

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

Room 400, City Hall
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania
Thursday, November 16, 2017
1:45 p.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCILWOMAN JANNIE L. BLACKWELL, CHAIR
COUNCILWOMAN CINDY BASS
COUNCILMAN WILLIAM K. GREENLEE
COUNCILMAN BOBBY HENON
COUNCILMAN DAVID OH
COUNCILWOMAN BLONDELL REYNOLDS BROWN
COUNCILMAN MARK SQUILLA

BILL 160111 - An ordinance amending Chapter
12-2800 of The Philadelphia Code, entitled
"Administrative Adjudication of Parking
Violations," to establish an amnesty program
for fines, fees and penalties on parking
violations...

- - -

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Good
3 afternoon, everyone. Let me thank you
4 all for coming. We're going to try to
5 get started.

6 My colleagues who are in their
7 offices, please come so we can get a
8 quorum. There is a meeting at 4 o'clock
9 at the School District where they are
10 supposed to vote themselves out of
11 existence, so we're trying to get our
12 hearing in so we can go there too after
13 our hearing, after we have our hearing.

14 And while we're waiting for my
15 colleagues to come, we're going to ask
16 our first panel to come forward at the
17 head table, Clarena Tolson, Christine
18 Derenick-Lopez, Uri Monson, and Alan
19 Butkovitz. They're our folks. So any of
20 that crew who is here, we invite you to
21 come forward while we're waiting for our
22 quorum.

23 As soon as we get our quorum,
24 one more, we will have the Clerk read the
25 title certainly of this bill and move

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 forward.

3 (Pause.)

4 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: If any
5 of you would like to testify, please see
6 Roxanne, who as soon as we start the
7 hearing will be standing here.

8 Roxanne, where are you?

9 She'll stand next to the gate,
10 and we want to make sure you all get your
11 names on the list. So please let her
12 know.

13 Roxanne, get your tablet ready
14 so that those who are on -- we already
15 have -- Rochelle Bilal, we already have
16 you, Michael Coard, Richard Hoy, Joseph
17 Valvo, Stephen Cottrells. And if I
18 didn't just say your name, please,
19 Roxanne, while we're ready.

20 I apologize, Vice Chair, for us
21 not getting together to talk about this
22 in detail.

23 All right. The Committee on
24 Finance is called into order. We are
25 here with regard to an amendment to Bill

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 No. 160111. We will ask the Clerk to
3 read the title of the bill.

4 THE CLERK: An ordinance
5 amending Chapter 12-2800 of The
6 Philadelphia Code, entitled
7 "Administrative Adjudication of Parking
8 Violations," to establish an amnesty
9 program for fines, fees and penalties on
10 parking violations; all under certain
11 terms and conditions.

12 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
13 you very much.

14 We note that we introduced this
15 a while ago, maybe around February or
16 something. We finally got to the point
17 where we think that we have enough
18 information and that there are enough
19 folks who want to testify and there's
20 enough information out that we think it's
21 ready for us to have a serious hearing.

22 I will make some opening
23 remarks and I'll ask anyone else who has
24 opening remarks and then we will begin
25 our testimony.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 So the reason for parking
3 management in any city or town is to
4 provide those who do business in the City
5 with convenient and curbside parking for
6 short visits to the City area or business
7 district.

8 People come to Center City
9 Philadelphia to do business, including
10 our own residents and visitors alike.
11 People come to visit our world-class
12 universities, to seek medical advice.
13 Others come seeking a great education and
14 visit hundreds of restaurants and
15 entertainment businesses, only to mention
16 a few.

17 Lately I am hearing horror
18 stories about parking tickets, old
19 parking tickets, that are becoming a
20 deterrent to people visiting and doing
21 business in Philadelphia. Many people
22 and businesses are jammed with financial
23 debt due to parking fines and penalties.

24 My constituents are from all
25 walks of life. They are extremely

11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

concerned that they and their family members have made mistakes in the past by not responding to parking tickets. These mistakes have multiplied in many cases and now a simple fine has become a fine plus extreme penalties. This has multiplied many times for the same person, the same family or the same business, and have become impossible to remedy and has become a gruesome financial burden.

An amnesty program would give all these individuals the chance to manage this debt, be granted some amnesty for past mistakes, and allow people to have a new beginning. The fear of the dreaded "boot" would be gone for some of those who -- for those who participate in this amnesty program.

I believe this program will bring many into compliance with their parking fines. These people will be able to begin to come back to Center City, to begin to feel safe on their blocks, in

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 their neighborhoods. The vitality of our
3 city and these businesses would grow.

4 The notion to visit other places will be
5 much, much better, and we believe people
6 could move around without being afraid of
7 a boot and without feeling victimized by
8 the Parking Authority.

9 We believe we have a plan that
10 could be a win-win for us all, for
11 visitors, residents, students,
12 businesses, and that we can move forward
13 together.

14 We have many other things we'd
15 like to talk about in the City. There
16 are many questions we're going to ask.
17 We received so much information,
18 information like in the last two months
19 there's been an increase in booting by
20 150 percent, that crews have gone from
21 two to five crews working at night in
22 residential neighborhoods to try to get
23 people and try to catch them.

24 We're tired of hearing that in
25 certain neighborhoods, poor neighborhoods

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 especially and minority neighborhoods,
3 they go down there. They boot. They
4 find a way, and they check all the cars
5 and boot block after block after block in
6 the same neighborhoods, and they choose
7 which neighborhoods they want to boot and
8 unfairly victimize our people.

9 We don't know what the
10 motivation is. We would like -- maybe
11 you can respond to that, you from the
12 Parking Authority who will now testify,
13 but we believe that it's not right for
14 the citizens of Philadelphia to feel like
15 victims of a Parking Authority, and we
16 think it's time for us to try to make a
17 difference.

18 We believe, as this bill says,
19 that if we allow for five years, 2013,
20 '14, '15, '16, and '17, that they be
21 allowed to pay 10 percent down and then
22 be given 24 months to pay it off and then
23 everything else wiped out, that people
24 have an opportunity to move forward with
25 a clean slate and that everybody wins.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 Everybody can win, because we believe the
3 City will bring in extra dollars. People
4 will have a clear slate.

5 And it's never been tried
6 before. So for all those who say we're
7 going to hurt schools, we're going to
8 hurt the budget, we're going to hurt this
9 or that, that has not -- it's never
10 happened before. It's a new idea. It's
11 a way to help us feel good about our city
12 again, make us feel not afraid to move
13 around. And we hope that representing
14 the Parking Authority that you will
15 consider this bill and that we can move
16 forward after this together.

17 Is there anyone else on the
18 panel who would like to make a comment?

19 Let me note that we have a
20 quorum. To my right, Councilwoman Cindy
21 Bass. To her right, Vice Chair Bob
22 Henon. To his right, Councilman Mark
23 Squilla. To my left, Councilman Bill
24 Greenlee, and to his left, Councilwoman
25 Blondell Reynolds Brown.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 Any comments?

3 (No response.)

4 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
5 you. Okay. Then we will ask you to
6 introduce yourself for the record and
7 open it up for your comments and
8 testimony.

9 MS. DERENICK-LOPEZ: Thank you,
10 Councilwoman Blackwell. Good afternoon.
11 My name is Christine Derenick--Lopez.
12 I'm the Chief Administrative Officer for
13 the City of Philadelphia. I am here to
14 testify on Bill No. 160111.

15 The Administration is committed
16 to supporting our residents and deeply
17 respects Councilwoman Blackwell's goal of
18 helping individuals of limited means. To
19 that end, we have proposed a parking
20 amnesty program that relieves undue
21 burdens while balancing potential impacts
22 to the School District. Specifically, we
23 have proposed a ten-year amnesty,
24 accessible through a 10 percent down,
25 24-month payment plan. This means that

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 for tickets more than ten years old,
3 participants would have the significant
4 late penalties that accrue, as well as
5 most boot, tow, and storage fees
6 forgiven.

7 The unfortunate truth is that
8 in spite of any bump in revenues from
9 participation in the amnesty, amounts
10 forgiven under this program will
11 inevitably translate into School District
12 losses. We would respectfully provide
13 the most accessible payment plan terms
14 possible and protect District revenues.
15 Nevertheless, we hear the Councilwoman's
16 steadfast call for an amnesty and are
17 open to a balanced approach. Uri Monson,
18 Chief Financial Officer for the School
19 District of Philadelphia, will be
20 testifying and can provide additional
21 information on the financial impact from
22 this bill to the School District.

23 The majority of Philadelphia
24 residents do pay their parking tickets.
25 In fact, 23,000 constituents are

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 currently in a payment plan. Based on
3 the Councilwoman's concerns, we are ready
4 to provide far more accessible payment
5 plan terms in addition to working out
6 amnesty or other provisions that balances
7 hardship, fairness, and the imperative of
8 protecting funding for schools. We
9 remain committed to finding a path
10 forward.

11 This concludes my testimony.
12 Thank you for the opportunity to appear
13 before you. I'm happy to answer any
14 questions you may have. Additionally,
15 representatives from the Parking
16 Authority and the School District of
17 Philadelphia, I believe they're also
18 presenting testimony, and then if it's
19 okay with you, we'll open it up for
20 questions. Does that sound good?

21 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL:
22 Certainly.

23 MS. DERENICK-LOPEZ: Thank you,
24 Councilwoman.

25 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 you.

3 MR. MONSON: Good afternoon,
4 Chair Blackwell, Vice Chair Henon, and
5 other members of City Council's Finance
6 Committee. My name is Uri Monson. I'm
7 the Chief Financial Officer for the
8 Philadelphia School District. I'm
9 pleased to present testimony regarding
10 Bill No. 160111 regarding the
11 establishment of an amnesty program for
12 fines, fees, and penalties on parking
13 violations and the potential impacts on
14 the annual payments the School District
15 receives from the Parking Authority.

16 As I've said previously before
17 Council, the School District effectively
18 receives any surplus funds the Parking
19 Authority recognizes at the end of its
20 fiscal year. I have also noted that the
21 School District has no control over any
22 of its revenues, and we're most concerned
23 that our revenue sources be recurring and
24 predictable to allow for proper planning
25 and investment in our schools.

11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

I'm unable to obtain prior year information on how much the Parking Authority collects annually for tickets that are more than three years old. I am aware that for the most recent three-month period, about \$2.3 million was collected for these tickets, but I can't account for seasonality of collections or the impact of the Parking Authority's new enforcement efforts.

Whether the actual annualized amount is 2.3 or over \$7 million, I'm confident that whatever reduced revenues are recognized by the Parking Authority will directly reduce the annual payments received by the School District. Either figure, 2.3 or 7 million, represents a significant portion of the \$10.3 million received by the District last fiscal year.

Projecting the extent of the impact on School District revenues is further exacerbated by the opaque nature of the financial information which is

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 provided to us by the Parking Authority.

3 I do want to thank City Council again for

4 getting the School District a seat at the

5 table during the periodic financial

6 update meetings with the Parking

7 Authority and the City. This has

8 provided some insight into the trends the

9 Parking Authority has seen during the

10 year, although the level of detail and

11 explanation of anomalies remains vague.

12 Effectively, we're given a check at the

13 end of the year, with a high-level

14 summary of how that figure was achieved.

15 This new initiative which will result in

16 an undetermined loss of revenues to the

17 Parking Authority serves only to provide

18 a handy justification for future

19 unexplained reductions in School District

20 funding.

21 For these reasons, I oppose the

22 adoption of Bill No. 160111.

23 That concludes my testimony,

24 and I'm happy to answer any questions at

25 the conclusion of the panel's testimony.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
3 you.

4 MS. O'CONNOR: Good afternoon.
5 I'm testifying on behalf of Clarena
6 Tolson from the Philadelphia Parking
7 Authority.

8 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: What's
9 your name? Say that again.

10 MS. O'CONNOR: Corinne
11 O'Connor. I'm the Deputy Executive
12 Director at the Philadelphia Parking
13 Authority.

14 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Forina
15 O'Connor?

16 MS. O'CONNOR: C-O-R-I-N-N-E.

17 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Say
18 that again.

19 MS. O'CONNOR: C-O-R-I-N-N-E.
20 O'Connor. I'm testifying today -- I'm
21 here to testify on Bill No. 160111.

22 As Council is aware, the
23 Philadelphia Parking Authority --

24 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: You're
25 Deputy Director? I'm sorry.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 MS. O'CONNOR: Excuse me?

3 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: What's
4 your title?

5 MS. O'CONNOR: Deputy Executive
6 Director.

7 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Deputy
8 Executive Director of the Parking
9 Authority?

10 MS. O'CONNOR: Yes.

11 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
12 you. Thank you.

13 MS. O'CONNOR: As Council is
14 aware, the Philadelphia Parking Authority
15 is an agent of the City of Philadelphia.
16 We're tasked with the duty of carrying
17 out the Traffic Code within the City of
18 Philadelphia. This includes the issuance
19 and collection of all parking violations
20 and fines.

21 To give you some insight of
22 ticket revenue, in 2016, \$79,068,554 was
23 collected from payments of parking
24 violations. In addition, \$24,608,536 is
25 still outstanding just from that year.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 On average, a ticket less than three
3 years old has a collection rate of 88
4 percent.

5 As previously stated, as an
6 agent of the City of Philadelphia, we
7 support the City testimony of moving
8 forward in creating a program in which we
9 all can support.

10 Thank you, and I will take any
11 questions.

12 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
13 you very much.

14 We note that the Parking
15 Authority gives out -- well, 1.5 in this
16 past year -- 1.6 million tickets a year.
17 That's some serious, serious tickets.

18 Are all of you finished with
19 your testimony?

20 MS. O'CONNOR: Yes.

21 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: And we
22 would say -- and we're going to move
23 quickly, before I call on Councilman
24 Greenlee -- that we know that you all are
25 offering instead of a five-year amnesty a

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 ten-year, and we don't know how people
3 can pay off -- we have someone who came
4 at the last hearing who was talking about
5 their car being taken and a bill for
6 \$10,000, and they had to go to the bank
7 and people -- it's just so much money,
8 and I don't know how people are going to
9 take ten years and pay off that amnesty
10 in 24 months. I don't think it's -- we
11 think five years is high. That was a
12 concession on my part, because we had
13 down two or three years. So we ended up,
14 to try to get my colleagues to agree,
15 with five years. But ten years is too
16 much money to expect people to be able to
17 pay in 24 months, and that's my opinion.
18 If somebody else has another opinion, of
19 course they're free to give it. And I
20 don't know how we can do that, nor -- you
21 know, this is something you all just came
22 up with. Nor has this panel, this
23 Finance Committee, had any time to
24 consider that.

25 Thank you.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 Councilman Greenlee.

3 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank
4 you, Madam Chair.

5 I'm just trying as much as
6 possible to kind of get down as much as a
7 figure as possible that, Mr. Monson, you
8 said that the School District could
9 possibly lose through this. So give me
10 those figures again. You said it could
11 be what and what, I believe?

12 MR. MONSON: So as I explained,
13 we're given limited data on this.

14 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Right. A
15 little closer to the mic, please.

16 MR. MONSON: Sorry.

17 For the last few months, it's
18 about \$2.3 million collected from the
19 tickets that were being discussed in this
20 bill. So if you assume that as the
21 minimum -- I don't know if that is, for
22 seasonality reasons, if that's higher or
23 normal than usual, and I don't have any
24 other data that I would normally have for
25 people to check. But if you assume that

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 is the minimum, if you annualize that
3 over the year, it would be close to 7
4 million.

5 So that's just the range I
6 gave. I'm working off the data I have.
7 It's not what I would normally be
8 comfortable giving you, but that's the
9 best I have to work off of.

10 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: I know
11 it's difficult to get exact figures in
12 this, because you don't know how many
13 people are going to participate and all
14 like that.

15 I guess, Ms. O'Connor, maybe
16 this question is for you. Obviously one
17 of the ideas of the amnesty besides
18 having certain tickets forgiven is hoping
19 people come forward, just like they did
20 with the real estate tax amnesty many
21 years ago. Is there a way to kind of
22 figure out -- because there's some people
23 that might not pay at all except that
24 they are offered amnesty. Am I making
25 sense?

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 MS. O'CONNOR: Yes.

3 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: I mean,
4 is there any way to kind of figure out or
5 have you given any thought to -- you're
6 saying there could be some money lost,
7 but could there be some money at least up
8 front made if there is an amnesty of some
9 portion? And we can debate how much.

10 MS. O'CONNOR: So it's believed
11 that once the amnesty is always offered,
12 that you do see that up --

13 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: I'm
14 sorry.

15 MS. O'CONNOR: It's believed
16 that once an amnesty is offered, you do
17 see that uptick for that short amount of
18 time, because you will have people come
19 in, but then in the years to follow, if
20 you're going to take an amnesty and take
21 a certain year where you're going to wipe
22 the slate clean, as we're calling it,
23 that revenue is never recovered.

24 So when you look at the revenue
25 that's outstanding to the City of

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 Philadelphia, each year that you wipe off
3 the slates, it's an additional \$18
4 million that the City is never going to
5 see again.

6 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: So when
7 you say \$18 million, that's \$18 million
8 money owed?

9 MS. O'CONNOR: To the City that
10 once the City threshold is hit, that the
11 schools would also see eventually. So
12 that's --

13 (Audience members talking.)

14 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Is there
15 any -- come on, folks.

16 Is there any way to figure
17 out -- because obviously one of the
18 debates here is how much we go back, is
19 it five years, is it seven years, is it
20 ten years, all that kind of thing. I
21 assume there must be some drop-off as you
22 go farther back in how much honey is
23 owed, right?

24 MS. O'CONNOR: Correct. But it
25 still stays -- it stays pretty high. It

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 stays within that \$15 to \$20 million.

3 Christine here would probably
4 like to speak on the amnesty that was
5 offered with the tax revenue at one point
6 to show the effects of that program.

7 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: That was
8 the tax?

9 MS. O'CONNOR: The tax.

10 MS. DERENICK-LOPEZ: So back in
11 Fiscal Year '10, there was a revenue -- a
12 tax amnesty that the Revenue Department
13 administered.

14 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Right.

15 MS. DERENICK-LOPEZ: So in
16 Fiscal Year 2010, there was an increase,
17 but for the following three fiscal years
18 there was a loss to the City of 18 -- a
19 little over \$18 million. So that's what
20 the City experienced from the last tax
21 amnesty, but that was, again, it was
22 revenue. It was taxes.

23 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: That was
24 taxes. And how much was gotten through
25 that time?

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 MS. DERENICK-LOPEZ: So the
3 Fiscal Year 2010, it looks like total
4 delinquent collections for Fiscal Year
5 2010 was 121.9.

6 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: So you
7 got a lot up front, but you're saying as
8 time went on, it went down, right?

9 MS. DERENICK-LOPEZ: That's my
10 understanding. Typically there's a bump
11 and then it goes down, and then you have
12 to really increase your collection
13 efforts in order to get it back on to its
14 normal collection rate.

15 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: So
16 collection efforts, I guess, when it
17 comes to parking tickets would then be
18 more aggressive booting or notification,
19 that kind of thing?

20 MS. DERENICK-LOPEZ: We didn't
21 do any scenario planning. I mean, we
22 know what the last tax amnesty program
23 brought. I mean, I think we'd have to do
24 some scenario planning to get an idea
25 what that potentially could look like.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: And I
3 know everything is different. I
4 understand that. It's a different
5 dynamic here with parking, but I'm just
6 thinking there at least would be some
7 bump originally, and then I guess we'd
8 have to figure, particularly depending on
9 how far back we go with the amnesty, how
10 much money could be lost, and obviously
11 none of us want to lose money for the
12 schools, guys. I think we all agree with
13 that, because we know what's facing us.

14 MS. DERENICK-LOPEZ: Right.

15 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: All
16 right.

17 Thank you, Madam Chair. Thank
18 you very much.

19 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
20 you very much.

21 Let me note that we were told
22 from your folks that less than 4.5
23 percent was collected after five years.
24 So that makes a difference. We were also
25 told by the Controller that when Joan

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 Krajewski did a tax amnesty program, that
3 some \$85 million was realized.

4 Let me ask you, and then I'm
5 calling on Councilwoman Bass and Henon
6 and then Squilla, what percentage of --
7 and all my colleagues. And Councilwoman
8 Reynolds Brown. What percentage of this
9 goes to the School District and what goes
10 to the City?

11 MS. O'CONNOR: So the state
12 code outlines how the money is broken
13 down that goes to the City and the
14 schools. It's different every year that
15 they have a baseline and then the
16 percentage. So you would basically have
17 to pull that code to understand --

18 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: But
19 how can you say then, give a specific
20 amount of what you're losing if you can't
21 say what is what and where it goes and
22 who gets it?

23 (Applause.)

24 MS. O'CONNOR: So this year
25 alone, the fiscal year that just ended,

11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

the City received almost 39 million and the schools received 10 million. Every year that baseline changes. That's what I was trying to explain. This year it could be -- once that gross revenue goes up, the baseline changes of what the City is going to receive and then what the -- and whatever is left over is what the schools will receive. So if this year the baseline goes up to 40 million, whatever is left over is what the schools will receive.

COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Yes.

Because we want to be real clear. So you've got to be fair. The School District gets 10 million and there's 100 million and the City gets the rest. You got to be straight and you've got to be clear, because all and all, it's still the taxpayers who pay it all.

(Applause.)

COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL:

Councilwoman Cindy Bass.

COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Yes. Thank

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 you. Thank you, Madam Chair.

3 So I guess I'm a little bit
4 troubled -- well, not even a little bit.
5 Quite a bit troubled that we can't speak
6 more precisely in terms of how much the
7 School District is losing, but that's the
8 primary argument for why this bill
9 shouldn't be considered. So it's kind of
10 hard to reconcile what you're telling us
11 and that it would make sense not to move
12 forward on this bill based on the revenue
13 that the District would lose, but you
14 can't give us a real calculation or an
15 estimate in terms of what that number
16 would be.

17 MS. O'CONNOR: May I answer to
18 that?

19 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Sure.

20 MS. O'CONNOR: So every year
21 the School District does not receive
22 their portion of the payment until the
23 books are closed at the end of the fiscal
24 year. So as we issue the check to the
25 City of Philadelphia, that happens on a

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 monthly basis. So as the gross revenue
3 happens and the net, a check is sent over
4 to the City every month. Once that money
5 is sent over every month, as I said, by
6 state code we follow that formula of what
7 has to go to the City first. So what is
8 left over is what goes to the school.
9 And what we're trying to testify is, with
10 the amnesty program, if less revenue
11 comes in and we meet, say, that 40
12 million but we only brought in 45, where
13 before the amnesty we probably would have
14 brought in 50, so whoever is going to see
15 the less money is going to be the School
16 District. That is what I believe what
17 Mr. Monson was trying to relay to you,
18 that at the end of the day, who is going
19 to get hurt first is the schools.

20 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: And I can
21 understand that, but at the same time, I
22 think a reasonable estimate should be
23 provided to the Council, to the
24 Committee. I think that it's not that
25 difficult to come up with an estimate,

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 because this is not something that we're
3 doing that's new. The amnesty would be
4 something -- actually, let me back up and
5 ask a question.

6 Has there ever been an amnesty
7 program through the Parking Authority?

8 MS. O'CONNOR: Since I've
9 worked there, I'm not aware of one. I've
10 been there since like 1990.

11 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: So when we
12 talked about amnesty programs, what we
13 were talking about were real estate
14 taxes, business taxes, City wage taxes,
15 things of that nature, which are
16 completely separate and can be a very
17 separate audience from those who are
18 paying parking tickets. Would you agree?

19 MS. O'CONNOR: Yes. They're
20 all separate.

21 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: So we've
22 never done it, and it's untested. So we
23 just don't know in terms of the amount
24 that the School District would lose, but
25 roughly let's go with the number -- I

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 think you said earlier about \$10 million
3 is what you thought; is that correct?

4 MS. O'CONNOR: Yeah. That's
5 what went to the schools last year.

6 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Okay. And
7 my statement to you is that based on the
8 School District's budget -- and I don't
9 want to minimize \$10 million, the
10 importance of any money to the School
11 District, but I think based on the size
12 of the School District of Philadelphia's
13 budget, to not do amnesty so that the
14 District could receive those funds
15 possibly, because you can't say for sure
16 whether they would receive them or not, I
17 think just is a little bit shortsighted
18 and it doesn't seem like the research has
19 really been done into what the total
20 effects would be. It feels like the same
21 people pay for everything and --

22 (Applause.)

23 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: And these
24 are citizens in the City of Philadelphia,
25 black and white, in our neighborhoods,

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 working folks, folks who get up every
3 day, go out, work hard, pay their bills,
4 and then end up jammed up with a parking
5 ticket. Maybe they got it. Maybe it
6 wasn't on the windshield. Maybe they got
7 two or three or whatever. And whether
8 we're talking about the Parking Authority
9 coming through and clearing out an entire
10 block, towing cars, ticketing cars,
11 booting cars, coming through our
12 neighborhoods, it really does feel like,
13 again, like a particular and targeted
14 population pays for so much of what
15 happens with our School District and with
16 our kids.

17 And so I think that we can do
18 amnesty. I think that it's not
19 unreasonable, and I think that the
20 Parking Authority, if they wanted to,
21 could go back to the table and help us to
22 figure this out, because I think that the
23 bill likely has support from this
24 Committee and probably would move
25 forward. And so I would urge the Parking

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 Authority to go back to the drawing board
3 and come up with a way to work with us,
4 because we'd like to work with you,
5 but --

6 MS. O'CONNOR: And we would
7 like to work with you, and I believe the
8 City's testimony had the offer that we
9 all support, the ten-year, and that's
10 what we testified, that we support the
11 City's testimony.

12 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Okay.

13 MS. O'CONNOR: So we did not
14 oppose what the City has testified to.
15 I've agreed to that.

16 COUNCILWOMAN BASS: Well, I
17 think the bill sponsor has something else
18 in mind. So I'm asking that if you want
19 to go back to the drawing table and come
20 up with something that works within the
21 framework of the bill sponsor,
22 Councilwoman Blackwell, then I think that
23 that's what should be done here.

24 Thank you.

25 MS. O'CONNOR: Okay.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 (Applause.)

3 MS. O'CONNOR: We are open to
4 future discussions on the matter,
5 definitely.

6 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
7 you.

8 Councilman Henon.

9 COUNCILMAN HENON: You can go
10 to Councilwoman Brown.

11 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL:
12 Councilwoman Reynolds Brown.

13 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Good
14 afternoon. Good afternoon, everyone.

15 (Good afternoon.)

16 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: When we
17 get to matters where we want to honor --
18 when we get to matters where we want to
19 honor all sides on the issue, the
20 challenge is having information that we
21 need so that we can make an informed
22 decision and -- information that we need
23 to make informed decisions. Two
24 Councilmembers, colleagues have asked for
25 information where there's still at least

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 for me a blur, and one has to speak with
3 the -- we know bottom line that all of us
4 want and expect that the School District
5 will continue to be a beneficiary,
6 because that's the number one, two, three
7 priority for those of us who pay taxes
8 when those dollars follow their way to
9 the School District.

10 Where I'm lost is and what
11 might be helpful with regards to
12 Councilwoman Bass's request, if you could
13 provide the last five years' history of
14 how much money has come in the Parking
15 Authority, and then you mentioned a
16 baseline and how that fluctuates year to
17 year, and then from that, what amount
18 that we know, because it's based on
19 history, goes to the School District.
20 That at least gives us a picture of the
21 financial operations over there at the
22 Parking Authority. So that would be
23 helpful to know.

24 Secondly, the question was, do
25 you know if there has ever been an

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 amnesty offered by the Parking Authority,
3 and the answer was not as long as I've
4 been there. So please help us. How long
5 have you been at the Parking Authority?

6 MS. O'CONNOR: 27 years.

7 (Audience members talking.)

8 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Please
9 allow me to get through my questions.

10 MS. O'CONNOR: I didn't know it
11 was bad to hold a job.

12 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Say what?

13 MS. O'CONNOR: I didn't know it
14 was bad to hold a job at this point.

15 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: So this in
16 many ways -- for this in many ways then,
17 therefore, might be a first. Is that a
18 fair assumption to make?

19 MS. O'CONNOR: Since I've been
20 employed there, since 1990, I'm not aware
21 of any amnesty program.

22 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay. In
23 response to the proposed policy
24 changes -- and I'm quoting here -- "In
25 order to maintain the amnesty reductions,

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 potential amnesty reductions, citizens
3 must remain compliant with future parking
4 tickets over the term of their payment
5 plans."

6 So what does compliant mean?
7 Does that mean no tickets or does that
8 mean tickets with prompt payment? How
9 would you define "compliance"?

10 MS. O'CONNOR: I would define
11 compliant as that if they received
12 additional tickets after getting into the
13 payment plan, that they would have to
14 make payment on those parking tickets.

15 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay. So
16 that's post then agreement?

17 MS. O'CONNOR: Correct.

18 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay. And
19 then it says, "Payment plans may be
20 extended from 12 to 24 months."

21 So what would drive or dictate
22 what circumstances when you say "may"?

23 MS. DERENICK-LOPEZ: So for
24 some of the constituents, they may not
25 want to go to 24 months. So we were

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 really leaving it open and at -- the
3 constituent would make that decision.

4 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay. And
5 then, lastly, we learned that from the
6 City's experience with the amnesty, which
7 ultimately ended up being a good thing,
8 there was an uptick, is the word that was
9 used, for a short amount of time. So
10 define for me "short amount of time." Is
11 that three months there was an uptick or
12 six months there was an uptick where you
13 saw a benefit from that initiative?

14 MS. DERENICK-LOPEZ: So my
15 understanding from the Finance
16 Department, it was during the amnesty
17 program. It was a 54-day amnesty
18 program. So during that period.

19 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: So it was
20 actually during the amnesty period?

21 MS. DERENICK-LOPEZ: Yes,
22 ma'am.

23 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay.
24 Potentially during the amnesty period,
25 down-payments may be reduced to 10

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 percent. However, the minimum monthly
3 payment is \$20. So what is currently the
4 Department's policy with regards to
5 down-payments on tickets? What's the
6 current practice?

7 MS. DERENICK-LOPEZ: So
8 currently -- so if it's your first time
9 in a plan or if you've completed a plan,
10 it's 25 percent down and then the balance
11 is in 12 months. For booted or towed,
12 it's 50 percent down and the balance in
13 12 months. And then if the constituent
14 happened to be in default in their plan,
15 it's 50 percent down and the balance is
16 in 12 months.

17 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay. So
18 that's helpful, because it's important to
19 know where we are now and what we're
20 trying to do better for citizens who end
21 up in this circumstance.

22 MS. DERENICK-LOPEZ: I agree.

23 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay,
24 then.

25 Thank you, Madam Chairwoman.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
3 you.

4 Councilman Squilla.

5 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you,
6 Madam Chair.

7 I'm a little confused too on
8 just the difference between what
9 Councilwoman Blackwell's bill has for a
10 five-year amnesty and you're offering a
11 ten-year amnesty. Is there an amount
12 number why you would want that
13 difference? Or what is the difference in
14 what you're suggesting compared to what
15 we are suggesting?

16 MS. O'CONNOR: So as I
17 testified earlier, for each year that --
18 I think what we looked at with the
19 amnesty program, if you came in and you
20 paid your less than five years tickets,
21 the rest of your record would be wiped
22 clean, correct?

23 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Right.

24 MS. O'CONNOR: So basically we
25 offered ten years, because for each year

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 between five and ten, you're seeing that
3 you're taking off the books per se \$18 to
4 \$20 million. So you're looking at like
5 \$100 million that would potentially go to
6 the City that would be erased.

7 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Do we know
8 how many people -- you have a list of
9 everybody who has back tickets, correct?

10 MS. O'CONNOR: Correct.

11 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And you
12 notify them monthly?

13 (Audience members yelling
14 "no.")

15 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Let her
16 answer.

17 MS. O'CONNOR: I didn't get
18 your question.

19 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: You have a
20 list of everybody who owes tickets 20
21 years to today. How often do you send
22 out notices?

23 MS. O'CONNOR: So when you
24 first receive a notice, you're going to
25 receive about five notices. When you

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 first receive a parking violation, if you
3 did not pay, you receive about five
4 notices. I think as the audience, by
5 their reaction, if you have a ticket
6 that's like 15 years old, you're not
7 going to keep getting a notice every
8 three weeks. That's just not something
9 that happens. So basically that's the
10 answer to that.

11 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So --

12 MS. O'CONNOR: As you get
13 parking tickets, you're going to get
14 notices. As you get into the
15 boot-eligible file, you're going to get a
16 notice to that. So every ticket gets
17 seven to eight notices once you get a
18 parking violation and you don't pay that
19 parking violation. But as that ticket
20 gets five, ten years old, you're not
21 going to keep getting a notice every two
22 months.

23 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: What is
24 the total number owed that's beyond five
25 years?

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 MS. O'CONNOR: Five to infinity
3 is what you're asking?

4 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Yes; five
5 to 100.

6 MS. O'CONNOR: I would have to
7 add that up.

8 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: You don't
9 know?

10 MS. O'CONNOR: I mean, off the
11 top of my head, no.

12 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And I
13 think it was said --

14 MS. O'CONNOR: I have it, but
15 I'd have to add that up.

16 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Councilman
17 Greenlee had said that the longer it
18 goes, it's less and less, I would
19 imagine?

20 MS. O'CONNOR: Correct.

21 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Unless you
22 include interest and penalties and all
23 those other stuff.

24 MS. O'CONNOR: Well, there's no
25 interest. It's just penalties.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: There's no
3 interest. It's just penalties?

4 MS. O'CONNOR: Right.

5 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So I think
6 what we need to know is -- I'm confused
7 on what your offer is compared to --
8 except it's a five-year difference with
9 the same thing?

10 MS. O'CONNOR: Yes. So as
11 Christine has testified, if she wants to
12 go over it again, the less down-payment
13 on a payment plan, a longer payment plan.
14 Just instead of going back five years, we
15 were saying back ten years.

16 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All right.
17 Thank you.

18 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL:
19 Councilman Henon.

20 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you,
21 Madam Chair.

22 And I guess one of the
23 shortcomings of letting -- I guess
24 collegiate courtesy is, some of the
25 questions were asked, but let me start

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 off by acknowledging that the
3 Councilwoman, our Chairperson, Chair
4 Lady, really represents her district
5 phenomenal and really is looking after
6 people who need some support and some
7 help from government. So I want to
8 applaud her for her ingenuity here in
9 coming up with an amnesty program.

10 For me, I have a lot --

11 (Applause.)

