:7, 17, 24 15:17 17:16 47:9, 19, 22 48:3, 8, 12 49:1, 10 52:22 56:11, 12 68:17 74:25 75:16 81:22 82:13, 17, 24 87:14 90:3 106:7 107:20	6 118:1 120:5 129:10, 16 138:6 139:8 141:7, 12 159:10 revenues 9:13 12:8 15:18 21:14 37:4 38:1 51:24 84:10, 12 89:25 90:18 105:21 106:11, 24 108:6, 7 113:12 130:5 136:6, 16 137:13 138:13 140:14 141:5 142:3, 4 161:24 162:2 163:14 reversed 67:10 review 12:10 49:6 52:19 55:5 72:12 74:9 76:6, 9, 22, 25 77:1, 22, 23 78:22 79:5, 12 94:13, 15, 20 95:17 107:15 116:25 117:2 118:11 119:5 120:15 121:18, 22 132:25 139:19, 24 141:20 150:1 151:11, 16 152:6, 7, 15, 24, 25 153:16, 17, 23 157:19 160:2 reviewed 111:3, 8 reviewing 25:5 150:8 151:1, 18 reviews 89:3, 6 160:9 revised 52:5 RFP 64:19 76:13 77:10 94:24 95:19 150:21, 22, 25 151:10 152:5 rhetoric 122:5 Rhynhart 72:21

6/22/2022

right 32:5 44:18 61:9 62:22 63:12 64:2 69:13, 16 70:22 76:17 78:10, 11 87:3 95:4, 6, 9 98:15, 24 100:6 108:8 117:12 126:3 128:1 133:23 142:24 143:12 153:8 154:13 155:5 160:14	satisfied 21:11 saving 51:3 saw 69:11 saying 43:12 85:18 132:13 says 56:10 scary 60:20 School 6:22 7:10, 20 8:5, 9, 24 9:7, 9 10:9, 14 12:15, 19, 23 13:1 14:7 15:20 16:25 18:11 20:3, 19 21:4, 9 22:9 27:2 29:4 30:17, 18 32:18, 21 34:4 43:13, 18 47:16 48:5, 22 49:4, 7, 10, 14 50:9 51:25 52:4, 22, 25 53:15 54:7, 24 58:13 59:16 61:24 65:12, 16 67:12 69:2, 21 72:16 75:17 80:6 81:15, 25 82:18, 21 83:1 84:6, 8, 10, 20 86:7, 24 87:1, 7 89:24 90:6 91:18 92:13, 18 96:18 97:6, 19 98:11 99:2 102:1 103:2, 9, 13, 16, 18, 25 104:2 106:1 107:6, 7, 11 111:4 115:2, 10 116:24 117:7, 20 119:1 130:4 132:6 135:6, 15 136:1, 5, 12 137:14 140:13 158:19, 23 159:11, 18 160:21 161:22 162:12, 15 163:16 164:13 schools 7:16 10:3 13:2, 8 16:4 28:21 87:6 101:12 Sci 55:23	scope 96:1 scramble 13:3 screen 4:13 scrutiny 58:9 SDP 53:15 searchable 112:2 156:13 second 34:19 56:7 118:5 146:19 147:16 secret 17:15 161:18 secretly 9:6 section 45:19 101:16 155:10 secured 48:9 see 9:18 10:3, 21 16:1 37:4 53:24 63:2 70:9 71:5 76:1 78:16 80:3, 20 86:19 91:13, 14 99:25 125:11 126:10 127:19 128:13 130:5 seeded 42:18 Seeing 19:23 45:12 59:24 146:16 seek 13:18 18:22 55:11 62:21 seeking 64:2, 5 seeks 47:14 55:1 seen 161:16, 21 seizing 104:13 selected 77:4, 9 selection 76:24 77:12 151:12, 13 send 24:8 sends 40:20 senior 11:16 119:23 sense 34:9 37:5, 17 38:1 83:11 106:18 senses 13:9 162:22 sent 25:6 separate 24:15 110:18 127:7 150:6, 12, 14 September 140:25 145:23 serious 134:5 seriously 99:16	seriousness 158:16 serve 19:16 88:11 services 51:16 77:15 80:5 96:2 98:5 set 28:2 85:6, 23 settle 141:1 settlements 161:18 seven 115:14 131:8 shame 14:8 shape 55:22 share 37:2 38:19, 25 61:4 63:9, 12 96:3 shared 22:11 35:5, 7 54:15 159:2 162:25 sharing 9:14 26:9 34:9 shift 37:20 shifts 134:5 136:3, 15 162:13 shock 13:9 shocked 162:21 short 51:20 shortchange 