12 COUNCILMAN HENON: I have a lot
13 of questions that I would like to ask,
14 and as a few members had already stated,
15 I'm going to be asking for some
16 information.

17 So, first, state code. What is
18 required for the state code? What is
19 that trigger number? I know you said it
20 changes, but how is that baseline set?

21 MS. O'CONNOR: So it's based
22 off of the gross revenue that comes into
23 the Parking Authority.

24 COUNCILMAN HENON: Gross
25 revenue, which changes.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 MS. O'CONNOR: Right. And then
3 it goes up a percentage. If the gross
4 revenue increases, then that percentage
5 that goes to the City increases. So I
6 don't know the exact percentage, so I
7 don't want to testify to a wrong number.

8 COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay.

9 MS. O'CONNOR: But I could go
10 back and pull the code and send it to all
11 the Councilpeople.

12 COUNCILMAN HENON: If you could
13 do that through the Chair, that would be
14 wonderful.

15 MS. O'CONNOR: Okay.

16 COUNCILMAN HENON: And the
17 split on what went to the School District
18 for the past five to ten years, because
19 that's what we're talking --

20 MS. O'CONNOR: Correct.

21 COUNCILMAN HENON: That's what
22 we're talking about right now.

23 You had mentioned \$18 million
24 per year that will be lost. Is that
25 because we're not having recurring

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 delinquency collections? Is that what
3 you're assuming?

4 MS. O'CONNOR: No. The
5 testimony, we're saying if we do an
6 amnesty program back five years, if we do
7 back ten years, so each year between five
8 and ten there's an outstanding debt of
9 about \$18 to \$20 million.

10 COUNCILMAN HENON: Because
11 there's more people, there's more
12 delinquency, right?

13 MS. O'CONNOR: Right. It's
14 basically that people haven't paid their
15 parking tickets. So if you take -- if
16 you go back amnesty, if your ticket is
17 five years or older, that year's slate is
18 wiped clean, that's revenue that is
19 basically wiped clean.

20 COUNCILMAN HENON: So what is
21 your delinquency collections for the
22 first five years?

23 MS. O'CONNOR: How much you
24 want to know that's outstanding?

25 COUNCILMAN HENON: Just

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 percentage.

3 MS. O'CONNOR: Well, less than
4 three-year-old tickets, 88 percent of
5 citizens pay their tickets.

6 COUNCILMAN HENON: 88 percent
7 of the citizens?

8 MS. O'CONNOR: Yes, less than
9 three years old. As they get older, it
10 gets harder to collect.

11 COUNCILMAN HENON: So you go
12 from 88 percent for the first three
13 years, one to three years. And between
14 years four and five?

15 MS. O'CONNOR: You're getting
16 into like the upper 70's.

17 COUNCILMAN HENON: And then it
18 drops to 4 percent after five years?

19 MS. O'CONNOR: No.

20 COUNCILMAN HENON: Somebody
21 made a statement saying --

22 MS. O'CONNOR: I wasn't clear
23 on that statement.

24 COUNCILMAN HENON: -- that the
25 collections are 4 percent.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 MS. O'CONNOR: I wasn't real
3 clear on that statement actually.

4 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Yes.
5 I said 4.5 percent, less than that.

6 COUNCILMAN HENON: Less than 4
7 percent. So I'm going to pose it as a
8 question. Could you get me the
9 collection rates from one to five years
10 and then from five to ten years and then
11 put a dollar value. So right now -- and
12 it's unclear on who has the right numbers
13 so we can make an informed decision here
14 and what goes to the City, what revenues
15 the Parking Authority is collecting, what
16 the City is getting, what the School
17 District is getting.

18 So one to five years, there's
19 \$118 million outstanding in delinquency;
20 is that correct, roughly?

21 MS. O'CONNOR: Correct.

22 COUNCILMAN HENON: And if we
23 forgive, assuming just like we are -- and
24 Uri would know this with pensions, our
25 unfunded liability. You assume that

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 everybody -- that's how you come up with
3 the unfunded, everybody is going to
4 collect the benefit at once.

5 So if everybody enrolls in the
6 program of the \$118 million that's
7 outstanding, after five years what is
8 being forgiven? Do you have that number?

9 MS. O'CONNOR: About 100
10 million is what I could see.

11 COUNCILMAN HENON: That's 100
12 million after five years?

13 MS. O'CONNOR: That's just in
14 between the five and ten years.

15 COUNCILMAN HENON: That assumes
16 everybody gets into a payment plan and
17 pays their -- they pay their principal,
18 their penalties, their interest,
19 their towing?

20 MS. O'CONNOR: There's no
21 interest. Absolutely no interest.

22 COUNCILMAN HENON: No interest.
23 So what are they paying?

24 MS. O'CONNOR: Their fine and
25 their penalties.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 COUNCILMAN HENON: Their fine
3 and their penalties.

4 MS. O'CONNOR: And the
5 penalties.

6 COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay. So if
7 you go to ten years, what would that --
8 that's 118 million, plus what's the other
9 five years?

10 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: I'm
11 told on your ten-year, you're not
12 forgiving fines and penalties even though
13 ten years is no amnesty. Having to pay
14 off ten years in 24 months, that's not an
15 amnesty. And you all also want to keep
16 on fines and penalties. That's not an
17 amnesty. That's nothing.

18 COUNCILMAN HENON: So principal
19 and fines --

20 (Applause.)

21 COUNCILMAN HENON: So principal
22 and fines for ten years, do you know what
23 that is?

24 MS. O'CONNOR: So before 2007,
25 you're still looking at now more in the

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 20 to 25 million each year for those
3 outstanding revenues. That's the -- I
4 have figures up to like 1990. 1990 is
5 the farthest we can go back, and that's a
6 very low number. That's only a couple
7 million.

8 COUNCILMAN HENON: So another
9 \$125 million on top of the 118 million;
10 is that what you're saying?

11 MS. O'CONNOR: Well, it's
12 actually more than that. So we're
13 discussing that if we go back ten years.
14 Every year you're looking at 18, 20
15 million. As I get older and I get into
16 like the year 2000, there's about 25
17 million outstanding. So it's actually
18 more money outstanding. As the ticket
19 gets older and older, it gets harder to
20 collect.

21 COUNCILMAN HENON: So what is
22 your process in delinquencies?

23 MS. O'CONNOR: What is my
24 process?

25 COUNCILMAN HENON: What is the

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 internal process of delinquencies? Do
3 you have a third-party processor or do
4 you in house --

5 MS. O'CONNOR: So, yes. We
6 have a vendor who sends out all the
7 notices. He then has a few
8 subcontractors who also send out notices
9 within the first four years of a parking
10 violation. After four years, we have --
11 the Philadelphia Parking Authority has
12 some collection agencies that we then
13 have them collect on old tickets.

14 COUNCILMAN HENON: So if I can
15 make a request on five years and ten
16 years, the aggregate amount with fines,
17 penalties, towing. So like if
18 somebody -- assume somebody is
19 delinquent. What is the principal, what
20 are the fines, what are the towing costs,
21 if you can break that down in categories.

22 MS. O'CONNOR: Yes.

23 COUNCILMAN HENON: And what
24 would the amnesty be forgiven after five
25 years and ten years.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 MS. O'CONNOR: Based on 100
3 percent?

4 COUNCILMAN HENON: Baseline 100
5 percent. And the School District data,
6 which I think Uri said that you really
7 don't have. I don't know why we don't
8 have that information here at this
9 hearing, because I think it's critical
10 when it comes to numbers, especially
11 going into next year when we have a
12 pretty significant deficit.

13 And also my last request would
14 be if you could map the targeted
15 delinquency areas and boot areas and just
16 provide that to the Chair.

17 MS. O'CONNOR: So we have all
18 different zones that we do boot
19 enforcement, which is the whole City of
20 Philadelphia.

21 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: We
22 have a point of information on the table.
23 Excuse me.

24 COUNCILMAN HENON: So the
25 request -- and I understand that you do

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 it --

3 MS. O'CONNOR: So would you
4 like to see --

5 COUNCILMAN HENON: I would like
6 to see where numbers of pocket of areas
7 where the boots are and the delinquencies
8 are and who is paying and who is not
9 paying.

10 MS. O'CONNOR: I mean, would it
11 be best to show you, say, like three
12 months of where the daily --

13 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Give
14 us what he's asking for.

15 MS. O'CONNOR: I know, but --

16 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: We
17 don't need you to restate it, and besides
18 that, we have a point of information on
19 the floor.

20 Councilwoman.

21 MS. O'CONNOR: I'm just trying
22 to get clear on what --

23 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Excuse
24 me. We have a point of information on
25 the floor. That is to be heard first.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Yes, yes,
3 yes. And I'm actually -- Councilman
4 Henon is drilling down exactly where I
5 was hoping we needed to go, because
6 believe it or not, Councilman Henon, I
7 had a similar question.

8 So it would be helpful in
9 response to Councilman Henon's question
10 to show us by councilmanic district what
11 is happening with regards to booting.

12 And what were those other
13 areas, Councilman? Towing?

14 (Audience members yelling out.)

15 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: So if you
16 can show us by councilmanic district,
17 then that really gives us a clearer
18 picture of where those practices are not
19 equal.

20 MS. O'CONNOR: So would you
21 like -- so to clarify, you want to get a
22 map of the boot areas that we enforce
23 every day by councilmanic district. And
24 what else would you like?

25 COUNCILMAN HENON: How about we

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 do this: How about I provide you with a
3 list of questions that I will run by this
4 Committee, and you could respond to the
5 Chair. Because I will, at the will of
6 this Committee, depending upon what their
7 will is on this bill, but on final
8 passage, I am not going to be committed
9 to anything until I get the information
10 that we request.

11 MS. O'CONNOR: Okay.

12 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL:

13 Councilman Oh and then Councilman
14 Greenlee.

15 COUNCILMAN OH: I don't have
16 questions.

17 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
18 you.

19 Councilman Greenlee.

20 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: One last
21 thing. I'm sorry. Thank you, Madam
22 Chair.

23 As Councilwoman Bass said,
24 obviously the other amnesty involved
25 different things. It was taxes. And I

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 understand where you have to base certain
3 figures on thinking everybody is going to
4 participate, but it's probably also not
5 realistic that everybody is going to
6 participate.

7 Christine, do you know how many
8 percentage-wise of people who were
9 delinquent in the tax actually
10 participated? Would you have anything
11 like that?

12 MS. DERENICK-LOPEZ:
13 Councilman, I don't have that
14 information, but I can definitely get it
15 from the Revenue Department.

16 (Audience members talking.)

17 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Could you
18 get that for us? And I understand the
19 figures you're giving us, and I know
20 usually when --

21 Come on, guys, please.

22 And I understand when you give
23 these estimates, you're basing it on
24 everybody participating, because I guess
25 you have to assume that, but also

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 realistically not everybody is going to
3 do it, either by not knowing about it or
4 not wanting to or whatever. So those
5 figures may be a little bit different
6 too. And I know it's hard to get exact
7 figures. We understand that, but we're
8 trying to get as much information as we
9 can, I guess. All right? Thank you.

10 Thank you, Madam Chair.

11 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
12 you.

13 And let me note that the
14 Administration wanted us to -- all this
15 we just heard on our way in. They wanted
16 to change the bill and have us not put so
17 many details in it so they would have the
18 wherewithal to do that. Now, how can we
19 do that when they don't have the
20 information we're asking for?

21 (Applause.)

22 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: We
23 tried to do all we could, as much detail
24 as we could to be fair to all sides, but
25 they didn't. They don't have the

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 information, and they're the ones who are
3 holders of the information. So that's
4 one of the reasons why we have to do what
5 we think is best. And I'm also told
6 that not all of the figures they're
7 giving us are correct figures. I'm told
8 that now as well.

9 What we're going to do is ask
10 that each of the three of you remain.
11 We're going to have other people who may
12 come with questions. I'm going to ask
13 you to remain while we call up others to
14 testify.

15 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Council
16 Lady, can I repeat my request?

17 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Yes.
18 Councilwoman Blondell Reynolds
19 Brown.

20 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: I want to
21 be clear that we're clear what the asks
22 are following this. And the grid for the
23 last five years history of the gross
24 amount that the Parking Authority has
25 taken in, the net that comes to the

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 agency, what then ultimately goes to the
3 School District, and then what portion of
4 that is broken out in fines,
5 delinquencies, and penalties so that we
6 can see a picture of what we're dealing
7 with. That's after you take care of the
8 matters to the gross revenue -- matters
9 to the state.

10 Thank you. Thank you, Madam
11 Chairwoman.

12 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
13 you.

14 We note here -- I did not read
15 this. I was supposed to yesterday. I
16 have information here the PPA has issued
17 an estimated 7.5 million tickets since
18 2012. Zip codes like 19121 in lower
19 North Philadelphia raked up over 120,000
20 parking tickets since 2012 and
21 neighborhoods 19140, 41, and 44 where
22 poverty rates range from 20 to 36
23 percent, ticket writing is epidemic. And
24 since 2012, 184,000 tickets have been
25 issued in 19140 with 36 percent poverty

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 rate; 179,000 tickets in 19141 with 20
3 percent poverty rates; and 105,000
4 tickets in 19144.

5 So that's just a few of them.
6 I could go on and on and won't, although
7 I will make this information available to
8 my colleagues who represent this area so
9 that they may have this. I was supposed
10 to have this ready today. I got so much
11 info, did not read it. So we're going to
12 let Councilwoman Bass, we're going to
13 make a copy of this for her now. And as
14 I said, I'm hearing that some of the
15 figures you're saying are not true.

16 (Applause.)

17 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: And as
18 you've also said, you don't have the
19 information for the School District. You
20 want to talk about what you all collect,
21 but you don't want to talk about its
22 effect honestly on the School District or
23 the communities. And, again, I will
24 repeat it. Some people didn't hear it,
25 that I said that I've heard about how you

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 go through neighborhoods street by street
3 and you take all the cars on the street
4 and try to tow them all, in poor
5 neighborhoods and minority neighborhoods.
6 I've heard how you're going from --
7 you've added curfews at night so that --
8 and more crews. There were two in the
9 day. Now there are three more crews at
10 night to go through poor neighborhoods in
11 our city. And it's just so unfair that
12 the public is made victims of the Parking
13 Authority. It's not fair, and we don't
14 intend to let it continue to exist.

15 (Applause.)

16 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: That's
17 where we are.

18 So, again, we're going to ask
19 you to wait while we have others testify.

20 Panel 2, Michael Coard,
21 Richard --

22 COUNCILMAN HENON:
23 Councilwoman.

24 Excuse me. Before you leave, I
25 know there's a lot of confusion, a lot of

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 cross-talk on requests for information.
3 I hope we can go back to the transcripts
4 here and maybe we'll compile a very
5 concise list that's specific to make it
6 easier for the request. I have a lot of
7 information that I want to request and,
8 again, I will support the sponsor of the
9 bill on the Committee, but I'm not ready
10 to vote on anything final until we
11 receive the information that these
12 members have requested.

13 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Well,
14 the vote is on our side. They don't want
15 a vote. They don't want amnesty. So
16 saying you won't support it doesn't help
17 us. It helps them.

18 COUNCILMAN HENON: So we have a
19 lot of information. So if you could
20 provide the information as quickly as
21 possible, it would be better.

22 MS. DERENICK-LOPEZ: We'll
23 definitely do that, Councilman. Thank
24 you.

25 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: We're

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 going to ask that you wait, sit to the
3 side while we ask Panel 2, Michael Coard,
4 Esquire; Richard Hoy, Esquire; Joseph
5 Valvo, Esquire; Stephen Cottrells. And
6 then after that, we want Rochelle Bilal,
7 and we'll deal with public from there on.

8 (Witnesses approached witness
9 table.)

10 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: All
11 right, gentlemen and ladies, thank you.
12 Thank you for being here. Michael Coard
13 may have gone. Richard Hoy, Joseph
14 Valvo, Stephen Cottrells, and Rochelle
15 Bilal.

16 And, again, we're asking the
17 first panel to wait so that you may hear
18 these concerns just in case you don't
19 know.

20 Thank you. Feel free to
21 introduce yourself for the record and
22 make your testimony. Thank you so much
23 for being here.

24 MR. VALVO: Absolutely. Good
25 afternoon. My name is Joseph Valvo. I'm

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 here today to testify with respect to the
3 bill. I apologize to the panel that I
4 did not write down the particular numbers
5 of that bill. I would ask that they be
6 provided to the record by someone who has
7 it in front of them.

8 Now, what I came here today to
9 testify and discuss is going to be in
10 just a moment a case study, which is an
11 actual parking dilemma, if you will, of
12 an individual in the City who I
13 represented pro bono. But before I do
14 that, I have to comment just a little bit
15 on some of the testimony I heard, as we
16 note we talk a lot about the math. And I
17 think it's important to note that when we
18 talk about the figures, at least as I
19 understand it, 100 million, 118 million,
20 et cetera, we're talking about accounts
21 receivable. We're talking about the
22 collections of monies that someone says
23 is owed. We're not talking about dollars
24 in pocket that are being spent. And I
25 say that because at the end of the case

11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

study I present, I will tie in to the fact that I think the technique being used of taking very low-value vehicles off the street is effectively enhancing the accounts receivable problem that the Department continually points to as the critical item that causes it to be necessary to take the actions they are. In a courtroom we would call it bootstrapping. And from the perspective of an independent case study, we suggest the following:

I was contacted by an individual. That individual must remain nameless, as I have not had the opportunity to ask them if I could present their data. But with respect to their case, the individual profiles as a 40-year-old lifelong resident of the City and County of Philadelphia who at the age of 40 has two prosthetic hips from a birth complication, a five-year-old child, and is currently receiving healthcare from the Department of Public

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 Assistance.

3 That individual was given a
4 motor vehicle by a friend/relative to
5 assist with the issues we've just
6 detailed and, quite frankly, over the
7 course of a 13-month period collected
8 approximately 13 individual parking
9 tickets in Philadelphia, more than half
10 of which were issued within one block of
11 the home that individual lives in,
12 because anyone who lives in South
13 Philadelphia understands there's not
14 enough parking places for the vehicles,
15 so at night you must hang off the
16 corners, unless you want to drive around
17 in your car all night long with your
18 five-year-old in the back screaming.

19 (Applause.)

20 MR. VALVO: This individual
21 contacted me, and I went to a hearing
22 before the examiners, if you will, at the
23 Parking Authority at 9th and Filbert. At
24 the conclusion of that discussion, it was
25 noted to me that there was a \$1,300

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 approximately debt owed and there was no
3 payment plan available for various
4 reasons that I cannot detail, but I
5 accepted at the time as true.

6 I made clear to the individuals
7 then that that person would simply not be
8 able to pay that amount at this time or
9 at any time in the foreseeable future and
10 offered a copy of the original title of
11 the vehicle to Parking Authority and
12 said, Please take this now. Do not
13 charge storage fees on the vehicle. Sell
14 it immediately so 100 percent of the
15 proceeds can go toward the debt owed on
16 the citations, approximately \$1,300.

17 I was responded to take it up
18 with the higher administration, which as
19 counsel, I did. And I will say that I
20 did get some access up the food chain in
21 Parking Authority, and they explained to
22 me that they're a collections agent for
23 the City, that there is no mechanism to
24 take a title, and they weren't interested
25 in that action.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 They then sold the vehicle at
3 sale. As a net result, the client
4 received a bill not for the tickets but
5 for the storage and the towing for
6 \$1,050. Still owes \$1,070 against the
7 citations despite the sale. That means
8 that a \$1,300 debt was turned into a
9 \$2,100 debt by the action of taking the
10 vehicle. I suggest that this causes a
11 number of problems.

12 Number one, there's an obvious
13 human factor here at play that seems to
14 be lost on our prior witnesses who
15 testified.

16 I concede as a private
17 businessman that collections of
18 receivables is one of the most
19 frustrating elements of business.
20 However, the kind of cold business-like
21 approach to the human issues that
22 obviously exist was a bit disheartening
23 for Council as I sat here and listened.

24 The second problem that comes
25 is that they have now as a result of this

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 action, again selling the motor vehicle
3 against the will of this individual,
4 increased that individual's debt,
5 increased their own bottom line
6 receivables, which they hold out to you
7 as the problem that exists that needs to
8 be corrected.

9 Now, I don't know how many of
10 the various tows around this city fall
11 into that category, but I'm immensely
12 certain my client isn't the only one.

13 It seems to me that when you
14 know as the agency not only with respect
15 to the human factors of the people who
16 you are in charge to serve but even basic
17 collection law principles, we do not
18 collect and use collection techniques to
19 harass or punish. They are supposed to
20 be designed to satisfy the debt. If you
21 know as the agency it costs approximately
22 \$1,000 for towing and storage and you
23 have the exact number of the debt with
24 respect to the tickets, if you pick a
25 vehicle up off the street that does not

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 have a book value that equals the
3 combination of those two figures, then
4 you have purposely punished the
5 individual for tickets, because you
6 cannot possibly collect a cent.

7 (Applause.)

8 MR. VALVO: It is within the
9 boundaries of that case study that I
10 suggest not only is the amnesty bill as
11 introduced very appropriate but, quite
12 frankly, I think there are even some more
13 measures that can be taken, especially
14 with pulling low-value vehicles off the
15 street.

16 You don't need to be a car
17 expert to plug in, which Parking
18 Authority has, the make, model, year of
19 the vehicle, the Kelley Blue Book, and it
20 will tell you instantaneously the book
21 value of the vehicle, which in many
22 cases -- and I think many of the people
23 here would say -- they don't own their
24 vehicle for the sake of its book value.
25 They own it for its practical value,

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 because it could take them to the doctor,
3 because it could take their children to
4 school, because it allows them to go get
5 their groceries. And when you take that
6 from them, without any real ability to
7 diminish the debt that they owe you, you
8 have punished, you have not collected,
9 and I suggest that is intolerable.

10 (Applause.)

11 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
12 you very much.

13 MR. VALVO: I thank you for
14 your time and attention, and I'm
15 certainly prepared to answer any
16 questions that may be asked.

17 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
18 you very much.

19 Mr. Hoy.

20 MR. HOY: My name is Richard
21 Hoy. I have been an attorney in
22 Philadelphia for 45 years, and I believe
23 everybody on this panel except for
24 Councilman Oh I'm very familiar with.
25 Mr. Valvo graduated from law school, and

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 I trained him in parking law, so he's
3 very good at it.

4 The problem we have is a
5 twofold problem. We have a Parking
6 Authority problem and we also have a
7 Philadelphia Traffic Court problem too,
8 because they're involved in taking these
9 cars.

10 (Applause.)

11 MR. HOY: When you're stopped,
12 lives stop in the City. Your car is
13 immediately taken, and you wind up in
14 Traffic Court trying to get your traffic
15 ticket straightened out, but then you got
16 to go over to the parking window after
17 Traffic Court releases you to the Parking
18 Authority. They have no criteria up
19 there. They want their money and they
20 want it now or you're not getting your
21 car back. This is part of their problem.

22 They have no amnesty. They've
23 never had anything. They don't want
24 anything, because it's going to cause
25 them to get less revenue in. They don't

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 want -- they want -- they got the little
3 guy there at Traffic Court and they're
4 going to twist it out of them or he's not
5 getting his car back and he's not going
6 to be able, like Joe said, go to work,
7 get his children to the doctors, get his
8 mother to the doctors, and he's going to
9 wind up just giving up the car.

10 But do you know how he goes and
11 gets a new car? The Parking Authority.
12 He goes to the auctions and buys the
13 cheap car, because they sell them cheap.
14 That's how he gets his car. A lot of my
15 clients do it. They can't afford the
16 Mercedes, so they afford the five or six
17 hundred dollar clunker that can get them
18 around.

19 We need an amnesty bill. I'm
20 going to tell you, Councilwoman
21 Blackwell, I don't think five years. I
22 think three years.

23 (Applause.)

24 MR. HOY: And I'll tell you
25 why. That's the law in the State of

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 Pennsylvania. You have three years
3 statute of limitations on every ticket in
4 all the counties of Pennsylvania except
5 Philadelphia. Philadelphia does a little
6 smart-ass thing they do. They put a date
7 certain when you get a ticket, and then
8 if you don't come in for your first
9 hearing, they find you guilty in
10 absentia, and then the statute of
11 limitation ends. But the rest of the
12 counties in Pennsylvania still have
13 statute of limitations. Philadelphia
14 doesn't, because the Philadelphia Traffic
15 Court got smart and it backs up all the
16 tickets.

17 We need a three-year statute of
18 limitations back with parking tickets,
19 because at one time parking tickets --
20 and there's a couple on the Council here
21 would know this and you, Councilwoman
22 Blackwell. They used to be criminal
23 matters at one time. Okay? And we
24 de-criminalized them. Now we make them
25 money matters, totally money matters.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 Philadelphia Traffic Court, at
3 least I will give them credit for one
4 thing. If you need a payment plan in
5 Philadelphia Traffic Court, you can go in
6 and sit with them and get a payment plan.
7 They don't fleece you. They don't kill
8 you in the payment plan thing. They'll
9 take 5 percent down or something like
10 that, and they'll give you some time to
11 pay it off, much better than what they're
12 suggesting here, much better.

13 The only problem with
14 Philadelphia Traffic Court is they have
15 in excess of \$225 million out on the
16 streets of Philadelphia that they haven't
17 collected, and they only go through maybe
18 40 or 50 payment plans a day with one
19 person.

20 This is going to need a
21 restructuring of the Parking Authority if
22 they're going to do what's necessary to
23 help these people. They're going to have
24 to sit down and look at individual cases,
25 because you have people coming in that

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 are on Social Security, SSI. They don't
3 have the money to pay these things. They
4 will pay something each month and they
5 will make an effort, but they don't have
6 what they expect, 25 percent down, 50
7 percent down, because you're taking a \$35
8 traffic ticket or parking ticket and now
9 it's \$90 and they're just -- they should
10 take that off and start off with that
11 figure. But they don't want to do this,
12 and I can see right now how they're going
13 to fight you all the way. Right to the
14 second floor of this building they're
15 going to try too. Tell them you're going
16 to lose -- they're throwing the
17 schoolchildren out. The schoolchildren
18 are now, pardon me, are thrown in front
19 of the bus. They're using that, and --
20 (Audience member yelling out.)
21 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: That's
22 right.
23 MR. HOY: And that's not right.
24 We will provide for our
25 schoolchildren, whether it's through the

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 Parking Authority or through something
3 else. We will provide for them. So just
4 don't keep throwing out we're not
5 going -- you're not going to get any
6 money for the schoolchildren if you do
7 this. These people will all benefit and
8 they'll all take care of their kids.

9 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: That's
10 right.

11 Thank you both very, very, very
12 much. Thank you very, very, very much.

13 (Applause.)

14 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL:
15 Mr. Stephen Cottrells and Michael Coard
16 are not here. And let me note that in
17 our bill, we talk about towing and
18 storage fees for a vehicle where we ask
19 for 30 percent payment and 70 percent
20 wiped out. We even are dealing with
21 that, but that's why they don't want to
22 deal with the rest of our bill, because
23 we tried to deal with all issues that
24 people have to consider and they don't
25 want to do that and they claim they don't

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 understand what we have.

3 So we'll move ahead. We're
4 very, very glad to have you. We're going
5 to ask that you, Rochelle Bilal,
6 introduce yourself to the record. Thank
7 you for coming last time. Thank you for
8 being here this time. And next to her
9 we're going to ask Adrian Clements,
10 Arnette Woodall, Nyerere Parks, and
11 Kalunji Hashim to come forward.

12 (Witnesses approached witness
13 table.)

14 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
15 you. Thank you so much. Would you
16 introduce yourself for the record and
17 make your testimony, and thank you for
18 all the support.

19 MS. BILAL: Good afternoon.

20 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Good
21 afternoon.

22 MS. BILAL: I'm Rochelle Bilal.
23 I'm a citizen of Philadelphia my entire
24 life. I'm presently the President of the
25 Guardian Civic League and I've been the

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 Secretary of the Philadelphia branch of
3 the NAACP since 2004.

4 I'm here to support the bill
5 that you introduced, Councilwoman Jannie.
6 Let me say this: I got more than 250
7 signatures here from people who are being
8 hurt.

9 I'm kind of really disappointed
10 in the people that came from the Parking
11 Authority and the school, because what
12 they just did here today to me was like a
13 coward, putting a child up in front of
14 them when the assailant was shooting at
15 them.

16 They come here putting a child
17 in front of them claiming what's going to
18 be done for -- what's not going to be
19 done for the schools. To me that was
20 cowardly. Every time they come here in
21 front of you, they throw the children in
22 our face.

23 I pay property taxes and my
24 child is 30. Some of my taxes go to the
25 school. I pay taxes on water. I pay

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 what y'all call the storm drain charge.

3 I pay taxes on everything in this city,
4 day in and day out, and if we got to pay
5 taxes more for our children in school, I
6 guess we'll have to suck it up, and I
7 ain't got a child in the school board.

8 But what I am offended about is
9 them to come here and bring the school
10 board here like cowards, holding the
11 child up in front of them while the
12 assailant is shooting at them. Don't
13 shoot me. I got the child in front of
14 me. That's an embarrassment. That's
15 offensive. Stop doing that. Stop doing
16 that. And then they're not listening
17 because they're over in the corner on the
18 phone. So they don't really care about
19 what we have to say here today, but I'mma
20 tell you this --

21 (Applause.)

22 MS. BILAL: -- we are going to
23 do whatever it takes, wherever it takes,
24 however it takes, and whatever the cost
25 is to deal with this issue in reference

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 to the Parking Authority cowards and
3 thieves.

4 So let me tell you about the
5 points, because I listened to them very
6 carefully here. I make sure I want to
7 hit this.

8 They said that the money that
9 they get from the parking fines,
10 penalties, and tickets, and they give the
11 school the leftovers. Let me ask City
12 Council here, have y'all ever audited the
13 Parking Authority? Have y'all ever
14 audited the Parking Authority? I looked
15 at the paperwork and I saw that they have
16 never audited the Parking Authority.
17 Never. So how do you know the fake news
18 that they came here with today is the
19 children?

20 (Applause.)

21 MS. BILAL: Let me get on to --
22 female, she had to leave. Our crowd is
23 dwindling down, because a lot of people
24 took off their lunch break to come over
25 here thinking we was going to start at 1

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 o'clock. They took time off of work to
3 sit up here, and so they got to run back
4 to work. So I need to make sure I hit
5 what one of our members said -- one of
6 the people here said today.

7 She said that she sat and
8 watched Parking Authority issuing tickets
9 from their cars, and then their cars --
10 they never got out of the cars to place
11 the tickets on the cars, and then they
12 pulled off. So if the Parking Authority
13 is going by people houses issuing
14 tickets, don't get out of the car to put
15 them on the car to let you know they got
16 them and then they pull off and then they
17 claim that they let you know this, and
18 then they said also in their conversation
19 that sometimes they just stop notifying
20 anybody of anything, but who let us know
21 that they was going to start
22 cross-referencing your name on any tag
23 that you got to whatever ticket you had
24 going back as far as 1976? Who made the
25 administrative decision to go

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 cross-reference?

3 Cross-reference is this way.

4 Let me caution everybody and even you if
5 you got a child in this city. Your
6 child -- you go get your child a car.
7 You've had your insurance since 16, which
8 I have. So quite naturally my name is
9 going to be on my child's car. My name
10 on her car. She gets a car. She's going
11 to work. Her car is a 2017 car. She
12 ain't never had no tickets, but the
13 Parking Authority is going to
14 cross-reference, because my name is on
15 her car, boot and tow her car so she
16 can't go to work.

17 Like I've been saying, most of
18 our children work outside of the City
19 because they can't get a job in the City.
20 So now she can't go to Langhorne where
21 she can work and earn a decent living,
22 more than 7.25 an hour that Shop Rite
23 pays them, with no benefits. So she goes
24 out of the City. So now she can't go
25 because you done cross-reference because

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 my name is on it and you're going to tow
3 and boot her car.

4 The Parking Authority are
5 gangsters.

6 Let me finish up.

7 Now you got a \$36 ticket,
8 because I'm in experience of this. Let
9 me show you this. I'm at an event in
10 South Street. I get out, put my money in
11 the kiosk, get my ticket, put it in my
12 car, like instructed. I go into my
13 event. I look at my time. I said, Oh, I
14 better get out here and get some more
15 time. So I go out, put some more money
16 in the kiosk, which my time hadn't ran
17 out yet, but I get some more, put it in
18 the kiosk, get another ticket, put in my
19 car, go back to my event.

20 The event ends. I come out. I
21 got about 30 more minutes on my time from
22 the kiosk. But there's a ticket on my
23 car. The guy's walking down the street.
24 Yo, yo, come back here. I open my car.
25 I go in and I get the ticket. I said,

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 Why would you give me a ticket? I got 30
3 more minutes.

4 Oh, well -- I said, Call your
5 supervisor.

6 The supervisor gets on the
7 phone. He said, Well, she got a ticket
8 that gave more. I must have made a
9 mistake.

10 He says, Well, I can't come
11 over there until 45 minutes to an hour.

12 Well, who going to wait around
13 for another hour for somebody to come and
14 handle it? So the supervisor said to me,
15 Take the little ticket, staple it to the
16 ticket that they gave me on my car, send
17 it in. He will take care of it.

18 One thing I ain't is stupid. I
19 took a copy of that and the ticket, then
20 I stapled it and sent it in.

21 Now, the \$38 ticket that I got
22 30 days later went to \$101, and I got a
23 summons in the mail to come down because
24 my -- I needed to do a hearing, because
25 this ticket then went up to \$101. Now, I

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 did what I was instructed to do.

3 I go to the hearing. I make a
4 time for the hearing. My hearing time is
5 at 11 o'clock. I get there 10:30, and I
6 sit for two and a half hours for a
7 hearing.

8 I get into the hearing. She
9 says, This what it is.

10 I said -- well, I explained to
11 her what happened and here's my copy. I
12 said, I stapled it and sent it in.

13 They don't have it.

14 Well, if you got the ticket,
15 you have to get it because it was
16 stapled.

17 They don't have it.

18 So I showed them my little
19 sticker and a copy of the ticket. In
20 five minutes the ticket was dismissed,
21 but in this process, I find out that
22 there was tickets on a vehicle that I
23 wasn't even aware of because my car was
24 stolen. It was crashed up one time. So
25 I'm not aware of this. From 1986. Now,

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 they never asked me did I want to make a
3 payment plan. She just said, well, this
4 ticket is dismissed and that's all I'm
5 dealing with, and I walked out of it.
6 That's the third thing.

7 I'm going to get to one more.

8 And they threw around 85 million,
9 100-and-something million, what the poor
10 kids are not going to get for the school
11 of the leftover money. I talked to
12 people who walked in there and they told
13 them that they wanted them to give them
14 \$10,000, which is supposed to be half of
15 whatever the fines and penalties are.
16 Oh, ain't no interest, but the fines and
17 penalties on five tickets this woman had
18 from 1992 went to \$10,000. \$10,000? All
19 the tickets together came to \$250. How
20 did it get to \$10,000?

21 Parking Authority are thugs,
22 and we're here today -- this room was
23 filled up before everybody had to go off,
24 but we are sticking together on this one.
25 We will do whatever, whenever, however,

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 and however much it costs to finish up
3 this. We say three years. We don't even
4 want to give them five years. We say we
5 in support of Bill No. 160111 as it is
6 stated.

7 Thank you.

8 (Applause.)

9 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
10 you very much. Thank you.

11 MR. CLEMENTS: Adrian Clements,
12 1-PA. And the Parking Authority --

13 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Excuse
14 me. We need you to give your name first.

15 MR. CLEMENTS: Adrian Clements.

16 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Yes.

17 MR. CLEMENTS: 1PA.

18 The Parking Authority -- you
19 know, you got to know something about
20 history, because everything has a history
21 where it started. When they came in,
22 they came in and they was going to help
23 the school. Then they came in, start
24 doing different things, and now all the
25 sudden the poor people, everybody who

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 have working, you know -- you want to
3 know why the City is so poor? The
4 Parking Authority is a part of making the
5 City one of the poorest city in the
6 country, because the Parking Authority,
7 if you got a car and you driving back and
8 forth and you going to work and you can't
9 get to work because the Parking Authority
10 got your car, now you get fired and the
11 kicker -- I'm not going to say a whole
12 lot because I know there's a lot, but the
13 kicker is, the Parking Authority still
14 going on with they system, because it's
15 about the money. And the Parking
16 Authority right now are planning to do
17 part-time workers. So you get part-time
18 workers that have more people to
19 distribute around to get more money, but
20 you're not paying the same amount, but
21 you're getting part time, so you're
22 getting double the capacity that you
23 would do with full time.

24 So the system right now with
25 the Parking Authority is gangsters, and

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 the City of Philadelphia brought them in
3 and they have no control over them now,
4 because when any time something big like
5 this happens and they can't even send the
6 right people down here with the right
7 information, that's disrespectful. And
8 the people that been running this city,
9 the poor people, people that have been
10 here for years and years, now they see
11 this is what the Parking Authority do to
12 them and this is what the City do.
13 Because it can't be all about money. It
14 got to be about the people who started
15 and was here fighting for things to get
16 better, and now they on the other end
17 that they're no longer being used or
18 needed. It's a shame the way the Parking
19 Authority comes off the way they come
20 off.

21 When you go try to deal with
22 the Parking Authority, you can't really
23 get nothing done, because one person say
24 this and another person say that. So,
25 you know, you don't know who to talk to

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 about a ticket or anything else.

3 That's my statement for today,
4 and I hope two years will be satisfied
5 for those that come. But when the
6 Parking Authority have you down for a
7 hearing, they know 80 percent of the
8 people ain't coming to a hearing. Only
9 the 20 percent that come might win some
10 of they money back. And it's not the
11 Parking Authority money. It's the
12 people's money, but they act like it's
13 money owed to them from you.

14 That's my statement, and that's
15 it.

16 (Applause.)

17 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
18 you very much. Thank you.

19 Good afternoon, Mr. Woodall.

20 MR. WOODALL: Good afternoon,
21 Councilwoman. Arnette Woodall, A&W
22 Community Solutions.

23 Inside of your Chambers today
24 you have community leaders from across
25 this city representing not just your

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 constituents but our constituents also,
3 because we work for them. And we're here
4 because we're all tired of the poverty
5 rate being the highest in the country for
6 big cities, and we know what drives it
7 and what feeds it, and it is
8 organizations and operations just like
9 this.

10 When a person wakes up in the
11 morning to go to work and they come out
12 of their home with their car to put their
13 children in the car to go to work and
14 they cannot go to work because that boot
15 has been put on that car 12 o'clock at
16 night, they are not expecting that in the
17 morning. It throws everybody's day off.
18 The children can't go to school, so forth
19 and so forth.

20 But the number that we also
21 want to know is, this lawyer that sat
22 here a minute ago told you about an
23 operation inside of this operation that
24 is totally illegal, and we also might be
25 staging a class-action lawsuit against

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 them for this. Because when they take
3 and sell those vehicles and then they
4 don't give the constituents and the
5 people that they're taking these vehicles
6 from, they give them no credit towards
7 the money that's owed towards those
8 tickets. They keep every dime of it.
9 That's criminal.

10 (Applause.)

11 MR. WOODALL: We want to
12 know --

13 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Say
14 that again. They take -- say that again.

15 MR. WOODALL: When they take
16 your car and they boot your car, like the
17 lawyer stated, and they take and impound
18 it, if you can't get your car back, if
19 you don't have the money to get your car
20 back and they take it to the auction and
21 auction it off, you get no credit towards
22 your tickets. So you still owe the full
23 amount for the tickets, the penalties,
24 everything. They deduct nothing. That
25 is robbery, and it's been going on since

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 the Parking Authority has been in
3 existence.

4 (Applause.)

5 MR. WOODALL: So I would like a
6 number on how much they made selling
7 these vehicles since they've been selling
8 these vehicles. We want that number
9 also.

10 (Applause.)

11 MR. WOODALL: And we need to
12 stop. That's also.

13 Murder is the only thing that
14 doesn't have a statute of limitation, and
15 what they're doing is murder to the
16 community. So we would like to know that
17 number.

18 Also another thing that's
19 happening that they're not talking about
20 is, once these people get on this payment
21 plan and they can't maintain that payment
22 plan, their registrations are being
23 voided by PennDOT, and then they have to
24 pay to get that reinstated also, and it's
25 making it harder for people to be able to

11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

go to work, because now their
registration is suspended. That practice
needs to stop, because it's
disenfranchising people and it's keeping
people from these low-income communities
disenfranchised and unincluded, because
they can't go to work. So they're not
included in the process of going to work.
They can't get their children to day
care. They're not included in the
process. And it's all about inclusion
also. We want to be included and we want
to be included in this whole process. We
will not go away on this issue, we
promise you that.

(Applause.)

COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
you, Mr. Woodall.

I understand that Controller
Alan Butkovitz is here. We invite him to
come forward. And then Councilwoman
Blondell Reynolds Brown wants to ask the
Parking Authority a question. So we need
them to come forward.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 (Witness approached witness
3 table.)

4 (Audience member yelling.)

5 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
6 you. This is the Controller Alan
7 Butkovitz that we referenced earlier, who
8 gave us important information. And so we
9 say thank you, welcome, and please
10 identify yourself for the record and
11 thank you for being here.

12 CONTROLLER BUTKOVITZ: Good
13 afternoon, Chairwoman Blackwell, members
14 of the Finance Committee.

15 Councilwoman asked me today to
16 look into the City's tax amnesty program
17 that was sponsored by Councilwoman
18 Krajewski back in 2009, and at the time,
19 there were about a billion dollars in
20 uncollected taxes. The collection was
21 about -- the City put in place an amnesty
22 that was in effect for 45 days, which
23 would have allowed people to pay their
24 delinquent tax, with forgiveness of 100
25 percent of the penalties and 50 percent

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 of the interest. It brought in in excess
3 of \$40 million. It's just a philosophy
4 question about whether that money would
5 have come in eventually or not. This was
6 modeled after a program in New Jersey,
7 which produced about \$600 million in
8 collections. I was very supportive of
9 what Krajewski did. My view was it's
10 theoretical whether or not it would have
11 come in otherwise.

12 One of the problems is that
13 these things tend to pile up in the same
14 way that payday loans do. You get a
15 ticket from the Parking Authority. If
16 you don't pay it within 15 days, then you
17 go to the next level, and then after 30
18 days, and pretty soon you're paying
19 several hundred dollars in something that
20 may have originated as a \$25 ticket. So
21 given the hardship with which the people
22 who are impacted by this have in raising
23 that kind of money, I think it would be
24 more efficient to provide an opportunity
25 periodically -- obviously the whole

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 theory of the amnesty is that people have
3 to feel that it's only coming once in a
4 blue moon so that they don't wait for it,
5 that you can keep them paying their fines
6 along the way, but after a period of
7 seven or ten years, I believe it worked
8 on the tax collections.

9 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
10 you.

11 Councilman Greenlee, you had a
12 question.

13 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank
14 you, Madam Chair.

15 Just one quick question,
16 Mr. Butkovitz, if you know. I had asked
17 this of the Administration earlier. Do
18 you know the percentage of people, are
19 there any records of percentage of people
20 that were eligible to be involved in that
21 program that did? Am I making sense?

22 CONTROLLER BUTKOVITZ: Well,
23 the City's records are just a mess. The
24 whole idea that there's a billion dollars
25 in taxes owed to the City I think has

11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

finally been proven to be a fairytale.
Based on it being a billion dollars, we
thought 10 percent would come in. Four
and a half percent came in. The work
done by our office since that time has
indicated that the real level of
collectable unpaid taxes is more like
\$200 to \$300 million, not a billion
dollars. It's kind of like the billion
dollars in uncollected bail that turned
out to be like a million dollars.

COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: The
reason I ask that is, when the School
District and the Administration was
basing their numbers on the impact of
this bill, and I know that this is the
usual way to do it, they were basing that
everybody would participate that could,
which is obviously not realistically
going to happen, because some people may
not be with us anymore that could
participate.

So I was just wondering if --
and even though it's a different program,

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 I was wondering if there was any record
3 of who -- roughly at least what
4 percentage, but it sounds like this
5 wasn't.

6 CONTROLLER BUTKOVITZ: No.

7 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: All
8 right. Thank you.

9 Thank you, Madam Chair.

10 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
11 you very much.

12 We thank you. What you've
13 proven is that there is a big difference
14 between what is and what people think is
15 or say is and what they hold the public
16 accountable for, and it's just not there.
17 And we thank you, Mr. Controller, for
18 looking that up and for coming.

19 CONTROLLER BUTKOVITZ: Okay.

20 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: One of
21 my folks just gave me a copy of a
22 resolution that happened during John
23 Street's era where they talked about \$20
24 million for people who lost their license
25 and Mike Stack in Harrisburg. Look that

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 up.

3 So there's an ongoing issue
4 with the public being victimized by our
5 authorities who charge them all this
6 money, and he asked them -- he urged,
7 John Street did, the Commonwealth to
8 establish an amnesty program. So we're
9 not out of order. We're in order for
10 trying to do something to make life
11 different for all of you who live and
12 work here and who are trying to survive.

13 So I thank you, Jeff, for
14 giving us this info. I'll pass it
15 around, make copies and pass it around to
16 all.

17 And let me tell our Controller
18 that we will also give him copies of this
19 information they passed out that we hear
20 is not in fact true. And so we want the
21 Controller to look at it where they talk
22 about this 18 -- what did they say, \$118
23 million that they can't collect, and
24 everywhere we look people are saying
25 that's not so. And they still can't say

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 what the School District is and what the
3 deal is.

4 So we're going to give that to
5 the Controller and ask him to look at it
6 as well.

7 Ms. Bilal.

8 MS. BILAL: Yes. Rochelle
9 Bilal.

10 We was here at the meeting that
11 was cancelled. There was an agreement
12 made with the Parking Authority not to be
13 going up blocks and booting blocks of
14 cars. Well, the Parking Authority reared
15 up their cross-referencing and they're
16 rearing up. They almost like the
17 retaliation targeting now. They done
18 reared up their ugly head and they are
19 out in full force, after we had that
20 little agreement with them.

21 So they haven't stopped. They
22 are more enforcing. So I had to tell you
23 that.

24 I'm clear, and most people know
25 where I live at. And I got a camera

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 front and back of my house, and guess who
3 I see lurking around my house in the
4 middle of the night? The targeted
5 people, the one that target my car. But
6 I'm like, come on my property and you got
7 a problem, because mine is on my
8 property, not City property.

9 So they reared their ugly heads
10 up. So whatever agreement you make with
11 them, they are not true to keeping it at
12 all. And today we need a moratorium
13 until this stuff is resolved. Otherwise
14 they're going to target some other folk.

15 (Applause.)

16 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
17 you.

18 While we ask Nyerere Parks,
19 Carl Jones, Damarys Natal, Pastor Pam
20 Williams to come forward, we will note,
21 yes, they agreed to not tow more than two
22 from a block, because they were towing
23 blocks and blocks and blocks.

24 (Audience members yelling.)

25 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: And

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 neighborhoods and neighborhoods and
3 neighborhoods, and they agreed not to do
4 it during the two weeks we had to wait
5 for this hearing.

6 Councilwoman Blondell Reynolds
7 Brown.

8 Parking Authority, will you
9 come back up next. We asked you to come
10 up now. Parking Authority, where are
11 you?

12 Parking Authority, we want you
13 to come in and sit down, because we have
14 questions for you from Councilwoman
15 Blondell Reynolds Brown. So please come
16 in, have a seat, and we'll call on you
17 next.

18 Thank you very much. Identify
19 yourself for the record.

20 MR. HASHIM: Hello. My name is
21 Kalunji Hashim.

22 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Go on.

23 MR. HASHIM: I'm sorry. Hello,
24 everybody. My name is Kalunji Hashim.
25 I'm a lifelong resident of Philadelphia.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 I've actually lived in two other states
3 as well for a short period of time, and
4 just from my experience from traveling up
5 and down the East Coast, I've never seen
6 tactics for retrieving money for parking
7 tickets the way that Philadelphia Parking
8 Authority does.

9 It's just a fact that I'm
10 currently actually on a payment plan from
11 tickets from 2003, and the thing is is
12 that, Councilwoman, you can look at my
13 name. My name is not a typical name.
14 It's not Michael Brown or something.
15 It's an African/Islamic name. However,
16 when I present my information, it's on my
17 license, it's documented, it's spelled
18 correctly.

19 So with that being said, my car
20 was booted in 2014 for tickets or
21 whatever. So when my car was
22 immobilized, you basically have to pay
23 whatever you owe outstanding from
24 whatever year it is before they release
25 your vehicle. So at that time when my

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 car was released, I paid off everything
3 that was under my name to my knowledge
4 and they presented to me. During that
5 time, they released my vehicle.

6 I want to say three months ago,
7 my car again -- it was lob-stopped. So I
8 went through the whole process due with
9 my car being lob-stopped, going to
10 Traffic Court on Spring Garden, paying
11 them off, sitting in basically judge's
12 chambers or whatever. That's basically
13 going through the process due to get my
14 car released.

15 Lo and behold, before I'm able
16 to leave the building, I have to see big
17 bad PPA, and of course they have tickets
18 from 2003 that I supposedly owed for.
19 I'm so flabbergasted the fact that it's
20 \$2,000 worth of tickets, but the thing is
21 is that I know for a fact in 2014 I paid
22 off everything that was under my name,
23 meaning that it shouldn't have been no
24 other tickets under my name.

25 I'm so flabbergasted about

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 paying \$2,000, I'm asking for questions.

3 They can't bring in the right supervisor

4 to provide me the information that I

5 need. I leave. They just direct me to

6 go down to 10th and Filbert the next day.

7 So the next day, I happened to

8 look at the paperwork as I'm leaving.

9 They spelled my name wrong. So basically

10 I have tickets under my name, but it's

11 spelled -- three letters are missing out

12 of my name. Now, this is not -- this is

13 a clerical error. This is not an error

14 on my behalf, because when I sign my

15 name, I sign my name correctly. What's

16 on my state-issued ID is my name spelled

17 correctly. However, it's a mistake on

18 PPA's behalf.

19 So with that being said, I go

20 down to PPA the next day. They tell me

21 regardless of the fact that my car was --

22 first they tried to tell me that my car

23 wasn't booted in 2014, which was a lie

24 because I presented the information that

25 I had. I actually still have my

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 paperwork from three years prior. Then
3 when I presented that to them, then they
4 said, well, despite the fact it was a
5 clerical error, I'm still responsible for
6 paying for the tickets from back from
7 2003. And it's just like how can I pay
8 for something when my car was immobilized
9 three years prior and I was told at that
10 time that everything was clear under my
11 name? However, they made a mistake and
12 they misspelled my name, which is no
13 fault of mine, I'm still responsible for
14 paying for that?

15 I mean, I just feel like the
16 practices that they use to withdraw money
17 from people is just like -- it's just
18 unfair. I mean, I'm a hard-working,
19 tax-paying citizen just like them or
20 anybody else, but quite frankly, I don't
21 have \$2,000 lying around just to give to
22 PPA. I'm quite sure I speak for
23 everybody in here.

24 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: None
25 of us does. And we're going to ask them

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 to review your case, and make sure we
3 have your information and contact
4 information as well. We're going to ask
5 them to review.

6 MR. HASHIM: I truly appreciate
7 that.

8 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
9 you very much.

10 MR. HASHIM: Thank you, ma'am.
11 I appreciate that.

12 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
13 you.

14 And we have about after this,
15 we probably have two groups yet to call.
16 I'm trying to hold on to Councilwoman
17 Reynolds Brown. So can you all try to
18 limit it, as one of my colleagues said,
19 maybe to two minutes if we're not being
20 unfair and we can get everybody in.

21 Thank you very much. Reverend
22 Pam Williams.

23 PASTOR WILLIAMS: Councilwoman,
24 Pamela Williams, better known as Pastor
25 Pam.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 I want to first applaud you,
3 Councilwoman. Mr. Henon -- and
4 Mr. Fenton in your office will tell you
5 that I have called your office several
6 times for several of my vehicles. The
7 Parking Authority owes me money. I ought
8 to file the Parking Authority on my
9 taxes.

10 What happened to me -- and I
11 have proof -- is unconscionable,
12 Councilwoman Reynolds. The Parking
13 Authority needs to be completely and
14 unequivocally audited.

15 My vehicle in one month was
16 towed -- booted and towed on three
17 separate occasions. I know that I owe
18 parking tickets. I have gone down trying
19 to negotiate. It is not -- it is
20 substantive to me that they do not have a
21 plan for ministers and pastors in this
22 city, and each time you go to the
23 hospital or you're dropping somebody off
24 or you're doing something, they're giving
25 me a ticket.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 So I don't remove myself from
3 the fact that I have tickets,
4 Councilwoman. The fact is that they
5 are -- how can I say it? They gangsters.
6 They are really gangsters. They are
7 thieves.

8 Every time I go -- I make a
9 payment plan. I give them about 2 grand.
10 You can check my record. About 2 grand.
11 And they do it consistently around income
12 tax return time. They'll come out and
13 they'll boot a whole block of cars. You
14 can go down from 53rd and Spruce Street
15 to 54th Street, Councilwoman, in your
16 district and you'll see a row of cars
17 just booted. Go down and turn down
18 Locust Street, you see another five cars
19 booted. Go down to 55th Street, you see
20 another three cars booted. It's just
21 like it's a science with them, and it's
22 wrong, Councilwoman.

23 This Philadelphia Parking
24 Authority -- and you know that they have
25 been inundated with mismanagement and

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 financial mismanagement and corruption
3 and everything else. It's a damn shame
4 what they do. And I know I just cursed,
5 because I'm mad as hell, because they did
6 it to me.

7 Just, for example, they towed
8 one of my cars. And I love cars. Y'all
9 might as well know that about me. So I
10 might have three or four at a time. Now,
11 they might be hoopdies, whatever, but I
12 love cars.

13 So they towed one of my cars on
14 the 3rd of July, and while I'm at a
15 ministerial conference, they towed
16 another car and boot it.

17 I go to retrieve my car. The
18 only way I can get my car back,
19 Councilwoman, is because they told me I
20 owe \$8,000, but previously in the month,
21 I just gave them \$2,000 to get my car
22 back. So the figure is even higher than
23 it was when I first went. And then they
24 tell me that I owe tickets from 1987, and
25 they have six Pamela Williams in the

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 computer and they tell me that I'm all of
3 them. And I only lived two places in my
4 whole entire life. And then when you try
5 to go down there and testify, they say
6 that you can't say anything because it's
7 being recorded and we're not here to
8 discuss that. We're only here to discuss
9 the tag number right here.

10 Then if we're only here to
11 discuss that tag number, why in the hell
12 did you pull up ten other tag numbers and
13 tell me that I got to pay for them
14 tickets too before you release my
15 vehicle?

16 And that's what they're doing
17 to people. You go in there for one thing
18 and then they say, Oh, well, we have the
19 right to charge you for all the tickets
20 that you ever gotten on any vehicle that
21 you ever know or any vehicle that is
22 associated with your name.

23 Am I right?

24 So it's the truth. So the fact
25 of the matter is, they towed my car on

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 the 17th of July while I'm out of town.

3 And I said, to heck with it, I'm not

4 going to worry about it. I'm not going

5 to send anybody down there.

6 I come back in town, go down

7 there and try to retrieve my car, call my

8 attorney. He said, Well, if you don't

9 have \$8,000, then just file bankruptcy

10 and file bankruptcy and get it all off of

11 you for right now, then we'll deal with

12 it. So I did that, went down, showed

13 them the form that I filed bankruptcy.

14 They wouldn't release my car, saying that

15 the tag that's on the car was not

16 registered in the State of Pennsylvania.

17 Held my car hostage. Held my vehicle

18 hostage for one solid month. One month.

19 I had to go to the Pennsylvania State

20 Police. I had to go to the Pacifico Ford

21 dealer and I had to wait to get a new

22 tag.

23 I've asked them, Well, if

24 you're saying that my tag doesn't match

25 but it is registered in the State of

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 Pennsylvania, why can't I tow my vehicle
3 out? They told me I could not.

4 Better yet, let me tell you why
5 you need to audit them, and I have all my
6 evidence right here. They sent me a
7 letter in the mail after 30 days telling
8 me that my vehicle would be towed within
9 that 30-day period. And I want y'all to
10 listen, because sometimes y'all
11 Councilmen don't care about what's
12 affecting people, but I'm telling you,
13 Councilwoman, you did a great thing now,
14 because this one I got. Because they
15 have taken seven cars from me. Seven.
16 And they took one two weeks ago, and I
17 was too weak and too depressed to fight
18 it, but they took my vehicle from in
19 front of my door that only had two
20 tickets on it, but because they wanted my
21 money, they towed my vehicle, sent me a
22 letter and said that we want to let you
23 know that your car was sold at auction.
24 I asked them, Could I go
25 back -- now, I'm there at the Parking

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 Authority on Essington Avenue trying to
3 retrieve my vehicle. I asked them, Can I
4 go back and empty the items out of my
5 vehicle? I'm standing there with a
6 letter saying that they sold my car at
7 auction.

8 I go back to get my stuff out
9 of my vehicle and take pictures. My
10 vehicle is sitting in the back. It has
11 not been auctioned. That's why they need
12 to be audited, because they sent me a
13 letter that was a lie.

14 So my thing here is, I know
15 amnesty and, yes, you should do amnesty.
16 You should. Because I got bills. I got
17 things in here, I ain't never lived in
18 some of these addresses, but they're
19 holding it to my account and they don't
20 want to listen to you when you go down
21 there. And then when you get indignant,
22 they want to call the sheriff and put you
23 off, and it's wrong.

24 So I'm here today for the
25 people, and I'm fighting because I've

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 been through this, and it's wrong. It's
3 a travesty. It's unfair. It's illegal.
4 You can't hold my property and you can't
5 confiscate my property without a legal
6 binding, and they didn't have a legal
7 binding to hold it.

8 So this is what happens in our
9 city. And so I ask you to enter a
10 moratorium against the Philadelphia
11 Parking Authority.

12 Mr. Henon, you don't need to
13 ask for all that stuff. They wrong.
14 They don't have it. She's been there 27
15 years, and all due respect to her, if you
16 can't come here prepared when somebody is
17 telling you they going to pass a bill on
18 you, then, hell, you got a problem.

19 (Applause.)

20 PASTOR WILLIAMS: When you ask
21 me to come down to talk about my tax
22 amnesty, I have to bring my ID, I have to
23 bring my proof of income, I have to bring
24 my utility bills, and have to be ready to
25 sit at the table to make a deal. They

11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

ain't ready. So we need a moratorium on
them doing anything. Get them off the
street. I don't care about them
patronage jobs that they give people.
It's wrong. They are walking our streets
and they are stalking our citizens and
they are creating a bad environment for
people just for a doggone parking ticket.
There's more guns we should be worrying
about than some darn parking tickets.

(Applause.)

COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
you.

PASTOR WILLIAMS: I want to
just say this one thing to you,
Councilwoman. \$217,000 were collected in
impoverished neighborhoods in
Philadelphia by the Philadelphia Parking
Authority, and only 8 percent were
collected in communities with a median
income of more than \$70,000, and that
needs to be examined, because they're
preying on poor, poverty, black, and
brown people in this city, and it needs

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 to stop. So we need a moratorium. We
3 need to shut the Parking Authority down
4 from issuing tickets, boots or towing and
5 auctioning off people's cars.

6 And let me tell you so y'all
7 know this part too, Blondell, because you
8 seem really interested. What you do is
9 when you go -- when they auction your car
10 off at the auction center, they got four
11 auction centers. I think it's four,
12 three or four across the City. So when
13 they auction your car off, what they do
14 is, they have people at the auction who
15 are people who go and resell your cars at
16 dealerships. So it's a hustle. And you
17 can't get a good deal or a good bid on a
18 car because these people are there with
19 pockets full on money who already got the
20 call that we're auctioning off a 2006
21 Mercedes, we're auctioning off a Tahoe,
22 we're auctioning this off, and they're
23 there ready. So even if me and my
24 brothers want to go and try to get a car
25 to recoup what we've lost, we can't even

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 do it because we can't afford it, because
3 the gangsters already hooked up with
4 other gangsters and they got it set up.

5 So I'll leave this with you.

6 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
7 you.

8 PASTOR WILLIAMS: If you need
9 to know anything about what's going on
10 with the Parking Authority, Pastor Pam is
11 well equipped and well knowledgeable.

12 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
13 you. Thank you.

14 (Applause.)

15 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Good
16 afternoon, sir. Identify yourself.

17 MR. JONES: How you doing,
18 Council, Chairwoman Blackwell. My name
19 is Carl Jones, and I'm a representative
20 of the 19140 zip code, and what we're
21 seeing here is basically purposeful
22 oppression of a targeted disenfranchised
23 group. I think it's been well
24 illustrated just by the members of -- the
25 people of the community that came out

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 today about who is being affected by
3 these draconian policies that have been
4 put in place by the Parking Authority.

5 Now, there was an article
6 recently in the Philadelphia Daily News
7 where the Interim Director Clarena
8 Thompson [sic] reinstituted this policy
9 recently where they would go back and
10 trace the tickets for all the different
11 tags for the cars that belonged to
12 different owners for the last however
13 long you owned the car. And so what's
14 been going on is, they're having a witch
15 hunt in our neighborhoods and our
16 communities where, as the sister just
17 stated clearly, you can go up and down
18 the blocks in North Philadelphia,
19 Northwest Philadelphia, West
20 Philadelphia, Southwest Philadelphia, you
21 know, the parts of South Philadelphia
22 that are predominantly black and brown
23 neighborhoods and you will see the
24 enforcement of the Parking Authority.
25 You will feel their presence. However,

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 you go to other neighborhoods in this
3 community, you can't go -- if you go
4 south of Broad Street on Washington
5 Avenue, you can park in the middle of the
6 street and nobody will offer you a
7 ticket. In fact, those tickets will get
8 rescinded.

9 So what you have is, they have
10 this booting blitz going on where they're
11 booting cars in our communities, but yet
12 and still -- I just have a question. The
13 Parking Authority, do they pay taxes?
14 They pay taxes every year; am I correct?
15 So as a business that pays taxes,
16 whenever a business has losses, don't you
17 write those taxes off? Don't you write
18 those losses off? So what are you doing
19 sending people bills for tickets that you
20 have already written off and that are
21 accounted for by the IRS?

22 So what you have here is a
23 Ponzi scheme where they're doubling down
24 on their money. And, see, this is why
25 they can't come forward and tell you

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 about what's going on in their books,
3 because they don't know what's been
4 written off and what they're counting two
5 times.

6 So these are some of the things
7 that's happening, and we have -- this is
8 the brother who stated -- a lot of
9 phantom tickets, because I too was booted
10 in 2006 and then received another ticket
11 on that car later that year. How would I
12 receive a ticket on that car later that
13 year if I didn't pay all the fines, if I
14 didn't get my car out? But yet and
15 still, I have tickets going back -- get
16 this now: I called Parking Authority and
17 they told me that I had an open case from
18 1988. Now, I don't know how old I look
19 to you, but I'm only 43 years old. In
20 1988 I was 14 years old. So where in the
21 hell are these tickets coming from and
22 these phantom tickets that people are
23 paying? And they're putting the burden
24 on the taxpayers to show receipts when
25 their corrupt systems are not being held

11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

accountable for all of the payments that have been made, that they're just not showing up in their system because they may have misspelled somebody's name or because they may have written down a wrong number somehow. And so they're putting those things on to us.

And what you're doing, you're talking about bringing these issues to the community, bringing these issues to the community because supposedly this is about protecting the children in the School District, but how can you protect the children in the School District when you're killing the community that supplies the children for the schools with these bills? And you're doing it at a time in the year that we all know is the most tenseful and stressful time of the year, where people are suffering, a spike in mental health, mental illness is in crisis. This is documented, and you're adding another tax burden to them or shut-off notices of sort that causes

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 people anxiety. Because you can't pay
3 any of your bills if you can't get to
4 work. You can't pay any of the back
5 payments if you can't get to work. And
6 then they want to talk about not giving
7 amnesty when they can't even come up with
8 accurate figures for what they owe -- for
9 what we owe, supposedly speaking, and the
10 number that -- you can see they're just
11 pulling numbers out of the air.

12 So I'm calling for a freeze on
13 the booting and a moratorium on all of
14 their policies from this day forward.
15 Hopefully we can get an injunction from a
16 judge sometime in the next few days to
17 stop the Parking Authority from going
18 around with this booting blitz that's
19 obviously a ploy from Clarena Thompson,
20 the new Deputy Director, in order to
21 become a full-term director. This is
22 what she's doing to boost revenue for the
23 Parking Authority. And I'm saying that
24 we need to call off the witch hunt until
25 we can get some resolution on this issue.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
3 you. Thank you.

4 (Applause.)

5 PASTOR WILLIAMS: Councilwoman,
6 can we ask why Clarena Tolson is not
7 here? She is the -- in charge of the
8 Parking Authority. Can we ask why she
9 felt it not important to come?

10 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Well,
11 we have the Parking Authority coming up.
12 We'll ask them.

13 PASTOR WILLIAMS: Okay. Thank
14 you.

15 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL:
16 Because we were told she would be here.

17 PASTOR WILLIAMS: Thank you so
18 much.

19 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
20 you very much.

21 So we're going to ask the
22 Parking Authority to come back up. After
23 that, Wayne Williams, are you here? John
24 Evans?

25 MR. EVANS: Yes.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL:

3 Kimberly Chapman, are you here?

4 MS. CHAPMAN: Yes.

5 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Robert

6 William Dancy? All right. And then

7 we'll have one more group and then we're

8 done.

9 Is Sarah Moore here?

10 (No response.)

11 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: No

12 Sarah Moore?

13 Angela Smith?

14 MS. SMITH: Here.

15 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: You'll

16 be the second group.

17 Adam Roch?

18 MR. ROCH: Roch.

19 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL:

20 Deborah Willis?

21 MS. WILLIS: Here.

22 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: And

23 Robert Stoughton? Oh, I promised -- I

24 knew you had to go. I'm sorry.

25 So those are the last two

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 groups, and we thank you all for your
3 patience.

4 Councilwoman Reynolds Brown.

5 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Yes. I
6 wanted to get some clarity or maybe some
7 verification of statements made by the
8 witnesses.

9 What is the interface and/or
10 relationship with PennDOT?

11 MS. O'CONNOR: Whenever a
12 vehicle is issued a parking violation,
13 that plate is ran through PennDOT, which
14 we call NCIC. So it's going to get the
15 owner's name and address where that plate
16 is registered.

17 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay. And
18 in instances where you might find that a
19 person's registration is not acceptable
20 to you, what does the Parking Authority
21 do?

22 MS. O'CONNOR: So if they run a
23 plate and it comes back that that plate
24 is not registered, is that what you're
25 asking?

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: That's
3 exactly what I'm asking.

4 MS. O'CONNOR: Then there's
5 really nothing we can do. You can't send
6 a notice -- if it doesn't come back that
7 there's a name and an address to that
8 plate, I can't send out a notice. So the
9 plate has to be registered in the State
10 of Pennsylvania or whatever state.

11 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: However,
12 one of the witnesses stated that their
13 car -- their plate was ran and you had
14 their car. They could prove that it was
15 their car, but the Parking Authority
16 would not return their car because based
17 on your electronic relationship with
18 PennDOT, it showed that the car wasn't
19 registered.

20 MS. O'CONNOR: So sometimes
21 when a person purchases a vehicle, they
22 get a title to that vehicle, but they
23 don't like follow through. And I'm not
24 saying that happened this time. I'm just
25 saying what could happen.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 If they do not take that title
3 to a local PennDOT and transfer it,
4 suppose you sold me your car and assign a
5 plate to it, then it's not going to be
6 properly registered in the State of
7 Pennsylvania.

8 Sometimes people put other
9 people's plates on their vehicle, so when
10 it ends up at the impoundment lot,
11 they're running the plate and it's coming
12 back to your name, but when they run the
13 VIN, the actual vehicle is still
14 registered in my name, which causes
15 confusion that some people have other
16 people's plates on their car.

17 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: It also
18 sounds --

19 MS. O'CONNOR: And that can
20 happen. A lot of stuff happens.

21 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: So when
22 instances like that happen, what type of
23 remedy does the Parking Authority have in
24 place to capture that special
25 circumstance of citizens who are indeed

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 innocent given the information that you
3 have? Because the option is, you make
4 the, some might argue, arbitrary decision
5 to just keep the car.

6 MS. O'CONNOR: So, no.
7 Whenever -- if you were to show up at the
8 impoundment lot, as the testimony had
9 stated, they would tell you that we have
10 to remove the plate from the car and now
11 you have to go to the State Police and
12 get that plate registered to that car in
13 order to get the car off the lot.

14 (Pastor Williams speaking from
15 audience.)

16 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Help us
17 understand that.