14:25 shortfall 129:16 shortfalls 68:15 showed 117:19 showing 24:23, 24 shows 10:11, 13, 17 17:6 116:1 side 152:1 sign 134:12 signed 162:5 significant 10:22 27:16 32:9 40:10 41:8, 12 87:9 136:4 160:18 162:14 164:10 signify 3:25 signoff 15:6 sign-off 130:17 161:14 similar 97:8 152:1	simple 38:25 simply 14:14 16:22 116:7 single 8:4 83:22 111:22 131:22 156:12 sir 56:5 61:11 sit 116:23 situation 71:3 96:21 98:19 103:20 situations 28:6 six 34:7 59:5 154:14, 15 155:2 size 79:1 154:13 skills 146:25 slide 9:17 10:7, 8, 16 11:2, 14 83:16 small 102:3 smart 54:12 social 52:2 solely 52:23 90:22 solve 38:25 somebody 40:19 57:20 77:4 94:25 soon 40:3 51:1 63:2, 23 64:20 76:10, 11 95:20 sorry 70:17 77:19 83:10 108:1 109:21 113:8 134:23 148:25 154:8, 9 sort 29:5 73:5 86:17 sorts 162:20 sound 126:16 sounds 67:17, 23 soup 78:14 speak 4:14 71:11 72:1 94:19 95:21 125:15 speaking 92:20 specific 75:13 specifically 24:15 47:13 56:19 68:4 73:2 81:16 84:8 101:12,	17 105:18, 25 107:4 116:2 138:5 144:1 147:4 speed 50:14 88:24 93:5 spend 29:1 138:3 spending 16:2, 6 40:8 78:23 155:19 163:24 spent 9:9 40:10 79:10 158:14 spirit 49:13 134:4 157:15 158:3 162:25 164:7 Spiva 2:13 4:6 9:11 45:22 109:5 spread 30:21 spreadsheet 112:3 spring 49:20 squeeze 7:24 SQUILLA 1:1 6:1 124:25 125:2, 3 126:2, 13 127:25 128:5 165:18 SRC 103:8 stable 33:20 staff 24:3 32:3 38:17 88:6 staffing 13:3 37:3 65:18 129:8 150:2 stakeholders 59:14 standard 111:23 standards 55:9 65:25 68:22 79:18 108:21 start 46:17 53:8, 9 63:5 83:5 started 31:8 51:5, 19 53:6 starting 63:1 93:8 108:4 143:7 159:20 state 2:16 12:22 13:11 19:3 20:11 27:15 39:23
--	--	---	---	---	---

6/22/2022

46:20 61:23 83:20 85:17 100:23 101:2, 19, 22, 24 102:8, 10, 13, 18 103:22 104:4, 19, 24 106:4 107:3 122:11, 13 124:10 128:21 133:20 134:1, 2 160:14 162:11 stated 7:23 86:4 111:25 124:17 159:23 statement 22:25 66:1 91:21 108:22 128:15, 17 129:22 130:11 statements 23:12 24:19, 21, 22 25:10 110:20, 22 129:6 135:25 160:10 stating 29:14 139:13 statute 104:3, 7 steadily 10:20 stems 21:5 stenographic 166:1 step 156:16 stepped 146:4 stint 17:4 stipends 17:2 stood 7:9 stories 13:6 story 8:13 strategic 28:9 streams 159:10 street 59:22 86:12 92:2 98:23 Streets 80:5 strengthened 57:22 62:7 strive 109:10 strong 34:17 stronger 127:22 struck 60:18 structural 164:4 structure 124:4 150:9	structures 78:5 121:19, 23 struggled 13:2 106:2 students 13:4 38:3, 5 study 144:6 stuff 99:7 subject 40:18 60:14 86:12 submit 148:6 153:3 submitted 15:23 115:20 117:2, 4 118:12, 18 119:9 128:10 151:2, 6 153:3 155:14 subpoena 14:9 15:22 16:11, 13 111:14 112:1 116:20 118:13, 19 119:11 155:25 156:6, 9 163:19 subpoenaed 111:16 subsequent 128:21 subsequently 85:21 substantial 128:22 successfully 92:15 sudden 31:3 sufficient 86:11 suggest 52:20 70:7 73:20 suggestions 79:15 157:24 sum 106:3 