18 MS. O'CONNOR: I don't know. I
19 would have to -- I think we would have to
20 take that history, because I'm confused
21 myself. I agree, if your plate is
22 getting tickets, then that has to be
23 assigned the name and the address for
24 sending you notices. It wouldn't come up
25 that -- they call it a plate that -- when

11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

a letter goes out and it's returned that that owner doesn't exist, that doesn't get into the boot-eligible status. Now, if that plate that's not registered to anybody parks in, say, no stopping or a rush hour, you could get what we call straight towed and it could end up in the impoundment lot. It's not necessarily booted.

So there's a million circumstances, so in order to answer that question, I think we need to sit down with the lady and find out what exactly happened, because as we see, you're going to have a big record. You've been booted and towed on several occasions. So we're going to have to look through a lot of stuff and see how that happened.

COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: I'm sure whatever homework is required to fix that circumstance is in order.

MS. O'CONNOR: That's what I said. A lot of times it's hard to answer a question because, as we see today, a

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 lot of people have unique stories of what
3 happened and how it happened and how many
4 cars they have and sometimes you have a
5 father with a son, same first and last
6 name. It doesn't have a junior or a
7 senior assigned to it. So you're
8 confusing John McLaughlin with John
9 McLaughlin who is the son, and as that
10 gentleman testified, he was only 14 in
11 1988. So of course it's not him. But
12 when you go down the Bureau of
13 Administrative Adjudication, they have to
14 decipher that and figure out. It's a lot
15 of history behind a lot of these tickets.
16 I don't think we've had a single person
17 today show up that said I have one ticket
18 and I didn't pay. These are all that
19 have multiple plates, multiple cars,
20 multiple tickets, a lot of history behind
21 it. So we can't just answer this vanilla
22 answer of this is what happened down
23 there.

24 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Last
25 question. While it is not City Council's

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 legislative authority to audit the
3 Parking Authority, whose is it? How
4 often are you audited and who audits the
5 Parking Authority?

6 MS. O'CONNOR: I think in the
7 past we were audited by the City as --

8 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Meaning
9 the City Controller's Office?

10 MS. O'CONNOR: Yes.

11 We're in the process of being
12 audited right now.

13 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: By whom?

14 MS. O'CONNOR: The Auditor
15 General.

16 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay. And
17 is that a regular standard practice or
18 has there been a trigger that's triggered
19 this audit, or what?

20 MS. O'CONNOR: It just occurred
21 within the last year.

22 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: So what's
23 the standard operating procedure? Annual
24 audits?

25 MS. O'CONNOR: We have -- the

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 Parking Authority is audited every year.

3 We hire an auditor to audit our books

4 through a contract. The audit that I'm

5 discussing now, that came in last year at

6 the change of our executive directors.

7 So I don't know if that's --

8 COUNCILMAN HENON: Point of
9 information, if I may.

10 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Please.

11 COUNCILMAN HENON: I think the
12 Parking Authority, it's mandated through
13 state law to be audited on a yearly
14 basis.

15 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay.

16 COUNCILMAN HENON: Is that
17 correct?

18 MS. O'CONNOR: Yes, and that's
19 what I was saying.

20 COUNCILMAN HENON: That's all.
21 Just let everybody know that it's
22 mandated by law, and you also do internal
23 and our City Controller.

24 Look, this by no means is --
25 it's just fact.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay.

3 Thank you.

4 Thank you, Madam Chair.

5 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
6 you.

7 Do you know why Clarena Tolson
8 is not here today?

9 MS. O'CONNOR: She had a prior
10 commitment, so she had asked me if I
11 could attend.

12 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Say
13 that again.

14 MS. O'CONNOR: She had a prior
15 commitment, so she asked if I could
16 attend on her behalf.

17 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Okay.
18 And they're asking me why Jerry Connors,
19 who is Collection Director, is not here.

20 MS. O'CONNOR: He does not work
21 for me, so I can't answer that question.

22 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: And I
23 understand that -- and we're asking the
24 Parking Authority to go down from the six
25 crews you all have at night to what is

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 normal, and that's two crews. We're
3 asking for you to commit to that today.

4 MS. O'CONNOR: Can I get
5 approval from my Executive Director
6 before I commit to that?

7 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Yes.
8 Because we really need that done.

9 Councilman Henon, do you have
10 any other questions for them? I did not
11 mean to be offensive earlier to any
12 people in this Committee. I admit, I get
13 a little gung-ho on these things I
14 believe in.

15 (Pastor Williams speaking from
16 audience.)

17 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
18 you.

19 Okay. He's all right.

20 Thank you. Sir, your name?

21 MR. WILLIAMS: I'm Wayne
22 Williams.

23 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: All
24 right. We got Wayne Williams, John
25 Evans, Kim Chapman, and Robert William

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 Dancy. Come forward. After that, we
3 have one other group.

4 Councilwoman Reynolds Brown, we
5 know you're going to the School District.
6 So you'll have to fill me in on what
7 happens when they agree to step down.
8 I'll call you later or tomorrow.

9 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay.

10 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
11 you.

12 (Audience members talking.)

13 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: No.
14 We're not asking the Parking Authority to
15 go. We're saying Blondell Reynolds
16 Brown, because she's going to the School
17 District to represent us about the School
18 Reform Commission stepping down. That
19 has nothing to do with the Parking
20 Authority. We're asking them to stay.

21 (Audience member talking.)

22 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: I'm
23 sorry. I don't know what you said. They
24 were talking to me. Or come up and ask
25 the question. Come up and ask. We'll

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 get you next.

3 Mr. Wayne Williams.

4 (Witness approached witness
5 table.)

6 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Come
7 and have a seat and we will -- we'll get
8 you next.

9 Wayne Williams, begin.

10 MR. WILLIAMS: Good afternoon,
11 Councilwoman. I want to thank you for
12 convening this hearing.

13 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
14 you.

15 MR. WILLIAMS: And I want to
16 thank Rochelle Bilal for being a voice
17 for the voiceless. And I'm going to be
18 as quick as I can and say I want to add
19 an amendment to this proposal today. Not
20 only should it be the amnesty agreement,
21 but for those people like myself who paid
22 off an agreement from 1992, to be
23 reimbursed. I want my money back.

24 I went for a test at the
25 hospital. When I came out, my car was

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 gone, and I thought I had misplaced the
3 car, forgot where I parked, when it
4 actually was towed. It just happened to
5 be a new car. So I had a new car loan.
6 So when I went to pay the ticket off,
7 they told me I owed a whole lot more
8 money. And when I went from the Parking
9 Authority to pick the car up, they had a
10 totally different figure. So I had to
11 take out -- exhaust a credit card, take
12 out a loan, and then start working for
13 Uber to pay the payments through
14 agreements. I think that's totally
15 unfair for tickets from 1992.

16 We're talking about a quality
17 of life issue. It's not something that
18 we took from the Parking Authority. We
19 are parking on the streets that were free,
20 and they're charging us for parking on
21 the streets. So we don't really owe them
22 anything. It's just a matter of the City
23 of Brotherly Love showing brotherly love
24 instead of a brotherly snub and sisterly
25 rejection. These are quality of life

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 issues, and we should not be gangsterized
3 and held victim by the Parking Authority.

4 So in addition to the amnesty,
5 I think those people who paid tickets
6 from 1900-and-whatever should also be
7 reimbursed. And that's just my story in
8 a nutshell.

9 (Applause.)

10 COUNCILWOMAN SQUILLA: Thank
11 you for your testimony. And I like the
12 brotherly snub and sisterly rejection
13 quote. It sounded good.

14 MR. WILLIAMS: You can use it.
15 But I still want my money back.

16 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All right.
17 Thank you.

18 You want to proceed. State
19 your name for the record and then
20 continue.

21 MR. EVANS: How you doing? My
22 name John Evans. I just heard about the
23 amnesty program last night. I was sent a
24 text. So I came down here at 12:30, 1
25 o'clock. I was trying to figure out what

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 was going to be done, because I also had
3 a run-in with PPA after coming out of
4 prison in 2008, and it was a situation
5 where they told me that I had \$14,000
6 worth of tickets accumulated from 1993,
7 all just from 1993.

8 Now, I can remember back when I
9 did have maybe two, three cars then, but
10 parking tickets and the value of \$14,000,
11 I can't recall. So I attempted to
12 resolve the issue with PPA by going down,
13 if anybody listening to me. So I tried
14 to resolve the issue by going down 8th
15 and Spring Garden, and I talked with a
16 few people and I tried to dispute
17 everything regarding my issue, and I was
18 told get on a payment plan, XYZ.

19 So I got on a payment plan in
20 2008 and I've been on a payment plan
21 since 2008, but I've been back and forth
22 to the Penitentiary, which resulted in
23 maybe another six years. And I've been
24 home 33 days, and I still owe a debt of
25 \$12,000 to date. And I think that's

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 totally ridiculous, and we can go back to
3 2008 and redispute how was it possible
4 that I accumulated \$14,000 worth of debt
5 in the year 1993.

6 That's basically, you know,
7 what I'm trying to explain. And so
8 anything like regarding amnesty program,
9 I just need to be a part of it, because I
10 got a heavy debt on my head right now,
11 you know, just coming home again, and
12 it's like something need to be done about
13 this Parking Authority, because they've
14 been reckless. I seen a lot, heard a
15 lot, and it's like something need to be
16 done. So I'm grateful for anything y'all
17 could do regarding the people,
18 Philadelphia, you know what I'm saying,
19 regarding these personal issues.

20 Thank you.

21 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.

22 (Applause.)

23 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you

24 for your testimony.

25 Please proceed. State your

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 name for the record.

3 MR. STOUGHTON: My name is

4 Robert Stoughton. And like most of the

5 people here who are citizens, I believe

6 I'm here because there's a problem with

7 the Parking Authority. We don't need to

8 go over the specifics. I have a whole

9 litany of specifics that people in the

10 Council, some of them are aware, and they

11 look at me and go, I don't have an

12 answer.

13 The bottom line is, I've been

14 talking to the Philadelphia Parking

15 Authority for weeks, and I can't even get

16 a firm number to pay the bill, and my

17 cars are on the boot list. I had to

18 bring a scooter from Florida so I could

19 be here. That's what I'm riding on

20 because all of my vehicles are on the

21 boot list, and I can't even get a number.

22 Forget the specifics. Here's

23 the real problem. We as citizens of this

24 country need to hold our elected

25 officials accountable.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 (Applause.)

3 MR. STOUGHTON: That includes
4 City Council. That includes the state.
5 That includes the County of Philadelphia.
6 Because all of you have a piece of this.
7 When I go to the Parking Authority, they
8 say, Well, the City said this. And then
9 I come back and they say, Well, yeah,
10 that's true, but the county said this.
11 Oh, wait a minute. The state mandate
12 says something different. Today we're
13 going to go by that one. You lose.

14 We just go round and round and
15 round and round. Until the people of
16 this country stand up and hold their
17 elected officials accountable, these
18 types of things are going to go on.

19 Council set this system up with
20 the State of Pennsylvania, and the system
21 is the problem. We need to address the
22 problem, not the individual issues
23 surrounding the problem.

24 COUNCILMAN OH: I'm just going
25 to have to interrupt to correct a kind of

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 misunderstanding that you have. The
3 state took over our Parking Authority,
4 the same as they took over our School
5 District.

6 MR. STOUGHTON: Good for them.

7 COUNCILMAN OH: So the problem
8 that we have is that no one that you
9 elect, no one in this city is really
10 accountable to you, and we need to get
11 back our Parking Authority, because they
12 are just an entity that's trying to make
13 money and sending it to other parts of
14 the state, for example.

15 So I did introduce the bill, by
16 the way, to take it back.

17 MR. STOUGHTON: Thank you.

18 COUNCILMAN OH: I think it will
19 probably be revived at this point in
20 time.

21 MR. STOUGHTON: That's exactly
22 what I'm trying to address. I may have
23 been specifically off base, but I don't
24 feel that I'm wrong. We in this country,
25 we are failing as citizens to hold our

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 elected officials accountable, and it
3 starts on our blocks, in our wards, in
4 our Council. If we can't solve the
5 problems with the Parking Authority, with
6 our school districts, how can we have the
7 moral authority to have a foreign policy
8 in this world that makes sense?

9 It starts at the bottom, and we
10 as individuals need to stand up. And I
11 want to thank Council for having this
12 hearing and this meeting, because what
13 you referred to is exactly where the
14 problem really stems from, and that's
15 why -- what you're talking about is why
16 all these people go down there and all
17 they get is go this way, go that way, go
18 this way, come back again.

19 The bottom line is, a
20 month-plus in, I can't even pay the bill
21 if I wanted to. And they have tickets
22 against me for vehicles I never owned, a
23 plate that was stolen. Why do they not
24 have a responsibility to look at the
25 plate, look at the car and go, Oh, it

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 doesn't match, and find out the plate is
3 stolen. No. I reported the plate
4 stolen. They still write a ticket. I
5 get the thing when I'm in bed from an
6 injury 22/7 for months. Nothing got done
7 personally. All this stuff goes by me.
8 Now they're telling me it's too late and
9 I have a ticket for a car I never owned,
10 a ticket against a plate that was stolen,
11 and three tickets against a car that I
12 had already sold.

13 I don't get it. And the
14 problem starts because of exactly what
15 you referred to. There's too many
16 authorities directing traffic, so to
17 speak, and the citizens are getting beat
18 up. And until the citizens stand up and
19 solve the problem through people like
20 you, through our Council and work with
21 you respectfully, honestly, and
22 sincerely, we'll never solve these
23 problems.

24 Like I said, I have a litany of
25 things that went wrong. There's no sense

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 bringing you the specifics. You've heard
3 all the specifics. We need to
4 restructure this so it stops happening.

5 I want to thank you again, and
6 thank you for the information that you
7 gave me, sir. I was remiss. I don't
8 think I was totally off base, but I was
9 off target a little bit, and I appreciate
10 your efforts, particularly Ms. Blackwell
11 and a few others who are aware
12 specifically of what I'm going through.
13 But what am I supposed to do? I can't
14 drive my cars and I can't get the number.

15 But anyway, I thank you, and I
16 hope that your efforts do achieve
17 something.

18 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
19 you. And anybody whose individual case
20 we need to check on, make sure -- where's
21 John? This is John Fenton. Make sure he
22 has your name and number and we'll check
23 on your case individually. Okay?

24 All righty. All right. We
25 want to make sure we get everybody who

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 hasn't testified. So identify yourself
3 for the record, everybody whose name I
4 mentioned. We did most of you. So I
5 think I called everybody, didn't I?

6 Robert Stoughton, Deborah Willis, Adam
7 Roch we just did, Andrew Smith, Sarah
8 Moore, and we already heard from the
9 others, Robert William Dancy, Kimberly
10 Chapman, John Evans, and of course Wayne
11 Williams.

12 So everybody who -- and anybody
13 else who wants to testify, now is your
14 time to come forward. This is our last
15 opportunity.

16 Thank you, Greg Spearman, Ward
17 Leader of the 60th, for being here.

18 And we're going to finish our
19 testimony, and we do have a motion we
20 want to make thereafter.

21 (Witnesses approached witness
22 table.)

23 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
24 you. Have a seat inside.

25 MS. BILAL: I got a list of

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 names and phone numbers.

3 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
4 you.

5 And please, if you give her
6 your name and number too, she will make
7 sure -- and you all know she is the head
8 of the Guardian Civic League. She is not
9 worried. She's not afraid of anybody,
10 and she will make sure we get
11 information. You have John here, but you
12 have Rochelle Bilal. Give her your
13 numbers, and we're happy to get back to
14 any of you, and she will give us a copy
15 for the petition.

16 All right. Thank you. Sorry
17 to hold you. Please begin your
18 testimony.

19 MR. DANCY: My name is Robert
20 Walter Montez Dancy. My issue with
21 Parking Authority is, I heard about this
22 bill and them taking cars. I went to the
23 Parking Authority to ask them -- to give
24 them my information to how many tickets I
25 had. They told me I need my license, my

11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

birth certificate, and everything. So I went back and gave them my license and my birth certificate. They gave me three pages of paper. Only ten -- out of all these names on here, only ten of them is my name, and they trying to tell me that I owe them for every person by the name of Dancy or Robert W, whatever, R, whatever, that lived in my address. I have to pay for all these tickets in order to get my car off the boot and tow list.

Just like she said, I'm not responsible for anything that's not my name, but this paper states that none of these names are mine but ten of them, and they still trying to make me pay. So I need to know how can I resolve this? Because I have six kids and I need to work, and it's getting cold. A motorcycle not working anymore. So I could drive my vehicles, therefore, back and forth to work.

Is there a lawyer in the house

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 that can help me with this or, you
3 know...

4 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Give
5 Rochelle Bilal your name or John Fenton
6 or both and we will check into it. We
7 agree. Too many people have come forward
8 saying they have different names. It's
9 not right. So we're happy to look into
10 it for you, Mr. Dancy.

11 MR. DANCY: So you said go to
12 Johnny over there?

13 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Sure.
14 You can give it to him or Rochelle, and
15 they'll make sure, either one or both.
16 Thank you.

17 Who is next?

18 MS. CHAPMAN: Hi. My name is
19 Kimberly Chapman. I'm here because of
20 concerns with the Philadelphia Parking
21 Authority. I have a paper here stating
22 that there was \$4,700 worth of tickets
23 with four tags, where two tags were
24 stolen. The cars, two of the cars, were
25 taken by the Philadelphia Parking

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 Authority.

3 During the first amount of
4 \$2,000 worth of tickets, I applied for a
5 job with the school crossing guard. I
6 got the job. I came in to try and get
7 help, because they said I could not now
8 work because I owed tickets. I tried to
9 do all that I could. I didn't have the
10 money at the time to get this job -- to
11 get these tickets taken off so I can make
12 a payment plan in order to get it
13 taken -- and I didn't no longer have the
14 car. They towed the car.

15 Since that, I was not able to
16 work. I got a job with the School
17 District. Then they're sitting up here
18 saying about monies with the School
19 District. I was a bus monitor, had a job
20 as a bus monitor. The bus was in an
21 accident. I was hurt. I could not work.
22 They fired me from my job. These buses
23 are not fit for these children to be on.
24 If I had children that was riding a bus,
25 the School District buses, I would not

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 allow them to ride them. They are
3 unsafe. I have evidence of that. So
4 where's the money going for these
5 children? Because the children are not
6 getting back and forth to school safe on
7 these buses.

8 My car was just recently booted
9 and towed within the last week. I
10 came -- I called actually at that
11 particular time. They said I needed \$91,
12 which was 3.50 plus if I did it over the
13 phone. There was an app they told me to
14 go to for PayTix, it's called. I paid
15 the \$91. I went to my sister, had her
16 pay the \$91 over the phone for these
17 tickets. They said my car would be
18 released to me so that I can make
19 arrangements for these tickets.

20 I sat in the car on 56th and
21 Market Street area waiting for them to
22 come and release my car for four hours.
23 They said maybe it will take six hours.
24 I called back. I stayed in the car until
25 11 o'clock, because I really wanted to

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 just not have them come and still boot
3 the car, because they said they didn't
4 have no receipt of the PayTix now that's
5 on my sister's credit card.

6 Lo and behold, I get down here,
7 they have no recognition, no receipts of
8 the payment being made. I had to call
9 the corporate headquarters in order for
10 them to say after three days that they
11 did have the payment.

12 I came down to try to get an
13 agreement. They said I needed \$2,000. I
14 didn't have \$2,000. I left. I called to
15 see if I could get an attorney. No
16 attorneys that I spoke with said that
17 they could help me. Basically it was,
18 No, we can't do anything with the
19 Philadelphia Parking Authority. It's not
20 going to be worth it.

21 The young man I spoke with at
22 the Parking Authority said, It would be a
23 waste of your time and money to try and
24 get a lawyer. You might as well take
25 that money and pay for the tickets for

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 cars that you have taken from me, for
3 money you've taken from me, and I don't
4 have a car, don't have a job, and my car
5 is booted and towed.

6 Now, mind you, I have half of a
7 certain percentage of the monies, which
8 they asked for 75 percent. It wasn't 50
9 percent that they wanted of the \$4,000.
10 I didn't have it. For the next day they
11 told me to come in. If I go in the next
12 day, I could speak with another person
13 for them to make a judgment on how much I
14 would need. But why can't you tell me
15 while I'm here right now today with this
16 same amount that's going to be presented
17 to you the next day to the next person
18 for them to feel like they're going to
19 tell me that I need the whole hundred
20 percent? I don't have it. I need my
21 car.

22 I take care of two older ladies
23 on my block. I can't go to the stores
24 for them. I can't get them to the
25 hospitals. I can't do anything right

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 now. And you lied to me and told me if I
3 paid that hundred dollars right then --
4 and I waited for them people to come, and
5 they told me they could not come to that
6 block unless there was five or more cars
7 that was booted. They was not coming
8 within that time, and there was 33 more
9 hours that my car was going to sit there
10 with that boot on it that I could not do
11 anything about, and you can't find even
12 the hundred dollars I paid to get payment
13 arrangements on \$800 worth of tickets,
14 which happened within two other tags.
15 But these tickets are from 1987 to 1996
16 that they are demanding I pay at one
17 time, after not being able to get a job
18 because I had tickets with the school
19 crossing guard and lost my job with the
20 School District because there was an
21 accident and I could not go to work.

22 It's not fair. I went to them.
23 I came here today because -- I said I
24 wasn't getting emotional.

25 But I came here today because

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 the money that I have to offer them to
3 make a payment arrangement, they're
4 telling me that it's not enough. I need
5 my vehicle. What do they expect for me
6 to do? Don't I have something to offer?
7 It's not fair.

8 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: We
9 agree. We're going to ask them to look
10 into it. We have the -- Deputy Director,
11 please look into her case today.

12 Step over here. She's going to
13 take your information, and then make sure
14 you leave your number with us.

15 MS. CHAPMAN: I do apologize,
16 but it's just very sad.

17 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: No
18 apology necessary. Thank you.

19 MS. CHAPMAN: Thank you for
20 listening.

21 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: So
22 step over here. They're going to look
23 into it, and make sure my office has your
24 name and number or Rochelle Bilal.

25 Yes, ma'am.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 MS. WILLIS: Good afternoon.

3 My name is Deborah Willis. I am a
4 minister at Church of God in Christ, a
5 children generation.

6 I'm here because I can hear the
7 hurt in the people that come up here and
8 testify. However, what I'm seeing is a
9 total neglect of the human factor
10 concerning the Parking Authority.

11 I understand the fact that it
12 is a business, and I hear the figures
13 that are being mentioned. However, I do
14 not hear anything that is pertaining to
15 the hardship of the people here in the
16 City of Philadelphia.

17 It is by far essential that we
18 acknowledge the fact that the people, the
19 people are the ones that are responsible
20 for the running of this City government.
21 It is the taxpayer who spends their money
22 here daily. That is not being considered
23 when it comes down to Parking Authority
24 and other municipalities.

25 I suggest, because I'm not

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 going to sit here and pose a problem
3 without a solution, but I do suggest that
4 we have a hardship entity added to these
5 kind of situations that occur in the
6 Parking Authority. They do not have any
7 consideration for the hardship.

8 Now, if you're making \$70,000
9 to \$100,000 a year, you can pay a \$30
10 parking ticket right online that day. If
11 you're waiting for public assistance, if
12 you're waiting for any kind of Social
13 Security, if you're unemployed and barely
14 getting by, that is not possible. And if
15 you get 15 days for it to repeat itself,
16 it becomes even more out of reach for
17 those people.

18 If you can take a few minutes
19 to add a clause that will include the
20 humanity of the policies, just enough so
21 that these people can pay what they need
22 to pay. It's not so much that we don't
23 want them to do what it is they're
24 supposed to do in terms of parking and
25 getting tickets. I understand that part

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 of it, but we have to understand we are
3 talking about the people.

4 We, the people, have to be able
5 to be able to live and function in a
6 community that is accepting us for who we
7 are. We need to have a human component
8 added on to the Parking Authority's
9 procedures, and that is the most
10 essential thing that I want to say.

11 But concerning the budget and
12 the School District, it has already been
13 decided that they did not want to have an
14 amnesty program. It was clearly stated
15 underneath the voices that was said up
16 here on the panel. The problem with that
17 is that if our children, if our children
18 are being neglected, it is not because we
19 did not pay our parking tickets. If our
20 children are not getting the proper
21 education, it is not because we did not
22 pay our parking ticket. Our children are
23 being neglected because they are not
24 appropriately designating the proper
25 funds to where it is supposed to be. If

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 they're having \$87 million a year coming
3 in and the School District is only
4 getting 7 million of that 87 million,
5 there is another \$80 million out there
6 somewhere, and it is not fair to the
7 people, the people, we the people. And I
8 keep saying we, the people, because we
9 have to understand the Constitution of
10 the United States was written for the
11 people, and this is a small entity of all
12 of it.

13 So I do wish that as people in
14 authority, as you sit there with your
15 title as Councilman, as State
16 Representative, as all those who are in
17 Senate and up to the Governor's Office,
18 that they remember and that we all
19 remember that the purpose of our being
20 sitting at those desks is for the people.
21 And I expect, and I have the right to
22 expect, fair dealings when it comes to
23 municipalities in the City of
24 Philadelphia.

25 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 you. Thank you very, very much. Thank
3 you. Thank you.

4 (Applause.)

5 MS. SMITH: Good afternoon,
6 Council. My name is Angela M. Smith. I
7 am committee person, 10th Division, 61st
8 Ward, 19120 zip code, and my complaint is
9 kind of sort of the same. They come
10 through -- the Parking Authority comes
11 through at 2 o'clock in the morning,
12 booting blocks of cars. Like over the
13 past month, they did it to like five
14 neighbors on one block of Howard Street.
15 Like I don't know if they run plates like
16 in the middle of the night, but the
17 bottom line is, I got a ton of
18 complaints, because they felt like they
19 were targeted basically. Then same
20 thing, they couldn't take their kids to
21 school or do anything.

22 Me, myself, I did owe a \$297
23 ticket from two tickets that had built up
24 at the end of 2016. They towed my car.
25 I took off work, called out of work. It

11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

was my mother's birthday. Came outside,
couldn't go to the cemetery because my
car was booted. My car is my private
property. You know, I mean, if you do
something wrong as far as tickets, they
put liens against your home or something.
Put a lien against my car then, but don't
take my car. That's my personal
property. I need it.

So a lot of people are looking
for answers and solutions on what we can
do to limit the Philadelphia Parking
Authority. And if the City needs to take
it back, then we need to try to figure
out how can the City take it back,
because the state is out of control
evidently. Something is wrong. We need
a medium.

COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
you very much.

MS. SMITH: You're welcome.
(Applause.)

COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Sir.

MR. ROCH: Hi. My name is Adam

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 Roch. And I'm not trying to talk about
3 the issues. I'm sure you are aware of
4 every single issue. But I'm trying to
5 give some suggestions.

6 Number one, I don't think so or
7 any of the citizen of Philadelphia think
8 about the PPA should police our street,
9 giving us tickets for registrations and
10 inspections and not related to Parking
11 Authority.

12 This money, we would like to
13 see it -- would like to see this money go
14 into the Philadelphia Police Department.
15 They deserve it, because they need maybe
16 more training, more better equipment. At
17 least somebody who is putting their lives
18 on lines for us every single day. That's
19 number one.

20 Number two, I would like to see
21 this Parking Authority ease or eliminate
22 the parking meters in some of the
23 businesses, especially the poor
24 neighborhoods. If the City working very
25 hard to trying to build the poor

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 neighborhood and help them out, the PPA
3 chasing every single customer coming into
4 this neighborhood trying to do business
5 in this poor neighborhood. And even the
6 businesses are losing money because the
7 customers cannot go to them due to the
8 PPA.

9 Now I'm going to ask -- I'm
10 going to talk about the amnesty. If it
11 is a real amnesty they're talking about,
12 they should waive every single ticket for
13 the past year for every single
14 Philadelphian, and for one reason, one
15 reason only, because they don't owe us
16 anything. They destroy us. They
17 terrorize us. They rob us. For them if
18 they give up whatever people owe for the
19 tickets before, that's called amnesty.

20 And for me as a businessperson,
21 this amnesty they come up with, it's
22 another way to get their money fast and
23 in a short time, because they couldn't
24 wait anymore, because they couldn't get
25 it. Because if they could get this money

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 before, they would not give us any
3 amnesty.

4 PPA, they don't believe in
5 amnesty and they don't believe in
6 humanity. They don't have heart. They
7 don't know anything about amnesty. This
8 mean they should not be asking anyone to
9 pay for 24 or 40 months, do not have
10 credit cards, didn't give us any money.
11 Even the credit cards they will -- they
12 have a statute of limitation maybe seven
13 years. They don't call you. They don't
14 come after you anymore.

15 They keep us off the street.
16 They did not allow us to go to our Center
17 City and enjoy. They keep the college
18 students from enjoying the City because
19 they can't afford the ticket, and they
20 keep the visitors, the one -- the
21 taxpayers spend too much money to bring
22 here by promoting Philadelphia. What's
23 the PPA doing? It's chasing them away
24 because giving them ticket and destroying
25 everyone on their vacation.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 And one more thing. If the PPA
3 allowing themselves to park in the wrong
4 and illegal spot to do their business and
5 give tickets to the citizen of
6 Philadelphia, why they're not allowing
7 other contractors and somebody else doing
8 business in Philadelphia to park
9 somewhere to get the job done? They need
10 to pay for the meter also because they're
11 making money. And by them blocking the
12 meter and another person who is doing his
13 job in Philadelphia cannot park because
14 he's taking it and he's not paying for
15 it, it doesn't make no sense. Doesn't
16 make no sense.

17 And thank you.

18 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
19 you.

20 (Applause.)

21 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: These
22 are the last two people who are here to
23 testify. Thank you.

24 MR. BARBER: Good afternoon.

25 My name is Tyrone Barber.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 I'm really not going to drag
3 this out, because I know it's been late.
4 I just have a few questions. The main
5 question is, if after a few years Parking
6 Authority sells your tickets to a
7 collection agency, how do they then go
8 back behind you and boot you for the same
9 tickets? If they no longer own them, how
10 do they boot you?

11 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Okay.
12 They're listening, so we'll have them
13 answer that question.

14 MR. BARBER: Excuse me?

15 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: We'll
16 ask them to respond. Any other
17 questions?

18 MR. BARBER: No, because I have
19 my own thing. I'm not booted. I'm here
20 out of support because I'm on the boot
21 list. Parking Authority told me they
22 wouldn't talk to me basically because
23 they don't have my vehicle. So they
24 don't want to talk to people unless they
25 have your vehicle and they can extort you

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 out of your money. I tried to make
3 arrangements with them before they got my
4 vehicle, and they basically told me we
5 can't talk to you.

6 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Okay.
7 We'll have -- they're listening. We'll
8 have them respond. Thank you.

9 Ma'am.

10 MS. SEARS: Hi. My name is
11 Lenore Sears. As a disabled person, one
12 of the problems that I have are the
13 kiosks are located very far away from the
14 disabled parking spaces. So sometimes I
15 have gotten tickets because I couldn't
16 get to the kiosk on time. And I did get
17 a boot one time, and I said, Well, I'll
18 go ahead and pay the fine, and I was
19 prepared to pay maybe the \$200 for the
20 legitimate tickets, but when I got there,
21 they went back to 1991 on every single
22 vehicle I had owned. And back in 1991,
23 as I'm sure you probably remember, there
24 was a crack epidemic, and I was married
25 to -- my husband was a crack-addicted

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 person, and he ran up every vehicle that
3 we had at that time, got tickets. And by
4 the time they add up all the tickets that
5 he had, they ran up to like \$8,000. In
6 order for me to get my vehicle out of
7 impound, I had to pay close to \$8,000,
8 and most of those tickets were in
9 collections. So I had to scrape up all
10 this money. And mind you, I'm disabled.
11 I had to borrow money from my family
12 members to get my van that's handicap
13 accessible out of impound. And I got my
14 vehicle out and paid the collection off,
15 and then when I got back to the Parking
16 Authority, they said, Oh, well, now you
17 have to pay us another \$3,000 for these
18 other fines that are with us. And I
19 thought that was ungodly and unfair. I
20 thought once I paid the \$8,000 to the
21 collection agency, then they spring up
22 another \$3,000 on me that they had.

23 I just think to go back to
24 people on tickets for back in the '90s is
25 just so unfair.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 People do have legitimate
3 tickets, and I don't think people just
4 want to totally dismiss the tickets that
5 they legitimately owe, but to go back to
6 tickets from the 1990s, this is so
7 unfair. People have circumstances that
8 they, you know, had no control over. My
9 husband was a crack-addicted person, and
10 I can't be held responsible for something
11 that somebody's poor actions back then.
12 And it's totally bankrupt me. It's
13 totally bankrupt me. I'm left penniless
14 now, penniless. It's so unfair.

15 You know, we need to have some
16 reasonable accommodations. Tickets do
17 need to be paid. No one is denying that.
18 But to go back to the '80s and '90s,
19 that's very unreasonable.

20 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: That's
21 why we have this amnesty program we're
22 proposing. We agree.

23 (Applause.)

24 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Yes,
25 ma'am. You want to testify?

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 MS. SEARS: Thank you for
3 listening.

4 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank
5 you.

6 Yes.

7 MS. ROBINSON: Yes. My name is
8 Christine Robinson.

9 I just wanted to know with this
10 amnesty program, what is -- the people
11 that gets on a payment plan, is they
12 going to get off the boot list? Because
13 they have an option to, okay, well, you
14 have to contact the collection agency,
15 you could give them a payment plan for
16 these two old tickets, but that won't get
17 you off of the boot list.

18 So I need to know that once
19 we're in this program or once we get on
20 the payment plan, how is it that we're
21 able to get off the boot list so we could
22 be able to live comfortably?

23 I park my car in the back of my
24 house. I don't even want to park in
25 front of my house because I don't want to

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 get booted. And I don't have no tickets
3 on the car that I have now. All my
4 tickets are old.

5 So I want to know like is there
6 going to be a way that we can get off of
7 the boot list?

8 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Well,
9 that's what we are proposing, that
10 amnesty means you're not on the boot list
11 and that you have 24 months to pay and
12 that you're off boot list. But you got
13 to be careful. Hopefully you won't get
14 more tickets then, because it deals with
15 the tickets that happened when you make
16 the agreement. So we're trying to do
17 that.

18 Yes, sir.

19 (Audience member talking.)

20 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: I'm
21 sorry. She can't hear you.

22 And this is it.

23 MS. BOSS: How you doing,
24 Councilwoman Blackwell?

25 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Fine.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 Thank you.

3 MR. BOSS: My name is Avery
4 Boss. I'm just interested in how soon
5 will this program be implemented for the
6 people?

7 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Well,
8 you are the last one to testify today.
9 So if we can report this bill out, this
10 is a Committee hearing. Then it will
11 have to come before the full Council and
12 be voted on. All that takes about a
13 month or something like that. So we
14 would --

15 COUNCILMAN HENON: After we get
16 the information, right?

17 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Yeah.
18 They're saying if we get the information,
19 because my colleagues don't want to
20 consider this without the Parking
21 Authority giving us the information we
22 need. But we'll make sure it's all in
23 the news. We'll make sure Bilal knows.
24 So you'll know when we have public
25 hearings. So it still has to go before a

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 full public hearing in this room before
3 the public. You'll know.

4 MR. BOSS: So we're talking two
5 months maybe?

6 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Maybe.

7 MR. BOSS: Okay.

8 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Now,
9 Madam Parking Authority, because we want
10 to vote. Everybody has got meetings.
11 People want to know how Parking Authority
12 can charge if their car has been towed,
13 if it's been sold, how can you continue
14 to charge them for tickets? Can you
15 answer that?

16 MS. O'CONNOR: Yes. So
17 normally when a vehicle is towed or
18 booted -- so suppose you park in rush
19 hour. You're going to get a \$76 parking
20 ticket, plus the \$175 tow fee. Every day
21 that the vehicle sits at the impoundment
22 lot, it's \$30.72 in storage each day. We
23 usually sell the car within 23 to 30 days
24 after being at the impoundment lot. We
25 then sell the cars at the PPA auction, as

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 someone has mentioned earlier. Sometimes
3 the vehicle is only sold for \$300. If
4 it's a 1992 maybe Datsun, it's not going
5 to go for a lot. So they sell for 300.
6 We then take that \$300 after we pay our
7 court filing fees and advertising costs
8 of maybe \$275, we then have to break out
9 the money that we have. It goes to the
10 tow fee, then the storage fee, then
11 parking tickets and Traffic Court tickets
12 and so on. So if it only sells for \$300,
13 it's not necessarily paying off the whole
14 debt that was accrued from the parking
15 ticket, plus the tow fees and the storage
16 fees that accumulated. So that's why
17 there's money that's still owed even if
18 we sold your vehicle.

19 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Any
20 other questions?

21 Having seen that, we are going
22 to -- thank you.

23 We are going to conclude our
24 public hearing and enter our public
25 meeting.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 (Audience member talking.)

3 MS. O'CONNOR: We do not sell
4 the tickets to collections, so --

5 (Audience member talking.)

6 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Sir,
7 she said they don't sell their tickets to
8 a collection agency.

9 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Madam
10 Chair, point of information. Point of
11 information.

12 Ms. O'Connor, if I could just
13 ask you, do you sell tickets to a
14 collection agency? Does a collection
15 agency collect any of your violations?

16 MS. O'CONNOR: Collection
17 agencies collect tickets, but we do not
18 sell the file. We still own the file.
19 So if you have parking tickets, like I
20 said earlier, we have subcontractors that
21 go and try to collect if a ticket is over
22 four years old. Follow me? Meanwhile,
23 it's still my file. So that's over --

24 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: So you
25 still have jurisdiction, I guess is the

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 question.

3 MS. O'CONNOR: Yes. It's still
4 boot eligible and it's --

5 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: You still
6 have jurisdiction, even though you have a
7 collection agency working for you to try
8 to collect the money. So that's why you
9 can still take action, because you still
10 have jurisdiction. You didn't sell the
11 car or the right to it.

12 MS. O'CONNOR: Correct.

13 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Okay.
14 Fine.

15 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: So
16 that means he could have a bill from you
17 and the agency; is that correct?

18 MS. O'CONNOR: You'll get a
19 notice from that agency. It's not a
20 bill. It's not --

21 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: So you
22 get a notice from a collection agency
23 plus you. That's what he's complaining
24 about.

25 MS. O'CONNOR: You're not

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 getting double billed. You don't owe
3 double amount of money. It's the same --

4 (Audience members talking.)

5 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: It
6 sounds like you're saying that he can get
7 a bill from a ticket agency who has the
8 tickets and a bill from you for the car.

9 MS. O'CONNOR: Normally when a
10 collection agency has that file, the
11 collection agency is going to send the
12 notices to the individual. Meanwhile,
13 your file is still -- if you have more
14 than three parking or red light tickets,
15 you're still going to be in a
16 boot-eligible file. So if you get
17 booted, then you are going to come down,
18 even though you were notified, say, an
19 outside vendor, you still -- I still have
20 the authority to boot you. I still have
21 the authority to tow you if you're on the
22 rush hour block.

23 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: You
24 mean you get new tickets?

25 MS. O'CONNOR: No.

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: I

3 don't understand.

4 MS. O'CONNOR: I am not --

5 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: So

6 you're saying he could get new tickets --

7 so you're saying then you sold the old

8 tickets, but --

9 MS. O'CONNOR: I never sell the
10 old tickets. You have a plate. You have
11 five parking tickets. You have five
12 parking tickets. They're over four years
13 old. Those five parking tickets make you
14 boot eligible. A collection agency will
15 start working those files, because I've
16 noticed you 30, 40 times and you have not
17 responded. While that is happening, that
18 collection agency can be noticing you. A
19 boot truck happens to be driving up
20 Market Street, sees your tag, and can
21 still boot you. It's still boot
22 eligible. I did not sell the file to the
23 collection agency. They're just working
24 it the same way we are working it.

25 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Is

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 that clear?

3 (Audience members talking.)

4 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: The
5 Parking Authority is saying -- and my
6 colleagues can explain it better if I
7 can't -- that they also hire people to
8 collect your ticket money. They can
9 collect it or the people they hire can
10 collect it. So you could have a couple
11 people out there looking for you.

12 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Madam
13 Chair, if I could just add, but the --
14 Ms. O'Connor, if I'm saying this right.
15 The Parking Authority still has
16 enforcement power, so if a car is there,
17 it's still bootable by the Parking
18 Authority even if the collection agency
19 is trying to collect the money.

20 MS. O'CONNOR: Correct.

21 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Did I say
22 it right? All right.

23 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Sir.
24 (Audience member talking.)

25 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: You

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 need to come up.

3 MR. BARBER: But my question
4 is --

5 COUNCILMAN HENON: Could you
6 introduce your name for the record.

7 MR. BARBER: Tyrone Barber.

8 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL:
9 Tyrone?

10 MR. BARBER: Tyrone Barber.

11 My question would be, then why
12 is it when I go to Parking Authority for
13 those same tickets, they boot you off and
14 say we can't handle that, it has to go to
15 collections? They won't do anything for
16 you if the ticket is on the collection
17 list.

18 MS. O'CONNOR: I understand
19 what he's saying. So he's saying when
20 you're down at the Bureau of
21 Administrative Adjudication, if you have
22 out of the five tickets three of those
23 tickets assigned to a company, say, like
24 Smith and Smith -- we're not going to
25 say -- I wasn't going to say vendors

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 names. I'm just using examples.

3 So they would say you have to
4 contact Linebarger. I will clarify that
5 and I will make sure that is not
6 happening. That is what I'm going to do
7 today. Because they should be able --
8 once they're down at BAA, they should be
9 able to handle all their violations while
10 they're there. Okay?

11 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: All
12 right. I think that we tried to answer
13 that, and now we want to try to -- I'm
14 trying to keep folks here long enough to
15 get a vote out of Committee on this bill.
16 I'm already one short.

17 I'm hoping that we can get this
18 bill -- all right. Thank you very much.
19 This will conclude our hearing on this
20 bill, on 160111, and now we will enter
21 Stated Meeting.

22 The Chair recognizes
23 Councilmember Henon for a motion on the
24 amendment to Bill No. 160111.

25 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you,

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111

2 Madam Chair. I'd like to make a
3 statement before I read the motion on the
4 amendment.

5 We are going to vote out
6 hopefully with a unanimous decision to
7 vote this amendment, this bill out as the
8 amended version, and there will be more
9 amendments on the floor of this body
10 pending the information that we requested
11 from the Parking Authority and the
12 Administration. We requested a lot of
13 information for a lot of reasons.
14 Councilwoman Blondell Reynolds Brown, our
15 Chairperson, and other members of this
16 body asked a significant amount of
17 questions and information and data that
18 will help with floor amendments as we
19 move forward.

20 And, Councilwoman, I want to
21 thank you for your due diligence and
22 efforts in making sure that people have a
23 fair chance.

24 On that motion, I want to thank
25 you, Madam Chair, and I offer an

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 amendment to Bill No. 160111. A copy of
3 this amendment has been circulated to all
4 members of the Committee, and I move for
5 the adoption of the amendment.

6 (Duly seconded.)

7 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: It has
8 been moved and properly seconded that the
9 amendment to Bill No. 160111 be approved.

10 All those in favor of the
11 motion will signify by saying aye.

12 (Aye.)

13 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Those
14 opposed, nay.

15 (No response.)

16 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: The
17 motion carries, and Bill No. 160111 has
18 been amended.

19 The Chair again recognizes
20 Councilmember Henon for a motion on Bill
21 No. 160111, as amended.

22 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you,
23 Madam Chair. I move that Bill No.
24 160111, as amended, be reported from this
25 Committee with a favorable recommendation

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 and further move that the rules of
3 Council be suspended to permit first
4 reading of this bill at our next Council
5 session.

6 (Duly seconded.)

7 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: It has
8 been moved and properly seconded that
9 Bill No. 160111, as amended, be reported
10 from this Committee with a favorable
11 recommendation and further moved that the
12 rules of Council be suspended so as to
13 permit first reading of this bill at our
14 next session of Council.

15 All those in favor of this
16 motion will signify by saying aye.

17 (Aye.)

18 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL:

19 Opposed?

20 (No response.)

21 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: The
22 ayes have it and the motion carries.

23 (Applause.)

24 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: And
25 Bill No. 160111, as amended, will be

1 11/16/17 - FINANCE - BILL 160111
2 reported from this Committee with a
3 favorable recommendation and a request
4 that the rules of Council be suspended so
5 as to permit first reading at our next
6 session of Council.

7 Let me thank everybody. Let me
8 thank my Committee. Hard issue, but an
9 important one. Thank you all, everybody
10 who has testified and everyone who has
11 come. Thank you all, and this hearing is
12 adjourned.

13 (Committee on Finance concluded
14 at 4:50 p.m.)

15 - - -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the
proceedings, evidence and objections are
contained fully and accurately in the
stenographic notes taken by me upon the
foregoing matter, and that this is a true and
correct transcript of same.

MICHELE L. MURPHY
RPR-Notary Public

(The foregoing certification of this
transcript does not apply to any reproduction
of the same by any means, unless under the
direct control and/or supervision of the
certifying reporter.)

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 1

A	achieve	administrat...	agent 17:15	191:9,25	22:17 27:20	170:24	140:5
A&W 94:21	152:16	10:15 60:14	18:6 70:22	amending	31:23 36:17	171:14	approved
ability 74:6	achieved	70:18	aggregate	1:15 4:5	39:9,10	anyway	190:9
able 6:23	15:14	101:17	54:16	amendment	41:11 54:16	152:15	approximat...
19:16 70:8	acknowledge	102:15	aggressive	3:25 142:19	61:24 70:8	apologize	69:8 70:2
76:6 97:25	163:18	189:12	25:18	188:24	92:20 96:23	3:20 67:3	70:16 72:21
109:15	acknowledg...	administrat...	ago 4:15	189:4,7	157:3	162:15	arbitrary
157:15	46:2	1:16 4:7	21:21 95:22	190:2,3,5,9	160:16	apology	134:4
161:17	act 94:12	10:12 85:25	109:6	amendments	184:3	162:18	area 5:6 63:8
165:4,5	action 70:25	136:13	118:16	189:9,18	189:16	app 158:13	158:21
177:21,22	71:9 72:2	187:21	agree 19:14	amnesty 1:16	amounts 11:9	appear 12:12	areas 55:15
188:7,9	183:9	admit 140:12	26:12 31:18	4:8 6:13,15	and/or 131:9	applaud 46:8	55:15 56:6
absentia	actions 68:9	adoption	40:22	6:20 10:20	193:23	113:2	57:13,22
77:10	176:11	15:22 190:5	134:21	10:23 11:9	Andrew	Applause	argue 134:4
Absolutely	actual 14:12	Adrian 81:9	141:7 156:7	11:16 12:6	153:7	27:23 28:22	argument
51:21 66:24	67:11	91:11,15	162:9	13:11 18:25	Angela	32:22 35:2	29:8
acceptable	133:13	advertising	176:22	19:9 21:17	130:13	46:11 52:20	Arnette 81:10
131:19	Adam 130:17	181:7	agreed 34:15	21:20,24	167:6	60:21 63:16	94:21
accepted 70:5	153:6	advice 5:12	106:21	22:8,11,16	annual 13:14	64:15 69:19	arrangement
accepting	168:25	afford 76:15	107:3	22:20 24:4	14:16	73:7 74:10	162:3
165:6	add 44:7,15	76:16 123:2	agreement	24:12,21	137:23	75:10 76:23	arrangeme...
access 70:20	142:18	171:19	38:16	25:22 26:9	annualize	80:13 83:21	158:19
accessible	164:19	afraid 7:6	105:11,20	27:2 30:10	21:2	84:20 91:8	161:13
10:24 11:13	175:4	9:12 154:9	106:10	30:13 31:3	annualized	94:16 96:10	174:3
12:4 175:13	186:13	African/Isla...	142:20,22	31:6,12	14:12	97:4,10	article 124:5
accident	added 64:7	108:15	159:13	32:13 33:18	annually 14:4	98:17	asked 35:24
157:21	164:4 165:8	afternoon 2:3	178:16	37:2,21,25	anomalies	106:15	45:25 74:16
161:21	adding	10:10 13:3	agreements	38:2 39:6	15:11	120:19	90:2 99:15
accommoda...	127:24	16:4 35:14	143:14	39:16,17,20	answer 12:13	121:12	101:16
176:16	addition 12:5	35:14,15	ahead 81:3	39:24 41:10	15:24 29:17	123:14	104:6 107:9
account 14:9	17:24 144:4	66:25 81:19	174:18	41:11,19	37:3 42:16	129:4 144:9	117:23
119:19	additional	81:21 94:19	ain't 83:7	46:9 48:6	43:10 74:15	146:22	118:24
accountable	11:20 23:3	94:20 99:13	86:12 88:18	48:16 52:13	135:12,24	148:2 167:4	119:3
103:16	38:12	123:16	90:16 94:8	52:15,17	136:21,22	168:23	139:10,15
127:2	Additionally	142:10	119:17	54:24 58:24	139:21	172:20	160:8
147:25	12:14	163:2 167:5	121:2	65:15 73:10	147:12	176:23	189:16
148:17	address	172:24	air 128:11	75:22 76:19	173:13	191:23	asking 34:18
149:10	131:15	age 68:21	Alan 2:18	99:16,21	180:15	applied 157:4	44:3 46:15
150:2	132:7	agencies	98:21 99:6	101:2 104:8	188:12	apply 193:21	56:14 60:20
accounted	134:23	54:12	alike 5:10	119:15,15	answers	appreciate	66:16 110:2
125:21	148:21	182:17	allow 6:16	120:22	168:12	112:6,11	131:25
accounts	149:22	agency 62:2	8:19 13:24	128:7	anxiety 128:2	152:9	132:3
67:20 68:6	155:10	72:14,21	37:9 158:2	142:20	anybody	approach	139:18,23
accrue 11:4	addresses	173:7	171:16	144:4,23	85:20	11:17 71:21	140:3
accrued	119:18	175:21	allowed 8:21	146:8	111:20	approached	141:14,20
181:14	adjourned	177:14	99:23	165:14	117:5 135:6	66:8 81:12	171:8
accumulated	192:12	182:8,14,15	allowing	170:10,11	145:13	99:2 142:4	asks 61:21
145:6 146:4	Adjudication	183:7,17,19	172:3,6	170:19,21	152:19	153:21	assailant
181:16	1:16 4:7	183:22	allows 74:4	171:3,5,7	153:12	appropriate	82:14 83:12
accurate	136:13	184:7,10,11	amended	176:21	154:9	73:11	assign 133:4
128:8	187:21	185:14,18	189:8	177:10	anymore	appropriat...	assigned
accurately	administered	185:23	190:18,21	178:10	102:22	165:24	134:23
193:5	24:13	186:18	190:24	amount 14:13	155:22	approval	136:7

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 2

187:23	186:24	114:24	31:9 37:20	175:24	174:4	118:4	53:1 54:1
assist 69:5	audit 118:5	119:2	89:23,25	176:5,11,18	basing 59:23	169:16	55:1 56:1
assistance	137:2,19	120:11	147:10	177:23	102:16,18	186:6	57:1 58:1,7
69:2 164:11	138:3,4	121:20	152:11	backs 77:15	basis 30:2	beyond 43:24	59:1 60:1
associated	audited 84:12	122:3	169:3	bad 37:11,14	138:14	bid 122:17	60:16 61:1
116:22	84:14,16	123:10	aye 190:11,12	109:17	Bass 1:10	big 93:4 95:6	62:1 63:1
assume 20:20	113:14	124:4,24	191:16,17	121:8	9:21 27:5	103:13	64:1 65:1,9
20:25 23:21	119:12	125:13	ayes 191:22	bail 102:11	28:24,25	109:16	66:1 67:1,3
50:25 54:18	137:4,7,12	126:16		balance 40:10	29:19 30:20	135:16	67:5 68:1
59:25	138:2,13	128:17,23	B	40:12,15	31:11,21	Bilal 3:15	69:1 70:1
assumes	auditor	129:8,11,22	BAA 188:8	balanced	32:6,23	66:6,15	71:1,4 72:1
51:15	137:14	131:20	back 6:24	11:17	34:12,16	81:5,19,22	73:1,10
assuming	138:3	132:15	23:18,22	balances 12:6	58:23 63:12	81:22 83:22	74:1 75:1
48:3 50:23	audits 137:4	133:23	24:10 25:13	balancing	Bass's 36:12	84:21 105:7	76:1,19
assumption	137:24	137:2,3,5	26:9 31:4	10:21	beat 151:17	105:8,9	77:1 78:1
37:18	authorities	138:2,12	33:21 34:2	bank 19:6	becoming	142:16	79:1 80:1
attempted	104:5	139:24	34:19 42:9	bankrupt	5:19	153:25	80:17,22
145:11	151:16	141:14,20	45:14,15	176:12,13	bed 151:5	154:12	81:1 82:1,4
attend 139:11	authority 7:8	143:9,18	47:10 48:6	bankruptcy	beginning	156:5	83:1 84:1
139:16	8:12,15	144:3	48:7,16	117:9,10,13	6:17	162:24	85:1 86:1
attention	9:14 12:16	146:13	53:5,13	Barber	behalf 16:5	179:23	87:1 88:1
74:14	13:15,19	147:7,15	65:3 69:18	172:24,25	110:14,18	bill 1:15 2:1	89:1 90:1
attorney	14:4,15	148:7 149:3	75:21 76:5	173:14,18	139:16	2:25 3:1,25	91:1,5 92:1
74:21 117:8	15:2,7,9,17	149:11	77:18 85:3	187:3,7,7	behold	4:1,3 5:1	93:1 94:1
159:15	16:7,13,23	150:5,7	85:24 87:19	187:10,10	109:15	6:1 7:1 8:1	95:1 96:1
attorneys	17:9,14	154:21,23	87:24 92:7	barely 164:13	159:6	8:18 9:1,15	97:1 98:1
159:16	18:15 31:7	156:21	94:10 96:18	base 59:2	believe 6:21	9:23 10:1	99:1 100:1
auction 96:20	33:8,20	157:2	96:20 99:18	149:23	7:5,9 8:13	10:14 11:1	101:1 102:1
96:21	34:2 36:15	159:19,22	106:2 107:9	152:8	8:18 9:2	11:22 12:1	102:17
118:23	36:22 37:2	163:10,23	111:6	based 12:2	12:17 20:11	13:1,10	103:1 104:1
119:7 122:9	37:5 46:23	164:6	115:18,22	29:12 32:7	30:16 34:7	14:1 15:1	105:1 106:1
122:10,11	50:15 54:11	166:14	117:6	32:11 36:18	57:6 74:22	15:22 16:1	107:1 108:1
122:13,14	61:24 64:13	167:10	118:25	46:21 55:2	101:7	16:21 17:1	109:1 110:1
180:25	69:23 70:11	168:14	119:4,8,10	102:3	140:14	18:1 19:1,5	111:1 112:1
auctioned	70:21 73:18	169:11,21	124:9	132:16	147:5 171:4	20:1,20	113:1 114:1
119:11	75:6,18	173:6,21	126:15	baseline	171:5	21:1 22:1	115:1 116:1
auctioning	76:11 78:21	175:16	128:4	27:15 28:4	believed	23:1 24:1	117:1 118:1
122:5,20,21	80:2 82:11	179:21	129:22	28:7,11	22:10,15	25:1 26:1	119:1 120:1
122:22	84:2,13,14	180:9,11	131:23	36:16 46:20	belonged	27:1 28:1	120:17
auctions	84:16 85:8	184:20,21	132:6	55:4	124:11	29:1,8,12	121:1 122:1
76:12	85:12 86:13	186:5,15,18	133:12	basic 72:16	beneficiary	30:1 31:1	123:1 124:1
audience	87:4 90:21	187:12	142:23	basically	36:5	32:1 33:1	125:1 126:1
23:13 31:17	91:12,18	189:11	144:15	27:16 41:24	benefit 39:13	33:23 34:1	127:1 128:1
37:7 42:13	92:4,6,9,13	Authority's	145:8,21	43:9 48:14	51:4 80:7	34:17,21	129:1 130:1
43:4 57:14	92:16,25	14:11 165:8	146:2 148:9	48:19	benefits	35:1 36:1	131:1 132:1
59:16 79:20	93:11,19,22	available	149:11,16	108:22	86:23	37:1 38:1	133:1 134:1
99:4 106:24	94:6,11	63:7 70:3	150:18	109:11,12	best 21:9	39:1 40:1	135:1 136:1
134:15	97:2 98:24	Avenue 119:2	154:13	110:9	56:11 61:5	41:1,9 42:1	137:1 138:1
140:16	100:15	125:5	155:3,23	123:21	better 7:5	43:1 44:1	139:1 140:1
141:12,21	105:12,14	average 18:2	158:6,24	146:6	40:20 65:21	45:1 46:1	141:1 142:1
178:19	107:8,10,12	Avery 179:3	168:15,16	159:17	78:11,12	47:1 48:1	143:1 144:1
182:2,5	108:8 113:7	aware 14:6	173:8	167:19	87:14 93:16	49:1 50:1	145:1 146:1
184:4 186:3	113:8,13	16:22 17:14	174:21,22	173:22	112:24	51:1 52:1	147:1,16
			175:15,23				

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 3

148:1 149:1 149:15 150:1,20 151:1 152:1 153:1 154:1 154:22 155:1 156:1 157:1 158:1 159:1 160:1 161:1 162:1 163:1 164:1 165:1 166:1 167:1 168:1 169:1 170:1 171:1 172:1 173:1 174:1 175:1 176:1 177:1 178:1 179:1,9 180:1 181:1 182:1 183:1 183:16,20 184:1,7,8 185:1 186:1 187:1 188:1 188:15,18 188:20,24 189:1,7 190:1,2,9 190:17,20 190:23 191:1,4,9 191:13,25 192:1 billed 184:2 billion 99:19 101:24 102:3,9,10 bills 33:3 119:16 120:24 125:19 127:18 128:3 binding 120:6 120:7 birth 68:23 155:2,4 birthday 168:2 bit 29:3,4,5 32:17 60:5 67:14 71:22	152:9 black 32:25 121:24 124:22 Blackwell 1:10 2:2 3:4 4:12 10:4 10:10 12:21 12:25 13:4 16:2,8,14 16:17,24 17:3,7,11 18:12,21 26:19 27:18 28:14,23 34:22 35:6 35:11 41:2 45:18 50:4 52:10 55:21 56:13,16,23 58:12,17 60:11,22 61:17 62:12 63:17 64:16 65:13,25 66:10 74:11 74:17 76:21 77:22 79:21 80:9,14 81:14,20 91:9,13,16 94:17 96:13 98:18 99:5 99:13 101:9 103:10,20 106:16,25 111:24 112:8,12 121:13 123:6,12,15 123:18 129:2,10,15 129:19 130:2,5,11 130:15,19 130:22 139:5,12,17 139:22 140:7,17,23 141:10,13 141:22 142:6,13 152:10,18	153:23 154:3 156:4 156:13 162:8,17,21 166:25 168:20,24 172:18,21 173:11,15 174:6 176:20,24 177:4 178:8 178:20,24 178:25 179:7,17 180:6,8 181:19 182:6 183:15,21 184:5,23 185:2,5,25 186:4,23,25 187:8 188:11 190:7,13,16 191:7,18,21 191:24 Blackwell's 10:17 41:9 blitz 125:10 128:18 block 8:5,5,5 33:10 69:10 106:22 114:13 160:23 161:6 167:14 184:22 blocking 172:11 blocks 6:25 105:13,13 106:23,23 106:23 124:18 150:3 167:12 Blondell 1:12 9:25 61:18 98:23 107:6 107:15 122:7 141:15	189:14 blue 73:19 101:4 blur 36:2 board 34:2 83:7,10 Bob 9:21 BOBBY 1:11 body 189:9 189:16 bono 67:13 book 73:2,19 73:20,24 books 29:23 42:3 126:2 138:3 boost 128:22 boot 6:18 7:7 8:3,5,7 11:5 55:15,18 57:22 86:15 87:3 95:14 96:16 114:13 115:16 147:17,21 155:12 159:2 161:10 173:8,10,20 174:17 177:12,17 177:21 178:7,10,12 183:4 184:20 185:14,19 185:21,21 187:13 boot-eligible 43:15 135:4 184:16 bootable 186:17 booted 40:11 108:20 110:23 113:16 114:17,19 114:20 126:9 135:10,16 158:8 160:5	161:7 168:4 173:19 178:2 180:18 184:17 booting 7:19 25:18 33:11 57:11 105:13 125:10,11 128:13,18 167:12 boots 56:7 122:4 bootstrappi... 68:11 borrow 175:11 Boss 178:23 179:3,4 180:4,7 bottom 36:3 72:5 147:13 150:9,19 167:17 boundaries 73:9 branch 82:2 break 54:21 84:24 181:8 bring 6:22 9:3 83:9 110:3 120:22,23 120:23 147:18 171:21 bringing 127:10,11 152:2 Broad 125:4 broken 27:12 62:4 brother 126:8 brotherly 143:23,23 143:24 144:12 brothers 122:24 brought 25:23 30:12 30:14 93:2	100:2 brown 1:12 9:25 27:8 35:10,12,13 35:16 37:8 37:12,15,22 38:15,18 39:4,19,23 40:17,23 57:2,15 61:15,19,20 98:23 107:7 107:15 108:14 112:17 121:25 124:22 131:4,5,17 132:2,11 133:17,21 134:16 135:20 136:24 137:8,13,16 137:22 138:10,15 139:2 141:4 141:9,16 189:14 budget 9:8 32:8,13 165:11 build 169:25 building 79:14 109:16 built 167:23 bump 11:8 25:10 26:7 burden 6:12 126:23 127:24 burdens 10:21 Bureau 136:12 187:20 bus 79:19 157:19,20 157:20,24 buses 157:22 157:25 158:7	business 5:4,6 5:9,21 6:10 31:14 71:19 125:15,16 163:12 170:4 172:4 172:8 business-like 71:20 businesses 5:15,22 7:3 7:12 169:23 170:6 businessman 71:17 businessper... 170:20 Butkovitz 2:19 98:21 99:7,12 101:16,22 103:6,19 buys 76:12 C C-O-R-I-N-... 16:16,19 calculation 29:14 call 11:16 18:23 61:13 68:10 83:2 88:4 107:16 112:15 117:7 119:22 122:20 128:24 131:14 134:25 135:7 141:8 159:8 171:13 called 3:24 113:5 126:16 153:5 158:10,14 158:24 159:14 167:25 170:19 calling 22:22 27:5 128:12	camera 105:25 cancelled 105:11 capacity 92:22 capture 133:24 car 19:5 69:17 73:16 75:12,21 76:5,9,11 76:13,14 85:14,15 86:6,9,10 86:10,11,11 86:15,15 87:3,12,19 87:23,24 88:16 89:23 92:7,10 95:12,13,15 96:16,16,18 96:19 106:5 108:19,21 109:2,7,9 109:14 110:21,22 111:8 115:16,17 115:18,21 116:25 117:7,14,15 117:17 118:23 119:6 122:9 122:13,18 122:24 124:13 126:11,12 126:14 132:13,14 132:15,16 132:18 133:4,16 134:5,10,12 134:13 142:25 143:3,5,5,9 150:25 151:9,11 155:12 157:14,14
---	---	---	--	---	--	---	--

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 4

158:8,17,20	160:2 161:6	41:6 45:21	152:20,22	151:17,18	Clarena 2:17	167:8	187:15
158:22,24	167:12	46:3 47:13	156:6	city 1:2,6 5:3	16:5 124:7	codes 62:18	collects 14:4
159:3 160:4	180:25	55:16 58:5	Chief 10:12	5:4,6,8 6:24	128:19	cold 71:20	college
160:4,21	case 66:18	58:22 60:10	11:18 13:7	7:3,15 9:3	129:6 139:7	155:21	171:17
161:9	67:10,25	101:14	child 68:24	9:11 10:13	clarify 57:21	colleagues 2:6	collegiate
167:24	68:12,19	103:9 139:4	82:13,16,24	13:5 15:3,7	188:4	2:15 19:14	45:24
168:4,4,8,9	73:9 112:2	182:10	83:7,11,13	17:15,17	clarity 131:6	27:7 35:24	combination
177:23	126:17	186:13	86:5,6,6	18:6,7	class-action	63:8 112:18	73:3
178:3	152:19,23	188:22	child's 86:9	22:25 23:4	95:25	179:19	come 2:7,15
180:12,23	162:11	189:2,25	children 74:3	23:9,10	clause 164:19	186:6	2:16,21 5:8
183:11	cases 6:5	190:19,23	76:7 82:21	24:18,20	clean 8:25	collect 49:10	5:11,13
184:8	73:22 78:24	Chairperson	83:5 84:19	27:10,13	22:22 41:22	51:4 53:20	6:24 21:19
186:16	catch 7:23	46:3 189:15	86:18 95:13	28:2,7,18	48:18,19	54:13 63:20	22:18 23:15
card 143:11	categories	Chairwoman	95:18 98:10	29:25 30:4	clear 9:4	72:18 73:6	30:25 34:3
159:5	54:21	40:25 62:11	127:13,15	30:7 31:14	28:15,20	104:23	34:19 36:14
cards 171:10	category	99:13	127:17	32:24 34:14	49:22 50:3	182:15,17	51:2 59:21
171:11	72:11	123:18	157:23,24	42:6 47:5	56:22 61:21	182:21	61:12 77:8
care 62:7	cause 75:24	challenge	158:5,5	50:14,16	61:21 70:6	183:8 186:8	81:11 82:16
80:8 83:18	causes 68:8	35:20	163:5	55:19 64:11	105:24	186:9,10,19	82:20 83:9
88:17 98:11	71:10	chambers	165:17,17	67:12 68:20	111:10	collectable	84:24 87:20
118:11	127:25	94:23	165:20,22	70:23 72:10	186:2	102:8	87:24 88:10
121:4	133:14	109:12	choose 8:6	75:12 83:3	clearer 57:17	collected 14:8	88:13,23
160:22	caution 86:4	chance 6:14	Christ 163:4	84:11 86:5	clearing 33:9	17:23 20:18	93:19 94:5
careful	cemetery	189:23	Christine	86:18,19,24	clearly	26:23 69:7	94:9 95:11
178:13	168:3	change 60:16	2:17 10:11	92:3,5,5	124:17	74:8 78:17	98:22,25
carefully 84:6	cent 73:6	138:6	24:3 45:11	93:2,8,12	165:14	121:17,21	100:5,11
Carl 106:19	center 5:8	changes 28:4	59:7 177:8	94:25 99:21	Clements	collecting	102:4 106:6
123:19	6:24 122:10	28:7 37:24	Church 163:4	101:25	81:9 91:11	50:15	106:20
carries	171:16	46:20,25	Cindy 1:10	106:8	91:11,15,15	collection	107:9,9,13
190:17	centers	Chapman	9:20 28:24	113:22	91:17	17:19 18:3	107:15
191:22	122:11	130:3,4	circulated	120:9	clerical	25:12,14,16	114:12
carrying	certain 4:10	140:25	190:3	121:25	110:13	50:9 54:12	117:6
17:16	7:25 21:18	153:10	circumstance	122:12	111:5	72:17,18	120:16,21
cars 8:4	22:21 59:2	156:18,19	40:21	136:25	Clerk 2:24	99:20	125:25
33:10,10,11	72:12 77:7	162:15,19	133:25	137:7,9	4:2,4	139:19	128:7 129:9
64:3 75:9	160:7	Chapter 1:15	135:22	138:23	client 71:3	173:7	129:22
85:9,9,10	certainly 2:25	4:5	circumstan...	143:22	72:12	175:14,21	132:6
85:11	12:22 74:15	charge 70:13	38:22	148:4,8	clients 76:15	177:14	134:24
105:14	certificate	72:16 83:2	135:12	149:9	close 21:3	182:8,14,14	141:2,24,25
114:13,16	155:2,4	104:5	176:7	163:16,20	175:7	182:16	142:6 148:9
114:18,20	193:2	116:19	citations	166:23	closed 29:23	183:7,22	150:18
115:8,8,12	certification	129:7	70:16 71:7	168:14,16	closer 20:15	184:10,11	153:14
115:13	193:20	180:12,14	cities 95:6	169:24	clunker 76:17	185:14,18	156:7
118:15	CERTIFY	charging	citizen 81:23	171:17,18	Coard 3:16	185:23	158:22
122:5,15	193:3	143:20	111:19	City's 34:8,11	64:20 66:3	186:18	159:2
124:11	certifying	chasing 170:3	169:7 172:5	39:6 99:16	66:12 80:15	187:16	160:11
125:11	193:24	171:23	citizens 8:14	101:23	Coast 108:5	collections	161:4,5
136:4,19	cetera 67:20	cheap 76:13	32:24 38:2	Civic 81:25	code 1:15 4:6	14:10 25:4	163:7 167:9
145:9	chain 70:20	76:13	40:20 49:5	154:8	17:17 27:12	48:2,21	170:21
147:17	Chair 1:10	check 8:4	49:7 121:7	claim 80:25	27:17 30:6	49:25 67:22	171:14
152:14	3:20 9:21	15:12 20:25	133:25	85:17	46:17,18	70:22 71:17	179:11
154:22	13:4,4 20:4	29:24 30:3	147:5,23	claiming	47:10	100:8 101:8	184:17
156:24,24	26:17 29:2	114:10	149:25	82:17	123:20	175:9 182:4	187:2