summaries 129:8 sunk 137:7 Sunshine 4:2 supervision 166:21 support 66:7 109:3 163:3 supported 50:6 supporting 50:16 Supreme 102:6	Sure 30:12 36:12 42:9 43:6 44:5 55:17 57:18 72:17, 23 74:19 76:8 79:14 86:2 88:19 95:9, 22 96:9 97:11 98:6 117:3 138:23 139:22 149:22 152:21 157:23 158:25 165:11 surface 41:11 surprised 33:6, 12 surprises 33:6 62:8 surrounding 91:25 surveyed 32:7 system 92:4 106:12, 15 systematic 90:2 systematically 9:5 84:18 systems 51:23 76:6 106:14 < T > table 131:12 take 4:7 55:6 70:8 73:20 97:14 101:14 105:5 124:13 128:16 133:21 152:10 taken 8:23 9:8 15:7 166:1 takeover 21:7 83:20 85:17 101:11 talent 62:22 78:11 95:4 talented 95:13 147:23 talk 7:7 56:9 talking 115:18 123:15, 25 TANEHA 166:11 taxi 92:6 taxpayer 163:24 taxpayers 15:2, 9 162:9	team 54:10 94:16, 22 Teams 1:1 2:24 3:24 95:6 109:8 Teamsters 81:5 technically 159:25 technology 78:10 109:21, 24 teenagers 16:25 tell 27:21 54:13 55:23 59:9 68:6 71:13 108:14 139:4 telling 108:16 temporary 62:25 term 107:1 terms 136:22 161:22 terrible 137:24 testified 93:16 testifier 20:2 testify 3:11 20:21 45:25 164:23 testimony 3:3 17:25 20:13 26:13 46:13, 18 52:17, 18 55:3 56:9 128:12 texting 60:1 Thank 2:15 4:4, 5 5:21 6:10, 24 9:16 20:14, 20 26:17 35:9 39:2, 4, 6, 10 45:5, 7, 13, 19, 20 46:4, 23 47:7 52:14, 15 53:21 61:9, 10, 12, 14 65:4 74:3, 4 75:1, 23 76:1 77:20 79:20, 21 80:4 88:14, 16 89:12 91:3, 8 99:17, 18, 23 100:1 105:13, 14 109:12 112:9 117:13 125:3, 4, 5	127:24 128:1, 3, 4, 6 149:15 155:5, 7 156:25 157:2 158:8, 13 165:6, 8, 15, 18, 20 thing 38:4 60:21 74:23 92:19 93:14 94:13 97:12 things 11:3 16:18, 21 17:9 29:24 33:6 37:19 38:11 39:2, 14 41:2 57:16 80:20 81:19 86:9 88:23 93:4 95:6 96:16, 18 99:8 116:19 117:17 125:18 127:1, 17, 18 134:8 136:20 143:14 145:17 148:6 150:16 162:20 think 7:7 26:25 27:24, 25 28:23 29:6 32:14 33:16 34:1, 10, 14 35:4, 18, 24 36:21 38:2, 9, 20 40:15 41:1, 21 42:25 53:2, 11 55:14 57:15, 17, 22, 25 58:5 60:22 62:1, 5, 23 63:21 64:4, 7, 11, 19 68:2, 5 69:11 70:10 75:6, 13 76:14 77:4 80:16 81:10, 20 84:2, 3, 14, 24 86:13 87:21, 23 88:19 92:20 93:1, 10 94:9 95:7, 18, 22 97:11, 17, 20 98:15, 21 99:5, 9, 12 100:15 106:18, 20 109:10 117:13 120:17 122:25 123:15 124:3 126:18, 22, 23,	25 127:4, 17, 19 129:23 133:3, 4 135:9 137:3 139:25 140:2 144:10 145:15 147:1 148:2, 13, 16 151:1, 5 153:18, 20 154:4 155:9 156:2 162:17 thinking 81:16 third 64:9, 16 72:11 73:6 74:8 79:12 147:17 159:22 third-party 63:14 76:5 121:1, 17 149:25 150:23 151:15 152:5 THOMAS 1:1 4:16, 17 79:24, 25 81:9 82:11 83:14 84:3, 15 86:15 89:12 90:13 94:12 thorough 89:3 thought 108:10 133:15 three 23:1 33:4, 24, 25 50:5 54:2 56:8 77:18, 20 152:16 three-month 76:15 77:1, 21 three-year 77:16 threshold 12:17 48:2, 4, 7, 11, 14, 17 52:24 84:1 85:23 86:5 thresholds 85:6 92:16 ticket 37:3 tickets 47:12 80:18 93:3 98:25 time 3:23 7:4 8:2 13:2 14:16, 20 15:15 18:21 19:21 21:6, 11 28:9 36:5 44:20 46:15 48:1 55:15 59:17 64:8