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 5

192:11	104:7	conclude	64:14	corrected	45:19,20	2:2 3:4 4:12	112:8,12,16
comes 25:17	communities	181:23	144:20	72:8	46:12,24	9:20,24	112:23
30:11 46:22	63:23 98:6	188:19	180:13	correctly	47:8,12,16	10:4,10,17	113:3,12
55:10 61:25	121:21	concluded	contract	108:18	47:21 48:10	12:21,24,25	114:4,15,22
71:24 93:19	124:16	192:13	138:4	110:15,17	48:20,25	16:2,8,14	115:19
131:23	125:11	concludes	contractors	corrupt	49:6,11,17	16:17,24	118:13
163:23	community	12:11 15:23	172:7	126:25	49:20,24	17:3,7,11	121:13,17
166:22	94:22,24	conclusion	control 13:21	corruption	50:6,22	18:12,21	123:6,12,15
167:10	97:16	15:25 69:24	93:3 168:17	115:2	51:11,15,22	26:19 27:5	129:2,5,10
comfortable	123:25	conditions	176:8	cost 83:24	52:2,6,18	27:7,18	129:15,19
21:8	125:3	4:11	193:23	costs 54:20	52:21 53:8	28:14,23,24	130:2,5,11
comfortably	127:11,12	conference	Controller	72:21 91:2	53:21,25	28:25 29:19	130:15,19
177:22	127:16	115:15	26:25 98:20	181:7	54:14,23	30:20 31:11	130:22
coming 2:4	165:6	confident	99:6,12	Cottrells 3:17	55:4,24	31:21 32:6	131:4,5,17
33:9,11	company	14:14	101:22	66:5,14	56:5 57:3,6	32:23 34:12	132:2,11
46:9 78:25	187:23	confiscate	103:6,17,19	80:15	57:9,13,25	34:16,22	133:17,21
81:7 94:8	compared	120:5	104:17,21	Council 1:2	58:13,13,15	35:6,10,11	134:16
101:3	41:14 45:7	confused 41:7	105:5	13:17 15:3	58:19,20	35:12,13,16	135:20
103:18	compile 65:4	45:6 134:20	138:23	16:22 17:13	59:13,17	36:12 37:8	136:24
126:21	complaining	confusing	Controller's	30:23 61:15	64:22 65:18	37:12,15,22	137:8,13,16
129:11	183:23	136:8	137:9	71:23 77:20	65:23 74:24	38:15,18	137:22
133:11	complaint	confusion	convenient	84:12	101:11,13	39:4,19,23	138:10,15
145:3	167:8	64:25	5:5	123:18	102:13	40:17,23	139:2,5,12
146:11	complaints	133:15	convening	147:10	103:7	41:2,9	139:17,22
161:7 166:2	167:18	Connors	142:12	148:4,19	107:22	45:18 46:3	140:7,17,23
170:3	completed	139:18	conversation	150:4,11	138:8,11,16	50:4 52:10	141:4,9,10
comment	40:9	consider 9:15	85:18	151:20	138:20	55:21 56:13	141:13,22
9:18 67:14	completely	19:24 80:24	copies 104:15	167:6	140:9	56:16,20,23	142:6,11,13
comments	31:16	179:20	104:18	179:11	144:16	57:2,15	144:10
10:2,7	113:13	consideration	copy 63:13	191:3,4,12	146:21,23	58:12,17,23	152:18
Commission	compliance	164:7	70:10 88:19	191:14	148:24	60:11,22	153:23
141:18	6:22 38:9	considered	89:11,19	192:4,6	149:7,18	61:15,17,18	154:3 156:4
commit 140:3	compliant	29:9 163:22	103:21	Council's	166:15	61:20 62:12	156:13
140:6	38:3,6,11	consistently	154:14	13:5 136:25	179:15	63:12,17	162:8,17,21
commitment	complication	114:11	190:2	Councilman	182:9,24	64:16,23	166:25
139:10,15	68:23	constituent	Corinne	1:11,11,12	183:5,13	65:13,25	168:20,24
committed	component	39:3 40:13	16:10	1:13 9:22	186:12,21	66:10 74:11	172:18,21
10:15 12:9	165:7	constituents	corner 83:17	9:23 18:23	187:5	74:17 76:20	173:11,15
58:8	computer	5:24 11:25	corners 69:16	20:2,3,14	188:25	77:21 79:21	174:6
committee	116:2	38:24 95:2	corporate	21:10 22:3	190:22	80:9,14	176:20,24
1:3 3:23	concede	95:2 96:4	159:9	22:13 23:6	councilmanic	81:14,20	177:4 178:8
13:6 19:23	71:16	Constitution	correct 23:24	23:14 24:7	57:10,16,23	82:5 91:9	178:20,24
30:24 33:24	concerned	166:9	32:3 38:17	24:14,23	Councilme...	91:13,16	178:25
58:4,6 65:9	6:2 13:22	contact 112:3	41:22 42:9	25:6,15	188:23	94:17,21	179:7,17
99:14	concerning	177:14	42:10 44:20	26:2,15	190:20	96:13 98:18	180:6,8
140:12	163:10	188:4	47:20 50:20	35:8,9 41:4	Councilme...	98:22 99:5	181:19
167:7	165:11	contacted	50:21 61:7	41:5,23	35:24	99:15,17	182:6
179:10	concerns 12:3	68:14 69:21	125:14	42:7,11,15	Councilmen	101:9	183:15,21
188:15	66:18	contained	138:17	42:19 43:11	118:11	103:10,20	184:5,23
190:4,25	156:20	193:5	148:25	43:23 44:4	Councilpeo...	106:16,25	185:2,5,25
191:10	concession	continually	183:12,17	44:8,12,16	47:11	107:6,14	186:4,23,25
192:2,8,13	19:12	68:7	186:20	44:16,21	Councilwo...	108:12	187:8
Commonwe...	concise 65:5	continue 36:5	193:8	45:2,5,16	1:10,10,12	111:24	188:11

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 6

189:14,20	crews 7:20,21	Datsun 181:4	decent 86:21	24:15 25:2	directly 14:16	32:11,12,14	100:19
190:7,13,16	64:8,9	DAVID 1:12	decided	25:9,20	director	33:15 36:4	101:24
191:7,18,21	139:25	day 30:18	165:13	26:14 38:23	16:12,25	36:9,19	102:3,10,11
191:24	140:2	33:3 57:23	decipher	39:14,21	17:6,8	46:4 47:17	102:12
Councilwo...	criminal	64:9 78:18	136:14	40:7,22	124:7	50:17 55:5	161:3,12
11:15 12:3	77:22 96:9	83:4,4	decision	59:12 65:22	128:20,21	57:10,16,23	door 118:19
counsel 70:19	crisis 127:23	95:17 98:10	35:22 39:3	deserve	139:19	62:3 63:19	double 92:22
counties 77:4	criteria 75:18	110:6,7,20	50:13 85:25	169:15	140:5	63:22	184:2,3
77:12	critical 55:9	128:14	134:4 189:6	designating	162:10	102:15	doubling
counting	68:8	160:10,12	decisions	165:24	directors	105:2	125:23
126:4	cross-refere...	160:17	35:23	designed	138:6	114:16	down-paym...
country 92:6	86:2,3,14	164:10	deduct 96:24	72:20	disabled	127:14,15	45:12
95:5 147:24	86:25	169:18	deeply 10:16	desks 166:20	174:11,14	141:5,17	down-paym...
148:16	cross-refere...	180:20,22	default 40:14	despite 71:7	175:10	149:5	39:25 40:5
149:24	85:22	days 88:22	deficit 55:12	111:4	disappointed	157:17,19	draconian
county 68:21	105:15	99:22	define 38:9	destroy	82:9	157:25	124:3
148:5,10	cross-talk	100:16,18	38:10 39:10	170:16	discuss 67:9	161:20	drag 173:2
couple 53:6	65:2	118:7	definitely	destroying	116:8,8,11	165:12	drain 83:2
77:20	crossing	128:16	35:5 59:14	171:24	discussed	166:3	drawing 34:2
186:10	157:5	145:24	65:23	detail 3:22	20:19	District's	34:19
course 19:19	161:19	159:10	delinquencies	15:10 60:23	discussing	32:8	dreaded 6:18
69:7 109:17	crowd 84:22	164:15	53:22 54:2	70:4	53:13 138:5	districts	drilling 57:4
136:11	curbside 5:5	180:23	56:7 62:5	detailed 69:6	discussion	150:6	drive 38:21
153:10	curfews 64:7	de-criminal...	delinquency	details 60:17	69:24	Division	69:16
court 75:7,14	current 40:6	77:24	48:2,12,21	deterrent	discussions	167:7	152:14
75:17 76:3	currently	deal 66:7	50:19 55:15	5:20	35:4	doctor 74:2	155:23
77:15 78:2	12:2 40:3,8	80:22,23	delinquent	dictate 38:21	disenfranch...	doctors 76:7	drives 95:6
78:5,14	68:24	83:25 93:21	25:4 54:19	difference	98:7 123:22	76:8	driving 92:7
109:10	108:10	105:3	59:9 99:24	8:17 26:24	disenfranch...	documented	185:19
181:7,11	cursed 115:4	117:11	demanding	41:8,13,13	98:5	108:17	drop-off
courtesy	customer	120:25	161:16	45:8 103:13	dishearteni...	127:23	23:21
45:24	170:3	122:17	denying	different 26:3	71:22	doggone	dropping
courtroom	customers	dealer 117:21	176:17	26:4 27:14	dismiss 176:4	121:9	113:23
68:10	170:7	dealerships	Department	55:18 58:25	dismissed	doing 5:20	drops 49:18
coward 82:13		122:16	24:12 39:16	60:5 91:24	89:20 90:4	31:3 83:15	due 5:23
cowardly	D	dealing 62:6	59:15 68:7	102:25	dispute	83:15 91:24	109:8,13
82:20	daily 56:12	80:20 90:5	68:25	104:11	145:16	97:15	120:15
cowards	124:6	dealings	169:14	124:10,12	disrespectful	113:24	170:7
83:10 84:2	163:22	deals 178:14	Departmenten...	143:10	93:7	116:16	189:21
crack 174:24	Damarys	debate 22:9	40:4	148:12	distribute	121:3	Duly 190:6
crack-addic...	106:19	debates 23:18	depending	156:8	92:19	123:17	191:6
174:25	damn 115:3	Deborah	26:8 58:6	difficult	district 2:9	125:18	duty 17:16
176:9	Dancy 130:6	130:20	depressed	21:11 30:25	5:7 10:22	127:9,18	dwindling
crashed	141:2 153:9	153:6 163:3	118:17	dilemma	11:11,14,19	128:22	84:23
89:24	154:19,20	debt 5:23	Deputy 16:11	67:11	11:22 12:16	144:21	dynamic 26:5
creating 18:8	155:9	6:15 48:8	16:25 17:5	diligence	13:8,14,17	171:23	
121:8	156:10,11	70:2,15	17:7 128:20	189:21	13:21 14:17	172:7,12	E
credit 78:3	darn 121:11	71:8,9 72:4	162:10	dime 96:8	14:20,23	178:23	earlier 32:2
96:6,21	data 20:13,24	72:20,23	Derenick--...	diminish 74:7	15:4,19	dollar 50:11	41:17 99:7
143:11	21:6 55:5	74:7 145:24	10:11	direct 110:5	20:8 27:9	76:17	101:17
159:5	68:18	146:4,10	Derenick-L...	193:23	28:17 29:7	dollars 9:3	140:11
171:10,11	189:17	181:14	2:18 10:9	directing	29:13,21	36:8 67:23	181:2
crew 2:20	date 77:6		12:23 24:10	151:16	30:16 31:24	99:19	182:20
	145:25						earn 86:21

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 7

ease 169:21	186:16	estimate	121:23	face 82:22	180:20	184:10,13	82:1 83:1
easier 65:6	enforcing	29:15 30:22	examiners	facing 26:13	181:10,10	184:16	84:1 85:1
East 108:5	105:22	30:25	69:22	fact 11:25	feeds 95:7	185:22	86:1 87:1
education	enhancing	estimated	example	68:3 104:20	feel 6:25 8:14	filed 117:13	88:1 89:1
5:13 165:21	68:5	62:17	115:7	108:9	9:11,12	files 185:15	90:1 91:1
effect 63:22	enjoy 171:17	estimates	149:14	109:19,21	33:12 66:20	filing 181:7	92:1 93:1
99:22	enjoying	59:23	examples	110:21	101:3	fill 141:6	94:1 95:1
effectively	171:18	et 67:20	188:2	111:4 114:3	111:15	filled 90:23	96:1 97:1
13:17 15:12	enrolls 51:5	Evans 129:24	excess 78:15	114:4	124:25	final 58:7	98:1 99:1
68:5	enter 120:9	129:25	100:2	116:24	149:24	65:10	99:14 100:1
effects 24:6	181:24	140:25	Excuse 17:2	125:7	160:18	finally 4:16	101:1 102:1
32:20	188:20	144:21,22	55:23 56:23	138:25	feeling 7:7	102:2	103:1 104:1
efficient	entertainm...	153:10	64:24 91:13	163:11,18	feels 32:20	Finance 1:3	105:1 106:1
100:24	5:15	event 87:9,13	173:14	factor 71:13	fees 1:17 4:9	2:1 3:1,24	107:1 108:1
effort 79:5	entire 33:9	87:19,20	executive	163:9	11:5 13:12	4:1 5:1 6:1	109:1 110:1
efforts 14:11	81:23 116:4	eventually	16:11 17:5	factors 72:15	70:13 80:18	7:1 8:1 9:1	111:1 112:1
25:13,16	entitled 1:15	23:11 100:5	17:8 138:6	failing 149:25	181:7,15,16	10:1 11:1	113:1 114:1
152:10,16	4:6	everybody	140:5	fair 28:16	felt 129:9	12:1 13:1,5	115:1 116:1
189:22	entity 149:12	8:25 9:2	exhaust	37:18 60:24	167:18	14:1 15:1	117:1 118:1
eight 43:17	164:4	42:9,20	143:11	64:13	female 84:22	16:1 17:1	119:1 120:1
either 14:17	166:11	51:2,3,5,16	exist 64:14	161:22	Fenton 113:4	18:1 19:1	121:1 122:1
60:3 156:15	environment	59:3,5,24	71:22 135:3	162:7 166:6	152:21	19:23 20:1	123:1 124:1
elect 149:9	121:8	60:2 74:23	existence 2:11	166:22	156:5	21:1 22:1	125:1 126:1
elected	epidemic	86:4 90:23	97:3	189:23	fight 79:13	23:1 24:1	127:1 128:1
147:24	62:23	91:25	exists 72:7	fairness 12:7	118:17	25:1 26:1	129:1 130:1
148:17	174:24	102:19	expect 19:16	fairytale	fighting	27:1 28:1	131:1 132:1
150:2	equal 57:19	107:24	36:4 79:6	102:2	93:15	29:1 30:1	133:1 134:1
electronic	equals 73:2	111:23	162:5	fake 84:17	119:25	31:1 32:1	135:1 136:1
132:17	equipment	112:20	166:21,22	fall 72:10	figure 14:18	33:1 34:1	137:1 138:1
elements	169:16	138:21	expecting	familiar	15:14 20:7	35:1 36:1	139:1 140:1
71:19	equipped	152:25	95:16	74:24	21:22 22:4	37:1 38:1	141:1 142:1
eligible	123:11	153:3,5,12	experience	family 6:2,9	23:16 26:8	39:1,15	143:1 144:1
101:20	era 103:23	180:10	39:6 87:8	175:11	33:22 79:11	40:1 41:1	145:1 146:1
183:4	erased 42:6	192:7,9	108:4	far 12:4 26:9	115:22	42:1 43:1	147:1 148:1
185:14,22	error 110:13	everybody's	experienced	85:24	136:14	44:1 45:1	149:1 150:1
eliminate	110:13	95:17	24:20	163:17	143:10	46:1 47:1	151:1 152:1
169:21	111:5	evidence	expert 73:17	168:6	144:25	48:1 49:1	153:1 154:1
embarrass...	especially 8:2	118:6 158:3	explain 28:5	174:13	168:15	50:1 51:1	155:1 156:1
83:14	55:10 73:13	193:4	146:7 186:6	farther 23:22	figures 20:10	52:1 53:1	157:1 158:1
emotional	169:23	evidently	explained	farthest 53:5	21:11 53:4	54:1 55:1	159:1 160:1
161:24	Esquire 66:4	168:18	20:12 70:21	fast 170:22	59:3,19	56:1 57:1	161:1 162:1
employed	66:4,5	exacerbated	89:10	father 136:5	60:5,7 61:6	58:1 59:1	163:1 164:1
37:20	essential	14:24	explanation	fault 111:13	61:7 63:15	60:1 61:1	165:1 166:1
empty 119:4	163:17	exact 21:11	15:11	favor 190:10	67:18 73:3	62:1 63:1	167:1 168:1
ended 19:13	165:10	47:6 60:6	extended	191:15	128:8	64:1 65:1	169:1 170:1
27:25 39:7	Essington	72:23	38:20	favorable	163:12	66:1 67:1	171:1 172:1
ends 77:11	119:2	exactly 57:4	extent 14:22	190:25	Filbert 69:23	68:1 69:1	173:1 174:1
87:20	establish 1:16	132:3	extort 173:25	191:10	110:6	70:1 71:1	175:1 176:1
133:10	4:8 104:8	135:14	extra 9:3	192:3	file 43:15	72:1 73:1	177:1 178:1
enforce 57:22	establishme...	149:21	extreme 6:7	fear 6:17	113:8 117:9	74:1 75:1	179:1 180:1
enforcement	13:11	150:13	extremely	February	117:10	76:1 77:1	181:1 182:1
14:11 55:19	estate 21:20	151:14	5:25	4:15	182:18,18	78:1 79:1	183:1 184:1
124:24	31:13	examined		fee 143:19	182:23	80:1 81:1	185:1 186:1
			F				

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 8

187:1 188:1	14:20 24:11	182:22	158:22	145:15	giving 21:8	147:11	78:20,22,23
189:1 190:1	24:16,17	following	182:22	gate 3:9	59:19 61:7	148:7,13,14	79:12,15,15
191:1 192:1	25:3,4	24:17 61:22	185:12	General	76:9 104:14	148:18	80:5,5 81:4
192:13	27:25 29:23	68:13	framework	137:15	113:24	150:16,17	81:9 82:17
financial 5:22	fit 157:23	food 70:20	34:21	generation	128:6 169:9	150:17,17	82:18 83:22
6:12 11:18	five 7:21 8:19	force 105:19	frankly 69:6	163:5	171:24	150:25	84:25 85:13
11:21 13:7	19:11,15	Ford 117:20	73:12	gentleman	179:21	156:11	85:21,24
14:25 15:5	23:19 26:23	foregoing	111:20	136:10	glad 81:4	158:14	86:9,10,13
36:21 115:2	36:13 41:20	193:7,20	free 19:19	gentlemen	go 2:12 8:3	160:11,23	87:2 88:12
find 8:4 77:9	42:2,25	foreign 150:7	66:20	66:11	19:6 23:18	161:21	90:7,10
89:21	43:3,20,24	foreseeable	freeze 128:12	getting 3:21	23:22 26:9	168:3	91:22 92:8
131:18	44:2,4	70:9	friend/relat...	15:4 38:12	30:7 31:25	169:13	92:11,14
135:14	45:14 47:18	Forget	69:4	43:7,21	33:3,21	170:7	96:25 98:9
151:2	48:6,7,17	147:22	front 22:8	49:15 50:16	34:2,19	171:16	102:21
161:11	48:22 49:14	forgive 50:23	25:7 67:7	50:17 75:20	35:9 38:25	173:7	105:4,13
finding 12:9	49:18 50:9	forgiven 11:6	79:18 82:13	76:5 92:21	42:5 45:12	174:18	106:14
fine 6:6,6	50:10,18	11:10 21:18	82:17,21	92:22	47:9 48:16	175:23	109:9,13
51:24 52:2	51:7,12,14	51:8 54:24	83:11,13	134:22	49:11 52:7	176:5,18	111:25
174:18	52:9 54:15	forgiveness	106:2	151:17	53:5,13	179:25	112:4 117:4
178:25	54:24 61:23	99:24	118:19	155:21	57:5 63:6	181:5	117:4
183:14	76:16,21	forgiving	177:25	158:6	64:2,10	182:21	120:17
fines 1:17 4:9	89:20 90:17	52:12	frustrating	161:24	65:3 70:15	187:12,14	123:9
5:23 6:23	91:4 114:18	forgot 143:3	71:19	164:14,25	74:4 75:16	goal 10:17	124:14
13:12 17:20	161:6	Forina 16:14	full 92:23	165:20	76:6 78:5	God 163:4	125:10
52:12,16,19	167:13	form 117:13	96:22	166:4 184:2	78:17 82:24	goes 25:11	126:2,15
52:22 54:16	185:11,11	formula 30:6	105:19	give 6:13	85:25 86:6	27:9,9,13	128:17
54:20 62:4	185:13	forth 92:8	122:19	17:21 19:19	86:16,20,24	27:21 28:6	129:21
84:9 90:15	187:22	95:18,19	179:11	20:9 27:19	87:12,15,19	28:11 30:8	131:14
90:16 101:5	five-year	145:21	180:2	29:14 56:13	87:25 89:3	36:19 44:18	133:5
126:13	18:25 41:10	155:24	full-term	59:22 78:3	90:23 93:21	47:3,5	135:15,18
175:18	45:8	158:6	128:21	78:10 84:10	95:11,13,14	50:14 62:2	141:5,16
finish 87:6	five-year-old	forward 2:16	fully 193:5	88:2 90:13	95:18 98:2	76:10,12	142:17
91:2 153:18	68:23 69:18	2:21 3:2	function	91:4,14	98:8,15	86:23 135:2	145:2,12,14
finished	fix 135:21	7:12 8:24	165:5	96:4,6	100:17	151:7 181:9	148:13,18
18:18	flabbergast...	9:16 12:10	funding 12:8	104:18	107:22	going 2:4,15	148:24
fired 92:10	109:19,25	18:8 21:19	15:20	105:4	110:6,19	7:16 9:7,7,8	152:12
157:22	fleece 78:7	29:12 33:25	funds 13:18	111:21	113:22	18:22 19:8	153:18
firm 147:16	floor 56:19,25	81:11 98:22	32:14	114:9 121:5	114:8,14,17	21:13 22:20	158:4
first 2:16 30:7	79:14 189:9	98:25	165:25	154:5,12,14	114:19	22:21 23:4	159:20
30:19 37:17	189:18	106:20	further 14:24	154:23	115:17	28:8 30:14	160:16,18
40:8 42:24	Florida	125:25	191:2,11	156:4,14	116:5,17	30:15,18	161:9 162:9
43:2 46:17	147:18	128:14	future 15:18	169:5	117:6,19,20	42:24 43:7	162:12,22
48:22 49:12	fluctuates	141:2	35:4 38:3	170:18	118:24	43:13,15,21	164:2 170:9
54:9 56:25	36:16	153:14	70:9	171:2,10	119:4,8,20	45:14 46:15	170:10
66:17 77:8	folk 106:14	156:7		172:5	122:9,15,24	50:7 51:3	173:2
91:14	folks 2:19	189:19	G	177:15	124:9,17	55:11 58:8	177:12
110:22	4:19 23:15	four 49:14	gangsterized	given 8:22	125:2,3,3	59:3,5 60:2	178:6
113:2	26:22 33:2	54:9,10	144:2	15:12 20:13	130:24	61:9,11,12	180:19
115:23	33:2 103:21	102:4	gangsters	22:5 69:3	134:11	63:11,12	181:4,21,23
136:5 157:3	188:14	115:10	87:5 92:25	100:21	136:12	64:6,18	184:11,15
191:3,13	follow 22:19	122:10,11	114:5,6	134:2	139:24	66:2 67:9	184:17
192:5	30:6 36:8	122:12	123:3,4	gives 18:15	141:15	75:24 76:4	187:24,25
fiscal 13:20	132:23	156:23	Garden	36:20 57:17	146:2 147:8	76:5,8,20	188:6 189:5
			109:10				

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 9

good 2:2 9:11 10:10 12:20 13:3 16:4 35:13,14,15 39:7 66:24 75:3 81:19 81:20 94:19 94:20 99:12 122:17,17 123:15 142:10 144:13 149:6 163:2 167:5 172:24 gotten 24:24 116:20 174:15 government 46:7 163:20 Governor's 166:17 graduated 74:25 grand 114:9 114:10 granted 6:15 grateful 146:16 great 5:13 118:13 Greenlee 1:11 9:24 18:24 20:2,3,14 21:10 22:3 22:13 23:6 23:14 24:7 24:14,23 25:6,15 26:2,15 44:17 58:14 58:19,20 59:17 101:11,13 102:13 103:7 107:22 182:9,24 183:5,13 186:12,21 Greg 153:16 grid 61:22 groceries	74:5 gross 28:6 30:2 46:22 46:24 47:3 61:23 62:8 group 123:23 130:7,16 141:3 groups 112:15 131:2 grow 7:3 gruesome 6:11 guard 157:5 161:19 Guardian 81:25 154:8 guess 21:15 25:16 26:7 29:3 45:22 45:23 59:24 60:9 83:6 106:2 182:25 guilty 77:9 gung-ho 140:13 guns 121:10 guy 76:3 guy's 87:23 guys 26:12 59:21 H half 69:9 89:6 90:14 102:5 160:6 Hall 1:6 handicap 175:12 handle 88:14 187:14 188:9 handy 15:18 hang 69:15 happen 102:21 132:25 133:20,22 happened 9:10 40:14 89:11 103:22	110:7 113:10 132:24 135:15,19 136:3,3,22 143:4 161:14 178:15 happening 57:11 97:19 126:7 152:4 185:17 188:6 happens 29:25 30:3 33:15 43:9 93:5 120:8 133:20 141:7 185:19 happy 12:13 15:24 154:13 156:9 harass 72:19 hard 29:10 33:3 60:6 135:24 169:25 192:8 hard-worki... 111:18 harder 49:10 53:19 97:25 hardship 12:7 100:21 163:15 164:4,7 Harrisburg 103:25 Hashim 81:11 107:20,21 107:23,24 112:6,10 head 2:17 44:11 105:18 146:10 154:7 headquarters 159:9 heads 106:9	health 127:22 healthcare 68:25 hear 11:15 63:24 66:17 104:19 163:6,12,14 178:21 heard 56:25 60:15 63:25 64:6 67:15 144:22 146:14 152:2 153:8 154:21 hearing 2:12 2:13,13 3:7 4:21 5:17 7:24 19:4 55:9 63:14 69:21 77:9 88:24 89:3 89:4,4,7,8 94:7,8 107:5 142:12 150:12 179:10 180:2 181:24 188:19 192:11 hearings 179:25 heart 171:6 heavy 146:10 heck 117:3 held 117:17 117:17 126:25 144:3 176:10 hell 115:5 116:11 120:18 126:21 Hello 107:20 107:23 help 9:11 33:21 37:4 46:7 65:16 78:23 91:22 134:16	156:2 157:7 159:17 170:2 189:18 helpful 36:11 36:23 40:18 57:8 helping 10:18 helps 65:17 Henon 1:11 9:22 13:4 27:5 35:8,9 45:19,20 46:12,24 47:8,12,16 47:21 48:10 48:20,25 49:6,11,17 49:20,24 50:6,22 51:11,15,22 52:2,6,18 52:21 53:8 53:21,25 54:14,23 55:4,24 56:5 57:4,6 57:25 64:22 65:18 113:3 120:12 138:8,11,16 138:20 140:9 179:15 187:5 188:23,25 190:20,22 Henon's 57:9 Hi 156:18 168:25 174:10 high 19:11 23:25 high-level 15:13 higher 20:22 70:18 115:22 highest 95:5 hips 68:22 hire 138:3 186:7,9 history 36:13	36:19 61:23 91:20,20 134:20 136:15,20 hit 23:10 84:7 85:4 hold 37:11,14 72:6 103:15 112:16 120:4,7 147:24 148:16 149:25 154:17 holders 61:3 holding 83:10 119:19 home 69:11 95:12 145:24 146:11 168:7 homework 135:21 honestly 63:22 151:21 honey 23:22 honor 35:17 35:19 hooked 123:3 hoopdies 115:11 hope 9:13 65:3 94:4 152:16 hopefully 128:15 178:13 189:6 hoping 21:18 57:5 188:17 horror 5:17 hospital 113:23 142:25 hospitals 160:25 hostage 117:17,18 hour 86:22 88:11,13 135:7	180:19 184:22 hours 89:6 158:22,23 161:9 house 54:4 106:2,3 155:25 177:24,25 houses 85:13 Howard 167:14 Hoy 3:16 66:4,13 74:19,20,21 75:11 76:24 79:23 human 71:13 71:21 72:15 163:9 165:7 humanity 164:20 171:6 hundred 76:17 100:19 160:19 161:3,12 hundreds 5:14 hunt 124:15 128:24 hurt 9:7,8,8 30:19 82:8 157:21 163:7 husband 174:25 176:9 hustle 122:16 I I'mma 83:19 ID 110:16 120:22 idea 9:10 25:24 101:24 ideas 21:17 identify 99:10 107:18 123:16 153:2 illegal 95:24	120:3 172:4 illness 127:22 illustrated 123:24 imagine 44:19 immediately 70:14 75:13 immensely 72:11 immobilized 108:22 111:8 impact 11:21 14:10,23 102:16 impacted 100:22 impacts 10:21 13:13 imperative 12:7 implemented 179:5 importance 32:10 important 40:18 67:17 99:8 129:9 192:9 impossible 6:10 impound 96:17 175:7 175:13 impoundme... 133:10 134:8 135:9 180:21,24 impoverished 121:18 include 44:22 164:19 included 98:9 98:11,13,14 includes 17:18 148:3 148:4,5 including 5:9 inclusion 98:12 income 114:11
---	--	---	--	--	---	--	---

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 10

120:23	110:4,24	interrupt	Jerry 139:18	keeping 98:5	93:25,25	86:20	102:7
121:22	112:3,4	148:25	Jersey 100:6	106:11	94:7 95:6	lastly 39:5	liability 50:25
increase 7:19	134:2 138:9	intolerable	Joan 26:25	Kelley 73:19	95:21 96:12	late 11:4	license
24:16 25:12	152:6	74:9	job 37:11,14	kicker 92:11	97:16	151:8 173:3	103:24
increased	154:11,24	introduce	86:19 157:5	92:13	101:16,18	Lately 5:17	108:17
72:4,5	162:13	10:6 66:21	157:6,10,16	kids 33:16	102:17	law 72:17	154:25
increases	179:16,18	81:6,16	157:19,22	80:8 90:10	105:24	74:25 75:2	155:3
47:4,5	179:21	149:15	160:4	155:20	109:21	76:25	lie 110:23
independent	182:10,11	187:6	161:17,19	167:20	113:17	138:13,22	119:13
68:12	189:10,13	introduced	172:9,13	kill 78:7	114:24	lawsuit 95:25	lied 161:2
indicated	189:17	4:14 73:11	jobs 121:5	killing 127:16	115:4,9	lawyer 95:21	lien 168:8
102:7	informed	82:5	Joe 76:6	Kim 140:25	116:21	96:17	liens 168:7
indignant	35:21,23	inundated	John 103:22	Kimberly	118:23	155:25	life 5:25
119:21	50:13	114:25	104:7	130:3 153:9	119:14	159:24	81:24
individual	ingenuity	investment	129:23	156:19	122:7 123:9	Leader	104:10
67:12 68:15	46:8	13:25	136:8,8	kind 20:6	124:21	153:17	116:4
68:15,19	initiative	invite 2:20	140:24	21:21 22:4	126:3,18	leaders 94:24	143:17,25
69:3,8,11	15:15 39:13	98:21	144:22	23:20 25:19	127:19	League 81:25	lifelong 68:20
69:20 72:3	injunction	involved	152:21,21	29:9 71:20	134:18	154:8	107:25
73:5 78:24	128:15	58:24 75:8	153:10	82:9 100:23	138:7,21	learned 39:5	light 184:14
148:22	injury 151:6	101:20	154:11	102:10	139:7 141:5	leave 64:24	limit 112:18
152:19	innocent	IRS 125:21	156:5	148:25	141:23	84:22	168:13
184:12	134:2	issuance	Johnny	164:5,12	146:6,11,18	109:16	limitation
individual's	inside 94:23	17:18	156:12	167:9	154:7	110:5 123:5	77:11 97:14
72:4	95:23	issue 29:24	Jones 106:19	kiosk 87:11	155:19	162:14	171:12
individually	153:24	35:19 83:25	123:17,19	87:16,18,22	156:3	leaving 39:2	limitations
152:23	insight 15:8	98:15 104:3	Joseph 3:16	174:16	167:15	110:8	77:3,13,18
individuals	17:21	128:25	66:4,13,25	kiosks 174:13	168:5 171:7	left 9:23,24	limited 10:18
6:14 10:18	inspections	143:17	judge 128:16	knew 130:24	173:3 176:8	28:9,12	20:13
70:6 150:10	169:10	145:12,14	judge's	know 3:12	176:15	30:8 159:14	line 36:3 72:5
inevitably	instances	145:17	109:11	8:9 18:24	177:9,18	176:13	147:13
11:11	131:18	154:20	judgment	19:2,8,20	178:5	leftover 90:11	150:19
infinity 44:2	133:22	169:4 192:8	160:13	19:21 20:21	179:24	leftovers	167:17
info 63:11	instantaneo...	issued 62:16	July 115:14	21:10,12	180:3,11	84:11	Linebarger
104:14	73:20	62:25 69:10	117:2	25:22 26:3	knowing 60:3	legal 120:5,6	188:4
information	instructed	131:12	junior 136:6	26:13 31:23	knowledge	legislative	lines 169:18
4:18,20	87:12 89:2	issues 69:5	jurisdiction	36:3,18,23	109:3	137:2	list 3:11 42:8
7:17,18	insurance	71:21 80:23	182:25	36:25 37:10	knowledgea...	legitimate	42:20 58:3
11:21 14:3	86:7	127:10,11	183:6,10	37:13 40:19	123:11	174:20	65:5 147:17
14:25 35:20	intend 64:14	144:2	justification	42:7 44:9	known	176:2	147:21
35:22,25	interest 44:22	146:19	15:18	45:6 46:19	112:24	legitimately	153:25
46:16 55:8	44:25 45:3	148:22		47:6 48:24	knows 179:23	176:5	155:13
55:22 56:18	51:18,21,21	169:3	K	50:24 52:22	Krajewski	Lenore	173:21
56:24 58:9	51:22 90:16	issuing 85:8	K 1:11	55:7 56:15	27:2 99:18	174:11	177:12,17
59:14 60:8	100:2	85:13 122:4	Kalunji	59:7,19	100:9	let's 31:25	177:21
60:20 61:2	interested	item 68:8	81:11	60:6 64:25		letter 118:7	178:7,10,12
61:3 62:16	70:24 122:8	items 119:4	107:21,24	66:19 72:9	L	118:22	187:17
63:7,19	179:4		keep 43:7,21	72:14,21	L 1:10 193:14	119:6,13	listen 118:10
65:2,7,11	interface	J	52:15 80:4	76:10 77:21	ladies 66:11	135:2	119:20
65:19,20	131:9	jammed 5:22	96:8 101:5	84:17 85:15	160:22	letters 110:11	listened 71:23
93:7 99:8	Interim 124:7	33:4	134:5 166:8	85:17,20	lady 46:4	letting 45:23	84:5
104:19	internal 54:2	Jannie 1:10	171:15,17	91:19,19	61:16	level 15:10	listening
108:16	138:22	82:5	171:20	92:2,3,12	135:14	100:17	83:16
		Jeff 104:13	188:14		Langhorne		