--	--	---	---	---	--

6/22/2022

69:13 77:16, 22 85:15, 16 86:17 87:18 94:4 100:17 101:10, 19 102:25 107:5 113:14 128:2 136:22, 25 152:16 157:3, 7 158:14, 17 160:18 timeline 76:9 82:7 95:16 150:23 152:14, 15, 18 timeliness 37:6 timely 34:2 36:17, 21 55:12 times 9:6 22:13 31:2 71:20, 21 93:16 102:18 timing 36:2 title 6:15 titles 148:20 today 7:9 9:2 14:16 17:6 19:2 22:25 46:5 53:3 80:3 114:17 130:23 135:17 155:21 157:2 159:4 163:20 165:5 today's 14:19 16:15 17:19 tolerate 8:7 15:11 164:15 ton 56:22 tools 35:22 topic 17:5 total 10:1 42:1 56:11 66:15 68:5 110:6 totaled 49:1 totaling 49:24 touch 39:16 117:16 tow 60:12 track 14:24 tractor 93:21 trade 31:24 trade-off 28:22, 25 29:17 trade-offs	29:13, 16 trailers 93:21 transcript 166:1, 19 transfer 106:11 transformation 161:4 translate 99:1 transparency 33:18 35:25 38:10 54:21 89:9 96:20 156:15 161:5 163:1, 11 transparent 32:12 36:13 44:17 99:8 transportation 92:7 119:21 transportation- related 92:8 triggered 23:8 troubling 161:17 truck 60:12 trucks 50:18 true 19:15 45:4 truly 116:6 trust 7:15 17:13, 14 24:15 26:5 42:13 49:18, 24 66:14 97:3 98:16 110:5 111:7 126:24 132:6 try 15:14 53:12 trying 30:20 38:23 56:23 98:17 109:13 122:6 142:1 145:25 146:12 158:6 tuition 84:23 162:20 turn 124:24 turnover 87:25 turns 100:3 two 13:22 25:20 101:21 105:3 144:3, 4 150:16 164:11 TWU 81:5 type 40:13 62:24 78:1	79:5 80:14 83:4 86:23 types 11:25 106:5 112:25 162:22 typical 27:23, 25 49:19 106:23 148:7 typically 17:11 < U > ugly 78:20 ultimately 100:20 104:25 129:1 unacceptable 18:14 90:16 unanswered 24:6 26:3 159:4, 14 unanticipated 42:15 unclear 41:25 unconstitutiona l 101:14 underfunded 41:18 underfunding 28:8 underrepresent ed 51:11 understand 2:16 20:23 29:12 30:9 39:22 42:13 56:24 86:22 87:18, 20 89:18 92:10 100:10 105:10 137:24 142:2 145:25 146:1 149:22 163:23 understanding 30:2 34:5 40:1, 9 112:11 130:16 understood 106:20 underway 151:5 undisclosed 13:15 unfamiliar 118:3 unforeseen 90:21 unilaterally 104:5	unions 67:1 80:15, 23 81:11, 13, 17 unique 28:4, 23 41:22 united 162:4 universe 159:8 Universities 148:11 unorthodox 6:21 unprecedented 23:23 158:20 unpredicted 89:19 unusable 138:1 unusual 68:21 upcoming 22:19 upper 80:22 88:6 Uri 20:2, 17 98:11 158:19 use 3:23 22:18 24:13 26:12 30:22 38:12 118:23 usual 18:13 usually 82:7 < V > vacancy 154:19 validity 16:6 variance 129:9 vast 160:23 vehicle 17:9 vehicles 30:17 vendors 127:16 verbal 60:15 versus 30:10 99:14 view 3:2 viewers 3:14 viewing 14:18 30:6 46:11 158:13 violation 47:12 violations 50:25 vision 91:11 vitality 91:24 voluntarily 13:18 133:25 voluntary 32:17 90:4 105:1	< W > waiting 120:25 walkable 93:13 want 7:1, 7 14:10 35:10, 15 36:12 38:18 44:14, 15 46:10 52:20 54:16, 22 60:24 69:12, 15 75:5, 11, 12 78:18 79:17 83:15 89:2, 11, 14 90:7 91:5, 7, 12 92:14 98:6 112:22 124:16 127:20 132:12 137:4 141:16 143:12 147:15, 21, 23 149:22 152:21 153:25 155:11, 21 158:13 161:9 162:2 165:6, 8 wanted 39:16 65:10, 13 76:2 100:2 149:19 157:6 Ward 144:3, 5 warning 29:21 wasteful 8:19 watch 131:4, 5 watching 158:15 way 18:25 29:1 40:22 41:15 55:22 63:24 102:19 103:24 126:25 ways 26:8 29:25 40:16 103:25 125:10 website 16:21 71:14 111:1, 10 146:23 148:3 Wednesday 1:1 week 18:5 weigh 31:22 73:25 weighing 36:18 welcome 72:4 89:1 125:17, 24 159:22 welcoming 95:11	Weldon 142:14, 16 Weldon's 142:18 well 22:20 25:8, 21 26:24 33:15 36:5 44:5 57:7 62:16 68:3 71:20 74:16 78:7, 25 80:6 81:17 86:18 87:11, 18 88:22 95:14 111:6 114:12 118:17 122:17, 20 124:19 125:14, 24 128:1 135:18 139:25 148:12 149:1 150:8 151:5 157:20 158:12 162:7 well-being 60:10, 24 61:6 well-known 11:4 went 57:11 70:14 102:21 156:8 we're 24:24 28:18 29:18, 22 31:12 36:11 37:14, 15 40:18 50:4, 12, 16 51:18 53:11 64:11 68:9, 10 69:9, 14 71:10 72:2, 3, 22 75:14 76:11 77:6 82:3 83:9 86:12 87:12 89:8 93:8 94:24 95:10, 13 98:2, 4, 17, 23 115:19 117:8 120:18, 25 121:16, 25 123:15, 25 124:20 125:25 126:11, 17 131:23 135:13 147:16 151:5 158:25 we've 8:22 32:4 39:13 49:17 51:13 57:2 72:18, 20
---	--	---	---	---	---

6/22/2022

77:2 78:2	145:4, 7				
88:8 96:16	155:24				
whack 120:6	wrong 57:11,				
wide-ranging	12 148:14				
27:19	wrote 128:18				
willful 14:23	< Y >				
willfully 146:8	yeah 73:1				
willfulness	83:12 98:9				
146:10	112:8 148:24				
willing 96:2	150:15 157:10				
132:19 136:21	year 7:20				
wipe 68:5	12:16, 25 18:4,				
wish 4:1 58:4	9 21:13, 20, 25				
108:19 147:21	22:16, 20, 23				
wishes 89:5	23:2, 12 25:22				
withholding	26:4, 9 33:7				
23:20	34:8, 12, 15				
witness 19:20	36:3 37:6, 8,				
45:11, 24	23 38:6, 7				
149:11	43:6 47:17				
witnesses 3:22	48:8, 10, 25				
157:1	49:8 56:10				
wondering	65:12 68:17				
81:22 83:3	71:13 72:22				
words 4:11	73:11 82:1, 2				
101:13 146:19	83:22 98:20				
work 16:22	102:5, 13				
27:4, 14 54:25	103:11, 19				
55:17, 25	107:14 130:6				
60:19 64:10	135:8 159:8				
81:7 86:20	years 7:9 8:2,				
87:22 89:23	12 10:1, 20				
93:24 95:12	12:18, 21				
136:23 137:16	13:22 21:2, 23				
147:21 152:7	25:20 27:7, 8				
156:22 164:6,	30:24 39:14				
7 165:10	48:15 50:19				
workers 80:2,	68:16 70:7, 9,				
24 137:21	12 71:5, 6, 8,				
workforce	12, 21, 24				
144:12	73:23 83:1, 10				
working 50:12,	87:8, 24				
23 51:5 59:12	year-to-date				
82:10 99:3	129:10				
125:9 126:17,	YOUTH 1:1				
21 127:5, 6	2:5, 11 6:18				
142:16 151:15	165:5, 7, 23				
152:3	yo-yo 38:5				
works 63:2					
80:13					
world 35:20					
worse 13:10					
worst 38:4					
worth 37:11					
48:13 98:7					
111:22					
write 98:24					
writing 80:17					
144:17, 19					