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 11

145:13	108:12	143:23,23	9:22	member	28:17,18	127:5	186:8,19
162:20	110:8	low 53:6	Market	79:20 99:4	30:12 32:2	mistake 88:9	monies 67:22
173:12	126:18	low-income	158:21	141:21	32:9 42:4,5	110:17	157:18
174:7 177:3	135:18	98:6	185:20	178:19	47:23 48:9	111:11	160:7
litany 147:9	138:24	low-value	married	182:2,5	50:19 51:6	mistakes 6:3	monitor
151:24	147:11	68:4 73:14	174:24	186:24	51:10,12	6:5,16	157:19,20
little 20:15	150:24,25	lower 62:18	match 117:24	members 6:3	52:8 53:2,7	misunderst...	Monson 2:18
24:19 29:3	156:9 162:9	lunch 84:24	151:2	13:5 23:13	53:9,9,15	149:2	11:17 13:3
29:4 32:17	162:11,22	lurking 106:3	math 67:16	37:7 42:13	53:17 62:17	model 73:18	13:6 20:7
41:7 60:5	looked 41:18	lying 111:21	matter 35:4	46:14 57:14	67:19,19	modeled	20:12,16
67:14 76:2	84:14		116:25	59:16 65:12	78:15 90:8	100:6	30:17
77:5 88:15	looking 42:4	M	143:22	85:5 99:13	90:9 100:3	moment	Montez
89:18	46:5 52:25	M 167:6	193:7	106:24	100:7 102:9	67:10	154:20
105:20	53:14	ma'am 39:22	matters 35:17	123:24	102:12	money 19:7	month 30:4,5
140:13	103:18	112:10	35:18 62:8	141:12	103:24	19:16 22:6	79:4 113:15
152:9	168:11	162:25	62:8 77:23	175:12	104:23	22:7 23:8	115:20
live 104:11	186:11	174:9	77:25,25	184:4 186:3	135:11	26:10,11	117:18,18
105:25	looks 25:3	176:25	McLaughlin	189:15	166:2,4,4,5	27:12 30:4	167:13
165:5	lose 20:9	mad 115:5	136:8,9	190:4	mind 34:18	30:15 32:10	179:13
177:22	26:11 29:13	Madam 20:4	mean 22:3	mental	160:6	36:14 53:18	month-plus
lived 108:2	31:24 79:16	26:17 29:2	25:21,23	127:22,22	175:10	75:19 77:25	150:20
116:3	148:13	40:25 41:6	38:6,7,8	mention 5:15	mine 106:7	77:25 79:3	monthly 30:2
119:17	losing 27:20	45:21 58:21	44:10 56:10	mentioned	111:13	80:6 84:8	40:2 42:12
155:10	29:7 170:6	60:10 62:10	111:15,18	36:15 47:23	155:17	87:10,15	months 7:18
lives 69:11,12	loss 15:16	101:14	140:11	153:4	minimize	90:11 92:15	8:22 19:10
75:12	24:18	103:9 139:4	168:5 171:8	163:13	32:9	92:19 93:13	19:17 20:17
169:17	losses 11:12	180:9 182:9	184:24	181:2	minimum	94:10,11,12	38:20,25
living 86:21	125:16,18	186:12	meaning	Mercedes	20:21 21:2	94:13 96:7	39:11,12
Lo 109:15	lost 22:6	189:2,25	109:23	76:16	40:2	96:19 100:4	40:11,13,16
159:6	26:10 36:10	190:23	137:8	122:21	minister	100:23	43:22 52:14
loan 143:5,12	47:24 71:14	mail 88:23	means 10:18	mess 101:23	163:4	104:6 108:6	56:12 109:6
loans 100:14	103:24	118:7	10:25 71:7	meter 172:10	ministerial	111:16	151:6 171:9
lob-stopped	122:25	main 173:4	138:24	172:12	115:15	113:7	178:11
109:7,9	161:19	maintain	178:10	meters	ministers	118:21	180:5
local 133:3	lot 25:7 46:10	37:25 97:21	183:16	169:22	113:21	122:19	moon 101:4
located	46:12 64:25	majority	193:22	mic 20:15	minority 8:2	125:24	Moore 130:9
174:13	64:25 65:6	11:23	measures	Michael 3:16	64:5	142:23	130:12
Locust	65:19 67:16	making 21:24	73:13	64:20 66:3	minute 95:22	143:8	153:8
114:18	76:14 84:23	92:4 97:25	mechanism	66:12 80:15	148:11	144:15	moral 150:7
long 37:3,4	92:12,12	101:21	70:23	108:14	minutes	149:13	moratorium
69:17	126:8	164:8	median	MICHELE	87:21 88:3	157:10	106:12
124:13	133:10,20	172:11	121:21	193:14	88:11 89:20	158:4	120:10
188:14	134:8,13	189:22	medical 5:12	middle 106:4	112:19	159:23,25	121:2 122:2
longer 44:17	135:9,18,24	man 159:21	medium	125:5	164:18	160:3 162:2	128:13
45:13 93:17	136:2,14,15	manage 6:15	168:19	167:16	mismanage...	163:21	morning
157:13	136:20	management	meet 30:11	Mike 103:25	114:25	169:12,13	95:11,17
173:9	143:7	5:3	meeting 2:8	million 14:7	115:2	170:6,22,25	167:11
look 22:24	146:14,15	mandate	105:10	14:13,18,19	misplaced	171:10,21	mother 76:8
25:25 78:24	168:11	148:11	150:12	18:16 20:18	143:2	172:11	mother's
87:13 99:16	180:22,24	mandated	181:25	21:4 23:4,7	missing	174:2	168:2
103:25	181:5	138:12,22	188:21	23:7 24:2	110:11	175:10,11	motion
104:21,24	189:12,13	map 55:14	meetings 15:6	24:19 27:3	misspelled	181:9,17	153:19
105:5	love 115:8,12	57:22	180:10	28:2,3,11	111:12	183:8 184:3	188:23
		Mark 1:13					

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 12

189:3,24	132:7	140:8 146:9	22:23 23:4	noticed	95:15	183:25	130:23
190:11,17	133:12,14	146:12,15	31:22 75:23	185:16	144:25	184:9,25	148:11,24
190:20	134:23	147:7,24	84:16,17	notices 42:22	158:25	185:4,9	149:7,18
191:16,22	136:6	148:21	85:10 86:12	42:25 43:4	167:11	186:14,20	150:25
motivation	140:20	149:10	90:2 108:5	43:14,17	O'Connor	187:18	175:16
8:10	144:19,22	150:10	119:17	54:7,8	16:4,10,11	objections	okay 10:5
motor 69:4	147:2,3	152:3,20	150:22	127:25	16:15,16,19	193:4	12:19 32:6
72:2	152:22	154:25	151:9,22	134:24	16:20 17:2	obtain 14:2	34:12,25
motorcycle	153:3 154:6	155:19,20	185:9	184:12	17:5,10,13	obvious 71:12	37:22 38:15
155:22	154:19	160:14,19	Nevertheless	noticing	18:20 21:15	obviously	38:18 39:4
move 2:25 7:6	155:7,8,16	160:20	11:15	185:18	22:2,10,15	21:16 23:17	39:23 40:17
7:12 8:24	156:5,18	162:4	new 6:17 9:10	notification	23:9,24	26:10 58:24	40:23 47:8
9:12,15	162:24	164:21	14:11 15:15	25:18	24:9 27:11	71:22	47:15 52:6
18:22 29:11	163:3 167:6	165:7	31:3 76:11	notified	27:24 29:17	100:25	58:11 77:23
33:24 81:3	168:25	168:10,15	100:6	184:18	29:20 31:8	102:20	103:19
189:19	172:25	168:18	117:21	notify 42:12	31:19 32:4	128:19	129:13
190:4,23	174:10	169:15	128:20	notifying	34:6,13,25	occasions	131:17
191:2	177:7 179:3	172:9	143:5,5	85:19	35:3 37:6	113:17	137:16
moved 190:8	187:6	176:15,17	184:24	notion 7:4	37:10,13,19	135:17	138:15
191:8,11	nameless	177:18	185:6	November	38:10,17	occur 164:5	139:2,17
moving 18:7	68:16	179:22	news 84:17	1:7	41:16,24	occurred	140:19
multiple	names 3:11	187:2	124:6	number	42:10,17,23	137:20	141:9
136:19,19	154:2 155:6	needed 57:5	179:23	29:15 31:25	43:12 44:2	offended 83:8	152:23
136:20	155:17	88:24 93:18	night 7:21	36:6 41:12	44:6,10,14	offensive	173:11
multiplied	156:8 188:2	158:11	64:7,10	43:24 46:19	44:20,24	83:15	174:6
6:5,8	Natal 106:19	159:13	69:15,17	47:7 51:8	45:4,10	140:11	177:13
municipalit...	naturally	needs 72:7	95:16 106:4	53:6 71:11	46:21 47:2	offer 34:8	180:7
163:24	86:8	98:4 113:13	139:25	71:12 72:23	47:9,15,20	45:7 125:6	183:13
166:23	nature 14:24	121:23,25	144:23	95:20 97:6	48:4,13,23	162:2,6	188:10
murder 97:13	31:15	168:14	167:16	97:8,17	49:3,8,15	189:25	old 5:18 11:2
97:15	nay 190:14	neglect 163:9	normal 20:23	116:9,11	49:19,22	offered 21:24	14:5 18:3
MURPHY	NCIC 131:14	neglected	25:14 140:2	127:7	50:2,21	22:11,16	43:6,20
193:14	necessarily	165:18,23	normally	128:10	51:9,13,20	24:5 37:2	49:9 54:13
	135:9	negotiate	20:24 21:7	147:16,21	51:24 52:4	41:25 70:10	126:18,19
N	181:13	113:19	180:17	152:14,22	52:24 53:11	offering	126:20
NAACP 82:3	necessary	neighborho...	184:9	154:6	53:23 54:5	18:25 41:10	177:16
name 3:18	68:9 78:22	170:2,4,5	North 62:19	162:14,24	54:22 55:2	office 102:6	178:4
10:11 13:6	162:18	neighborho...	124:18	169:6,19,20	55:17 56:3	113:4,5	182:22
16:9 66:25	need 35:21,22	7:2,22,25	Northwest	numbers	56:10,15,21	137:9	185:7,10,13
74:20 85:22	45:6 46:6	7:25 8:2,6,7	124:19	50:12 55:10	57:20 58:11	162:23	older 48:17
86:8,9,14	56:17 73:16	32:25 33:12	note 4:14	56:6 67:4	131:11,22	166:17	49:9 53:15
87:2 91:14	76:19 77:17	62:21 64:2	9:19 18:14	102:16	132:4,20	Officer 10:12	53:19,19
107:20,24	78:4,20	64:5,5,10	26:21 60:13	116:12	133:19	11:18 13:7	160:22
108:13,13	85:4 91:14	107:2,2,3	62:14 67:16	128:11	134:6,18	offices 2:7	once 22:11,16
108:13,15	97:11 98:24	121:18	67:17 80:16	154:2,13	135:23	officials	23:10 28:6
109:3,22,24	106:12	124:15,23	106:20	nutshell	137:6,10,14	147:25	30:4 43:17
110:9,10,12	110:5 118:5	125:2	noted 13:20	144:8	137:20,25	148:17	51:4 97:20
110:15,15	119:11	169:24	69:25	Nyerere	138:18	150:2	101:3
110:16	120:12	neighbors	notes 193:6	81:10	139:9,14,20	Oh 1:12	175:20
111:11,12	121:2 122:2	167:14	notice 42:24	106:18	140:4	58:13,15	177:18,19
116:22	122:3 123:8	net 30:3	43:7,16,21		180:16	74:24 87:13	188:8
123:18	128:24	61:25 71:3	132:6,8	O	182:3,12,16	88:4 90:16	ones 61:2
127:5	135:13	never 9:5,9	183:19,22	o'clock 2:8	183:3,12,18	116:18	163:19
131:15				85:2 89:5			

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 13

ongoing 104:3	outlines 27:12	158:14	62:20 64:12	154:21,23	104:15	174:18,19	45:3 51:18
online 164:10	outside 86:18	161:3,12	67:11 69:8	156:20,25	120:17	175:7,17	51:25 52:3
opaque 14:24	168:2	175:14,20	69:14,23	159:19,22	passage 58:8	178:11	52:5,12,16
open 10:7	184:19	176:17	70:11,21	163:10,23	passed	181:6	54:17 62:5
11:17 12:19	outstanding	Pam 106:19	73:17 75:2	164:6,10,24	104:19	payday	84:10 90:15
35:3 39:2	17:25 22:25	112:22,25	75:5,16,17	165:8,19,22	Pastor 106:19	100:14	90:17 96:23
87:24	48:8,24	123:10	76:11 77:18	167:10	112:23,24	paying 31:18	99:25
126:17	50:19 51:7	Pamela	77:19 78:21	168:13	120:20	51:23 56:8	pending
opening 4:22	53:3,17,18	112:24	79:8 80:2	169:10,21	121:15	56:9 92:20	189:10
4:24	108:23	115:25	82:10 84:2	169:22	123:8,10	100:18	Penitentiary
operating	owe 74:7	panel 2:16	84:9,13,14	173:5,21	129:5,13,17	101:5	145:22
137:23	96:22	9:18 19:22	84:16 85:8	174:14	134:14	109:10	PennDOT
operation	108:23	64:20 66:3	85:12 86:13	175:15	140:15	110:2 111:6	97:23
95:23,23	113:17	66:17 67:3	87:4 90:21	179:20	pastors	111:14	131:10,13
operations	115:20,24	74:23	91:12,18	180:9,11,19	113:21	126:23	132:18
36:21 95:8	128:8,9	165:16	92:4,6,9,13	181:11,14	path 12:9	172:14	133:3
opinion 19:17	143:21	panel's 15:25	92:15,25	182:19	patience	181:13	penniless
19:18	145:24	paper 155:5	93:11,18,22	184:14	131:3	payment	176:13,14
opportunity	155:8	155:16	94:6,11	185:11,12	patronage	10:25 11:13	Pennsylvania
8:24 12:12	167:22	156:21	97:2 98:24	185:13	121:5	12:2,4	1:6 77:2,4
68:17	170:15,18	paperwork	100:15	186:5,15,17	Pause 3:3	29:22 38:4	77:12
100:24	176:5 184:2	84:15 110:8	105:12,14	187:12	pay 8:21,22	38:8,13,14	117:16,19
153:15	owed 23:8,23	111:2	107:8,10,12	189:11	11:24 19:3	38:19 40:3	118:2
oppose 15:21	43:24 67:23	pardon 79:18	108:6,7	parks 81:10	19:9,17	45:13,13	132:10
34:14	70:2,15	park 125:5	113:7,8,12	106:18	21:23 28:21	51:16 70:3	133:7
opposed	94:13 96:7	172:3,8,13	113:18	135:6	32:21 33:3	78:4,6,8,18	148:20
190:14	101:25	177:23,24	114:23	part 19:12	36:7 43:3	80:19 90:3	pensions
191:19	109:18	180:18	118:25	75:21 92:4	43:18 49:5	97:20,21	50:24
oppression	143:7 157:8	parked 143:3	120:11	92:21 122:7	51:17 52:13	108:10	people 5:8,11
123:22	181:17	parking 1:16	121:9,11,19	146:9	70:8 78:11	114:9	5:20,21
option 134:3	owes 42:20	1:17 4:7,10	122:3	164:25	79:3,4	145:18,19	6:16,23 7:5
177:13	71:6 113:7	5:2,5,18,19	123:10	part-time	82:23,25,25	145:20	7:23 8:8,23
order 3:24	owned 124:13	5:23 6:4,23	124:4,24	92:17,17	83:3,4	157:12	9:3 19:2,7,8
25:13 37:25	150:22	7:8 8:12,15	125:13	participants	97:24 99:23	159:8,11	19:16 20:25
104:9,9	151:9	9:14 10:19	126:16	11:3	100:16	161:12	21:13,19,22
128:20	174:22	11:24 12:15	128:17,23	participate	108:22	162:3	22:18 32:21
134:13	owner 135:3	13:12,15,18	129:8,11,22	6:19 21:13	111:7	177:11,15	42:8 46:6
135:12,22	owner's	14:3,10,15	131:12,20	59:4,6	116:13	177:20	48:11,14
155:12	131:15	15:2,6,9,17	132:15	102:19,23	125:13,14	payments	59:8 61:11
157:12	owners	16:6,12,23	133:23	participated	126:13	13:14 14:16	63:24 72:15
159:9 175:6	124:12	17:8,14,19	137:3,5	59:10	128:2,4	17:23 127:2	73:22 78:23
ordinance		17:23 18:14	138:2,12	participating	136:18	128:5	78:25 80:7
1:15 4:4	P	25:17 26:5	139:24	59:24	143:6,13	143:13	80:24 82:7
organizations	p.m 1:7	31:7,18	141:14,19	participation	147:16	pays 33:14	82:10 84:23
95:8	192:14	33:4,8,20	143:8,18,19	11:9	150:20	51:17 86:23	85:6,13
original	Pacifico	33:25 36:14	143:20	particular	155:11,18	125:15	90:12 91:25
70:10	117:20	36:22 37:2	144:3	33:13 67:4	158:16	PayTix	92:18 93:6
originally	pages 155:5	37:5 38:3	145:10	158:11	159:25	158:14	93:8,9,9,14
26:7	paid 41:20	38:14 43:2	146:13	particularly	161:16	159:4	94:8 96:5
originated	48:14 109:2	43:13,18,19	147:7,14	26:8 152:10	164:9,21,22	penalties 1:17	97:20,25
100:20	109:21	46:23 48:15	148:7 149:3	parts 124:21	165:19,22	4:9 5:23 6:7	98:5,6
ought 113:7	142:21	50:15 54:9	149:11	149:13	171:9	11:4 13:12	99:23
	144:5	54:11 61:24	150:5	pass 104:14	172:10	44:22,25	100:21

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 14

101:2,18,19	18:4 26:23	68:11	88:7 154:2	play 71:13	22:9 29:22	68:18	151:14,19
102:21	40:2,10,12	pertaining	158:13,16	please 2:7 3:5	62:3	108:16	164:2
103:14,24	40:15 49:4	163:14	pick 72:24	3:11,18	pose 50:7	presented	165:16
104:24	49:6,12,18	petition	143:9	20:15 37:4	164:2	109:4	problems
105:24	49:25 50:5	154:15	picture 36:20	37:8 59:21	possible	110:24	71:11
106:5	50:7 55:3,5	phantom	57:18 62:6	70:12 99:9	11:14 20:6	111:3	100:12
111:17	62:23,25	126:9,22	pictures	107:15	20:7 65:21	160:16	150:5
116:17	63:3 70:14	phenomenal	119:9	138:10	146:3	presenting	151:23
118:12	78:9 79:6,7	46:5	piece 148:6	146:25	164:14	12:18	174:12
119:25	80:19,19	Philadelphia	pile 100:13	154:5,17	possibly 20:9	presently	procedure
121:5,9,25	94:7,9	1:2,6,15 4:6	place 85:10	162:11	32:15 73:6	81:24	137:23
122:14,15	99:25,25	5:9,21 8:14	99:21 124:4	pleased 13:9	post 38:16	President	procedures
122:18	102:4,5	10:13 11:19	133:24	ploy 128:19	potential	81:24	165:9
123:25	121:20	11:23 12:17	places 7:4	plug 73:17	10:21 13:13	pretty 23:25	proceed
125:19	160:8,9,20	13:8 16:6	69:14 116:3	plus 6:7 52:8	38:2	55:12	144:18
126:22	percentage	16:12,23	plan 7:9	158:12	potentially	100:18	146:25
127:21	27:6,8,16	17:14,15,18	10:25 11:13	180:20	25:25 39:24	previously	proceedings
128:2 133:8	47:3,4,6	18:6 23:2	12:2,5	181:15	42:5	13:16 18:5	193:4
133:15	49:2 101:18	29:25 32:24	38:13 40:9	183:23	poverty 62:22	115:20	proceeds
136:2	101:19	54:11 55:20	40:9,14	pocket 56:6	62:25 63:3	preying	70:15
140:12	103:4 160:7	62:19 68:21	45:13,13	67:24	95:4 121:24	121:24	process 53:22
142:21	percentage-...	69:9,13	51:16 70:3	pockets	power 186:16	primary 29:8	53:24 54:2
144:5	59:8	74:22 75:7	78:4,6,8	122:19	PPA 62:16	principal	89:21 98:9
145:16	period 14:7	77:5,5,13	90:3 97:21	point 4:16	109:17	51:17 52:18	98:12,14
146:17	39:18,20,24	77:14 78:2	97:22	24:5 37:14	110:20	52:21 54:19	109:8,13
147:5,9	69:7 101:6	78:5,14,16	108:10	55:22 56:18	111:22	principles	137:11
148:15	108:3 118:9	81:23 82:2	113:21	56:24 138:8	145:3,12	72:17	processer
150:16	periodic 15:5	93:2 107:25	114:9	149:19	169:8 170:2	prior 14:2	54:3
151:19	periodically	108:7	145:18,19	182:10,10	170:8 171:4	71:14 111:2	produced
156:7 161:4	100:25	114:23	145:20	points 68:7	171:23	111:9 139:9	100:7
163:7,15,18	permit 191:3	120:10	157:12	84:5	172:2	139:14	profiles 68:19
163:19	191:13	121:19,19	177:11,15	police 117:20	180:25	priority 36:7	program 1:16
164:17,21	192:5	124:6,18,19	177:20	134:11	PPA's 110:18	prison 145:4	4:9 6:13,20
165:3,4	person 6:9	124:20,20	planning	169:8,14	practical	private 71:16	6:21 10:20
166:7,7,7,8	70:7 78:19	124:21	13:24 25:21	policies 124:3	73:25	168:4	11:10 13:11
166:11,13	93:23,24	146:18	25:24 92:16	128:14	practice 40:6	pro 67:13	18:8 24:6
166:20	95:10	147:14	plans 38:5,19	164:20	98:3 137:17	probably	25:22 27:2
168:11	132:21	148:5	78:18	policy 37:23	practices	24:3 30:13	30:10 31:7
170:18	136:16	156:20,25	plate 131:13	40:4 124:8	57:18	33:24 59:4	37:21 39:17
172:22	155:8	159:19	131:15,23	150:7	111:16	112:15	39:18 41:19
173:24	160:12,17	163:16	131:23	Ponzi 125:23	precisely 29:6	149:19	46:9 48:6
175:24	167:7	166:24	132:8,9,13	poor 7:25	predictable	174:23	51:6 99:16
176:2,3,7	172:12	168:13	133:5,11	64:4,10	13:24	problem 68:6	100:6
177:10	174:11	169:7,14	134:10,12	90:9 91:25	predomina...	71:24 72:7	101:21
179:6	175:2 176:9	171:22	134:21,25	92:3 93:9	124:22	75:4,5,6,7	102:25
180:11	person's	172:6,8,13	135:5	121:24	prepared	75:21 78:13	104:8
186:7,9,11	131:19	Philadelphi...	150:23,25	169:23,25	74:15	106:7	144:23
189:22	personal	32:12	151:2,3,10	170:5	120:16	120:18	146:8
people's	146:19	Philadelphi...	185:10	176:11	174:19	147:6,23	165:14
94:12 122:5	168:9	170:14	plates 133:9	poorest 92:5	presence	148:21,22	176:21
133:9,16	personally	philosophy	133:16	population	124:25	148:23	177:10,19
percent 7:20	151:7	100:3	136:19	33:14	present 1:9	149:7	179:5
8:21 10:24	perspective	phone 83:18	167:15	portion 14:19	13:9 68:2	150:14	programs

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 15

31:12	66:7 68:25	173:5,13	ready 3:13,19	28:10,13	redispute	132:17	193:21
Projecting	103:15	183:2 187:3	4:21 12:3	29:21 32:14	146:3	relay 30:17	request 36:12
14:22	104:4	187:11	63:10 65:9	32:16 42:24	reduce 14:16	release	54:15 55:13
promise	164:11	questions	120:24	42:25 43:2	reduced	108:24	55:25 58:10
98:16	179:24	7:16 12:14	121:2	43:3 65:11	14:14 39:25	116:14	61:16 65:6
promised	180:2,3	12:20 15:24	122:23	126:12	reductions	117:14	65:7 192:3
130:23	181:24,24	18:11 37:9	real 21:20	received 7:17	15:19 37:25	158:22	requested
promoting	193:15	45:25 46:13	28:15 29:14	14:17,20	38:2	released	65:12
171:22	pull 27:17	58:3,16	31:13 50:2	28:2,3	reference	109:2,5,14	189:10,12
prompt 38:8	47:10 85:16	61:12 74:16	74:6 102:7	38:11 71:4	83:25	158:18	requests 65:2
proof 113:11	116:12	107:14	147:23	126:10	referenced	releases	required
120:23	pulled 85:12	110:2	170:11	receives	99:7	75:17	46:18
proper 13:24	pulling 73:14	140:10	realistic 59:5	13:15,18	referred	relieves 10:20	135:21
165:20,24	128:11	173:4,17	realistically	receiving	150:13	remain 12:9	rescinded
properly	punish 72:19	181:20	60:2 102:20	68:24	151:15	38:3 61:10	125:8
133:6 190:8	punished	189:17	realized 27:3	reckless	Reform	61:13 68:15	research
191:8	73:4 74:8	quick 101:15	really 25:12	146:14	141:18	remains	32:18
property	purchases	142:18	32:19 33:12	recognition	regard 3:25	15:11	resell 122:15
82:23 106:6	132:21	quickly 18:23	39:2 46:4,5	159:7	regarding	remarks 4:23	resident
106:8,8	purpose	65:20	55:6 57:17	recognized	13:9,10	4:24	68:20
120:4,5	166:19	quite 29:5	82:9 83:18	14:15	145:17	remedy 6:11	107:25
168:5,10	purposeful	69:6 73:11	93:22 114:6	recognizes	146:8,17,19	133:23	residential
proposal	123:21	86:8 111:20	122:8 132:5	13:19	regardless	remember	7:22
142:19	purposely	111:22	140:8	188:22	110:21	145:8	residents
proposed	73:4	quorum 2:8	143:21	190:19	regards 36:11	166:18,19	5:10 7:11
10:19,23	put 50:11	2:22,23	149:9	recommend...	40:4 57:11	174:23	10:16 11:24
37:23	60:16 77:6	9:20	150:14	190:25	registered	remiss 152:7	resolution
proposing	85:14 87:10	quote 144:13	158:25	191:11	117:16,25	remove 114:2	103:22
176:22	87:11,15,17	quoting 37:24	173:2	192:3	131:16,24	134:10	128:25
178:9	87:18 95:12		reared	reconcile	132:9,19	repeat 61:16	resolve
prosthetic	95:15 99:21		105:14,18	29:10	133:6,14	63:24	145:12,14
68:22	119:22	R	106:9	record 10:6	134:12	164:15	155:19
protect 11:14	124:4 133:8	R 155:9	rearing	41:21 66:21	135:5	report 179:9	resolved
127:14	168:7,8	100:22	105:16	67:6 81:6	registration	reported	106:13
protecting	putting 82:13	raked 62:19	reason 5:2	81:16 99:10	98:3 131:19	151:3	respect 67:2
12:8 127:13	82:16	ran 87:16	102:14	103:2	registrations	190:24	68:18 72:14
prove 132:14	126:23	131:13	170:14,15	107:19	97:22 169:9	191:9 192:2	72:24
proven 102:2	127:8	132:13	reasonable	114:10	regular	reporter	120:15
103:13	169:17	175:2,5	30:22	135:16	137:17	193:24	respectfully
provide 5:4		range 21:5	176:16	144:19	reimbursed	represent	11:12
11:12,20	Q	62:22	reasons 15:21	147:2 153:3	142:23	63:8 141:17	151:21
12:4 15:17	quality	rate 18:3	20:22 61:4	187:6	144:7	representat...	respects
36:13 55:16	143:16,25	25:14 63:2	70:4 189:13	recorded	reinstated	123:19	10:17
58:2 65:20	question	95:5	recall 145:11	116:7	97:24	166:16	respond 8:11
79:24 80:3	21:16 31:5	rates 50:9	receipt 159:4	records	reinstated	representat...	58:4 173:16
100:24	36:24 42:18	62:22 63:3	receipts	101:19,23	124:8	12:15	174:8
110:4	50:8 57:7,9	reach 164:16	126:24	recoup	rejection	represented	responded
provided	98:24 100:4	reaction 43:5	159:7	122:25	143:25	67:13	70:17
15:2,8	101:12,15	read 2:24 4:3	receivable	recovered	144:12	representing	185:17
30:23 67:6	125:12	62:14 63:11	67:21 68:6	22:23	related	9:13 94:25	responding
provisions	135:13,25	189:3	receivables	recurring	169:10	represents	6:4
12:6	136:25	reading 191:4	71:18 72:6	13:23 47:25	relationship	14:18 46:4	response 10:3
public 64:12	139:21	191:13	receive 28:8	red 184:14	131:10	reproduction	37:23 57:9
	141:25	192:5					

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 16

190:15	112:5	183:11	133:11	10:22 11:11	174:11	183:10	shooting
191:20	revived	186:14,22	163:20	11:18,22	177:2	185:9,22	82:14 83:12
responsibility	149:19	186:22	rush 135:7	12:16 13:8	seasonality	selling 72:2	Shop 86:22
150:24	Reynolds	188:12,18	180:18	13:14,17,21	14:9 20:22	97:6,7	short 5:6
responsible	1:12 9:25	righty 152:24	184:22	14:17,23	seat 15:4	sells 173:6	22:17 39:9
111:5,13	27:8 35:12	Rite 86:22	S	15:4,19	107:16	181:12	39:10 108:3
155:15	61:18 98:23	rob 170:17	sad 162:16	20:8 27:9	142:7	Senate	170:23
163:19	107:6,15	robbery	safe 6:25	28:16 29:7	153:24	166:17	188:16
176:10	112:17	96:25	158:6	29:21 30:8	second 71:24	send 42:21	shortcomings
rest 28:18	113:12	Robert 130:5	sake 73:24	30:15 31:24	79:14	47:10 54:8	45:23
41:21 77:11	131:4 141:4	130:23	sale 71:3,7	32:8,10,12	130:16	88:16 93:5	shortsighted
80:22	141:15	140:25	Sarah 130:9	33:15 36:4	seconded	117:5 132:5	32:17
restate 56:17	189:14	147:4 153:6	130:12	36:9,19	190:6,8	132:8	show 24:6
restaurants	Richard 3:16	153:9	153:7	47:17 50:16	191:6,8	184:11	56:11 57:10
5:14	64:21 66:4	154:19	sat 71:23 85:7	55:5 62:3	Secondly	sending	57:16 87:9
restructure	66:13 74:20	155:9	95:21	63:19,22	36:24	125:19	126:24
152:4	ride 158:2	Robinson	158:20	74:4,25	Secretary	134:24	134:7
restructuring	ridiculous	177:7,8	satisfied 94:4	82:11,25	82:2	149:13	136:17
78:21	146:2	Roch 130:17	satisfy 72:20	83:5,7,9	Security 79:2	sends 54:6	showed 89:18
result 15:15	riding 147:19	130:18,18	saw 39:13	84:11 90:10	164:13	senior 136:7	117:12
71:3,25	157:24	153:7	84:15	91:23 95:18	see 3:5 22:12	sense 21:25	132:18
resulted	right 3:23	168:25	saying 22:6	102:14	22:17 23:5	29:11	showing
145:22	8:13 9:20	169:2	25:7 45:15	105:2	23:11 30:14	101:21	127:4
retaliation	9:21,22	Rochelle 3:15	48:5 49:21	127:14,15	51:10 56:4	150:8	143:23
105:17	20:14 23:23	66:6,14	53:10 63:15	141:5,16,17	56:6 62:6	151:25	shut 122:3
retrieve	24:14 25:8	81:5,22	65:16 86:17	149:4 150:6	79:12 93:10	172:15,16	shut-off
115:17	26:14,16	105:8	104:24	157:5,16,18	106:3	sent 30:3,5	127:25
117:7 119:3	41:23 45:4	142:16	117:14,24	157:25	109:16	88:20 89:12	sic 124:8
retrieving	45:16 47:2	154:12	119:6	158:6	114:16,18	118:6,21	side 65:14
108:6	47:22 48:12	156:5,14	128:23	161:18,20	114:19	119:12	66:3
return 114:12	48:13 50:11	162:24	132:24,25	165:12	124:23	144:23	sides 35:19
132:16	50:12 60:9	room 1:6	138:19	166:3	125:24	separate	60:24
returned	66:11 79:12	90:22 180:2	141:15	167:21	128:10	31:16,17,20	sign 110:14
135:2	79:13,22,23	roughly	146:18	schoolchild...	135:15,19	113:17	110:15
revenue	80:10 92:16	31:25 50:20	156:8	79:17,17,25	135:25	serious 4:21	signatures
13:23 17:22	92:24 93:6	103:3	157:18	80:6	159:15	18:17,17	82:7
22:23,24	93:6 103:8	round 148:14	166:8	schools 9:7	169:13,13	serve 72:16	significant
24:5,11,12	110:3 116:9	148:14,15	179:18	12:8 13:25	169:20	serves 15:17	11:3 14:19
24:22 28:6	116:19,23	148:15	184:6 185:6	23:11 26:12	seeing 42:2	session 191:5	55:12
29:12 30:2	117:11	row 114:16	185:7 186:5	27:14 28:3	123:21	191:14	189:16
30:10 46:22	118:6 130:6	Roxanne 3:6	186:14	28:10,12	163:8	192:6	signify
46:25 47:4	137:12	3:8,13,19	187:19,19	30:19 32:5	seek 5:12	set 46:20	190:11
48:18 59:15	140:19,24	RPR-Notary	190:11	82:19	seeking 5:13	123:4	191:16
62:8 75:25	144:16	193:15	191:16	127:17	seen 15:9	148:19	similar 57:7
128:22	146:10	rules 191:2	says 8:18	science	108:5	seven 23:19	simple 6:6
revenues 11:8	152:24	191:12	38:19 67:22	114:21	146:14	43:17 101:7	simply 70:7
11:14 13:22	154:16	192:4	88:10 89:9	scooter	181:21	118:15,15	sincerely
14:14,23	156:9	run 58:3 85:3	148:12	147:18	sees 185:20	171:12	151:22
15:16 50:14	160:15,25	131:22	scenario	scrape 175:9	sell 70:13	shame 93:18	single 136:16
53:3	161:3	133:12	25:21,24	screaming	76:13 96:3	115:3	169:4,18
Reverend	164:10	167:15	scheme	69:18	180:23,25	She'll 3:9	170:3,12,13
112:21	166:21	run-in 145:3	125:23	se 42:3	181:5 182:3	sheriff 119:22	174:21
review 112:2	179:16	running 93:8	school 2:9	Sears 174:10	182:7,13,18	shoot 83:13	sir 123:16

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 17

140:20	sold 71:2	spaces 174:14	44:21 45:2	132:12	135:6	135:19	109:18
152:7	118:23	speak 24:4	45:5,16	134:9	stops 152:4	151:7	127:12
168:24	119:6 133:4	29:5 36:2	144:10,16	165:14	storage 11:5	stupid 88:18	128:9
178:18	151:12	111:22	146:21,23	188:21	70:13 71:5	subcontract...	sure 3:10
182:6	180:13	151:17	SSI 79:2	statement	72:22 80:18	54:8 182:20	29:19 32:15
186:23	181:3,18	160:12	Stack 103:25	32:7 49:21	180:22	substantive	84:6 85:4
sister 124:16	185:7	speaking	staging 95:25	49:23 50:3	181:10,15	113:20	111:22
158:15	solid 117:18	128:9	stalking	94:3,14	stores 160:23	suck 83:6	112:2
sister's 159:5	solution	134:14	121:7	189:3	stories 5:18	sudden 91:25	135:20
sisterly	164:3	140:15	stand 3:9	statements	136:2	suffering	152:20,21
143:24	solutions	Spearman	148:16	131:7	storm 83:2	127:21	152:25
144:12	94:22	153:16	150:10	states 108:2	story 144:7	suggest 68:12	154:7,10
sit 66:2 78:6	168:12	special	151:18	155:16	Stoughton	71:10 73:10	156:13,15
78:24 85:3	solve 150:4	133:24	standard	166:10	130:23	74:9 163:25	162:13,23
89:6 107:13	151:19,22	specific 27:19	137:17,23	stating	147:3,4	164:3	169:3
120:25	somebody	65:5	standing 3:7	156:21	148:3 149:6	suggesting	174:23
135:13	19:18 49:20	specifically	119:5	status 135:4	149:17,21	41:14,15	179:22,23
161:9 164:2	54:18,18	10:22	staple 88:15	statute 77:3	153:6	78:12	188:5
166:14	88:13	149:23	stapled 88:20	77:10,13,17	straight	suggestions	189:22
sits 180:21	113:23	152:12	89:12,16	97:14	28:19 135:8	169:5	surplus 13:18
sitting 109:11	120:16	specifics	start 3:6	171:12	straightened	summary	surrounding
119:10	169:17	147:8,9,22	45:25 79:10	stay 141:20	75:15	15:14	148:23
157:17	172:7	152:2,3	84:25 85:21	stayed 158:24	street 64:2,2	summons	survive
166:20	somebody's	spelled	91:23	stays 23:25	64:3 68:5	88:23	104:12
situation	127:5	108:17	143:12	23:25 24:2	72:25 73:15	supervision	suspended
145:4	176:11	110:9,11,16	185:15	steadfast	87:10,23	193:23	98:3 191:3
situations	son 136:5,9	spend 171:21	started 2:5	11:16	104:7	supervisor	191:12
164:5	soon 2:23 3:6	spends	91:21 93:14	stems 150:14	114:14,15	88:5,6,14	192:4
six 39:12	100:18	163:21	starts 150:3,9	stenographic	114:18,19	110:3	system 92:14
76:16	179:4	spent 67:24	151:14	193:6	121:4 125:4	supplies	92:24 127:4
115:25	sorry 16:25	spike 127:22	state 27:11	step 141:7	125:6	127:17	148:19,20
139:24	20:16 22:14	spite 11:8	30:6 46:17	162:12,22	158:21	support 18:7	systems
145:23	58:21	split 47:17	46:18 62:9	Stephen 3:17	167:14	18:9 33:23	126:25
155:20	107:23	spoke 159:16	76:25	66:5,14	169:8	34:9,10	
158:23	130:24	159:21	117:16,19	80:15	171:15	46:6 65:8	T
size 32:11	141:23	sponsor	117:25	stepping	185:20	65:16 81:18	table 2:17
slate 8:25 9:4	154:16	34:17,21	132:9,10	141:18	Street's	82:4 91:5	15:5 33:21
22:22 48:17	178:21	65:8	133:6	sticker 89:19	103:23	173:20	34:19 55:22
slates 23:3	sort 127:25	sponsored	134:11	sticking	streets 78:16	supporting	66:9 81:13
small 166:11	167:9	99:17	138:13	90:24	121:6	10:16	99:3 120:25
smart 77:15	sound 12:20	spot 172:4	144:18	stolen 89:24	143:19,21	supportive	142:5
smart-ass	sounded	spring 109:10	146:25	150:23	stressful	100:8	153:22
77:6	144:13	145:15	148:4,11,20	151:3,4,10	127:20	suppose	tablet 3:13
Smith 130:13	sounds 103:4	175:21	149:3,14	156:24	students 7:11	133:4	tactics 108:6
130:14	133:18	Spruce	166:15	stop 75:12	171:18	180:18	tag 85:22
153:7 167:5	184:6	114:14	168:17	83:15,15	study 67:10	supposed	116:9,11,12
167:6	sources 13:23	Squilla 1:13	state-issued	85:19 97:12	68:2,12	2:10 62:15	117:15,22
168:22	south 69:12	9:23 27:6	110:16	98:4 122:2	73:9	63:9 72:19	117:24
187:24,24	87:10	41:4,5,23	stated 18:5	128:17	stuff 44:23	90:14	185:20
snub 143:24	124:21	42:7,11,15	46:14 91:6	stopped	106:13	152:13	tags 124:11
144:12	125:4	42:19 43:11	96:17	75:11	119:8	164:24	156:23,23
Social 79:2	Southwest	43:23 44:4	124:17	105:21	120:13	165:25	161:14
164:12	124:20	44:8,12,16	126:8	stopping	133:20	supposedly	Tahoe 122:21
							take 18:10

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 18

19:9 22:20	67:21,23	technique	136:10	81:15,17	25:19 39:7	145:25	thrown 79:18
22:20 48:15	97:19	68:3	153:2	91:7,9,10	45:9 58:21	149:18	throws 95:17
62:7 64:3	127:10	techniques	192:10	94:17,18	77:6 78:4,8	152:8 153:5	thugs 90:21
68:9 70:12	141:12,21	72:18	testify 3:5	98:18 99:5	88:18 90:6	169:6,7	Thursday 1:7
70:17,24	141:24	tell 73:20	4:19 8:12	99:9,11	97:13,18	175:23	ticket 17:22
74:2,3,5	143:16	76:20,24	10:14 16:21	101:9,13	108:11	176:3	18:2 33:5
78:9 79:10	147:14	79:15 83:20	30:9 47:7	103:8,9,10	109:20	188:12	43:5,16,19
80:8 88:15	150:15	84:4 104:17	61:14 64:19	103:12,17	116:17	thinking 26:6	48:16 53:18
88:17 96:2	165:3	105:22	67:2,9	104:13	118:13	59:3 84:25	62:23 75:15
96:14,15,17	170:11	110:20,22	116:5	106:16	119:14	third 90:6	77:3,7 79:8
96:20 119:9	178:19	113:4	153:13	107:18	121:16	third-party	79:8 85:23
133:2	180:4 182:2	115:24	163:8	112:8,10,12	151:5	54:3	87:7,11,18
134:20	182:5 184:4	116:2,13	172:23	112:21	165:10	Thompson	87:22,25
143:11,11	186:3,24	118:4 122:6	176:25	121:13	167:20	124:8	88:2,7,15
149:16	target 106:5	125:25	179:8	123:6,12,13	172:2	128:19	88:16,19,21
158:23	106:14	134:9 155:7	testifying	129:2,3,13	173:19	thought 22:5	88:25 89:14
159:24	152:9	160:14,19	11:20 16:5	129:17,19	things 7:14	32:3 102:4	89:19,20
160:22	targeted	telling 29:10	16:20	131:2 139:3	31:15 58:25	143:2	90:4 94:2
162:13	33:13 55:14	118:7,12	testimony	139:4,5	79:3 91:24	175:19,20	100:15,20
164:18	106:4	120:17	4:25 10:8	140:17,20	93:15	three 14:5	113:25
167:20	123:22	151:8 162:4	12:11,18	141:10	100:13	18:2 19:13	121:9 125:7
168:9,14,16	167:19	ten 11:2 19:9	13:9 15:23	142:11,13	119:17	24:17 33:7	126:10,12
181:6 183:9	targeting	19:15 23:20	15:25 18:7	142:16	126:6 127:8	36:6 39:11	136:17
taken 19:5	105:17	41:25 42:2	18:19 34:8	144:10,17	140:13	43:8 49:9	143:6 151:4
61:25 73:13	tasked 17:16	43:20 45:15	34:11 48:5	146:20,21	148:18	49:12,13	151:9,10
75:13	tax 21:20	47:18 48:7	66:22 67:15	146:23	151:25	56:11 61:10	164:10
118:15	24:5,8,9,12	48:8 50:10	81:17 134:8	149:17	think 4:17,20	64:9 76:22	165:22
156:25	24:20 25:22	51:14 52:7	144:11	150:11	8:16 19:10	77:2 91:3	167:23
157:11,13	27:2 59:9	52:13,14,22	146:24	152:5,6,15	19:11 25:23	109:6	170:12
160:2,3	99:16,24	53:13 54:15	153:19	152:18	26:12 30:22	110:11	171:19,24
193:6	101:8	54:25 101:7	154:18	153:16,23	30:24 32:2	111:2,9	180:20
takes 83:23	114:12	116:12	text 144:24	154:3,16	32:11,17	113:16	181:15
83:23,24	120:21	155:5,6,17	thank 2:3	156:16	33:17,18,19	114:20	182:21
179:12	127:24	ten-year	4:12 10:4,9	162:18,19	33:22 34:17	115:10	184:7 186:8
talk 3:21 7:15	tax-paying	10:23 19:2	12:12,23,25	166:25	34:22 41:18	122:12	187:16
63:20,21	111:19	34:9 41:11	15:3 16:2	167:2,2,3	43:4 44:13	145:9	ticketing
67:16,18	taxes 24:22	52:11	17:11,12	168:20	45:5 55:6,9	151:11	33:10
80:17 93:25	24:24 31:14	tend 100:13	18:10,12	172:17,18	61:5 67:17	155:4	tickets 5:18
104:21	31:14,14	tenseful	19:25 20:3	172:23	68:3 73:12	159:10	5:19 6:4
120:21	36:7 58:25	127:20	26:17,17,19	174:8 177:2	73:22 76:21	184:14	11:2,24
128:6 169:2	82:23,24,25	term 38:4	28:25 29:2	177:4 179:2	76:22	187:22	14:4,8
170:10	83:3,5	terms 4:11	34:24 35:6	181:22	100:23	three-month	18:16,17
173:22,24	99:20	11:13 12:5	40:25 41:2	188:18,25	101:25	14:7	20:19 21:18
174:5	101:25	29:6,15	41:5 45:17	189:21,24	103:14	three-year	25:17 31:18
talked 31:12	102:8 113:9	31:23	45:20 58:17	190:22	122:11	77:17	38:4,7,8,12
90:11	125:13,14	164:24	58:21 60:9	192:7,8,9	123:23	three-year---	38:14 40:5
103:23	125:15,17	terrorize	60:10,11	192:11	134:19	49:4	41:20 42:9
145:15	taxpayer	170:17	62:10,10,12	theoretical	135:13	threshold	42:20 43:13
talking 19:4	163:21	test 142:24	65:23 66:11	100:10	136:16	23:10	48:15 49:4
23:13 31:13	taxpayers	testified	66:12,20,22	theory 101:2	137:6	throw 90:8	49:5 54:13
33:8 37:7	28:21	34:10,14	74:11,13,17	thieves 84:3	138:11	throw 82:21	62:17,20,24
47:19,22	126:24	41:17 45:11	80:11,12	114:7	143:14	throwing	63:2,4 69:9
59:16 67:20	171:21	71:15	81:6,7,14	thing 23:20	144:5	79:16 80:4	71:4 72:24

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 19

73:5 77:16	180:14	132:22	176:4,12,13	120:3	188:14	165:15	untested
77:18,19	181:11,11	133:2	tow 11:5 64:4	trends 15:8	turn 114:17	understand	31:22
84:10 85:8	182:4,7,13	166:15	86:15 87:2	tried 9:5	turned 71:8	26:4 27:17	update 15:6
85:11,14	182:17,19	today 16:20	106:21	60:23 80:23	102:11	30:21 55:25	upper 49:16
86:12 89:22	184:8,14,24	42:21 63:10	118:2	110:22	twist 76:4	59:2,18,22	uptick 22:17
90:17,19	185:6,8,10	67:2,8	155:12	145:13,16	two 7:18,21	60:7 67:19	39:8,11,12
96:8,22,23	185:11,12	82:12 83:19	180:20	157:8 174:2	19:13 33:7	81:2 98:20	urge 33:25
108:7,11,20	185:13	84:18 85:6	181:10,15	188:12	35:23 36:6	134:17	urged 104:6
109:17,20	187:13,22	90:22 94:3	184:21	trigger 46:19	43:21 64:8	139:23	Uri 2:18
109:24	187:23	94:23 99:15	towed 40:11	137:18	68:22 73:3	163:11	11:17 13:6
110:10	tie 68:2	106:12	113:16,16	triggered	89:6 94:4	164:25	50:24 55:6
111:6	time 8:16	119:24	115:7,13,15	137:18	106:21	165:2 166:9	use 72:18
113:18	19:23 22:18	124:2	116:25	troubled 29:4	107:4 108:2	185:3	111:16
114:3	24:25 25:8	135:25	118:8,21	29:5	112:15,19	187:18	144:14
115:24	30:21 39:9	136:17	135:8,17	truck 185:19	116:3	understand...	usual 20:23
116:14,19	39:10 40:8	139:8 140:3	143:4	true 63:15	118:16,19	25:10 39:15	102:18
118:20	70:5,8,9	142:19	157:14	70:5 104:20	126:4	understands	usually 59:20
121:11	74:14 77:19	148:12	158:9 160:5	106:11	130:25	69:13	180:23
122:4	77:23 78:10	160:15	167:24	148:10	140:2 145:9	undetermin...	utility 120:24
124:10	81:7,8	161:23,25	180:12,17	193:7	156:23,24	15:16	
125:7,19	82:20 85:2	162:11	towing 33:10	truly 112:6	160:22	undue 10:20	V
126:9,15,21	87:13,15,16	179:8 188:7	51:19 54:17	truth 11:7	161:14	unemployed	vacation
126:22	87:21 89:4	told 26:21,25	54:20 57:13	116:24	167:23	164:13	171:25
134:22	89:4,24	52:11 61:5	71:5 72:22	try 2:4 7:22	169:20	unequivoca...	vague 15:11
136:15,20	92:21,23	61:7 90:12	80:17	7:23 8:16	172:22	113:14	value 50:11
143:15	93:4 99:18	95:22 111:9	106:22	19:14 64:4	177:16	unexplained	73:2,21,24
144:5 145:6	102:6 108:3	115:19	122:4	79:15 93:21	180:4	15:19	73:25
145:10	108:25	118:3	town 5:3	112:17	twofold 75:5	unfair 64:11	145:10
150:21	109:5	126:17	117:2,6	116:4 117:7	type 133:22	111:18	Valvo 3:17
151:11	111:10	129:16	tows 72:10	122:24	types 148:18	112:20	66:5,14,24
154:24	113:22	143:7 145:5	trace 124:10	157:6	typical	120:3	66:25 69:20
155:11	114:8,12	145:18	traffic 17:17	159:12,23	108:13	143:15	73:8 74:13
156:22	115:10	154:25	75:7,14,14	168:15	Typically	175:19,25	74:25
157:4,8,11	127:19,20	158:13	75:17 76:3	182:21	25:10	176:7,14	van 175:12
158:17,19	132:24	160:11	77:14 78:2	183:7	Tyrone	unfairly 8:8	vanilla
159:25	149:20	161:2,5	78:5,14	188:13	172:25	unfortunate	136:21
161:13,15	153:14	173:21	79:8 109:10	trying 2:11	187:7,9,10	11:7	various 70:3
161:18	157:10	174:4	151:16	20:5 28:5		unfunded	72:10
164:25	158:11	Tolson 2:17	181:11	30:9,17	U	50:25 51:3	vehicle 69:4
165:19	159:23	16:6 129:6	trained 75:2	40:20 56:21	Uber 143:13	ungodly	70:11,13
167:23	161:8,17	139:7	training	60:8 75:14	ugly 105:18	175:19	71:2,10
168:6 169:9	170:23	tomorrow	169:16	104:10,12	106:9	unincluded	72:2,25
170:19	174:16,17	141:8	transcript	112:16	ultimately	98:7	73:19,21,24
172:5 173:6	175:3,4	ton 167:17	193:8,21	113:18	39:7 62:2	unique 136:2	80:18 89:22
173:9	times 6:8	top 44:11	transcripts	119:2	unable 14:2	United	108:25
174:15,20	113:6 126:5	53:9	65:3	144:25	unanimous	166:10	109:5
175:3,4,8	135:24	total 25:3	transfer	146:7	189:6	universities	113:15
175:24	185:16	32:19 43:24	133:3	149:12,22	unclear 50:12	5:12	116:15,20
176:3,4,6	tired 7:24	163:9	translate	155:7,18	uncollected	unpaid 102:8	116:21
176:16	95:4	totally 77:25	11:11	169:2,4,25	99:20	unreasonable	117:17
177:16	title 2:25 4:3	95:24	traveling	170:4	102:11	33:19	118:2,8,18
178:2,4,14	17:4 70:10	143:10,14	108:4	178:16	unconscion...	176:19	118:21
178:15	70:24	146:2 152:8	travesty	186:19	113:11	unsafe 158:3	119:3,5,9
					underneath		119:10

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 20

131:12	voices 165:15	107:12	23:16 34:3	80:4 81:3,4	161:22	142:4	world-class
132:21,22	voided 97:23	109:6 113:2	36:8 60:15	81:9 90:22	174:21	153:21	5:11
133:9,13	vote 2:10	118:9,22	79:13 86:3	95:3,4	weren't 70:24	witnesses	worried
162:5	65:10,14,15	119:20,22	93:18,19	104:8,9	West 124:19	66:8 71:14	154:9
173:23,25	180:10	121:15	100:14	105:4	wherewithal	81:12 131:8	worry 117:4
174:4,22	188:15	122:24	101:6	111:25	60:18	132:12	worrying
175:2,6,14	189:5,7	128:6	102:18	112:4,19	white 32:25	153:21	121:10
180:17,21	voted 179:12	142:11,15	108:7	116:7,8,10	William 1:11	woman 90:17	worth 109:20
181:3,18		142:18,23	115:18	122:20,21	130:6	wonderful	145:6 146:4
vehicles 68:4	W	144:15,18	149:16	122:22	140:25	47:14	156:22
69:14 73:14	W 155:9	150:11	150:17,17	123:20	153:9	wondering	157:4
96:3,5 97:7	wage 31:14	152:5,25	150:18	129:21	Williams	102:24	159:20
97:8 113:6	wait 64:19	153:20	170:22	130:7	106:20	103:2	161:13
147:20	66:2,17	164:23	178:6	135:17	112:22,23	Woodall	wouldn't
150:22	88:12 101:4	165:10,13	185:24	137:11	112:24	81:10 94:19	117:14
155:23	107:4	173:24	Wayne	139:23	115:25	94:20,21	134:24
vendor 54:6	117:21	176:4,25	129:23	140:2	120:20	96:11,15	173:22
184:19	148:11	177:24,25	140:21,24	141:14,15	121:15	97:5,11	write 67:4
vendors	170:24	178:5	142:3,9	141:20	123:8 129:5	98:19	125:17,17
187:25	waited 161:4	179:19	153:10	143:16	129:13,17	word 39:8	151:4
verification	waiting 2:14	180:9,11	ways 37:16	148:12	129:23	work 21:9	writing 62:23
131:7	2:21 158:21	188:13	37:16	153:18	134:14	33:3 34:3,4	written
version 189:8	164:11,12	189:20,24	we'll 12:19	154:13	140:15,21	34:7 76:6	125:20
Vice 3:20	waive 170:12	wanted 33:20	65:4,22	156:9 162:9	140:22,24	85:2,4	126:4 127:6
9:21 13:4	wakes 95:10	60:14,15	66:7 81:3	176:21	142:3,9,10	86:11,16,18	166:10
victim 144:3	walked 90:5	90:13	83:6 107:16	177:19,20	142:15	86:21 92:8	wrong 47:7
victimize 8:8	90:12	118:20	117:11	178:16	144:14	92:9 95:3	110:9
victimized	walking	131:6	129:12	180:4	153:11	95:11,13,14	114:22
7:7 104:4	87:23 121:6	150:21	130:7	187:24	Willis 130:20	98:2,8,9	119:23
victims 8:15	walks 5:25	158:25	141:25	we've 31:21	130:21	102:5	120:2,13
64:12	Walter	160:9 177:9	142:7	69:5 122:25	153:6 163:2	104:12	121:6 127:7
view 100:9	154:20	wanting 60:4	151:22	136:16	163:3	128:4,5	149:24
VIN 133:13	want 3:10	wants 45:11	152:22	weak 118:17	win 9:2 94:9	139:20	151:25
violation 43:2	4:19 8:7	98:23	173:12,15	week 158:9	win-win 7:10	151:20	168:6,18
43:18,19	15:3 26:11	153:13	174:7,7	weeks 43:8	wind 75:13	155:21,24	172:3
54:10	28:15 32:9	Ward 153:16	179:22,23	107:4	76:9	157:8,16,21	
131:12	34:18 35:17	167:8	we're 2:4,11	118:16	window 75:16	161:21	X
violations	35:18 36:4	wards 150:3	2:14,15,21	147:15	windshield	167:25,25	XYZ 145:18
1:16,17 4:8	38:25 41:12	Washington	3:19 7:16	welcome 99:9	33:6	worked 31:9	
4:10 13:13	46:7 47:7	125:4	7:24 9:6,7,8	168:22	wins 8:25	101:7	Y
17:19,24	48:24 52:15	wasn't 33:6	13:22 15:12	went 25:8,8	wipe 22:21	workers	y'all 83:2
182:15	57:21 61:20	49:22 50:2	17:16 18:22	32:5 47:17	23:2	92:17,18	84:12,13
188:9	63:20,21	89:23 103:5	20:13 22:22	69:21 88:22	wiped 8:23	working 7:21	115:8 118:9
visit 5:11,14	65:7,14,15	110:23	30:9 31:2	88:25 90:18	41:21 48:18	12:5 21:6	118:10
7:4	66:6 69:16	132:18	33:8 40:19	109:8	48:19 80:20	33:2 92:2	122:6
visiting 5:20	75:19,20,23	160:8	47:19,22,25	115:23	wish 166:13	143:12	146:16
visitors 5:10	76:2,2	161:24	48:5 53:12	117:12	witch 124:14	155:22	yeah 32:4
7:11 171:20	79:11 80:21	187:25	60:7,20	142:24	128:24	169:24	148:9
visits 5:6	80:25 84:6	waste 159:23	61:9,11,21	143:6,8	withdraw	183:7	179:17
vitality 7:2	90:2 91:4	watched 85:8	62:6 63:11	151:25	111:16	185:15,23	year 13:20
voice 142:16	92:2 95:21	water 82:25	63:12 64:18	154:22	witness 66:8	185:24	14:2,21
voiceless	96:11 97:8	way 8:4 9:11	65:25 66:16	155:3	81:12 99:2	works 34:20	15:10,13
142:17	98:13,13	21:21 22:4	67:20,21,23	158:15	99:2 142:4	world 150:8	17:25 18:16
	104:20						18:16 21:3

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 21

22:21 23:2	126:19,20	164:9	95:1 96:1	12 38:20	50:1 51:1	156:1 157:1	1991 174:21
24:11,16	145:23	101 88:22,25	97:1 98:1	40:11,13,16	52:1 53:1	158:1 159:1	174:22
25:3,4	171:13	105,000 63:3	99:1 100:1	95:15	54:1 55:1	160:1 161:1	1992 90:18
27:14,24,25	173:5	10th 110:6	101:1 102:1	12-2800 1:15	56:1 57:1	162:1 163:1	142:22
28:4,5,10	182:22	167:7	103:1 104:1	4:5	58:1 59:1	164:1 165:1	143:15
29:20,24	185:12	11 89:5	105:1 106:1	12,000	60:1 61:1	166:1 167:1	181:4
32:5 36:16	years' 36:13	158:25	107:1 108:1	145:25	62:1 63:1	168:1 169:1	1993 145:6,7
36:17 41:17	yelling 42:13	11/16/17 2:1	109:1 110:1	12:30 144:24	64:1 65:1	170:1 171:1	146:5
41:25 47:24	57:14 79:20	3:1 4:1 5:1	111:1 112:1	120,000	66:1 67:1	172:1 173:1	1996 161:15
48:7 53:2	99:4 106:24	6:1 7:1 8:1	113:1 114:1	62:19	68:1 69:1	174:1 175:1	1PA 91:17
53:14,16	yesterday	9:1 10:1	115:1 116:1	121.9 25:5	70:1 71:1	176:1 177:1	2
55:11 73:18	62:15	11:1 12:1	117:1 118:1	125 53:9	72:1 73:1	178:1 179:1	2 64:20 66:3
108:24	yo 87:24,24	13:1 14:1	119:1 120:1	13 69:8	74:1 75:1	180:1 181:1	114:9,10
125:14	young 159:21	15:1 16:1	121:1 122:1	13-month	76:1 77:1	182:1 183:1	167:11
126:11,13		17:1 18:1	123:1 124:1	69:7	78:1 79:1	184:1 185:1	2,000 109:20
127:19,21	Z	19:1 20:1	125:1 126:1	14 8:20	80:1 81:1	186:1 187:1	110:2
137:21	zip 62:18	21:1 22:1	127:1 128:1	126:20	82:1 83:1	188:1,20,24	111:21
138:2,5	123:20	23:1 24:1	129:1 130:1	136:10	84:1 85:1	189:1 190:1	115:21
146:5 164:9	167:8	25:1 26:1	131:1 132:1	14,000 145:5	86:1 87:1	190:2,9,17	157:4
166:2	zones 55:18	27:1 28:1	133:1 134:1	145:10	88:1 89:1	190:21,24	159:13,14
170:13		29:1 30:1	135:1 136:1	146:4	90:1 91:1,5	191:1,9,25	2,100 71:9
year's 48:17	0	31:1 32:1	137:1 138:1	15 8:20 24:2	92:1 93:1	192:1	2.3 14:7,13,18
yearly 138:13		33:1 34:1	139:1 140:1	43:6 100:16	94:1 95:1	17 8:20	20:18
years 8:19	1	35:1 36:1	141:1 142:1	164:15	96:1 97:1	175 180:20	20 24:2 40:3
11:2 14:5	1 84:25	37:1 38:1	143:1 144:1	150 7:20	98:1 99:1	179,000 63:2	42:4,20
18:3 19:9	144:24	39:1 40:1	145:1 146:1	16 1:7 8:20	100:1 101:1	17th 117:2	48:9 53:2
19:11,13,15	1-PA 91:12	41:1 42:1	147:1 148:1	86:7	102:1 103:1	18 23:3,7,7	53:14 62:22
19:15 21:21	1,000 72:22	43:1 44:1	149:1 150:1	160111 1:15	104:1 105:1	24:18,19	63:2 94:9
22:19 23:19	1,050 71:6	45:1 46:1	151:1 152:1	2:1 3:1 4:1	106:1 107:1	42:3 47:23	103:23
23:19,20	1,070 71:6	47:1 48:1	153:1 154:1	4:2 5:1 6:1	108:1 109:1	48:9 53:14	200 102:9
24:17 26:23	1,300 69:25	49:1 50:1	155:1 156:1	7:1 8:1 9:1	110:1 111:1	104:22	174:19
37:6 41:20	70:16 71:8	51:1 52:1	157:1 158:1	10:1,14	112:1 113:1	184,000	2000 53:16
41:25 42:21	1.5 18:15	53:1 54:1	159:1 160:1	11:1 12:1	114:1 115:1	62:24	2003 108:11
43:6,20,25	1.6 18:16	55:1 56:1	161:1 162:1	13:1,10	116:1 117:1	1900-and-w...	109:18
45:14,15	1:45 1:7	57:1 58:1	163:1 164:1	14:1 15:1	118:1 119:1	144:6	111:7
47:18 48:6	10 8:21 10:24	59:1 60:1	165:1 166:1	15:22 16:1	120:1 121:1	19120 167:8	2004 82:3
48:7,17,22	24:11 28:3	61:1 62:1	167:1 168:1	16:21 17:1	122:1 123:1	19121 62:18	2006 122:20
49:9,13,13	28:17 32:2	63:1 64:1	169:1 170:1	18:1 19:1	124:1 125:1	19140 62:21	126:10
49:14,18	32:9 39:25	65:1 66:1	171:1 172:1	20:1 21:1	126:1 127:1	62:25	2007 52:24
50:9,10,18	102:4	67:1 68:1	173:1 174:1	22:1 23:1	128:1 129:1	123:20	2008 145:4
51:7,12,14	10,000 19:6	69:1 70:1	175:1 176:1	24:1 25:1	130:1 131:1	19141 63:2	145:20,21
52:7,9,13	90:14,18,18	71:1 72:1	177:1 178:1	26:1 27:1	132:1 133:1	19144 63:4	146:3
52:14,22	90:20	73:1 74:1	179:1 180:1	28:1 29:1	134:1 135:1	1976 85:24	2009 99:18
53:13 54:9	10.3 14:19	75:1 76:1	181:1 182:1	30:1 31:1	136:1 137:1	1986 89:25	2010 24:16
54:10,15,16	10:30 89:5	77:1 78:1	183:1 184:1	32:1 33:1	138:1 139:1	1987 115:24	25:3,5
54:25,25	100 28:17	79:1 80:1	185:1 186:1	34:1 35:1	140:1 141:1	161:15	2012 62:18
61:23 74:22	42:5 44:5	81:1 82:1	187:1 188:1	36:1 37:1	142:1 143:1	1988 126:18	62:20,24
76:21,22	51:9,11	83:1 84:1	189:1 190:1	38:1 39:1	144:1 145:1	126:20	2013 8:19
77:2 91:3,4	55:2,4	85:1 86:1	191:1 192:1	40:1 41:1	146:1 147:1	136:11	2014 108:20
93:10,10	67:19 70:14	87:1 88:1	118 50:19	42:1 43:1	148:1 149:1	1990 31:10	109:21
94:4 101:7	99:24	89:1 90:1	51:6 52:8	44:1 45:1	150:1 151:1	37:20 53:4	110:23
111:2,9	100-and-so...	91:1 92:1	53:9 67:19	46:1 47:1	152:1 153:1	53:4	2016 17:22
120:15	90:9	93:1 94:1	104:22	48:1 49:1	154:1 155:1	1990s 176:6	167:24
	100,000						

Committee on Finance
November 16, 2017

Page 22

2017 1:7	49:25 50:6	8 121:20					
86:11	4,000 160:9	8,000 115:20					
217,000	4,700 156:22	117:9 175:5					
121:17	4.5 26:22	175:7,20					
22/7 151:6	50:5	80 94:7 166:5					
225 78:15	4:50 192:14	800 161:13					
23 180:23	40 28:11	80s 176:18					
23,000 11:25	30:11 68:22	85 27:3 90:8					
24 8:22 19:10	78:18 100:3	87 166:2,4					
19:17 38:20	171:9	88 18:3 49:4					
38:25 52:14	185:16	49:6,12					
171:9	40-year-old	8th 145:14					
178:11	68:20						
24-month	400 1:6	9					
10:25	41 62:21	90 79:9					
24,608,536	43 126:19	90s 175:24					
17:24	44 62:21	176:18					
25 40:10 53:2	45 30:12	91 158:11,15					
53:16 79:6	74:22 88:11	158:16					
100:20	99:22	9th 69:23					
250 82:6							
90:19	5						
27 37:6	5 78:9						
120:14	50 30:14						
275 181:8	40:12,15						
297 167:22	78:18 79:6						
	99:25 160:8						
3	53rd 114:14						
3,000 175:17	54-day 39:17						
175:22	54th 114:15						
3.50 158:12	55th 114:19						
30 80:19	56th 158:20						
82:24 87:21							
88:2,22	6						
100:17	600 100:7						
118:7 164:9	60th 153:17						
180:23	61st 167:7						
185:16	7						
30-day 118:9	7 14:13,18						
30.72 180:22	21:3 166:4						
300 102:9	7.25 86:22						
181:3,5,6	7.5 62:17						
181:12	70 80:19						
33 145:24	70's 49:16						
161:8	70,000						
35 79:7	121:22						
36 62:22,25	164:8						
87:7	75 160:8						
38 88:21	76 180:19						
39 28:2	79,068,554						
3rd 115:14	17:22						
4	8						
4 2:8 49:18							